

Brigham's Bastion

Pipe Springs and its Place on the Mormon Frontier

Historic Resource Study

Prepared for Pipe Springs National Monument

John Alton Peterson

Chapter 1

Setting the Stage: Spanish Exploration, Indians, Brigham Young's Kingdom, and Mountain Meadows Massacre

"In the Custody of the Holy Gospel"

Spanish Franciscans were the first recorded European explorers of the region to the south of Salt Lake City, who forged the trails that Mormon colonizers would follow. Like the Franciscans, the Mormons aggressively conquered new lands by establishing their own Native American missions. Utilizing a system very much like that of the Franciscans, they built extensive chains of ecclesiastical colonies, and sought to connect them with new roads through long stretches of desert wilderness. Both Catholics and Mormons built presidios or forts (like Winsor Castle) to protect their roads and colonies. Both developed systems for filling their new lands with colonists "from the old country," and used their indigenous converts not only as trail guides to lead them to the conquest of new territories, but also as workers to help them transform the wilderness into productive pastures and fields. This shared drive for colonization and native converts brought both the Catholic Church and the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints to the vicinity of Pipe Spring. The Mormons, like the Catholic colonizers before them, contributed to the development of great chunks of the American West and Southwest and left deep cultural imprints over large areas that remain to this day. That first expedition, of ten Spaniards traveling under Fray Francisco Atanasio Dominguez and Fray Silvestre Vélez de Escalante left Santa Fe, New Mexico on July 29, 1776 to explore the area up to Utah Lake. From 1776 onward, the

missionary impulse of the Gospel of Jesus Christ provided a background for Pipe Spring almost as imposing and ever-present as the backdrop of the Vermilion Cliffs.

The Domínguez-Escalante Expedition was not the first time Europeans traveled the local trails.¹ By the 1730s, the Spanish trade with the Yutas led to the establishment of two Spanish towns on the rough thoroughfare that was beginning to take shape along the Vermillion Cliff trails. In 1734 Abiquiú was settled, followed the next year by Ojo Caliente—both early way stations on the developing road which has come to be called the Old Spanish Trail.² Escalante and Domínguez expanded this emerging trail north as far as Provo, and south much of the length of modern Utah to the Hurricane Cliffs. The voyagers turned east to explore a viable spur running from the Virgin River to a ford on the Colorado now called the Crossing of the Fathers. Following a path marked out by native informants, they came within four miles of Pipe Spring. Most historians believe Escalante and Domínguez missed Pipe Spring’s precious water by slaking their thirst in ponds of snowmelt in nearby Bull Rush Wash. Since most of the trails in the area actually converged at Pipe Spring, Spaniards passing through this country during the warmer months would have had no choice but to stop there for water. Early Mormon cattlemen found multiple “Spanish crosses” painted or carved into the rock in the Pipe Spring region, some marking important waterholes. Perhaps some Spanish explorers actually visited this important native water source and campground, although it cannot be demonstrated by the records they

¹ Sánchez, *Forging the Old Spanish Trail*, especially 9, and 16.

² Sánchez, *Forging the Old Spanish Trail*, especially 8–12.

left.³ Later Hispanics like Antonio María Armijo used this southern spur and certainly stopped at Pipe Spring, which entered the historic record in 1829.⁴

Throughout their travels, the Spanish described various bands of Northern Ute, Paiute, Navajo, and Hopi, paying special attention in the report to the ancestors of the Shivwit, Uinkarit, and Kaibabit bands of Paiute they met on the Arizona Strip.⁵ The Escalante and Domínguez expedition's route, from Utah Valley to the Crossing of the Fathers on the Colorado River, established trails for future explorers and travelers. In 1776, Escalante and Dominguez had with them at least one Spaniard who was fluent enough in the Ute tongue to be classified as an interpreter, indicative that significant intercourse existed between the Ute and the Spanish and their Mexican successors.⁶ Escalante and Dominguez's journals of their 1776–1777 expedition

³ William Richard Harris, *The Catholic Church in Utah: Including . . . the Journal of the Franciscan Explorers and Discoverers of Utah Lake, the Trailing of the Priests from Santa Fe, N. M., with Map of Route,...* (Salt Lake City: Intermountain Catholic Press, 1909), especially 211–212; and Ted J. Warner, ed., and Fray Angelico Chavez, trans., *The Domínguez-Escalante Journal: Their Expedition Through Colorado, Utah, Arizona, and New Mexico in 1776* (Salt Lake City, Utah: University of Utah Press, 1995), especially 104–105. Certain individuals important in the history of Pipe Springs believed that the Domínguez-Escalante Expedition actually reached the springs. See for example Dilworth Woolley, Manti, Utah, to “Dear Burt,” September 4, 1943, WSC. In 1925 an old cowboy named John Watson showed LeMar Bybee of Kanab an important waterhole in the desert southwest of Pipe Spring marked by a large cross painted in white. When Bybee asked Watson “who put it there[?],” the older man said “Oh just some old Catholic Priest I guess.” See C. Leonard Heaton, “Pipe Spring National Monument Field Notes 1941,” PSLA, #1610, 26 May 1953. For additional information on crosses believed to have been etched or painted on rocks in the Pipe Springs area by Hispanic travelers before the arrival of the Mormons, see photos and text in John H. Hiscock, Superintendent of Pipe Spring National Monument, to John A. Peterson, February 4, 2014, JAP; Andrea Bornemeir, Chief of Interpretation and Resource Management, Pipe Spring National Monument, to John A. Peterson, October 15, 2013, JAP; and John S. Azar, “Witch Pool,” *The Ol' Pioneer: The Quarterly Magazine of the Grand Canyon Historical Society* 17 (July–September 2006): 3–4.

⁴ Sánchez, *Forging the Old Spanish Trail*, 103–107; LeRoy R. Hafen and Ann W. Hafen, *Old Spanish Trail: Santa Fe to Los Angeles: With Extracts from Contemporary Records and Including Diaries of Antonio Armijo and Orville Pratt* (Glendale, CA: A. H. Clark Co, 1954; Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1993); and LeRoy R. Hafen, ed., “Armijo's Journal,” *Huntington Library Quarterly* 11 (November 1947): 87–101.

⁵ For general information and diary accounts of the Domínguez-Escalante Expedition, see Harris, *The Catholic Church in Utah*; Bolton, *Pageant in the Wilderness*, including loose maps in sleeve; Escalante, *The Domínguez-Escalante Journal*; and Sánchez, *Forging the Old Spanish Trail*, 9, 16, 55–79.

⁶ Ted Warner, *The Domínguez-Escalante Journal*, especially viii; and Sondra Jones, *The Trial of Don Pedro León Luján: The Attack Against Indian Slavery and Mexican Traders in Utah* (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 2000).

indicate that as they made their journey across the Arizona Strip,⁷ the Paiute they encountered seemed to have had an exceedingly well-developed fear of passing Europeans. The numerous accounts in Escalante's writings of the Paiute's fear of the Spaniards seems to suggest that Hispanic slavers had long frequented the area and their fear was largely the result of the New Mexican slave trade. Spanish slavers had undoubtedly already traveled the region from the east, following the trails past Pipe Spring to the Valley of the Virgin. Simultaneously, their Ute, Navajo, and Apache allies terrorized the Paiute as they violently gathered them up to feed the New Mexican slave market. From their first encounter with the Southern Paiute, the Mormons believed the unusual temerity of these Indians was caused by the slave trade.⁸

On October 12, inside Paiute country, at a spot near modern Kanaraville, the expedition encountered their first "Payuchis" or Paiute. When they surprised about twenty women "gathering wild plant seeds on the plain," the terrified Paiute immediately scattered. Two of these women were captured and detained by force. Escalante reported that the pair were so frightened "that they could not even speak" and wrote that the missionaries "tried to take away their fear" through "the interpreter and Joaquín the Laguna." They released their captives, "telling them to notify their people that we came in peace, that we harmed no one." Throughout the day they frequently saw other Paiute who scattered and ran at the sight of them. A Spanish man in their group captured a young Paiute man who was so intimidated by his captors that "he appeared to be out of his mind. He stared in every direction, watched everyone closely, and any

⁷ The Arizona Strip is that portion of Arizona that lies north of the Colorado River. Because of the barrier the Grand Canyon poses, the Strip, including Pipe Springs, has been highly influenced by Utah and its culture. For years Utahns tried to wrest the Strip from the Arizona territory and officially annex it. See Allan Kent Powell, ed., *Utah History Encyclopedia* (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1994), 23–24.

⁸ James G. Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Utah Mission by James G. Bleak Historian of the Southern Mission [1896]," Brigham Young University Library typescript, 1928, 2 vols., CHL, ms1301, 1, 17. See Sondra Jones, *Attack Against Indian Slavery*.

gesture or motion on our part startled him beyond measure.” They sought to calm him down by giving him “something to eat and a ribbon” which Escalante himself put on him. The Paiute carried “a large, well-fashioned hempen net which he said he used for catching jackrabbits and cottontails.” When asked where he got the net, he answered “that they came from other Indians who live down El Rio Grande” from whom the Paiute also bought colorful shells.

Pressing this man into guide service, the expedition followed him to his camp. Escalante wrote that they found “a very old Indian, a young man, several children, and three women, and all of them handsome. They had very good piñon nuts, yucca dates, and some little pouches of maize.”⁹ Hoping to follow the source of the maize to lead them to the Havasupai, Hopi, and Zuni, whom they knew raised corn, they attempted to hire one of the Paiute to take them “to those who they said planted the maize.” The Spaniards offered him “a large all-purpose knife and some beads of white glass” if he would be their guide. Bearing witness of the profound fear this Paiute had of white men, Escalante explained that “prompted by his great suspicion, the old man seized [the knife] and offered himself as our guide in order to get us out of there, as it later became evident to us, so as to allow time for his family to get away and retreat to the nearby sierra.” The two Paiute guides led the Spaniards through a gap where Ash Creek cuts through a ridge of black lava rock near the modern village of Pintura, where “in the roughest part of this cut the two guides vanished from our sight, so that we never saw them again. We applauded their cleverness in having brought us through a place so well suited for carrying out their ruse.”¹⁰

Up to this point the expedition was planning to follow the Virgin River to the Colorado, but on October 16 they met some Paiute who warned them of the difficulties ahead and

⁹ Ted Warner, *The Domínguez-Escalante Journal*, 91–93.

¹⁰ Warner, *Domínguez-Escalante Journal*, 93–94.

suggested an alternative route. These *Parussis* convinced the Padres to take an eastern route up the Hurricane Fault, across the Pipe Springs desert, toward a major ford that came to be called *El Vado de los Padres* or the Crossing of the Fathers. Knives and beads were given to these Indians, who promised to show them a way up the nearly insurmountable Hurricane Cliffs.

Taking them up the immense cliff at Rock Canyon at the head of Fort Pierce wash, these Paiute promised to place the expedition “on a correct and proper route” toward the eastern crossings. Indeed, the Rock Canyon was the portal to a number of major trails that headed east across the Hurricane Plateau, most of which ran directly to Pipe Spring, the most important waterhole between the Virgin and Kanab Creek, a distance of about eighty miles. Apparently the Padres’ horses could not make it up the incredibly steep Rock Canyon trail, and their guides abandoned the expedition, leaving the Spaniards to scout their own trail. The expedition attempted to water their thirsty horses in putrid water pockets which gathered rainwater, but the fetid liquid was “so bad that many of the mounts refused to drink.” Having retreated to the base of the cliffs, they followed them southward looking for water. “In direst need,” they camped with no water for themselves or their horses. Now totally out of food, the explorers “decided to deprive a horse of its life so as not to forfeit our own,” but put the slaughter off until they could find water. The next day they continued south along the cliffs, looking for water and taking “nourishment from the weeds.” They continued south along the base of the Hurricane Cliffs and discovered their own passage up the daunting Hurricane Cliffs at Black Canyon. Once atop the plateau they found an immense “plain of good pasturage” for cattle.¹¹

Finally, by October 20 and 21, they found fresh water and became the first Europeans to record their encounter with the Pipe Spring desert. As the Spaniards traveled northeast in

¹¹Warner, *Domínguez-Escalante Journal*, 97–101.

Antelope Valley on October 20, a tributary called Bull Rush wash forced them north toward Pipe Springs and the Vermilion Cliffs. Since this deep arroyo cannot be crossed on horseback until within four or five miles of Pipe, it can be safely assumed that the main body of the expedition got at least that close to the springs. As small parties frequently left the company looking for Natives from whom they hoped to obtain food and directions to the ford, the possibility exists that expedition members may have visited the Pipe Springs (which along with Moccasin Springs was the most notable Native campsite in the entire region). Escalante's record gives no indication that they did, but Escalante wrote that as the Spanish were forced to "swing northeast" on October 20 by Bull Rush's uncrossable barrier, they "found several banked pools of good water in an arroyo" provided by recent freshets. That night the Padres' traveling "Pageant in the Wilderness" camped in a flatland between two bluffs on the edge of Bull Rush wash where they found "a great supply of water and good pasturage." It was this very pasturage that would bring Mormon cattlemen into the area nearly ninety years later. The Padres' detailed description of the locality allowed historian Ted J. Warner to positively fix the exact location of the campsite. October 21 brought the main contingent to its closest recorded proximity to Pipe Springs as they crossed *El Arroyo de Santa Gerturdis* "several times" with their horses.¹²

On October 22, Escalante recorded his company's first encounter with the Kaibab Band of Paiute at a point on or near the Kaibab Plateau. These ancestors of the Paiute who later played such important roles in the history of Pipe Springs were later called Kaibab, Kaibabit, or "Buckskin Mountain Indians" by the Mormons, but told Escalante that they called themselves "the Pagampachi." They too were very frightened by the Spanish and begged Joaquín the Laguna, the Northern Ute that had accompanied the expedition, to protect them from Spanish

¹² Warner, *Dominguez-Escalante Journal*, 104–105; and Bolton, *Pageant in the Wilderness*, 104–105.

treachery. In the most direct proselytizing effort they had made since leaving Utah Lake, on October 20 the Padres evangelized twenty-six Kaibabit. Escalante wrote: “We proclaimed the Gospel to them, decrying and explaining to them the wickedness and futility of their evil customs, most especially with regard to the superstitious curing of their sick.” They distributed three yards of red ribbon to the people, giving each one a little piece, “which left them very happy and grateful.” They asked the Kaibabit if they “wished to become Christians,” to which the Indians appeared to respond positively. Escalante and Domínguez promised to send “padres and Spaniards” to come “to instruct them and live among them,” and asked where they could find them on their return. The Kaibabit truthfully said that they could always be found “on this same sierra and the adjacent mesas.” Leaving after their sermonizing, one of the band agreed to direct the Spanish to the ford, but when he had accompanied them but “half a league he became so afraid that we could not persuade him to continue.”¹³

The desertion of this Kaibabit guide caused Escalante and Domínguez serious difficulty and cost nearly two weeks of blind wandering in the deep and nearly impenetrable canyons through which the mighty Colorado flows. By October 27, the party reached the confluence of the Paria and Colorado at what is now called Lees Ferry. Two stout swimmers tested the swift current, losing their clothing, and nearly their lives, in the process. Eleven more frustrating days of exploring the massive cliffs and box canyons adjacent to the river brought them to a natural crossing the native residents called “Ute Ford,” but that the Mormons later most often called *El Vado de los Padres* or the Crossing of the Fathers. On November 7 they used axes “to cut steps on a stone cliff for the space of three yards or a bit less” to keep their horses from slipping as they made their way down a steep sandstone slope to the floor of what was later called Padre

¹³ Warner, *Domínguez-Escalante Journal*, 106–110.

Creek. The Escalante-Domínguez Expedition found the crossing much as the Paiute had described it and their horses successfully passed over the mighty Colorado without having to swim. On the east side of the river, the expedition praised “God our Lord” by “firing off some muskets in demonstration of the great joy we all felt in having overcome so great a problem.” Fray Escalante described the “main cause of our having suffered so much, ever since we entered Parussi country, was our having no one to guide us through so much difficult terrain. For through the lack of expert help we made many detours, wasted time . . . and suffered hunger and thirst.”¹⁴

On January 2, 1777, the Domínguez-Escalante expedition reached their starting point, the Villa of Santa Fe. The next day the Padres presented the governor with Escalante’s diary and the painted token prepared by the Timpanogos Ute of Northern Utah. They also gave the governor their Yuta guide Joaquín as though he were a mere piece of property.¹⁵ They had been absent from Santa Fe for some 159 days and had traveled roughly 1,700 miles. The expedition put much of the modern Arizona Strip on Spanish maps and officially acquainted Europeans with the Paiute living west of the Colorado River. The basic route the Padres explored from the Virgin to the Crossing of the Fathers would eventually bring other Spaniards into the area, including slavers, trappers, miners, and traders. In time this part of the Fathers’ route became an important shortcut from New Mexico to Nevada and California.

For many years before the Escalante-Domínguez Expedition of 1776, the Spanish government had developed the policy of forbidding traffic and trade in the lands of the Yutas. Among the reasons for this restrictive policy was that unscrupulous traders coursing wildly through Ute lands turned formerly peaceful Native Americans into vicious enemies who raided

¹⁴ Warner, *Domínguez-Escalante Journal* 112–120.

¹⁵ Warner, *Domínguez-Escalante Journal*, especially 143.

Spanish settlements in retaliation for abuses and injustices received at the hands of the merchandisers. A string of New Mexican governors argued that the simplest way to keep the Yutas peaceful was to restrict or totally deny licenses allowing traders to go among them. Reports of the Padres' adventure, of course, naturally increased Spanish interest in trading with the Yutas. But in 1778 a growing pan-Indian rebellion against the Spaniards in New Mexico caused Teodoro de Croix, the commandant general of the *Provincias Internas* (who was in charge of the whole northern frontier of New Spain), to issue an order prohibiting any trade with the Yutas whatsoever. So many traders were flocking into Colorado and Utah, exchanging European horses and goods for slaves and pelts that de Croix had criers officially trumpet and post his ban on Ute trade in every village and town. As Joseph P. Sánchez has pointed out, de Croix recognized that he was fighting against a longstanding and well-established “New Mexican tradition of trading with the Yutas.” Metal knives and awls, as well as corn, tobacco, and horses had long been exchanged for hides, pelts, blankets and slaves. Sánchez pointed out that “Traders from Abiquiú, Taos, Picuries, and Chama were especially tied to the Yuta trade,” and that they used various routes to reach deep into the Great Basin. While official bans on trading in Ute country were in effect “throughout the rest of the Spanish colonial period in New Mexico,” an enormous amount of illicit merchandising between the Utes and the Spanish continued. The governors prosecuted violators but the forbidden trade nonetheless continued at a brisk pace, and each illegal expedition taught the Spanish more about the Utes and their country.¹⁶

As the years went by, the general route the Padres had explored between the Virgin River and the Crossing of the Fathers was used more and more. By the 1820s, New Mexicans were

¹⁶ Sánchez, *Forging the Old Spanish Trail*, 91–102.

aware that American and French traders and trappers were also pressing into the area and their desire to maintain a foothold in the region likely increased Hispanic traffic over what we will call the Pipe Spring corridor. By 1829, Hispanic traders had fully fleshed out an acknowledged route of trade and immigration to California which used Pipe Springs as a major waterhole. Mexico won its independence from Spain in 1821, and while the old regime's bans on Ute trade remained in place for some time, official interest in the Yuta country awakened, in part to respond to American competition. On May 14, 1830, the governor of the Mexican province of New Mexico, José Antonio Chávez, wrote his superiors in Mexico City that a new route had been opened up between New Mexico and California over Ute lands and that he believed the time had come "for the Supreme Government to promote the commerce of this region." He described that on November 8, 1829 a licensed expedition of about sixty men left New Mexico for California. Led by Antonio Mariá Armijo, the company had traversed the area enough to report that that Native people fled in terror at the sight of the traders. Fear of provoking trouble with the Native Americans had been the reason for the Spanish and Mexican bans on commerce with the Utes. Chávez wrote that "the Indians proved no obstacle and this contributed not a little to the success of the expedition."¹⁷ The truth is, as Joseph Sánchez points out, the eventual discovery of a practical route from New Mexico to California by Armijo was a culmination of decades of travel to the Yuta country by New Mexican traders and slavers. They had learned about the geography and shared their knowledge, they learned the language of the Utes and used it for trade, and they accumulated information about the people and the land and passed it into the oral tradition of their generations. The Old Spanish Trail and its variant routes owed its

¹⁷ Sánchez, *Forging the Old Spanish Trail*, 103–104.

existence as much to illegal traders as it did to those adventurers who sallied forth with license in hand and the blessings of the Spanish authorities.¹⁸

Antonio Armijo's diary indicates that his sixty-man expedition left Abiquiú on November 7, 1829 and included traders who had traveled over various portions of the route before. By December 6, they reached the Crossing of the Fathers and, after resting two days, reached the steps the members of the Domínguez-Escalante Expedition had carved to help their horses reach the river. Not far from the river they met some Payuches, and echoing the report of the Padres, Armijo wrote that he found them “a docile and timid nation.” Armijo's description of the route west from the river is terse and therefore exceedingly vague. It seems his company reached Pipe Springs on 15 December. Armijo called it “*Agua de la Vieja*,” or “the watering place of the Old Woman,” likely naming it after an aged Kaibab woman they met there. By December 20, they were at the Virgin, which they followed to the Colorado, traveling then to Las Vegas Springs and eventually on through Cajon Pass to the San Bernardino Rancho. On January 31, 1830 they arrived at the San Gabriel Mission near Los Angeles. On March 1, Armijo left California for New Mexico, retracing his steps, presumably passing through Pipe Spring a second time, arriving “in this jurisdiction of Jemez” on April 25. According to Old Spanish Trail authority Joseph Sánchez, the trail Armijo “discovered” became “the favored route” between New Mexico and California for the next twenty years.” Again he emphasized that much of Armijo's route “was already known, as other New Mexicans had criss-

¹⁸ Sánchez, *Forging the Old Spanish Trail*, 106.

crossed that country for decades” but that it was Antonio Armijo who officially brought Pipe Springs to the knowledge of Mexican authorities.¹⁹

Exploration along the Old Spanish Trail—which the Mormons generally called “the California Road”—began as early as 1849, when Young dispatched Apostle Parley P. Pratt and an expedition of some “50 men, 25 wagons, and 30 pack horses and mules to explore the country south along the Old Spanish Trail.”²⁰ According to James G. Bleak, the historian of “the Southern Utah Mission,” Pratt’s “journey of exploration was for the purpose of examining the country and its facilities towards sustaining a population.”²¹ They explored about half of what became the Mormon Corridor between Salt Lake City and San Bernardino, California. Returning Mormon Battalion members who had been released in California had become acquainted with the route, some of whom later drove cattle and freighted goods back and forth over the trail, bringing the first wagon from California to Salt Lake City as early as 1848.²² Pratt’s company carefully noted places along the route that had enough water, grass, and tillable soil to support

¹⁹ Sánchez, *Forging the Old Spanish Trail*, 103–117; LeRoy and Ann Hafen, *Old Spanish Trail*, 155–170, especially 163; LeRoy Hafen, “Armijo’s Journal,” 87–101, especially 96; NPS, “Draft National Historic Trail Feasibility Study and Environmental Assessment, Old Spanish Trail, New Mexico, Colorado, Utah, Arizona, Nevada, California” (N.p. Department of the Interior, National Park Service, 2000), 53, 55; “Old Spanish Trail Profile: Antonio Armijo,” <http://www.oldspanishtrail.org/assets/downloads/TrailPersonalityProfile-Armijo.pdf>.

²⁰ Juanita Brooks, ed., *Journal of the Southern Indian Mission: Diary of Thomas D. Brown* (Logan, UT: Utah State University Press, Western Text Society Number 4, 1972), ix. For general information on the Pratt Expedition, see Parley Parker Pratt, *The Autobiography of Parley Parker Pratt, One of the Twelve Apostles of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Embracing his Life, Ministry and Travels, with Extracts, in Prose and Verse, From His Miscellaneous Writings*, ed. Parley P. Pratt, Jr., (Chicago: Published for the Pratt Bros. by Law, King and Law, 1874), 408–412; James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 1: 1–2; William B. Smart and Donna T. Smart, eds., *Over The Rim: The Parley P. Pratt Exploring Expedition to Southern Utah, 1849–50* (Logan, UT: Utah State University Press, 1999); and Janet Burton Seegmiller, *A History of Iron County: Community Above Self* (Salt Lake City: Utah State Historical Society and the Iron County Commission, 1998), 37–38, 41.

²¹ James G. Bleak, “Condensed History of what is known as Southern Utah,” 1, James Godson Bleak Papers, USHS.

²² Battalion member Jefferson Hunt, for example, “traversed the route from Great Salt Lake City to the Little Salt Lake and west on the Spanish Trail to California at least once a year between 1847 and 1851.” See Janet Seegmiller, *Iron County*, 37–38, 41. Early in 1848 Porter Rockwell and twenty-five Mormon Battalion men brought a single wagon from California to Great Salt Lake City laden with seeds, fruit cuttings, and food. See Smart and Smart, *Over the Rim*, 73–74.

future Mormon settlements, including the valleys in which Beaver, Parowan, Paragonah, Cedar City, Kanarraville, and Harmony are now located. They also discovered coal and iron ore near Cedar City, now the capital of Iron County. On December 31, 1849, Parley P. Pratt and his entourage camped at the confluence of Santa Clara Creek and the Virgin River where St. George now stands.²³ During the semi-annual conference of the church in April 1850, Brigham Young appointed Apostles George A. Smith and Ezra T. Benson to “plant colonies” and an iron works in the land Pratt had explored.

The Pipe Springs Region and Utah’s Slave Trade Crisis

The trails of commerce that men like Escalante, Dominguez and Armijo explored whetted the Hispanic appetite for Native American slaves, which evolved into a well-developed system of human trafficking. Native peoples willing to cooperate in this trade were rewarded with horses, guns, powder, lead, knives, tobacco, alcohol, blankets and other trade goods. As the Old Spanish Trail and its various spurs linked Santa Fe with Los Angeles, Northern Utes discovered that they could steal horses and cattle from one wing of Hispanic colonization, drive them over the long trails, and sell them to the other. Bouncing back and forth between California and New Mexico kept Northern Utes in Paiute lands to such an extent that certain Northern Utes considered themselves chiefs of the Paiute. In 1847, when the Mormons arrived in the area, they found Northern Utes like Walkera, Arapeen, Ammon, Sanpitch, Peteetneat, and Enos claiming “Lordship” over decimated Southern Paiute peoples like the Tontaquints, Parussi, Shivwits,

²³ Smart and Smart, *Over the Rim*, especially 12, 95, and 107.

Uinkarit, and Kaibabit.²⁴ Mounted Northern Ute raiders had established themselves as tributary lords over their weaker Paiute neighbors from whom they demanded women and children to sell into slavery. Paiute bands were summarily decimated as husbands and fathers traded off wives and children for trinkets. More often, they helplessly watched as family members were violently captured and carried away. Of necessity the Paiute learned to hide at the very sight of strangers. Mothers reportedly adorned children with a special “looped belt” to enable them to quickly snatch up their children when under attack by the Ute and Mexican slavers.²⁵ When Jacob Hamblin, missionary to the Native people, first came among Tontaquint Paiute in the St. George area in the early 1850s “the women and children secreted themselves in the brush, while the men approached the new comers in a very cautious hesitating manner; trembling as they shook hands.” Hamblin and other Mormons correctly surmised that “the cause of their fear. . . arose from the fact that bands of Utes and Mexicans had repeatedly made raids upon them and had taken their children to California and Mex[i]co and sold them for slaves.”²⁶

By 1851, Mormons were aware the country they were taking possession of was “infested” with what they called “strolling” bands of Mexicans who traded horses for Native children who were then sold in the slave markets of Taos and Santa Fe. Mormons were surprised at the extent to which the Native peoples of Utah adopted this aspect of Hispanic culture. Many introduced themselves with Spanish names, decorated themselves with Hispanic jewelry, and caparisoned their horses with Spanish leather bedecked with New Mexican silver. So many

²⁴ For general information on the Utah slave trade with New Mexico and California and the key involvement of Northern Utes as middlemen, see William J. Snow, “Utah Indians and the Spanish Slave Trade,” *UHQ* 2 (July 1929): 67–73; Sanchéz, *Forging the Old Spanish Trail*; Sondra Jones, *Attack Against Indian Slavery*; Sonne, *World of Wakara*; “Indian Slavery of the West,” in Kate B. Carter, comp., *Heart Throbs of the West*, 12 vols. (Salt Lake City: Daughters of Utah Pioneers, 1939–51), 1, 144–161; John Peterson, *Utah’s Black Hawk War* (Salt Lake City, University of Utah Press, 1998), 63–69.

²⁵ Sondra Jones, *Attack Against Indian Slavery*, especially 46–47.

²⁶ James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 1, 17.

Native Americans knew some Spanish that much of the earliest Mormon proselytizing to Native Americans was conducted in that tongue.²⁷ Within days of the first arrival of Mormons at what would become Salt Lake City in July 1847, a Northern Ute with the Spanish name Baptiste approached the newcomers with two children whom he offered to sell. At first they were not interested, but when the Northern Ute salesman murdered one of them before their eyes, Brigham Young's son-in-law Charles Decker quickly gave him a gun to save the life of the surviving child. Eventually she was raised in Brigham Young's own home, the first of hundreds of children "rescued" by the Mormons. The Latter-day Saints quickly realized that such captured children needed their help. John R. Young, a nephew of Brigham Young who later helped build Winsor Castle at Pipe Spring, wrote of two small children captured by the Ute in a battle with the Shoshone in 1847 who were offered for sale to the early settlers of Salt Lake City. Perhaps in an attempt to coerce the Mormons into an unwilling purchase, the Ute tortured the children nearly to death within earshot of the city. Young wrote that Ute had shingled the head of a seven-year-old daughter of a prominent Shoshone chief "with butcher knives and fire brands. All the fleshy parts of her body, legs and arms had been hacked with knives, then fire brands had been stuck into the wounds. She was gaunt with hunger and smeared from head to foot with blood and ashes." She too was purchased by Charles Decker and eventually raised in the home of Brigham Young. Such initial purchases convinced the Ute that the Mormons would be willing and ready partners in their human traffic.²⁸

²⁷ "Synopsis of the Doings and Travels of His Excellency Brigham Young, Governor and Superintendent of Indian Affairs to the Southern part of the Territory," April–May 1853, BYP; "Proclamation by the Governor," Provo, Utah, 23 April 1853, in *Deseret News*, 30 April 1853, 3; and Peterson, *Utah's Black Hawk War*, 64–66.

²⁸ Sondra Jones, *Attack Against Indian Slavery*, especially 47–49; and John R. Young, *Memoirs of John R. Young, Utah Pioneer 1847* (Salt Lake City: The Deseret News, 1920), 62.

Brigham Young tried to curtail the slave trade, declaring that not only was it “a cruel practice to enslave human beings,” but that “the results of such a business caused war and bloodshed among the Indian tribes.”²⁹ Young could see that if he was to successfully colonize Utah and convert native people, such violence must stop. The *Book of Mormon* and the revelations of Joseph Smith affirm that one of the great missions of the church was to turn the Native Americans, called “Lamanites,” to Jesus Christ. The Lamanites, Smith taught, would one day become “white and delightsome” and with the help of the Latter-day Saints would one day build a “New Jerusalem” in the heart of North America from which Jesus Christ himself would reign personally upon the earth. When Young inaugurated his people’s exodus from Nauvoo, Illinois in 1846, he was thrilled that anywhere he chose to settle in that great expanse would place him in Native American country, where he could easily commence the work outlined in Smith’s prophecies. The second prophet of Mormonism, following a precedent set by Joseph Smith, took a keen interest in the Rocky Mountains, and in the Great Basin. At the time of the Exodus, the Great Basin was deep in Mexican territory and when Young left Nauvoo he hoped he was leaving the United States for good.³⁰

In 1851, the Trade and Intercourse Act of 1834—which regulated white commerce with the Native Americans—was extended to the territories newly acquired from Mexico. As the official governor of Utah, Young used the act to stop the slave trade.³¹ Once the Indian Trade and Intercourse laws were in effect, Governor Young arrested all New Mexicans trading in Utah without a license. By December 1851 a number of “Spaniards” were in Utah jails. However,

²⁹ Daniel W. Jones, *Forty Years Among the Indians: A True Yet Thrilling Narrative of the Author’s Experiences Among the Natives* (Salt Lake City: Juvenile Instructor Office, 1890), 51.

³⁰ See Peterson, *Utah’s Black Hawk War*, especially 5–6, and 22–27.

³¹ Sondra Jones, *Attack Against Indian Slavery*; and Daniel Jones, *Forty Years Among the Indians*, 51–52.

“stopping this slave business helped to sour” Northern Utes against the Latter-day Saints. Walkara, often called “Walker” by the Mormons, was then the most powerful Northern Ute war chief, and along with his brother, Arapeen, was the most potent Ute leader involved in the slave trade. Daniel W. Jones recorded that following one of the trials of a well-known trader, “Walker’s band” attempted to sell some Indian children at Provo. Obeying Governor Young’s orders, the settlers “declined buying,” whereupon Arapeen became enraged and demanded that since “the Mormons had stopped the Mexicans from buying these children” that they must now buy them. Still the Mormons refused, whereupon Arapeen “took one of these children by the heels and dashed its brains out on the hard ground.” Jones witnessed and reported that Arapeen casually tossed “the body towards us, telling us we had no hearts, or we would have bought it and saved its life.”³² In 1853 the slavers further tested Young’s resolve by threatening to incite Walkara and other Ute to attack the Mormons if they intervened. In April of that year Young, while traveling in central Utah, was informed that a large number of Spaniards were “gathered on the Head waters of the Severe River, & were inviting the Indians to robbery & bloodshed.” The “headwaters of the Severe” rise deep in Paiute country only about thirty-five to forty miles north of Pipe Spring. As Paiute country straddled the Utah-Arizona border and was the center of Utah’s slave trade, Pipe Spring and its nexus of Indian trails were central to the activities of Ute raiders and New Mexican traders in their effort to gather up Paiute captives.

As Young’s entourage headed south from Provo, a “suspicious looking” stranger “doubly armed with pistols & rifle,” demanded a private interview with the governor. The stranger turned out to be Dr. Wallace Alonzo Clark Bowman, described by Mormons as a “bellicose Anglo-American” from Abiquiú who, because of his heritage and language, been chosen by Hispanic

³² Daniel Jones, *Forty Years Among the Indians*, 53.

partners to inform Young that the New Mexican traders were determined “to revive the slave trade.” When Young refused to see Bowman, he “accosted” Young “in an insulting and threatening manner” and claimed that he had “four hundred Mexicans on the Sevier awaiting his orders.” Daniel Jones wrote that Bowman “threatened anyone that might interfere with him, saying he could bring all the Indians in the mountains to help him” and that he had all the necessary “power at his back to use all the Mormons up.” Young still refused to confer with the belligerent “stranger” and continued his tour, but not before sending several of his agents to investigate the “suspicious” activities of Bowman and his “Spaniards.” One of Young’s men confronted Dr. Bowman, who reportedly “made some haughty expression about Governor Young.” The territorial executive, he said, “need not feel so damned important, [as] I associate with Governors when I am at home, and have money enough to buy Governor Young and all his wives.” Bowman repeated his previous threats, saying “the Indians here are all at my command.” Young concluded that Bowman’s threats, “combined the warlike aspect of Walker and the Utah Indians in Iron Co., was *prima facie* evidence of an intended insurrection.” On April 23 Young issued an official proclamation as Governor of the Territory of Utah, warning the people “that there is in this Territory, a horde of Mexicans, or outlandish men, who are infesting the [mountains], stirring up the Indians to make aggressions upon the inhabitants; and who are also furnishing the Indians with guns, ammunition, &c., contrary to the laws of this Territory, and the laws of the United States.” The Lieutenant-General of the Nauvoo Legion issued “general orders to the several commandants of Military Districts” to have “their command[s] ready to move to any point of the Territory [*sic*] at a moments notice, to repel any attack, & defend the Citizens.” A special Nauvoo Legion “detachment of 30 men” was immediately sent “to reconnoiter the

country South and arrest every strolling Mexican & their associates they may meet, so as to preserve the peace of the Territory, and keep the Indians at Bay.”³³

Before the affair was over, it helped provoke the most serious difficulty the Mormons had had with the native peoples up to that point—the 1853 Walker War, named for the Northern Ute Chief Walkara, a kingpin in the slave trade.³⁴ In the upheaval, the Utes apparently killed Bowman “but a few miles from the city” after being released from a jail in Nephi, Utah. Some gentiles, however, gave the mysterious and controversial Mormon vigilantes called “the Danites” the credit for Bowman's death, claiming Brigham “knew by the Spirit of God, the trader was a spy sent from the States to take his life.”³⁵ Lasting less than a year, the Walker War, coupled with Utah's determination to prosecute the Spanish slavers, largely ended the illicit trade with New Mexico.³⁶ As Sondra Jones has pointed out, though, in *The Trial of Don Pedro León Luján: The Attack Against Indian Slavery and Mexican Traders in Utah*, while attempting to “rescue” native children from the slave traders, the Mormons simply substituted “Indian Slavery” with a different sort of “menial servitude.” The Latter-day Saints “adopted” native children into their

³³ “Synopsis of the Doings and Travels of His Excellency Brigham Young, Governor and Superintendent of Indian Affairs to the Southern Part of the Territory,” April-May 1853, BYP; *JD*, 1, 104–105; “Governor's Message to the Members of the Council, and House of Representatives, of the Legislature of Utah,” December 12, 1853, in *Deseret News*, 15 December 1853, 2, UDN; Sonne, *World of Wakara*, 159; Sondra Jones, *Attack Against Indian Slavery*, 104–105; Daniel Jones, *Forty Years Among the Indians*, 54–56; and “Proclamation by the Governor,” Provo, Utah, 23 April 1853, in *Deseret News*, April 30, 1853, 3, UDN.

³⁴ For information on the Walker War, see Kent Powell, *Utah History Encyclopedia*, 615; Peter Gottfredson, comp. *Indian Depredations in Utah* (Salt Lake City: Skelton Publishing Co., 1919; 2nd. ed. Salt Lake City: Merlin G. Christensen, 1969), 43–58; John Peterson, *Utah's Black Hawk War*, especially 63–69; Sonne, *World of Wakara*, 161–206; Robert Kent Fielding, *The Unsolicited Chronicler: An Account of the Gunnison Massacre, Its Causes and Consequences, Utah Territory, 1847–1859* (Brookline, MA: Paradigm Publications, 1993), 81–154; Howard R. Driggs, “Utah's First Indian conflict: The Walker War,” *Juvenile Instructor* (July 1918): 343–347; and Gustive O. Larson, “Walkara's Half Century,” *Western Humanities Review* 6 (Summer 1952): 235–59.

³⁵ Daniel Jones, *Forty Years Among the Indians*, 55–56; Nelson Winch Green, *Fifteen Years Among the Mormons: Being the Narrative of Mrs. Mary Ettie V. Smith* (New York: Charles Scribner, 1858), x–xii, and 252–277; John Hanson Beadle, *Life in Utah: Or, the Mysteries and Crimes of Mormonism, Being an Exposé of the Secret Rites and Ceremonies of the Latter-day Saints with a Full and Authentic History of Polygamy and the Mormon Sect from its Origin to the Present Time* (Philadelphia: National Publishing Company, [1870]), 170–171; Sonne, *World of Wakara* 159; and Sondra Jones, *Attack Against Indian Slavery*, 160n39.

³⁶ Sondra Jones, *Attack Against Indian Slavery*; and Daniel Jones, *Forty Years Among the Indians*, 51–53.

own families or simply recruited them as “indentured servants.” Brigham Young nurtured children scarred by the slave trade in his own home and urged church members to “buy up the Lamanite children as fast as they could, and educate them and teach them the gospel.” As early as 1853, a non-Mormon passing through Utah noted that Paiute children adopted by Mormons called their “protectors ‘father’ and ‘mother,’” but like virtually all children in Latter-day Saint households, they were required to work. Native “adoption” and “indentured servitude,” while ostensibly motivated by Mormon altruism, provided members with domestic help and farm labor that was not much different from the “slavery” Young’s legislation and prosecution against “the Spaniards” sought to curtail.³⁷

Brigham Young’s Kingdom and the Federal Government

Conflict with the federal government resulted in the need to expand into areas of North America that were uninhabited by non-Mormons, or gentiles. Whereas Native Americans could become part of Young’s kingdom, gentiles were less compliant and Young’s aspiration to establish his own sovereign nation in lands desired by the federal government led to distrust, disdain, and armed conflict. The year after he prophetically declared the Salt Lake Valley would be the “Center Stake” from which Mormon colonization would radiate, the 1848 Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo placed the Saints again within the domain of the United States. Convinced this would eventually bring trouble for the Latter-day Saints, Young began an aggressive plan to secure control of a huge chunk of the American West by sending colonists to settle on all

³⁷ Sondra Jones, *Attack Against Indian Slavery*, especially 1–6, 12, 51–52, and 99–106. Jones cites two historians who agree that the Indian indenturing act of 1852 essentially legalized Indian slavery in Utah.

available water in this incredibly dry region and claim it exclusively for the Latter-day Saints. By controlling the water Young hoped he could keep gentiles out.³⁸ Young ultimately envisioned the State of Deseret, which he originally planned to be an independent Latter-day Saint commonwealth that included all of Utah and parts of seven other western states, including a California seaport.³⁹ For the rest of his life he was viewed by non-Mormons as an “arch-traitor” and a religious revolutionary, who became embroiled in a vicious political competition with the federal government.

The term “Great Game” was used at least as early as 1869 to describe the military, political, and religious strategies of Brigham Young as he squared off on a desert chessboard against the government and people of United States of America to establish his Great Basin kingdom.⁴⁰ His long term goal, and the short term actions it dictated, were considered un-American by the majority of the American public; in fact, they were considered “counter-revolutionary” in a country whose foundation was based on a Declaration of Independence from kings, kingdoms, and what they frequently called “one man power.” Representative of other presidents, Zachary Taylor was alarmed that Young’s theocratic kingdom had established itself on “the backbone of the continent” in the Rocky Mountains, an area destined to be the very heart

³⁸ “Gentile” is a term used during that period for those who were not members of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints. The term was used by Mormons and non-Mormons alike in early Utah history and will be used throughout this study in a non-pejorative manner.

³⁹ See Dale L. Morgan, *The State of Deseret* (Logan, UT: Utah State University Press/Utah State Historical Society, 1987).

⁴⁰ Henry O’Rielly apparently first applied the term “great game” to Brigham Young when writing about the 1857–1858 Utah War in 1869. See “Mormonism: Its Progress and Prospects—A New Nationality,” in *Frank Leslie’s Illustrated Newspaper*, September 25, 1869, 19, NCN. For discussions of Latter-day Saint notions of kingdom, see Robert Bruce Flanders, *Nauvoo: Kingdom on the Mississippi* (Urbana, IL: University of Illinois Press, 1965); Klaus J. Hanson, *Quest For Empire: The Political Kingdom of God and the Council of Fifty in Mormon History* (East Lansing, MI: Michigan State University Press, 1970); Leonard J. Arrington, *Great Basin Kingdom: Economic History of the Latter-Day Saints, 1830–1900* (Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska Press, 1958); and David L. Bigler, *Forgotten Kingdom: The Mormon Theocracy in the American West, 1847–1896* vol. 2, in *Kingdom in the West: The Mormons and the American Frontier* series (Spokane, WA: The Arthur H. Clark Company, 1998).

of the country. Abraham Lincoln knew what was at stake when he prophesied that Utah and her minerals would “yet become the treasure-house of the nation.”⁴¹ Far more important than Utah’s mineral and agricultural wealth was the country’s “national treasure,” i.e., the “American Way” of ordering society—its Declaration of Independence from kings, kingdoms, and despots, and its trust in the Constitution. Viewing Young’s “kingdom” as inimical to the most sacred values of Americanism, US presidents, including Polk, Taylor, Buchanan, Grant, and Hayes engaged in a “Great Game” with Brigham Young for supremacy in, and dominion over, a huge chunk of ground that included portions of what is now eight modern American states.

Described by his opponents as wily, cunning, and foxlike, Young frequently spoke of “beating the devil at his own game.”⁴² To him, it was a life and death struggle with evil. His ultimate enemy was the Devil himself, often personified in Young’s mind as his servants cloaked as federal officials, and he repeatedly declared war on the whole world. Certain to invite conflict, Young declared to Saints assembled in general conference in 1851 that: “Evry [sic] thing is against Mormonism & Mormonism is against evry thing.” Openly he declared war: “Hear it O Earth[!] for the Kingdom of God is against all Earth & Hell. . . . we shall fight them untill the kingdom[s] of this world become the kingdom of our God. We shall fight Battle after Battle until the victory is won [or until we are forced to] lay down our lives for Christ sake.”⁴³ Such preaching was at odds with American pluralism. Perhaps sarcastically revealing the source of some of the overflowing confidence he had in himself and in his people, he thundered:

⁴¹ Edward W. Tullidge, *History of Salt Lake City* (Salt Lake City, UT: Star Printing Company, 1886), 697.

⁴² For example see *New York Times*, July 26, 1869, 5, FHL.

⁴³ Scott G. Kenny, ed., *Wilford Woodruff’s Journal: 1883–1889 Typescript* (Midvale, UT: Signature Books, 1984), 4, 72–74, (hereafter Woodruff, *Journal*).

We can beat the world at any game. . . . because we have men here that live in the light of the Lord, that have the Holy Priesthood, and hold the keys of the kingdom of God. . . .

We can pray the best, preach the best, and sing the best. We are the best looking and finest set of people on the face of the earth, and they may begin any game they please, and we are on hand, and can beat them at anything they have a mind to begin.⁴⁴

Perhaps modeling himself after the military and political hero of the Book of Mormon—Captain Moroni—and certainly modeling himself after Joseph Smith, Young “thought it no sin that he should defend [his people] by stratagem.”⁴⁵ Like Captain Moroni, and Joseph Smith, Young employed spies, agents, and even counter-agents in systematic espionage. He hired lobbyists, retained powerful attorneys, and sent political missionaries to Washington to cultivate friendly relations with powerful senators and congressmembers. A world class statesman, Brigham Young had used provisions of the Northwest Ordinance of 1787 to set up a masterfully designed and executed (and strangely legal) system to allow his church-controlled territorial legislature to authorize local county probate courts (packed with Latter-day Saint juries) to try all criminal cases in Utah. For nearly twenty years, this church-controlled territorial judicial system was most often able to set aside federal courts and protect Mormons from outside prosecution. This practice became especially controversial when federal officials attempted to prosecute Utah’s most notorious crime—the 1857 Mountain Meadows Massacre.

In a major confrontation in the spring of 1857, President James Buchanan mobilized 2,500 troops to put down what he termed “the Mormon Rebellion in Utah.” Part of a major

⁴⁴ Brigham Young, *Journal of Discourses* (Liverpool: S.W. Richards, 1857), 76.

⁴⁵ The Book of Mormon, Alma 43:30

political conflagration that was then called “Buchanan’s War” or “Buchanan’s Blunder,” and has since been called the Utah War, Buchanan sent soldiers to depose of Young as Utah’s territorial governor and to forcibly install a new gentile governor, Alfred Cumming. Young reportedly first learned that the army was on its way on July 24, while celebrating the tenth anniversary of the Saints’ arrival in the Salt Lake Valley; a letter written by Anson Winsor was handed to him (the man who would later be primarily responsible for building Winsor Castle).⁴⁶ Viewing the United States Army as a hostile force, Young declared martial law, forbade the troops from entering Utah’s sovereign territory, and prepared his militia to receive them. By 1857, Young had developed a string of settlements following the basic outlines of a significant portion of the route once taken by Escalante and Dominguéz. Called “the Old Spanish Trail” or “the California Road,” to the Saints it was “a Mormon Corridor” running south from Salt Lake City on the basic route of modern I-15 to Young’s southernmost outpost at San Bernadino, California. This Mormon corridor was studded with relatively evenly spaced towns—Provo, Payson, Nephi, Fillmore, Beaver, Parowan, Cedar, Tokerville, Washington—all strategically claiming water sources along the way. Native American missions in Harmony and Santa Clara had been established and Jacob Hamblin, John D. Lee, and others were busy proselytizing the Southern Paiute.

⁴⁶ Winsor was “wagon master” of the Brigham Young Express Company and had become aware of the movement of troops while traveling to Fort Leavenworth on company business. The letter was delivered by Abraham Smoot. See Andrew Jenson, *Latter-day Saints Biographical Encyclopedia: A Compilation of Biographical Sketches of Prominent Men and Women in the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints*, 4 vols., (Salt Lake City: Andrew Jenson History Company, 1901–1936; exact photo repr., Salt Lake City: Western Epics, 1971), 3, 569–570; “Sketch of Life of Anson Perry Winsor,” *Washington County News*, June 28, 1917, 4, UDN; and Frank Esshom, *Pioneers and Prominent Men of Utah* (Salt Lake City: Utah Pioneers Book Publishing Company, 1913), 1256. Winsor descendants take great pride in remembering that Anson “was the one who notified Brigham Young when the United States army was coming to Utah to annihilate [*sic*] Utah.” Anson Perry Winsor, III, “A History of These People,” 2, in CHL, USHS, and JAP.

Mountain Meadows Massacre

The federal government's growing suspicion that Mormons played a pivotal role in the slaughter at Mountain Meadows fostered Brigham Young's intention of establishing a string of outposts south of Salt Lake City. Preparing for actual warfare with the United States, Young had his Native American missionaries attempt to cement alliances with every band they could find, in hopes that the Native Americans would stand with the Latter-day Saints. Many agreed to fight what they called the "Mericans" if they actually came against the "Mormones." In the war hysteria that accompanied the news of a US army coming to Utah "to rub the Mormons out," Southern Utah Mormons and Southern Paiute attacked a gentile immigrant company on the California Road west of Cedar City, killing some 120 men, women, and children on September 11, 1857, at a upland meadow in the mountains between Pinto and Santa Clara. Attackers spared around seventeen youngsters between the ages of four and seven, because they believed the children were too young to tell what happened to their parents.⁴⁷ Protecting accused massacre participants from federal prosecution (himself included) was a primary reason for Young to build a fort at Pipe Spring and for turning all of southern Utah into an armed bastion. Whether Brigham Young ordered the murders, or gave specific instructions that the immigrants be left alone is up for debate, however: the controversy stems from the fact that Mormons blamed the whole affair on the Southern Paiute and their northern relatives, the Pahvants.

⁴⁷ For general information relative to the Mountain Meadows Massacre, see Juanita Brooks, *The Mountain Meadows Massacre* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University, 1950; new edition, Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1962; fifth printing, 1974); Will Bagley, *Blood of the Prophets: Brigham Young and the Massacre at Mountain Meadows* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2002); and Ronald W. Walker, Richard E. Turley, Jr., and Glen M. Leonard, *Massacre at Mountain Meadows* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008).

Within days of the massacre, gentile Indian Agent Garland Hurt began getting reports from Native Americans that it was the Mormons, and not the natives, who had killed the emigrants. Responding to these reports, Hurt sent “an Indian boy named Pete who spoke the english Language quite fluently” with instructions “to proceed to iron county on a secret rout[e], and learn from the puides [Piedes or Paiute] . . . what the nature of the difficulty was, and who were the instigators of it.” By September 23, Pete reported that the “Southern Paiute acknowledged having participated in the massacre. . . but said that the mormons persuaded them into it. They said. . . John D. Lee came to their village and told them that Americans were very bad people, and always made it a rule to kill Indians whenever they had a chance. . . . he then prevailed on them to attack the emigrants. . . and promised them that if they were not strong enough to whip them, the mormons would help them.” The Mormon version of this affair is that the “Puides went to the Emigrant camp and asked for meat and they gave them beef with strickine [*sic*] upon it, and when Brigham learned this fact he sent word back to [the Indians] to do with the Americans as they thought proper.”⁴⁸

In the aftermath of the killings most of the surviving children were adopted by the Mormons, while a number were reportedly taken by the Paiute. When news of the massacre reached the east, relatives of children known to have been with the emigrants clamored to have them delivered from the hands of the Mormons and their native allies. As early as March 4, 1858, the Acting Commissioner of Indian Affairs in Washington, DC (Charles E. Mix) ordered Utah Superintendent of Indian Affairs (Jacob Forney)⁴⁹ to make every effort to locate the child survivors of the Mountain Meadows Massacre. On May 5, the Secretary of War wrote Albert

⁴⁸ Garland Hurt, Indian Agent, Camp near Bridger, to Dr. J. Forney, Supt Ind A., UT, 4 December 1857, in Jacob Forney, “Letterbooks,” 1 [56–74], CHL.

⁴⁹ The Army escorted Forney to Utah to replace Young as Utah’s superintendent of Indian Affairs.

Sidney Johnston, the Commanding General of the Army in Utah, that he believed the child survivors of the massacre to “to be still in captivity” and suggested he “adopt some measure which may eventually lead to their recovery from the Indians.” These papers were forwarded to Forney, reminding him of acute pressure in Washington, DC and elsewhere to “secure” the young survivors’ freedom and “readily return [them] to their friends in Arkansas.”⁵⁰ Utah’s new governor, Alfred Cumming, obtained the name of Jacob Hamblin as the person most likely to be able to round up the children, and Cumming passed Hamblin’s name on to Forney who immediately hired him. Hamblin was Young’s chief southern Utah Indian missionary and operated an Indian Farm at Santa Clara, northwest of modern St. George. A polygamist, Hamblin also had a home at Mountain Meadows, only two miles from the massacre site. Although he was away at the time of the massacre, many of the children had been taken to his home to be cared for by one of Hamblin’s wives. It was the Hamblins’ intention to adopt two of these children. Hamblin had served the US government as an Indian agent under Young and had great influence with the native people of Utah.

On June 22, Forney interviewed Hamblin in Salt Lake City, getting his version of the massacre and its aftermath. Hamblin falsely reported that most of the “unfortunate children” were held captive “for some days among the Indians.” He testified that with “considerable effort” the Mormons had purchased or otherwise recovered them. Ample Latter-day Saint sources certify that the children had been placed in a wagon before the killing actually commenced and were delivered that very night to Hamblin’s wife Rachel, at the “Apostle to the Lamanite’s” Mountain Meadows home. Thereafter they were dispersed in the local Mormon community. After thus misleading Forney, Hamblin told the superintendent his own family was

⁵⁰ Forney, “Letterbooks,” 2, 137–141, 295.

now in possession of one of the children and that “all the children (15) in question [were] in his immediate neighborhood in the care of whites.”⁵¹ But by August 3, Hamblin’s story had changed. He now reported to the superintendent that he only knew the whereabouts of ten of the children and that he had learned that the Paiute had traded several of them off to the Hopi. On August 4, Forney drafted a certificate announcing he had authorized Hamblin to gather the children together so they could be returned to their families.⁵²

That same day, Forney ordered Hamblin to recover the child survivors “whether among whites or Indians.” As part of his search for the children, Forney commissioned Hamblin to traverse Escalante and Armijo’s old trail to the Hopi villages. Thus Hamblin described the trip he was about to take on which he and his traveling companions would discover and name Pipe Spring.⁵³ In the complexities the Great Game imposed upon Mormon and federal Native American relations, Hamblin led Forney to believe he was making the trip exclusively to fulfill the superintendent’s orders, when in reality the trip was directed by Brigham Young. Young desired to make alliances with the Hopi, Navajo, and other native peoples on the other side of the Colorado River, and now that a federal army threatened the settlements in northern Utah, he needed an exodus for the Saints.⁵⁴ Young allowed Superintendent Forney to fund his

⁵¹ Forney, “Letterbooks,” 2, 292, 143–148, 195–197; Juanita Brooks, *Mountain Meadows Massacre*, 74, 277; Philip Klingensmith testimony, in “The First Trial of John D. Lee,” in Samuel Nyal Henrie, ed., *Writings of John D. Lee*, 2nd ed., (Tucson: Fenestra Books, 2002), 323–324; Walker, Turley, and Leonard, *Massacre at Mountain Meadows*, 208, 217; Bagley, *Blood of the Prophets*, 215; David L. Bigler and Will Bagley, eds., “Survivors of Sebastopol: The Children,” in *Innocent Blood: Essential Narratives of the Mountain Meadows Massacre*, Kingdom in the West vol. 12 (Norman, OK: University of Oklahoma Press / Arthur H. Clark Co., 2008), 239–254, especially 239–240; and Todd M. Compton, *A Frontier Life: Jacob Hamblin, Explorer and Indian Missionary* (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 2013), 99–100, 154.

⁵² Forney, “Letterbooks,” 2, 311.

⁵³ Forney, “Letterbooks,” 2, 195–197.

⁵⁴ Ammon M. Tenney, who accompanied Hamblin on his 1858 expedition to Hopiland, wrote that as “the war clouds gathered from the East, as if maddened, by a combination of elements, to wipe out an imaginary rebellion,” Brigham Young instituted explorations “in every quarter. . . as a safeguard, [to find] a place to retreat to should we be driven to such an extremity. Great S. L. City as it was then called, with many other Towns & Vilages, were abandoned, and came near, being committed to the flames when in the month of August 1858 an expedition under

reconnaissance expedition by directing Hamblin to explore a potential escape route into Arizona and establish friendly relations with the Navajo and Hopi while ostensibly “searching for lost children.” Evidence of Young and Hamblin’s collusion, Forney’s private letter to Hamblin promising to pay him for gathering and caring for the massacre survivors ended up in the Prophet’s personal papers.⁵⁵

By the time Hamblin got his men and mules together in October 1858, the US Army was firmly established in Cedar Valley, about forty miles southeast of Salt Lake City. And though a delicate peace had been established, and Cumming and Forney had ostensibly replaced Young as governor and superintendent of Indian Affairs, Young still acted as though he held both titles. This incensed the secretary of war, who told officers that Brigham Young was “the greatest impostor of the age, and that he should very soon [have to] die.”⁵⁶ Another federal official rejoiced that “the Game is now nearly played out & a New order of things will be established [now] Brigham is no longer Governor of Utah.”⁵⁷ For the sake of the kingdom, Young sent Hamblin to discover an escape route to Arizona and Mexico and to make friends with the Navajo and Hopi in case they had to use it.⁵⁸ Thus the Mormon discovery of Pipe Spring was connected to the Mountain Meadows Massacre, the Great Game, and the difficult “political adjustment” that occurred in Utah in the aftermath of the Utah War.

the leadership of Jacob Hamblin was sent to explore a rout and treat with the numerous Indian tribes West but more particularly East of the Big Colorado / it had been known that somewhere East of this river were tribes of Lamenites [sic] who were in an advanced state of civilization.” Ammon M. Tenney, “Early Recollections of my Youth” (hereafter Tenney, *Recollections*), 3, Arizona Historical Society, typescript provided to author by Todd Compton.

⁵⁵ See Jacob Forney, Superintendent of Indian Affairs Office, Great Salt Lake City, to Jacob Hamblin, Fort St. Clara, U. Territory, August 4, 1858, BYP.

⁵⁶ William Meeks, Provo City, to His Excellency James Buchanan, January 14, 1859, BYP.

⁵⁷ W. W. Drummond, Chicago, Ill., to Peter Robinson, May 19, 1858, BYP.

⁵⁸ William Meeks, Provo City, to His Excellency James Buchanan, January 14, 1859, BYP.

Chapter 2

Explorations of Jacob Hamblin, Mountain Meadows Survivors, Colonizing Dixie

“A More Cert[ajin] shot was never made”:

“From [This] Event We Styled the place ‘Pipe Springs’”

On October 28, 1858 Jacob Hamblin started for Oraibi from Washington, Utah (a little Mormon village on the Virgin River), which was then the headquarters of Brigham Young’s Southern Indian Mission, accompanied by twelve other missionaries and a Paiute guide. The men included Jacob Hamblin’s brothers, William and Frederick, his brothers-in-law Dudley and Thomas Leavitt, and Ira Hatch, Thales Haskell, Samuel Knight, Andrew S. Gibbons, Benjamin Knell, Ammon M. Tenney, Lucius Fuller, and James Davis.¹ Fourteen-year-old Ammon Tenney, the youngest member of the group, had been brought along as a Spanish interpreter, since they knew many of the Native Americans they were likely to encounter had some knowledge of that language.² James Davis came along as a Welsh interpreter, for Brigham Young, like many of his

¹ James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 1, 44–46; Jacob Hamblin, Fort Clara, to Pres. B. Young, December 18, 1858, BYP; James A. Little, *Jacob Hamblin: A Narrative of His Personal Experience, as a Frontiersman, Missionary to the Indians and Explorer, Disclosing Interpositions of Providence, Severe Privations, Perilous Experiences and Remarkable Escapes* (Salt Lake City: Deseret News, 2nd ed., 1909), 72; and Pearson H. Corbett, *Jacob Hamblin: The Peacemaker* (Salt Lake City: Deseret News Press, 1952), 150.

² Ammon Tenney learned Spanish as a child while living on a ranch outside San Bernardino, California, in the 1850s. He learned the language “of necessity, as I had no other playmates except those who spoke Spanish.” Tenney’s zealous Mormon parents would often “rise up, & pro[p]hisy, of the ten-thousands, that would [yet] hear the Gospell of Salvation, through me & in that language.” At fourteen, Tenney was a sickly adolescent weighing “less than 90 lbs,” but since the Navajo and Hopi “without an exception. . . talked more or less spanish,” he was drafted as Hamblin’s interpreter. Thus began Tenney’s life-long ministry as a missionary to the Native Americans.

contemporaries in the American West, believed rumors that the Hopi were descendants of a Welsh Prince named Madoc who reportedly left Wales for the New World with 3,000 Welshmen in fifteen ships in 1170 to colonize some corner of America three centuries before Christopher Columbus. Because the Hopi were lighter skinned than many Native Americans (and because there were some pure white “albinos” among them), Young felt they might be descendants of “Prince Madoc’s Welsh Colony” or “Nephites,” from the *Book of Mormon*. Young hoped a Welsh interpreter might solve the mystery by recognizing Celtic words among the Moqui, whom the Mormons sometimes called “Welsh Indians.”³

Traveling along the Vermilion Cliffs, the Hamblin Expedition reached the springs Antonio Armijo had called “Agua de la Vieja,” or “the watering place of the Old Woman,” on Saturday October 30, 1858. In a report to Brigham Young dated December 18, 1858, Hamblin described the springs and his two-and-a-half-days’ journey “over a country destitute of water only shortly after rains that may be found in pools and holes in the rocks[.] plenty of grass[.] when we arrived at a large Spring called read [*sic*] rock Spring by the Indians.”⁴ Hamblin’s first expedition⁵ camped at the springs the Native Americans variously called “Red Rock Springs,” “Yellow Rock Springs,” “Mu-tum-wa-va (Dripping Rock)” or “Matung ([springs at] the end of a

Tenney, “Recollections,” 1–6. See also R. Allen Hackworth, “Ammon Meshach Tenney and His World,” *Mormon Studies Online Journal* (2009): 13. My thanks to Todd Compton for bringing this and the previous source to my attention. See also Winn Whiting Smiley, “Ammon M. Tenney: Mormon Missionary to the Indians,” *Journal of Arizona History*, 13 (Summer 1972): 86.

³ The story of Madoc was immortalized in Robert Southey’s 1805 epic poem “*Madoc*,” and this early Welsh immigration was accepted as fact on both sides of the Atlantic. See John D. Lee, Parowan, Iron County, U. T., to Dr. Willard Richards, March 13, 1852, in *Deseret News*, April 17, 1852, 1; JH, January 6, 1859, 4; Little, *Jacob Hamblin: A Narrative of His Personal Experience*, 72; Corbett, *Jacob Hamblin*, 508–509; Elizabeth Kane, *A Gentile Account of Life in Utah’s Dixie, 1872–73: Elizabeth Kane’s St. George Journal* (Salt Lake City: Taner Trust Fund, University of Utah Library, 1995), 30–31; Juanita Brooks, *On the Ragged Edge: The Life and Times of Dudley Leavitt* (Salt Lake City: Utah State Historical Society, 1973), 88; and William R. Palmer, “Pioneers of Southern Utah: Llewelyn Harris,” *Instructor* 79 (December 1944): 561–564.

⁴ Jacob Hamblin, Fort Clara, to Pres. B. Young, December 18, 1858, BYP.

⁵ Hamblin would eventually make this same trip many times. See Compton, *Jacob Hamblin*.

Rock Ridge).”⁶ The best-documented report of how Mormons came to call the area “Pipe Spring” comes from friendly competitive target practice among members of the expedition. William Hamblin was renowned throughout the Mormon lands as a master gunsmith and marksman, nicknamed “Gunlock” or “Gunlock Hamblin” or “Gunlock Bill.” While the missionaries rested at the springs, they engaged in a little target practice. According to the story, Dudley Leavitt bet Gunlock that he could not hit a silk handkerchief at 50 paces. To the delight of Leavitt and several others, because the air pushed by Gunlock’s musket-ball repeatedly blew the handkerchief out of the way, the master marksman was unable to hit his mark. His honor sullied, Gunlock brusquely told Leavitt: “if you will stick your pipe up out there I will shoot the bottom out without breaking the bowl.” Leavitt apparently set a fine “meerschaum smoking pipe that he had purchased when he was a member of the Mormon Battalion” on a rock and Gunlock blew the bottom out of it at 50 paces “without touching the sides.” Ammon Tenney wrote that “a more cert[a]in shot was never made” and that “from [this] event we styled the place ‘Pipe Springs.’” It is important to note that most of these early Mormon explorers, including Jacob Hamblin, were inveterate yarn spinners whose chief form of entertainment was swapping tales around a campfire, sometimes embellishing their own experiences or those of others. As early as 1872, Clem Powell, with the Powell Expedition, identified the story as having originated with a group of trappers who seemingly named the springs before the Mormons came. Early travelers

⁶ Jacob Hamblin reported the Paiute called it “Read [sic] Rock Springs,” Jacob Hamblin, Fort Clara, to Pres. B. Young, December 18, 1858, BYP. John Wesley Powell wrote that the Native Americans called it “Yellow Rock Spring,” in John Wesley Powell, *The Exploration of the Colorado River and Its Canyons* (New York: Dover Publications, Inc., 1961), 297–298; and in John Wesley Powell, “An Overland Trip to the Grand Cañon,” *Scribner’s Monthly*, 10 (October 1875): 663. This name is preserved today in the name of the Yellowstone Mesa, an imposing landform about five miles southwest of Pipe Springs. Two non-Paiute writers have preserved the Paiute name “Matung” or “the end of a rock ridge” for the cliffs at Pipe Springs. See Herbert E. Gregory, “Population of Southern Utah,” *Economic Geography* 21 (January 1945): 56; and W. Earl Rinehart, “Let’s Guard What is Left,” *Garfield County News*, 11 March 1938, 5, UDN. For “Mu-tum-wa-va (Dripping Rock),” see Robert H. Keller and Michael F. Turek, *American Indians & National Parks* (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1998), 69.

and archeological remains aver that ancient Puebloans had built structures near the springs and that the name could have originated from a pipe or water conduit the Anasazi or other native group had previously constructed to use the water for culinary or agricultural purposes.⁷

The name first appears in the Mormon sources in a November 19, 1859 report written in the Deseret Alphabet by Indian Missionary M. J. Shelton, telling of Hamblin's second visit to the Hopi villages.⁸ Since the springs had multiple conduits and outlets, in early sources it was most often referred to in the plural, i.e. "Pipe Springs." Those same sources also make clear, however, that early Mormons also spoke of the springs in the singular. Young's scribe, Thomas Bullock, created a map in February 1860 of Hamblin's entire route from Washington, Utah to Oraibi, Arizona. Basing his map on reports written by Hamblin's missionaries, Bullock clearly marked the location of "Pipe Springs." Just a fortnight later, though, Bullock made a second map at the

⁷ For examples of oral tradition, see Ammon M. Tenney, Statement on the Naming of Pipe Springs, in "Where the Western Country Got Its Names," *Deseret News*, December 19, 1908, 2–3, UDN; and Tenney, "Recollections," 10. For examples of the numerous (and varying) accounts that exist of the display of marksmanship that resulted in the naming of Pipe Springs, see previous footnote and Walter Clement Powell, Winsor Castle, Utah Territory, to *Chicago Tribune*, n.d., reprinted from the *Chicago Tribune*, July 11, 1872, in "Letters of Walter Clement Powell to the Chicago Tribune," in *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 399; Ammon M. Tenney, "Account of Travels in S. Utah and Ariz.," HL; Ammon M. Tenney, as quoted in *Deseret Evening News*, 19 December 1908, Last Edition, Art Section, 2–3; James H. McClintock, *Mormon Settlement in Arizona: A Record of Peaceful Conquest of the Desert* (Phoenix: Manufacturing Stationers Inc., 1921), 98; Anthony W. Ivins, Office of the First Presidency, Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints, Salt Lake City, to Mr. D. S. Spencer, Salt Lake City, June 8, 1922, in NMPSF; "Famous Rifleman Gave Name to Pipe Spring," *St. Albans Daily Messenger* (St. Albans, VT), February 4, 1925, 2, GB; "Pipe Springs Holds Importance in History of Arizona," in *Kane County Standard*, December 29, 1933, 6, UDN; "Marker Erected at Pipe Springs for A.P. Winsor," in *Kane County Standard*, September 15, 1933, 1, UDN; Flora Snow Woolley, "History of the Pipe Springs Monument, Given to the 'Camp Cleone' Daughters of Utah Pioneers, Kanab, Utah," November 9, 1934, 1, in WSC, b3, f9; Flora Snow Woolley, "In Two Worlds," 46, WSC, b1, 15; Lettie Swapp, "Early Settlers of Kane County," in Lettie Young Swapp Collection, Daughters of Utah Pioneers & History of Kanab, item 6, FHL, US/Can Film, 1,598,077; *Garfield County News*, March 27, 1936, 3, UDN; Thomas J Tormey, *Arizona: A State Guide* (New York: Hastings House, 1940), 628; W. Earl Rhinehart, "Let's Guard What Is Left," in *Garfield County News*, March 11, 1948, 5; and Corbett, *Jacob Hamblin*, 509.

⁸ M. J. Shelton, Oraibi Village, to G. A. Smith, 13 November 1859, SCA, v1, dvd 32, b5, f19. The Deseret Alphabet was a phonetic spelling system developed by the board of regents of the University of Deseret under the direction of Brigham Young to help foreign-speaking converts to the Mormon Church learn English. Brigham Young sent Shelton to teach the Hopi the Deseret Alphabet in the fall of 1859. See also M. J. Shelton, Oraibi Village, N. M., to G. A. Smith, November 16, 1859, SCA, v1, dvd 32, b5, f19.

direct dictation of Jacob Hamblin himself, this time delineating the spot as “Pipe Spring.”⁹ Following the lead of the nineteenth-century sources, we will refer to the place interchangeably as “Pipe Spring” *and* “Pipe Springs” in this study. It is important to point out, however, that when National Park Service Director Stephen T. Mather prepared the paperwork to designate Winsor Castle as a National Monument in May 1923 he used “Pipe Spring” in the singular. When President Warren G. Harding signed these papers proclaiming “Pipe Spring” a National Monument on May 31, 1923, he canonized the singular usage and as far as the United States government is concerned “Pipe Spring” has been the official name used ever since.¹⁰

Hamblin’s report of his first expedition to the Moquis indicates that “the Apostle to the Lamanites” employed at least two different Native American guides and that at times as many as twenty Paiute traveled with them. One of these guides seems to have accompanied them from the Mormon settlements and shown them the trail to Red Rock Springs. How long this guide stayed with them is unclear. A second guide, this one a Kaibab chief, joined them at the western base of the Kaibab Plateau. (Kaibab is a Paiute term meaning Mountain that Lies Down, signifying something akin to Flat Mountain, or Flat Top. Natives also called the plateau Deer Mountain or Buckskin Mountain, since they obtained venison and deerskins there. From the earliest days the Mormons most often called the plateau Buckskin Mountain. John Wesley Powell later designated it the Kaibab Plateau.) Having traveled a day and a half from Pipe to this point, Hamblin reported to Young that on reaching Deer Mountain they “met with the Uinapats or Pine

⁹ See “Sketch of route from Washington City to the Moquitch Indians compiled from M. J. Shelton’s letter to George A. Smith, Nov 13, 1859 by Thos. Bullock,” February 7, 1860, in CHL, CR 300/100; and “Route of Jacob Hamlin from Washington, to the Moquitch Indians, Oct 1859, sketched by Thomas Bullock, Feb. 21, 1860, the places, distances, and courses, being given by Jacob Hamlin, same day, from recollection,” B.Y.P.

¹⁰ Proclamation of President Warren G. Harding, May 31, 1923, in *Statutes at Large of the United States of America from December, 1923, to March, 1925, Concurrent Resolutions of the Two Houses of Congress and Recent Treaties, Conventions, and Executive Proclamations*, vol. 53, pt. 2 (Washington: Government Printing Office, 1923): 1913–1914.

ites Indians a small band of Piutes with whom we were acquainted[d].” “Naraguots the chief,” of this band “was some acquainted with the Moquishces and the route [to their villages so we] engaged [him] to Pilot us” to Oraibi.¹¹ Elsewhere “Naraguots” is rendered “Narraguts,” or “Naraguts,” and in an autobiography dictated after Hamblin was much better acquainted with these Native Americans, he described Naraguts as the “chief” of the “tribe of Kibab Indians.” Hamblin described that at the western foot of the Buckskin Mountains, his party met with “nearly all the tribe of Kibab Indians” who provided them “supper by cooking a large number of rabbits.” Hamblin described how the Kaibab’s belief in good and bad medicine protected the Mormons from retaliation. The “very prevalent idea of good and bad medicine among these Indians gives evidence of a very general belief in witchcraft,” according to Hamblin. After speaking with a tribe member who spoke bluntly about his wish for retaliation against him, Hamblin later learned that “this Indian had said that in the night, when I was asleep, that he intended to chop an axe into my head—but being afraid it would make bad medicine for him, he did not do it.”¹²

Naraguts and nearly twenty of his “warriors” led the Mormons over the plateau which Hamblin described as “a high or elevated country covered with Pine [but] no water for 60 miles.”¹³ Upon reaching the river they had trouble finding the ford. They “traveled up the Colerada about one hundred miles without being able to cross it.”¹⁴ Hamblin later dictated that “after climbing dangerous cliffs and crossing extensive fissures in the rocks, the tenth day out from home we crossed the Colorado River at the Ute Ford, known in Spanish history as ‘The

¹¹ Jacob Hamblin, Fort Clara, to Pres. B. Young, December 18, 1858, BYP.

¹² Little, *Jacob Hamblin: A Narrative of His Personal Experience*, 73–74.

¹³ Jacob Hamblin, Fort Clara, to Pres. B. Young, December 18, 1858, BYP.

¹⁴ “Bishop Covington’s account of the expedition to the Moquitch Indians,” December 1858, BYP.

Crossing of the Fathers.”¹⁵ Young Ammon Tenney later wrote of the crossing that the water was “about one mile wide.” Twenty “warriors grasped each other’s hands and stretched out in a line side by side, so they could aid and help to hold up the one or more who found it hard to swim in the water. We remained behind this 100-foot line and would turn toward those that were seventy-five yards ahead who were in the shallowest water and by so doing we maneuvered our horses when they did not swim.”¹⁶ Two weeks into their journey, a mule loaded with their last provisions of “dried meat and flour” ran off, leaving them without food or water for three days. With a day’s journey to Oraibi remaining, Hamblin wrote that “our Piute friend left us” and that the now starving Mormon explorers “roasted and et the cow hide” they had brought along to repair their moccasins. Within fifty-five miles of the Hopi villages they ran into Hopi farms where they found “a withered Squash” which they gratefully shared. Soon they approached the village of Oraibi. Hamblin wrote that this ancient Hopi town stood “on an eminence” or high perpendicular rock making it inaccessible except by a narrow passage where they were met by several hundred nervous Hopi who, after counseling together, separated their Mormon guests and “invited them to dine with different families.”¹⁷

Remembering the purpose for which Superintendent Forney had financed his trip, Hamblin reported to Young that he visited multiple Hopi villages making “strict inquiry for the lost children” of the Mountain Meadows Massacre. At the Moqui town of *Mishongnovi*, expedition members found “a white child about two and [a] half years old.” Through their Spanish interpreter they only learned that the Hopi claimed to have “got him of[f] the Apaches.” The child was sick and it was now mid-November. Knowing the high country of the Kaibab

¹⁵ Little, *Jacob Hamblin: A Narrative of His Personal Experience*, 74.

¹⁶ Ammon Tenney, *Journal*, quoted in Corbett, *Jacob Hamblin*, 154–155.

¹⁷ Jacob Hamblin, Fort Clara, to Pres. B. Young, December 18, 1858, B.Y.P.

Plateau would be covered with deep snows on their return trip, they did not even suggest “the purchase of the child,” knowing the little one “could not [possibly] stan[d] the journey.”¹⁸ On November 18 they started for home, leaving four of their number (including Gunlock Bill Hamblin)¹⁹ behind “to study [the Hopi] language, get acquainted with them and, as they are of the blood of Israel, [to] offer them the gospel.”²⁰ The journey home “was very laborious and disagreeable.” Again one of their animals ran away with a portion of their provisions which already were “scarcely sufficient for our journey.” Near the present site of Kanab a major winter storm stranded them for several days. For five days they survived on less than “a pint of beans a Day to the man.” Hamblin remembered that “at Pipe Spring the snow was knee deep and falling fast.” It took an entire day to slog from Pipe to Cedar Ridge.²¹

Thus the Mormons officially became acquainted with the Pipe Springs corridor, a collection of old Native, Spanish, and Mexican trails they now made their own. Over the next few years Hamblin and his straggling teams of missionaries traveled the Pipe Springs corridor again and again, each time exploring better and shorter spurs but always stopping at the springs. By February 1860, two separate hand-drawn maps of the Pipe Springs corridor were executed and filed in Brigham Young’s office. In addition to an escape route in light of pressure from the federal government for compliance to its authority, Pipe Spring was significant to the future of

¹⁸ Jacob Hamblin, Fort Clara, to Pres. B. Young, December 18, 1858, B.Y.P.

¹⁹ This is significant because at least one writer averred that Gunlock shot the bottom out of Dudley Levitt’s pipe *on their return trip*, which was impossible, since the marksman remained at Oraibi. See Corbett, *Jacob Hamblin*, 509, fn 4.

²⁰ Little, *Jacob Hamblin: A Narrative of His Personal Experience*, 77.

²¹ Little, *Jacob Hamblin: A Narrative of His Personal Experience*, 77–78; Jacob Hamblin, Fort Clara, to Pres. B. Young, December 18, 1858, B.Y.P.; and Brooks, *Life and Times of Dudley Leavitt*, 88–89.

the Latter-day Saints' cattle business, as Hamblin reported to Brigham Young that "there is no lack of the best of grass on this rout."²²

"Surviving Children of the Murdered Fix the Crime upon the Mormons":

The Massacre Survivors and the Coming Storm

On December 9, 1858 Jacob Hamblin wrote a short report of his expedition to the Moqui "in search of the lost children" to Superintendent Forney, followed by a much longer and more detailed account to Brigham Young. To Forney he wrote "I think I have discharged my duty faithfull as to gathering the unfortunate children. I have fifteen of them now in my possession. I am satisfied there were 17 of them saved from the massacre. I know there was two of them taken east by the Pey Utes."²³ In response, Forney wrote Hamblin a congratulatory letter on January 28, 1859, lauding Hamblin's effort. Forney had originally hoped to employ Hamblin to help him take the children south over the California Road to Los Angeles, from where he intended to take them by ship via Panama to the east. Now he wrote Hamblin that because he was not granted "a leave of absence," he would be forced to "bring them to [Salt Lake City] and if permission is granted me, to take them to Washington over the plains in the spring."²⁴ Meanwhile, \$10,000 was appropriated by Congress "to defray the expenses of the recovery and restoration of the children" ensuring "that these unfortunate little beings may be restored to their relatives and

²² Jacob Hamblin, Fort Clara, to Pres. B. Young, December 18, 1858, BYP; "Bishop Covington's account of the expedition to the Moquitch Indians," December 1858, BYP.

²³ Jacob Hamblin, Santa Clara, to J. Forney, Superint., December 9, 1858, in Forney, "Letterbooks," 2, 468-470; Jacob Hamblin, Fort Clara, to Pres. B. Young, December 18, 1858, BYP; and Thales H. Haskell, Fort Clara, to Jacob Forney, Supt., December 11, 1858, in Forney, "Letterbooks," 2, 471.

²⁴ Forney, "Letterbooks," 2, 496.

friends at the earliest period possible.”²⁵ The superintendent traveled to Hamblin’s home in Santa Clara to take possession of the children, examining the massacre site at Mountain Meadows on his way. Ira Hatch, who had traveled with Hamblin to Oraibi, was now Forney’s guide and they were accompanied by a group of forty gentiles the superintendent had picked up on the trail to protect him from the Mormons, some of whom apparently threatened to “make an eunuch of him.”²⁶ James Lynch, the leader of Forney’s small army of gentile protectors, described the group’s experience at Mountain Meadows. He later testified that “For more than two square miles the ground is strewn with the skull bones and other remains of the victims. In places the water has washed many of these remains together, forming little mounds, raising monuments as it were to the cruelty of man to his fellow man. Here and there may be found the remains of an innocent infant beside those of some fond, devoted mother, ruthlessly slain by men worse than demons.” He had “witnessed many harrowing sights on the fields of battle, but never [was] my heart [rent] with such horrible emotions, as when standing on that silent plain contemplating the remains of the innocent victims of Mormon avarice, fanaticism, and cruelty.”²⁷

A group of soldiers who came shortly after Forney and Lynch reported that most of the skulls they found “bore marks of violence, being pierced with bullet holes, or shattered by heavy blows, or cleft with some sharp edged instrument.” They reported that “some of the skulls showed that fire-arms had been discharged close to the head.” An army surgeon traveling with the soldiers surmised that the bodies of the victims, “by all appearance, had been left to decay

²⁵ J. W. Denver, Commissioner of Indian Affairs, to Michael Delaney, Esq., March 4, 1859, in “*Message of the President of the United States, Communicating, [. . .] Information in Relation to the Massacre at Mountain Meadows, and other Massacres in Utah Territory*”, 1 May 1860, S. Ex. Doc. No. 78, 36th Cong., 1st Sess., (hereafter “*Message of the President of the United States*,” 1860), 51.

²⁶ Jacob Forney to Kirk Anderson, editor, *Valley Tan*, May 5, 1859, in *Valley Tan*, May 10, 1859, 2, UDN; and James Lynch, Affidavit Sworn Before D. R. Eckels, Chief Justice of the Utah Territorial Supreme Court, July 27, 1859, in “*Message of the President of the United States*,” 1860, 81–85, (hereafter Lynch, Affidavit.)

²⁷ Lynch, Affidavit, 81.

upon the surface” without burial. They found “masses of women’s hair, children’s bonnets, such as are generally used upon the plains, and pieces of lace, muslin, calicoes, and other material,” especially noting the profusion of “women’s and children’s apparel.”²⁸ Lynch reported that Forney’s party spent “two or three hours” at the Meadows “burying the uncovered remains of the massacred.” Growing angrier with every Mormon village they passed, Lynch reported “the people would hold no communication with our party, and spoke in the most insulting terms of the *Americans*, as they designate all who are not Mormons.”²⁹

On April 15, Forney, Lynch, and their entourage arrived in Santa Clara and camped in the streets for two days while they arranged to take possession of the thirteen children in Hamblin’s wife’s care. Lynch later complained that Hamblin “screened some of these murderers about his house from justice, among whom are an Indian named George, and a white man by the name of Tillis.” Lynch was incensed that “such a man” as Hamblin was employed by Superintendent Forney. He later swore under oath that Hamblin “knows all the facts” relative to the massacre “but refuses to disclose them.” Lynch averred that the Mormon Indian Agent “falsely reported to Dr. Forney that the children we brought away were recovered by him from persons who had bought them from Indians.” According to Lynch, Hamblin “knew that what he reported was false, and [lied only] to cheat the government out of money to again reward the guilty wretches for their inhuman butcheries.” Superintendent Forney sought to distill Lynch’s hostility because he knew that if he hoped to retrieve the survivors and get information regarding the killings, he must court the cooperation of the Mormons. Forney’s policy of trying to get along with the

²⁸ Charles Brewer, Assistant Surgeon United States Army, to Captain R. P. Campbell, Second Dragoons, Commanding Paymaster’s Escort, Camp at Mountain Meadows, Utah Territory, 6 May 1859, in “*Message of the President of the United States*,” 1860, 16–17.

²⁹ “The Mountain Meadows Massacre. Surviving Children of the Murdered Fix the Crime upon the Mormons,” in *San Francisco Daily Evening Bulletin*, May 31, 1859, 3 GBC, italics in original.

Mormons made him appear soft on the Latter-day Saints, and to Lynch, Forney was a “Mormon-lover” through and through, which made it all the easier for Hamblin to pull the wool over his eyes.³⁰ In addition to the thirteen survivors they picked up in Santa Clara, Hamblin directed them to three more children in the Cedar City area. Long hours on the road and in campgrounds gave the children’s new guardians time to ask questions and it became clear that “these infants never have been with the Indians.” As Lynch later testified, “they were never in the hands of the Indians, but [have always been in the hands of] those who murdered [their parents].”³¹

In a widely distributed newspaper article captioned with the headline “The Mountain Meadows Massacre. Surviving Children of the Murdered Fix the Crime upon the Mormons,” Lynch informed the nation on May 31, 1859 that the oldest of the children still had “vivid” memories of the massacre that could be used in court to incriminate the Latter-day Saints. For example, “a very intelligent little girl, named Becky Dunlap, pointed out to [Lynch] at Santa Clara an Englishman named Tellus [*sic*], whom she says *she saw murder her father.*” Young Becky also stated that she saw Jacob Hamblin’s adopted Paiute son George kill her two sisters. After interviewing some of the principle participants, Lynch was convinced “Mormon avarice” played a major role in the massacre, estimating that the victims’ property amounted to “eighty or ninety thousand dollars, the greater part of which, it is believed, now makes rich the harems of this John D. Lee.”³² According to Forney’s researches, “\$30,000 worth of property, was

³⁰ Jacob Forney to Kirk Anderson, editor, *Valley Tan* May 5, 1859, in *Valley Tan*, May 10, 1859, 2, UDN; Lynch, Affidavit, 81–85; “The Mountain Meadows Massacre. Surviving Children of the Murdered Fix the Crime upon the Mormons”; and Bagley, *Blood of the Prophets*, 219.

³¹ K. P. Campbell, Capt. Second Dragoons, Com’g Santa Clara Expedition, to Major F. J. Porter, Assistant Adjutant General US Army, Camp Floyd, Utah Territory, July 6, 1859, in “*Message of the President of the United States*,” 1860, 15.

³² “The Mountain Meadows Massacre. Surviving Children of the Murdered Fix the Crime upon the Mormons,” italics in original; and Lynch, Affidavit, 81–82.

distributed a few days after the massacre, among the leading church dignitaries.”³³ Becoming more suspicious and vocal about the Mormons’ role in the attack, Forney wrote to the commissioner of Indian Affairs in Washington, DC, stating “this massacre was concocted by white men and consummated by whites and Indians.” “The cause or reason for the commission of a crime so terrible as that of killing at least 115 persons,” he wrote in an article published in both the gentile and Latter-day Saint press, “must assuredly become a subject of enquiry with the proper legal authorities.”³⁴

After having spent two weeks traveling with the children (and an even longer time traveling with James Lynch), Forney unburdened himself in a private letter to General Albert Sidney Johnston, the commander of all the US troops in the Department of Utah. He wrote that most of his new wards knew “their family names,” and a few could “recollect the place of their former homes.” The most important thing he gleaned from the children, he told the commander, was “that at least four of the oldest of the children *know*, WITHOUT DOUBT KNOW, enough of the material facts of the Mountain Meadow affair, to relieve this world of the white hell-hounds, who have disgraced humanity by being mainly instrumental in the murdering [of] at least one hundred and fifteen men, women, and children, under circumstances and manner without a parallel in human history for atrocity.” Forney assured Johnston that he had given Federal Judge John Cradlebaugh “the names of such persons who, I have reason to believe, participated in the affair,” and promised the general that when they were brought to trial he

³³ J. Forney, Superintendent of Indian Affairs, U. T. to Hon. J. W. Denver, Commissioner of Indian Affairs, Washington, DC, in “*Message of the President of the United States*,” 1860, 53.

³⁴ Jacob Forney to Kirk Anderson, editor, *Valley Tan* 5 May 1859, in *Valley Tan*, 10 May 1859, 2, UDN; and Jacob Forney to Hon. Elias Smith, G. S. L. City, 5 May 185[9], in *Deseret News*, 11 May 1859, UDN, 1.

would not hesitate to “furnish the evidence to convict them.”³⁵ By mid-June, a total of seventeen children were in Forney’s possession in Salt Lake City. Two were detained to give evidence, but on June 26, the other fifteen left Salt Lake City for their homes in Arkansas in “three light spring wagons, and one baggage wagon” provided by General Johnston. For protection they were escorted across the plains by several companies of Johnston’s troops. James Lynch accompanied them all the way to Arkansas to deliver them to their relatives and friends and for the rest of his life worked assiduously to bring the perpetrators of the massacre to justice.³⁶

On July 27, 1859 James Lynch swore out a lengthy affidavit before Judge Eckles, Utah’s gentile chief justice, accusing Hamblin of falsely reporting the Mountain Meadows children had been in the possession of Indians to protect white murderers. According to Lynch, Hamblin was also guilty of other malfeasance since he had “been in the confidence and under employment of the superintendent of Indian affairs. Bishop Hamlin . . . is employed by Dr. Forney among the Indians down south, [and] knows all the facts, but refuses to disclose them, [and] falsely reported to Dr. Forney that the children we brought away were recovered by him from persons who had bought them from Indians.” Furthermore, Hamblin had cheated “the government out of money to again reward the guilty wretches for their inhuman butcheries.”³⁷ Lynch thought it “strange” that Forney would have “employed Mormons, the very confederates of these monsters, who had so wantonly murdered unoffending emigrants, to ferret out the guilty parties” and search for survivors. Lynch’s commentary on Hamblin was simple: “Hamlin [*sic*] cannot [simultaneously] be a Mormon bishop and a friend of the United States, at least, *where Mormons or Mormonism is*

³⁵ J. Forney, Spanish Fork Indian Reservation, to General A. S. Johnston, Commander of Utah Department, Utah Territory, 1 May 1859, in “*Message of the President of the United States*,” 1860, 8–9.

³⁶ “*Message of the President of the United States*,” 1860, especially 11–12, and 79; and <http://1857massacre.com/MMM/lynch.htm>.

³⁷ David Tullis, “*Message of the President of the United States*,” 1860, 78.

concerned. His creed and oaths forbid it, and he could not, if he would, with safety to himself, do it.” Believing that Brigham Young was the mastermind of the massacre, Lynch called for action:

It is now high time that the actors and perpetrators of this dreadful crime should be brought to condign punishment. For years the Mormons have possessed an immunity from punishment or a sort of privilege for committing crimes of this nature, but soon it is to be hoped a new state of things must dawn—a retribution must come, vengeance must be had—civilization humanity and christianity call for it, and the American people must have it. Blood may be shed, difficulties may be encountered, but just as sure as there is a sun at noon-day, retribution will yet overtake the guilty wretches—their aiders, abettors, whether open or hidden under disguise of Government employment.³⁸

By 1860, Lynch’s testimony had made it to the desk of the President of the United States, documenting the atrocities of Mountain Meadows. James Buchanan published it to an already enraged nation.³⁹

The Civil War and The Founding of St. George
“The Object of Settling the South Is to Have Hiding Places
for Those that Will Love and Serve God.”

³⁸ Lynch, Affidavit, italics in original.

³⁹ “*Message of the President of the United States,*” 1860.

As the nation geared up to do something about the Mountain Meadows Massacre, Mormon polygamy, and Brigham Young's continued disregard of federal power, the coming of the American Civil War suddenly put what was called "the Mormon Problem" on the back burner. President Buchanan had issued his "*Message of the President, Communicating . . . Information in Relation to the Massacre at Mountain Meadows, and other Massacres in Utah Territory,*" in May 1860. But on November 7 of that year, Abraham Lincoln was elected on the controversial Republican platform of eradicating "the Twin Relics of Barbarism," slavery and polygamy. By January 1861, South Carolina and other southern states were seceding from the Union, and on April 12, 1861 Confederate batteries opened fire on Fort Sumter in Charleston Harbor, signaling the beginning of the Civil War. After Secretary of War John Floyd resigned on December 29, 1860 to join the Confederacy, Camp Floyd's name was briefly changed to Camp Crittenden, after Kentucky's Senator John Crittenden who was instrumental in keeping Kentucky from seceding from the Union. By July 1861, however, Camp Crittenden was abandoned as its troops were recalled to the east to participate in the conflagration about to engulf the nation. In their absence and in preparation for soldiers' return, Brigham Young strengthened Mormon power in southern Utah, expecting what he began calling "Utah's Dixie" to be the physical battlefield on which the fate of his movement would be decided should the United States of America and the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints actually come to blows. In nineteenth-century Mormon communities, the term "Dixie" was used to delineate the warm climate of Washington and Iron counties in the extreme southwest part of the territory of Utah and lands adjacent to it in Nevada and Arizona. The name embodied the Latter-day Saint hope that cotton, tobacco, wine, and other products about to be cut off by the War of the Rebellion

could be produced in this temperate zone. Similarly, the pride Utahans took in the name “Dixie” suggested something of Utah’s own rebellion against the United States of America.

In 1860, there were fewer than 80 families living south of the rim of the basin. To make this unknown country a viable refuge, Young was aware that he must reinforce it on a massive scale.⁴⁰ To Young, the red rocks of Dixie weren’t just beautiful, they were strategically vital. For one thing, southern Utah was expansive, rough and rocky, and largely unexplored by outsiders, with few known waterholes, and even fewer rivers and springs. Speaking of the whole of Mormon country, Young said in 1855: “I could hide this whole people, and fifty times more, in the midst of these mountains, and our enemies might hunt until they died with old age, and they could not find us.”⁴¹ Young had temporarily moved church headquarters to Parowan during the Utah War, and frequently exulted to the Dixie Saints: “I thank God for these rugged mountains & barren Hills as a Defence for the Saints of God,” adding that “if it was not for the home [in which] we live in these strong mountains[,] the Gentiles would drive us out[,] but [Dixie’s mountains] are so barren & rugged that the Gentiles find no place to stop to get a foothold for the Saints have taken up all places fit for cultivation.”⁴² Brigham Young repeatedly made remarks like this to the Saints he had sent to southern Utah explaining that “If the Nation Makes war upon us again we want some place to go whare [sic] we Can have a safe place to keep our women &

⁴⁰ Arrington, *Great Basin Kingdom*, especially 84–88; Smart and Smart, *Over the Rim*; James Bleak, “Condensed History,” unpaginated; James Bleak “Annals of the Southern Mission”; Albert Miller, *Immortal Pioneers*, especially 9; Juanita Brooks, ed. *Journal of the Southern Indian Mission: Diary of Thomas D. Brown* (Logan: Utah State University Press, 1972); and William R. Palmer, “Indian Mission,” in *Forgotten Chapters of History: A Series of Talks Given Over Radio Station KSUB, Cedar City, Utah*, compiled and published by Merrill Library and Learning Resources Program, Utah State University, Logan, Utah and the heirs of Dr. William R. Palmer, October 1978, vol. 2, no. 63 (March 16, 1952): 1–3, no. 64 (March 23, 1952): 1–3, no. 65 (March 30, 1952): 1–3, and no. 66 (April 6, 1952): 1–3, USHS.

⁴¹ “A Discourse by President Brigham Young, Delivered in the Tabernacle, Great Salt Lake City, July 8, 1855,” *JD*, 2:312

⁴² “Synopsis of President Young’s remarks at Grafton,” September 19, 1864, RTC.

Children in while we have to defend our homes.”⁴³ The object of “settling the South is to have hiding places for those that will love and serve God.”⁴⁴

As rumors of war escalated, the troops at Camp Crittendon were put on notice to be ready to move to the scene of action “at a moments warning.” During the spring of 1861, Young noted that “many of the officers have seceded and removed themselves.” Governor Cumming left for his native Georgia, now part of the Confederacy, and his successor, Acting Governor Francis H. Wootton, also resigned “to strengthen the influence of the new Confederacy in Maryland.” Col. Davies, then Utah’s superintendent of Indian Affairs, was also a secessionist and spent his time “trying to enlist some men to fight for the South” rather than focusing on his official duties. With few, if any, to take notice, it was an auspicious time for Young to make his move to strengthen his southern bastion, so on May 15 he headed south for “the rim of the basin” in a presidential entourage consisting of “48 men, 14 women, 2 children, with 23 carriages, 21 horses, and 42 mules.”⁴⁵ This was the first time since the arrival of the troops in 1858 he could quietly explore the area without provoking a military response from Colonel Johnston. Another motivation was his uncertainty about what the outcome of Civil War might bring—Republicans’ animus toward Mormon polygamy was fierce. Young was concerned enough about the War to announce to his associates that he was taking the drastic step of pulling all missionaries out of the United States.⁴⁶

⁴³ Woodruff, *Journal*, 6:468–469.

⁴⁴ Minutes of Brigham Young Sermon delivered at the Quarterly Conference of the St. George Stake, May 2, 1869, St. George Utah Stake, General Minutes, CR 7836, vol. 3, CHL.

⁴⁵ George A. Smith, Great Salt Lake City, to Brother John L. Smith, June 13, 1861, in JH, 13 June 1861, 1–3; and *New York Times*, July 8, 1861.

⁴⁶ JH, June 14, 1861, 1; JH, May 2, 1861, 1

Young's entourage included "agriculturalists" and "horticulturists" because the church president correctly feared that War in the east would adversely impact the availability of cotton, tobacco, and other products normally obtained from the southern states. Young felt the "near tropical" climate of Utah's Dixie made it perfect for the raising of cotton, tobacco, olive oil, indigo, molasses, and sugar. "The settlements south of the Rim of the Basin are as yet small," he wrote in 1861, "but it is expected they will rapidly strengthen and increase as the demand for cotton increases under increased facilities for its manufacture." Part of Young's visit was to urge the planting of cotton "over the rim" and the establishment of a cotton factory at Parowan. But his "inspection tour" was also militarily strategic. They traveled down the Mormon Corridor to Cedar City "by the customary route," so Young could examine both of the "passes" into his proposed bastion. On the other side of the rim they took the California Road to Santa Clara by way of Pinto and Mountain Meadows where Young personally inspected the massacre site for the first time. Apostle Wilford Woodruff, the official historian of the expedition, wrote that they found a pile of stones "about 12 feet high" that had been put up by "Company K 1st Dragoons" in 1859, about the time Hamblin turned the survivors over to Superintendent Forney.⁴⁷

As they passed over the rim of the basin, Woodruff immediately noted a change in temperature, writing: "We soon came to warm weather so we had to strip to our shirt sleeves." Approaching Santa Clara they passed through a tight spot in the gorge of Santa Clara Creek descriptively named "Jacob's Twist," where the road tortuously threaded its way through windy and perpendicular rock narrows. Certainly following Young's lead, Woodruff noted in his official record that "Jacob's Twist could be easily defended against an Enemy, as few Could get

⁴⁷ Brigham Young, G. S. L. City, to Presidents Amasa M. Lyman and Chas. C. Rich, June 13, 181, in JH, June 13, 1861, 4; and Woodruff, *Journal*, 5:577.

into it at a time ‘and it twists like an augur [*sic*].’” Near the mouth of the gorge, Young found Santa Clara, a tiny village of thirty houses and thirty-four men. He was gratified to find Fort Clara surrounded by excellent orchards and vineyards and a healthy crop of cotton. He also visited every other settlement “over the Rim of the Basin,” including Tonaquint, Washington, Virgin City, Toquerville, Grafton, and Adventure (now known as Rockville), as well as Gunlock and Harrisburg. He found the population “under the Rim” scattered and “very small,” amounting to only “79 families in all.”⁴⁸ Though he was not quick to announce the extent of the plans he was then formulating, Young was about to dramatically change the future of Utah’s Dixie by establishing a temple at St. George.⁴⁹

On the way back north toward the passage of the Black Ridge Gorge, Young took a detour to examine the settlements located in the gorge of the Virgin. Heading toward what is now the west entrance of Zion National Park, Young’s company passed over some “very rough country through narrow defiles and rugged Canyons.” Woodruff journalized: “This Country from Tokerville to Adventure is the best place to hide up women & Children and defend them in time of war for no army could get into these pockets & openings if there was a few men to oppose them.” On their return trip to Cedar City, they passed through Black Ridge Gorge, a long defile which similarly could be easily defended. Young had now examined both entrances into his southern bastion and found their defensive characteristics more than adequate.⁵⁰ Back in Salt Lake, on June 9, Young’s second counselor in the First Presidency, Daniel H. Wells, addressed

⁴⁸ JH, 26 May 1861, 1; and Woodruff, *Journal*, 5:577–578.

⁴⁹ James Bleak, “Condensed History,” unpaginated; and Anthony W. Ivins, “Autobiography of Anthony Woodward Ivins, Salt Lake City, Utah. July 1st, 1923,” 22, AWI, b1,f3." Albert Miller, *Immortal Pioneers*, 29–30.

⁵⁰ JH, 29 May 1861, 1; and Woodruff, *Journal*, 5:579–580.

the assembled Saints in “the new bowery,” rejoicing in the defensive properties of the territory they had passed over:

This land is choice above all other lands for the Saints of God, for there is no other land that I know of by travel, by description or by report that combin[e]s so many and such great facilities and advantages to benefit the Saints of the Most High. Here [can be found] the most secure places and the most formidable barriers against interruptions from any foreign foe. I feel every time I think of it, as I sta[r]ted south, that every mountain ridge, the wide and extended plains, and every sage brush, I look upon as a friend to the Saints, and that they are thrown around them as an insurmountable barrier against those who desire the overthrow of the kingdom of God upon the earth. But here we are, where we can draw from the elements those things that we need, where we are protected from those that seek our overthrow and destruction.

The Lord our God has done this, and has brought this people to it. Here is a land prepared for us where we can build and inhabit, multiply and increase, and become a great and a mighty people.⁵¹

St. George: A City Born in a Day

Brigham Young took the first step to fill his southern bastion with Latter-day Saints at the Semi-Annual General Conference held in Salt Lake City on October 6–8, 1861, where he called

⁵¹ JH, June 9, 1861, 1.

about 300 families to settle “over the Rim of the Basin.” A year later this number was augmented by 200 more. Young had directed George A. Smith to make up a list of “missionaries” for the 1861 contingent and called upon Apostles Orson Hyde and John Taylor to help him. The tally they produced included a host of individuals and families who would one day be intimately connected with Pipe Springs.⁵² Two of these members brought substantial economic resources to the area: Horace S. Eldredge, “one of the commercial founders of the Mormon commonwealth in Utah,”⁵³ and Dr. James M. Whitmore, a wealthy Texas cattleman who with his wife Elizabeth had brought a chest full of gold and a giant herd of Texas Longhorns and fine horses to Utah in 1857.⁵⁴ Part of Young’s plan for his new bastion called for a closed Mormon economy designed to exclude gentiles. From the start, he saw stock-raising as an important industry to support the new center he was planning south of the rim, and he hand-picked James Whitmore and his cattle to help establish it.

Throughout October, Brigham Young instructed the colonizing missionaries that “he wished a city to be located on the slope north of the junction of the Santa Clara with the Rio Virgin and said it should be named St. George.” Young’s instructions were that “a sufficient number of mechanics such as coopers, blacksmiths, carpenters, masons, plasterers, joiners, etc.,” be sent with a view “to the necessities of [making] a new colony.” “It is expected,” Young said, that those called would “become *permanent settlers* in the southern region, and that they will cheerfully contribute their efforts to supply the Territory with cotton, sugar, grapes, tobacco, figs,

⁵² Among those called (or whose parents were called) who would later have some connection with Pipe Springs were James Andrus, Alexander F. Findlay, Joseph L. Heywood, Anthony W. Ivins, William B. Maxwell, Robert McIntyre, John M. Moody, Charles Pulsipher, Erastus Snow, James M. Whitmore, Anson P. Winsor, and John R. Young. For the entire list of 309 families called to Dixie in 1861, see JH, October 8, 1861, 1–9.

⁵³ Tullidge’s *Quarterly Magazine*, 1 (April 1881): 368.

⁵⁴ PSLA, VF, FH, Whitmore.

almonds, olive oil, and such other useful articles.” Aware that such a sudden move would jolt not only the personal finances of the families involved but the entire northern Utah housing market, he directed that “those who are unable to sell out without too great a sacrifice, can take a portion of their families, or go themselves with team and implements and put in a crop this winter, and remove their families hereafter.”⁵⁵ Young planned to run a telegraph line from Salt Lake to his southern bastion so that if he was actually ever forced to take refuge there, he could administer his kingdom remotely by wire. The National Transcontinental Telegraph Line was completed on 17 October 1861 and on that very day Brigham Young and George A. Smith spent some time “calculating the cost of building a telegraph line from Salt Lake City to Santa Clara.” It would be built at an enormous expense, for the Prophet estimated that it would probably cost “\$175 per mile” for the length of some 350 miles, for a total of \$61,250.⁵⁶

Young directed that Apostles George A. Smith, Orson Pratt, Erastus Snow and capitalists Horace S. Eldredge and Dr. James M. Whitmore go in advance of the main body of colonizing missionaries to select the exact location for St. George and other requisite new settlement sites. They were to take Israel Ivins along as a surveyor.⁵⁷ Exchanging their northern Utah homes for wagons and stock, it took the missionaries about thirty days to make the journey to Dixie, crossing the rim of the basin by the first week in December 1861. As Young instructed, Smith, Snow, and Whitmore arrived early and made their investigation,⁵⁸ and settled on the flats of the

⁵⁵ JH, October 13, 1861, 1–2

⁵⁶ JH, October 16, 1861, 2, and October 17, 1861, 1.

⁵⁷ Though Young had already “prophesied” the site of the new town, he was usually more of a pragmatist than a prophet and gave his committee free rein to “ascertain which was the best place” for the central city, “and have it built up immediately,” and then see that the whole “district of country. . . be built up from there.” JH, October 17, 1861, 1. Erastus Snow and Orson Pratt had famously been the first Mormons to enter the Salt Lake Valley, in July 1847, and it seems they were chosen to head up the settlement of Young’s new bastion in the south as a symbol of a new beginning. Andrew Karl Larson, *Erastus Snow: The Life of a Missionary and Pioneer for the Early Mormon Church* (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1971), 329.

⁵⁸ Somehow Pratt was waylaid in Parowan.

St. George Valley as Young had prophesied they would. Smith wrote that his committee found “the land more susceptible of irrigation than they expected, and of much better quality.” Similarly, they found “more water than they expected . . . which was also of a better quality” than they could have hoped. Significantly, for the future economy of the whole region, they found that “the amount of grass and other facilities for stock-raising [were] inexhaustible to all appearance,” *except* immediately around their proposed settlement site. Flooding into the valley on the investigative committee’s heels were “about four hundred wagons” full of Latter-day Saints and their household wares.⁵⁹

Before the missionaries ever left northern Utah, a petition was sent to the United States Postmaster General requesting that a post office be opened at St. George and that Orson Pratt be appointed as postmaster. Noting this peculiar aspect of Mormon colonization, St. George historian Albert E. Miller wrote: “Seldom, if ever before, was a city named, a post office applied for, and a postmaster selected, before the location was made, but this was the case of St. George.” Apparently the name St. George was a fixed to the “central city” of Washington County as this petition was read to Brigham Young. George A. Smith asked him what the name would be. Young told Smith he would name it, if Smith would be satisfied with the name he chose. Smith agreed, whereupon Young named it St. George.⁶⁰

James & Elizabeth Whitmore and “The Finest Stock [in] the Country”

⁵⁹ George A. Smith, G. S. L. City, to John L. Smith, December 5, 1861, in JH, 5 December 1861, 1; and James Bleak, “*Condensed History*,” unpaginated.

⁶⁰ Andrew Jenson, *Encyclopedic History of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints* [. . .] (Salt Lake City: Deseret News Publishing Company, 1941), 726.

St. George pioneers found that wealth was most easily transported “on the hoof.” But livestock needed to be maintained by water and grass and they found that the land immediately around Dixie’s new mother settlement was nearly bereft of grass. At first they hired community herdsman to herd their cattle “on shares” along Fort Pearce Wash, in the shadow of the Hurricane Cliffs, some eleven miles southwest of St. George. At some point in 1862, however, John, Charles, and William Pulsipher discovered extensive grasslands on Shoal Creek, some thirty-six miles north of St. George, and they began herding a large portion of the St. George cattle on shares there. Their father, Zera Pulsipher, was a General Authority in the First Quorum of Seventy who was tapped by Brigham Young to care for church tithing cattle in the St. George region. The Pulsiphers named the stock-raising village that arose on Shoal Creek “Hebron” “after the herdgrounds where Abraham settled when the Lord led him out of Babylon to the Land of Canaan.”⁶¹ As in the biblical story, however, they needed better grass for Dixie’s extensive herds, which drove cattlemen and sheepherders over the massive Hurricane to the east, where Jacob Hamblin had previously discovered hundreds of thousands of acres of prime desert grasslands on “the Hurricane Plateau.” Samuel Gould was one of the first to move his flocks and herds there, establishing “Gould’s Ranch” at a spring that constituted a major water hole on the Pipe Springs corridor.⁶² Others soon followed and pressed further into what they would soon be calling their New Canaan. William B. Maxwell made a ranch on Short Creek. Levi Savage, Jr., herded his sheep first at Moccasin Springs, and later moved them to “the vicinity of pipe springs.” The economic power and ecclesiastical support behind the large herds of James M.

⁶¹ Genesis 13:18; “Hebron Ward Historical Records, 1862–1872, Clerk John Pulsipher,” 1–10, CHL; Jenson, *Encyclopedic History of the Church*, 329–330; John Lewis Pulsipher, *The Life and Travels of John Lewis Pulsipher, 1884–1963: The Autobiography of a Southern Nevada Pioneer* (n.p., n.d.), 2; and Luther M. Winsor, “Life History of Luther M. Winsor,” 1, FHL.

⁶² Gould’s Ranch was about 2.5 miles from the edge of the Hurricane Cliffs.

Whitmore allowed him to chase Savage and other “small operators” off, making him the master of Pipe Springs and its gigantic range, which was viewed as the best range between Gould’s Ranch and Kanab.⁶³

On April 13, 1863, a land certificate was issued by the Washington County (Utah) Recorder certifying that James M. Whitmore was “the lawful claimant of Lot One Block one of Pipe Springs Farming Land Survey containing one hundred and sixty acres of land.” More evidence of the interchangeable singular and plural usage of Pipe’s name, this small certificate referred to the place both as Pipe Spring and Pipe Springs in just a few lines of text. Early Mormons knew Pipe was actually in Arizona but since the nearest government office of that territory lay hundreds of miles away and across the chasm of the Grand Canyon (and because they considered Pipe to belong to Zion), during this early period it was treated as though it was in Utah. As a result, early owners of Pipe Springs paid road building assessments and other taxes to Utah or its counties.⁶⁴

Dr. James M. Whitmore and his wife Elizabeth Carter Flahrity Whitmore were perhaps the wealthiest couple on George A. Smith’s list of the 309 families called to Brigham’s Bastion in 1861. Like many others on the list, they were from the South. James was born in Tennessee and Elizabeth in Alabama, but the pair considered themselves Texans when they were converted to the Mormon Church in the Lone Star State in 1856. Family tradition has preserved three separate stories explaining why James was called “Doctor” or “Dock Whitmore.” The two most

⁶³ Savage probably arrived in Dixie in 1862. Anson P. Winsor, who later built Winsor Castle at Pipe Springs, was the Bishop of Rockville and, as the bishop of the eastern-most major settlement, had jurisdiction over the grazing lands south of the Vermilion Cliffs, including those around Pipe Springs and modern day Kanab, which Savage here calls “Knarb.” Levi Savage, Jr., Tokerville, to President Brigham Young, February 2, 1871, BYP.

⁶⁴ Pipe Springs Land Certificate, April 13, 1863, Joint Washington & Kane County Probate Court Record Book B, 43, P.T. Reiley typescript and related papers, in PTR, s8, b10, f 150.

frequently told were that he apprenticed as a druggist or as a veterinarian in his youth, but a third explained that he served “in the medical corps” during the Mexican War.⁶⁵ According to family accounts “Dock Whitmore” specialized in “animal digestive systems” and met Elizabeth when he delivered “medicine for some special cattle” at Flahrity’s ranch south of Dallas. Her father, Richard Carter, was an exceptionally wealthy slave-owning cattleman who specialized in taming and marketing wild Texas longhorns, the feral descendants of cattle “introduced by Coronado in 1541.” When Whitmore married Elizabeth in 1853, she held great personal wealth in the form of the long-horned cattle and took an enormous herd of Texas Longhorns Zionward in 1857.

Elizabeth’s father, however, stipulated if she did not “become a permanent citizen of some state or territory not subject to Mormon government within ten years from the probate of this will[,] the moiety or portions of my Estate herein allotted and bequeathed to her shall laps as to her and be divided equal between” his surviving daughter and his grandchildren from his two deceased children.⁶⁶ Whitmore family histories are numerous and contradictory, but they paint Elizabeth as a potent force in the Carter-Whitmore partnership. It appears that in May 1857 she returned to settle some business in Texas and left their ranch on Waxahachie Creek, just south of Dallas, with a herd of “about 3,000” Texas longhorns. In addition to the cowboys she hired to drive the cattle, she was accompanied by a group of emigrating Mormons. Along the trail they had several battles with Native Americans, an encounter with a herd of buffalo that stampeded their cattle, and repeated difficulties forcing the cattle across many of America’s great rivers. At Fort

⁶⁵ Unless otherwise specified the information in these paragraphs on the Whitmores comes from numerous and disheveled family histories in PSLA, VF, FH, Whitmore; Le Landgren, *A Whitmore Family History, 1793–1990* (West Linn, OR: Bob Chamberlain, Family Gathering, 1990), PSLA; Mary Louise Whitmore Price, “Family History of Mary Louise Whitmore Price,” CHL; and “A Brief History of Mary Louisa Whitmore,” CHL.

⁶⁶ Last Will and Testament of Richard Carter, State of Texas, Brazos County, November 25, 1860, in PSLA, VF, FH, Whitmore.

Leavenworth, Kansas, Elizabeth sold 1,300 steers to the US Army, which was then sending troops to Utah to “destroy the Mormons.” It was a legacy that, along with the 1,800 remaining longhorns she and James eventually brought to Utah, attracted the attention of Brigham Young.

James and Elizabeth Whitmore’s wealth bought them influence and position enjoyed by few Latter-day Saints. James sat in the House of Representatives in the Territorial Legislature and was called by Young, as part of the elite party of five, to select the actual site of St. George. Since most of those called to the new Southern Mission were indigent, Young depended upon Whitmore and a handful of other wealthy capitalists among the missionaries to support the economy of the southern bastion. Upon settling in Dixie, Whitmore almost immediately opened a freighting company that carried merchandise between St. George and Salt Lake. When Young sought to expand commerce in his kingdom by establishing a post on the Colorado to which he hoped to freight supplies into Utah by way of steamboats, he depended on Whitmore and a few others to make it happen. Meanwhile, Whitmore needed the best range possible for his large herds of cattle, sheep, and fine horses.

According to family records, the Whitmores arrived in Utah on September 15, 1857, “six weeks in front of the Army.” James participated in fortifying Echo Canyon and joined with other Nauvoo Legionnaires to keep General Johnston’s troops out of the settlements during the winter of 1857–1858. While the “Doctor” was only thirty-one years of age at the time, in January 1858 Young selected him to be part of a committee of five to draft a letter of complaint to President Buchanan. Entitled *An Address From the Citizens of Great Salt Lake City to His Excellency James Buchanan, President of the United States*, and dated January 16, 1858, Dr. Whitmore and his fellows described the Latter-day Saint community as those “who dwell in the mountains, far from the busy world without.” They reminded the president that the “strong hand of oppression”

had driven them “to this desert, mountainous country” and that they “hoped here to unmolestedly enjoy those rights which we had been denied [to the church] in Ohio, Missouri and Illinois.” Regarding the Army, then in winter quarters just east of the Mormon settlements, they said, “It has been reiterated, again and again, by the troops selected to come here, that they intended to possess our houses, slay our leaders, ravish our wives and daughters and pollute the pure valleys of Utah with their fiendish revelries.” They boldly told the president: “Your army will not be permitted to enter our valleys,” and promised to destroy their settlements rather than “surrender” the “domestic inalienable rights” of Utah Territory. They closed their missive by warning Buchanan that if he continued his “present course” his grave would “be pointed out as that of the man who broke the noblest of national compacts” and that his name would be “consigned to future generations with lasting infamy.”⁶⁷

Young and Whitmore expected the Whitmores to be at Pipe Springs for the long haul. After building a small dugout where he and several hands could stay, he laid out strong corrals, planted fruit trees and a large vineyard, and cultivated several large fields that he irrigated with spring water. Like all Dixie missionaries, Whitmore had been called by Young “to make the desert blossom as a rose” and he did his best to fulfill his plan. In fact, among the minutes of Whitmore’s St. George speeches is a sermon he gave at a conference in November 1864 wherein he articulated his faithfulness to the Mormon religion and its prophet. “Elder J. M. Whitmore,” the minutes read, “expressed his satisfaction with his home in the south, and that he intended to be obedient to the counsel of those over him. He spoke of the advantages of union in carrying on

⁶⁷ Elijah F. Sheets, A. H. Raleigh, Gilbert Clements, J. M. Whitmore, and William Moody, “An Address From the Citizens of Great Salt Lake City to His Excellency James Buchanan, President of the United States,” Great Salt Lake City, Utah Territory, 16 January 1858, in JH, January 16, 1858, 1–2.

any work, especially so with us in the Kingdom of God.”⁶⁸ James G. Bleak, the official historian of the Southern Utah Mission, provided an early snapshot of Whitmore’s work at Pipe Springs from an inspection tour made by Apostle Erastus Snow in May 1865.⁶⁹ He described the “2 houses and inclosures” at Gould’s Ranche, located only 2 to 3 miles from the fault. Eight miles more brought them to “Tenney’s Sheep Troughs,” and twelve miles from “Tenney’s” over a road of “heavy sand” brought them to William Maxwell’s Ranche at Short Creek, where they overnighted after enjoying an “excellent supper of (goat meat) Butter Milk & Bread.” “Maxwell’s Ranche” consisted of “two houses [and] an inclosure in which is raised some corn and wheat.” Here Bleak learned of “the Indian Trail” which passed through the Vermilion Cliffs via Short Creek Canyon and up over Canaan Mountain to the village of Shonesburg, near Zion’s Canyon. Bleak wrote that “the Indian trail from over this ridge follows down creavas[es]” where travelers scamper “like chimney sweeps over the face of [the precipice] by means of two ladders and so down until you grow dizzy contemplating them.”

The tour then descended into Antelope Valley at Cedar Ridge. Bleak wrote the following of their visit to Whitmore’s ranch at Pipe Springs and the remainder of their journey to the small settlement of Kanab:

At the foot of the descent from Maxwell’s [Cedar Ridge] we nooned, thence over a good road 8 miles to Pipe Springs and Whitmores ranche. An excellent stock range [with an] abundance of grass. clear cool water bubling up from [?]. Mr. Whitmore has a

⁶⁸ *Deseret News*, December 14, 1864, 7, UDN.

⁶⁹ See James Andrus, Capt., and F.B. Woolley, Adjt., “Report of Reconoitering Expedition [to] Mouth of the Green River, 1866,” submitted to Brigadier General Erastus Snow, September 18, 1866, in Gregory C. Crampton, ed., “Military Reconnaissance in Southern Utah, 1866,” *UHQ* 32 (April 1964): 149; and Edwin D. Woolley, Jr., “Pipe Springs Story No. 12,” 1, in WSC, b3, f9.

comfortable “dugout” not yet having had time to build a house[. He] has two fields . . . under cultivation containing about 11 acres of excellent land. [Whitmore] has set out 2000 grape vines, peach, apple, and other trees, good coralls for stock & he milks 50 cows and boasts the finest stock of the country. . . . Bidding adù [sic] to the hospitable quarters of the Doctor, we were soon again in saddle . . . about 4 miles road very sandy to Moccasin Springs . . . the road continues the same general course, over a gently undulating country on the foot hills of the Virgen Mountains [The Vermilion Cliffs]. . . . to our right is the valley of Pipe Springs the water of which escapes through a deep gorge to the colorado extending with a gentle ~~indentation on the North~~ from the rim of the basin to the Colorado . . . No streams and but [few] Springs enliven this wide waste of upland scarce a tree can be seen in all the valley. it is one vast stretch of plain covered at the present season with grass ~~which gives~~ The herds dotting it here and there finding water at the springs named and a few others of less water, 14 miles from the Moccassin Spring we found the “Canab,” a small stream issueing from a Kanyon from the North, there [are] at present six families located here, [The people of Kanab] have the Kanyon fenced across above [und] and in the Kanyon is their farming and hay land of an ecellent quality about 50 acres have in all been under cultivation not all sown yet this spring. Wheat, Corn, Potatoes and Vegetables are successfully grown, also cotton is grown but not successfully I should think as they must be subject to late and early frosts.⁷⁰

⁷⁰ James G. Bleak, “Journal of Trip to the Head Waters of the Rio Virgen and Sevier,” March–June 1865, James G. Bleak Collection, CHL, Ms 10587.

James Whitmore was a busy man. He and Elizabeth had at least six living children—at the time, all under the age of thirteen. They maintained homes both in St. George and in Salt Lake. His freighting business between those two cities kept him constantly on the go, as did Young’s project to freight goods to Zion by way of Colorado River steamboats. Between 1864 and his death in January 1866, Whitmore made repeated trips to Callville, Young’s proposed freighting center on the Colorado where Young, Whitmore, and other investors had Anson Call build a warehouse to receive shipped goods for Whitmore and other Salt Lake merchants.⁷¹ Dr. Whitmore was also highly involved in St. George’s civic and ecclesiastical affairs. Whitmore actually spent very little time at Pipe Springs, and he hired a fellow Texas convert and family friend, Robert McIntyre, who was in his early twenties, to watch his cattle, horses, mules and sheep. Robert McIntyre was the son of John M. Moody’s plural wife, Margaret McIntyre. She had three sons with her former husband, who died after the family joined the church in Texas. Moody raised the McIntyre boys as his own, and he and Margaret had a daughter together named Mary. The Moodys had been “friends and neighbors” of the Whitmores in Texas, in Salt Lake, and now in St. George. Both families were described as “people of refinement” who had brought property to Zion “which, by comparison at that time, entitled them to be regarded as possessed of wealth.”⁷²

⁷¹ Angus Cannon, who was involved in the Callville enterprise and helped Whitmore locate the warehouse, wrote that “a warehouse [was built] on the Colorado river at the highest point that could be reached by steamers. The idea then was to bring supplies, merchandise, etc., into Utah by that route--through the Gulf of California, up the Colorado and overland to Utah. The merchants of Salt Lake were interested in the project and planned to bring merchandise in in this way. It was known that a man named Lieutenant Ives, in the employ of our government, had brought a boat up to Roaring Rapids in 1857, and reported that to be the head of navigation.” Cannon describes in detail the difficulties that he and Whitmore and their guide Jacob Hamblin had in locating the warehouse. See “Angus M. Cannon Tells of Early Stirring Times,” in *Salt Lake Herald*, February 26, 1905, 2, and 20, UDN. See also *Deseret News*, January 18, 1865, 4, UDN.

⁷² Anthony Ivins, “Traveling Over Forgotten Trails,” *Improvement Era*, 19 (February 1916): 350–351.

Chapter 3

Pipe Springs and the Navajo War

Mormons became aware of Navajo raids on their flocks and herds on December 18, 1865 when “the Indians made a break” on Kanab and took four horses out of a corral jointly owned by Levi Savage and a “Brother Smith.” Local Kaibabites living with the Mormons in Kanab also had some of their horses stolen and reported that tracks and other signs indicated that numerous small bands of Navajo raiders were operating in their country. The raiders came on foot, hoping to leave mounted and driving herds of horses, mules, cattle and sheep filched from the Mormons. Before a month had passed, Salt Lake newspapers were reporting that the Ute War Chief Black Hawk had recruited between “150 and 200” Navajo who had “driven off some 700 or 800 head of cattle, horses and sheep” and that they intended to stay in the country from Kanab to St. George until they got “all” of the Mormons’ stock.¹ At the time of these first Navajo incursions, there were significant Latter-day Saint ranching centers east of the Hurricane Fault at Gould’s Ranch, Tenney’s Troughs, Short Creek, Pipe Springs, Moccasin, Kanab and on the Paria River.² Desperately hungry Navajo had been pushed toward Utah while attempting to elude Colonel Christopher “Kit” Carson’s 1863–1865 “Navajo round-up,” forced deportation, and “Long Walk” to the Bosque Redondo Reservation in eastern New Mexico. Before the round-up, the pastoral Navajo had been the richest and most populous tribe in the United States, with gigantic

¹ James G. Bleak, St. George City, to George A. Smith, Historian, January 15, 1866, GAS; *Salt Lake Telegraph*, January 26, 1866, and February 2 and 3, 1866, NCN; and KSMH, December 1865–January 1866.

² Andrew L. Siler, Northrup, Kane County, Utah, to Professor J.P. Kirtland, December 25, 1865, in *Cleveland (Ohio) Herald*, February 7, 1866, NCN.

herds of sheep, goats, horses, and cattle. But unrelenting federal campaigns aimed at the Navajo and their stock reduced them to a state of utter destitution. One band under Ganado Mucho, for example, had owned 40,000 sheep which US troops bayoneted and left in grand heaps upon the ground as part of a scorched earth policy directed against the Diné.³ The Navajo first sought to replenish their decimated herds by stealing stock from neighboring tribes, especially the Hopi. First Presidency member George A. Smith reported that “the killing of the Navajoe sheep by federal authority rendered the Navajoes destitute and desperate and to sustain themselves they robbed the peaceful Moquis of 15000 Sheep which reduced the latter to famine, in which 24 men and 22 women perished.”⁴ As part of Brigham Young’s southern strategy, from as early 1858, Jacob Hamblin and his missionaries had provided the Moqui with rifles and ammunition to help them ward off Navajo incursions. By 1865, Hamblin estimated his missionaries had left “between 20 and 30 old guns” which the Hopi sometimes used to steal stock from the Navajo. When the Hopi used arms supplied by the Mormons to retrieve stock Diné raiders had just driven away from Utah, the enraged Navajo increased their incursions against both sides of the Mormon-Hopi alliance.⁵

³ Lawrence C. Kelley, *Navajo Roundup: Selected Correspondence of Kit Carson’s Expedition Against the Navajo, 1863–1865* (Boulder, CO: Pruett Publishing Company, 1970); and J. H. Beadle, *The Undeveloped West; or Five Years in the Territories: Being a Complete History of that vast Region Between the Mississippi and the Pacific*. . . (Philadelphia: National Publishing Company, 1873), 641. Barboncito, also known as *Hastiin Daghaa’i* or “Man of Whiskers,” was captured at Canyon de Chelly in September 1864 by Colonel Kit Carson’s soldiers and forced into captivity at the Navajo and Mescalero Apache reservation at Bosque Redondo. With some 500 followers he escaped the reservation in June 1865 and headed far to the northwest to join Manuelito and other Navajo who had never been captured who had fled toward northern Arizona and southern Utah. It is known that Manuelito participated in raids against the Mormons, and likely that Barboncito did. Certainly his followers did. David M. Brugge, “Barboncito,” in Mark C. Carnes, ed., *American National Biography: Supplement 2* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2005), 14–15; www.lapahie.com/Barboncito.cfm; and John Peterson, *Utah’s Black Hawk War*, especially 88, 216–218, 223–224.

⁴ George A. Smith, “Autobiography,” in *Historian’s Office Letterpress Copybooks*, 338–339, CHL.

⁵ Tenney, “Recollections,” 8; Thales Haskel, *Journal*, 2 March 1860, in Juanita Brooks, ed., “Journal of Thales H. Haskell,” *UHQ* 12 (January and April 1944): 94; HOJ, 4 June 1869, SCA, dvd 1:17, 30:203; Jacob Hamblin and John R. Young, Kanab Mission, to Prest. Geo. A. Smith, 12 September 1869, PISP, doc. 1642; Erastus Snow and John W. Young, St. George, to Elder Jacob Hamblin and the Brethren who will accompany him to Moquis Country,

The Pipe Springs Murders

After the Navajo thefts on Mormon stock in December 1865, Levi Savage and four other Kanab Mormons joined by “25 or 30 Piedes” followed some of the thieves but were unable to overtake them before they made the Colorado crossing. Simultaneously “all the stock from Peter Shirts’ settlement on the Pah-Reah” were driven away, while a number of horses “and a quantity of other stock were taken from Roundy’s settlement on the [Upper] Kanab.” Clearly multiple raiding bands were in the area, making a coordinated sweep of poorly guarded Mormon herds ranging over a vast area of the Arizona Strip extending from the Paria River to the Hurricane Fault.⁶ James Whitmore had just returned to St. George from a trip to Callville on December 18, and sometime after Christmas took his oldest son George (who was then twelve years of age) to bring supplies to Robert McIntyre who was living alone in a crude herd house at Pipe as the primary herder of Whitmore’s stock. The doctor’s cattle, horses, and mules were scattered over the Pipe Valley range, while several hundred sheep were herded by McIntyre near the Springs. McIntyre and the two Whitmores apparently were impervious to the fact that large numbers of their stock had already been driven off and that they were about to be robbed again.⁷

About the time of Whitmore’s arrival at his ranch, a Northern Ute named Patnish who had been living among Paiute and Navajo east of the Colorado River, led a combined force of

24 September 1869, in Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:14; Reilly, *Lee’s Ferry*, 5 and 9; Charles M. Robinson, III, ed., *The Diaries of John Gregory Bourke, vol. 1, November 20, 1872–July 28, 1876* (Denton, TX: University of North Texas Press, 2003), 84; and Beadle, *Undeveloped West*, 616.

⁶ James G. Bleak, St. George City, to George A. Smith, *Historian*, January 15, 1866, GAS; Erastus Snow, St. George, to President B. Young, 12 February 1866, BYP; and *Salt Lake Telegraph*, 26 January 1866, NCN.

⁷ Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 1:208.

Navajo, Paiute, and Ute raiders to Pipe Springs.⁸ Some Mormons were later convinced by circumstantial evidence that a pair of Paiute from the Cedar City area named KK John and Charlie Howd were also involved.⁹ On the morning of January 8, 1866, James Whitmore and Robert McIntyre left young George Whitmore at the ranch, telling him they were going to “hunt up some horses” and return before dinner. That night Patnish and his helpers gathered up Whitmore’s sheep and drove them toward the Colorado. There are various contemporary accounts as to the number of sheep taken from Pipe Springs, most ranging from 185 to 600, while one Washington County resident reported to Salt Lake newspapers that “it is pretty certain that they had driven off some 700 or 800 head of cattle, horses and sheep.” The Nauvoo Legion (the church militia) examined the area and obtained information from “friendly Indians,” and became convinced this was no isolated incident, but that it was part of a much larger operation in which multiple raiding parties had been clearing the range of Mormon owned stock “all winter.” On February 2, scarcely three weeks after the raid at Pipe Springs, the *Salt Lake Daily Telegraph* published a letter from Dixie announcing that “Black Hawk is with the Navajoes [in the south],

⁸ Patnish was a reportedly “Yampahute” from northern Utah by birth who “was raised among the Navajos and finally became chief of a small faction made up of Navajos, Utes and Pahutes.” According to Anthony W. Ivins, Patnish created “an element of disturbance” generally favored by “neither the Utes nor Navajos.” Patnish’s “country” was said to be east of the Colorado crossings near Navajo Mountain, and his band was often referred to by Mormons as a collection of “renegade” Paiute and Navajo. Modern Southern Paiute of the Kaibab Band call these mixed Indians *Ne-we-pah-hoon-wits*, or “Navajo-Paiute.” Benn Pikyavit, interview by John A. Peterson, Pipe Spring National Monument, 18 June 2014. Anthony Ivins further stated that Patnish, whom he sometimes called Pahnish, was “a bad man, who was responsible for a great part of the trouble which later developed between the settlers of Southern Utah and the Navajos and their Pah-ute neighbors.” It was not immediately known that Patnish led the raiding band, but by 1870 whites generally believed he led the raiders to Pipe Springs. For example, in December 1870 the *Deseret News* published a letter by George A. Smith that said “Patnish, the Yampahute chief who led the Navajos who killed Dr. Whitmore and Robert McIntyre five years ago, has now crossed the Colorado, with a band, and threatens the lives and property of the inhabitants of the southeastern frontier.” See also Anthony W. Ivins, *Journal*, October 29, 1875, as quoted in *Manuscript History of the Arizona Mission*, CHL; Anthony W. Ivins, “Traveling Over Forgotten Trails,” *Improvement Era* 19 (February 1916): 352; George A. Smith, St. George, to Editor *Deseret News*, December 10, 1870, in *Deseret News* 14 December 1870, 8, UDN; and John Peterson, *Utah’s Black Hawk War*.

⁹ James Andrus, Captain Commanding, Grafton, U. T., to Geo. A. Smith, March 12, 1866, GAS. Coal Creek John (also known as “Panguitch John”) and Charlie Howd will be discussed in detail later.

and they say they intend to stay in that country till they get all the stock. They are reported [to be] about 150 to 200 strong.”¹⁰

James Whitmore had much experience with Native Americans in Texas as well as in Utah, Arizona, and Nevada. He had employed his medical skills on their behalf and reportedly was well-liked by the Kaibabit in the vicinity of Pipe Springs. Not expecting trouble, the wealthy rancher set out that morning armed with nothing more than a cash and a bundle of Salt Lake City mortgages he kept constantly on his person. About four miles southwest of Pipe Springs, in a place Edwin D. Woolley, Jr., called “red clay flat,” Patnish and his band discovered the stockmen while driving away “all” of Whitmore’s sheep and “about four hundred head of brother [Rhoades’] cattle.” They had apparently already driven away “60 or 70 [head] of fine horses” branded with Whitmore’s “J.W.” on their left thighs. According to testimony by the Native Americans, the white men tried to outrun the raiders but their mounts mired in the rain-soaked clay and the Indians overtook them. Mormons later learned from natives that McIntyre had a pistol and fought valiantly for his life. Both men, however, were soon filled with arrows and each was finished off with a point-blank pistol shot to the head. The raiders then took the ranchers’ mounts, most of their clothing, McIntyre’s pistol, and Whitmore’s pocketbook, cash, and papers.¹¹ Frank Chuarumpeak, a chief of the Kaibabit, later told the Mormons that the

¹⁰ B. F. Pendleton, St. George to Jacob Gates, January 13, 1866, *Salt Lake Daily Telegraph*, January 26, 1866, NCN; James G. Bleak, St. George, to George A. Smith, Historian, January 15, 1866, GAS; W.H. Crawford, Washington, to T. B. H. Stenhouse, Esq., January 21, 1866, *Salt Lake Daily Telegraph*, February 2, 1866, NCN; and Clement Walter Powell, Winsor Castle, Utah Territory, to the *Chicago Tribune*, in *UHQ* 16–17 (1848–1849): 400.

¹¹ See previous footnote; John Peterson, *Utah’s Black Hawk War*, 218–224; James G. Bleak, St. George, to George A. Smith, Historian, January 15, 1866, GAS; Henry Lunt, Cedar City, to George A. Smith, January 17, 1866, GAS; Anson P. Winsor, Grafton, Kane Co., to President Erastus Snow, January 22, 1866, BYP; *Salt Lake Telegraph*, January 26, 1866; Robert Gardner, St. George, to Prest. E. Snow, January 27, 1866, BYP; George A. Smith, Parowan, to George Q. Cannon, February 13, 1866, BYP; Jacob Hamblin and John R. Young, Kanab Mission, to Prest. Geo. A. Smith, September 12, 1869, PISP, doc. 1642; *Ogden Standard*, December 29, 1894, 1; Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 1:209–211; Angus M. Cannon, “Angus M. Cannon Tells of Early Stirring Times,” and “Story of Indian War in the Arizona Strip,” *Salt Lake Herald*, February 26, 1905, 2 and 20, UDN; 3 variant copies of Elizabeth Woolley Jensen, “The Story of the Killing of J. M. Whitmore and Robert McIntire by the

Navajo “came up and forced the Piedes to help them get the sheep.” Frank explained that the Navajo “could scare the local Ind[ians] and make them do as they wanted.” Chuarumpeak allegedly told at least one Mormon that the Navajo “crossed the 500 sheep on the ice of the Colorado.”¹² Despite Frank’s testimony, tracks discovered by the Nauvoo Legion and reports later obtained from the raiders themselves indicated that most of Whitmore’s stolen stock was driven across the ice at the Crossing of the Fathers. The thieves filled their blankets with dirt and sand and carried it out onto the frozen river and scattered it to enable the animals to cross without slipping.¹³

Young George Whitmore naturally became alarmed when his father and hired hand did not return. According to one account, he barricaded himself in the dugout by blocking the inside swing of the door with furniture. Lucky he did, for according to his own account “during the night the door was rattled by heavy hands.” Another version says he hid under a haystack in a barn his father was said to have built, while another says the Native Americans shot arrows into the barricaded door while the boy hid inside. It was also reported that the next day George scribbled a message on the back of an old envelope that his father and McIntyre had gone missing and sent it with a friendly Paiute to Kanab, some eighteen miles to the east. Perhaps

Indians at Pipe Springs told to me (Elizabeth) by father [Edwin D. Woolley, Jr.] in 1910,” WSC, b3, f9; and Tasy Texanna Whitmore Grace to Mrs. John Witherall, Salt Lake City, August 5, 1915, OMP, b85, f1 [Tasy was Whitmore’s youngest daughter and was born about six weeks before her father was killed.

¹² Edwin D. Woolley, Jr., “Pipe Springs Story No. 12,” in WSC, b3, f9; and “Notes on Father[‘s] Life,” WSC, b1, f13, 9.

¹³ Various Nauvoo Legion reports indicate that the Indians crossed at “the Old Ute Ford,” also known as “Crossing of the Fathers.” For example see Edwin G. Woolley, “Journal of a Scouting Expedition Against Marauding Navajo Indians, Feb 25th 1869 to March 12th 1869,” 12, PSLA. See also Walter Clement Powell, “Journal,” *UHQ*, 16–17 (1948–49): 356–357. Anthony W. Ivins reported that the raiders later acknowledged that they crossed Whitmore’s sheep at “the Crossing of the Fathers, above Lees Ferry.” Anthony W. Ivins, in “A. W. Ivins Journal” as quoted in E. C. LaRue, *Water Power and Flood Control of Colorado River Below Green River, Utah*, Water Supply Paper 556, (Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 1925) in Serial Set v. 8475, H. Doc. 540, 12–13. See also Leonard Heaton, “Notes Taken from Interview with J. H. Jennings by Leonard Heaton,” 23 August [??], Rockville, transcription of PISP no. 1621, PSLA; and [Elizabeth Woolley Jensen?], “Notes on Father’s [Edwin D. Woolley, Jr.] Life,” WSC, b1, f13.

aware that Mormon families and missionaries in residence in Kanab were likely in trouble themselves, the frightened youth started out on foot for St. George. Two Kanab volunteers taking word of the missing men to the settlements in Dixie overtook the youngster and brought him to Maxwell's Ranch and then on to St. George.¹⁴

The killings of Whitmore and McIntyre at Red Clay Flats, four to five miles southwest of Pipe Springs, were part of a large-scale uprising that involved virtually every Native American group in the area. This unrest expressed itself in The Black Hawk War, a Northern Ute-led war against the Mormons which began in central Utah in April 1865, and in a Navajo war on Latter-day Saint stock which was getting under way in Dixie as 1866 opened.¹⁵ By January 1866 Native Americans were telling Washington County Militia that Black Hawk himself was “on the Pah-reah [the Paria River in Kane County] with some Navajos and eight or ten small bands of other Indians, all very hostile.”¹⁶ As early as November 1865, Mormons feared Black Hawk would export his war to the Navajo, and on November 12, Erastus Snow sent out a circular letter to the southern settlements warning them to protect themselves “against the murderous hostile Utes” who were “liable to beat South and prey upon the herds of Kane County during the winter, unless

¹⁴ James Whitmore had constructed a dugout that was used as a herd house a few yards east of where Winsor Castle stands today. One eyewitness (Edwin D. Woolley, Jr.) described that in 1866 “the ranch consisted of two log cabins and a log barn containing a little hay that the men had mowed with a scythe.” In another document Woolley called them “the log huts used by Whitmore and McIntyre.” Edwin D. Woolley, Jr. comments in “Pipe Springs story no. 12,” and in Dilworth Jensen, “From the Days of ‘69,” both in in WSC, b3, f9. A contemporary report, however, of an official church exploring party that visited Pipe Springs about eight months before the killings described that “Mr. Whitmore has a comfortable ‘dugout’ not yet having had time to build a house.” See James G. Bleak, “Journal of Trip to the Head Waters of the Rio Virgen and Sevier,” May 31, 1865, James G. Bleak Collection, ms 10587, CHL. According to pioneer reminiscences, a corral was located “east of the dugout 40 or 50 yards where sheep was taken from the night after [Whitmore and McIntyre] were killed in the day.” Leonard Heaton, “Notes Taken from Interview with J. H. Jennings by Leonard Heaton,” Rockville, transcription of PISP no. 1621, PSLA. See also Malinda Parker Roundy, “Pioneers of the Early Days,” *Garfield County News*, June 6, 1930, 1, and 4, UDN.

¹⁵ For general information regarding the Black Hawk War and its role in precipitating the Navajo War, see John Peterson, *Utah's Black Hawk War*. In fact, the Pipe Springs killings could be said to have been the opening salvo of a Navajo war inspired, at least in part, by the Black Hawk War.

¹⁶ *SGMH*, 170.

our outposts in that direction are placed in a thorough state of defense.” Snow ordered that the Saints in the Kanab–Long Valley–Pipe Springs region “should provide himself with efficient arms and ammunition” and that each settlement build a “public corral,” to be watched day and night by armed guards. Snow acknowledged that “the voice of wisdom” dictated that a fort should be built at Kanab and in the new settlement of Berryville in Long Valley, some thirty miles north of Pipe Springs. A Nauvoo Legion Military Order dispatched Captain Lorenzo W. Roundy, of “Company ‘O’ of the 2nd Regiment Iron County Military District” to “proceed immediately to Kanab, Kane County, and to build a good and sufficient fort at that place.” Roundy was also ordered “to maintain a vigilant guard by day and by night to protect the people and their stock,” and to “enforce, if necessary the concentration of families of Pah-Reah, Upper Kanab and Skootem-Pah, at Kanab.”¹⁷

By the end of 1865, Black Hawk had collected a substantial intertribal coalition involving Ute, Shoshoni, Paiute, Navajo, Hopi, and even some Jicarilla Apache. By 1866, fully half his raiders were Navajo. Patnish was a Northern Ute by birth. His leadership of a combined force of both Paiute and Navajo at Pipe Springs is emblematic of the intertribal nature of both the Black Hawk War and the Navajo War Black Hawk helped to inaugurate. Throughout both wars, Natives engaged in hit-and-run livestock raids in which thousands of head of Mormon-owned horses, mules, cattle, sheep, and goats were run off. Mormons responded by mobilizing their church militia, the Nauvoo Legion, and in both wars there were multiple engagements as the legion attempted to recover stolen stock and punish raiders. Navajo were particularly vulnerable

¹⁷ Colonel D. D. McArthur to Lorenzo W. Roundy, November 19, 1865, in “Research by Mary W. Chidester Workman, Danville, Ohio,” 5, USHS. See also Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 1:206. Circular Letter of Erastus Snow, Virgen City, “to the Saints in Long Valley, Upper and Lower Kanab, Pah-Reah and all others in that region of country,” November 12, 1865, in *SGMH*, 163–164 and Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 1:206–208.

to Black Hawk's entreaties, weakened as they were by the attacks of Kit Carson, the Navajo Long Walk, and the subsequent genocidal treatment at the Bosque Redondo Reservation in New Mexico. This drove pastoral Navajo—whose herds had been decimated by their recent war with the United States—to cross the Colorado to replenish stock by stealing from the Mormons. Under the circumstances, Whitmore's enormous herds ranging at Pipe Springs, often under the watch-care of a single man, provided an easy target. Reports of success brought hundreds of Navajo raiders streaming across the Colorado toward Mormon settlements, and ultimately resulted in the fortification of Pipe Springs as a Mormon military post.¹⁸

Young Tony Ivins was a year and a half older than George Whitmore, and remembered the fear and excitement that swept over St. George when word reached town that one of the community's most prominent leaders and his hired hand were missing. According to Ivins, the news that Whitmore and McIntyre were missing arrived as a dance was commencing in St. George's Social Hall on the evening of January 10, 1866. (Other evidence indicates word reached St. George on the 11th.) "The cotillions had been formed, the musicians were tuning their instruments, the people were in a happy mood," according to Ivins' reminiscence, "when they were unexpectedly called to order." "The manager announced. . . that a traveler, passing Pipe Springs, had observed that there was no one at the ranch house, and that signs indicating the recent presence of Indians were plainly visible."¹⁹

¹⁸ Peterson, *Utah's Black Hawk War*, especially 209–224.

¹⁹ Anthony W. Ivins, "Traveling Over Forgotten Trails," 354. Contemporary evidence suggests that this party must have occurred on January 11, for the dispatch calling for St. George troops was written on January 11 at Maxwell's Rancho on Short Creek, and the Nauvoo Legion left St. George on the morning of the 12th. See William B. Maxwell, Major, Maxwell's Rancho, to Col. McArthur, 11 January 1866, quoted in James G. Bleak, St. George City, to George A. Smith, Historian, January 15, 1866, GAS; and the rest of Bleak's letter; and Cannon, "Angus M. Cannon Tells of Early Stirring Times," and "Story of Indian War in the Arizona Strip," *Salt Lake Herald*, February 26, 1905, 2 and 20, UDN.

“Whitmore’s old fur collard over coat and McIntyre’s trowsers”:

The Grama Canyon Killings

Early on the morning of January 12, 1866, a Nauvoo Legion company of forty-four riders from St. George and Washington and three baggage wagons left for Pipe Springs. They were soon joined by thirty-one additional Nauvoo Legion minutemen from Virgin, Grafton, and Rockville. Some reports stated their number eventually swelled to ninety Latter-day Saint troopers. The command was led by Colonel Daniel D. McArthur, Lt. Colonel Angus M. Cannon, and McArthur’s aide-de-camp John D. L. Pierce. The men were divided into four platoons, one of them led by Captain James Andrus of Rockville, whose exploits fighting Native Americans eventually made him famous throughout all Mormondom.²⁰ Their orders were that “the Indians be pursued and over-taken if possible, before they cross the Colorado with their plunder; but not to cross the river in pursuit.” They were also ordered to see that “all the stock from Whitmore’s range and vicinity” were gathered at Kanab and to build a small Nauvoo Legion “block house” at Pipe Springs.²¹ Jacob Hamblin accompanied the legionnaires “to see that the indians received fair treatment.” Unfortunately for the Kaibabit, the “Apostle to the Lamanites” became deathly ill and left the group at Short Creek. Some of Hamblin’s contemporaries and subsequent historians believed that the extreme retaliation about to be dished out to the Kaibabit would never have been allowed had Hamblin remained with the command.²²

²⁰ Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 1:212; Anthony Ivins, “Traveling Over Forgotten Trails,” 354; “James Andrus History,” 3–5; and Angus Cannon, 20.

²¹ SGMH, 166; and Henry Lunt, Cedar City, Iron Co. to Hon. G. A. Smith, January 17, 1866, GAS.

²² Contemporaries called Hamblin’s ailment “Calculus,” a word used to indicate kidney stones or some other type of kidney disease. Hamblin remembered his illness was so severe that some of his friends despaired of his life and that his health was “very poor for about a year.” See James G. Bleak, St. George, to Elder George A. Smith, January 27 and 29, 1866, GAS; Little, *Jacob Hamblin*, 111–112; Daniel D. McArthur, Col. Commanding, and John D. L. Pearce, Aid-de-Camp, Pipe Springs, to Major R. Bentley, January 15, 1866, in Bleak, “Annals of the Southern

When they reached Pipe on January 16, they found the structures and corrals empty and everything blanketed by snow so thick that no tracks could be followed.²³ The next day, Colonel Daniel D. McArthur split his command, moving half to nearby Moccasin Rancho to effectively use the limited shelter and fodder these two frontier ranches provided. For the next ten days they sent out daily reconnaissance patrols looking for native peoples from Pipe and Moccasin. The first few days of searching availed nothing, but on the 18th, Captain James Andrus and his reconnaissance patrol came across two Kaibabit skinning cattle. These two, an old man and a boy of about sixteen years of age, were taken back to a ranch house at Moccasin and interrogated by Captain John D.L. Pierce. During two full days of intense interrogation they denied knowing anything relative to the raid. Captain James Andrus tied a rope over a beam in a Moccasin ranch house and threatened to hang the Kaibabit on the spot if they did not talk. The older man was so frightened that he broke into convulsions. Piece by piece, the Mormons drug the information they needed out of the two men. The terrified Kaibabit first reported they only dreamed that the Navajo had done the killing. Then they admitted they had actually seen Navajo come in to the area, first stating that they only saw them from a distance, their guns glistening in the sun. At last one broke down and stated that while hiding on a hilltop, he had seen the Navajo kill Whitmore and McIntre and knew the approximate location of their bodies. He revealed that the Navajo had forced a small band of Kaibabit to help them gather stock and that together the Navajo and Kaibabit had killed the two white men. The older captive promised to lead the whites to the flat

Mission,” 1:212, and in SGMH, 168–170; “[Minutes] of the Treaty Effected with the Navajos at Fort Defiance, N. M.,” in Jacob Hamblin, Kanab, to President Erastus Snow, November 21, 1870, in Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:63; Elsie Chamberlain Carroll, ed., *History of Kane County* (Salt Lake City: Utah Printing Company, 1960), 10; Compton, *Hamblin*, 263; and Richard Ira Elkins, *Ira Hatch: Indian Missionary, 1835–1909* (Bountiful, UT: n.p., 1984), 93.

²³ Anthony Ivins, “Traveling Over Forgotten Trails,” 355–356; and Angus Cannon, 20.

where the bodies lay hidden under the snow, while his younger companion agreed to lead the legion to the camp of a small group of Kaibabites who they both now testified had participated in the raid.²⁴

Early on January 20, Captain Andrus' young Kaibabite captive led his Nauvoo Legion detachment to the encampment some fifteen to twenty miles southeast of Pipe Springs.²⁵

According to a contemporary account,

This camp . . . consisted of six [male] Indians, three squaws, and a couple of children.

The brethren proceeded to search the camp; one Indian, who was sitting, would not move from his position when requested to do so, whereupon one of the brethren[,] Charles Lytle[,] attempted to make [him move, which caused the Kaibabite] to draw an arrow with the apparent intention of shooting; on seeing this, . . . Capt. James Andrus, shot him.²⁶

²⁴ Daniel D. McArthur, Col. Commanding, and John D. L. Pearce, Aid-de-Camp, Pipe Springs, to Major R. Bentley, 21 January 1866, in Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Mission," 1:213–214, and in SGMH, 168–170; Edwin D. Woolley, Jr., "Pipe Springs Story No. 12," 1; Anthony Ivins, "Traveling Over Forgotten Trails," 356; and Angus Cannon, 20. Dee Woolley explained: "We organized searching parties. One platoon of twelve men would go as far as they could looking for tracks or signs of Indians and [then come] back. Snow had covered all signs of life. The next day another 12 would go in another direction."

²⁵ Named after grass that grows in the Pipe Springs desert, Grama Canyon is a spur of Kanab Gulch, which itself is a spur of the Grand Canyon. Mormons variously described the Canyon as ten, twelve, fifteen and twenty 20 miles from Pipe Springs. Some Mormons, including Edwin D. Woolley, Jr., recounted that this incident occurred in Bull Rush Wash. Kaibab Paiute Robert Pickivit and Johnnie [?], however, were adamant that they had got it from Indian George, a child survivor of the incident who later lived to become the chief of the entire Kaibab Band, that the attack on the Indian encampment occurred in Grama Canyon. This seems to have been corroborated by Anthony W. Ivins, who said it occurred in "the vicinity of the Kanab Gulch." Angus Cannon, who was with the militia, said the Indians "were camped in a deep gulch off toward the Buckskin mountains, between lower Kanab and the Colorado and over twenty miles from where we were camped." To honor the voice of the Kaibabites I use their testimony, but acknowledge that the sources conflict. See Anson P. Winsor, Grafton, Kane Co., to President Erastus Snow, 22 January 1866, BYP; William R. Palmer, loose research notes in William R. Palmer Papers, 1870–1960, MS 1268, CHL; Edwin D. Woolley, Jr., "Pipe Springs Story No. 12," 1–2; Anthony Ivins, "Traveling Over Forgotten Trails," 356; and Angus Cannon, 20.

²⁶ James G. Bleak, St. George, to George A. Smith, church historian, 26 January 1866, GAS; and Angus Cannon, 20.

Andrus found that the deceased man had been sitting on “some of Bro Whitmore[']s clothes.” Andrus demanded the Native Americans deliver up their bows and arrows, and after they had done so one Kaibabit, fearing they all would be killed, made “three attempts to wrest a gun from some of the boys.” At last “his desperation increased to such a degree that it was necessary to kill him.” Bishop Anson P. Winsor described that “one of the boys Struck him over the head with his revolver and broke his Skull in.” A short skirmish ensued. As one of Nauvoo Legion commander later put it, “the redskins had little show against the rifles of the white men—they fought with arrows. The result was that [two] Indians [were] killed, another wounded and five captured.” On searching the camp, the Mormons found “fresh rawhide, several sheepskins, large numbers of ‘Navajo arrows’ and a ‘peck’ of newly made flint arrowheads.” They also found “Whitmore’s old fur collard over coat and McIntyre’s trowsers” and “some gold coins and a wad of greenbacks amounting to several hundred dollars.” The Kaibabit maintained that these items were “gifts” from the Navajo and that they were innocent of the killings. Overpowered by the evidence, however, the troopers gathered up four Kaibab males, and together with their guide, marched them back toward Pipe “as prisoners.”²⁷ Meanwhile, the older Kaibabit captive led a second Mormon patrol to Red Clay Flats, a spot variously estimated to be four or five miles southeast of Pipe Springs. Snow still blanketed the ground and at first the man seemed to have forgotten where the dead Mormons lay. Thirty legionnaires spread their horses out in a line and “marched down one side of the plain and up the other. On the second round one of the horses knocked the snow from the arm of Dr. Whitmore.” Observing from a distance, the Kaibabit guide asked if the body that had been found “was the one with whiskers.” Hearing that it was, he

²⁷ Anson P. Winsor, Grafton, Kane Co., to President Erastus Snow, January 22, 1866, BYP; James G. Bleak, St. George, to George A. Smith, church historian, January 26, 1866, GAS; Angus Cannon, 20; and John Peterson, *Utah’s Black Hawk War*, 221–222.

“directly” pointed to a spot nearby and said *Eba!* [Paiute for “there!”] “and the body of Robert McIntyre was found at the spot indicated.” The fact that the man so quickly located the body of McIntyre in relationship to where Whitmore was found immediately convinced “the boys” that “he must have had a hand in the matter.”

The Mormons found that Whitmore had been “stripped of every particle of clothing” except his sacred priesthood garments and a vest, which was apparently so damaged by arrows and blood that it was useless to his killers. McIntyre had also been stripped.²⁸ A graphic report of the incident written by James G. Bleak the same week as the discovery read:

On examination it was found that both the men had been shot from the left side [by a gun] each receiving one shot. Bro Whitmore also received 8 arrow wounds and Bro McIntire 16 arrow wounds. 5 arrow heads were taken out of McIntire. Otherwise the bodies were not mutilated, except that Bro Whitmore was somewhat injured by mice which had got to him while under the snow. The bodies were in a high state of preservation, not the least taint [of odor] being perceptible, although they had been dead 15 days.²⁹

Bishop Winsor of Grafton and others reportedly retained arrows and arrow points that they gathered at the scene.

As the legionnaires waited for wagons, they became more incensed over the supposed culpability of their native guide. Just as they were lifting the bodies into the wagon, the platoon

²⁸ Anson P. Winsor, Grafton, Kane Co., to President Erastus Snow, January 22, 1866, BYP; Angus Cannon, 20; and “Veteran Indian Fighter: Col. Pearce of St. George Recalls Pioneer Adventures,” in *Salt Lake Herald*, March 16, 1898, 6, UDN.

²⁹ James G. Bleak, St. George, to George A. Smith, church historian, January 26, 1866, GAS. The Mormons later learned from native people that McIntyre was shot twice as many times as was his employer because he was armed with a pistol and fought valiantly for his life. Anthony Ivins, “Traveling Over Forgotten Trails,” 356.

of James Andrus and their five captives reached them on their return from Grama Canyon with reports of finding Whitmore and McIntyre's coats, britches, saddles and other possessions in the Kaibabit camp. James Bleak's official report of what happened next was terse: "The boys on seeing the bodies of their dead brethren, lost their patience[.] [T]hey turned the four Indian prisoners, and the [older] guide loose, and then shot them. This makes in all, 7 Indians killed, the other [Indian] is still a prisoner; and is used as a guide."³⁰ Edwin D. Woolley, Jr., (often called Dee) was part of the detachment and wrote that the militiamen "stood [the five Indians] up in a row and shot them[.] They fell on their faces in the snow, not one made a struggle."³¹

In the official report, the expedition's commanding officer, Colonel Daniel D. McArthur, stated that learning of the evidence found in the Kaibabit camp as they loaded Whitmore's and McIntyre's corpses into the wagon "was too much for the Brethren to stand." McArthur wrote "The clothes of the murdered men, [the] money, fresh sheepskins and . . . other things . . . stood as evidence . . . of their guilt . . . so [the brethren] turned the prisoners loose and shot them on the ground where the murdered bodies lay. Thus did retribution overtake them on the scene of their crime. This makes seven (indians) killed."³² Perhaps trying to justify the killings, Bishop Winsor wrote to Apostle Erastus Snow in St. George that when the Kaibab prisoners held by Andrus saw the bodies of Whitmore and McIntyre being pulled out of the snow they started to run so "the boys fired on them."³³

³⁰ Angus Cannon, 20; and James G. Bleak, St. George, to George A. Smith, church historian, January 26, 1866, GAS.

³¹ "Pipe Springs Story, no. 12," 1, in WSC, b3, f9.

³² Daniel D. McArthur, Col. Commanding, and John D. L. Pearce, Aid-de-Camp, Pipe Springs, to Major R. Bentley, 21 January 1866, in Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Mission," 1:213–214, and in SGMH, 168–170.

³³ Anson P. Winsor, Grafton, Kane Co., to President Erastus Snow, January 22, 1866, BYP.

The legionnaires had official orders to punish the killers of Whitmore and McIntyre, and may have felt scripturally justified in their actions. Believers in *The Book of Mormon* and the revelations of Joseph Smith felt obligated to protect their property, their church, their lives, and the lives of their loved ones. The God of the Book of Mormon commanded “Ye shall defend your families even unto bloodshed,” and “Ye shall not suffer yourselves to be slain by the hands of your enemies.”³⁴ Brigham Young at least tacitly upheld the action at Red Clay Flat³⁵ and several months after the killings issued a church-wide “General Epistle” declaring that the Saints should not allow native peoples “to murder our brethren and sisters . . . without doing our best to check them, *even if we have to resort to strong measures in doing so!*” He cautioned the Saints about making the “friendly Indians who are in our midst . . . expiate the wrongs of those who are hostile,” but declared “our secret enemies” who give “aid and comfort to those who are openly hostile” should “be treated as foes.”³⁶ Years after these executions, Andrus explained that “Having found the bodies and caught the Indians who were responsible for their murder the next thing was to decide what to do with them. At that time the Indians had absolutely no respect for any rights the Whites might claim, and did not recognize any court or ruler. They were barbarians in every sense, nomads and stealers. They recognized only ‘an eye for an eye’ and the only way we could discipline them was to kill them,” with the intent that they would “let others of their tribe know what to look forward to” if there were any future attacks.³⁷ Colonel

³⁴ See the Book of Mormon, especially Alma 43:45–47; and Doctrine and Covenants, 98:23–48. Heroes from Nephi to Moroni, including General Mormon himself, were righteous men who “wielded the sword” in defense of God’s people.

³⁵ Brigham Young, President’s Office, G. S. L. City, to Elders Geo. A. Smith and Erastus Snow, St. George, Washington, Co., 5 March 1866, in *JH*, 3–4.

³⁶ Brigham Young, Heber C. Kimball, Daniel H. Wells, and George A. Smith, G. S. L. C., to President Orson Hyde and the Bishops and Saints in Sanpete, Sevier and Piute[,] Wasatch & Summit Cos., and Pres. E. Snow and the Saints in Iron, Kane and Washington Counties, 28 April 1866, BYP, also in *JH*, May 2, 1866, 2–4.

³⁷ In May 1896 all four St. George wards were consolidated into one. Their respective bishops were released and to the surprise of many James Andrus was called as bishop. He served in the position for nine years. *JH*, 13 May 1896,

McArthur, the commander of the Mormon forces at Pipe Springs, reasoned that Black Hawk and a number of Navajo recruits were on the Paria River near Lee's Ferry preparing for more raids against the Latter-day Saints. In his report to his Nauvoo Legion superiors in St. George he wrote: "We have heard of a large band of indians, camped on the Pahreah, and as soon as our supplies come up, we shall march on to them, with prayers in our hearts that the Lord will use as a means in His hands to punish them for their crimes."³⁸

On January 21, a patrol of militiamen went back to Grama Canyon, where they came across a woman dragging the old man who had been wounded the day before. Fearing the worst, the terror-stricken woman unleashed what the white men described as a Paiute death yell. At first the troopers left the couple, but after riding two or three miles, some of the men convinced their officers that the "sullen" old man deserved to die, as he had witnessed who had killed his family members in the Mormon attack on his encampment. They reasoned that if he lived, vengeance might someday be exacted on them. After some arguing, volunteers were called to silence the old Paiute. Thomas Clark responded with "Damned if I wouldn't like to kill an Indian before I go," and he and a man named Ward raced back to see who got "to blow [the old man's] brains out." Dee Woolley was part of the expedition who discovered Whitmore's and McIntyre's clothes and believed Paiute had acquired the dead white men's clothes, sheep and beef, after the Navajo had first killed them. Of this particular killing, Woolley declared, "I never was so ashamed of anything in all my life—the whole thing was so unnecessary." Woolley later spent much of his life living among the Kaibab and believed the "stout" protestations of innocence he heard from

2; *The Union* (St. George, UT), May 28, 1896, 3, CALOC; and Jenson, *Encyclopedic History of the Church*, 726–727; Charles Ellis Johnson, memorandum of July 1914, copy in PSLA, VF, FH, Whitmore and in CHL.

³⁸ Daniel D. McArthur, Col. Commanding, and John D. L. Pearce, Aid-de-Camp, Pipe Springs, to Major R. Bentley, 21 January 1866, in Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Mission," 1:213–214, and in SGMH, 168–170. For Native American reports of Black Hawk being in the area, see Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Mission," 1:214–215.

the survivors of these vicious attacks. For many others, though, the clothes and money of the murdered men, as well as the rawhide, fresh sheepskins and “Navajo arrows” found in their camp, not to mention the catching of their Kaibab guides in the act of skinning one of Whitmore’s cattle, indicted the whole band of complicity with the Navajo. Woolley was detailed to Red Clay Flat to bury the five Indians and reflected “It was a most disgraceful affair . . . as it turned out that the Indians who were punished were not the guilty ones, but had been forced to do what they had done by the Navajo who had crossed the Colorado on the ice and had driven the sheep back that way.”³⁹ At a certain point his children contemplated raising a monument at Red Clay Flat “using the real names of the men who did the cruel deeds,” but they never did.⁴⁰

Seth Johnson, an interpreter with the 1866 Andrus expedition, later told his son that as the Mormons surrounded the native’s camp in Gramma Canyon, the Paiute “very definitely” denied any involvement in the murders of Whitmore and McIntyre. Understanding they were suspects, they begged Johnson to convince Andrus to wait taking undeserved “justice” on them, saying: “It was the Navajo from over the river [that] killed these two men. The Indians said that if they’d wait till the snow went off that they could prove [their innocence] to them. They could show the tracks and give them the proof that it was the Navajo” and that the stock had been driven over the river. Johnson was fully convinced “from the way they told it” that the Paiute were telling the truth. Reporting the native testimony to his superiors, Johnson begged for their lives. At last he was pushed aside and told that “if he didn’t shut up and didn’t [quit] trying to defend them then he’d get the same treatment” they were about to receive. Later, when the snow

³⁹ Edwin D. Woolley, Jr., “Pipe Springs Story, no. 12,” 1–2, in WSC, b3, f9; William R. Palmer, “Pioneers of Southern Utah: Edwin D. Woolley, Jr.,” *Instructor* 80 (March 1945): 108–109.

⁴⁰ Elizabeth Woolley Jensen, “Notes and Thoughts on the Whitmore Story,” in WSC, b3, f10; and Edwin D. Woolley, Jr., “Pipe Springs Story, no. 12,” 1–2, in WSC, b3, f9.

melted, the tracks reportedly convinced “those that made the examination” that the Navajo were indeed the culprits. According to Johnson’s son, general consensus was that what the Paiute said “was definitely the truth.”⁴¹ Within weeks of the killings, George A. Smith had repeated discussions with Paiute headmen in the Parowan area “who maintained that the Whitmore murder and the Pipe Spring Ranch robbery was done by Navajoes only.” On February 13, 1866, for example, Owannup, “the Pah Ede captain at Parowan” insisted that the Kaibab “played only a secondary part” in the murders by “being fools and begging some of the spoils.” Meanwhile Brigham Young was barraged by reports that the Paiute everywhere were unanimous in declaring “that those who were killed were not the murderers of the brethren.”⁴²

To this day, Paiute of the Kaibab Band aver that their ancestors were innocent of any involvement in the killings or in the theft. Multiple accounts of the Kaibab killings have survived among the Southern Paiute. One of the best of them follows:

After the Navajos had killed Whitmore they gave some of his clothes to one of the members of a band of Paiutes. When white men found these clothes among the Paiutes they killed them all including men, women, and children. The only survivors were Georgey George’s father and his brother who ran away because they were young men and could run fast, while those who were killed were mostly old people.

⁴¹ Parley Johnson, interview by Charles S. Peterson, August 19, 1987, Utah State Historical Society Oral History Project, 2–4, USHS, copy in JAP.

⁴² George A. Smith, Parowan, to George Q. Cannon, February 13, 1866, BYP; *JH*, February 14, 1866, 1; and Brigham Young to Geo. A. Smith and Erastus Snow, March 5, 1866, 3–4.

One of the white men in the killing party recognized one old lady who used to do his washing for him in St. George and he didn't want her killed. James Andrus, however, wanted to kill her. In order for this man to save her, he had to grab her and lift her up to the side of his horse and hold her weight by having her stand on his foot in the stirrup. James Andrus, meanwhile, was trying to grab her but this white man kept spinning his horse around to keep her out of the reach of Andrus. Andrus finally decided to let her live. The friendly white man gave her some money to try to make her feel better. She threw the money on the ground feeling that it was not worth the lives of her loved ones they had just killed.⁴³

Latter-day Saint churchman, historian, and radio broadcaster William R. Palmer interviewed a woman in the early decades of the twentieth century who claimed she was one of only two children who survived the Grama Canyon killings. Called "Old Tappie," she was twelve years old at the time of the killings. Tappie told Palmer that the three women and two children "buried the two Indians who were killed there" and that they "went away in great fear and crying loudly in their sorrow, to hunt for other camps of their people." "It was Indians," she said, "who found and buried the bodies of the five Indian prisoners shot to death out on the plains." Additionally, the orphan survivor testified:

the Paiutes knew nothing about the murders until the Navajoes camped with them that night. They told the Paiutes they had killed two white men and gave them some of the

⁴³ LeVan Martineau, *Southern Paiute: Legends, Lore, Language and Lineage* (Las Vegas: KC Publications, 1992), 62–63.

clothing stripped from the bodies. They also killed two sheep for meat and gave her people the two pelts and some of the meat. The Navajoes left very early the next morning and told them they had better move their camp away off in the mountains. After they left, [some of the Paiute] went out to see the two dead men for the Navajoes told them where they were left.

As Palmer sized it up, the evidence of “clothing, money and other loot that belonged to the dead men” overwhelmed the troopers and “on the ground where the murdered men lay, they shot every Indian in their custody [while] the real culprits, the Navajoes, who actually did the killing and stealing, went scot free with their booty.” After a lifetime interacting with Paiute and Mormons who experienced these events, Palmer concluded that “these Indians were not guilty of the murders but had received the stolen effects from the Navajo who, fearing retribution, had fled back to their own country.”⁴⁴ Many Latter-day Saints still believed that the Kaibabit’s complacency in the killings made them deserving of the punishment they received. Brigham Young articulated the church’s official position on March 5, 1866:

In respect to Indians you must be careful and not injure those who are innocent. Reports have reached here that those who were killed were not the murderers of the brethren; but they cannot be called innocent, for it is evident that they had justified the proceedings and probably were accessory to it, even viewing their conduct in its mildest light, as they had the articles with them which had been plundered from the murdered men. In such a case

⁴⁴ William R. Palmer, “Killing of Whitmore and McIntire,” in *Forgotten Chapters of History* 2, no. 69 (27 April 1952): 1–3; and William R. Palmer, “Pioneers of Southern Utah: Edwin D. Woolley, Jr.,” *Instructor* 80 (March 1945): 108–109. Palmer later reported that Tappie “neither justified the Indians nor condemned the white men” but just told him “what happened as nearly as she could remember it.”

it really matters but little whether they killed them or not, as they undoubtedly are guilty.⁴⁵

Vengeance is Mine—a Latter-day “Deathwind”

On January 20, 1866, the bodies of James Whitmore and Robert McIntyre were loaded into a wagon, packed in snow, and freighted back to St. George. On January 23, “all business was suspended” in St. George for a community wake. James Bleak wrote that the “deepest sorrow” pervaded the city, and Charles Ellis Johnson wrote that “the death of these two prominent men was felt to be a sort of public calamity.” Charles L. Walker wrote that he and others “pulled out the arrow points from their bodys and dres[s]ed them in their burial robes ready for interment.” The remains were then put on display “in the lower room of the St. George Hall” for public viewing. “Upwards of 300 persons” followed the bodies to the St. George Cemetery where they were buried “side by side in one grave.” The killings got the attention of every one south of the rim of the basin, for “it was the first depredation in the Dixie country in which [Mormons] lost their lives.”⁴⁶ The killings provoked vengeful feelings on the part of some Latter-day Saints toward the Paiute. The converse was also true as Paiute considered the wholesale slaughter of the Kaibabit at Red Clay Flats and Grama Canyon. Black Hawk and his raiders undoubtedly used the Pipe Springs’ atrocities to encourage formerly peaceful Paiute to

⁴⁵ Brigham Young to Geo. A. Smith and Erastus Snow, March 5, 1866, 3–4.

⁴⁶ Anson P. Winsor, Grafton, Kane Co, U. T. to President Erastus Snow, January 22, 1866, BYP; Robert Gardner, St. George, to Prest. E. Snow, January 27, 1866, BYP; Charles L. Walker, *Diary of Charles Lowell Walker*, ed. A. Karl Larson and Katharine Miles Larson, (Logan: Utah State University Press, 1980), 1: 251; Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 1:214–215; Charles Ellis Johnson, memorandum of July 1914, copy in PSLA, VF, FH, Whitmore, and in CHL; and Anthony Ivins, “Traveling Over Forgotten Trails,” 356.

join them. The intertribal nature of some of the raiding bands made it difficult for Mormons to determine the extent of Kaibab involvement in the theft of their stock. Retaliation on both sides continued, culminating in the Battle of Pipe Springs, or the Battle of Bull Rush Wash. Navajo raids on livestock continued but finally ended with the Hamblin-Powell-Navajo Peace Treaty of November 1870.⁴⁷

In late February 1866, Captain James Andrus and a company of thirty militiamen crossed the Kaibab Plateau and joined that portion of the emerging Pipe Springs corridor that was called the Ute Trail. All Native American traffic used this trail which led from House Rock Valley to the crossings of the Colorado at Ute Ford and at the mouth of the Paria. By this time Hamblin and his missionaries had been using the Ute Trail for nearly a decade in their yearly visits to the Moqui and Navajo on the far side of the Colorado. Examining the tracks left by Whitmore's stolen herd, Andrus reported that "it appeared that the sheep had been crossed on the ice [at Ute Ford]." The militia's primary purpose in coming so far east was to "reconnoitre that region[,] search for hostile Indians." Sometime during the winter the Shirts family underwent "a three months seige in his stone house which he barricaded securely," before sending a plea for help to Kanab with a friendly Native American. Shirts and other Mormons were convinced that the family was robbed by Black Hawk and his Ute and Navajo emissaries and various mixed Paiute-Navajo raiding bands like the one led by Patnish.⁴⁸ According to Tappie, the attacks were made

⁴⁷ "Notes on Whitmore," in "Memories, Gentry Hotel, St. Thomas, Nevada, Constructed 1906," 58, in PSLA, VF, FH, Whitmore; Edward Hunter Snow, "Autobiography of E. H. Snow 1931," 3, in Juanita Brooks Papers, Mss B 103, b18, f11, USHS; Warrum, 1:781-782 and 2:188; and Landgren, *Whitmore Family History*, 14; and "George C. Whitmore Dies; Long a Prominent Figure," in *News Advocate*, August 11, 1918, 1, in UDN.

⁴⁸ John Peterson, *Utah's Black Hawk War*, 218; Charles Emerson Griffin, "Autobiography of Charles Emerson Griffin, Finished 18 March 1893," 23, CHL; Map of Andrus Expedition in JH, April 3, 1866, 2; Robert Gardner to Brigham Young, January 22, 1866, BYP; Erastus Snow to Brigham Young, February 12, 1866, and February 19, 1866, BYP; Brigham Young to William H. Hooper, February 13, 1866, BYP; Special Order No. 3, Headquarters Washington Military District Nauvoo Legion to Captain James Andrus, 14 February 1866, and related material in "James Andrus History," 5-6; George A. Smith, Tokerville, to General Wells, February 19, 1866, UTMR, no. 808;

to avenge a curse Shirts sent forth upon some of her Kaibab relatives. Shirts reportedly employed natives to help plant crops, who therefore felt some right to the produce and harvested some of it for themselves. Peter Shirts apparently sought to control them by exploiting their fear of what they perceived as the Saints' special connection with the supernatural.⁴⁹ When some of the Native American Shirts disciplined for raiding his corn patch actually died, their clansmen retaliated. According to Kaibab sources, Mormons sending "cursings" upon native people played a role in both Paiute and Navajo involvement in the Pipe Springs raids.⁵⁰

After detailing a few men to escort Shirts and his family back to the settlements, Andrus and his troops came across the tracks of a large herd of sheep and cattle and presumed that these were the animals that had been stolen from Whitmore. It first appeared the tracks all led to the far side of the Colorado, leading Andrus to conclude that it was "the Navajo who committed the deed." At the ford they saw where the raiders had scattered dirt and sand on the frozen river to provide traction as they drove the animals across the ice. But as they reconnoitered, they also discovered a line of tracks left by a number of animals being driven back into an obscure corner of Kaibab Country. Following these animals on a different trail back to the east side of the

JH, February 19, 1866, 1–2, March 10, 1866, 1–2, March 11, 1866, 2, and March 15, 1866, 3–5; Capt. James [Andrus], Kanab, to Col. D D. McArthur, March 9, 1866, UTMR, no. 1518; George A. Smith, Parowan, to D. H. Wells, March 12, 1866, UTMR, no. 1520; George A. Smith, G. S. L. City, to William H. Hooper, April 5, 1866, and George A. Smith, G. S. L. City, to Gen. John W. Smith, Assessor of Internal Revenue, both in HOJ, RTC; and Edwin G. Woolley, "Expedition Against Marauding Navajo [. . .] 1869," 8.

⁴⁹ When Jacob Hamblin first visited Pipe Springs in 1858, the remains of a Native American he had cursed for stealing his cattle near Santa Clara were shown to him under a ledge of the nearby Vermilion Cliffs. The brother of the deceased believed Hamblin had killed his sibling through Mormon "bad medicine." He subsequently threatened to split Hamblin's head open with an axe until the great missionary convinced him that the same curse that killed his brother would soon overtake him if he did. Little, *Jacob Hamblin*, 73–74. According to some accounts, the Black Hawk War started because Mormons threatened stock-stealing natives that they would write their names on paper and ask Shenob, a major Ute and Paiute deity similar to Satan or the Evil Spirit, to visit them with death. When measles killed the chief and large numbers of his people, the chief's son (Jake Arapeen) and Black Hawk vowed to take vengeance. John Lowry, "Reunion at Manti, John Lowry States Cause of Black Hawk War," in Gottfredson, *Indian Depredations in Utah*, 335–338.

⁵⁰ William R. Palmer, "Killing of Whitmore and McIntire," in "Forgotten Chapters of History," vol. 2, no. 69 (27 April 1952): 1–3.

Kaibab Plateau, they discovered that a band of Kaibab had driven the stock into a side canyon and established a camp. Now convinced that at least some Kaibab had participated in the raids, Andrus surrounded these “guilty” Kaibab and demanded their surrender. When they “showed fight,” his men fired, instantly killing three men. As the Mormons rifled the camp they found fresh sheepskins and cowhides and “15 new Navajo blankets, which the prisoners told [Andrus] the Navajos had given them for helping to steal the stock.” According to Captain Andrus, tracks and native testimony made it clear that combined bands of “Navajo and Piedades” had been systematically raiding Mormon herds all winter.

The leader of the Kaibab band, Spaneshanks, was a Navajo who had married a Kaibab woman and at various times he was accepted as a tribal member of both groups. Some Mormons believed him to be a Paiute while others understood he was a Navajo. Comfortable in Ute, Paiute, Navajo, Mexican, and Latter-day Saint circles, multi-lingual men like Spaneshanks were key to the operations of the intercultural raids against Mormon cattle. Latter-day Saint records indicate that Spaneshanks was the son of a deceased Navajo chief and the brother of Barboncito, who was then one of the two or three most important leaders in the entire Navajo Nation. Spaneshanks had significant interaction with the Mormons and had been known in the white community of southern Utah as a friendly Native American. Formerly a Diné leader of some stature, on at least one occasion he had saved Jacob Hamblin and other Mormon missionaries from being killed by his Navajo kinsmen. He was at one time closely enough allied with the Mormons that he gave his Kaibab daughter to missionary Ira Hatch, who eventually married her as a plural wife and raised a family with her. At some point Spaneshanks was discarded by the Navajo and led a small band of his Kaibab wife’s people in raids against the Latter-day Saints. Spaneshanks was enraged by Andrus’ attack, “swore vengeance, and pledged his two

sons to wage relentless warfare against the whites.” The killings on the Kaibab Plateau, as well as those at Red Clay Flats and Grama Canyon, drove Paiute over a wide stretch of territory to join Spaneshanks and others in a plot to take vengeance.⁵¹

The Paiute Retaliate—

Spaneshanks, Coal Creek John, Charlie Howd and the Berry Massacre

Robert, Isabella, and Joseph Berry had spent the winter in Spanish Fork, and late in March 1866 they traveled over a portion of the Pipe Springs corridor on their way to their family’s ranch in Berryville, in Long Valley.⁵² Unbeknownst to the Berrys, a group of Paiute, enraged by the killings of their kinsmen near Pipe Springs, had been stalking them since they re-entered Paiute country.⁵³ Some Native Americans in Utah already had bad feelings toward the

⁵¹ Anthony Ivins, “Traveling Over Forgotten Trails,” 678–682; papers about about Spaneshanks’ family relationships in the possession of Brent Herridge SLC; Christian Lyngaa Christensen, Moab, to John R. Young, December 16, 1923, CHL. For *Panishew* see George A. Smith, Jr., *Journal, September–November 1860*, CHL. For Pan-a-shank see *Deseret News*, April 26, 1866, 5, UDN. For Banashaw and Spanish Shanks see William B. Maxwell, Winsor, to Bro. Geo. A. Smith, April 12, 1866, in JH, 1–2, and Edwin G. Woolley, “Expedition Against Marauding Navajo.” See also John Peterson, *Utah’s Black Hawk War*, 88, 218, 235–236; Little, *Jacob Hamblin: A Narrative of His Personal Experience*, 82, 88–89; 96, and 110; Edward Leo Lyman, “Caught In Between: Jacob Hamblin and the Southern Paiutes During the Black Hawk-Navajo Wars of the Late 1860’s,” *UHQ* 75 (2007): 22–43, especially 28, and 31; and “Marabouts Life Summary,” Family Search.

<https://familysearch.org/photos/stories/937712>.

⁵² Various family histories in “Berry Family Autobiographies and Biographies,” CHL; William R. Palmer, “Killing of Berry Bros. and Mrs. Berry,” in “Forgotten Chapters of History,” vol. 2, no. 70 (4 May 1952): 1–3; William R. Palmer, “Pioneers of Southern Utah: William Shanks Berry,” *Instructor* 79 (June 1944): 272–274; Jenson, *Encyclopedic History of the Church*, 286; Gottfredson, *Indian Depredations in Utah*, 181–182; and “History of Claybourne Montgomery Elder,” **Rootsweb**, <http://freepages.genealogy.rootsweb.ancestry.com/~socrateselder/Elder/History%20of%20Claybourn%20M%20Elder.htm>.

⁵³ According to some, “the Great Bend of the Sevier River” located southwest of Nephi marked the boundary between Northern Ute and Paiute lands. See William R. Palmer, “Captain John,” in *Men You Should Know and Family Sketches: A Series of Radio Talks Given Over KSUB Station, Cedar City, Utah, [1943]*, 1, CHL. Some sources indicate that plotting Paiute had been following the Berrys from as far north as Corn Creek (modern Kanosh, UT) in the Pahvant Valley. See Hattie Esplin, “Massacre and Raids Prior to Permanent Settlement,” in “Histories of Kane County and Orderville,” 16–17, FHL. Moroni Spilsbury, whose father had helped bring the bodies of the Berrys to Grafton for burial, reported that as the Berrys made their way south they stopped at Parowan “to rest their team and. . . horses.” He described that “some of our local Indians and some Parowan Indians saw them there. They

entire Berry family since John Berry had clobbered Chief Black Hawk with a brass bucket and was known to have taken up arms against native people. Some later told Jim Andrus that they targeted the Berrys because “Rob Berry” had “kicked an Indian off from his place once” for helping himself “to some of Rob Berry’s stuff.” Others from various Kaibabit camps and Paiute bands joined in the attack of the Berrys to exact vengeance for the recent rash of Nauvoo Legion killings.⁵⁴ At least some of the Paiute trailing the Berrys were “Cedar City Indians” who called themselves Wahnquint (those who live on Wap-pan-o-quint). While not Kaibabit, the Wahnquint had close connections and felt they all had been wronged by unwarranted attacks taken by the Nauvoo Legion against their innocent relatives near Pipe Springs.

Two of the Paiute leaders were well known to southern Utah Mormons. Coal Creek John, also known as “Captain John,” and “Panguitch John” was the son of Cal-o-e-chipe who Mormons had understood to be the head chief of all the Southern Paiute. Well informed Latter-day Saints believed Cal-o-e-chipe was not a Paiute at all, but rather a Northern Ute, a brother of Wakara and Ammon and others of what they understood to be “the Ute Royal family” who had long imposed their rule on their Paiute relatives.⁵⁵ Coal Creek John had often been a pliable

cut across the Mountains on their ponies and waited for the Berry brothers” between Short Creek and Pipe Springs. Moroni Spilsbury, interview by Juanita Brooks, 19 June 1935, MRMP.

⁵⁴ Palmer, “Captain John,” 2–3; Luella Adams Dalton, *History of Iron County Mission, Parowan, Utah* (n.p., 1998), 102; Moroni Spilsbury, “Sketch of Moroni Spillsbury,” 1, MRMP; Moroni Spilsbury, interview by Juanita Brooks, 19 June 1935, 1, MRMP; and Moroni Spilsbury, interview by Louise Slack, 19 July 1935, http://historyharrisfamily.blogspot.com/2010/03/george-moroni-spilsbury_5752.html.

⁵⁵ James Andrus, Captain Commanding, Grafton, U. T., to Geo. A. Smith, 12 March 1866, GAS; William R. Palmer, “Captain John,” 1–4; William R. Palmer, “Indian Names in Utah Geography,” *UHQ* 1 (1928): 8, and 18; William R. Palmer, “Utah Indians Past and Present: An Etymological and Historical Study of Tribes and Tribal Names from Original Sources,” *UHQ* 1 (1928): 41; William R. Palmer, “A Report on the Wahnquint Band of Pahute Indians Located at Cedar City, Utah,” especially 1–2, CHL; “Martha Alexander Story,” loose research note in William R. Palmer Papers, CHL; Hattie Esplin, “Massacre of the Berrys,” in Kate B. Carter, comp., *Our Pioneer Heritage*, 20 vols., (Salt Lake City: Daughters of Utah Pioneers, 1958–1977) 9:204–206; and Arthur D. Coleman, *Esplin Pioneers of Utah* (Provo, UT: J. Grant Stevenson, 1968), 33, FHL. Born in the 1870s, and raised among Coal Creek John’s people, Palmer was a special friend of the Cedar City Paiute. Eventually “initiated into the tribe. . . [as a] full-blood Pah Ute according to tribal custom,” Palmer knew the Wahnquints as well as any white man. Department of the Interior, memorandum for the press, Pah Ute Indian Ceremony, June 3, 1923, in William R. Palmer Papers,

friend of the Mormons, before he was alienated by the killings of the Kaibab and became “the terror” of southern Utah. In 1857 he had played a leading role in the Mountain Meadow Massacre.⁵⁶ Charlie Howd was Coal Creek John’s chief lieutenant in taking vengeance on the Mormons for the Kaibab killings. Charlie had been raised for a time as an “indentured servant” in the home of a Mormon family in Beaver with the surname Howd.⁵⁷ While Mormons did not know it at the time, Coal Creek John, Charlie Howd, and others had tracked the Berrys from as far north as Fillmore waiting for an opportunity to take retribution for the Mormon killings of Paiute. Contemporary evidence is convoluted and contradictory, but it seems the trio left Virgin City on or about April 1, 1866 with two horses, a wagon, and a dog. That evening they reached Tenny’s Troughs, near the modern community of Apple Valley. Ezra Strong, a Virgin River sheepherder, warned the lone travelers that the Paiute were mad and urged them to wait for a larger company to gather instead of attempting to run the gauntlet of the Pipe Springs corridor on their own. At Maxwell’s Ranch on Short Creek, William Maxwell similarly warned them that it would be foolhardy to travel through the Pipe Springs area alone. Confident in both their weapons and their abilities, the three Berrys set out alone from Maxwell’s Ranch on Monday

CHL. Obtaining the information directly from the Wahnquints, Palmer wrote that Cal-o-e-chipe’s domain “extended from the Great Bend of the Sevier River [near Leamington] south to the Colorado River.” Palmer, “Captain John,” 3. As late as 1879, whites described Coal Creek John as being “chief of all the Indians south of Beaver as far as Santa Clara, and who lives at or near Cedar City.” *Salt Lake Tribune*, December 10, 1879, 2, UDN.

⁵⁶ Walker, Turley, and Leonard, *Massacre at Mountain Meadows*, 206, 208. One of Coal Creek John’s names was Tau-gu.

⁵⁷ Simeon F. Howd was one of the original pioneers to enter the Salt Lake Valley with Brigham Young in 1847. He settled Parowan with George A. Smith in 1851. In 1856 he was called to lead the founding of the settlement of Beaver, and reportedly built the first log cabin there. At some point he came across a group of Native Americans about to kill two young boys “because their parents had been killed and no one wanted to take care of them.” Simeon traded a horse for each of the boys and took them into his family. He called one of them Charley and the other Curly Jim because of his curly hair. Charley lived with the Howds until adulthood, whereupon he married a native woman and returned to his people. Jenson, *Latter-day Saints Biographical Encyclopedia*, 4:708; Rosella Murdock Eyre and Susie Veater Goff, “The Life of Simeon F. Howd and Lucinda Morgan Howd,” Cedar City website, <http://www.cedarcity.org/DocumentCenter/View/7643>; and Colleen Anderson, “A Sketch of My Greatgrand [sic] Father, Simeon F. Howd’s Life,” Family Search, <https://familysearch.org/photos/stories/2236877>.

April 2, 1866. Just a few miles beyond Short Creek they came to a conspicuous knoll on the road now known as Berrys' Knoll. Those who later examined the tracks on the ground theorized that some thirty Native Americans fired on them from the cedars. Mormons later were informed by natives that Coal Creek John, Charlie Howd, and Spaneshanks were the primary leaders of the attack.

Blood on the ground bore witness that the Berrys used their pistols and shotgun to good advantage against their attackers. At the reins, Robert Berry "turned from the road" and started the lone wagon "down a white sage flat" and "undertook to outrun the Indians" and return to Maxwell's Ranch. Knowing the country better than the Berrys, the attackers were aware that a deep wash would make the Berry's mad dash back to Maxwell's difficult, if not impossible. Tracks revealed that only one of the attackers was mounted and that they headed off down the wash and again surprised the Berrys. The frantic Berrys dumped much of their cargo as their horses crashed through the brush, hoping the attackers might stop to loot the jettisoned wheat, sugar, and other supplies. An arrow punctured the harness collar of one of the Berry's horses, fatally penetrating its chest, forcing the wagon to jackknife, and allowing the attackers to close in. John R. Young, a nephew of Brigham Young, wrote that "Robert was taken prisoner and tied to the front whe[e]l of his wagon, where he had to witness the brutal torturing of his wife before he was shot full of arrows." Contemplating the brutality of the atrocity in later years, John R. Young wrote: "I think these shocking murders led up to the building of Fort Windsor at the Pipe Springs."

Travelers informed the Berry family that their relatives had left Maxwell's Ranch on April 2, and together they hypothesized that they probably had been waylaid by Native Americans. John and William Berry gathered a search party and set out to find their loved ones.

On April 7, cattlemen and friendly Piedes gathering stray stock from the Pipe Springs range stumbled across the three dead Mormons and their looted wagon. The arrows were immediately plucked from the bodies as evidence and identified by the best-informed Mormons as belonging to the Paiute. According to Latter-day Saint accounts, some of the iron arrow points had been manufactured by a Cedar City blacksmith who remembered trading them to Coal Creek John and Charlie Howd. On the ground not far from the wagon, the Mormons found the body of Spaneshanks. Local Piedes swore the killers were Navajo, as “proved” by the body of a Navajo chief lying on the ground. Many Mormons knew Spaneshanks’ relationship with the Kaibabit, however, and in an initial report one militia leader summed up the general consensus among the Latter-day Saints: “We think here that the Piedes *are the Navajoes* and this is retaliation for the [Kaibabit] killed by Captain James Andrus.”⁵⁸ The Iron County chieftains and their Kaibab kinsmen vehemently denied any culpability in the deaths of the Berrys, though they strangely knew many details of the massacre and had even claimed to have examined the ground shortly after the killings. By 1869, both Captain John and Charlie Howd were again in league with the

⁵⁸ *Deseret News*, 26 April 1866, 5, UDN; John Peterson, *Utah’s Black Hawk War*, 235–236; Larson, *Erastus Snow*, 391; Elsie Carroll, *Kane County*, 9, 30; various family histories in “Berry Family Autobiographies and Biographies,” CHL; Hattie Esplin, “Massacre and Raids Prior to Permanent Settlement,” in “Histories of Kane County and Orderville,” 16–17, FHL, and variant versions in Hattie Esplin, “Massacre of the Berrys,” in Kate B. Carter, comp., *Our Pioneer Heritage*, 9:204–206, and Hattie Esplin, “Settlement of Long Valley,” and “Massacre of the Berry Brothers,” in Kate Carter, *Heart Throbs of the West*, 12: 227–231; “History of Claybourne Montgomery Elder”; Gottfredson, *Indian Depredations in Utah*, 181–183; Anthony W. Ivins, “Traveling Over Forgotten Trails,” 680; Palmer, “Killing,” 1–3; William R. Palmer, “Pioneers of Southern Utah: William Shanks Berry,” *Instructor* 79 (June 1944): 273; “James Andrus History,” 6; Paul Wayne Carroll and Russell M. Robison, *Our Carroll Heritage: A Tapestry of the Charles Negus Carroll Family* (Richfield, UT: P. W. Carroll, 2007), 285; Excerpts from John R. Young to John A. Young, July 30, 1924, in John A. Young, “Fort Windsor at Pipe Springs, Arizona,” August 17, 1968, PSLA, VF, FH, Young; Henry Eyring, St. George, to Brig Genl E. Snow, April 8, 1866, Utah Territorial Militia Files, r2, doc. 831, SA; Nephi Johnson, Virgen City, Kane Co., to Geo. A. Smith, in JH, April 8, 1866, 3; John Steele, Toquerville, to General Snow, in JH, April 9, 1866, 2; Anson P. Winsor, Grafton, to President Brigham Young, April 9, 1866, BYP; William B. Maxwell, Winsor, to Bro. Geo. A. Smith, in JH, April 12, 1866, 1–2; James G. Bleak, St. George, to Elder Geo. A. Smith, *Historian*, April 13, 1866, GAS; Anthony Ivins to Prest. Brigham Young, GSLC, April 23, 1866, BYP; Walter Clement Powell to the *Chicago Tribune*, May 21, 1972, *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–49): 407–408; Moroni Spilsbury, “Sketch of Moroni Spillsbury,” 1, MRMP; Moroni Spilsbury, interview by Juanita Brooks, 19 June 1935, 1, MRMP; and Moroni Spilsbury, interview by Louise Slack, July 19, 1935.

Mormons, “profess[ing] great friendship” and serving the Nauvoo Legion as scouts and spies against their common enemies, the Navajo raiders. They maintained that the killing “was done by six Navajoes, three on horses, and three on foot.”⁵⁹

The Temporary Abandonment of the Pipe Springs Corridor

On April 28, 1866, in the wake of the Pipe Springs Killings, the Berry Massacre, and a rash of killings of both Mormons and Native Americans further north, Brigham Young ordered that exposed settlements and ranches throughout the Mormon lands be evacuated and that all Latter-day Saints consolidate in settlements large enough to protect themselves *and their stock* from native people. “Evacuated” inhabitants were to reinforce the larger towns and villages where the presidency ordered that “good and substantial forts, with high walls and strong gates” be erected “and the people moved into them[!]” By consolidating settlers and their stock, Young risked overstocking nearby ranges and destroying the entire frontier economy. Erastus Snow feared that “the great amount of sheep and other stock . . . if brought within the reach and protection of our river settlements would be worse than the locusts of Egypt, devouring every green thing and leaving the people no alternative but to devour them in return.” By late May, a four-year hiatus in Brigham Young’s expanding frontier had commenced with the removal of stock from all ranches on the Hurricane Plateau, those in the vicinity of Moccasin and Pipe Springs, and Peter Shirts’ ranch on the Paria.⁶⁰ This temporary abandonment allowed the range

⁵⁹ Edwin G. Woolley, “Expedition Against Marauding Navajo,” 19.

⁶⁰ About the last week in June Nauvoo Legion troops escorted “about one hundred families” from Long Valley and “the Kanab Country” back to Dixie in a wholesale evacuation of the rich upland grazing ranges east of the Hurricane Cliffs. John Peterson, *Utah’s Black Hawk War*, especially 256–259, 296–301, and 329–335; Brigham Young, Heber C. Kimball, Daniel H. Wells, Great Salt Lake City, to President Erastus Snow and the Bishops and Saints of

between the Hurricane Fault and the Kaibab Plateau and south of the Vermilion Cliffs to regenerate. When peace was made with the Navajo in November of 1870, the grasses on what the Mormons were then calling the Pipe Springs Plateau seemed to be richer than ever.

With the abandonment of Long Valley and Kanab and the rangelands of “the Pipe Springs Plateau,” the only Mormons that ventured into the area were Hamblin’s ubiquitous missionaries and Nauvoo Legion brigades chasing native people who had stolen stock from the settlements on the Virgin River. Between 1866 and 1870, Navajo dramatically increased their raids on Mormon livestock. The Pipe Springs corridor thus remained a busy thoroughfare as one raiding party after another furtively approached the settlements west of the Hurricane Cliffs, snatching up unsuspecting herds. The Mormons figured out that unmarried Navajo males seeking stock with which to “buy” wives from other Navajo made up a large portion of the corridor’s traffic. They usually timed their raids to coincide with the fall of the waters of the Colorado in winter, for every animal they stole would have to cross the river, a feat which was simply impossible in spring and summer. Sometimes they got lucky and the river froze at the fords, facilitating a hasty escape. On the other hand, the snows of deep winter turned the Kaibab Plateau into an impassable barrier that forced the raiders to use House Rock Valley to skirt the Buckskin. Mormons soon became aware that the raiders generally timed their sorties to coincide with the waning of the moon so as to be able to steal their stock at the darkest possible time.⁶¹

Washington and Kane Counties, 2 May 1866, in Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 1:226–229; SGMH, especially 184; Erastus Snow, St. George, to Lieut. General D. H. Wells, 21 May 1866, TML, r3, no. 1526; George A. Smith, G. S. L. City, to Gen. John E. Smith, Assessor of Internal Revenue, November 9, 1866, HOJ, RTC; and John R. Young, *Memoirs of John R. Young, Utah Pioneer 1847* (Salt Lake City: The Deseret News, 1920), 145.

⁶¹ Erastus Snow, St. George, to Pres. B. Young, telegram, December 2, 1868, in *Deseret News*, 9 December 1868, 5, UDN; Brigham Young, Salt Lake, to E. Snow & D D. McArthur, telegram, September 30, [1870?], BYP; “Indian Depredations at Kanab,” *Deseret News*, September 20, 1871, 8, UDN; and Beadle, *Undeveloped West*, 615–619, 640–641.

Winter pools of rainwater and snowmelt made Pipe Springs a strategic location for Mormons to come into contact with Navajo transporting stolen stock. The Bull Rush Wash and the Vermilion Cliffs at Pipe Springs Point created a seven to eight mile choke point at Pipe Springs through which all stock destined for the Colorado fords passed. As Captain Andrus put it, the Kanab Gulch and its tributary, Bull Rush Wash, formed “a deep narrow precipitous impassable gorge from Near Pipe Springs Ranch to [the] Colorado, a distance of about 50 miles. (This gorge effectually prevents any parties from reaching the [Colorado River] without passing in sight of Pipe Springs.)” The militiamen called this crucial bottleneck “the Pass of Pipe Springs” and recognized that a Nauvoo Legion fort at Pipe staffed with mounted troopers during “raiding season” could do much to shut the Navajo down.⁶² Accordingly, a crude rock Nauvoo Legion “block fort” or “guard house” and covered stable were constructed there. In fact, the militiamen sent out at the time of Whitmore’s death had orders to “build a fort” at Pipe as early as January 1866. Whether they actually commenced it that early is unknown.⁶³

Between May 1866 and November 1870, the Nauvoo Legion built similar block houses on Fort Pierce Wash and Berry Springs west of the Hurricane Cliffs, at Gould’s Ranch atop the cliffs, near Winsor in the southern end of Long Valley, at Fort Peter near “Shirts’ Pass” on the Paria, and at both El Vado de los Padres and the crossing at the confluence of the Paria which was then sometimes called Jacob’s Crossing. Dixie settler David McMullin said there were six of

⁶² James Andrus, Capt., and F. B. Woolley, Adj., Report of Reconnoitering Expedition [to] Mouth of the Green River, 1866, submitted to Brigadier General Erastus Snow, September 18, 1866, in Gregory C. Crampton, ed., “Military Reconnaissance in Southern Utah, 1866,” *UHQ* 32 (April 1964): 149; and Edwin G. Woolley, “Expedition Against Maurading Navajo,” 3.

⁶³ Henry Lunt, Cedar City, Iron Co. to Hon. G. A. Smith, January 17, 1866, GAS; Erastus Snow, St. George, to Pres. B. Young, telegram, December 2, 1868, in *Deseret News*, December 9, 1868, 5, UDN; Erastus Snow, St. George, to Prest B Young or Gen D H Wells, telegram, January 2, 1869, BYP; Henry Eyrering, Adjutant, St. George, to Gen. E. Snow, February 27, 1869, in *Deseret News*, March 3, 1869, 6, UDN; HOJ, June 4, 1869; and Erastus Snow, St. George, to Prest Young, telegrams, July 20, 1869, November 20, 1869, and December 7, 1869, BYP.

these small forts “besides the one out at the Pipe Springs.” They were all part of Erastus Snow’s “plan for making outposts to guard the various passes in the mountains against the Navajoes.”⁶⁴ Instructions for the block houses at Ft. Pierce and Gould’s Ranch required “From 4 to 6 men with good horses and thoroughly armed, will be kept constantly at each place and relieved from time to time as may be deemed best.” The men and horses were to live in stone quarters “with port holes” in houses “to be covered with stone flagging, or earth, in a manner that it cannot be fired from the outside, with but one door, and that heavy and strongly barred, so that one or two men well armed may defend themselves against any number of Indians.” When grazing, horses were to be hobbled or picketed within range of the post guns.⁶⁵

Throughout these years, there were repeated missionary expeditions to the Moqui Villages and to the Navajo east of the Colorado. Brigham Young, Erastus Snow, and Jacob Hamblin all believed missionary work was a key component to ending the raids. In the wake of all the Mormon killings of Kaibab after the murders of Whitmore and McIntyre, Jacob Hamblin spent the summer of 1866 seeking to make peace with the Kaibab. In the fall, he sent other missionaries to attempt to conciliate the offended tribesmen who often used Pipe Springs and its buildings as a base of operations. For example, while the Andrus expedition was still out looking for possible river crossings, a party of missionaries left St. George under orders from Erastus Snow “for the purpose of conciliating the factions of the Indians, who had heretofore assumed a hostile attitude against us.” Leaving St. George on September 4, 1866, they traveled the Pipe Springs corridor and noted that “the gulch running from below the Pipe Springs toward the

⁶⁴ Orders no. 16, Brigade Headquarters, Iron Military District, St. George, to Cols. Daniel D. McArthur & A. P. Winsor, November 29, 1866, TMR, no. 1547; Elsie Carroll, *History of Kane County*, 12; “Interview Between David McMullin and Wilma Hartman,” June 201935, 2, MRMP; E. O Beaman, “The Cañon of the Colorado,” *Appleton’s Journal*, 11 (2 May 1874): 546; Charles Walker, *Diary*, 1:273–274; and Griffin, “Autobiography,” 21–22.

⁶⁵ Orders no. 16, Brigade Headquarters to Cols. McArthur and Winsor, November 29, 1866.

Colorado [was] impassable with horses” and camped for several days at Pipe Springs. They held “some very satisfactory meetings” with “friendly Indians” in Long Valley who had been caring for crops and stock the settlers had abandoned in June.⁶⁶

“Surprised in the vicinity of the Pipe Springs”: The Battle of Bull Rush Wash

Despite Mormon peace missions, from 1866 to 1870 the Pipe Springs region saw pitched battles between the Navajo and the Nauvoo Legion. Mormons believed a band of Paiute described by Mormons as “Renegade Pies,” some of whom were former Kaibab, had been involved in the Navajo’s raids on Mormon settlements. By 1870 it was well known that a chieftain, a Yampahute named Patnish, had led a mixed group of Navajo and Paiute to Whitmore’s ranch at Pipe Springs at the time of the killings of James Whitmore and Robert McIntyre in January 1866. Both before and after the Whitmore massacre, Kaibab Paiute intermarried with the various Ute, Paiute, Navajo and Hopi bands deepening intertribal relations and anti-Mormon activity.⁶⁷ A notable example started with a raid in Pine Valley during the last days of December 1866. According to Mormon sources, a handful of Kaibab spies led thirteen Navajo to the upland valley in the mountains north of St. George and together they started a stolen herd of about thirty “horses and mules” and some thirteen head of cattle toward the Colorado. They drove their herd past St. George and had a short skirmish with militiamen posted at the newly established Fort Pierce which guarded the pass leading to the top of Hurricane

⁶⁶ Report of peace mission to Indians under Ira Hatch, 1866, St. George, September 14, 1866, in Glenn E. Snow, “Historical Record Book,” in James G. Bleak Collection, SC, DSU; and Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 1:245.

⁶⁷ John Wesley Powell, *Exploration of the Colorado River and its Canyons*, 334.

Cliffs. In response, on December 29 a call was sent to various settlements for men “to go to Pipe Springs to intercept the Indians.” By the end of the day Colonel John D. L. Pierce and Captain James Andrus pulled together a force of eighty-four militiamen who followed the raiding trail toward Pipe Springs.

In what has variously been called the Battle of Pipe Springs, or the Battle of Bull Rush Wash, Mormons with rifles opened fire on thirteen raiders armed only with bows and arrows. Perhaps hoping to conceal their stolen stock from the garrison assigned to guard the bottleneck at Pipe, thirteen Navajo had driven their herd into Bull Rush Wash. Once convinced they were well hidden within the sheer walls of the wash, they killed a horse and were jerking meat for the remainder of their journey when Ammon Tenney spotted their fires. At the Mormons’ “first fire” the Navajo scattered, taking “shelter in the crooked wash they had camped in,” but “as the commands of their Chief rang out they came together and [courageously faced] their assailants, notwithstanding the great odds [arrayed] against them.” As the Mormons rained down a murderous fire upon them, the raiders used the wash’s numerous rocks, ledges, and side-arroyos to slowly retreat “to the top of [a] neighboring ridge, where they made a stand, returning shot for shot” with the much larger and better armed force. According to Colonel Pierce’s official account, the battle lasted about an hour and covered “a piece of ground about a half a mile wide and 3 miles long, and that one of the roughest[,] rockeyest[,] [and] worst cut up pieces of ground . . . that could be imagined.” The cornered Navajo used the rocks and defiles in and adjacent to the Wash with great valor, causing Tenney to write: “The Warriors who had reached this level top turned and faced eighty-four well armed men. . . . As they were only thirteen warriors this has ever been the most courageous and brave feat I have ever witnessed in all my experience.” At a certain point Captain Andrus ordered his men to “remount and take the position which the

Indians were holding by assault.” All but two of the thirteen Navajo were killed or wounded in the battle at Bull Rush. Andrus and his men followed the two unwounded Navajo as they fled Bull Rush and picked one off and recovered every animal the raiders had stolen except the horse the raiders had slaughtered at the time of the attack and the one on which their captain had escaped. In the minds of the Saints, their God had certainly preserved them. In his entry for January 1, 1867, Charles L. Walker wrote: “The Indians that made the raid a few days ago were surprised in the vicinity of the Pipe Springs by Capt Jas And[r]us. . . . The Lord in this thing has answered our prayers and delivered our enemies into our hands.”⁶⁸

The Battle of Bull Rush Wash was a crushing defeat for the Navajo; however, Navajo raiding actually increased and continued unabated for three and a half more years. Within weeks of the battle “a few thievish Piedades” who the Mormons believed had “served as guides to the Navajoes” and who frequently stole horses and cattle “upon Navajoe Credit” were identified and the “ring-leader of these rogues” allegedly confessed and was summarily executed. All over Southern Utah, Paiute suspected of theft “on Navajo Credit” were quietly “put out of the way.” Richard Higbee, for example, remembered that several former residents of Kanab went back out to the deserted village, probably to gather crops and animals that had been left when the outpost

⁶⁸ SGMH, 206, and 206b; James Lewis, Harrisburg, to Hon Erastus Snow, December 330, 1866, TMR, no. 995; Henry Eyring, St. George, to Genl. Erastus Snow, GSLC, TMR, no. 1549; Henry Eyring, St. George, to Brig Genl Erastus Snow, January 2, 1867, TMR, no. 1550; John D. L. Pearce, St. George, to General Erastus Snow, January 5, 1867, TMR, no. 1551; Charles Walker, *Diary*, 1: 275–276; John C. Clowes, Beaver City, to Pres. Brigham Young, telegram, January 8, 1867, in *Deseret News*, 8, UDN; J. E. J., St. George, letter to the editor, December 30, 1866, in *Salt Lake Telegraph*, January 10, 1867, 2, GB; J. E. J., St. George, letter to the editor, Jan 3, 1867, in *Salt Lake Telegraph*, January 17, 1867, 2, GB; John C. Clowes, St. George, to President Brigham Young, telegram, January 26, 1867, in *Deseret News*, January 30, 1867, 5, UDN; JH, January 4, 1867, 1; JH, January 8, 1867, 1; JH, January 15, 1867, 1; Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 1:255–257, 259; “James Andrus History,” 6–8; Gottfredson, *Indian Depredations in Utah*, 255–256; Spilsbury, “Sketch,” 3, MRMP; Moroni Spilsbury, interview by Juanita Brooks, June 19, 1935, 1, MRMP; “Interview Between David McMullin and Wilma Hartman,” June 20, 1935, 1–3, MRMP; *The Andrus Recorder*, 11 (December 1975) <http://miloandrus.org/wp-content/uploads/2011/03/AR-Vol11-No02-December-1975.pdf>; Elsie Carroll, *History of Kane County*, 13–14; McClintock, *Mormon Settlement in Arizona*, 71; and Anthony W. Ivins, “Indian Traditions and Customs by Anthony W. Ivins Compiled from Unpublished Manuscripts and Stories Published in the Improvement Era, 1927,” 56–61, in AWI, b14, f13.

was abandoned. He described that at a “public milking corral” in Kanab, an old Kaibabit hovered around watching them every night “until dusk.” Suspecting he was planning to steal their animals, Higbee reported that at a “business meeting” they decided to kill him. “We went down there and dug a hole in the corral and when he came down we knocked him in the head and threw him in that hole and run the cows over it and we never had any more trouble.” The *Salt Lake Telegraph* reported that friendly Kaibabit brought news that a band consisting of seven lodges of raiders camped on the east bank of the Colorado had hollered across the river that “they [now] wanted peace and that there [had been] enough blood shed.” Despite this encouraging report, almost immediately the raiders re-crossed the river and succeeded in stealing over one hundred head of animals and Andrus and his men were again on their trail.⁶⁹

Toquerville’s John Steele, for example, wrote to George A. Smith that the people of the entire region felt that the Navajo War was “pressing them rather tight.” On January 22, Steele reported to the First Presidency that some of his neighbors “are saying if they have to fight Indians all the time and support their families to boot, they will return to Salt Lake, where their boys can go to school and their stock run over Jordan. Others think it best to move back and make some other settlements the frontier.”

On June 4, 1869, Jacob Hamblin met Young in his office in Salt Lake City to discuss Young’s strategy and the needs of the Southern Indian Mission. The “Church Historian’s Office Journal” entry for that day indicates that Hamblin told the church president that “the Indians who lived [at Pipe Springs] had always come and told Hamblin when the Navajo’s intended to make

⁶⁹ John Steele, Toquerville, to George A. Smith, January 22, 1867, in *Salt Lake Telegraph*, February 8, 1867, 2, GB; Erastus Snow, St. George, to President Brigham Young, February 24, 1867, BYP; Richard Higbee and Lorine Isabel Lamb Higbee, interview by Juanita Brooks, June 19, 1935, 1, MRMP; Luella Adams Dalton, *History of Iron County Mission, Parowan, Utah* (n.p., 1998), 101–102; and John C. Clowes, St. George, to President Brigham Young, telegram, January 26, 1867, in *Deseret News*, January 30, 1867, 5, UDN.

raids.” “Pres. Young,” the record continued, “instructed Hamblin to make a settlement there [at Pipe Springs] for the Indians.” By planting Kaibab mission settlements on the Navajo Trail at Pipe Springs and Kanab, Hamblin, his missionaries, and “friendly Indian spies” could deter Navajo incursions, or at least warn Virgin River settlements of potential Navajo raiders. Once the Navajo were in the Mormon settlements, the armed missionaries and Kaibab could position themselves at strategic natural bottlenecks on the Ute-Navajo Trail between those settlements and the two Colorado River fords, making it more difficult for the raiders to escape with their stolen Mormon herds. Meanwhile the plan would arm and feed the Kaibab, protect them from the Navajo, and hopefully draw them more completely into the church.⁷⁰

On July 20, 1869, Erastus Snow reported that Jacob Hamblin had “just started out with 3 men to put in turnips and cut hay at pipe springs and Kanab and commence his [latest] Indian mission.”⁷¹ On August 6, stone masons from St. George spent a few hours “repairing the house” at Pipe Springs, “making it suitable for guard quarters the coming winter.”⁷² As happened to most indigenous Americans in the region, starvation and disease, especially those “virgin soil epidemics” brought by European contact, like small pox and measles, were decimating populations in an unspeakably gruesome demographic catastrophe. By the fall of 1870, John W. Powell conducted an unscientific census of the Kaibab, where four of the band’s elders could count all the living on their fingers and toes—seventy three men, women and children were all that remained.⁷³ When Jacob Hamblin arrived in Pipe Springs in July 1869, the Kaibab “knew

⁷⁰ Ibid., Jacob Hamblin and John R. Young, Kanab Mission, to Prest. Geo. A. Smith, 12 September 1869, PTR, s8, b21, f329; and *MS 31* (1869): 776.

⁷¹ Erastus Snow, St. George, to Prest Young, telegram, July 20, 1869, BYP.

⁷² Charles Walker, *Diary*, 1:297.

⁷³ William deBuys, ed., *Seeing Things Whole: The Essential John Wesley Powell*, (Washington, DC: Island Press, Shearwater Books, 2001), 114–115.

that he was their friend” and “were willing to trust him.” The Mormon alliance gave the shrinking Kaibab band of seventy-three greater strength in numbers to protect them from the Navajo, who then numbered over six thousand. Hamblin also brought “quite an outfit” of supplies from the Superintendent of Indian Affairs to disburse among the survivors.⁷⁴ Decimated and in the most desolate of circumstances, the Kaibab perceived the contributions of Hamblin and his missionaries, in the short run at least, as windfalls of the greatest fortune.

Despite these efforts, Navajo raiding was greater than ever that winter. During the early months of 1870, the Utah Territorial Legislature appropriated \$2,000 “to assist in building fort or forts to protect the settlers in Kane County from the Navajo Indians, to be expended under the direction of General Erastus Snow.”⁷⁵

By 1869, Captain John was again “friendly and co-operative” with the Saints. Thus “radically reformed,” through Jacob Hamblin’s influence, Coal Creek John was employed as a guide to John Wesley Powell’s second expedition. By the mid-1870s, he was baptized a Mormon, holding the office of Elder in the Melchizedek Priesthood. At that time he was sent by Brigham Young “among the southern tribes to teach them the gospel and lead them to ways of industry and peace.” Reportedly, for the rest of his long life he was true to the commission given him by the Mormon prophet.⁷⁶ Although the Navajo War continued, Kaibab and Mormons joined forces at Pipe Springs, Kanab, and Fort Peter. The Kaibab needed Brigham Young’s

⁷⁴ William deBuys, ed., *Seeing Things Whole*, 114–115.

⁷⁵ *Deseret News*, February 16, 1870, 8, UDN; and Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:39–40.

⁷⁶ William Palmer, “Captain John;” John D. Lee, *Diaries*, 2:125; Erastus Snow to Brigham Young, July 22, 1869, in Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:3; Edwin G. Woolley, “Expedition Against Marauding Navajo,” 19; Erastus Snow, St. George, to Major Charles F. Powell, October 2, 1871, in Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:126; Charles Walker, *Diary*, 1:399; Jacob Hamblin and John Oakley, Kanab, Kane Co., U. T. to Prest. Brigham Young, March 14, 1875, BYP; SGMH, 545; *Salt Lake Herald*, August 21, 1879, 2; *Salt Lake Herald*, August 4, 1891, 6, UDN; and *Kane County Standard*, May 30, 1930, 1, 8, UDN.

resources and protection, and Young saw peace as an opportunity to convert Native Americans to the Mormon faith.

By 1870, the Civil War had concluded and was five years into its reconstruction under President Grant. Grant and his federal appointees, in conjunction with anti-polygamist Utah territorial governors, renewed their attack on the practice of polygamy, launching a cold war between the US government and Young's kingdom. The fort at Pipe Spring was the result of the continued need for protection from Native Americans as well as from prosecution and persecution from the federal government.

Chapter 4

Exploring the Territory in Partnership with the Federal Government

Exploring, building, settling, and defending fortified corridors was fundamental to Brigham Young's frontier strategy. Young planned to open new roads to be used for Mormon immigration into Arizona and Mexico. While relatively few Mormons lost their lives, the stock-raids of the Black Hawk War, and the Navajo War it helped to spawn, negatively impacted Latter-day Saints' livelihood in an economy where actual stock, i.e. cattle, horses, mules, and sheep, represented individual and collective capital. In addition to securing a potential exodus route in the midst of federal persecution, the building of Winsor Castle at Pipe Springs was part of a massive resettlement program essential to Young's rising cooperative economic movement and in the building of the St. George Temple. Surveying was essential to these endeavors and on several occasions, Saints participated in federal government-sponsored explorations alongside John Wesley Powell. Young viewed the high-quality maps and scientific knowledge obtained by the government surveys as an important asset to the development of his Kingdom despite the risk that maps had the potential to be used against him. Young introduced John Wesley Powell to his most important southern scout, Jacob Hamblin, and enthusiastically secured Hamblin's services to the Powell Expedition "at \$50 Per Month."¹ Young and his church members' cooperation were an important asset to Powell's expedition by providing the explorers with first-hand

¹ John D. Lee, *A Mormon Chronicle*, 2:135.

knowledge of the region. It was generally believed that Brigham Young and other Mormon leaders bought political influence with hospitality, future business opportunities, or outright bribes. Young occasionally admitted as much, lamenting that he was sometimes forced to “grease the wheels” of government officials to get positive results.² At the very least there was an unspoken but reciprocal exchange of political favors between Young and Powell, but perhaps a more lucrative arrangement existed.³

Young and Powell each saw in the other a willing ally to help obtain his personal goals. From Young’s perspective, Powell, with his Washington connections, could help obtain the peace with the Navajo that had eluded him thus far. Young had worked through Utah Superintendents of Indian Affairs Orsemus Irish, Franklin Head, and the current office holder, John E. Tourtellotte, as well as the various commissioners of Indian Affairs, to obtain help shutting down Navajo raiding on his southern frontier, and as yet the problem seemed to intensify with every passing

² For example, see “Remarks by President Brigham Young, made in the Tabernacle, Great Salt Lake City, April 6, 1861,” in *JD*, 9:4–5. John Peterson, conjectures that “Powell was acutely aware that there were powerful forces that would not look kindly upon his helping the Mormon people. Even two decades later when he published *The Exploration of the Colorado River and its Canyons* in 1891, it seems he still felt it impolitic to even mention it. A political wheeler-dealer *par excellence*, Powell may well have been paid by Brigham Young.”

³ There is ample evidence that Young used all the resources at his disposal, including “bribery,” to “beat the devil at his own game.” See *New York Times*, 26 July 1869, 5, FHL; D. Michael Quinn, *The Mormon Hierarchy: Extensions of Power* (Salt Lake City: Signature Books, 1997), 271; and John G. Turner, *Brigham Young: Pioneer Prophet* (Cambridge, MA: Belknap Press of the University of Harvard Press, 2012), 368–369. The National Press made the most of Young’s creative “contributions” and frequently ran stories about “Mormon money from Brigham Young’s tithing fund” being used to “purchase influence” and alleged that “that the Profit” claimed that he could “buy every minister in the United States [government], all Congress, and [even] the President himself.” In 1873 it was estimated that “church authorities at Salt Lake have [spent] a million dollars out of the tithing funds of Brigham Young, to buy newspaper influence and the votes of Congressmen.” Though this figure was ridiculously inflated, many newspapers knew from experience that “the Mormons have grown rich out of their mining and agricultural industries in Utah, and will use their funds lavishly to purchase immunity for their social evil.” See also *New York Times*, July 26, 1869, 5, FHL; *Salt Lake Herald*, January 14, 1873, 2, UDN; *San Francisco Call*, February 16, 1873, as quoted in *Deseret News*, February 26, 1873, 8, UDN; *Cleveland Leader*, February 25, 1873, 2, GBC; *Boston Traveler*, 12 August 1875, 2, GBC; *Salt Lake Tribune*, June 16, 1877, 2, UDN; and *Christian Advocate* 80 (9 November 1905): 1776–1777.

year.⁴ Young had agreed to provide Powell's projects with Jacob Hamblin's extensive geographic knowledge, experience, and influence with the local native peoples, as well as important logistical support and Mormon manpower for his projects, if Powell would use his clout as an important representative of the government to help him end the Navajo War on his southern frontier. A man with powerful self-interests and ambitions, Powell was intent on procuring opportunities for future government employment not only as an explorer, scientist, and ethnographer, but also as an Indian agent. Already working directly for the United States Geological Survey, the Smithsonian Institution and its Bureau of Ethnology, he was courting potential future employment with the US War Department, and the Army Corp of Engineers. Aware his geographical explorations and ethnographical studies brought him into extraordinary relationships with a wide variety of indigenous peoples, he also carried connections in the Indian Department that culminated in his appointment as Indian office special commissioner and special Indian agent. Just how, when, and where they worked out the details of their alliance is unclear, but when Young parted with Powell and Hamblin at Pipe Springs in September 1870, Powell and Hamblin went on a mission of peace intrinsically wound up in Young's purposes. Young's plans for his southern stock-raising industry, including the use of church tithing herds centered at Pipe Springs to finance the building of his St. George Temple, was absolutely dependent on a Mormon-Navajo peace accord.

Powell and his men mixed freely with presidents Young and Wells and their company of Latter-day Saints, and formed lasting and important friendships around evening campfires. Over time, the Powell Expedition formed generally positive impressions of these Mormons. John D. Lee

⁴ See correspondence in James Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Mission," 2:20, 22–23. In 1869 Ely S. Parker, the first Native American to hold the office of Commissioner of Indian Affairs, personally attempted to deal with the Mormon-Navajo problem.

captured the stirrings of this phenomenon when he wrote of “a Maracculous [*sic*] accident” that occurred when a pair of horses drawing a carriage stumbled on the edge of a high cliff catapulting two Mormon leaders “40 feet down the Precipice.” Quick acting men heroically “anchored” the horses and carriage—which was actually dangling over the edge. Witnessing the scene, Powell observed that “In a Moment all was right up . . . [and] nothing hurt,” not even the catapulted passengers. Powell wrote that he had just witnessed “a Miricle,” declaring “that if he had been in the States, he would have expected to have seen a Man’s Neck broke, a Pair of Horses killed & a carriage stove to attums . . . But with you Mormons, in a Moment all is up again & no body hurt.”⁵ For the rest of Powell’s career, scores of Latter-day Saints served his various expeditions as guides, artists, mule wranglers, packers, photographers, hunters, cooks, surveyors and suppliers. Powell provided Young and his lieutenants with inside information, and represented them kindly to members of Congress, presidents, and military officers. It was the beginning of a special relationship between Mormons and gentiles in the Kanab country that eventually resulted in their working together to make Pipe Springs a national monument.

As the spring of 1870 progressed, fierce debates in Congress and in the newspapers—studded with threats from the Grant administration and his War Department—convinced Young that he needed a more substantial system of defense. Young started by ordering the purchases of Pipe Springs from Whitmore’s widow. On August 17, 1870, Brigham Young left Salt Lake City with about a dozen hand-picked men on “an exploring trip to the Kanab country.” Young’s group traveled much of the way in tandem with John Wesley Powell and his topographical corps. Young chanced to be traveling to scout out a location for his hiding place in the uncharted lands

⁵ John D. Lee, *A Mormon Chronicle*, 2:139. An account of the accident is also found in A. Milton Musser, Fort Kanab, letter to *the editor of Deseret News*, 10 September 1870, in JH, 3.

north of the Colorado River with the very men the federal government had appointed to map it.⁶ By September 3, 1870, both Young and Powell were in Parowan,⁷ their collective entourage having expanded to “a company of 40 men” including some implicated in the Mountain Meadows Massacre, the Morrisite War, and other “crimes.”⁸ They left Parowan headed for Kanab and Pipe Springs through a canyon to the east⁹ using the opportunity to “Explor[e] the Severe & canabb [*sic*] country” from a different approach, plotting out several new roads from the south end of the Sevier Valley over the rim of the basin into Kanab via Skutumpah Canyon, Kanab Creek, and the Paria River. Various parties split off from time to time to examine every approach the Saints and the US military could possibly use to access the new safe haven.¹⁰ Exploring and controlling any natural routes into the Kanab region from the north was paramount to the area’s safety, would augment the St. George-Short Creek-Pipe Springs-Kanab-Lee’s Ferry corridor, and would facilitate the Mormon exodus into Arizona and Mexico. Part of the road they forged over the divide between the headwaters of the Sevier River (which heads north into the Great Basin) and the Virgin and Paria rivers became a main Mormon road from Northern Utah to Arizona and Mexico via Lee’s Ferry. For two generations of Latter-day Saints traveling between northern and southern settlements by wagon it became “the fond old route

⁶ Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, to President H. S. Eldredge, Liverpool, UK, 4 October 1870, BYLB, SCA; George A. Smith, Salt Lake City, to Prest. H. S. Eldredge, Liverpool, UK 5 September 1870, BYLB, SCA; and John D. Lee, *A Mormon Chronicle*, 2:135.

⁷ JH, 5 September 1870, 1.

⁸ A. Milton Musser said the group left Parowan “with our company magnified to 43 souls.” Among them were Mountain Meadows Massacre masterminds William H. Dame and John D. Lee, as was Robert T. Burton, who was accused of killing Joseph Morris and others during the “Morrisite War.” A. Milton Musser, letter to the *editor*, *Deseret News*, 10 September 1870, 3; John D. Lee, *A Mormon Chronicle*, 2:135; and George A. Smith, Salt Lake City, to Prest. H. S. Eldredge, Liverpool, UK, 5 September 1870, BYLB, SCA.

⁹ Little Creek Canyon.

¹⁰ John D. Lee, *A Mormon Chronicle*, 2:135–141; and A. Milton Musser, letter to the *editor*, *Deseret News*, September 10, 1870, 3.

known as the Lee's Ferry by way of Upper Kanab."¹¹ Today, Highway 89 follows much of the route they forged.

They group passed down the Paria River, where Young had been told a major settlement could be formed. Instead of farmland, they traveled over "barren, Rolling, cedar Ridges covered occasionally with Petr[i]fied wood." On seeing the desolate and rocky terrain along the Paria, Young found it unworthy of white settlement and directed that it continue to be used as an "Indian Farm" and so serve as a buffer-settlement. The idea, as with the farms at Pipe Springs and Kanab before it, was to place an armed community of "tame" Kaibabits between the Navajo and the Mormons.¹² Peter Shirts' rock fort was still standing on the banks of the Paria River where "he & his wife & 4 children stood the Indian siege" at the time of the Whitmore killings at Pipe Springs. Young may have been inspired by the fort for the bastion he was planning to build at Pipe Springs. Peter Shirts had covered his rock fort on the Paria with flagstone, making it "entir[ely] impregnable against fire." More importantly, he had ingeniously cut a trench from the nearby river which carried water into the fortified house itself, allowing its besieged inmates, supplied with an adequate stock of food, to survive indefinitely.¹³ Brigham Young's plans for the Pipe Springs fort included instructions that water be brought into the safety of the new fort's walls for strategic reasons as well as for the refrigeration of the Winsor Castle Stock Growing

¹¹ Lorenzo Hill Hatch, *Lorenzo Hill Hatch Journal*, ed. Ruth Savage Hilton (Provo: Brigham Young University Adult Education and Extension Services Publications, 1958), 181.

¹² Initially interested in the "Paria River Valley" because of its "natural fortifications," Lee wrote that Young "felt much disgusted as well as disappointed with the previous reports of the [Paria] country." Indeed, "This Much talked of country & over rated locality created a general disappointment" among all of the travelers. The Paria, "as far as we traveled[,] lye between two high Bluff[s] of perpendicular Rocks about a 1000 feet high, the bottom from 50 to 300 yards in width, the Banks low & sandy, water Rily, gre[e]n cottonwood & squaw bushes." A. Milton Musser, letter to the editor, *Deseret News*, 10 September 1870, 3; and John D. Lee, *A Mormon Chronicle*, 2:137–138. Other Mormons, crowded out of better settlement sites, eventually settled on the Paria, and, as Young prophesied, the river swept their fields and most of their houses away. A few of their ruined rock houses can still be seen there today. Hamblin's Native Americans operated an Indian Farm in this desolate place for only a few years.

¹³ John D. Lee, *A Mormon Chronicle*, 2:137–138.

Company's dairy products. At Pipe Spring, water was brought into the Castle through ingenious trenches which were lined and covered with flagstone and buried out of sight, an improvement on Shirts' open trenches.

At the time of Powell and Young's trip to the Paria, Young was initiating a plan to use the grazing lands centered at Pipe Springs as the "New Canaan" that would both financially and militarily deliver his "modern Israel."¹⁴ Young's "Canaan" consisted of the country between the Vermillion Cliffs and the Colorado River, and spreading from Gould's Ranch on the edge of the Hurricane Fault and then east through what was to become Canaan Ranch and Short Creek, and continuing beyond Pipe Springs and the Kanab Country, to the east slope of the Kaibab Plateau and the House Rock Valley. It was higher in elevation than "Dixie" and the land west of the Hurricane Fault centered around St. George, but lower than northern Utah. Hence, "Canaan has a climate between the northern [winterland] and the hot Dixie," allowing grazing year-round, which the other two areas generally did not provide. Simultaneously, surrounding "Canaan . . . are high buttes forming castle-shaped crags, and a grand variety of peaks of variegated colors [many of which] are nearly perpendicular." These natural features could protect the church and its cattle from the Grant administration, should another "Utah War" commence.

Arriving in Kanab on September 9, 1870, the Prophet and his entourage found Levi Stewart and the twenty families Young had sent there on a colonizing mission earlier that year. According to First Presidency member George A. Smith, "the Prest. & a No. of Brethren rode around to Select a cite for the city. Went Some 2 m[ile]s. South, [but] finally returnd & selected the cite a litle

¹⁴ The foundations of the Canaan Cooperative Cattle Ranch had been laid earlier that March, and Kanab was being resettled, and the fort at Pipe Spring was about to be constructed to facilitate Young's New Canaan Plan. Brigham Young and George A. Smith to Daniel H. Wells, telegram, 22 January 1871, BYP; and Phillip Foremaster, "'The Arizona Strip': Presented to Rio Virgin Chapter [of the] Utah State Historical Society, March 1, 1973, St. George, Utah," DSUSC, 14.

East [*sic*] of the Fort.” On President Young’s instructions, Arza Hinckley doused for water with a forked stick and found subterranean wells “in several places.” On Young’s command, Territorial Surveyor Jesse W. Fox laid out the city in accordance with Joseph Smith’s “City of Zion Grid,” which in Kanab’s case consisted of “Blocks of 4 Lots, 1 1/2 acre in Each Set, with 1/2 acre in the center for corrals, stockyards &c., with an ally runing [*sic*] to the centre... with Streets 6 Rods wide.” After dark “Professor Fox & Major Powel took observations” by the stars to determine the new settlement’s exact longitude and latitude.¹⁵

After ordering that Kanab and scores of other villages and ranches be abandoned, Brigham Young planned for Kanab’s second incarnation by choosing its settlers as well as its exact location in relation to creek, cliff, and canyon. He laid out its blocks and streets, giving directions for its refortification and the location of its future meeting house, school, and central square. As Young initiated the resettlement of Kanab, he gave Levi Savage’s extensive land claims to Bishop Stewart. In Young’s mind, Savage’s loss was a justifiable cost of communal colonization. Cooperation and group effort, and not individualism, was the Latter-day Saint *modus operandi*, and, as federal pressure increased, so did Young’s drive for cooperative settlement and communal economic and defensive strategies. He instructed Stewart to have the Saints “**coopera[te]** their cat[t]le & have a cooperative store & let the Poor own it & keep out speculators.” He also pressured Lee to purchase and manage his sawmill “for the advance of [the] kingdom.” As he often did as he laid out other new Mormon settlements, he set aside an entire city block for himself near the center of town.¹⁶ After organizing the Kanab Ward, Young and his men parted with Powell to press eighteen miles further west to Pipe Springs, leaving the

¹⁵ John D. Lee, *A Mormon Chronicle*, 138–140.

¹⁶ John D. Lee, *A Mormon Chronicle*, 2:140–141; and David King Udall and Pearl Udall Nelson, *Arizona Pioneer: Mormon David King Udall, His Story and his Family, 1851–1938* (Tucson, AZ: Arizona Silhouettes, 1959), 61.

one-armed civil war major at “Kanab where he in company with Jacob Hamblin, whom he employed at \$50 Per Month, started on their Exploring Tour in the Colorado country.”¹⁷

September 1870 Powell-Hamblin Uinkaret Expedition

Two days after Brigham Young and Jesse W. Fox laid out the lines of Winsor Castle at Pipe Springs with stakes and string, John Wesley Powell and Jacob Hamblin used the nascent fort as a point of departure for an important expedition. In 1870 Young sent Jacob Hamblin on a series of special missions to conciliate Native Americans who might pose a threat to the huge herds he planned to amass at Pipe Springs, Short Creek, and Kanab. The Indian farms among the Kaibab were part of this effort, as were numerous talks Hamblin held with the Buckskin Mountain people whom he had lived among for over a year. The Shivwits and Uinkaret bands of Paiute living near Mount Trumbull and Mount Dellenbaugh in the Uinkarets mountains on the north rim of the Grand Canyon preyed upon Mormon cattle and it was believed that these Paiute assisted the Navajo in their raids. Red Lake Utes or Shiberetches in the vicinity of Fish Lake, also known as Green River Utes, had been kingpins in Black Hawk’s raids during the Black Hawk War. Because of their southern location, they interacted with southern Utah and northern Arizona native peoples, and provided Black Hawk’s alliance with vital connections in Colorado and New Mexico. But by 1870, the Northern conflict was petering out, as smallpox and measles reduced astonishing numbers of Native Americans. On Young’s directive, Hamblin journeyed to the headquarters of the Navajo Agency at Ft. Defiance, New Mexico, to attempt to conclude a treaty

¹⁷ John D. Lee, *A Mormon Chronicle*, 2:135.

between that nation and the Mormon people. Major John Wesley Powell arrived in the Kanab country just in time to help Young and Hamblin with their plans to pacify the local natives. Hamblin's missions to the Shivwits, Uinkaret, and Navajo made the Pipe Springs Ranch possible. Powell's interest in these Native Americans and their country was fourfold. Three of his men, William Dunn, Oramel G. Howland, and his brother Seneca Howland, had been killed by Shivwits not far from the north rim of the Grand Canyon. Amid rumors that they had been killed by Mormons, Powell wanted to satisfy himself (and the government) as to their actual fate. Second, Powell wanted permission, cooperation, and guarantees of safety for when he resumed his Colorado River explorations. Third, Powell—in his role as an ethnologist at the Smithsonian Institution—was intensely interested in the Numa, the name by which he classified the Southern Paiute, and he needed access to the Shivwits and Uinkaret to study them. Fourth, President Grant and his war department were very much aware of the Latter-day Saints' plans to make a defensive stand against United States and wanted Powell to explore and map the area. Presumably Brigham Young was not fully aware of the extent of this last purpose or he might not have been as likely to help Powell as he was, nor to have personally directed Jacob Hamblin to hire on as Powell's guide and interpreter. Hamblin's presence was crucial to each of Powell's Uinkaret Mountain Expedition purposes, and Powell and Hamblin and a small body of men used Pipe Springs as a staging ground and departure point for this expedition. Government explorers camped at the Springs the very day Young staked out his bastion. Captain Francis Marion Bishop, Powell's topographer, recorded meeting President Young's party at or near Pipe Springs on September 12, and that "Maj. Powell, myself, Walter, Mr. Hamblin, Charlie Benn, Mr. A. Nebeker, and Indian guides" camped there that night and the next. On September 13, while the others were "fixing up their packs," for the trip (and while Young wrote his letters of instruction

regarding “the Kanab business” from Toquerville), Captain Bishop wrote that he spent the day around Pipe Springs “tak[ing] the topography of this locality.”¹⁸

Powell conducted topographical exploration and naming of geologic features as he made his way from Kanab to Pipe Springs by a circuitous route which included a quick examination of two branches of the Rio Virgen in Zion Canyon, which was becoming a prominent component of the Mormon defense system. After a day-hike in Mukun‘tuweap Canyon, the Paiute name he originally applied to what is now called the Virgin Narrows in Zion National Park, he left Rockville heading east on the “the Indian trail” at the base of “the Vermillion Cliffs.”¹⁹ “All day we follow[ed] this Indian trail toward the east,” he wrote, “and at night camp[ed] at a great spring, known to the Indians as Yellow Rock Spring, but to the Mormons as Pipe Spring.”

Powell retained the Mormon name for Pipe Springs for his maps, but he named a nearby plateau “Yellowstone Mesa,” adopting the Paiute designation for the geological feature.²⁰ Powell wrote

¹⁸ Francis Marion Bishop, “Captain Francis Marion Bishop’s Journal, August 15, 1870–June 3, 1872,” ed. Charles Kelly, *UHQ*, 15 (January, April, July, October 1947): 160–161. Like Hamblin, Ashton Nebeker was a hired Mormon guide, interpreter, packer, and mule wrangler. He lived in Toquerville.

¹⁹ Powell, *The Exploration of the Colorado River*, 295–297, 299.

²⁰ Powell, *The Exploration of the Colorado River*, 297. Powell frequently “rechristened” geographic place names. He renamed “Craggy Cañon” “Split-Mountain Cañon” because of its “strongly-marked features,” the Colorado running through its length, literally splitting the mountain in two, forming a spectacular canyon with walls rising from the river over “twenty-five hundred feet high.” E. O. Beaman, “The Cañon of the Colorado, and the Moquis Pueblos: A Wild Boat-ride through the cañons and rapids.--A Visit to the Seven Cities of the Desert.--Glimpses of Mormon Life,” *Appleton’s Journal*, 11 (18 April 1874): 515. Because of his early exploration and topographical work and the influence of his maps, Powell gave Utah and Arizona scores of geographic names. He named landmarks such as the Grand Canyon, Point Sublime, Bright Angel Point, Smithsonian Butte, and the Vermillion Cliffs, and lesser known landmarks such as Mt. Dellenbaugh, Mt. Trumbull, and the Escalante Valley. He preserved many Paiute place names, such as *Toroweap*, the *Uinkaret* Mountains, or the *Shivwits* Plateau. Sometimes he anglicized the Paiute name, changing the more correct *Pah-reer* (“Elk River” in Paiute), to the Paria, or sometimes calling *Toroweap*, Tuweap, inadvertently giving the place two names, one Paiute and the other its’ anglicization. When a Mormon or Paiute name seemed particularly historical, expressive, or captured the essence of a place, he left it alone and entered it on his maps and in his topographical records. Thus Mountain Meadows, Kolob Canyon, Pine Valley Mountain, or Hurricane Plateau remain. Sometimes he used both, calling today’s Zion Canyon both by this Mormon name, and the Paiute *Mukuntuweap* (“Straight Canyon”). Pipe Springs and its neighboring “Yellowstone Mesa” are such an example. The name of the mesa preserves the anglicization of the original Paiute name for Pipe Spring (“Yellow Rock Spring”), while the cognomen “Pipe Springs” preserves the remembrance of early Mormon explorers who “discovered” it and named it after an event they experienced there.

that “Pipe Spring is a point just across the Utah line in Arizona, and we suppose it to be about 60 miles from the river.”²¹ Showing that the Mormons had not concealed all their plans for the fort, Powell wrote that “here the Mormons design to build a fort another year, as an outpost for protection against the Indians.” Young emphasized his bastion’s use against the Navajo rather than its potential use against the United States.²² The major described finding “a cabin” near the springs “in which some Mormon herders find shelter,” likely referring to young Anson P. Winsor, Jr., and a companion, who had been sent there by Bishop Winsor in May or June. The pair occupied both the rock Nauvoo Legion guard house and Whitmore’s old dugout, either of which could be called “a cabin.” But apparently they also occupied several log structures remaining from James Whitmore’s time at Pipe Springs. Dee Woolley remembered that at the time of Whitmore and McIntyre’s murder in January of 1866, Whitmore’s ranch at Pipe Springs “consisted of two log cabins and a log barn containing a little hay that the men had mowed with a scythe.”²³

Powell called Pipe Spring “a great spring,” undoubtedly comparing it to the tiny water pockets and foul seeps his native guides showed him as they headed for Mount Trumbull in the Uinkaret Mountains. Describing the portion of the Arizona Strip that lay before him, he wrote that in a district of country large enough to make “half a dozen. . . good sized counties in Illinois,” only three or four small springs, seeps, and water pockets could be found.²⁴ At Pipe Springs Hamblin

²¹ Powell, *Exploration of the Colorado River*, 298.

²² Powell, *Exploration of the Colorado River*, 298.

²³ Various sources refer to both rock and log “cabins” and at least one dugout at Pipe Springs before the building of Winsor Castle. See for example, John Wesley Powell, *Exploration of the Colorado River*, 298; Luther M. Winsor, “Sketch of the Life of Anson Perry Winsor,” 2, PSLA, VF, FH, Winsor; Edwin D. Woolley, Jr., autobiographical draft, two loose pages, in WSC, b3, f9; Dilworth Woolley, “Dilworth on Pipe Springs, from his orange note book,” WSC, b3, f9; and Elizabeth Jensen, “Material on Pipe Springs furnished by Mr. L. M. Winsor[,] Dec. 16, 1960,” 1, WSC, b3, f9.

²⁴ According to family sources, when the Winsors first came to Pipe Springs in 1870 “fifty acres of land had already been cleared, cultivated and irrigated.” Luther M. Winsor, “Sketch of the Life of Anson Perry Winsor,” 2, PSLA,

secured the services of Chuar'umpeak and a Native American named Shuts to lead them to the Uinkaret mountains, showing them the seeps and water pockets as they went, and to help them obtain a peaceful meeting with both the Uinkaret and Shivwitz bands of Paiute. Chuar'umpeak (also called Naraquats, Frank, Indian Frank, Frank Indian, or Captain Frank by Mormons),²⁵ who came along as guide and interpreter, was interested in a Navajo peace for the security of his shattered Kaibab band. On the trip to Ft. Defiance, Powell developed a long-term relationship with Chuar'umpeak, who became the single most valuable native informant for Powell's ethnographic studies of the Numa, as his chief Native American guide, special envoy, chief ethnographic informant, and most photographed Paiute for the next decade and beyond. Having lived for a time with the Mormons, sometimes in the home of Jacob Hamblin, Chuar'umpeak spoke a smattering of English and as a result Powell sometimes secured his services for other American explorers, like George M. Wheeler. It was Naraquats who had led Hamblin to Pipe Springs on that first trip when Gunlock Hamblin allegedly shot out the bottom of Dudley Leavitt's pipe. Chuar'umpeak was the leader of his people and friend of the whites, both Mormon and gentile.²⁶ Jacob Hamblin formally initiated him into the church with his entire band on July 5 1876.²⁷ Chuar'umpeak worked for over a decade to get church leaders to move the Mormons' 'Indian farm' from Kanab to Moccasin and he can thus be viewed as the father of the present reservation of the Kaibab Band of Paiute. Despite his Mormon baptism, he died

VF, FH, Winsor. When John H. Beadle visited Pipe Springs in 1872, however, he found that even with Pipe's "large stream, the Bishop [Anson Winsor] can cultivate but fifteen acres, the porous, sandy soil requiring five times as much irrigation as the land around Salt Lake City." Beadle, *Undeveloped West*, 659.

²⁵ September 10, 1870, A. Milton Musser commented on Chuar'umpeake's special contribution. So-rum-pah may be the recorder's version of Powell's "Chuar'umpeake." Out of 80 Kaibabites baptized by Hamblin on July 5 1876, Frank was baptized first. The first female baptized was "'Ah-wants' (Frank[']s wife)". See "Baptism of Lamanites at Kanab, 5 July 1876[6]," in L. John Nuttall Papers, CHD, ms 1269, r6 b7, f9.

²⁶ "Death of Indian Frank," *Ogden Standard Examiner*, 28 February 1894, 4, UDN.

²⁷ "Baptism of Lamanites at Kanab," 5 July 1876, LJNP, ms 1269, r6, b7, f9, CHL; and "Death of Indian Frank," 4.

practicing native religion in a sweat lodge in 1894, and was buried in Moccasin.²⁸ Naraquats traveled nearly seventy miles one way to deliver Brigham Young his telegrams and letters. During this period the Mormons frequently employed Paiute to deliver their frontier postage and called dispatches delivered in this manner “Indian Mail.”²⁹

Powell was much impressed with his native guides Chuar’umpeak, “the chief of the Kai’vavits,” and “Shuts” whom he called “the one-eyed, barelegged, merry-faced pigmy.” “It is curious now to observe the knowledge of our Indians,” he wrote of his guides, “there is not a trail but what they know; every gulch and every rock seems familiar. I have prided myself on being able to grasp and retain in my mind the topography of a country; but these Indians put me to shame.”

Reaching the Mt. Trumbull area on September 16, from the summit of “a little mountain” Powell saw “once more the labyrinth of deep gorges that flank the Grand Canyon”³⁰ He found chief Tomore’routikai’s Uinkaret band camped in a grassy upland valley surrounded with towering pines. Powell gathered snippets of Paiute mythology and other ethnographical information and learned the whereabouts of the Shivwits, “a tribe that lives about the springs on the mountain sides and canyon cliffs to the southwest” who were then encamped some thirty miles away.³¹ A new guide led the expedition down the broken and steep canyons to the Colorado to help Powell locate a river “supply depot” for future use. The plan was to hire locals to carry supplies down the cliffs on their backs to establish caches to resupply Powell’s canyon flotilla the coming season.³² The next evening the Shivwits ambled in to the Uinkarit camp and Hamblin and Powell

²⁸ “Death of Indian Frank,” 4.

²⁹ For example, see Moses F. Farnsworth, diary excerpts, 19 and 25 June 1870 in Kanab Ward General Minutes, LR 4303/11, CHL.

³⁰ Powell, *Exploration of the Colorado River*, 299–300.

³¹ Powell, *Exploration of the Colorado River*, 302.

³² Powell, *Exploration of the Colorado River*, 316; *New York Times* correspondent in Kanab, Utah Territory, 13 August 1873, in *New York Times*, 4 September 1873, 2, NPC; and Wallace Stegner, *Beyond the Hundredth*

sat with the elders of both bands in the glow of a council fire. Powell was impressed with the manner of the frontier churchman whom he noted had been “been a missionary among the Indians for more than twenty years.”³³ “This man, Hamblin, speaks their language well and has a great influence over all the Indians in the region,” Powell wrote of his new companion. “He is a silent, reserved man, and when he speaks it is in a slow, quiet way that inspires great awe. His talk is so low that [the Native Americans] must listen attentively to hear, and they sit around him in deathlike silence.” With Hamblin interpreting, Powell told the Paiute that he planned on spending “some months in their country during the coming year,” and that he wanted to be treated as a friend. He told them “that all the great and good white men are anxious to know very many things, that they spend much time in learning, and that the greatest man is he who knows the most; that the white men want to know all about the mountains and the valleys, the rivers and the canyons, the beasts and birds and snakes.” Powell told them about “many Indian tribes, and where they live; of the European nations; of the Chinese, of Africans, and all the strange things about them that c[a]me to his mind.” He told them “of the ocean, of great rivers and high mountains, of strange beasts and birds.” “At last I tell them,” Powell wrote, that “I wish to learn about their canyons and mountains, and about themselves, to tell other men at home; and that I want to take pictures of everything and show them to my friends.”³⁴

Then the Shivwits chief reacted to Powell’s message with generosity and affirming “We believe in Jacob, and look upon you as a father . . . We will be friends and when you come we will be glad.”³⁵ The Shivwits informed Hamblin and Powell that three men had come upon one of their

Meridian: John Wesley Powell and the Second Opening of the West (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1953; 1st Bison Book edition, 1982), especially 103–112, and 127–130.

³³ John Wesley Powell, *Exploration of the Colorado River*, 320, 290.

³⁴ Powell, *Exploration of the Colorado River*, 320–321.

³⁵ Powell, *Exploration of the Colorado River*, 321–322.

villages the previous year “almost starved and exhausted with fatigue,” claiming to have come down the Great Canyon on the river. They were kindly fed and put on their way toward the Mormon settlements to the north. Shortly after they left, a native from another village told “them about a number of miners having killed a squaw in drunken brawl,” and concluded, that Powell’s men were the guilty party. Freely admitting to the murders of Dunn and the Howlands, they excused themselves saying, “Last year we killed three white men. Bad men said they were our enemies. They told great lies. We thought them true. We were mad; it made us big fools. We are very sorry.” Fearing retaliation, the Shivwits chieftain articulated the pattern that they and neighboring tribes had experienced at the hands of the white men. “When white men kill our people, we kill them. Then they kill more of us. It is not good. We hear that the white men are a great number. When they stop killing us, there will be no Indian left to bury the dead.”

“That night I slept in peace,” Powell wrote, “although these murderers of my men, and their friends, the Uinkarets, were sleeping not 500 years away.” Vouching for the honesty of the Uinkaret he added: “While we were gone to the canyon, the pack train and supplies, enough to make an Indian rich beyond his wildest dreams, were all left in their charge, and were all safe; not even a lump of sugar was pilfered by the children.” Before leaving the region, Powell and his entourage named the mountain range they found themselves in on the north rim of the Grand Canyon “Uinkarets,” a Paiute word meaning “the region of pines.” They named its tallest peak Mount Trumbull in honor of US Senator Lyman Trumbull of Illinois, who helped push legislation financing Powell’s expeditions through Congress.³⁶ “Two days more, and we are

³⁷ “Our children play in the warm sand; we hear them sing and are glad. The seeds ripen and we have to eat and we are glad. We do not want their good lands; we want our rocks and the great mountains where our fathers lived. We are very poor; we are very ignorant; but we are very honest. You have horses and many things. You are very wise; you have a good heart. We will be friends. Nothing more have I to say.” John Wesley Powell, *Exploration of the*

[back] at Pipe Spring,” Powell wrote. It was the first of many times he would use Pipe Springs as a base of operations.³⁷

The Mormon-Navajo Treaty Talks at Ft. Defiance & Patnish

The most important component of that mission was a trip to Navajo Agency headquarters at Ft. Defiance. After visiting the Kaibab on the Paria and at Kanab, and working to conciliate the Uinkaret and Shivwits near Mt. Trumbull, Powell and Hamblin turned eastward toward the Hopi villages and Fort Defiance, just east of the Arizona border in New Mexico, to ensure peace with those peoples. Powell, Hamblin, and Frank left Kanab on or near September 24, 1870, and were accompanied by at least two other Powell employees (Francis Marion Bishop and Walter H. Graves) and four other Mormons, including Ammon M. Tenney, the Spanish interpreter who had been with Hamblin as a fourteen year old boy in 1858 when Pipe Springs was “discovered.” Tenney could translate with Hopi and Navajo who knew at least a smattering of Spanish.³⁸ Powell wrote of the need “to build a flatboat for the purpose of ferrying over the river, and have had the lumber necessary for that purpose hauled from St. George to Kanab. From here to the mouth of the Paria [Lee’s Ferry] it must be packed on the backs of mules; Captain Bishop and Mr. Graves are to take charge of this work, while with Mr. Hamblin I explore the Kaibab Plateau.”³⁹ Powell’s pack train carried material culture collected from Shoshone, Ute, and Paiute bands for the Smithsonian Institute’s Bureau of Ethnology as well as manufactured goods to

Colorado River, 322–323; and *New York Times* correspondent in Kanab, Utah Territory, 13 August 1873, in *New York Times*, 4 September 1873, 2, NPC.

³⁷ John Wesley Powell, *Exploration of the Colorado River*, 325.

³⁸ Hamblin made several mistakes in dictating his account of the trip, including dating it in October 1871. He remembered “Three men who were strangers to me accompanied us with Brothers Ammon M. Tenney, Ashton Nebeker, Nahan Terry, Elijah Potter, and Frank, a Kibab Indian.” Little, *Jacob Hamblin: A Narrative of His Personal Experience*, 21.

³⁹ Powell, *Exploration of the Colorado River and its Canyons*, 327.

trade with the Paiute, Navajo, Hopi, and other native peoples for additional pieces of ethnographic interest. Leaving Captain Bishop and Graves and their Kaibab to haul their cumbersome lumber and ethnographic loads on a direct route for the crossing of the Paria, Powell, Hamblin, and Chuar'umpeak took side excursions examining the canyon country's geology and topography, leaving the pack train for several days at a time.

On October 28, Powell and Hamblin left the Hopi villages, with "quite an addition to the party" made up of a number of Moquis "employed as freighters." The Hopi donkeys, Powell wrote, were "loaded with heavy packs" containing "the collections we have made in the various towns of Tusayan."⁴⁰ Despite recording so much detail in his official account of the expedition to the Uinkaret Mountains, exploring the Kaibab Plateau, and of his visit to the Hopi, Powell simply mentioned that his party reached the Navajo Agency at Ft. Defiance after dark on October 29, where "thousands" of Navajo had "gathered to receive rations and annuities" and that they were given a "hearty greeting" by the officers at the agency. The next day he wrote, "It is a wild spectacle; groups of Indians are gambling, there are several horse races, and everywhere there is feasting. At night the revelry is increased; great fires are lighted, and groups of Indians are seen scattered about the plains." Powell implied in his account that he left the next day never to return, though we know he spent several days accompanying Jacob Hamblin in holding peace conferences with Navajo headmen and was at least nominally present until November 5.⁴¹

⁴⁰ Powell, *Exploration of the Colorado River*, 351–353.

⁴¹ Powell, *Exploration of the Colorado River and its Canyons*, especially 353; Frank T. Bennett, Capt. U. S. Army, Agent for Navajo Indians, U. S. Navajo Indian Agency, Fort Defiance, to Whom it May Concern, 5 November 1870, in James Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Mission," 2:59; Jacob Hamblin, Kanab, to President Erastus Snow, 21 November 1870, in James Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Mission," 2:60-65; Little, *Jacob Hamblin, A Narrative of his Personal Experience*, 121-125; and Ammon M. Tenney Statement, "War and Peace: Two Arizona Diaries," ed. Frank D. Reeve, *New Mexico Historical Review*, 24 (April 1949): 126. John Peterson, conjectures "Hailing from Illinois, from whence the Mormons had been driven during his youth, and well on his way to becoming a Washington insider, Powell was acutely aware that there were powerful forces that would not look kindly upon his helping the Mormon people. Even two decades later when he published *The Exploration of the Colorado River and*

Captain Frank T. Bennett heartily welcomed Powell and Hamblin at the Navajo Agency in Ft. Defiance. On November 5 Agent Bennett sent a letter inviting the Navajo head and sub-chiefs representing the six to eight thousand Navajo, who then gathered at the agency to meet on November 5 with Powell, Chuar'umpeak, and Hamblin.⁴² It seems a notable anomaly that an apostle of Jesus Christ negotiated for a separate peace for his church while United States government officials and a Paiute interpreter looked on. The peace treaty between the Mormons and the Navajo, however, was also in the best interests of Major Powell, Chuar'umpeak, and Captain Bennett, who each had their own reasons for wanting the Navajo raiding stopped, and each used whatever influence he possessed to that effect. The huge gathering provided the opportunity to talk to all the Navajo headmen at one time, and potentially work out a lasting peace. On November 5, Bennett, Powell, Hamblin, and their aides met with twenty-nine principle leaders of the Navajo Nation in one of the agency's rooms while thousands of Indians milled about.⁴³ Hamblin later exulted that "all the principal chiefs but one, and all the sub-chiefs but two," were present for the talks.⁴⁴ According to the official minutes of the treaty, Captain Bennett, who the Navajo referred to as Chaatsohi,⁴⁵ commenced the talks. He urged the chiefs to listen carefully to Powell and Hamblin as the subject of their "talk" concerned the safety and future of "every man, woman and child" of their nation.

its Canyons in 1891, it seems he still felt it impolitic to even mention it. Powell may well have been paid by Brigham Young to exert his influence at the Mormon-Navajo treaty talks and thus may have had additional reasons to remain silent about his services there."

⁴² Frank T. Bennett, Capt. U. S. Army, to Whom it May Concern, 5 November 1870.

⁴³ Ammon M. Tenney, "War and Peace: Two Arizona Diaries," 126.

⁴⁴ Little, *Jacob Hamblin: A Narrative of his Personal Experience*, 122.

⁴⁵ Only a year before, in the fall of 1869, Captain Frank T. Bennett had formed the foundation of the Navajo's immense modern flocks by issuing them 13,300 sheep and 1,000 goats as stipulated in their 1868 treaty with the United States. See Laurance D. Linford, *Tony Hillerman's Navajoland: Hideouts, Haunts, and Havens in the Joe Leaphorn and Jim Chee Mysteries*, foreword by Tony Hillerman, expanded 2nd ed.

Powell spoke briefly, telling the Native Americans he “*was sent* to establish peace between them and the Mormons,” without specifying by whom. He explained that the Mormons were also Americans, and therefore were parties to the treaty they had made with the United States in 1868 that had allowed the majority of them to return to their own lands from their exile at the Bosque Redondo Reservation.⁴⁶ According to Interpreter Tenney, Powell “recounted the past to them,” referring to Kit Carson’s raids against them in which thousands of their stock were shot down, their peach trees and gardens destroyed, and some 8,500 of them summarily marched off their lands to the reservation at Bosque Redondo in eastern New Mexico. Leading them to believe he was fully empowered to speak for the US military, the retired major “boldly declared that if they continued their maurading [*sic*] he would order [out] the army and cut down their trees” as Carson had, but this time “not leave one vestige” of their orchards, flocks or hogans “to cumber the ground.”⁴⁷ The message contrasted with others the federal government told them about the Mormons, who were often represented to the native peoples by US military officers as a people distinct from the Americans; during the 1860s and early 1870s, these officers encouraged Native Americans across Utah to attack the Mormons.⁴⁸

⁴⁶ Many Navajo had escaped Kit Carson’s dragnet and “the Navajo Round-up” to the Bosque Redondo Reservation by pressing north and west toward and into Utah, especially into the “Navajo Mountain Country” near the confluence of the Colorado and San Juan Rivers. It was these Indians, who, with encouragement and guidance from Black Hawk and his Northern Ute raiders and their Paiute allies, raided Mormon stock in 1865 in efforts to replenish their horse, mule, sheep, and cattle herds that had been so dramatically reduced during their war with the United States. As poverty stricken Navajo either escaped from the Bosque Redondo reservation, or finally were released by the 1868 treaty to return to their own lands, many joined their tribesmen in raids on the rich herds of the Mormons pressing in on their northwestern frontier. Even those who did none of the raiding themselves, purchased or traded stolen animals and thus virtually the whole Navajo Nation enjoyed the spoils of the war on the Saints. When Mormons retaliated by sending the Nauvoo Legion against the raiders and ultimately killing “from twenty to thirty” of them by 1870, Navajo notions of revenge greatly increased Navajo antipathy towards the Mormons and “justified” the entire nation’s participation in continuing the raids on Mormon stock.

⁴⁷ Ammon M. Tenney Statement, 126–127.

⁴⁸ Earlier the same year, for example, the First Presidency got reports from multiple Shoshone chiefs that “U. S. officers have had eight (8) Indians from Cache and four from Box Elder [Counties] to California to show them their forts, big guns, soldiers &c also the Indian agent at Ft Hall has proposed to hire the Bannacks, Snakes, Shoshones and Digger Indians to commence war against the Mormons about the tenth of april, for which he will pay them

Jacob Hamblin spoke for about an hour after Powell urged the assembled chieftains to “hear what the Mormon Captain says.” Hamblin told them he was glad to see them and that he had come a very long distance to do so. “I do not like to talk of war,” he said, but he boldly accused them of stealing “a large amount of horses, mules, and some other stock from the Mormons.” Underscoring the strategic role Pipe Springs and its trails had played in the inauguration of the Navajo War and the subsequent attacks by James Andrus and the Nauvoo Legion on the escaping Navajo raiders who escalated it, Hamblin later recounted: “I explained to them some of the evils of the war which had commenced by killing two men and driving off their stock; that while they had taken from us many horses and mules, they had lost twenty or thirty of their men.”⁴⁹ Their raids had resulted in the abandonment of many Mormon settlements as his “people were compelled to leave their homes to escape the raids of the Navajo.” Many Mormons were exasperated and wanted to retaliate. “Our Young men and middle age[d], gathered together to make war upon the Navajo, determined to cross the river, and follow the trail of the stolen stock and lay waste the country,” Hamblin explained, but “Our head chief—Brigham Young was a man of Peace; and stopped his people from raiding, and wanted *us* to make peace; this is my business here, and they are anxiously waiting for me to bring your answer.”⁵⁰ “What shall I tell my people?” Hamblin asked, “Shall we live in peace and till the soil, raise cattle, horses, and sheep and be friends? Or shall I go back and tell my people that you want to live like wolves and come prowling around in the night instead of coming like friends?”⁵¹ “I hope you will listen to

blankets, guns, ammunition Mormon cattle and all the houses and farms north of Box Elder to live on as their own . . . A number of the Indians have refused to enter into the compact, so it is laid over until the grand council to be held about the first of April.” Telegram of Peter Maughan, Logan, to Prest. Daniel H. Wells, NLC.

⁴⁹Jacob Hamblin, Kanab, to President Erastus Snow, November 21, 1870, in James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:60; and Little, *Jacob Hamblin: A Narrative of his Personal Experience*, 122–123.

⁵⁰Jacob Hamblin, Kanab, to President Erastus Snow, November 21, 1870, in James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:60–61.

⁵¹ Ammon Tenney Statement, 127.

this talk,” he urged them, concluding, “I have now gray hairs on my head, and from my boyhood I have been on the frontiers doing all I could to preserve peace between the white men and Indians.” In his published narration of these events, Hamblin reported that his words caused tears to form in the eyes of Chief Barbencito.⁵² At this point Bennett told the chiefs “they *must* sign a document of reconciliation.” Barbencito recommended they resume negotiations in the morning. Part of the issue for the Navajo was “that they were not able to arrive at what principle to recover the stolen property as [the Mormon stock] had been traded off and had gone through 4 & 5 innocent hands” by then. Hamblin conceded that if the Navajo chiefs would “maintain peace they could keep the animals already stolen and that [the Mormons] would forgive them.” This was somewhat of a hollow concession because the Governor of New Mexico had already told the Navajo they could keep the stolen stock.⁵³

This important issue settled, Chief Barbencito made a quick expression of his love for combined gentile-Mormon American nation. He testified that “the Americans are the best people,” that they had “been his friend from a boy,” and perhaps under some duress because of Powell and Hamblin’s open threats, he said he knew that the government had saved them “from hunger and death.” He admitted plainly that “some thieves [had] gone out as between their fingers or legs, and committed depredations,” but that “those who did the stealing were those that never went to the Bosquedundee,⁵⁴ and that the Piutes must have directed them to the Stock.” Perhaps referring to the movements of Black Hawk, Patnish, and others in exporting the former’s Northern Ute War to the south in the winter of 1865–1866, he said that he had heard that “the Paiute” had “had

⁵² Little, *Jacob Hamblin: A Narrative of his Personal Experience*, 124.

⁵³ Tenney, Statement, 128; and Jacob Hamblin, Kanab, to President Erastus Snow, November 21, 1870, in James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:63.

⁵⁴ The Bosque Redondo Reservation near Ft. Sumner, New Mexico.

trouble with the Mormons, and that some of the Navajo were induced to join them in committing depredations upon the Mormons,” and had done so “several times.” He explained that this trouble had started before most of the Navajo had returned from the “bosque-dundee” and did not involve the great majority of them. “A relative of one of their Chiefs had been killed by the Mormons,” while on such a raid, and to seek revenge, this chief had since made raids but was now dead. Barbencito stated that he had heard there were “only two crossings” on the Colorado used by the raiders, and that the “lower one” (i.e., Lees Ferry) was the best. Repeatedly, he accused the Paiute for starting the war. Referring to “the renegade” Paiute who lived on the east side of the Colorado he said, “that they . . . commit thefts and lay it on the Navajo.” To stop these Eastern Paiute and any Navajo who might slip through the “fingers or legs” of their chiefs, Barbencito urged Hamblin to keep a strong Mormon force at the Colorado crossings and track any raiders that pass through these bottlenecks and send him information that he “may know who commits the depredations.” He told Hamblin that neither he nor the other chiefs could guarantee that there would be no more raids, but promised that in the future the chiefs would return “all stock stolen from [Hamblin’s] people that he can find.” Speaking for the whole body of assembled Navajo headmen, Barbencito promised that “from this time” they would be “at peace with the Mormons, as with the Great Father at Washington.”

Barbencito hugged Hamblin and called him his father. Agent Bennett repeatedly assured Hamblin that the Mormons could trust their resolve. Admitting they were unable to prevent recalcitrant young men from slipping across the river on an occasional raid, the chiefs promised that as far as the tribal government was concerned, the Navajo war on the Mormons was officially at an end. The group continued to reconcile the initial events of the war and the role played by Paiute in leading Navajo to Pipe Springs in 1866. Hamblin told the chiefs that

according to his understanding “when the raids were first made, Five years ago, the Navajo were led [to Pipe Springs] by three principal men of the Piutes, [from] this side of the River.” Mormon troops “killed seven Piutes at a place near where a white man was killed,” referring to Whitmore’s death and the slaughter of Kaibabit near Pipe Springs. Regrettably he admitted “we killed the wrong Indians, not the Piutes who done the mischief. I was very sick at the time. When I got well, I went and visited my Great Chief, Brigham Young, and he gave orders, for no more raids on the Indians.” With this declaration of peace, Barbencito asked Hamblin if Navajo would be welcome to cross the river and come into Mormon lands for purposes of trade. Hamblin assured him they would be, *if* they brought a pass from their agent to show they had been authorized to leave their reservation. “If you come without one we shall be obliged to treat you as enemies,” Hamblin said, for the Mormons could not otherwise distinguish raiders from peaceful traders.

Ammon Tenney wrote that “in a few days we turned our faces homeward—a happy lot of missionaries . . . knowing that we had accomplished our mission by obtaining peace, notwithstanding I saw them riding my own horses that they had stolen from me in Utah.” The chiefs that had missed the “council of reconciliation” at Ft. Defiance had been directed by Barbencito and other Navajo leaders to meet the Mormon missionaries some “85 miles west on [their return] journey so as to sign the ‘Treaty document.’” Hamblin wrote a letter dated November 21, 1870, to Erastus Snow describing this second round of Navajo treaty talks. Without naming him, the letter seems to indicate that Manuelito, “the 2nd Chief of the [Navajo] Nation” was present. Similarly, a man Hamblin described as “the principle Chief of the raiding band” was there and acted as chief negotiator for the Navajo. The letter may suggest that “the 2nd Chief of the [Navajo] Nation” (Manuelito) and “the principle Chief of the raiding band,”

were one and the same, since Manuelito participated in raids against the Mormons. Tenney recorded that Navajo headmen “were much impressed with the results of declaring peace and the prospects of commercial opportunities in trading of their woolen and excellent home made blankets for our horses.” Reopening peaceful commerce with the Mormons and Native Americans on the west side of the Colorado River was a driving force in the Navajo decision to be at peace with the Mormons.⁵⁵

Before leaving the Moqui villages, Hamblin persuaded Hopi headman Tuba and his wife Pulaskanimki to return to Kanab with him “to stay here one year to make blankets, and learn our ways.” As Hamblin, Tenny, Tuba, Pulaskanimki, Captain Frank, and their retinue arrived on the cliffs near Lee’s Ferry, about thirty Paiute “living in the Navajo country” who were part of a mixed group sometimes known as “Yampahutes” or “Pah-Channicks or Pah-Shannicks” came to them and confessed that “they had taken a part with the Navajo in raiding” the Mormons and announced that they too “desired to have a good peace talk.” Hamblin was quick to oblige. Four of these “renegade Paiute” also returned to Kanab with Hamblin to visit their Kaibabit relatives, from whom they had been estranged at least since the beginning of the Navajo-Mormon War.⁵⁶ The triumph of their mission at Ft. Defiance made the fort at Pipe Springs less of a necessity to protect themselves from Native American. But almost on Hamblin’s heels “Patnish the

⁵⁵ Little, *Jacob Hamblin: A Narrative of his Personal Experience*, 125; Jacob Hamblin, Kanab, to Pres. Erastus Snow, November 21, 1870, in James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:65–66; Ammon Tenney, Statement, 121–129; and John Peterson, *Utah’s Black Hawk War*, 216–218, and 224. The former “raiding Chief” addressed Hamblin through Interpreter Tenney. He told Hamblin that since the council at Ft. Defiance, the Navajo “hailed” Hamblin “as our Sun-Father, the Father of Peace,” and said: “We have not come to change the splendid treaty already signed and entered into but we have come to cultivate and irrigate this tender plant of peace so that it will grow and bear fruit of a lasting brotherhood that we may in the oncoming years eat this fruit of peace from one dish, sleep under one blanket and warm ourselves by one fire and teach our children to follow our example, while time lasts.” Tenny, “Statement,” 128–129.

⁵⁶ Jacob Hamblin, Kanab, to Pres. Erastus Snow, November 21, 1870, James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:65–66; Little, *Jacob Hamblin: A Narrative of His Personal Experience*, 127–128, and Ammon M. Tenney, Pension Claim, in Serial Set, Vol. No. 7954, S. Rpt. 860, 67th Cong. 2d Sess., 36–39. See also the next footnote.

‘Yampahute’” crossed the river and began to stir up trouble. Patnish was one of the leaders of the Pah-Channicks, that group of intrepid “horse and cattle thieves” that Hamblin had been calling the “renegade Piutes living east of the Colorado.” Tenny wrote that “These Pah-Channicks or Pah-Shannicks [were] an offshoot of the Piutes but the fiercest and bravest warriors of the district involved in our campaigns.” Mormon leaders generally believed that Patnish and a group of Pah-Channick “thugs” had united with several bands of Navajo who had escaped the Long Walk by hiding in the badlands near the Colorado River in an area claimed by the Pah-Channicks. Influenced by the expanding war machine of the Northern Ute raider Black Hawk, this “renegade” confederacy had forced the Kaibab to lead them to Whitmore’s dugout at the time of the Pipe Springs’ murders just five years earlier.⁵⁷ The success of this first major raid of the Navajo War, netting as it did thousands of sheep, hundreds of cattle, and scores of horses and mules, eventually drew other Navajo to prey upon the Mormon frontier. Hamblin believed that Patnish and other “Renegade Piutes” acted as guides and general allies to Navajo marauders. According to Hamblin’s Native sources, “Patnish the Yampahute” now crossed the Colorado to test the Saints’ new system of forts, guard houses, Nauvoo Legion pickets, “Indian Farm” buffer zones, and Kaibab informants, and also, to shatter the treaty Hamblin had just concluded with the Navajo elders. At first Patnish claimed to have come across the river “to ratify the treaty Bro Hamblin had effected with the Navajoes.” After hanging around Kanab two or three days,

⁵⁷ On December 7, Joseph W. Young and Jacob Hamblin wrote from Winsor Castle that “Patnish, the one who led the Navajo in here the time that Dr. Whitmore and McIntyre were killed,” had arrived in Kanab with “a band of renegade Yam-pah-utes.” “Yampahute” was a phrase used to describe certain Northern Utes from the area of the Yampa river in northeastern Utah. There were certainly Northern Utes among the Pah-Channicks that had helped Black Hawk spread his confederacy among the Utes, Navajo, Paiute, Hopi, and Apaches of the four corners region. The word “Yampahute” seems also to have been used by Mormons to connote band of “Pahutes” or Paiute. The “Yampahute” Patnish was also often referred to as a “Piede” or “Piute.” See Joseph W. Young and Jacob Hamblin, to Pres. Erastus Snow, December 7, 1870, in St. George Manuscript History, 1:316–317, and James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:71–73 (where Joseph W. Young is erroneously given as John W. Young); Serial Set, Vol. No. 7954, S. Rpt. 860, 67th Cong. 2d Sess., 36–39.

Patnish demanded “Cattle and Horses to make him talk good.” The Kaibabit informed their Mormon friends “that Patnish Says if he does not get what he wants he will return and meet the Navajoes, and try and sour their minds against us, and no doubt do his best to get up a raid.” The fact that Patnish was on the west side of the Colorado and acting surly, and that Navajo “traders” were expected soon in Kanab caused the Kaibabit to flee their posts at the two major river crossings and at the Paria Indian Farm. Kanab’s Bishop Levi Stewart wrote Brigham Young on December 8 that “Bro. Hamblin has gone to Pipe spring for to try and raise a few men to go [guard the crossing at] the Pah-reah with some from this place” in response to Barbencito’s admonition for the Mormons to guard the Colorado River crossings. Stewart called for twenty additional men to augment the “thirty men all told” he had in the Kanab area “to man the mill, go on expeditions and to protect our interests here.” He expressed “full confidence in the Navajoes keeping the treaty made with Bro H. but [had] no Confidence in the raiding [Paiute] bands.”⁵⁸ On December 7, the day before Bishop Stewart wrote from Kanab, Joseph Young wrote from “Winsor Castle” that Jacob Hamblin called on him there to “consult about the safety of these outposts.” The two agreed that reinforcements from the Virgin River settlements were needed to guard the crossings, and to strengthen Kanab and Pipe Springs.⁵⁹ That same day, Young and Hamblin wrote a second letter to Erastus Snow to announce Patnish’s presence, describing him as “the one who led the Navajo in here the time that Dr. Whitmore and McIntyre were killed.” “His spirit is anything but good,” it read, “and it is evident that he would like to break up the treaty Bro. Hamblin has just effected with the Navajo.” Young and Hamblin reported that Patnish was mysteriously seeking an interview with Coal Creek John, the chief of the Cedar City

⁵⁸ Levi Stewart, Kanab, to Brigham Young, December 8, 1870, BYP.

⁵⁹ Joseph W. Young, Winsor Castle, to Pres. Erastus Snow, December 7, 1870, in St. George Manuscript History, 1:316, and James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:71.

Paiute who had been involved in the Berry Massacre, which Mormons now understood had been perpetrated by a combined force of Navajo and Paiute raiders augmented by friendly local Paiute seeking revenge for the killings of innocent Kaibab in the aftermath of the 1866 Pipe Springs raid.⁶⁰

Despite the success of the Hamblin peace treaty mission, in 1870 outposts on the southeastern frontier were still vulnerable to attack. Kaibab headman Chug, who was a baptized Latter-day Saint but still possessed of his native worldview, warned Hamblin there would be trouble from the southeast. Since peace had been established among the Pah-Channicks and the Navajo on the far side of the Colorado, Chug said that the *Tu-mu-ur-ru-gwait-si-gaip*, or “Rock Rovers” (which were certain evil spirits the Paiute believed had inspired the Navajo war in the first place), would now cross the river and make havoc in Kaibab lands. “Now [that] the Indians east of the river have all made peace,” Chug told Hamblin, “the evil spirits will have no place to stop over there. They have followed you [back] here. The destroyer will enter into the wind, fire and water, and do you [Mormons] all the mischief he can.”

⁶⁰ Joseph W. Young and Jacob Hamblin, Winsor Castle, to Pres. Erastus Snow, December 7, 1870, in James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:71–73, where it is erroneously listed as being sent by John W. Young and Jacob Hamblin.

Chapter 5

The Arrest of Brigham Young

*“Brigham Young Is Said to Be Founding a New Colony in Arizona, in Which
None but the Saints Will Be Admitted.”*

When Brigham Young arrived at Pipe Springs in September of 1870, he found Anson Winsor and his family and some hired hands camped in Whitmore’s old dugout, the Nauvoo Legion guardhouse and rock shed, and two wagon boxes they had taken off their chaises to use as tents.¹ Before the sun set, President Young personally directed Surveyor Fox in staking out the lines of his bastion indicating that a great deal of thought had already gone into the project. A fortnight later Young wrote to Horace S. Eldredge, serving a mission in England, that “we went to Pipe Springs, where we located a rock fort, to be 162 by 66 feet, to be so arranged as to accommodate a number of persons in case of an Indian attack. The fort will enclose a fine spring of good water, and when completed we propose naming it ‘Windsor Castle.’” Young’s letter to Eldredge also revealed his planned use of “Windsor Castle” was connected to his need to protect himself against federal prosecution and federal persecution. Young exclaimed to Eldredge

the late extraordinary proceedings of the US officials in this Territory; of the bombastic proclamations of his Excellency the Governor, of the extrajudicial powers claimed for the US officers in the late rulings of Chief Justice McKean, of the outrages of the soldiery at Provo, or the silly attack of the Governor on Gen. De Trobriand—all these have been

¹ KWMH, 13 September 1870.

ventilated in the *Deseret News* and *Salt Lake Herald* to an extent that will enable you to easily comprehend the situation and the folly of the men who esteem themselves equal to the task of uprooting the kingdom of God.”

Their “inglorious efforts” he continued had little impact on the Saints “who have seen so many of a like ilk fuss and fume away their brief period of office, and then sink into unregretted oblivion. So we feel assured it will be the case with those who at present are so tireless in endeavoring to stay the progress of the growing cause of Zion. God has not forsaken His people, nor left His Saints to take care of themselves.”²

Young’s next sentence in his letter to Eldredge focused on the Indian War, his second consideration in building the fort. He commented on Black Hawk, who had died the previous week and credited him as being “the most formidable foe amongst the red men that the Saints have had to encounter for many years.” Looking back over the Saints’ troubles with the Native Americans, he wrote that “were there no white men to purchase stolen stock and supply the Indians with whiskey and ammunition, there would be fewer Indian thieves and scarcely any Indian difficulties.” Here too, the Saints were obliged “to take care of themselves”—another reason for the building of Winsor Castle.³

Defensively a real, albeit tiny, castle, it was named for Anson Winsor, whose “noble” ancestors reportedly donated the land upon which the original Windsor Castle had been built.⁴ By initially using “Windsor,” Young may have tried to connect the proposed fort to a successful and illustrious past.⁵ Despite being named after its superintendent, like everything else in the

² Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, to President Horace S. Eldredge, October 4, 1870, in *MS 32* (1870), 701.

³ Brigham Young to Horace S. Eldredge, October 4, 1870.

⁴ Raymond B. and Maurine Winsor Farnsworth, *Winsor/Windsor Family History and Genealogies* (Provo, UT: n.p. 1986), 212.

⁵ Brigham Young to Horace S. Eldredge, October 4, 1870.

kingdom, Windsor Castle was Young's. When Young's estate was unraveled and his will executed after his death in August 1877, the line between Young's immense personal property and the even more colossal collection of church property he oversaw as Trustee in Trust was blurry, if not non-existent. From the start, Young's cattle enterprise at Pipe Springs, soon to be officially incorporated as The Winsor Castle Stock Growing Company, was part privately owned, part publicly owned, and in part owned by the Trustee in Trust of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, and no one, apparently not even Young, knew where private ownership ended and public and church ownership started. This confused status of private versus church ownership had existed among Mormon leaders at least since 1831, when Joseph Smith received his first revelation on the Law of Consecration and Stewardship, and Mormon historians have long acknowledged that "it is difficult to determine which of their financial transactions were purely personal and which were Church-related."⁶

Off again early on September 13, Young and a much-reduced entourage next arrived in Tokerville. Before he slept, Young dictated at least five important letters initiating his master plan in the Canaan desert. The first was addressed to Bishop Willis of Toquerville and Bishop John Parker of Virgin City, and dealt with the problem of transporting his steam sawmill up over the Hurricane Cliffs. He had arranged for its freighting before he left Salt Lake City. His letter called upon the bishops to provide extra spans of horses and mules to assist in dragging the mill and its heavy boiler up the huge incline on to the Hurricane Plateau and for "three good efficient men, with picks, spades and shovels" to accompany the heavy pieces of equipment and asked that "ten or fifteen men . . . work the road [especially] from Virgin City to Sheep Trough."

⁶ Lyndon W. Cook, *The Revelations of the Prophet Joseph Smith: A Historical and Biographical Commentary of the Doctrine and Covenants* (Provo, UT: Seventy's Mission Bookstore, 1981), especially 167.

Anxious that neither he nor the church be charged for this special road building to facilitate the construction of his fort, he ordered that this “be done at the expense of the County, to lengthen the turns and widen the crossings of gulches which will enable the teams loaded with Boiler to pass safely over.”⁷

His second letter was co-signed by President Wells, and addressed to “Elder Jacob Hamblin, Prest Indian Mission,” with instructions on how to run the Paria Indian Farm and involve the Kaibabit in defending the Latter-day Saints. Teaching the Native Americans to stand on their own as soon as possible, Hamblin was to “appoint some good Indian to act as Bishop at the Paria,” dividing church grain there among the Kaibabit. Care was to be taken that “the fodder and that portion of the grain belonging to the whites be preserved for [Nauvoo Legion] scouting parties.” Fundamental to his welfare policy, Young directed that “The Indians must be learned as fast as practicable to work to sustain themselves and not expect that the whites or other people will do their work for them.” Native scouts were to be posted “both at Paria and Kanab to watch for and give timely information of the approach of Navajoes or other hostile Indians.” This labor fulfilled the Mormon scriptural dictum that “the idler shall not eat the food of the laborer,” and that the “idler have no place in the church.”⁸ Young informed Hamblin that “arrangments [*sic*] have been made with Bro. Winsor to furnish you with the cows you lack for the Indian families you have promised” and ordered that “by no manner of means encourage either them or any other Indians of having arms and amunition to use against the whites.” His job as a missionary

⁷ Brigham Young, Toquerville, to Bps Willis of Toquerville & Parker of Virgin City, 13 September 1870, BYP.

⁸ Doctrine and Covenants, x.

was to “endeavor to induce them to resort to the more peaceful avocations of life such as keeping stock and raising grain for a subsistence.”⁹

The third letter written from Tokerville was addressed to “Bp Levi Stewart & Brethren at Kanab.” It contained some standard Mormon colonizing instructions, including the setting aside of specific blocks for a school, a meeting house, “and other public purposes” and urging them to “start a school for your children as speedily as possible” and to begin the immediate planting of “trees and shrubbery for shade and fruit.” Young was involved in the minutest level of detail and recommended “the mulberry and locust in preference to Cottonwood for shade.” The bulk of the letter dealt with the native peoples, reminding the Kanab settlers that they were “located and laying a foundation for a settlement far distant in an Indian country where it would be imposible [*sic*] to receive timely assistance in case that you should have to encounter hostilities with the Indians. Hence to a great extent you will have to rely upon your own resources and vigilance for your safety.” He chided them for being “already too careless” regarding the safety of their stock and for moving about in companies that were “too small.” He warned that “although the Indians in your midst appear friendly and may give you timely notice of the approach of the Navajoes,” that it was “not safe to trust [themselves] entirely to them, as the only means of information and consequent safety.” Like he had warned all frontier settlements before them, he cautioned Bishop Stewart and the “Brethren at Kanab” to keep their horses and cattle within “reach” and not “allow them to go off at such distance as they are at the present time.” The threat of depredations was real. Considering that the Black Hawk War had not fully ended, and that the related Navajo

⁹ Brigham Young and Daniel H. Wells, Toker[ville], to Elder Jacob Hamblin, Prest Indian Mission, September 13, 1870.

War was in full swing, he ordered them that “the fort that you live in now should be fixed up in good style” and further commanded:

You must keep your stock in bye places or nooks well guarded so that they cannot be reached by hostile Indians without your knowledge; and when you travel from place to place on business or otherwise, be sure that you go in sufficient numbers to protect yourselves against any wandering band of Indians you may happen to encounter. No night should pass without having inside your corrals or stables at least a sufficient number of horses to mount your men—And all this vigilance should be constantly kept up.

Wherever you locate the mill, you should build a block house from which you can with your guns command the mill & surroundings, and have men sufficient to defend the same . . . observing the above rules concerning [the corralling or stabling of adequate numbers of horses for defense].

As in all frontier Mormon communities, especially while they were in their earliest stages of development, the Brethren at Kanab were “required to observe the counsel of the Bishop in water and land matters and receive the land and the amt thereof as he shall appoint.” Reminding them against individualism, he advised “that you organise a cooperative herd and value your stock when put in and taken out—and that you also establish a cooperative store, owned by the people; so as to prevent any speculator from coming in with goods.” Kanab and Pipe Springs were both founded in the high pitch of Young’s cooperative movement and both would be

significantly shaped by it. The native peoples were included in this cooperation, and Bishop Stewart was ordered to “preserve the grain allotted to the Indians at Kanab, and cause that it be dealt out to them from day to day, as they need it.” All were to “render to Bro. Hamblin” and his native wards, “such needed assistance [*sic*] as may be in your power to afford.”¹⁰

The next morning, before leaving Tokerville for St. George, President Young dictated a fourth letter. Though only three sentences long, it inaugurated the collection of tithing cattle at Pipe Springs. Addressed “To the Bishops of the several Wards in Kane, Washington, & Iron Counties,” it read:

Dear Brethren:

The Cooperative Stores in your wards and those employed therein which do not pay their tithing in cash should pay it in stock at cash rates, delivered to Bro. Winsor. If the stores and those thus employed will do this punctually they will attain to greater prosperity than if neglected. The tithing due from the Cooperative Store at St George should be used in constructing the Meeting House at that place.¹¹

This short letter calls attention to the fact that the planned tithing ranch at Pipe Springs was designed to gather tithing stock in Kane, Washington, and Iron Counties and to serve St. George, Washington, Santa Clara, Virgin City, Tokerville, Rockville, Grafton, Harmony, Kanaraville,

¹⁰ Brigham Young and Daniel H. Wells, Tokerville, to Bp. Levi Stewart & Brethren at Kanab, September 13, 1870, BYLB, SCA.

¹¹ Brigham Young, Toker[ville] to the Bishops of the several Wards in Kane, Washington, & Iron Counties, September 14, 1870, BYLB, SCA.

Cedar City, Parowan, Paragona, and scores of smaller villages and ranches now including Kanab, and soon to include the resettled Long Valley settlements. A similar tithing ranch and fort located at Cove Creek between Beaver and Fillmore, established some two years earlier, serviced those two major centers and their satellite villages and ranches. Other church farms and tithing ranches existed near all other Mormon centers, but only those in exposed Native American country, such as Pipe Springs and Cove Fort, required extensive protective bastions. Young was contemplating moving tithing stock from northern Utah, in part to get them away from Internal Revenue assessors, some of whom considered tithing the prophet's personal income.

By 1870 almost any Mormon hamlet worthy of the designation city, town, or village had at least one tithing office and a cooperative store, both overseen by a local bishop and the latter designated by a painting of an "all seeing eye" in a triangle under which was written "*Holiness to the Lord.*" Large towns often had tithing offices and cooperative stores in each ward. Young's letter to the Kane, Washington, and Iron county bishops reiterated that tithing was preferably to be paid in cash, but as cash on the Mormon frontier (or anywhere in Utah, for that matter) was a hard commodity to come by, livestock was second best and could be paid in as tithing at cash rates. These rates were regularly established by local priesthood authorities acting together in elite "Schools of the Prophets" committees that acted as Boards of Trade and who set cash values for horses, bulls, steers, cows, heifers, calves, and sheep, frequently regulating these prices based on local and territorial economic conditions. Schools of the Prophets were organized by Young and his apostles in stakes and larger wards as an economic defense to keep gentiles from upsetting their economic plans.¹²

¹² *Great Basin Kingdom*; and Woodruff, *Journal*, 6:481.

Before his appointment as Pipe Springs tithing herd supervisor, Anson Perry Winsor had served as bishop of Grafton and then of Rockville, and in the more important calling of “presiding bishop” or “regional bishop” of all settlements on the upper Virgin River. He had long been authorized to receive and watch over all tithing matters in settlements like Virgin City, Tokerville, Rockville, Grafton, Duncan’s Retreat, and Springdale. His call as tithing ranch superintendent at Pipe Springs grew out of his “presiding bishopric,” if indeed, it was not directly attached to it.¹³ The years of experience it had provided, as well as the trust he had garnered with Brigham Young and Edward Hunter, the general presiding bishop of the whole church, had prepared him for what lay ahead. Winsor was a born leader, capable businessman and fastidious agriculturalist. In his position, Winsor was authorized to receive tithing stock directly in all three counties then settled in southern Utah. He was to call on cooperative stores, and their employees (who were viewed as church employees) to turn their cattle stock directly over to himself, instead of to their local bishops. Although yet to be revealed, Young planned to build a temple in St. George. Having tithing stock placed directly in Winsor’s hands allowed Young immediate access to it for temple building purposes.

In the kingdom’s frontier economy, there simply was not enough tithing to meet the pressing temporal needs of the people, let alone to build costly temples. Since tithing was most often paid in kind, there was a great amount of spoilage of produce, and the expensive care of various commodities reduced their values at each level as tithes were passed up the line. Young often complained that the First Presidency only got access to tithing residues which had been reduced at each ecclesiastical level as they were passed along.¹⁴ Determined to make temple-

¹³ In Mormonism, a bishop is ordained for life.

¹⁴ Young expressed a frustration he felt throughout his presidency: “I do not get enough tithing to pay the clerks” to record it. *L. John Nuttall: Diary Excerpts*, comp. Ogden Kraut (Salt Lake City: Pioneer Press, 1994), 27.

building his highest priority, however, Young appointing Bishop Winsor his special agent, empowering him to gather livestock tithing directly from individuals, and directly from the officers of their chief communal enterprises, i.e., their cooperative stores, cattle herds and commercial businesses (which Young had established in part for this very purpose). Winsor was to do this without putting the stock under the control of local bishops or stake presidents or their respective tithing offices, or for that matter, under the control of the Presiding Bishopric in Salt Lake City who normally managed all tithing funds. This slight organizational realignment, ingeniously (and contrary to the Revelations of Joseph Smith) put Young in direct and personal control of a sizable portion of the tithing funds without allowing his underlings to allocate it to other pressing projects. Without such an organizational realignment, Young knew he would not see a temple completed in his lifetime.¹⁵ The new system would also help finance the Logan and Manti temples, and help finish the Salt Lake Temple—whose forty-year building period was lengthened as much by lack of funds as by any other factor.

Temple ordinances, which lay at the very heart of Mormonism, fueled Young's emphasis on completing temples.¹⁶ The primary reason he had settled his Great Basin kingdom was so that he and his people could build their temples in peace, and there receive holy ordinances in which they made sacred covenants with their God which prepared them for Godhood. Young, in a revealed theology he received from the prophet Joseph Smith, viewed the temple, the very house of God itself, along with its sacred covenants and ordinances, as the ultimate earthly bastion, the

¹⁵ Young did live to see the completion of the St. George Temple, at a cost of \$500,000, passing away just **two** months after its final dedication. Just after its completion, Bishop A. Milton Musser, one of Young's chief financial agents and bookkeepers, announced to the world that "A Temple has just been finished in St. George, at a cost of \$500,000." See A. Milton Musser, *The Fruits of "Mormonism," by Non-"Mormon" Witnesses* (Salt Lake City: Deseret News Printing Establishment, 1878), 29.

¹⁶ **David John Beurger, *The Mysteries of Godliness: A History of Mormon Temple Worship* (San Francisco: Smith Research Associates, 1994).**

veritable center of any city of refuge.¹⁷ In each temple, the Saints would be “endowed with power from on high” that they “might escape the power of the enemy, and be gathered unto me a righteous people, without spot and blameless.”¹⁸ The temples themselves were the entry point to the quintessential city of refuge, Zion, the New Jerusalem. The Holy of Holies, it was the very gate to the “better country, that is, an heavenly” to which all righteous men and women of faith pressed forward, confessing they were “strangers and pilgrims on the earth.”¹⁹

The theology of the Latter-day Saints held that Jesus Christ himself had given Joseph Smith a principle with promise, which now rested upon the square and aging shoulders of Brigham Young. The promise, according to Joseph Smith’s revelations, involved both blessings and cursings, depending upon the diligence and sacrifice his people manifested in temple building. The blessing promised “If ye labor with all your might, [in temple building] I will consecrate that spot that it shall be made holy. And if my people will hearken unto my voice, and unto the voice of my servants whom I have appointed to lead my people [regarding temple building], behold, verily I say unto you, they shall not be moved out of their place.”²⁰ This was a blessing Brigham Young believed in implicitly. And having personally (and with the whole church) been “moved out of his place” five different times, each time losing all of his property, and with the whole nation now demanding that Congress drive the Mormons from Utah, this was a blessing from heaven Brigham Young wanted to secure.

¹⁷ The Holy Temple, with its covenants, its washings and anointings, its endowments and investitures, its impartation of the Grand Key Words of the Holy Priesthood, its “holy grounds,” “holy ordinances, and charters, and... holy words,” was God’s mighty fortress against Satan and his forces that the Saints were engaged in battling. Doctrine and Covenants, 124:46.

¹⁸ Doctrine and Covenants, 38, especially verses 31, 32.

¹⁹ Hebrews 11:8–22.

²⁰ Doctrine and Covenants, 124:45.

Young's determination was to renew and redeem Deseret: to make it a protected Canaan again, by renewing his own commitment, and that of his people to temple building; to temple ordinances; and most of all, to the living of temple covenants. These drove him to develop his "New Canaan" policy and turn toward Pipe Springs. He was particularly committed to "the Law of Consecration and Stewardship," which he defined as living the United Order, a communal economic manner of living, "having all things in common," based the Book of Acts, the Book of Mormon, and multiple revelations received by the Prophet Joseph Smith. Pipe Springs and its tithing ranch allowed for the building of the St. George temple, the first "House of the Lord" to be completed in Utah. A temple must be built deep in the heart of the natural bastion God had prepared, a place guarded by natural barriers: a place where his people could militarily and economically exclude others, to protect the holy rituals they held most dear. Intentionally and strategically designated for this very purpose, St. George, by Young's careful nurturing, was becoming the second city of Utah.²¹ Pipe Springs was now destined to be the bank from which Young could finance construction of the St. George Temple, the largest and most expensive single structure built thus far in the territory of Utah. Significantly, Brigham's bank, like his bastion, was strategically located near the border in Arizona, out of the reach of Utah's federal officials. In what would come to be called the Arizona Strip, the mighty Colorado and its almost impenetrable Grand Canyon protected Pipe Springs from Arizona officials. There he could guard the tithing herds from the Navajo, from malicious federal officers, as well as from hosts of his own well-meaning bishops, presidents, and tithing house officers intent on using them all for other purposes—like feeding the native peoples and the poor and pushing forward other building projects and less important public works. Constructing the St. George Temple, and making sure

²¹ Woodruff, *Journal*, x.

he had the longevity, peace, freedom, and wherewithal to do it, became the great last goals of Brigham Young's life and his Pipe Springs fortress was key to obtaining them.

On Thursday September 15, 1870, Brigham Young and his entourage closed out their Pipe Springs-Kanab exploration tour by holding an evening meeting in St. George. The "seats were filled long before the hour appointed." President Wells spoke on what was required to be a Saint, showing "that it took Moral courage to Stand out against the world and live the life of the righteous." Robert Taylor Burton followed, speaking "on the difficulties the saints had to undergo in this desert region." Emphasizing Young's recent decision to "Stand . . . against the world" in this country and not flee to another, Taylor urged the Saints to be content with their country and "Showed that the Blessings of contentment was preferable to wandering up and down seeking a better place a little way beyond." Brigham Young concluded by giving a brief overview of "his t[r]avels this Season," which included his April visit to the "Land of Canaan" stretching from the Hurricane Ledge along the Vermillion Cliffs through Short Creek and Pipe Springs to Kanab. The "object" of these trips, he told the St. George Saints, was "to look up all the available places that would do for the saints to dwell in" in this time of danger.²² "Our enemies at present were like a thousand hungry wolves surrounding a Forest in which was one sollitary [*sic*] little Lamb at which they were howling, yelping and barking . . . all thirsting for its Blood." Connecting this threat to the deliverance he saw in this New Canaan, he "Spoke of the advantages of the country in the region of Kannab," and "urged the importance of the darey [dairy] business and of filling those immence [*sic*] plains" around Short Creek, Pipe Springs, and Kanab "with Stock."²³

²² Charles Walker, *Diary*, 1:318.

²³ Charles Walker, *Diary*, 1:318.

The president and his party left for Salt Lake City early the next morning, September 16. By the 17th, telegraphic dispatches had reached St. George announcing that Utah's "war governor," J. Wilson Shaffer, asserted his rights as commander in chief of the militia of the Territory of Utah by issuing a pair of official proclamations that in essence abolished the Nauvoo Legion. Charles Walker wrote in his journal that "Gov Schaffer . . . Prohibits the gathering of men with arms either in Public drills or reviews and [demands the return of] all arms . . . given us belonging to the US" and that the anti-Mormon governor "would like all private arms of the Mormon Boys, if He could get them." "It is quite evident," Walker concluded, "that our foes are bent on mischief toward us and are trying every plan to bring us in collision with them to spill our Blood."²⁴ Young had hardly returned from strengthening Kanab and laying out his new fort at Pipe Springs when newspapers in the eastern United States began to show that someone, perhaps the "lusty old criminal" himself, was leaking the prophet's plans to create a safe haven for "persecuted Mormons" on the Utah-Arizona border. For example, as early as October 7, 1870, the *Emporia News* in Kansas, announced that "Brigham Young is said to be founding a new colony in Arizona, in which none but the saints will be admitted."²⁵

Early observers of the fort noted its potential to protect and provide defense for its inhabitants. Frederick Dellenbaugh, a seventeen-year-old artist with the Powell Survey, wrote a description of his first visit to Winsor Castle in March 1871 many years later and after making repeated trips through Mormondom and after visiting scores of Mormon forts.

²⁴ Charles Walker, *Diary*, 1:318–319.

²⁵ *Emporia Weekly News* (Emporia, KS), October 7, 1870, 1, and October 20, 1871, 2, NPC.

For protection against raiders Mr. Winsor was building a solid double house of blocks of sandstone, making walls three feet thick. The two buildings were placed about twenty feet apart, thus forming an interior court the length of the houses, protected at the ends by high walls and heavy gates. No windows opened on the exterior, but there were plenty of loopholes commanding every approach. A fine large spring was conducted subterraneously into the corner of one of the buildings and out again, insuring plenty of water in case of a siege. Brigham Young was part owner of this establishment, and it was one of the most effective places of defence [sic] on a small scale, that I have ever seen. It was never needed so far as I have heard, and even at the time I marvelled [sic] that it should be so elaborately prepared--far beyond anything else in the whole country.²⁶

Dellenbaugh was as acquainted with Mormon forts as any gentile and while he seemed to be unaware of Young's planned use of "Winsor Castle," as a personal refuge, he knew at least that the church president was "part owner of this establishment."

In the years before its completion, the need for Winsor Castle as a refuge from the federal government grew in importance. John H. Beadle, an anti-Mormon who helped Bill Hickman write his *Confessions* in 1871 and 1872, wrote that already by the Autumn of 1870 the notorious Mormon murderer Hickman had "taken refuge at Kanab, the new Mormon stronghold supposed also to be the hiding place of Burton (murderer of the Morrisites), Porter Rockwell, and other Danites, who, like Brigham Young, have 'gone South for their health.'" Hickman was accused of having been a "Danite," a Latter-day Saint hit-man, or "avenging angel" for Young. By 1871 Hickman had left the Church and become a full-fledged enemy to Young and his Kingdom, and

²⁶ *Emporia Weekly News* (Emporia, KS), October 7, 1870, 1, and October 20, 1871, 2, NPC.

promised to testify against the church president in open court. In 1870, however, while the two were still on strained speaking terms, Young urged Hickman to avoid arrest by hiding in “the new Mormon stronghold . . . and hiding place” he was building in Kanab.²⁷ John D. Lee and Isaac C. Haight, infamous for their roles in the Mountain Meadows Massacre, apparently followed quick on Hickman’s heels. So did Robert T. Burton who was indicted in the fall of 1870 for allegedly “murdering” a “false prophet” named Joseph Morris and several of his followers while serving as a US Deputy Marshal in 1862.”²⁸ Should the federal government seek to enforce the 1862 Morrill anti-bigamy act, there would be thousands of such “lambs” needing protection in addition to those who committed atrocities at Mountain Meadows Massacre. To provide adequate protection, Kanab needed to be “settled up” at once, and at the October 1870 conference, Young called for one hundred families to strengthen the southern settlements.²⁹

Governor Shaffer’s proclamation gave Young further cause for concern that he and his people were under attack. The Nauvoo Legion was an unusual private church army which doubled as Utah’s territorial militia and was Young’s greatest visible expression of his actual power. Shaffer’s proclamations were designed to obliterate the Nauvoo Legion and thereby Young’s “threatening power.” The proclamations tore control of the territorial militia from Young’s hands and firmly placed it in the governor’s by prohibiting all “musters, drills, or

²⁷ William Hickman, and J. H. Beadle, *Brigham’s Destroying Angel: Being the Life, Confession, and Startling Disclosures of the Notorious Bill Hickman, the Danite Chief of Utah* (New York: G. A. Crofutt, 1872), especially vi. See also Hope A. Hilton, “Wild Bill” *Hickman and the Mormon Frontier* (Salt Lake City: Signature Books, 1988).

²⁸ Journal History of the Church (hereafter JH), May 10, 1871, 2; Robert Glass Cleland and Juanita Brooks, eds., *A Mormon Chronicle: The Diaries of John D. Lee: 1848–1876* (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1983), 2:174; Hickman and Beadle, *Brigham’s Destroying Angel*, 161, 211–214; C. LeRoy Anderson, *Joseph Morris and the Saga of the Morrisites* (Logan, UT: Utah State University Press, 1988); and Janet Seegmiller, “Be Kind to the Poor”: *The Life Story of Robert Taylor Burton* (Salt Lake City: Robert Taylor Burton Family Organization, 1988), 213–227, 267–280, especially 274.

²⁹ James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:58.

gatherings of militia [in] the Territory of Utah,” except upon Shaffer’s personal orders. Shaffer also appointed Young’s old nemesis, Patrick Connor, as major-general of the Utah Territorial Militia and ordered that “all arms or munitions of war belonging to either the United States or the Territory of Utah,” be turned in to Major-General Connor’s assistant adjutant-general. For Young to call out the Nauvoo Legion on his own authority now would be an illegal act of high treason, punishable by death. The national press trumpeted that Governor Shaffer had “taken steps to checkmate Brigham Young and his followers.” The papers exuberantly declared that “if at any future time the government finds it necessary to send a force against Brigham, to bring him to his senses, it intends that . . . he shall have no armed ‘legion’ [with] which he may oppose . . . Federal authority.” Shaffer expected the proclamations to provoke a confrontation. “Brigham Young has played his game of bluff long enough,” Grant’s war governor challenged, “I will make him show his hand.” In an exchange of letters between Governor Shaffer and Daniel H. Wells, lieutenant general of the now defunct legion, Shaffer insisted that the only lieutenant general recognized by law was General Philip H. Sheridan of the United States Army. The governor further made it clear to First Presidency that he would do nothing which “would aid you and your turbulent associates to further convince your followers that you . . . are more powerful than the Federal government.”³⁰ Meanwhile, newspapers in the east prognosticated that Young would not give up his army “without some kind of a struggle,” and prophesied that “unless great prudence is exercised there will be a military collision.” Considering “the present temper of the public mind,” they forecast that “it would require but very little aggravation on [the

³⁰ Tullidge, *History of Salt Lake City*, 483, 490; J. M. B., “Mormons and Mormonism, XLII,” *The Christian Advocate* 80 (November 9, 1905): 1776, GB; “Checkmating the Mormons,” *New Port Mercury* (Newport, RI), 1 October 1870, 2, GBC; and *Democratic Enquirer* (M’Arthur, OH), December 7, 1870, 2, CALOC.

prophet's] part to justify a general cleaning out of the whole Mormon tribe."³¹ At midnight on September 23, 1870, some fifty US troops from the newly established Camp Rawlins entered Provo "armed with needle-guns, bayonets, and revolvers." Crazed with whiskey, they wantonly fired shots into windows, smashed in doors, wrecked houses, and paraded defenseless citizens through the streets, "beating them with rifles and pricking them with [their] bayonets." For hours they wandered Provo's streets yelling, "Come out, you God damned Mormons and Mountain Meadows massacreers."³²

Young had peacefully passed through Provo the day before the riot on his way home from Pipe Springs. Had he shown his hand by deploying the Nauvoo Legion to punish the riotous troops, the "second Mormon War" the nation expected and many hoped for, might have actually come. Instead, Young exercised restraint. After Shaffer's death from consumption on October 31, however, Young tested the proclamations outlawing his church army by two provocations of his own. The first, described by a contemporary as a "militia serio-comedy," occurred on November 21, 1870, and was known in Utah History as the "Wooden Gun Rebellion." At the regular time for the annual muster of the Nauvoo Legion, approximately one hundred legionnaires, in the spirit of humor and fun, assembled on their normal muster-grounds in the twentieth-ward square in Salt Lake City, carrying "wooden guns" so as not to *blatantly* violate Shaffer's proclamations. In the absence of a governor, Territorial Secretary George A. Black upheld Shaffer's proclamations, and eight Nauvoo Legion officers were arrested and charged with treason.³³

³¹ *Massachusetts Spy* (Worcester, MA), 30 September 1870, 2, GBC; *Hartford Daily Courant* (Hartford, CT), 23 September 1870, 2, GBC; and *New Port Mercury* (Newport, RI), 1 October 1870, 2, GBC.

³² Hubert Howe Bancroft, *History of Utah, 1540-1887* (San Francisco: The History Company, 1890), 660.

³³ Tullidge, *History of Salt Lake City*, 492-498.

In a much more serious and potentially catastrophic provocation on the 4th of July, 1871, Young, through the lieutenant-general of his defunct legion, Daniel H. Wells, “set at defiance the proclamation forbidding the assembly of militia without the Governor’s order.” His purpose was “to try the temper of [the] Territorial authorities,” and “to maintain the organization of the Nauvoo Legion outside of [the] control of the Governor of the Territory” by “ordering out the Mormon militia for parade on the Fourth.”³⁴ The remarkable circumstance took place during the absence of the new gentile governor of Utah, George L. Wood, who had gone to Washington “to consult with the President upon Mormon affairs.” The idea was to test Governor Shaffer’s proclamations while Governor Woods was away. Acting Governor George A. Black, whom Mormons called “King George II,” was a “boy” in his twenties who had been prepared in advance by “King George I” to deal sternly with such challenges.³⁵ The prophet’s dangerous contest demonstrated that Shaffer’s proclamations had originated with President Grant and would be enforced by the United States Department of War. On June 22, Daniel H. Wells ordered the commandant of the legion’s Salt Lake military district to furnish the parade with several martial bands, one company of artillery with ordnance “to fire salutes, etc.,” one company of cavalry, and three companies of infantry. The request was published in the *Deseret News*.

On June 30, Acting Governor George A. Black issued a third proclamation, this one forbidding the militia to march in the parade, as it would violate Governor Shaffer’s earlier proclamations. Meanwhile, Black, after consulting with President Grant, his cabinet, and the

³⁴ See “Utah Affairs: Bold Assumption of Authority by the Mormon Militia—The Church Determined to Force an Issue—The Governor’s Powers Defied. . .,” in *New York Herald*, June 29, 1871, 3, GBC. See also *New York Herald*, July 1, 1871, 4, GBC; and *New York Tribune*, July 1, 1871, 5, GBC.

³⁵ *Salt Lake Herald*, November 9, 1873, 3, UDN.

whole chain-of-command of the War Department, publicly ordered General Regis De Trobriand, commandant of United States forces at Fort Douglass, to post three companies of US soldiers backed by heavy artillery (loaded with live ammunition), on the streets of the city to enforce Shaffer's proclamations, as well as his own. Young shrewdly, and dangerously, used the celebration of "the 95th anniversary of our Nation's Independence" to make the Saints look like patriotic victims simply trying celebrate the basic American rights some of their fathers had died for. Turning the controversy over the parade into a media circus, Young hoped the glaring paradox of the United States government stripping its citizens of their right to bear arms in a Fourth of July parade would shift public opinion in the east and throw a cog in Grant's Utah policy. As the date of the national celebration approached, Young and Acting Governor Black, and their respective military establishments, stared each other down, with General Trobriand (a tough but peace-loving patriot who could see both sides' points of view) caught in the middle.

Wells and Young timed their orchestrated spectacle perfectly to allow international attention to crest on the morning of the Fourth of July itself, drawing worldwide attention to the showdown in Salt Lake City. On the morning of the fourth, three companies of Nauvoo Legion infantrymen lined up fully armed and uniformed. The mounted division also queued up, with their horses richly caparisoned. The martial bands and artillery Wells had ordered were also in place. At a point down the pre-determined parade route, General De Trobriand had posted three companies of US troops with artillery of their own. De Trobriand, a friend of the Mormons but an obedient soldier, let it be known that he had orders to destroy the Nauvoo Legionnaires should they march in the parade and that he was prepared to do it. Acting Governor Black had orders from Washington to enforce the proclamations to the letter no matter who got hurt in the process. As the parade commenced, De Trobriand "rode round viewing the procession" to be sure the

Nauvoo Legion did not march. Brigham Young was the first to blink. At the last possible moment, Young reportedly replaced his armed legionnaires in the parade lineup with 300 young Mormon girls crowned with flowers and wearing pure white dresses. These female products of polygamy marched past De Trobriand's tense troops bearing banners touting "Liberty," "Freedom," "The Constitution," and "President Grant." Considering the circumstances, the banners, of course, were meant to be sarcastic, but the event passed without bloodshed.

Both sides claimed victory. De Trobriand's troops returned to Camp Douglas victorious for having prohibited the Nauvoo Legion from marching in the parade. The Nauvoo Legion did march that day, however, but not on the parade route. In an orderly fashion they made their own route to the Tabernacle, where Independence Day speeches were to be delivered. After solemnly firing their canons "to celebrate the fourth," Brigham's legionnaires neatly "deposited their arms, & attended [the] Tabernacle without them, and after [the] service closed . . . resumed their arms and retired to thier [sic] homes in good order." That night Nauvoo Legion Lieutenant General Daniel H. Wells telegraphed Brigham Young, who was in Soda Springs, Idaho, to assure him that the prophet's "programme" was "fully carried out" and that General De Trobriand returned to Camp Douglas "perfectly satisfied that we were fully competent to take care of ourselves." "The firing of our cannon," Wells told Young, "never sounded as lovely to me as to day."³⁶

³⁶ De Trobriand, a knighted French aristocrat, had renounced his native citizenship to become an American general. Many of the Nauvoo Legion officers were bishops. For information on this event see "The Utah Troubles: The History of the Military Difficulty. . . . A Possible Fuss To-Morrow," in *New York Herald*, July 4, 1871, 6, GBC; George A. Black, Secretary and Acting-Governor, and Commander in Chief of the Militia of Utah Territory, Executive Department, Salt Lake City, Utah Territory, "Proclamation," June 30, 1871, and George A. Black, Acting Governor, U. T., Executive Department, Salt Lake City, Utah Territory, to Col. P. R. de Trobriand, Commandant at Camp Douglas, July 1, 1871, both in RG 60, General Records of the Department of Justice, Letters Received, Source Chronological Files, 1871–1884, Utah, Dec. 1870–July 1871, b1011, NA; Regis de Trobriand, Col. 13th Inf., Camp Douglas, U. T. to George A. Black, Secretary and Acting Governor of Utah Territory, Salt Lake City, UT, July 2, 1871, NA, RG 393, pt. 1, 3731, Department of the Platte, Headquarters, Letters Received; D. H. Wells, Salt Lake, to Prest. B. Young, telegram, July 4, 1872, BYP; Tullidge, *History of Salt Lake City*, 499–505; Marie Caroline Post, *The Life and Memoirs of Comte Regis de Trobriand, Major-General in the Army of the United States by his*

Wilford Woodruff was with Brigham Young when he received Wells' telegram the next day and wrote in his diary: "Our Enemies were Defeated & we triumph[h]ed."³⁷

For nearly a week, newspapers across the country chronicled the standoff, finally rejoicing that the Mormon "change of mind was effected by the determined attitude of the United States officers, and the presence of a strong body of United States troops in [Salt Lake City]." The papers trumpeted that "the victory was the first ever fairly won in Utah," and that "the supremacy of the United States law over the decrees of the Mormon Church was for the first time fully vindicated." In the end most agreed that "Nothing short of a deadly conflict induced the church leaders to surrender their arrogant claims." Many felt that it was the symbolic end of Mormon power.³⁸

From the earliest days of the territory of Utah, Brigham Young used the provisions of the Northwest Ordinance of 1798 to allow the territorial legislature to legally authorize that all criminal cases in Utah be tried by local county probate courts whose judges and juries were Latter-day Saints. For years this unique system protected Mormons charged with polygamy, involvement in the Mountain Meadows Massacre, and other crimes and misdemeanors from being tried in gentile-controlled federal courts. During this period, local bishops acted as probate judges, essentially making territorial courts ecclesiastical courts. If Brigham Young did not want a case tried, a quick word to the bishop kept it off his docket. Similarly, juries could be instructed by church leaders as to what their decisions should be. This changed when President Grant appointed James B. McKean as the territory's Chief Justice in 1870. While the pageantry of

Daughter, Marie Caroline Post (New York: E. P. Dutton & Company, 1910), 423–425; and *Deseret News*, June 3, 1874, 10, UDN.

³⁷ Woodruff, *Journal*, 7:22.

³⁸ *Albany Evening Journal*, July 6, 1871, 3.

Governor Shaffer's emasculation of the Nauvoo Legion unfolded, Chief Justice McKean had been slowly dismantling twenty years of expert Latter-day Saint legislation and jurisprudence that kept the courts firmly in the control of the Mormon majority.

After Governor Shaffer's death, Chief Justice McKean became the leader of what Mormons called "the Gentile Ring," "the anti-Mormon Ring," "the Utah Ring," or just simply "the Ring," or "the Clique." Young himself often called the ring "the McKeanites." The Ring was a group of important federal officials, newspapermen, attorneys and businessmen who dedicated themselves to destroying both polygamy and the Mormon theocracy.³⁹ The group alternatively met in the dining room of Utah's fanciest hotel, the Townsend House, or in the lounge of the nearby Wasatch Club. The Ring kept in close contact with President Grant, his cabinet, important congressmembers in Washington, and key officers in the departments of War and Justice, as well as powerful members of the Protestant clergy who were particularly opposed to Mormonism. Though members of the Ring represented themselves as patriots of the highest order, the Mormons and many gentiles viewed them as scheming "political adventurers" bent on profiting financially and politically from the Republican Party's Reconstruction policies.⁴⁰ Of their type, Brigham Young and his advisors sometimes said, "They cry Polygamy but mean

³⁹ *Cincinnati Commercial [newspaper]*, quoted in *Salt Lake Herald*, November 7, 1871, 2, UDN. By the fall of 1871, the Ring included McKean and his associate justices C. M. Hawley and O. F. Strickland; Schaffer's successor, Governor George L. Woods; the Secretary of the Territory, George A. Black; the United States Assessor for Utah, J. H. Taggart; and the territory's chief tax collector, O. J. Hollister, who happened to be the brother-in-law of Vice President Colfax. They were joined by several editors of anti-Mormon newspapers and a host of other non-Mormon movers and shakers including R. N. Baskin, the author of the Cullom Bill. It was a common belief among both Mormons and gentiles that "the success of the first Mormon War (a \$40,000,000 steal) makes the thieves smack their lips for more pickings from the [United States] Treasury." Geo. Francis Train, New York, to President Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, January 15, 1870, BYP.

⁴⁰ *New York Herald*, November 16, 1871, 2, NPC; *Salt Lake Telegram*, May 28, 1902, 8, UDN; Townsend, *The Mormon Trials*, 6, 16–25, BYLB; Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, to Horace S. Eldredge, N. Y. City, January 24, 1872, BYLB; Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, to Edward Young, Clintonville, Waupaca Co., Wis., January 25, 1872, BYLB; and Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, to Willard Young, West Point, NY, January 26, 1872, BYLB.

Plunder!”⁴¹ believing “these scoundrels” used feigned indignation over polygamy to design ways to rob the Latter-day Saints of their lands and improvements, gain supremacy over certain lucrative mines, or at least to profit from military contracts should they succeed in provoking the United States to make war on polygamous Utah.⁴² One discerning eastern journalist reported that they were called “the Jumpers’ Club” because some of them used their offices to “‘jump’ or possess without right and by force . . . valuable mining claims” and other properties held by both Mormons and gentiles.⁴³ It was widely held both in and out of Utah that the Ring’s sole purpose was to create a collision between the United States and the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints that would result in a Mormon exodus to Mexico, leaving all their improvements up for grabs.⁴⁴

Chief Justice McKean was a former Methodist minister and friend of the Right Reverend Dr. John Philip Newman, who during these years was the Pastor of the Metropolitan Methodist Episcopal Church in Washington, DC, the personal minister of President Grant, and official chaplain of the United States Senate. Latter-day Saints often identified Newman as the “power behind the throne” as far as Grant’s religious crusade against them was concerned and “Reverend McKean” as his right-hand man. Contemporary newspapers represented the Right Reverend Dr. Newman as “perhaps the most popular of Methodist pulpit orators.” He led a powerful lobby of

⁴¹ *Salt Lake Herald*, September 24, 1871, 2, UDN.

⁴² The Mormon press repeatedly charged that “while the nation is worked upon with the cry of polygamy,” the Ring’s “real object” was “to break up the community as a religious organization, destroy the leaders and the people, [and] scatter them [as] wanderers again on the earth.” The *Salt Lake Herald* alleged that “from the arbitrary course now being pursued there is an evident intention on the part of some of the [federal] officials, at least, to goad the people into desperation, so that some overt act may be committed that will give a color for calling upon the general government for an army to be sent here to chastise them.” The paper alleged that “these men aim at stripping the people, who settled and made this Territory what it is” and marveled that “all this is aimed at under the cover of law.”

⁴³ James Bonwick, *The Mormons and the Silver Mines* (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1872), 177.

⁴⁴ *Cincinnati Commercial*, quoted in *Salt Lake Herald*, November 7, 1871, 2, UDN.

Protestant clerics in Congress, and worked behind the scenes in Washington to operate against the Latter-day Saint theocracy, reportedly because Joseph and Emma Smith, Brigham Young, John Taylor, and a host of other Mormon leaders had roots in the Methodist Church and had “robbed” tens of thousands of “Methodist Sheep.” Like Joseph Smith himself, Reverend Newman was a product of the Burnt-over District of New York, where the fires of the Second Great Awakening produced unusually powerful zeal and fiery oratory. President Grant once jokingly but honestly stated, that “there were three political parties [then] in America—the Republicans, the Democrats, and the Methodists.” Newman moved eastern congregations by “declaring that such a man as Young must and should be put down, and that Mormonism as a despotism must cease under the flag of our country.” Putting pressure on Grant, he proclaimed that “it will be the glory of this administration if the iniquity [of Mormonism] is removed from the face of the earth” by the hero of Appomattox. The Mormon press thundered back that “the ferocious parson” was “a rabid religious fanatic, thirsting for the blood of those who will not conform to his false and narrow creed and bloody bigotry” and that he was “actively inciting the US Government and the nation to deeds of murder, spoliation and rapine upon the most law-abiding and innocent community on the American continent, or in the world.”⁴⁵ Mormon Apostle George Q. Cannon once wrote that McKean was “the most unrelenting, persevering and active enemy that [the LDS Church] ever knew.”⁴⁶ According to prosecuting attorney George C. Bates, McKean’s single purpose was “to consummate the judicial murder of Brigham Young,

⁴⁵ *New York Commercial Advertiser*, 10 June 1871, 1, GBC; Mark Perry, *Grant and Twain: The Story of a Friendship that Changed America* (New York: Random House, 2004), 177–179; *MS 33* (1871): 43–44, 58; and George A. Smith, Salt Lake City, to Cousin Catharine, February 18, 1872, RTC.

⁴⁶ George Q. Cannon to Geo. A. Smith, Washington, DC, May 29, 1872, GAS; George A. Smith, Salt Lake City, to Cousin Catharine, February 18, 1872, RTC.

Mayor Wells . . . and other leading Mormons, on charges the most absurd and untrue,” and that he was willing to reconstruct the whole Utah legal system.⁴⁷

By the fall of 1871, the courts of Utah no longer belonged to Brigham Young. Since no statute against polygamy existed in Utah territorial law, McKean construed a law the Mormons had legislated against adultery to fit Young and the sixteen polygamous wives he was currently living with. This law used the language “If any man or woman, not being married to each other, lewdly and lasciviously associate and cohabit together . . . such person[s] so offending shall be punished by imprisonment not exceeding ten years, and not less than six months, and fine not more than one thousand dollars, and not less than one hundred dollars, or both, at the discretion of the court.” Because of McKean’s use of this law against adultery, for years to come “cohabitation” and not “polygamy” was the operative word in federal prosecution of Mormonism’s marital practices.⁴⁸ Meanwhile McKean, US marshals hand-picked by Governor Shaffer, and private detectives hired by the government, scoured Utah for evidence to conclusively tie Young to the Mountain Meadows Massacre and a host of supposed Mormon murders of gentiles and Latter-day Saint apostates the church president had been held responsible for in the national press. After more than year’s worth of investigative work, on April 15, 1871, private detective and US Deputy Marshal Samuel H. Gilson met self-proclaimed “Danite murderer” Bill Hickman. After his disfellowshipment, Hickman became a pariah in the Mormon community, feared for his life, and nursed a great grudge against his former leader and employer. Young had on occasion hired Hickman as a cowboy to watch over church herds, and as a spy to watch over General Connor and other gentiles. Gilson, McKean, and head US

⁴⁷ Tullidge, *History of Salt Lake City*, 513.

⁴⁸ Tullidge, *History of Salt Lake City*, 528–533.

Marshal M. T. Patrick worked out the details of immunity for various murders Hickman was known to have committed, if he would turn state's evidence on Brigham Young and help them indict the Prophet. Since "the one aim of his life . . . was to get even . . . with Brigham Young," Hickman happily obliged. The evidence Hickman had given "had gone to Washington, and had come out in pamphlet form."⁴⁹ By the last week in September 1871, correspondents for eastern newspapers in Salt Lake City were reporting that Hickman admitted killing Richard Yates during the Utah War in March 1858 and that Brigham Young, Daniel H. Wells, Hosea Stout, and Brigham's son Joseph A. Young were all accessories to the crime.⁵⁰ Brigham Young was informed in advance of his pending arrest on October 2, 1871 for "unlawful cohabitation." Governor George L. Woods explained in a letter to President Grant that the indictment charging Young with "murder in the first degree" for allegedly directing Hickman to kill Yates would be held back "for a short time" because of the explosive nature of the Salt Lake City populace.⁵¹ Additional companies of US troops were brought to Salt Lake City by rail, increasing the number of soldiers at Camp Douglas to 5,000, the highest number that had ever been stationed there.⁵²

⁴⁹ See Hickman and Beadle, *Brigham's Destroying Angel*, especially, 183, 190–191; and *Shippensburg Chronicle* (Shippensburg, PA), January 4, 1884, 1, NPC.

⁵⁰ Eastern presses belted out promises like: "The United States judiciary have got 'the dead wood' upon the prophet, and there is nothing can save him from the penitentiary or the gallows." The *New York Sun* published a letter written 27 September 1871 reporting that "the brother of the United States Marshal leaves to-day with documents to be submitted to the Attorney General [in Washington], asking for [advice] in regard to the charges that are made against Brigham Young, referring back to 1856 and 1857, at which time there is no doubt of murders having been committed by the Danites, with the connivance of the Mormon leader." The *New York Sun's* readers were told "there are lively times ahead for the prophet." *New York Sun* correspondent, letter written September 27, 1870, in *Milwaukee Sentinel*, October 11, 1871, NCN.

⁵¹ Woods wrote "The investigations which have been made, have disclosed deeds of horror which are unsurpassed in the history of crime. The outer World Knows nothing of the murderous infamy of Mormonism. The trials soon to be had will bring forth deeds of Savage barbarity which will disgust the Nation [especially those] pertaining to the Mountain Meadows Massacre." George L. Woods, Governor of Utah, Executive Office, Salt Lake City, to His Excellency U. S. Grant, President, 2 October 1871, Office of the Adjutant General (Main Series) 1871–1880, NA Microcopy 666, r32, frames 82–89, NA.

⁵² George L. Woods to U. S. Grant, October 2, 1871; and *Lowell Daily Citizen and News* (Lowell, MA), October 4, 1871, NCN.

In the midst of this crisis, on the very eve of the date given out for Young's arrest, a meeting of Brigham's chief counselors was held in the Lion House in Salt Lake City. In attendance were the First Presidency, several of the twelve apostles, Young's closest brother, Joseph Young (who was also "President of the Seventies"), and a group of high powered church-retained attorneys, several of whom were gentiles. The group was assembled to discuss whether Brigham Young would call out the Nauvoo Legion and fight, flee to the protection of Winsor Castle and the Kanab country, or submit to Grant and McKean and their "illegal" prosecutions. George Alfred Townsend, a newspaper correspondent for the *Cincinnati Commercial* wrote a contemporary account of the meeting as he received it from two of Young's gentile attorneys. They reported that most of Young's advisors were old polygamous patriarchs "baked dry in the furnace of old Mormon dangers." There was John Taylor, "who stood by Joe Smith when he was shot in Carthage jail and was himself wounded, and would rather take his chances in the open air than go to a Gentile jail again." There was George A. Smith who had witnessed "the sack of Nauvoo," and Orson Pratt, "whose brother, Parley Pratt, was shot dead by the Gentiles."

Townsend wrote that

Almost unanimously they urged that [Young] must never give himself up: the people would rise if he were to be convicted, whether he, forbade them or no. Their counsel was to cut the irrigating ditches, burn every Mormon settlement in the Territory, leave the valley of Salt Lake in desolation, and march across Arizona with their herds and portables to Mexican soil; these were their own, and they had a right to annihilate the property they had created.

At the time, Brigham Young was seventy years, and, as Townsend described him, in the weakened “condition of an old lion.” After hearing their counsel, Young told his brethren that he had been promised “safe conduct and fair treatment” by the courts. John Taylor reminded the group of the fate of Joseph Smith after such promises. According to Townsend, “Brigham closed his great square mouth and jaw, and said calmly: ‘God is in courts as well as in battles and marches. There will be no resistance. I shall obey the summons.’”⁵³

***“Federal Authority vs. Polygamic Theocracy:
A System is on Trial in the Person of Brigham Young”***

Per the court’s prearrangement, on Monday October 2, 1871, Young was arrested on “a charge of lewd and lascivious cohabitation with sixteen different women.”⁵⁴ He appeared in McKean’s courtroom and was put under \$5,000 bail. Daniel H. Wells and Apostle George Q. Cannon were also arrested, charged, and released on bail. The charges of murder against them all were not initially tendered.⁵⁵ McKean made it clear to his packed jury that the “case of the people vs. Brigham Young” ought actually be called “Federal Authority vs. Polygamic Theocracy.” McKean was using the adultery case to topple the whole Mormon theocratic system, or as he put it, “A system is on trial in the person of BRIGHAM YOUNG.” Even more to his point, he lectured his jury, “The Government of the United States, founded upon a written Constitution, finds within its jurisdiction another Government—claiming to come from God—

⁵³ George Alfred Townsend, *The Mormon Trials at Salt Lake City* (New York: American News Company, 1871), 24–25.

⁵⁴ George L. Woods to U.S. Grant, October 2, 1871, 1–2, in PAM 15792, USHS.

⁵⁵ Townsend, *The Mormon Trials*; *The Times* (London), October 27, 1871, 8; and *Salt Lake Tribune*, December 29, 1871, 2, UDN.

imperium in imperio—whose policy and practice, in grave particulars, are at variance with its own. The one Government arrests the other in the person of its chief, and arraigns it at the bar.”⁵⁶

Captain William H. Hooper, “Brigham Young’s Delegate to congress,” went to Washington to foment opposition against McKean among his congressional colleagues, and to effect some kind of a compromise with the Grant administration.⁵⁷ Grant’s religious conviction prevented any sort of compromise but some of Hooper’s Washington allies, including Senators Lyman Trumbull and Oliver P. Morton, attacked Grant and McKean’s whole operation as being not only illegal and unconstitutional, but purposefully designed to provoke the Mormons to violence. They raised the cry that Grant and the Utah Ring hoped to incite a war with Utah in order to drive the Mormons out of the territory so as to enrich themselves by filching their property, as others had done when the Saints were driven out of Missouri and Illinois.⁵⁸ Senator Trumbull, the *New York Herald* wrote, came out “strongly” against “the action which has already been taken against the polygamists, and other men of almost equal reputation will not be backward in arraigning the administration if it should turn out that the United States troops had been used as the instruments of persecution in the interests of speculators.” The *Herald* prognosticated that “It is likely that there will be a considerable [negative] reaction among republican politicians, especially Congressmen” if the prosecution of Young continued, and that “it is understood that [even] the Cabinet is not a unit in sustaining the course of Judge

⁵⁶ The *New York Times*, October 20, 1871, FHL.

⁵⁷ The *New York Herald* reported “Delegate Hooper, of Utah, is talking a great deal and to everybody.” JH, November 4, 1871, 2. See also *The Times* (London), November 13, 1871, FHL.

⁵⁸ See for example *Deseret News*, June 15, 1870, UDN; JH, September 23, 1871, 7, and December 12, 1871, 2.

McKean.”⁵⁹ The political tide was slowly beginning to turn against Grant’s Utah policy.⁶⁰ Young needed time for this negative groundswell to develop and continue its effect on national opinion.

After allowing himself to be arrested on McKean’s adultery charge, new developments caused Brigham Young to have a change of heart. Rank-and-file Mormon polygamist Thomas Hawkins was tried and convicted on the same territorial law regarding “lewd and lascivious cohabitation” that Young was charged with having broken. The church president’s attorneys apparently got advance notice that McKean would sentence Hawkins to a fine of \$500 and a prison term of three years’ hard labor.⁶¹ The excitement caused by Young’s arrest led the populace to begin arming themselves and to make “many violent threats” against the federal officials, including “threats to assassinate.” In response, Woods requisitioned “more Troops and in response to my call three [more] Companies have been sent and are now at Camp Douglas. There are now eight Companies at the Post, which will be barely enough should emergency arise[.] But the moral effect of their presence will be great, and not only deter the Mormons from the commission of excesses, but will strengthen the hand of civil authorities, by encouraging witnesses—apostate Mormons—to tell what they know.”⁶²

On October 24, Brigham Young skipped bail, fled Salt Lake City, and absconded to southern Utah with an entourage of eleven wagons guarded by 100 heavily armed members of

⁵⁹ JH, November 3, 1871, 4.

⁶⁰ JH, November 4, 1871, 2.

⁶¹ *Daily Alta California*, 23 October 1871, 2, CDNC. The *Daily Alta California* stated that “the conviction of Hawkins implies that also of Brigham Young, of Wells . . . and, in short, of all Mormons who have been a little too much married.” The California paper hit on a major problem, though: “Where jails are to be found for the incarceration of the whole of them, is a question which we do not pretend to be able to answer. Probably only the leaders will be punished, and the masses will be let off on a solemn promise to reduce their families to the ordinary standard.”

⁶² George L. Woods to U. S. Grant, October 2, 1871.

the outlawed Nauvoo Legion.⁶³ In a message he dictated to his First Counsellor in the First Presidency forty-eight hours after this Young explained “We have been meditating upon the affairs of our present conditions that the brethren who are hunted and persecuted by the Ring might as well come South and help us in improving the Southern Country until this blow is over[.] [T]his would perhaps be the easiest and cheapest way to get rid of the mob and have the advantage of another Territory.” As he was aware that “this blow” might *not* be over anytime soon, he suggested to Wells the idea of putting younger men into all the high profile leadership positions in the north— men “whose names can not well be presented to the Grand Jury or Inquisition to be condemned [*sic*] to death... While we who are use[d] to hardships can if it is necessary continue a line of settlements into Mexico.” Young was clearly aware he might be leaving Salt Lake City for good to follow his old “corridor to Mexico” plan but with little intention of relinquishing the slightest degree of control over his kingdom. The Deseret Telegraph Line was then being rapidly pushed to Pipe Springs and Kanab, which would allow Young to control even the most minute details of the Office of the First Presidency.⁶⁴

Another factor contributing to Young’s decision was the War Department’s decision to transfer Regis De Trobriand away from the post as commandant of Camp Douglas (because he was too friendly with the Mormons) and replace him with General Henry A. Morrow. Considering the anti-Mormon animus of the soldiers there, they felt certain Young’s incarceration would produce a repeat of the events of Carthage jail. A Utah correspondent to the *New York Tribune* explained that Young’s “hasty action” resulted from news that “arrests of the

⁶³ See *Corinne Daily Reporter*, November 2, 1871, 2, UDN; *New North-West* (Deer Lodge City, MT), November 11, 1871, 2, CALOC; and *Daily Gate City* (Keokuk, IA), November 2, 1871, as quoted in JH, November 2, 1871, 4.

⁶⁴ Brigham Young and George A. Smith to Daniel H. Wells and “others such as you call to your aid as counsellors,” October 26, 1871, BYP. Young told Wells: “We shall want an operator in my Telegraph Office [in the Lion House at Church Headquarters] so that we can hold our conversation each and every night.”

Mormon leaders, under the indictments for murder found by the Grand Jury during the latter part of September, were about to be made But the removal of Gen. De Trobriand from the position of Commander of Camp Douglas—the only place of security for prisoners [added to the] undisguised and offensive attitude of the court and its principal [officers], induced a precipitate change of base.” The “unmistakable animus of the court” assured that he would be convicted, putting his life in immanent danger.⁶⁵ Considering the feeling in northern Utah for McKean and his court, Young had good reason to think his leaving, and thus, his non-conviction, could prevent an uprising among the people. With powerful forces in Washington likening McKean’s court to “the Spanish Inquisition”⁶⁶ and clamoring for a more humane Utah policy,⁶⁷ the religious leader’s flight to the safety of the southern mountains could indeed make McKean, and in fact, the entire Grant administration “appear as persecutors instead of prosecutors.”⁶⁸

Perhaps with this last issue in mind, President Wells—who was also the mayor of Salt Lake City—stayed behind. As expected, he was quickly seized and charged with murder, but Daniel Wells was not Brigham Young, and the troops remained quiet.⁶⁹ Within a short time, Wells was released on \$50,000 bail—the figure having grown by a factor of ten since Young ran out on his bail. Apostle Orson Hyde, on the other hand, indicted under a similar charge, led US Marshals on a six-mile chase before losing them and escaping to southern Utah. Meanwhile,

⁶⁵ Quoted in *Salt Lake Tribune*, November 20, 1871, 2, UDN.

⁶⁶ The *Washington Capital* carried an editorial from the *Jewish Times* objecting to McKean’s actions. It read: “The *Jewish Times* is not satisfied with the action of judge McKean in Utah. ‘There can be but one opinion about his conduct,’ it thinks. ‘He would have finely filled a Spanish tribunal in the days of Torquemada. No wretched heretic brought before him could have escaped the fagot. Law or no law, he would have found a way to roast him.’ JH, December 12, 1871, 1.

⁶⁷ See *New York Herald* quote and *Deseret News* commentary in *Journal History*, November 4, 1871, 2–4.

⁶⁸ *Journal History*, November 4, 1871, 2.

⁶⁹ See Hickman and Beadle, *Brigham’s Destroying Angel*. To the chagrin of McKean and the Ring, General Morrow wine and dined “the lieutenant-general of the Lord’s army” and let him receive retinues of visitors and otherwise waited on him hand and foot. Nearby, Bill Hickman bunked with soldier “mates” at the Camp and dictated his memoirs detailing Young’s involvement in various Mormon murders.

George Q. Cannon fled to California. Wells telegraphed John D. Lee, then hiding out in and around Kanab with Isaac C. Haight, John Mangum and other Mountain Meadow Massacre participants, that writs had been issued for them as well. Lee knew what this meant. “I obtained some cartridges & 2 Boxes [of] McClain’s Pills,” he wrote in his diary. He also recorded that reports among the Saints were that President Young was “Closely Persued [*sic*] by officers & soldiers, [and that he was] only 6 hours ahead” of his pursuers, and that “Lawyer Fitch had Notified Pres. B. Y. to Make his escape or he would be arrested before Midnight.”⁷⁰

Brigham’s last flight was a master stroke of political gaming and actually did much to change public opinion in his favor. A month after he left, his enemies at the *Salt Lake Tribune* declared that “with the flight of the Prophet passed away for ever all prospects of another Mormon war or another [mass] exodus [from Utah].” Committed to furthering Utah’s mining and commercial interests, and not its desolation, the *Tribune* had its own reasons to hope it was right—but it stated the truth when it observed that “it cannot be . . . denied that a substantial portion of the American press have [suddenly] come ‘to the rescue’ of the Mormons.”⁷¹ Immediately after Young absconded, the *Tribune* reported that George Q. Cannon went “to create a panic and a sympathy in California, over the affairs of the Mormons, and it produced so far the desired results.” Cannon strengthened alliances with West Coast capitalists and politicians and Utah business and mining interests. Meanwhile, the *Tribune* reported that “this apostolic

⁷⁰ John D. Lee, *Diaries*, 2:174. There is little evidence in US military records that troops made any effort to pursue Young. *Corinne Daily Reporter*, November 2, 1871, 2, UDN; *Evening Star* (Washington, DC), 10 November 1871, 1, GBC; *Jackson Citizen Patriot* (Jackson, MI), November 8, 1871, 1, GBC; and *New North-West* (Deer Lodge City, MT), 11 November 1871, 2, CALOC. Newspapers reported that “an expedition” of one hundred deputy marshals backed by several companies of soldiers was “forming to go after him.” The administration and the War Department feared that such action would feed the image of Mormon persecution and “a modern Inquisition.” President Grant sent General Christopher C. Augur to Salt Lake on a quick fact-finding mission and had him report to him personally in Washington.

⁷¹ *Salt Lake Tribune*, November 28, 1871, 2, UDN.

incendiary,” i.e., Cannon, “was proclaiming to the good folks of the Golden State that if the federal officers of Utah persisted in prosecuting the Mormon leaders for adultery and arresting some of them for murder, as designed, the Mormon people would burn and devastate everything in the Territory,” including commercial, mining, and transportation developments West Coast financiers were heavily invested in. Located as it was in the “Heart of the Continent,” Utah’s torching could potentially cripple the entire US economy, and would certainly devastate the economic fortunes of the entire American West. Showing the seriousness with which California was watching the situation, the *Salt Lake Tribune* noted with chagrin that “the Firemen’s Fund and Insurance Company of San Francisco” actually sent its agent to cancel its substantial fire insurance policies held in Utah.⁷²

Utah merchants, miners, and other capitalists, representing investors from all over the world, pressured the Grant administration to avoid a collision in Utah. Meanwhile, Young’s non-Mormon attorney, Thomas Fitch, was sent by his employer on a lecture tour “to the East.” As a Mormon missionary to Washington, the silver tongued Fitch delivered “incendiary” messages from the floor of Congress, vividly describing the negative impact Grant’s anti-Mormon crusade might have on the wealth of the nation, both in terms of the high costs of prosecuting a civil war in distant Utah, and in the devastation a Mormon “torching” of the territory would bring to the nation’s mining, railroad, and telegraphic interests. Mormon-friendly gentile newspaperman George A. Townsend filled the papers with similar messages and aspersions to the “Inquisition Court” of Judge McKean.⁷³

⁷² *Salt Lake Tribune*, November 10, 1871, 2, UDN.

⁷³ *Salt Lake Tribune*, November 10, 1871, 2, UDN; John D. Lee, *Diaries*, 2:174; and Townsend, *The Mormon Trials*.

Young's Escape to "The Kanab Country" and Changing Public Opinion

While the words "Pipe Spring," "Pipe Springs," or "Winsor Castle" have not been found quite this early in the letters exchanged between Grant and his governors and judges in Utah, or in the correspondence of his military officers, Kanab and the Kanab Country appear frequently. Kanab is only seventeen miles from Pipe Spring as the crow flies. Many national newspapers were becoming relatively clear on the general area Young had fled to, frequently mentioning St. George, Kanab, and Arizona as his location. Gentile papers in Utah and Nevada, in a better position to hear "leaks" from the Saints themselves, though, were aware that "Brigham Young has left Utah and gone to the 'Springs.'" ⁷⁴ Utah's federal officials had a reasonably good understanding of the protective bastions Young had prepared in the south, both the stronghold southern Utah provided generally, and the specific stronghold the Kanab Country constituted, complete with its fortifications at Kanab and Pipe Springs. As Governor Woods reported Young's arrest to President Grant on October 2, he described that "Mormons are all powerful in [the southern] portion of the Territory, there being but few 'Gentile' Miners down there, and the whole power of the Church is used to secret persons charged with crime. Kanab[,] a remote settlement in the extreme South, exclusively Mormon is a place of refuge; they are prepared for resistance [*sic*] there, and declare that no arrests shall be made." He affirmed that "most of the murderers of Mountain Meadow will take refuge and it will be useless for the Marshall, unattended with an efficient Military force, to attempt to take any of them into custody." ⁷⁵ To breach the Kanab country, Governor Woods called for the erection of a military post in St.

⁷⁴ For example, see the *Salt Lake Tribune* quoting the *Elko Independent*, in *Salt Lake Tribune*, November 13, 1871, 3.

⁷⁵ George L. Woods to U. S. Grant, October 2, 1871, 2.

George or Beaver. “I know troops are scarce,” he acknowledged to the president, “but there is perhaps no place in the Republic where they are more needed than [in southern Utah].” He called for “at least one hundred mounted men to go to Beaver in the latter part of December to assist the civil authorities in the execution of [McKean’s] laws.”⁷⁶ Despite Young’s abrupt departure, Latter-day Saint newspapers worked to portray his flight as previously planned; they reported that he was simply going to attend the St. George Stake Conference, November 3–5, and then to stay there as part of his annual two or three month winter visit to the region to enjoy the warmth of Dixie, for his health.⁷⁷

As the fleeing prophet traveled south he wrote to Wells: “[I] expect not to be disturbed by Dept Marshals or anybody else[.] They all well understand that my going south is to preserve their scalps and their heads for it has been about almost impossible to restrain the people from taking vengeance on them and they may attribute it to my good feelings and Kindness that they still live.”⁷⁸ Just before he left Salt Lake City, Young and his coreligionists had made a sizable donation to the City of Chicago which had just experienced its infamous Great Fire. While some Saints were convinced the fire was an outpouring of God’s justice for the nation’s present mistreatment of his people, as well as to make Illinois atone for the spilled blood of Joseph Smith, the gesture to a state that had driven them out evoked deep sympathy for a people allegedly ready to torch their own city because of religious persecution. Anti-Mormon lecturer Grace Greenwood attended a meeting at the Salt Lake Tabernacle held to help raise \$20,000 for

⁷⁶ George L. Woods to U. S. Grant, October 2, 1871, 2.

⁷⁷ Hickman and Beadle, *Brigham’s Destroying Angel*, vi. Charles L. Walker of St. George observed that the Saints at the conference “seemed to rejoice that Br Brigham and Geo A had escaped from their enemies and come to where they might dwell in peace among their friends.” Charles Walker, *Diary*, 1:335.

⁷⁸ Brigham Young, Fillmore, to D. H. Wells, A. Carrington, and D. McKenzie, October 28, 1871, BYP. The exodus of a feeble, older, Brigham Young seeking warmer climate may have also been designed to garner national sympathy. See Charles Walker, *Diary*, 1:334

“the Chicago sufferers” and was deeply touched. Greenwood wrote to the *New York Herald*, reflecting “it was a strange thing to see these men standing at bay, with ‘the people of the United States’ against them, giving generously to their enemies.”⁷⁹

The nation argued about the purposes of Brigham’s flight, as did rank and file Latter-day Saints; many among both groups maintained he had left Salt Lake for good. McKean and his prosecuting attorneys formally announced that Young had forfeited his bail bond and was now a fugitive from justice.⁸⁰ But in the public relations war that raged in Young’s absence, the prophet’s attorneys succeeded in convincing many that their client “had not escaped or sought to escape from the jurisdiction of the Court; that he had not passed beyond the boundaries of the Territory; that he had not intended and would not forfeit his bonds, but would appear personally in Court whenever required.” Meanwhile, “the Court took the matter under advisement, it being understood or represented that Brigham’s absence from Salt Lake City is by advice of counsel, he being in ill health, requiring a warmer climate.” Young, however, had indeed “passed beyond the boundaries of the Territory,” for he made several visits to Pipe Springs and reconnoitered and improved portions of his northern Arizona escape route toward Lee’s Ferry.⁸¹

On November 1, Young’s retinue arrived in St. George. Young announced the construction of a new temple in St. George, solidifying that he had no intention of having the Saints evacuate the southern part of the territory. The mammoth project was unanimously sustained at the St. George conference in the traditional Mormon style “by the raising of right

⁷⁹ *The Times* (London), October 27, 1871, 8, FHL; and Tullidge, *History of Salt Lake*, 536–538.

⁸⁰ To the officials of the court, Young’s potential forfeit would be a godsend, as only the three territorial judges were paid by the federal government (and not much at that). All other costs were to be provided by the territorial legislature, but this body was under the total control of the church and obviously would not pay for any prosecution against fellow Mormons. Meanwhile, the Senate Judiciary Committee was not pleased with McKean’s actions, and apparently worked to block federal funding for his juries, witnesses, and prosecuting attorneys.

⁸¹ “The Trial of the Saints Postponed. . . ,” in *San Francisco Chronicle*, November 221, 1871, NPC.

hands” and in the next two days, President Young oversaw the surveying of the site on what was then the southern edge of town.⁸² In his preaching the next Sunday, Young spoke of “the abusive treatment the Federal officials had showed to the Saints and some of the leading men of the church.” Young prophesied “that Pres U S Grant [would] go down for his actions to[w]ard this people.” Upon hearing what amounted to a prophetic curse upon the National President, the congregation enthusiastically shouted “Amen.”⁸³

Upon conclusion of the groundbreaking ceremonies for the Temple, Young turned his full attention to keeping a low profile, building a ferry crossing at the Paria, and searching for safe settlement areas. Young used his time in the south to prepare for his potential exodus from St. George to his bastion at Pipe Spring, and perhaps even across Lee’s Ferry toward Mexico, and also for the exodus of other polygamists over the same route. Local church leaders were urged to speak to the Saints “on the policy of knowing nothing about Br Brigham or his Brethern when strangers are lurking about trying to elicit information concerning them,” and similarly “on the importance of being faithful and wide awake on our part as elders and p[o]lice and to keep an eye out for strangers traveling thro our countr[y] and to be true as steel to . . . the Lord[’]s annointed.”⁸⁴ Jacob Hamblin enlisted John D. Lee, then hiding in the Kanab area, to be his partner in building the ferry. The latter made a home at the crossing, giving his name to “Lees Ferry.” Though the commencement of the St. George Temple signaled that the majority of the Latter-day Saints would be staying in Utah, Young’s personal destination was in flux. Lee

⁸² Charles Walker, *Diary*, 1:334–335. On Nov. 9th, George A. Smith, “patron saint” of all Dixie, knelt on the ground surrounded by “a large concourse of People congregated on the South East corner of the site” and offered a “full and powerful” dedicatory prayer.

⁸³ Charles Walker, *Diary*, 1:336.

⁸⁴ Charles Walker, *Diary*, 1:337.

simply stated in his *Confessions* that “Brigham Young was anxious to have the ferry kept in good condition for passing the river, for he did not know what hour he might need it.”⁸⁵

Similarly, Young put pressure on A. Milton Musser, superintendent of the Deseret Telegraph Company, to have the line extended from St. George to Pipe Spring and Kanab as quickly as possible. Erastus Snow noted the “great urgency” subsequently exerted by Musser to extend Dixie’s telegraph lines by 175 miles; it was to be an east-west extension running into Utah from Pioche, Nevada, through Hebron, to St. George and on to Pipe Springs and Kanab. The line had been planned as part of Young’s New Canaan policy, but this “great urgency” to complete it coincided exactly with Brigham Young’s arrest on October 2, 1871.⁸⁶ Bringing the line through to Pipe Springs was inspired by the persecutions of the McKean court to connect every Mormon settlement in order to alert polygamists anywhere and everywhere to flee when federal officials came against them. The telegraph line served this purpose for the next twenty years.⁸⁷ In November and December of 1871, Governor Woods, Utah’s federal marshals and military officers, and in fact, the whole leadership of the War Department and the president’s cabinet itself continued to discuss whether or not to send marshals and troops into the Kanab Country after the absconded prophet. As they held these discussions, southern church members worked feverishly to dig the holes, erect the poles, stretch the wire, and complete the line to Pipe Springs and Kanab. On December 15, 1871 Deseret Telegraph Company superintendent A. Milton Musser connected the equipment, and sixteen-year-old Luella Stewart, the daughter of

⁸⁵ Reilly, *Lee’s Ferry*, 23–24; and John D. Lee and William W. Bishop, *Mormonism Unveiled; or the Life and Confessions of the Late Mormon Bishop, John D. Lee; (Written by Himself) Embracing a History of Mormonism . . . Also the True History of the Horrible Butchery Known as the Mountain Meadows Massacre* (St. Louis: Bryan, Brand & Company, 1877), 266.

⁸⁶ Erastus Snow, St. George, to Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, October 4, 1871, BYP; and A. Milton Musser, Salt Lake City, to Prest. B. Young, December 8, 1870, BYP.

⁸⁷ At roughly the same time the line was going to Pioche, Kanab and Pipe Spring, it was going to similar places on the Saints’ northern frontier, such as Paris, Idaho. See JH, 1871 11 7, 2.

Bishop Stewart of Kanab, sent the first telegraphic message from Brigham's bastion at Pipe Springs. The fort was still unfinished, but Musser reported that "Winsor Castle [was] progressing rapidly towards completion."⁸⁸

Before December 1871, most of the road from St. George to Pipe Springs lay on the north side of the Utah-Arizona border, where those escaping from McKean's territorial courts were liable to be picked up by Utah authorities. Still expecting he might need it at any moment, on December 6 Young commenced another exploration trip to relocate the road so that it passed directly out of Utah some four miles south of St. George, and then stayed safely south of the line all the way to Pipe. This required surveying a new passageway up the Arizona portion of the nearly insurmountable Hurricane Fault. Demonstrating his determination, the church president called on Joseph W. Young to bring surveying instruments and a team of experienced road builders. Once this road was laid out, Brigham rejoiced that "a better road can be made than the one now travelled, shortening by 10 miles the distance to the crossing on the Colorado River, Kanab City and intermediate points." On December 11 he wrote his secretary in Salt Lake City from St. George that his health was improving and that he was "engaged visiting and comforting the Saints, exploring and developing the resources of this land, and seeking out and locating secure resting places for the Saints among the rugged recesses of these majestic mountains."⁸⁹

During his stay in the south in November and December, 1871, Brigham Young kept in constant contact with his attorneys. In Washington, attorney Thomas Fitch found Senator Lyman Trumbull, the chair of the Senate Judiciary Committee, already posed to pounce on Grant for his instigation of McKean's illegal and unconstitutional measures. To Trumbull and many other

⁸⁸ A. Milton Musser, Salt Lake City, to Prest. B. Young, December 8, 1870, BYP; and *Salt Lake Herald*, December 17, 1871, 2, UDN. Luella's full name was Eliza Luella Stewart. She later married David K. Udall.

⁸⁹ Brigham Young, St. George, to Elder George Reynolds, December 11, 1871, BYP.

Washington power brokers, Grant's persecution of the Mormons was an abuse of constitutional law. Washington had been shaken to its foundation in 1868 by the impeachment of Andrew Johnson. Now, in 1871, there was actually talk of "Senator Trumbull . . . and other men of almost equal reputation . . . arraigning the administration if it should turn out that the United States troops had been used as the instruments of persecution [in Utah] in the interests of speculators."⁹⁰ While few gentiles condoned polygamy, as the *Sacramento Daily Union* pointed out, Chief Justice McKean had "erred in his interpretation and application of the law." The paper's greatest fear was that the "unreasonable" and "unlawful" persecution of the leaders of the hierarchy, who have a strong spiritual hold upon the ignorant, bigoted mass which composes the Mormon population, "would actually prolong the natural death of Polygamy."⁹¹ Powerful senators, congressmembers and newspaper reporters now assured the Saints "that none in Utah [would] dare to hurt them if the voice of the nation declares it must not be."⁹² The Senate Judiciary Committee promised Young's attorneys that they would bring McKean's illegal proceedings before the United States Supreme Court, where the whole affair would certainly be quashed, but only if Young would return to Salt Lake City and fight his battles in the American way, that is, in court. Working closely with Senator Trumbull and the Senate Judiciary Committee, Young's attorneys informed Young that McKean would take up his case again on January 9, 1872, and they advised their client that he must be present in McKean's Salt Lake City courtroom when he did. Trumbull and others warned that if Young did not appear in court, marshals and troops would certainly be sent to fetch him, and considering the excitable nature of

⁹⁰ See JH, November 3, 1871, 4; and November 4, 1871, 4.

⁹¹ *Sacramento Daily Union*, November 1, 1871, 2, CDNC.

⁹² *Salt Lake Tribune*, November 28, 1871, 2, UDN.

the populace, troops ransacking Dixie while looking for Young would likely provoke the war the speculators hoped to foment.⁹³

On Sunday December 16, 1871, Young headed north to face Chief Justice James B. McKean in court. On January 9, 1872, McKean was forced to show clemency and instead of the rowdy soldiers of Camp Douglas providing Young with “a comfortable cot and a tin plate” (and perhaps even a hangman’s noose) in their military jail,⁹⁴ McKean was pressed by eastern powers to allow Young to be held under house arrest in his own home and office for nearly four months while his murder trial continued. Young was released on April 25, 1872, after the United States Supreme Court, in what is called the Englebrecht Decision, declared Justice McKean’s legal system unconstitutional. According to the *Salt Lake Tribune*, when Grant learned the direction the Supreme Court was to take, in a conversation with a group of “Jack Mormons” from Utah, Grant “bit off the end of his cigar” and declared that there no longer need be any “apprehension of a collision in Utah.” The old war hero declared that it was his obligation that “to preserve the peace” in Utah too, and that he “should take care that it was preserved!”⁹⁵

Pipe Springs: The Last Bastion

This was the last of Young’s attempts to build forts against American forces or prepare to raise arms against US troops. Designed and built during his last planned military conflict with the United States of America, Winsor Castle at Pipe Spring was Brigham Young’s last bastion.

⁹³ Luna Thatcher, Salt Lake City, to Dear Darling George, December 11, 1871, Philip Blair Family Papers, UU. Luna Thatcher was one of Brigham Young’s daughters.

⁹⁴ *Salt Lake Tribune*, December 28, 1871, 2, UDN.

⁹⁵ *Salt Lake Tribune*, April 2, 1871, 2, UDP.

The Nauvoo Legion was gone forever. John Wesley Powell, soon to be joined by George M. Wheeler, Clarence King, Clarence Dutton, and their expeditions, would map every hideout and nook in Young's purview. An expanding American nation was perched ready to swallow the Great American West whole. Young obviously needed a new strategy. With only a fortune and an enchanted land to lose, both for himself and his people, the seventy-one-year-old prophet was ready to move his strategy inside courtrooms, inside newspaper offices, inside Congress, and most importantly, inside America. It was a historic moment, a small but significant step toward the Americanization of Mormonism. This is a great deal of what Pipe Spring National Monument memorializes.

In the fall and early winter of 1871, Grant and McKean's reconstruction policies appeared to be toppling "one man power" in Utah. Wary critics of the Grant administration throughout the nation, however, began to complain of the "dishonest," "unfair," and blatantly "illegal" tactics used by Grant's chief justice in Utah. A Salt Lake correspondent to *the New York Tribune* announced that "intelligent and honest anti-Mormons here and elsewhere express dissatisfaction at [McKean's] course." "Candid and thoughtful men," he said, "declare that the end—the destruction of polygamy—does not justify the means adopted." McKean had gone so far as to openly declare that since Mormon crimes were so extraordinarily "shameful in [their] character," that "measures equally offensive . . . and nearly as questionable in a moral and legal sense, are wholly justifiable for its overthrow." The *New York Tribune's* correspondent acknowledged that "Polygamy must be destroyed, *but not by trick, evasion or fraud.*"⁹⁶ Even Grant's attorney general, Amos T. Akerman, and George C. Bates, the gentile attorney Grant appointed to prosecute his "Mormon trials" in Utah, complained of McKean's blatant abuse of

⁹⁶ *New York Tribune*, December 16, 1871, 3, NPC.

the law. Bates later testified that McKean “disgraced and abused [the rule of law] in a manner to which the world can furnish no parallel.” By mid-December 1871, President Grant asked for the attorney general’s immediate resignation from his post as head of the newly founded Department of Justice. McKean had spent over a year hand-tailoring the whole court system in Utah to result in the church leaders’ conviction. Despite the “un-American” nature of the theocracy, McKean’s twisting of a territorial statute against adultery to try the entire theocratic system was a gross miscarriage of justice, whether the President of the United States put him up to it or not.⁹⁷

In November 1871, Young explored rugged side canyons and washes, looking for “secure resting places” for himself and his people. He examined the forts at Kanab and Pipe Springs, and both coming and going his entourage overnights at the castle with Brother Winsor. He found stone masons still at Pipe Spring, frantically finishing the castle’s walls. Some of the workers had been working on the project over a year, and the wife of one of the stone masons reported that on Young’s last night there, Danite Porter Rockwell, “along [as] a body guard to Brigham . . . while at Pipe . . . got rather drunk, and as they left Pipe Brigham and the driver of the team were sitting in the front seat looking solemnly ahead [while] Port was shouting and waving his hat.” Having traveled 255 miles on this leg of their journey “over very bad roads,” they returned to Erastus Snow’s St. George Mansion where they “nicely camped” while attending to temple building issues.⁹⁸

⁹⁷ Townsend, *The Mormon Trials*.

⁹⁸ Brigham Young, St. George, to Albert Carrington, November 8, 1871, BYP; John Henry Smith, St. George, to Joseph F. Smith, December 3, 1871, Joseph F. Smith Incoming Correspondence, 1855–1918, SC; Brigham Young, St. George, to Elder George Reynolds, December 11, 1871, BYP; and “Elijah Averett Journal,” 21, UU.

Chapter 6

Commencing the Construction of Winsor Castle

Detailed records regarding the building of Brigham's bastion at Pipe Springs have not been found, although records for several other important Mormon forts of the period have been.¹ Work on the fort began on September 12, 1870, the date Brigham Young selected its location and Utah territorial surveyor Jesse W. Fox laid out its lines, and it was completed some two years later. Winsor family histories claim the fort was finished in the early spring of 1872,² but correspondence in Brigham Young's papers show that a building crew was still busy near the end of August 1872. At that time the roof and cupola were still being added on the north building.³ The exact date of completion was probably not far into the fall of 1872. Immediately after Young appointed Anson Winsor tithing herd superintendent in April 1870, the latter sent his son Anson Perry Winsor, Jr., to occupy the Whitmore dugout, rock guard house, shed, and corrals built by the Nauvoo Legion and to plant a garden in anticipation of his father's family's arrival there later that fall. The younger Winsor's son, and namesake of both, Anson Perry Winsor III, wrote that his grandfather "took my father at the age of 16 over [to Pipe Springs] to plow the ground to get ready to plant grain and other crops so the family would have food" there when the Winsors moved from Rockville to commence building the fort in the fall.⁴ This was in

¹ See Larry Porter, "A Historical Analysis of Cove Fort, Utah," (master's thesis, BYU, 1966); and "Fort and Bastion at Gunnison, circa 1867 . . . Architectural drawing and specifications for an enclosed fortified city wall with bastion and living quarters at Gunnison, Utah," CHL.

² See for example LaVar J. Winsor, "Anson Perry & Emeline Zenetta Brower," 7, PSLA, VF, FH, Winsor.

³ J. W. Jackson, Winsor Castle, Kane Co., U. T., to Prest B. Young, August 25, 1872; and J. W. Jackson, Winsor Castle, Kane Co., to Horace Greeley Ex Editor of *Tribune* & Future President of U. S., August 25, 1872, both BYP.

⁴ Anson Perry Winsor, III, "A Short Sketch of the Life of A. P. Winsor, Jr.," 1, PSLA, VF, FH, Winsor; Anson Perry Winsor, III, "History of Anson Perry and Emeline Zenetta Brower Winsor," 2, PSLA, VF, FH, Winsor; Luther M.

accordance with Brigham Young's original instructions to Anson Erastus Snow on April 18, 1870 when he tersely inaugurated the New Canaan program that would culminate in the construction of his bastion by the following letter:

President E. Snow:— Proceed with the Kanab business; Cooperative herding &c. Have Brother Winsor go out as soon as convenient, and commence putting in grain and other planting suitable to the soil and climate.

Hope you have arranged matters satisfactorily with Sister Whitmore.

Expect Pres't D. H. Wells and Stringham will visit Kanab and Canaan after Conference.⁵

Anson Jr. was left with "a span of oxen and a saddle pony to do the work," but the pony ran off toward Kanab, so the boy "was left with just the oxen."⁶ His job was "to take care of things, clear some ground for a garden and some farm land and watch the Church cattle that were arriving all the time."⁷ Anson Jr. "was there six months alone" with only Native Americans for companionship, and he soon made friends with the children who sometimes "slept on his hearth at night where they could keep warm." Native neighbors taught the lone white boy both the Paiute and Navajo languages and he reportedly "could talk with either tribe for the rest of his life."⁸ Another informant recorded that there was also a young white teenager who spent the

Winsor, "Sketch of the Life of Anson Perry Winsor," 1–2, PSLA, VF, FH, Winsor; and Elizabeth Jensen, "Material on Pipe Springs furnished by Mr. L. M. Winsor[,] Dec. 16, 1960," 1, WSC, b3, f9.

⁵ James Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Mission," 2:42–43.

⁶ Anson Perry Winsor, III, "History of Anson Perry and Emeline Zenetta Brower Winsor," 2, PSLA, VF, FH, Winsor.

⁷ LaVar Winsor, "Anson Perry & Emeline Zenetta Brower," 6.

⁸ Anson Perry Winsor, III, "History of Anson Perry and Emeline Zenetta Brower Winsor," 2, PSLA, VF, FH, Winsor.

summer months of 1870 with Winsor. To the frustration of young Winsor, this youth spent his time “fiddling,” and offered him little help with the crops and young Kaibabits were somehow induced to help with the work.⁹ Meanwhile, while Anson Winsor Sr. scurried to close up his bishop’s office and affairs in Rockville, while gathering tithing cattle from Beaver to St. George, his second wife (Mary) died. Winsor’s first wife, Emeline Zenetta Brower, “took Mary’s three children and raised them as her own,” giving Emeline a total of eleven children to raise in addition to supporting her husband in his new calling. Still suffering from Mary’s death, the family “moved some of their supplies to Pipe Springs in the fall of 1870.”¹⁰

Hoping to ensure its rapid and successful completion, Brigham Young turned supervision of the project over to his energetic, devoted, competent, but over-worked nephew, Joseph W. Young. The younger Young, a son of Brigham’s brother Lorenzo, already served as mayor of St. George, president of the St. George Stake of Zion, and as Erastus Snow’s right hand man and official counsellor in the Southern Mission. He was also the polygamist husband of several wives and had a large family to support. Brigham’s nephew was also special caretaker of the distressed settlements on the Muddy Mission, who were just then under incredible financial pressure and about to be driven out of Nevada by that state’s anti-Mormon tax policy. Joseph supervised the mass exodus of hundreds of Muddy River settlers and directed their resettlement in Kane County’s Long Valley, just twenty miles northwest of Pipe Springs. Additionally, he personally supervised the massive building projects of the St. George stake, including the tabernacle, which was just being finished; by November 1871, his uncle appointed him the supervisor of the building of the St. George Temple. Brigham Young needed a man who he could count on to push

⁹ Elizabeth Jensen, “Material on Pipe Springs furnished by Mr. L. M. Winsor[,] Dec. 16, 1960,” 1.

¹⁰ LaVar Winsor, “Anson Perry & Emeline Zenetta Brower,” 5–6.

the project forward and he demanded much of his hard-working and reliable nephew. The overworked Joseph W. Young would be dead in less than three years.

Joseph W. Young penned the first reference that has been found relative to Brigham's plan to build his bastion at Pipe Springs. On April 25, 1870, he wrote his uncle Brigham:

Since your return home I have studied a little about putting [*sic*] up my saw mill out in the neighborhood of the Kanab, as those Herd houses and Forts will need considerable lumber, and if a Town is built at Kanab, and Long Valley is resettled, it will be a great help to those places to have some lumber, and I think a good investment for me.

I have seen John Berry and talked with him. He had a mill framed and ready to put up, five miles from the settlement,¹¹ in a good grove of timber with a good water power, and where it will be very easy logging. Berry's frame is piled up and covered[,] and can be very readily put together, and I think I can safely say that we can furnish a good deal of lumber this fall if it is wanted, and we are advised [by you] to go on with it.

If we do anything about it, we want to lay our plans so as to go out with a good party and drive a head for a month or two, and get out our lumber and come away

¹¹ The settlement referred to was Berryville in Long Valley, which had been evacuated in 1866. Less than a year after writing this letter, Joseph W. Young would redirect the resettlement of Long Valley. At that time he personally changed the name of "Berryville" to "Glendale." He also changed the name of the deserted Long Valley settlement of "Winsor" to "Mt. Carmel." Long Valley had originally been settled under the direction of Anson P. Winsor while he served as the presiding bishop of the settlements on the upper Virgin River. "Winsor," of course, was named after him.

before the Navajos begin their raids, unless Long Valley is resettled this fall. In that case we would be tolerably safe [to stay indefinitely because of the increased population.]

I have talked with Bro Snow on the subject, and he thinks that if you will give us the job of geting [sic] out lumber for the designed fort at Pipe Spring, and whatever buildings you may put up at Moccasin Springs, we will be safe in building the mill.

Considering his own impoverished financial situation, he noted “I do feel anxious to get something started that will help me to live.” Joseph gently begged his uncle, “I would very much like to have an interest (though ever so small) in the Pipe Springs Ranche.”¹²

The Canaan Cooperative Cattle Company, also sometimes referred to as “the Southern Utah Co-operative Stock Herd Company,” “the St. George Co-operative herd,” or simply “the Canaan Ranch,” was organized on April 9, 1870, by Erastus Snow who was elected its president.¹³ By January 1871, the Canaan Cooperative had as many as 1,500 head of cattle at Short Creek and perhaps even more grazing south of its headquarters at Canaan Springs, located on the Hurricane Plateau south of Rockville and west of Short Creek and Pipe Springs. The church apparently owned at least ten percent of its original \$100,000 capital stock, while individual church members owned the rest. Brigham Young himself helped write the company’s

¹² Joseph W. Young, St. George, to Brigham Young, April 25, 1870, BYP.

¹³ In his 25 April 1870 letter, Joseph W. Young wrote that “Our Co-operative herd will start out to Maxwell’s Ranche in a few days.” This was a reference to the Canaan Cooperative Cattle Company that had only recently been formed in St. George, and of the relocation of some of its herds to Short Creek in “the Kanab Country.”

constitution and by-laws. A long-lived and eminently successful enterprise, it justified Brigham's confidence in cooperative ranching by paying an unprecedented 38.5 percent dividend to its stockholders for its first fourteen months of operation.¹⁴

At least by September 17, Brigham Young called on Joseph W. Young "to take charge of building a fort at Pipe Springs." Back in Salt Lake, on September 29, 1870, Brigham Young dictated a letter "officially" appointing Joseph W. Young to superintend the construction of Winsor Castle, minutely spelling out how the project was to proceed. The fact that the building of the fort was put under the auspices of the ecclesiastical organization, rather than the Nauvoo Legion, is telling. Though the line between the two was often blurred, the building of forts with pronounced military purposes—like Ft. Gunnison, Ft. Sanford, and Ft. Pearce—was carried out under military direction. Winsor Castle's economic, ecclesiastical, and private purposes were as important as its strategic military importance. Perhaps Brigham felt it was quickest to build the fort with ecclesiastical "tithing power" rather than military orders. In any case, Young's letter of "appointment and instructions" to Joseph W. reads like a set of military orders rather than a "calling" to fulfill a church assignment. The letter provides rich insight into Young's purposes and plans for the building of Winsor Castle and the inner workings of the Latter-day Saint tithing system in 1870. Young's "Appointment and Instructions to Elder Joseph W. Young" is here cited in full:

¹⁴ The Canaan Cooperative Stock Company was organized in Toquerville on April 9, 1870 with Erastus Snow as president and Bishop Joshua T. Willis of Toquerville as vice president. It inspired the formal creation of the Winsor Castle Stock Growing Company at Pipe Springs in 1873, and by 1878 it had swallowed up the WCSGC, and for a time owned Winsor Castle and its Pipe Springs Ranch and many other stock growing operations. See Erastus Snow, St. George, to Prest B. Young, Cove Creek, telegram, April 10, 1870, BYP; and James Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Mission," 2:43. See also "Articles of Agreement of the Canaan Co-operative Stock Company," TKP; *MS*, 32 (26 July 1870): 478; George A. Smith, *Journal*, January 28, 1871; B. Young, Jr., St. George, to *Deseret News*, telegram, January 31, 1871, in *Deseret News*, February 8, 1871, 7, UDN; *Deseret News*, June 4, 1871, 9, UDN; and Phillip Foremaster, "The Arizona Strip," lecture presented to the Rio Virgin Chapter of the Utah State Historical Society, March 1, 1973, St. George, Utah, 14, DSUSC.

You are hereby appointed Superintendent to build “Winsor Castle” at Pipe Springs in Washington County, on the ground surveyed and laid out by Jesse W. Fox Surveyor, specifications as to size & style, &c. being given on accompanying plan and specifications.¹⁵

You are also hereby authorized to use labor tithing from all the settlements on the Rio Virgen, in Pine Valley, Ash Creek, Piute[,] Kanarra, Cedar City, Panacca, and all the settlements in Iron and Beaver Counties. As no labor tithing is at present required for sending teams to the Missouri [sic] River for the immigrating saints,¹⁶ it is believed and hoped that the brethren will lend their united influence and assistance in procuring the necessary means and labor for forwarding this enterprise, as it is designed to be a stronghold for the storing of provisions and forage for the use of men and animals and for the protection of the stock of the inhabitants against raids and depredations of the Navajoes and other Indians who are or may be hostile.

It will doubtless be the case that persons will want to compound their labor tithing by paying in grain, stock and other use, than going to labor at such a distance, and

¹⁵ Architectural drawings were not filed with Young’s retained copy of the appointment and have not been found.

¹⁶ From 1862 onwards, Brigham Young sent men, teams, and wagons from Utah to pick up immigrants at the Missouri River or at the westward most railroad terminus. These immigration “missionaries” were called “down and backers” because they went down “to the States and back” to bring converts to Zion. This work was done free of charge as “a mission,” a priesthood responsibility, or “labor tithing.” Leonard J. Arrington, *Brigham Young: American Moses* (Springfield, IL: University of Illinois Press, 1986), 283–284.

the Bishops of the respective wards are hereby instructed to assist in making these exchanges with the people and assist you so far as lies in their power in collecting the labor tithing and forwarding the same to your order as you shall require from time to time. In this way by making such exchanges it is thought that [constant] team work, laborers, mechanics and the necessary material may be procured and paid for to erect said premises, but if it becomes necessary for you to draw a little grain and other produce tithing the Bishops of the above settlements are hereby instructed to honor your orders. The Bishops of course will see that all credits and charges are properly entered, and you will also keep an accurate account of all you receive, from whom and how expen[ded] that the entire expense when it shall be completed may be regularly charged to the proper account or accounts. You will use all due diligence and economy and prudence in the entire execution of this trust, and make report thereof to this office from time to time as the work progresses.

It is expected that Brother A. P. Winsor will furnish beef cattle and milk Cows as may be needed to feed the men at work and hay for the teams, with such other produce as he may be able to spare.

Your Brethren.

Brigham Young

Geo A Smith

On October 16, 1870, Joseph W. Young wrote a letter to Horace S. Eldredge, president of the European Mission, that gives some insight into the plans for the architecture for its commercial and military functions and the builder's plans to leave St. George the next day, October 17, "with a small company to commence the work."

I am appointed to superintend the building of a fort, which the Church is building at Pipe Spring, the place where Dr. Whitmore was killed. It is to be a big affair, on the plan of Cove Creek Fort. It will be 152 feet long and 66 feet wide, the wall next [to] the bluff 30 feet high, with two story dwellings inside, and the wall on the lower side 20 feet high, with milk rooms, &c., inside. This work will keep me out most of the winter, but it is a very necessary work, and I am willing to do my part in it. This Pipe Spring and Kanab country is right between us and the Navajos, and it is the best country for stock-raising that I ever saw, if it can be made safe against the raids of these marauding Indians. I start out tomorrow with a small company to commence the work.¹⁸

¹⁷ Portions of this original letterpress copy have faded to such an extent that they cannot be seen by the human eye. Special thanks to Glenn N. Rowe and Christopher K. McAfee of the CHL who made sophisticated UV archival lighting equipment available and provided technical assistance so it could be transcribed. Rowe, McAfee, and Joseph Soderborg also spent several hours assisting me in making this transcription on March 30, 2012, which I gratefully here acknowledge. See Brigham Young, George A. Smith, and Daniel H Wells, to Joseph W. Young, September 29, 1870, BYLB, CHL, CR 1234/1 b8 f3, vol. 12:374–375.

¹⁸ Joseph W. Young, St. George, to President Horace S. Eldredge, October 16, 1870, *MS 32* (1870): 731–732.

Winsor Castle's plan would roughly follow that of Cove Creek Fort, which also had been built to protect a church tithing ranch. Before the building of Winsor Castle, Cove Fort was referred to "as the most substantially built fort in the territory" and Pipe Spring's fort was "to be a big affair, on the plan of Cove Creek Fort."¹⁹ Though Pipe Springs was actually in Arizona, Latter-day Saints sometimes dated their correspondence as originating at "Winsor Castle, Utah Territory."²⁰ These two forts are both preserved, and visitors today can easily see their similarity in layout.²¹ Cove Fort buildings are single story and the fort enclosure is significantly larger than Pipe Springs. Both followed the basic plan of a rectangular courtyard walled by extensive stone buildings on two sides and feature enclosed natural water sources, catwalks over huge doorways, and numerous portals and loopholes from which to fire in the case of attack. Joseph W. Young's description of the Pipe Spring and Kanab country as "the best country for stock-raising" made the cessation of Navajo raids of primary importance for the region's grazing potential and did not disclose that Winsor Castle was also to be used for defense.

Joseph Young apparently left for Pipe Springs on October 17, but his visit was short. By November 4–6 he was back in St. George conducting the three-day Conference of the Southern

¹⁹ The fort on Cove Creek was most often simply called "Cove Fort." See Porter, "Cove Fort"; and John Peterson, *Utah's Black Hawk War*, 286, 298–299. In an 1868 letter George A. Smith wrote to the *Deseret News* that "Cove Creek Fort [was] the most substantially built fort in the Territory" and that "the protection of the road from Indian raids, as well as for the safety of travellers [*sic*] over these long stages during the storms of winter, and the preservation of the telegraph line, prompted President Young to erect this substantial enclosure, which, when completed, and the gates hung, will enable a few men to defend themselves against a host of savages." George A. Smith, Parowan, letter to the editor, *Deseret News*, May 20, 1868, in JH, May 20, 1868, 1.

²⁰ For examples see J. W. Jackson, Winsor Castle, Kane Co., U. T., to Prest B. Young, August 25, 1872; and J. W. Jackson, Winsor Castle, Kane Co., Horace Greeley Ex Editor of *Tribune* & Future President of U. S., August 25, 1872.

²¹ As has been pointed out, almost any Mormon community of any size had a fort. They were often much, much larger than either Winsor Castle or Cove Fort, often enclosing many city blocks. Because of their immense size, and the larger populations on hand to defend them, they did not need to be built as "substantially" as the Pipe Springs and Cove Creek tithing ranch herd-house forts, which were in exposed and sparsely populated areas. A notable exception was the "substantial" Nauvoo Legion headquarters bastion built in Gunnison in Sevier County during the Black Hawk War, but like most Mormon forts, it was dismantled for its building materials when it was no longer considered strategically important.

Mission. He read his entire letter of appointment to build Winsor Castle to the congregation assembled in the basement of the unfinished St. George Tabernacle, and “made some remarks on the payment of labor and other tithing for that purpose.” The general theme of the conference was “Cooperation in Merchandizing, Manufacturing, and Stock Raising.”²² To make sure the message of the conference reached every hamlet and ranch in the Southern Mission, the St. George stake president directed Henry Eyring, of the St. George tithing office, to send out a circular letter to all the ecclesiastical units in the stake, inviting the Saints to view winter fort-building at Pipe Springs as a means to settle “back labor tithing.” Representatives of local wards and branches carried the message back to their respective settlements from the Conference of the Southern Mission, and bishops employed the teachers quorums to disseminate the invitation in their home visits to members that month. News and instructions were carried to the far-flung villages, farms, and ranches of the Mormon empire by spoken reports made by local Saints who had attended recent conferences in St. George and in Salt Lake City. Bishop George H. Crosby “read a letter from H. Eyring giving us the privelege [*sic*] of paying all back Tithing, except cash & Stock, in building a Fort at Pipe Spring to be called Winsor Castle,” announcing that their stake president “Jos. W. Young is appointed to take charge of that work.” Back “cash & Stock” tithing would be needed for the proposed temple, but produce tithing, and especially labor tithing that had not yet been paid, could be used to build Brigham’s bastion.²³

²² St. George Utah Stake, General Minutes, 4–6 November 1870, CHL.

²³ “Hebron Ward Historical Records, 1862–1872, Clerk John Pulsipher,” 109–111, CHL. Other messages disseminated by the teachers of Hebron included word that “Prest Snow wished all the children to attend school,” and that the Saints “attend to baptism for the dead” in the Endowment House in Salt Lake City for “our dead friends are waiting for us to attend to the ordinance for them that they [may also] have part in the Kn [Kingdom] of heaven, & be freed from the society of the wicked & be admitted to the society [*sic*] of the church of the first born in the Mansions of our Father.” Saints were to be reminded of the Latter-day Saint injunctions to pay tithing, live the Word of Wisdom, and otherwise “live our religion” so that “our lives [might] be an example for our children.”

Despite his uncle's intentions, Joseph W. Young's involvement in Pipe Springs was limited to commencing the project and using his position as St. George stake president to solicit tithing labor for its construction. The prophet's nephew actually had very little to do with the construction of the fort, as his assignments of supervising of the building of the St. George Tabernacle and, later, the newly announced St. George Temple, forced Joseph W. Young to pass the "on-the-ground" oversight of the Pipe Springs project to Anson Winsor. This transition occurred before February 24, 1871, when Joseph wrote the president of the church that he had been "out to Pipe Spring and turned every thing belonging to the Fort to Bro. Winsor."²⁴ In his letter he referred to a "day book" in which he kept an account of his labors at the fort, but he complained "a multitude of cares" prevented him from adequately keeping it up and that "I therefore cannot make you a statement at present."²⁵ Like many second and third echelon Latter-day Saint leaders, and in fact like most rank and file Latter-day Saints in general, Brigham kept Joseph W. Young so busy that he could not adequately provide for the needs of his family, forcing him to rely on voluntary gifts of cattle and produce from individual Latter-day Saints.²⁶ Joseph W. pled with his uncle to somehow cut him in on the private commercial stock-raising venture at Pipe Springs business so that he could feed his family. He then gingerly asked his uncle that he and his younger brother John R. with John Berry be allowed to set up a sawmill in a nice stand of timber some five miles east of Winsor (Now Mt. Carmel) in Long Valley. "Those Herd houses and Forts will need considerable lumber," he had written the President, "and if a Town is built at Kanab, and Long Valley is resettled, it will be a great help to those places to

²⁴ Joseph W. Young, St. George, to Brigham Young, February 24, 1871.

²⁵ Joseph W. Young, St. George, to President B. Young, February 24, 1871.

²⁶ In May 1870, for example, Lorenzo Brown and a "br. Crosby," apparently found a stray cow and "made a present of her to Joseph W Young" rather than turn her over the local pound keeper. See Lorenzo Brown, *The Journal of Lorenzo Brown* (n.p.: Heritage Press, n.d.), 195, entry for 9–11 May 1870.

have some lumber, and I think a good investment for me.” His letter makes it clear that from the start, Moccasin and its springs (located three or four miles from Pipe) were planned to be part of “the Pipe Springs Ranche.” It also demonstrates a connection between the building of a fort at Pipe Springs and the resettlement of Kanab and Long Valley.²⁷ Long Valley was surrounded by “a forest of tall pines averaging from 50 to 100 feet high, and from 3 to 6 feet through” that was “free from brush or undergrowth, leaving the tall stately pines waiting for the woodman’s axe. This was a great treat as the country for hundreds of miles is destitute of timber, only as it is found hid away in the hills.”²⁸

Both the Lee and Stewart sawmill in Skutumpah (which was to supply Kanab’s needs) and the Young and Young sawmill (which was to supply Long Valley’s needs) were intended by Brigham Young to provide lumber for the fort at Pipe Springs and some related sheds he was planning to have built at Moccasin. During the entire time the Pipe Springs fort was being constructed, Joseph W. and John R. Young struggled, with very little capital or financial help from their uncle, to get their saw mill up and running. From the beginning both saw mills had serious problems, and, at least in the earliest phases of construction, hand-powered whip saws operating in Long Valley provided Winsor Castle and its supporting structures with lumber.²⁹ Stone work on Winsor Castle was likely finished in the spring of 1872, while the Young Brothers’ Mill was not operational until August of that year. Presiding over his stake, leading the

²⁷ Joseph W. Young, St. George, to President B. Young, April 25, 1870, BYP.

²⁸ Elvira Stevens Barney, *The Stevens Genealogy: Embracing Branches of the Family Descended from Puritan Ancestry, New England Families not Traceable to Puritan Ancestry, and Miscellaneous Branches Wherever Found . . .* (Salt Lake City, UT: Skelton Pub. Co., 1907), 270, 277–278; and Lydia Hopkins, “History of Glendale,” in Ellen S. Ence, “Lydia Ellen Hopkins Snow, Handmaiden of God,” May 1998, 42–43, FHL.

²⁹ Joseph W. Young, St. George, to President B. Young, April 25, 1870; Joseph W. Young, St. George, to Pres. B. Young, June 2, 1871, BYP; Erastus Snow, St. George, to Prest. B. Young, Salt Lake, August 4, 1872, BYP; and Harriet Maria Taggart Goodrich, “Autobiography of Harriet Maria Taggart Goodrich,” 3–4, PSLA, VF, no. 4, “Unassociated Histories.”

exodus of the Muddy Saints out of Nevada to Long Valley, working to establish his mill, feeding his family, and a host of other pressures, and most importantly of all, failing health, kept Joseph W. Young from pushing the fort forward as fast as his letter of appointment dictated it should be pushed.³⁰

Fire at Kanab and the Muddy Rivers Missions

While a few men labored on Winsor Castle during the fall of 1870, Bishop Levi Stewart continued to expand and strengthen the primitive fort at Kanab. When Brigham Young laid out Kanab and Pipe Springs in September of that year, each of its four massive walls were to be twelve feet high, 256 feet long, and stoutly built of shaped vermillion sandstone. Like Winsor Castle, Fort Kanab was to be patterned after Cove Fort in Millard County, but was to be much larger, as it was designed to protect a village. Its courtyard was to be large enough that the community's herds could be locked up at night when threatened by Native Americans. For Young, the Kanab structure, along with the fort at Pipe, would guard his newly initiated cooperative cattle operations from raids and keep watch over his escape route to Arizona and Mexico. Just as importantly, it would stand as a bulwark against the troops Ulysses S. Grant and Congress were still talking about sending to Utah, and it would provide a place of refuge for Mormons charged with polygamy and Mountain Meadows crimes. Knowing Bishop Stewart's tiny congregation would have to be bolstered by more colonizers, Young directed Stewart to see that the massive rock fort was built with tithing labor so that it would not tax the coffers of the general church. When they had finished their own fort, the "Kanab brethren" were to direct their

³⁰ J. W. Jackson, Winsor Castle, Kane Co., U. T., to Prest B. Young, August 25, 1872.

tithing labor to Winsor Castle until it too was completed. Together, the two forts were designed to form the southeastern bastion of the entire Mormon kingdom.

When fire broke out on December 14 1870, the fort consisted of a crude log and adobe extension that had been hastily added to connect Levi Savage's makeshift fort with at least one rock guardhouse put up by the Nauvoo Legion in 1869. The fort structures were roofed with cottonwood and juniper beams covered with small branches, sage brush, and grass, and then topped with sod. The entire south wall, however, simply consisted of "unpealed [*sic*] cedar posts" set in the ground and lashed together with rawhide to form a slapdash barricade about eight feet tall. Bishop Stewart's families occupied several "apartments" in the fort's northwest corner with a room dedicated as Kanab's bishop's office, tithing store, school, and meeting house.³¹ Young's plans for a substantial stone fort at Kanab were disrupted by the peace treaty mission at Ft. Defiance which assured settlers that the Navajo had promised to give up their raiding. Since Brigham Young had not revealed his plan to use his southern forts for protection from the US government, the Kanabites did not feel a sense of urgency to construct the massive rock fort. Six members of Bishop Levi Stewart's family died in the fire. That same day, Brigham Young responded to a slower burning but equally destructive conflagration set to consume the Muddy settlements. On the 14th, Brigham Young wrote: "Jos W. Came in from Pipe Springs night before last and reports works progressing slowly. Tomorrow Jos. W. starts for the Muddy[.] [W]e have instructed him to consult the brethren there as to their remaining in that

³¹ Kanab Ward General Minutes, 6–7, CHL; KWMH, 13 September 1870; Blanch H. Mace, "The Old Fort at Kanab During Settlement," *Kane County Standard*, April 23, 1943, 1 and 4, UDN; and Adonis Robinson, 36.

country Since it has be[en] declared [to be] in Nevada. We wish them to do pretty much as they please.”³²

The “Muddy Mission,” established in 1865 on the Muddy River, a tributary of the Virgin then located in Utah and Arizona territories, had a population of about six hundred in 1870.³³ These villages and their outlying farms and ranches comprised the extreme southwest frontier of the Mormon kingdom and had been established to protect water sources and settlement sites from gentiles and to raise cotton for Utah “home manufacture.” These settlements were also part of the line of settlements designed to protect a highway of colonization and potential escape leading to a Colorado River crossing that now lies under the waters of Lake Meade. Of all of the areas ever settled by the Latter-day Saints, the region along the Muddy was arguably the most desolate. Located in the Mojave Desert, with a terrain and climate similar in character to nearby Death Valley, temperatures in summer could approach 120° Fahrenheit. In the words of one settler, “Not even the caw of a crow, or the bark of a wolf, was there to break the awful monotony. I could see something green on the tops of the distant mountains, a thousand feet above me, but [in the valley] there was nothing but a continual stench of miasma, and hot streaks of poisonous air to breathe.”³⁴

In 1866, Congress shaved off one degree of longitude from the territory of Utah and gave it to Nevada. The next year Congress similarly carved off that portion of Arizona that contained the Muddy settlements and added it, too, to Nevada. Even before a government survey in 1870

³² Brigham Young, St. George, to Daniel H. Wells, December 14, 1870, BYP; and Brigham Young, St. George, to Hon. Daniel H. Wells, December 16, 1870, BYP. A sign of Joseph’s importance to the mission, one of the Muddy’s chief villages, St. Joseph, was named after him. Warren Foote, *Autobiography of Warren Foote: Son of David Foote*, . . . , 2nd printing, (Mesa, AZ: Dale Arnold Foote, 1997), 206; and Helen S. Carlson, *Nevada Place Names: A Geographical Dictionary* (Reno, NV: University of Nevada Press, 974), 208. Carlson mistakenly wrote that Joseph W. Young was a son of Brigham Young. He was, rather, the son of Brigham’s brother Lorenzo Dowe Young.

³³ James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 1900-1907, 2:82.

³⁴ George W. Brimhall, *The Workers of Utah* (Provo City: The Enquirer Company, 1889), 44–45.

conclusively proved the Muddy settlements now belonged to Nevada, state and county officials rushed to charge their new wards exorbitant back taxes.³⁵ According to George A. Smith, Nevada's rate of assessment was "five times as great as that of Utah."³⁶ Back taxes for the entire Muddy community for the years 1869 and 1870 amounted to "twelve thousand dollars" and according to Nevada state law was payable only in "gold coin."³⁷ Agriculturalists in a barren desert far removed from any market to sell their crops, the impoverished settlers on the Muddy were simply unable to meet Nevada's stiff demands. With temples and railroads to build and a far-flung kingdom to maintain, and now having seen for himself that the Muddy country was of little value, Young simply refused to pay. Nevada responded by threatening to send the state militia to extort the tax by impounding property and incarcerating delinquent taxpayers.³⁸

On December 14, 1870, Brigham Young, George A. Smith, and Erastus Snow granted the Muddy settlers the power "to choose for themselves" whether they ensured their right to stay in their homes on the Muddy by paying their own taxes, or whether they left their mission en masse and retreated to Utah. Perhaps this unusual freedom was driven by the bad health of both Brigham Young and George A. Smith, who wintered in St. George that season seeking to regain their strength. Young had been "confined to his room most of the time" since he arrived in St. George in December 1870.³⁹ The First Presidency had few options in terms of places available

³⁵ For the transfer of Utah and Arizona territory to Nevada, see James W. Hulse, *The Nevada Adventure: A History* (Reno, NV: University of Nevada Press, 1965), 134–139, especially 135; and James Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Mission," 2:81–82, 86–87.

³⁶ George A. Smith, St. George, to US Senator John S. Harris, December 23, 1870, quoted in James Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Mission," 2:81–82.

³⁷ Joseph W. Young, St. George, to President Brigham Young, February 24, 1871, BYP.

³⁸ Foote, *Autobiography of Warren Foote*, especially 211-213.

³⁹ George A. Smith wrote that both he and the President were in St. George trying to "benefit [from] a change of climate." "President Young's excessive labors during the [previous] season" on his various journeys "preaching most everyday, and driving his own team, were entirely too much for a man of his age." "He has been somewhat afflicted with rheumatism, a disease with which he has been tortured occasionally from his youth. . ." George A. Smith, St. George, to Elder John Jacques, January 5, 1871, James Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Mission," 2:84–

for the Muddy pioneers' resettlement and this may have contributed to the unusual circumstance. When asked for "counsel," the Muddy settlers were "advised by the First Presidency to locate in [Long] Valley" about twenty miles north of Pipe Springs.⁴⁰ The "Annals of the Southern Mission" affirm that "most of them went in a body to Long Valley . . . arriving there on the 1st o[f] March [1871]."⁴¹ Joseph W. Young and Richard Bentley left St. George around December 15, 1870, bearing Young's letter giving the Muddy Saints freedom to choose whether they stayed in Nevada or retreated to Utah. It commended them for their "noble work in making and sustaining that outpost of Zion, against many difficulties, amid exposures and toil" and advised them to abide by the decision of the majority. In either case, the letter instructed the settlers "to petition the [Nevada State] Legislature for an abatement of all back taxes."⁴² In a follow-up letter Young recommended "the prompt execution of your plans for [a] cooperative herd,—locating your surplus stock East of the mountains, [i.e. in Utah] and the removal of such other property as can be consistently removed into Utah" to keep it out of the clutches of Nevada's tax assessors.⁴³ On December 20, Joseph Young presided over a meeting of "the people on the Muddy," where Brigham's letter was read and the settlers voted for resettlement in Utah.

William Heaton played a leading role in the deliberations on the Muddy settlement, and along with Bishop James Leithead, was put on a committee of seven "to look out a new location"

85. See also George A. Smith to William H. Hooper, January 10, 1871, James Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Mission," 2:87.

⁴⁰ Foote, *Autobiography of Warren Foote*, 211; George A. Smith to William H. Hooper, January 10, 1871, in James Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Mission," 2:87-88; Telegram of Brigham Young and Geo. A. Smith to D. H. Wells, 22 January 1871, BYP; and Erastus Snow, St. George, to Bishop Stark and Brethren in Long Valley, as well the former occupants, as those newly arrived from the Muddy, April 21, 1871, in James Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Mission," 2:93-95.

⁴¹ James Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Mission," 2:90.

⁴² Brigham Young, George A. Smith, and Erastus Snow, St. George, to Bro. James Liethead and the brethren and sisters residing on the Muddy, December 14, 1870, in James Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Mission," 2:73-74.

⁴³ Erastus Snow, St. George, to Bishop James Henrie and the Brethren of Panaca and Eagleville Wards, 19 December 1870, in James Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Mission," 2:75-76.

for resettlement.⁴⁴ Joseph W. Young and William Heaton’s relocation committee returned from Long Valley “the forepart of January” and “brought up a good report of the land which they had searched.” Brigham Young “counseled” the Muddyites to settle in Long Valley, provided the “old settlers” who had been driven out by the Navajo War would “relinquish their old claims or . . . sell out.”⁴⁵ Under Brigham Young’s direction, Apostle Erastus Snow wrote letters to the former owners of Long Valley who had since settled at Harmony and Kanarraville, asking them if they would “relinquish their claims in favor of the brethren from the Muddy.” Snow wrote that if they were not willing to outright cede their claims gratis, their terms “ought to be liberal, giving those who had to break up their homes on the muddy an opportunity to recover from their losses.” Illustrative of the communal nature of Mormon society, the losses of the Muddyites were, at least in principle, to be absorbed by the whole Latter-day Saint community—as long as it did not draw on the tithes destined for church coffers.⁴⁶

The Winsor Family and the Building of the Fort at Pipe Spring

With Joseph W. Young focused on relocating the Muddyites, Anson Winsor took over the fort building at Pipe Springs. By mid-January 1871 the construction site had become a hive of activity. John D. Lee passed through there on January 20 and found so many people there that

⁴⁴ James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:77; and Foote, *Autobiography of Warren Foote*, 210.

⁴⁵ Foote, *Autobiography of Warren Foote*, 213–214. Harriet Goodrich wrote that “President Young said we had the privilege of making our home anywhere we wished but that he would like to have a company of us go and settle in Long Valley. . . . Accordingly we left our unfinished homes, unharvested crops, etc. and obeyed these wishes.” Harriet Maria Taggart Goodrich, “Autobiography of Harriet Maria Taggart Goodrich,” 4, PSLA, VF#4, “Unassociated Histories.”

⁴⁶ Warren Foote remembered that all former Long Valley claim holders were consulted and wrote that “some relinquished their claims altogether, some wanted pay, and some wanted to return. Foote, *Autobiography of Warren Foote*, 213.

he referred to it in his diary as “the settlement [*sic*] at Pipe.” He reported encountering teamsters on the road “from Parowan that were freighting Provisions to Pipe Springs on Tithing [labor].”⁴⁷ A substantial quantity of “provisions” were necessary, for some sources suggest that “a working force of 40 men” labored on Winsor Castle during the winter.⁴⁸ At “the settlement at Pipe” Lee was “Kindly received [*sic*] by Bros. Jno. R. Young & the Bros. Everetts, Elisha & Elijah.” Lee’s reference helps to establish the early arrival of four of the most important personalities involved in the construction of Winsor Castle, the first being Lee himself. Brigham Young’s purpose in building Winsor Castle was to house the people he hoped the entire “Kanab Country” would protect—Mormons accused of various crimes, such as the Mountain Meadows Massacre. John D. Lee was the most notorious Mountain Meadows malefactor, and he provided lumber and labor for the new fort. When the Lee and Stewart sawmill at Skutumpah actually operated it cut 5000 feet daily, and kept four teams busy hauling lumber away. Lee’s diary implies that most of this lumber went to private residences in the Kanab and Long Valley region. On March 20, 1871, however, he wrote that he “sent 1,500 feet of Lumber to Bishop Winsor, [at] Pipe Springs.”⁴⁹ A curious note in a ledger kept by Anson Winsor shows that John D. Lee and his son Joseph Hyrum were paid \$86.17 out of Winsor Castle’s “Trustee in Trust” account for “Labor on Ranche and buildings, . . . & supplies.” Lee family histories report that John D. Lee actually lived for a time at Pipe Springs.⁵⁰

John R. Young, Joseph W. Young’s brother, wrote that at his older brother’s request he took his wives Albina and Tamar and their families “to the Pipe Spring Ranch, near Kanab, and

⁴⁷ John D. Lee, *Diaries*, 2:156.

⁴⁸ For example see Elizabeth Jensen, “The Pipe Springs Story,” 28, WSC, b3, f9.

⁴⁹ John D. Lee, *Diaires*, 2:157–159.

⁵⁰ “Winsor Castle Stock Growing Company, Ledger B,” 52.

boarded the workmen who were building Winsor Fort.” John R. wrote that he remained there until the fort was finished.⁵¹ His son Silas remembered that his father “built the stone houses west of the fort” and that his father’s family lived in these western buildings while the Winsors lived “in the cabins on the east.” John R.’s wives fed the workers and Silas remembered that they “lived on corn bread and milk, Dixie molasses, some cured pig meat[,] potatoes, [and] flour gravy.” Silas reported that his father “superintended the quarr[y]ing of stones” for Winsor Castle and that they “got the stones along the face of the mountain on the west and north.” To cement them together, Silas helped his father make lime for mortar out of limestone they obtained “about 4 miles south on a knoll in [Pipe] valley.” He remembered “I used to sit on the lime stone knoll and watch [for Native Americans] with spy glass[es] while father loaded the limestone” into a wagon. John R. built kilns in which they burned the limestone. Later it was leached in pits and covered with soil until it was needed. Silas remembered that it was his lot to watch over the horses and cattle at night and that “they had an Indian herding sheep.” He also remembered that “Old Charlie Chamberlain used to help Sister Winsor take care of the pet lambs.”⁵² John R. Young wrote a letter after the fort was acquired by the National Park Service claiming that he was “general director of the work” and “time keeper.” He also stated that his nephew, Joseph G. Young, hauled the rock with his (John R.’s) team, and that some of the stone was quarried at Moccasin.⁵³ Contemporary evidence establishes that John R. Young was there as the fort neared completion in August 1872, but by that time he was simply listed as serving as a shepherd. John

⁵¹ John R. Young, *Memoirs*, 147; and Lee, *A Mormon Chronicle*, 2:156.

⁵² Silas Smith Young, Price UT, Statement to Dilworth Woolley, March 3, 1944, 1–2, in WSC, b3, f9.

⁵³ John R. Young, Mesa, Arizona, to John A. Young, July 30, 1924, letter excerpts quoted in John A. Young affidavit, August 17, 1968, in “Fort Windsor at Pipe Springs, Arizona,” History to 1870, PISPL, VF no. 2.

R. also stated that “Elisha Everett, who worked as a mason on the Nauvoo temple was the foreman in charge of the building work.”⁵⁴

Anson P. Winsor’s son Andrew, only four when his family moved to Pipe Springs, remembered that “two rock cabins were built on their arrival, one for A. P. Winsor and family and the other for the workmen.” According to his youthful memory “the construction of the fort began immediately and was finished in a comparatively short time.” In his opinion, the fort’s most impressive features were its large swinging doors, “two at the east entrance and two at the west entrance” which “allowed outfits to enter at one end and leave from the other without turning around.”⁵⁵ Documenting a slower process of the fort’s construction, another young son of Anson, Sr., Joseph F. (Frank) Winsor, who was about seven years of age in 1870, remembered that there were never more than a dozen men working on the castle at any given time through the entire two-year process.⁵⁶ Frank and other family members reported that Francis Quire, an eccentric English convert, singlehandedly dug the entire basement with pick and shovel, hauling several tons of material away with a wheelbarrow. Family lore still represents this hard working excavator as “somewhat strange, psychologically speaking” and recalls that when he was not digging he “played a violin by the hour by himself” during the whole time he was at Pipe.⁵⁷ Frank Winsor reported that as a seven-year-old, he drove the oxen that pulled the “lizzard” (an

⁵⁴ John R. Young, Mesa, Arizona, to John A. Young, July 30, 1924, letter excerpts quoted in John A. Young affidavit, August 17, 1968, in “Fort Windsor at Pipe Springs, Arizona”; and J. W. Jackson, Winsor Castle, Kane Co., U. T., to Prest. Brigham Young, August 25, 1872, BYP.

⁵⁵ Andrew N. Winsor, WPA interview, 1941, 2, USHS, Mss B 57, b342, f33.

⁵⁶ Joseph F. Winsor, “The Life of Joseph F. Winsor, Written by Marilla Cook as told by Brother Winsor, Autumn of 1948–Spring and Summer of 1949,” PSLA, VF, FH, Winsor; and LaVar Winsor, “Anson Perry & Emeline Zenetta Brower,” 6.

⁵⁷ Luther M. Winsor, “Interview of Luther M. Winsor, Pipe Springs, July 4, 1965,” 2, PLS, VF, FH, Winsor. Luther, a son of Anson P. Winsor, Jr., added that Francis Quire “never married and was much teased by the young people of St. George, when he lived alone.” Frank Winsor remembered “Francis Quire . . . had only a pick, a shovel, and a wheelbarrow to do all that work. He dug tons of dirt out of the side hill.” Joseph F. Winsor, “Life,” 1; and **LaVar Winsor**, “Anson Perry & Emeline Zenetta Brower,” 6. In some of the documents, Francis Quire is called “Brother Squires.”

improvised “skid” or sand sled ingeniously made out of the crotch of a large cedar tree), which hauled the heavy red-sandstone ashlar stone cutters cut out of nearby spurs of Pipe Springs Point.⁵⁸ A Winsor family history claims that forty heavily armed men were sent by Brigham Young to help Anson Winsor “build a fort, improve the spring and to care for the ten to fifteen thousand head of tithing cattle in Antelope Valley, Arizona.”⁵⁹ A grandson of Anson Winsor remembered that his grandmother “served as many as 40 men in the east bldg [sic]” at Pipe Springs while it was under construction.⁶⁰

Anson Winsor himself had been a “finish carpenter” in his younger days, and according to his obituary, had had substantial experience “in making fortifications to keep off Johnson’s army” during the Utah War.⁶¹ His obituary also states, “He was called to Pipe Springs in 1869 to build a fort against the Indians to collect tithing cattle and take charge of them.”⁶² But some Winsor family histories suggest that Anson P. Winsor Sr. “had very little to do with the actual building.” Frank Winsor told family members that he, as a child, “worked more weeks on the building than his father did.” Anson Sr. “was in charge of the cattle ranch the Church was building there,” Frank said. “He had cattle to gather” and “take care of,” from “as far north as Fillmore.” He also had “fields to plant and harvest for winter feed,” and therefore “did not have much time for the building.”⁶³ Other Winsor family histories, however, maintain that Winsor was the “foreman” and built the fort himself. Whatever the exact nature of his involvement, his sons Walter, Anson Perry Jr., Alonzo, Frank, and Andrew put in much labor. They were joined at

⁵⁸ Joseph F. Winsor, “Life,” 1; and Luther M. Winsor, “Interview 4 July 1965,” 2.

⁵⁹ Nettie May Winsor Irving, “The History of Anson Perry Winsor,” 1, in JAP, Winsor. Certainly by 1871 there were nowhere near that many cattle on the Pipe Springs range.

⁶⁰ Luther M. Winsor, “Interview July 4, 1965,” 2.

⁶¹ LaVar Winsor, “Anson Perry & Emeline Zenetta Brower,” 2; Luther Winsor, “Life History,” 5; and Obituary of Anson Winsor, *Washington County News*, June 28, 1917, 4, UDN.

⁶² *Washington County News*, June 28, 1917, 4, UDN.

⁶³ LaVar Winsor, “Anson Perry & Emeline Zenetta Brower,” 6.

least a portion of the time by Abraham Lee Winsor, an adult nephew of Anson and Emiline who came west after serving as a Union soldier during the Civil War. Frank told his descendants that “during the building of the fort mother Winsor and the girls had to cook for a dozen extra men and this cooking was done over a camp fire, there wasn’t even a fire place in the dugout, they had to live in while the fort was under construction.”⁶⁴ Anson P. Winsor III claimed with pride: “[Anson Winsor Sr.] and his children built the Winsor Castle at Pipe Springs. It is now a national monument and is admired by visitors from all over the world. It is rated as the most outstanding fort in the world and is truly an example of his wonderful workmanship. . . . I often visit Pipe Springs and am proud of the fact that I bear the name of ANSON PERRY WINSOR III.”⁶⁵

After Brother Quire cleared away a portion of the mountainside for the courtyard and dug the footings, they had to reroute the spring. Andrew Winsor wrote that “the water came into the fort through an under ground rock flume” and that the spring itself was “covered with flat rocks and dirt so that the Indians couldn’t find it and shut it off in case they raided the fort.”⁶⁶ Frank Winsor remembered that “they started by cleaning out the spring down to the rock” and then “laid a rock wall around the spring and a ditch made of rock to where the south room of the east building is then run the water through a trough to the ponds, east of the fort.” Whether they constructed the ponds at this point Frank did not make clear, continuing:

They then built a dome of rock over the spring and the ditch, strong enough to hold up a loaded wagon. Then they filled in around the dome and ditch with rock

⁶⁴ LeVar Winsor, “Anson Perry & Emeline Zenetta Brower,” 6–7; Adelia Winsor Shurtliff, “History of Grandfather Winsor: His work for and on the St. George Temple,” 1, in “Winsor Family History,” FHL; and Abraham Lee Winsor, holograph copy of autobiography, in “Winsor Family History.”

⁶⁵ Anson P. Winsor III, “A History of These People,” CHL.

⁶⁶ Andrew Winsor, WPA interview, 3.

then put big flat slabs of rock over this to make the court yard. The houses are at different levels because they wanted the east one lower than the spring so the water would run through it and the other is on top of the rock the spring comes out of.⁶⁷

Just before he died in 1941, Andrew N. Winsor left a concise description of Winsor Castle that serves as an important eyewitness description of its construction:

There was a large wooden watering trough for the stock just outside the north back door. The Fort had an up stairs or second story. The Fort consisted of two buildings about one hundred feet long facing one another and running east and west. There was sort of a public square between the two and the ends of the two buildings were also joined making the fort about one hundred feet square. A passage way joined the upstairs of the two buildings over the large wooden gates at either end. There were also a systematic arrangement of port holes both in the upper and lower story of each building. These portholes were larger on the inside of the wall than they were on the outside to enable riflemen from inside to shoot at several different angles and they were smaller on the outside to make it more difficult for the Indians to shoot through the holes from outside. The fort consisted of four rooms, [two] upstairs and two downstairs in each of the buildings, although temporary partitions may have been installed later.

⁶⁷ LaVar Winsor, "Anson Perry & Emeline Zenetta Brower," 6.

[. . .] Several years later while the St. George Temple was being built the Church cow herds at Pipe Springs furnished the temple builders with beef, butter and cheese. The north east room in the fort was used as a storage room for these products as it was kept cool by the water that entered it through the rock pipe [from] Pipe Spring near by.

Like virtually everyone associated with the fort's construction, Andrew seemed oblivious to the fort's planned use to protect Brigham Young from prosecution by United States officials. To him it was simply a fortification built to protect stockmen from marauders. "The construction of this fort later proved to be all in vain," he wrote, "as the Indians never once ever raided the fort, although many of the stock herders there may have been killed if it hadn't been for the protection the fort afforded in case of an emergency."⁶⁸

Elijah and Elisha Averett

Brigham Young called two of the very best masons in Utah, twins Elijah and Elisha Averett, to head up to stone-cutting. John D. Lee reported seeing both of the Averett twins at Pipe Springs on January 20, 1871.⁶⁹ Fifty-nine years of age in January 1871, the Averett twins had worked on the Nauvoo Temple, the Salt Lake Temple, and the St. George Tabernacle, and were two of the most skilled and experienced stonemasons in all of Utah Territory. According to Elijah Averett, his brother Elisha was Joseph Smith's "chief Mason" during the Missouri and

⁶⁸ Andrew Winsor, WPA interview, 3.

⁶⁹ Lee, *A Mormon Chronicle*, 2:156.

Illinois periods of Latter-day Saint history. Under Smith's direction, Elisha quarried the massive cornerstones for the Far West Temple in Missouri and had the singular honor of laying that temple's foundation in special ceremonies held on July 4, 1838.⁷⁰ That same day, First Presidency member Sidney Rigdon gave his infamous "Independence Day Sermon" in which he "declared independence" from the religious intolerance and mob-violence of the American nation.⁷¹ Elisha's cornerstones are reverently visited by Latter-day Saints as monuments of the religious intolerance leveled against their ancestors. Elisha was one of two "master masons" selected by Joseph Smith to lay the foundation of the Nauvoo Temple, as he had for the unfinished Far West Temple.⁷² It is likely that Elisha also laid the foundation for Winsor Castle, as Averett family histories indicate that he got to Pipe Springs before Elijah, and left much earlier, leaving most of the work there to Elijah.⁷³ Elisha had been selected to accompany Joseph Smith when the Prophet proposed to personally locate an asylum for his people in the Rocky Mountains in May and early June of 1844, but as Elijah related: "Joseph's wife and some others thought they would all die if he did not come back. So, they [Joseph Smith and his brother Hyrum] returned and gave themselves up [to be killed.]"⁷⁴

Both Averetts played significant roles in the Mormon exodus to Utah, leading large crews of men in the construction of bridges, locating herd grounds and camps, and in obtaining food for the saints as they crossed Iowa en masse. Elisha was part of the original vanguard of 144

⁷⁰ Elijah Averett, "From the Journal of Elijah Averett", in "Stories: Elijah Averett," Ancestry of Marie Pool (website). <http://mariepool.tripod.com/stories/id3.html>.

⁷¹ Elijah Averett, "Journal." See also Stephen C. LeSueur, *The 1838 Mormon War in Missouri* (Columbia: University of Missouri Press, 1987).

⁷² Elijah Averett, "Journal"; and Charles Ray Averett Jr., "Elisha Averett," in http://www.stewartkin.com/histories/averett_elisha.html.

⁷³ Murray Averett, "Elijah Averett," in "Stories: Elijah Averett," Ancestry of Marie Pool (website).

⁷⁴ Elijah Averett, "Journal"; Charles R. Averett, Jr., "Elisha Averett"; and B. H. Roberts, *The Life of John Taylor: Third President of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints* (Salt Lake City: George Q. Cannon & Sons, 1892), 179.

pioneers who explored and built the Mormon Trail from the Missouri River to the Great Salt Lake Valley. Subsequently, both Elisha and Elijah did much stonework on early Utah edifices—including the Utah territorial statehouse in Fillmore, the council house and the temple in Salt Lake City, Cove Fort, the Washington Cotton Factory, the Provo wool mills, and the exquisite St. George Tabernacle. After building Winsor Castle, both settled in Kanab and constructed a multitude of rock homes there as well. Both also helped build the St. George and Manti temples. Throughout the Mormon world it was said that if “the Averett twins . . . had a hand in building anything, it was well built.”⁷⁵

The Averett twins’ having been pulled off the unfinished tabernacle in St. George and sent away from that project when a temple was about to be commenced speaks volumes as to the high priority Brigham Young set on Winsor Castle. Their work is central to the old pioneer fort’s continued survival. The Averett brothers were simply the best masons available for the job, and Young wanted Winsor Castle to be solid, stout, and beautiful. Frederick Dellenbaugh said he had never seen a “more effective” place of defense “on a small scale” than the Averett brothers’ fort at Pipe Springs. He was impressed by its substantial walls, constructed of well-mortared and finely faced sandstone blocks, with their “loopholes commanding every approach.” He “marveled that it should be so elaborately prepared—far beyond anything else in the country.” It is significant to note that in March 1872, young Dellenbaugh listed “Mr. Winsor” as the castle’s primary builder, and that he was building it “for protection against raiders.”⁷⁶

⁷⁵ Elijah Averett, “Journal”; Murray Averett, “Elijah Averett”; “Averett Family History: Genealogy and Family Sketches,” especially 20, DSUSC; Abraham O. Smoot, Provo City, to Pres. Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, 25 May 1870, BYP; Elisha Averett obituary, *Deseret News*, November 5, 1890, 3, UDN.

⁷⁶ Frederick Samuel Dellenbaugh, *A Canyon Voyage The Narrative of the Second Powell Expedition down the Green-Colorado River from Wyoming, and the Explorations on Land, in the Years 1871 and 1872*. 185–186.

Despite John R.'s testimony regarding Elisha's role as foreman, Averett family history indicates that Elisha left for Kanab quite early in the project, leaving Elijah to serve as master mason and chief builder of Winsor Castle. It seems that sibling rivalry made it impossible for the twin master masons to work together, and after a quarrel Elisha left Elijah behind to serve alone as chief "architect & mason."⁷⁷ The best set of contemporary documents we have relative to Pipe Springs construction simply lists "E Avrett" as "Arch[it]ect [sic] & Mason." Later sources, however, make it clear that this was a reference to Elijah. It remains for future historians to conclusively catalogue the respective work of the Averett twins and the other workers who supported them. Like John R. Young, Elijah Averett brought at least one plural wife (Johanna Christina Neilsen Averett) who according to her son Murray Averett lived at Pipe Springs with her husband and their children during the duration of the project. Murray remembered that they "were at Pipe more than a year."⁷⁸

Feeding Laborers, Tithing, and Cooperative Cattle Ranches

Joseph W. Young oversaw the evacuation of the Muddy and employed many of the immigrants to work on the St. George Tabernacle, St. George Temple, and Pipe Spring. By employing these refugees, Joseph more than doubled the number of "public hands" the nearly empty St. George tithing office larders needed to feed.⁷⁹ Considering how tightly the Prophet

⁷⁷ Family tradition states that Elisha's son Robert Wesley was baptized at Pipe. Lewis Wesley Averett, interview by Robert W. Olsen, October 10, 1964, interview notes in PSLA, VF, FH, Averett; "A History of Elijah Averett," 16, PSLA, VF, FH, Averett; and J. W. Jackson, Winsor Castle, Kane Co., U. T., to Prest B. Young, August 25, 1872, BYP

⁷⁸ Murray Averett, "Elijah Averett"; Murray Averett, "History of Johanna Christina Neilson Averett," 21, in "Elijah Averett Journal," UU; and J. W. Jackson, Winsor Castle, Kane Co., U. T., to Prest. Brigham Young, August 25, 1872, BYP.

⁷⁹ Erastus Snow, St. George, to President Brigham Young, March 29, 1871, BYP.

was clinging to tithed cattle as he geared up to build the St. George Temple, Joseph wondered how the St. George Stake was to feed these added workers and their dependents. The same day he reported the successful evacuation of the Muddy settlers, he wrote this carefully worded letter to his uncle:

We are putting another set of hands on the walls of the Tabernacle, and we hope to have the roof on by fall.

Bro Snow and myself have been talking [about] the best plan to adopt to feed the workmen, and he wishes me to lay before you the condition we are in with regard to this matter.

We think we can manage to get [wheat for] bread but have no way of getting [*sic*] meat; there has been little or no tithing pork brought in and we have no tithing beef.

We have never had the liberty to use any Tithing Stock. Year before last all the stock was turned over to Ira Hinckly [at Cove Fort Tithing Ranch] and this last year everything has gone to Pipe Spring.

It will do no good to ask the people to donate beef cattle, for they have not got them[.] All the beef cattle in this mission were converted into cash last fall for the purchase of the machinery in the [cotton] factory [as you directed.]

Now what shall we do? The only Beef that I know of is at Pipe Spring[.] Bro Winsor has a good many there and [plenty of] four year old steers that are good beef. The four year olds will not increase much in value, and will perhaps do as much good in the stomachs of these public hands, as they ever will in any other way.

We will use [this beef] very sparingly, but it seems as though the public servants mission should eat a little meat, when the Lord bestows flocks and herds in abundance upon His people.

If you feel as though you could consent to our drawing some beef from Bro. Winsor[,], please send us authority to do.⁸⁰

The importuning (and mildly lecturing) tone of Joseph’s letter as he begged Brigham for food for his hungry Tabernacle workers is instructive. It seems he felt he was asking something his uncle probably would not readily support. Beef, the primary means of exchange in southern Utah’s frontier economy, was being stored up so carefully on church ranches to finance temples and other future public works, that from Joseph W. Young’s perspective the public hands then in service were not being adequately fed. These “hands” often donated their work as “labor tithing” or simply worked for food. They were often given tithing office scrip, a kind of homemade currency with which they could purchase needed supplies from the tithing office or trade with other Saints. The Dixie rank and file could not be called on to provide beef for the public hands, for they had already donated huge amounts of beef to pay for machinery for Brigham’s Cotton

⁸⁰ Joseph W. Young, St. George, to Brigham Young, February 24, 1871, BYP.

and Woolen Mill in Washington, some three miles from St. George. Before the year was out, the church president counseled the Dixie Saints as a body to buy the whole cotton factory operation from him on credit for the price he set—\$44,000. Considering how the Mormon priesthood operated, the people and their local leaders had little choice in the matter. They were directed to buy the factory and were obedient to the prophet. T. B. H. Stenhouse, who was just then leaving the church, largely because of such business arrangements, observed that “there never was a people more willing to do what they were told than the Mormons,” and Young easily “swayed them whither he pleased.”⁸¹

While Brigham’s fort at the Pipe Springs Ranch was hardly even begun by February 1871, tithing stock and animals donated for temple building had been gathered there from every town, hamlet, and ranch from Fillmore in central Utah to the Arizona line, providing Brother Winsor with a good many tithing animals. Joseph’s mention of the little increase in value of the four-year-old steers draws attention to the fact that the Ranch’s purpose was to grow the church’s investment. Brigham’s parsimonious management of the tithing herds was driven by his expressed desire to use every single resource available to him “to build the Kingdom of God,” even if the long term goal produced significant short term sacrifices. Had so much of the proceeds of these resources not seemed to end up in his own pockets, or in those of his family members after his death, his own and subsequent generations perhaps would have been kinder to Brigham Young and his altruism. Brigham’s economy and his attitudes toward wealth were a unique blend of New Testament Christian communalism and Yankee capitalism. When Erastus Snow and Joseph W. Young called upon Young for cattle to feed the public hands in St. George,

⁸¹ James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:92–93; and T. B. H. Stenhouse, *The Rocky Mountain Saints* (Salt Lake City: Utah Lighthouse Ministry, 2000), 665.

he reluctantly allowed Anson Winsor to release a few of the four-year-olds from the Pipe Spring range to meet their needs. It was clearly not enough, however, as Erastus Snow revealed in a letter to the church president wherein he thanked him “for the liberty extended of drawing *a* little beef for [the workmen] from Bro Winsor.” Showing that he too knew how to gently remind Young to take care of his workers, he promised him that thus fed, “our workmen will be ready for the next job, [i.e., the St. George Temple,] by the time you get the work laid out for them.”⁸²

Reports of contemporary gentiles noted that large numbers of Latter-day Saints were becoming “exceedingly restive under the tithing system” as administered by Brigham Young. In the early 1870s, Massachusetts travel writer John Codman reported that “the ten-per-cent income-tax for the church is becoming yearly more difficult to collect. ‘Pay your tithes or you cannot inherit the [Celestial] kingdom,’ has been the refrain of many sermons that I have heard.”⁸³ Always a prominent part of Mormonism, such sermons were becoming increasingly necessary. Young’s foremost “tithing agent,” A. Milton Musser, wrote to his chief in January 1871 that a review of church records showed that “for several years past the people have paid but little over one half of the tithing with which they have been voluntarily and annually assessed.” He wrote the prophet that church records demonstrated that “a great deal of . . . stock tithing” was owed to the tithing office. Musser believed this was partially “traceable to the annual destruction of grasshoppers, whose ravages have taken so much of the [1870] grain [crop], that the [people’s] flour-bins [throughout the entire territory] have had to be replenished [by] the sale of stock” which otherwise would have been paid in as tithing. He was also convinced that the

⁸² Erastus Snow, St. George, to Brigham Young, 29 March 1871.

⁸³ John Codman, *The Mormon Country: A Summer with the “Latter-Day Saints”* (New York: United States Publishing Company, 1874), 170. For Mormons “the Celestial Kingdom” is the highest of a hierarchy of three heavens or degrees of Eternal Glory to which human beings are assigned after judgment.

Indian Wars had seriously interrupted the payment of tithing stock, for the native peoples had stolen thousands of animals which naturally impeded the people's "increase."⁸⁴

Mormons sold surplus stock to the miners and settlers in the states and territories surrounding Utah at what eastern markets considered "famine prices."⁸⁵ But hungry Saints also drew heavily on tithing office reserves which were quickly depleted. So many tithing animals had to be sold to the western mining markets to replenish empty tithing office flour-bins that Traveling Bishop Elijah Sheets⁸⁶ was surprised to find the whole church herd consisted of only 16,000 head of sheep and "70 or 80 head" of cattle in the north, "and 2 or 3 hundred head of cattle at Pipe Springs in Arizona."⁸⁷ This deceptively low estimate of the number of cattle the church owned was colored by the fact that the first presidency had just recently transferred a large fraction of its livestock from official "trustee-in-trust ownership" to Brigham Young's personal accounts and to "privately owned" ward and stake cooperative herds to hide them from government tax collectors. Similarly, the church misleadingly represented that its cattle ranch at Cove Fort been sold for cash and the funds dispersed to the needy. All this and much more was done to protect tithing property from the United States Internal Revenue Department assessor. As

⁸⁴ A. Milton Musser, Salt Lake City, to Prest. B. Young, January 28, 1871, BYP. In Mormon theology, tithing is based on "increase." For example, if a herd "increased" by ten cattle in a given year, the owner was expected to give one of them to the bishop as tithing. According to a revelation received by Joseph Smith in 1838, after an individual paid a one-time-only tithe of ten percent of his total property, he was required to pay one-tenth of his "increase" annually. See Doctrine and Covenants, 119:1-7.

⁸⁵ *Winnebago Chief* (Rockford, IL; newspaper), July 22, 1869, 3, GBC.

⁸⁶ In April 1871, Sheets, a close associate of Presiding Bishop Edward Hunter, was appointed "Traveling Bishop for Utah, Juab, Millard, Sevier, Sanpete and Tooele counties." In that role he was general supervisor of church herds in the central Utah region. He also saw that tithing was forwarded "in kind as received, to the General Tithing Store [in Salt Lake City] *unless otherwise directed by the First Presidency.*" In August 1871 he was appointed general supervisor of *all* church stock and pasture lands. See Orson F. Whitney, *History of Utah*, 4:110.

⁸⁷ Elijah F. Sheets, "Jo[u]rnal-2," unpaginated, Elijah F. Sheets Collection, CHL.

trustee-in-trust, Young was assessed \$59,338.51 in back taxes and late fines for failure to pay on tithing income for the year 1868 alone.⁸⁸

Not long after his inauguration, Ulysses S. Grant appointed John B. Taggart as assessor for Utah, and Oliver J. Hollister as collector, to help him break Young's power by attacking his financial base.⁸⁹ The Internal Revenue Department, by US statute, did not tax funds received by churches through charitable donations of parishioners. Considering Grant's new campaign against Mormon Utah, key congressional leaders promised to change the tax code and the Internal Revenue Department proceeded as if this had already been done. For years the gentile press had proclaimed that tithing funds disappeared "into Brigham Young's pocket." Meanwhile the faithful had "the utmost confidence in the Trustee in Trust generally & so do not care to have any check on him & in short that there was no tithing [accounts]" from which the assessor "could get an idea of the business." Based on what Taggart could gather from wayward Saints and informed gentiles, the assessor formally estimated that Young took in between two and three million dollars annually in tithing alone. In a blatant breach of US tax law, Assessor Taggart

⁸⁸ For extensive correspondence regarding the government's campaign to tax Brigham Young personally for tithing income discussed in this and subsequent paragraphs, see BYP, r62, b49, f31 and 32.

⁸⁹ Hollister was sent to Utah after Grant's election in November 1868. Grant's inauguration was on 4 March 1869. Hollister was officially appointed April 5, and Taggart on 10 May. By December 1870 they were prepared to begin confiscating church property. See HOJ, June 18, 1869; and JH, October 2, 1870, 1. Taggart and Hollister's threatening of the hierarchy's "sacred" and vital tithing funds naturally led the Saints to rank them among their "bitterest enemies." See Francis M. Lyman, Fillmore City, to William Clayton, December 18, 1869, BYP. Hollister was most often credited with behaving like a "Gentleman," while Taggart frequently treated the Mormons with disdain. Daniel H. Wells, Salt Lake City, to Brigham Young, January 1, 1871, BYP. Utah's delegate to Congress, William Hooper, wrote: "I think of Doctor Taggart as one of the *inimical* men who instead of pouring the oil of peace upon the troubled waters are constantly trying to stir up strife." George A. Smith spoke of Taggart as our "disagreeable U. S. assessor" who meddled in issues far beyond the scope of the Internal Revenue Department. See excerpts of William H. Hooper, Washington, D. C., to George A. Smith, January 17, 1870, Richard D. Poll Papers, UU; and various letters of George A. Smith, in HOLC, Romney Typescripts, CHL. For his part, Assessor Taggart testified before the House Committee on Territories in 1870 that "confirmed Mormons recognize and observe no law except such as they are compelled to observe," and that "they do not scruple at any means they can contrive to evade the revenue law." *Testimony of an Internal-Revenue Collector in Utah, 11 February 1870*, in 48th Cong, 1st Sess., House Rept. 1351, pt. 2, 7-8.

boldly assessed Young's personal tax accordingly. Young refused to pay, complaining that tithing was a voluntary donation to the church and thus legally exempt from taxation. Backed by their superiors in Washington, Taggart and Hollister adamantly pressed their demands. When Young ignored them, a fifty percent penalty was imposed. Meanwhile Taggart and Hollister and the Grant administration argued that Mormon tithing could not be considered voluntary because non-tithe payers were put under immense social pressure to pay up and were threatened with excommunication if they did not. Even more severe, in Latter-day Saint theology, salvation in God's highest heaven was directly tied to the payment of tithes. The saving ordinances of the temple, including the ordinance that sealed families together forever, were categorically denied to non-payers of tithes.⁹⁰

For decades the issue of Young's wealth and how he obtained it was an international story, almost as full of salacious interest as what might be happening in the quiet corners of "the Prophet's harem." Newspapers across the English-speaking world speculated on Young's wealth and enumerated his proclivity for "avarice and greed." American author Fitz Hugh Ludlow averred that Young was "undoubtedly the richest man in the Western Hemisphere." Some went so far as to claim that he had the second largest account in the Bank of England, at \$150,000,000. Young scoffed at such ridiculous reports but coyly said he wished they were true.⁹¹ The *Cincinnati Daily Enquirer* charged that Young's "avarice and his greed of wealth have overreached him, and that the Assessor of Internal Revenue will be his executioner." A growing

⁹⁰ For detailed information regarding the Grant administration's campaign to tax Brigham Young personally for "tithing income," see Internal revenue income tax matter, 1869–1871, Communications and other documents concerning revenue assessor John P. Taggart's attempts to tax LDS tithing, BYP, r62, b49, f31 and 32. See also Testimony of John P. Taggart, United States assessor for Utah, in H.R. Rep. No. 21, Pt. 2, "Laws in Utah [to accompany bill H. R. No. 1089]," 41st Cong., 2d Session, 3 February 1870, 1–7, Serial Set Vol. No. 1436, GBC.

⁹¹ Fitz Hugh Ludlow, *The Heart of the Continent: A Record of Travel Across the Plains and In Oregon, with an Examination of the Mormon Principle* (New York: Hurd and Houghton, Cambridge University Press, 1871), 318; T. B. H. Stenhouse, *Rocky Mountain Saints*, 665–667.

howl in the nation demanded that “the Mormon chief . . . be treated just like every other citizen of the United States.” The nation was “demanding of Brigham to render an account of his Trusteeship, where he has handled many millions without showing the scratch of a pen for it.”⁹² The federal attack on the tithing system was just one prong of a full frontal attack on Brigham’s desert and mountain bastion that Ulysses S. Grant was methodically bringing to bear against it.

Young remonstrated against these assessments in a special claim which he filed with the Internal Revenue Department “for Remission of Taxes Improperly Assessed.” He argued that “Tithing is a free gift or donation by the members of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints to no person but to a Fund to be expended building places of public worship and for other charitable and benevolent purposes . . . and as such [should not be] subject to taxation.” Young averred in the strongest terms: “I have never used the Tithing fund for purposes of speculation, nor permitted it to be done anywhere or at any time.”⁹³ Brigham’s delegate to Congress, William H. Hooper, was directed to launch a congressional campaign against this “unlawful persecution” which was manifest through illegal taxation. Meanwhile, Taggart “proceeded to assess [the annual] tithes at nearly \$2,000,000” and correctly predicted that “Church leaders will evade the collection of these taxes unless the Government is firm in its purpose.” On his repeated urgings, officers of the Revenue Department visited Major General William T. Sherman in Washington to

⁹² O. J. Hollister, Collector, United States Internal Revenue, Collector’s Office, District of Utah, Salt Lake City, to Hon Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, February 18, and March 2, 1870, BYP; and *Testimony of an Internal-Revenue Collector in Utah*, 8. For detailed information regarding the government’s campaign to tax Brigham Young personally for “tithing income” discussed in this and subsequent paragraphs, see BYP, r62, b49, f31 and 32. For press quotations and examples of newspaper articles regarding Young’s wealth, see *Winnebago Chief* (Rockford, IL), July 22, 1869, 3, GBC; *Evening Star* (Washington, DC), December 2, 1870, 1, GBC; *New York Commercial Advertiser*, December 2, 1870, 4, GBC; *New York Tribune*, December 3, 1870, 1, GBC; *Cincinnati Daily Gazette*, December 3, 1870, 3, GBC; *Quincy Daily Whig*, December 9, 1870, 2, GBC; *Flake’s Bulletin* (Galveston, TX), December 17, 1870, 2, GBC; and *Cincinnati Daily Enquirer*, December 18, 1870, 2, GBC.

⁹³ “Claim under Circular No. 21 for Remission of Taxes Improperly Assessed, February 23, 1870, Territory of Utah, County of Salt Lake,” BYP.

beg him to provide military forces to collect the church's taxes, and newspapers throughout the country reported that Sherman declared that he would "furnish all the forces necessary to enforce the law."⁹⁴ Seemingly preparing for such an exigency, on February 18, 1870 the Utah Territorial Legislature (under Brigham Young's direction) passed a new law enabling the incorporation of "cooperative institutions" in which the church could hide its holdings in private companies. The cooperative cattle companies that grew out of this legislation were a major factor in the creation of the Pipe Springs Ranch and its fortified herd house. For the next decade and a half, it outwardly appeared that private companies (the Winsor Castle Stock Growing Company and the Canaan Cooperative Stock Company respectively) owned Pipe Springs, but all concerned knew that the ranch and its range were actually the property of the church.⁹⁵ The Grant administration's attack on tithing forced Young to more fully develop his Cooperative Plan and pushed him to perfect and institute his plans for cooperation's ultimate expression, an economic system based on Joseph Smith's revelations which Young called the Order of Enoch, or the United Order (UO).⁹⁶ Cooperation and the UO would both come to impact the tithing ranch at Pipe Springs.

Assessor Taggart and Collector Hollister were powerless to confiscate such property because it was no longer formally owned by the trustee-in-trust but was now in privately

⁹⁴ For examples, see *Jackson Citizen Patriot* (Jackson, MI), February 21, 1870, 2, GBC; *New Orleans Times*, February 22, 1870, 4, GBC; *New Hampshire Sentinel* (Keene, NH), February 24, 1870, 2; and *San Luis Obispo Tribune*, March 29, 1870, 1, GBC.

⁹⁵ Both of these companies, as well as scores of others, were established under an Act of the Governor and Legislative Assembly of [the] Territory of Utah, entitled "An Act Providing for Incorporating Associations for Mining, Manufacturing, Commercial and other Industrial Pursuits," approved February 18, 1870. By April 24, 1870 initial steps were taken to organize the CCSC, and the WSGC was organized 2 January 1873. Both mention the act in their articles of agreements. See their respective articles of agreement in Thomas L. Kane Collection, CHL, Ms 16717, r11, b17, f 4 and 7. See also Phillip Foremaster, "The Arizona Strip" (paper presented to Rio Virgin Chapter of the Utah State Historical Society, St. George, UT, 1 March 1973) 14, DSUSC; James Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Mission," 2:43; SGSM, 298; and MS 32 (July 26, 1870): 478.

⁹⁶ See Arrington, *Great Basin Kingdom*, especially chapters X, "Cooperation," and XI, "The Order of Enoch."

controlled stock-growing cooperatives.⁹⁷ The First Presidency briefly suspended the payment of tithes and offerings altogether in January 1871, and threatened to take the issue of taxing tithing as income to the US Supreme Court. A church epistle was sent to bishops commanding them to stop taking in tithing immediately. Young described his thinking this way in a telegram to Daniel H. Wells on January 3: “We think it will be wisdom for the Latter Day Saints to omit paying tithing—Some of the Officers of the government seem determined to rob us of our hard earnings which are donated to sustain the poor and other charitable purposes = we will carry on our public works and assist the poor by some other method.” The circular was telegraphed to “all the Bishops in the Territory not to receive any more Tithing nor make any more Reports to the Trustee in Trust’s Office.” Instead they were to encourage ward members to make “donations and offerings.”⁹⁸ Congressional pressure against the taxation of tithing became so intense that on or about January 11, 1871, the Internal Revenue commissioner was forced to announce that tithing could not be taxed.⁹⁹

The First Presidency’s call for the cessation of tithing payments relieved many rank and file Latter-day Saints. The coming of the railroad and the influx of gentile merchants and businessmen with eastern connections who undersold Mormon shopkeepers had resulted in a

⁹⁷ Daniel H. Wells, Salt Lake City, to Prest. B. Young, December 28, 1870, BYP; and two different letters of Daniel H. Wells, Salt Lake City, to Prest. B. Young, January 1, 1871, BYP. Wells suggested that Hollister confiscate the two Salt Lake tabernacles on the Temple Block, complete with the New Tabernacle’s famous organ, as well as the “Tithing office buildings known as the Deseret buildings” in Salt Lake City. Hollister was forced to acknowledge to Wells that if he took the brand-new Salt Lake Tabernacle and organ, “it would raise a howl about persecution that [Grant’s Republican Party] would not get over for 50 years.” Hollister demanded the confiscation of property “out side of the Temple Block” to pay taxes on tithing income. Wells declared that if the offered property “was not satisfactory [the Internal Revenue Department] would have to find” the property before it could steal it.

⁹⁸ Daniel H. Wells, Salt Lake City, U. T., to Hon. W. H. Hooper, Washington, DC, December 8, 1870, BYLB, SCA, dvd 1:25; Brigham Young, St. George, to D. H. Wells, telegram, January 3, 1871, BYP; George A. Smith, *Journal*, January 4, 1871, CHL; City Hall, Salt Lake City, to Hon Wm H Hooper, January 11, 1871, RTC, CHL; A. Milton Musser, Salt Lake City, to Brigham Young, January 28, 1871, BYP.

⁹⁹ Brigham Young, St. George, to D. H. Wells, telegram, January 3, 1871, BYP; A. Milton Musser, Salt Lake City, to Brigham Young, January 28, 1871, BYP; Daniel H. Wells, Salt Lake City, to Prest. B. Young, January 1, 1871, BYP; *Salt Lake Herald*, January 14, 1871, 3, UDN; and *MS*, 33 (1871): 106.

decrease in both the number of Saints paying tithing and the actual amount brought in. Trade that had formerly gone to Mormons now went to gentiles and resulted in less increase in Mormon pockets to pay tithes. The railroad—and the flood of gentiles it brought—spelled the end of Mormon isolation in northern Utah and was shaking Young’s kingdom to its financial and spiritual core. The closer Mormons were to the gentiles, physically and culturally, the less tithing they paid.¹⁰⁰ This syphoning away of Mormon profits curtailed the donation of funds used to finance the bringing of new converts from Europe, and immigration slowed to a trickle. These factors, combined with burgeoning apostasy and other forms of attrition and apathy in church membership, meant that the pool of adult tithe payers and the collective funds that could be tithed were growing smaller. Meanwhile, the prolific Mormon marriage system produced more and more offspring, increasing the finances needed to meet the needs of the community. These Mormon children represented future tithe payers, but for now they constituted an immense drain on the whole economy. Thousands of Saints were leaving the church, especially in areas of high gentile population—like Salt Lake, Ogden, and Corrine—and in the gentile mining centers around Beaver City in southern Utah. According to many apostates, tithing was the chief reason they left the church. Codman maintained that the Priesthood’s continual clamoring for tithing would “eventually help to overthrow. . . Brigham Young’s influence” altogether.¹⁰¹

Pipe Springs figured prominently in Young’s strategy to isolate Mormons from newcomers and the encroaching United States, as well as in its role in building the St. George

¹⁰⁰ A. Milton Musser, Salt Lake City, to Brigham Young, January 28, 1871, BYP. Musser was “thoroughly convinced that the country people pay a more liberal tithing.”

¹⁰¹ Gentile travel-writer John Codman recorded meeting large numbers of these new apostates, including a woman named Collins whose home he visited. The former “Sister Collins” apologized “on the score of poverty” because of the meanness of her home, and because she had no shoes. But she assured Codman that her family was “better off now than when we was Mormons,” because “we have got clear of tithing, and that gives a little more money to us, instead of to old Brig.” Codman, *Mormon Country*, 63–64.

Temple. The cooperative stock raising operations Young designed for the Pipe Springs Ranch were a major component of his plan to economically isolate his people from the gentiles. The completion of St. George Temple fostered the Mormon endowment fraternity that further separated the Saints from gentiles.¹⁰² Called the Holy Order, the Anointed Quorum, or the Anointed Lodge by Joseph Smith, the Latter-day Saint endowment ordinance has similarities with Catholic and Eastern Orthodox royal and sacerdotal investiture rituals. The endowment fraternity was believed by Latter-day Saints to have been “restored” in its proper order by Joseph Smith and was a powerful bastion for separation.¹⁰³

“Glory to God and the Lamb”—The Church Stock Are Safe

While Joseph W. Young and Erastus Snow quibbled with the church president over the public hands consuming a few “four year old steers,” the southern Utah tithing herd at Pipe Springs was augmented by cattle from the north.¹⁰⁴ On December 14, 1870 Brigham Young sent a verbal message to the keeper of both the prophet’s private herds and the substantial church herds on Antelope Island and other Salt Lake Valley herd grounds, prodding him to move cattle

¹⁰² See Wilson Care McWilliams, *The Idea of Fraternity in America* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1973), especially 240.

¹⁰³ See David John Buerger, *The Mysteries of Godliness: A History of Mormon Temple Worship* (San Francisco: Smith Research Associates, 1994); Devery S. Anderson and Gary James Bergera, *Joseph Smith’s Quorum of the Anointed, 1842–1845* (Salt Lake City: Signature Books, 2005); Andrew F. Ehat, “Joseph Smith’s Introduction of Temple Ordinances and the 1844 Mormon Succession Question,” (thesis, Department of History, Brigham Young University, December 1981); James E. Talmage, *The House of the Lord: A Study of Holy Sanctuaries Ancient and Modern, Including Forty-Six Plates Illustrative of Modern Temples* (Salt Lake City: Deseret News for the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 1912); and Boyd K. Packer, *You May Claim the Blessings of The Holy Temple* (Salt Lake City: Bookcraft, 1980).

¹⁰⁴ Without greater access to church financial and tithing records and Young’s private financial records it is impossible to know how many were sent or to whom they belonged. These records certainly exist in the LDS Archives but have not been fully cataloged and are therefore not currently available for research.

from these ranges in the north to the safety of Pipe Springs in the south.¹⁰⁵ Young was especially interested in having the expensive bulls driven down to ensure the production of the highest quality calves as possible. With temples in St. George, Manti, and Logan then in contemplation, developing the high quality “temple stock” in his Canaan was a long-term enterprise.

Hiding church cattle from the federal government was a major reason for the establishment of Pipe Springs Ranch. In response to the US Internal Revenue Department’s repeated attempts to collect taxes on the general tithing, Young, his secretaries and attorneys, and Delegate Hooper engaged in a lively dispute with federal officials regarding Young’s personal and ecclesiastical taxes during the fall and early winter of 1870–1871. The tithing herds were of particular interest for confiscation to pay these back taxes and fines, as they were easier for the government to take than the carrots, cabbages, and chickens the Saints turned in as tithing. Grant appointed General J. Wilson Shaffer, a number-crunching former commissary general in the Union Army, as his “Reconstruction Governor” of Utah, to preside over the confiscation of church property.¹⁰⁶ Young was resolute that the feds were out of their constitutional bounds in trying to tax tithing donations as income, and he wrote to Daniel Wells that they had “no right to assess tithing property and I certainly shan’t pay the assessment and if they get anything they will have to find church property and get it out of that.”¹⁰⁷ The continued threat of “persecution

¹⁰⁵ Briant Stringham was the primary keeper of the church’s tithing stock from 1855 to his death from overexertion in caring for them in August 1871. He was known territory-wide as unsurpassed “lover of animals” who “recognized fine stock” and had a special interest breeding fine horses. See Bryant Stringham Hinckley et al., *Briant Stringham and His People: Containing Sketches of the Lives of Some Sixty-Five People Mostly Members of the Family of Briant Stringham, Utah Pioneer of July 24, 1847* (Salt Lake City: Sevens & Willis Press, 1849), especially 32, 53–57, 71, 79–83.

¹⁰⁶ “John Hanson Beadle,” in Henry M. Utley and Byron M. Cutcheon, *The Class of Sixty-One University of Michigan and Something About What “The Boys” Have Been Doing During Forty Years from 1861 to 1901* (Detroit: John Bornman & Son, 1902), 172–176; John Hanson Beadle, *Life in Utah: Or, the Mysteries and Crimes of Mormonism. Being an Exposé of the Secret Rites and Ceremonies of the Latter-day Saints with a Full and Authentic History of Polygamy and the Mormon Sect from its Origin to the Present Time* (Philadelphia: National Publishing Company, [1870]), 516–526, 117, 290, 453; and *Salt Lake Tribune*, January 23, 1873, 2, UDN.

¹⁰⁷ Brigham Young, St. George, to Daniel H. Wells, telegram, January 9, 1871, BYP.

through taxation” drove Young to lay plans to set up the Winsor Castle Stock Growing Company as an ostensible privately owned company in which animals actually belonging to the church could be sheltered. This tactic of mixing up church and private stock ownership to shield them from taxation or confiscation had worked for church leaders in the past.

Young felt the threat of this “persecution through taxation” and made another unprecedented defensive move. At the October 1870 General Conference, Brigham Young resigned from his position of “Trustee in Trust,” a position almost always held by the president of the church. Young represented his resignation as “solely” because of his age, his need for “relaxation,” as well as his desire to free up time “for preaching.” But that his resignation as trustee in trust occurred at the very height of his struggle with the Internal Revenue Department over taxing church property as personal property is more than coincidence. Once Young resigned as trustee in trust, and once northern cattle had been redirected to Pipe Springs and other out-of-the-way places to prohibit their confiscation by federal tax officers, the commissioner of the Internal Revenue Department ruled to put a temporary stay on the taxing of Mormon tithing.¹⁰⁸ The government determined it could not legally tax donations. As early as January 12, 1871, news of this decision reached St. George, and Charles L. Walker wrote the following in his diary: “Mr. Pleasanton of the Internal Revenue Department decided that our church was not obliged to pay taxes on our tithes and church Property. This is quite a severe blow to our enemies who tho[ugh]t to catch us on this point and bring trouble upon [u]s, but the Lord has overruled it for good, and our foes are foil[e]d. Glory to God and the Lamb.”¹⁰⁹ Young assured the Saints

¹⁰⁸ “I learn by telegraph the collection of initial revenue tax on me as T in T. [Trustee in Trust] is postponed for 80 days. If there should be legislation or action on this case I wish Bro Hooper to appeal it to the Secretary of the Interior.” Brigham Young, St. George, to Hon. Daniel H. Wells, 14 December 1870, BYP.

¹⁰⁹ Charles Walker, *Diary*, 1:326.

that despite his resignation as trustee in trust, in “my position as president of the church . . . I shall still exercise supervision over business, ecclesiastical and secular, leaving the minutiae to younger men.” In the end his resignation as trustee in trust was simply a change in official title designed to protect church property. Young, as always, was still fully in charge of the Mormon financial kingdom.¹¹⁰

The Muddy Settlers and Final Construction of Pipe Springs

A number of factors worked to slow construction on Brigham’s fort at Pipe Springs. The pressing crisis of removing and resettling the saints from the Muddy, the hurried collection of tithing stock at Pipe Springs to keep it out of the hands of federal tax collectors, and the herding, branding, and other “cowboying” duties that went with such a large herd all seriously delayed work on the fort. In addition, the project required laborers to open new roads to facilitate the Muddy-Long Valley traffic, work on the Young Brothers’ sawmill, and the pressing need to build shelters and plant crops in Moccasin and Long Valley. Sometime in April, the Skutumpah sawmill broke down and “came to a dead halt.”¹¹¹ To help feed newcomers, Anson Winsor commenced milking 200 head of “wild” range cattle at the construction site, which similarly slowed the work of fort building.¹¹² Twelve-year-old Maria Janette Averett, daughter of

¹¹⁰ “Brigham Speaks for Himself,” *Chicago Times*, 14 April 1873, 7, MANI.

¹¹¹ Lee, *Chronicle*, 2:159.

¹¹² When the Mormons came to Utah they brought with them thousands of “good milking cows largely of Shorthorn blood” from Illinois. For years Utah’s beef cattle were largely descended from these “valuable milch cows,” whose penchant for producing milk made them less than ideal beef stock. As late as the 1880s Mormon shorthorn beef cows were known for losing “parts of their udders from having more milk than their calves could take, and they were such persistent milkers that they were apt to go into winter too thin in flesh” to multiply as quickly as stockier beef breeds. Small operators dealt with this problem by milking the cows and selling their offspring as beef. Mormon shorthorn stock spread throughout the West and with careful interbreeding produced high quality Hereford herds that revolutionized the Western stock industry. Anson Winsor used Texas longhorn bulls descended from

stonemason Elijah Averett, remembered wading through manure and mud that spring to milk Winsor's cows.¹¹³

By March 1, 1871, several Muddy settlers were arriving in Long Valley, many traveling by way of Pipe Springs. Sometime in February, John R. Young left Pipe with mule teams and wagons to take part in the massive volunteer effort to bring the Muddy saints away from their homes. He personally "piloted" a contingent of "about thirty men with their families" from the Muddy to Pipe Springs, building roads and bridges as they went. It seems Young used the promise of labor at Winsor Castle, or on the barns and sheds his brother had also been commissioned to build at Moccasin, to entice a company of Muddyites "under Louis Allen" to locate "temporarily at Pipe Springs and Moccasin." In addition to working on the fort, they were employed working a twenty-mile-long road from Pipe to Long Valley to facilitate bringing lumber to Pipe Springs and Moccasin from the sawmill Joseph W. and John R. Young hoped to construct in a "good stand of timber" some five miles east of the deserted Long Valley settlement of Winsor. As yet, however, the Young brothers were unable to finance the building of their mill.¹¹⁴

those brought to Utah by gentile immigrants slain in the Mountain Meadows Massacre to improve the beef strain of the church's largely shorthorn tithing herd. See Alvin H. Sanders, *The Story of the Herefords: An Account of the Origin and Development of the Breed in Herefordshire, A Sketch of its Early Introduction into the United States and Canada, and Subsequent Rise to Popularity in the Western Cattle Trade, with Sundry Notes on the Management of Breeding Herds* (Chicago: The Breeder's Gazette, 1914), especially 668–669, GB; and *Salt Lake Tribune*, 29 July 1872, 2, UDN. A number of Winsor family histories speak of the "wild" range cows milked at Pipe Springs. The number of these animals varied between 80 and 200. A grandson of Anson Winsor told a family story in which Brigham Young asked his grandfather why he was milking a range cow using "such a small container." When the cow kicked the bucket and splashed milk all over the prophet, Winsor said "This is why we milk in such small containers." See *Salt Lake Tribune*, July 29, 1872, 2, UDN; "A Short Sketch of the Life of A. P. Winsor, Jr., PSLA, VF, FH, Winsor; Luther M. Winsor, "Sketch of the Life of Anson Perry Winsor," 2, PSLA, VF, FH, Winsor; and "Interview of Luther M. Winsor, Pipe Springs, July 4, 1965," 2–3, PSLA, VF, FH, Winsor.

¹¹³ Blanch Shumway Hansen, "Maria Janette Averett Shumway," PSLA, VF, FH, Averett.

¹¹⁴ Harriet Maria Taggart Goodrich, "Autobiography of Harriet Maria Taggart Goodrich," 3–4, PSLA, VF no. 4, "Unassociated Histories"; John R. Young, *Memoirs*, 148; and Jenson, *Encyclopedic History of the Church*, 522.

In the meantime John R. acted as a mediator between the Pipe Springs construction project and the new Long Valley settlers. After former Muddy settlers George Goodrich and Isaiah Bowers and their two families had moved into a doorless dugout built into the side of a hill in Long Valley, they were hired to cut lumber with a two-man whip saw “for a man at Pipe Springs.” By this means, their families “secured some flour and beans.” Though it was not cash pay, their families received it gratefully, as their food supply otherwise consisted only of “a little bran and flour.” Reduced to abject poverty, Goodrich was clothed in a pair of trousers his wife made from old flour sacks. An endowed Mormon, Goodrich was obliged to go without temple garments as he could not afford to replace the worn-out ones. Goodrich’s wife remembered Joseph W. Young wanted her husband to remain and help him build and run his Long Valley sawmill but he “could not promise us any bread stuff in pay, so when our present supply of food was exhausted it was necessary for us to leave.”¹¹⁵

On April 15, 1871, Brigham Young’s plans for the St. George Temple were made public in a meeting of the St. George Stake School of the Prophets. “A thrill of joy seemed to pass over the assembly [sic] of Elders present,” wrote Charles Walker. With eager anticipation he recorded the general plan announced for the structure in his diary: “It is to be built of Stone plastered inside and out. The length 196 feet, width 142, and 80 feet high, two stories with a large Hall in each story with room on each side, and a baptismal font in the basement. Br Brigham and Geo A Smith will be down next October to comence the work and give directions concerning its erection &c.”¹¹⁶ Excitement about the coming temple shifted focus away from Brigham’s Bastion at Pipe Springs as preaching throughout southern Utah turned from fort

¹¹⁵ Harriet Maria Taggart Goodrich, “Autobiography of Harriet Maria Taggart Goodrich,” 3–4; and “Orderville Historical Record, 1873–1911,” 224, CHL, LR 6543/29.

¹¹⁶ Charles Walker, *Diary*, 1:329.

building to tithe paying, temple building, and the “domestic economy” that building the Temple would require of the entire southern Utah community. Since Young had fostered the notion that Winsor Castle’s primary purpose was to protect stock from Navajo raids, Hamblin’s triumphant reports of his successful Ft. Defiance treaty and his peace accords with formerly hostile Native Americans caused some Mormons to question the fort’s necessity. Grasshoppers devastated Utah crops in 1870 and again in 1871, and the resulting shortage of vegetables, grains, and fruits added to the shortage of beef caused by the amassing of tithing herds at Pipe Springs to create a general famine in the south. Tithing offices throughout the territory were nearly empty. Settlers throughout Dixie, Pipe Springs, Moccasin, Long Valley, and Kanab headed north in great numbers to work for foodstuffs, depleting laborers needed for Pipe Springs.¹¹⁷

Only Young’s reaction to occasional continued threats of “War on the Mormons” from the White House, Congress, the War Department, the office of Utah’s governor, and the national press prodded the few Saints remaining at Pipe Springs to move ahead with their castle. During most of 1871, it seems that the bulk of the rock work was done by Elijah Averett, Anson Winsor, John R. Young, and their dependents, augmented by occasional “labor tithers” who came and went. The walls rose at an exasperatingly slow pace. A son of Elijah Averett indicated the rock work was not finished until April 1872, and other sources conclusively demonstrate that Elijah was still serving as “stone mason” as late as the end of August of that year. The Young brothers continued to experience difficulties in getting their mill financed and built. The Lee-Stewart sawmill at Skutumpah experienced repeated mechanical problems, and while it sometimes

¹¹⁷ A. Milton Musser, Salt Lake City, to Prest. B. Young, 28 January 1871, BYP; Abram Hatch, Heber City, to President B. Young, 29 March 1871, BYP; Joseph W. Young, St. George, to Pres. B. Young, 1 May 1871, BYP; Telegram of Erastus Snow, Toquerville, to His Excellency Gov Woods, Salt Lake City, 13 September [1871], BYP; Erastus Snow, St. George, to Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, 4 October 1871, BYC;

produced lumber, most of it was required for Kanab and Long Valley residences. Meanwhile, hand-powered whip saws in Long Valley provided lumber for Winsor Castle and other building projects in the Kanab country.¹¹⁸

Anticipating a need for a telegraph line, Young pushed a 100-mile extension with “great urgency,” bringing the total length of his network to 600 miles. After poles were installed, ox teams stretched the wire, which was attached to insulators specially designed to fit southern Utah’s home grown juniper and pinion telegraph poles. The Native Americans called the mysterious contraption arising over the Pipe Springs corridor “the singing wires.” St. George stake president Joseph W. Young was responsible for the Deseret Telegraph Line’s arrival at Pipe. The poles were put up through tithing labor by those able and willing to pay it, or by other freewill donation, while minimal payments were made out of tithing office funds to others who provided labor, teams, and wagons “for hire.” Kanab teenager Zadok Judd, Jr. wrote, “I drove a four-mule team belonging to Bishop Levi Stewart, going with my mules to Toquerville with Jacob Hamblin to get a load of telegraph wire for the line. I helped to set the poles also. They were set by donation, each family or man was asked to raise so many poles according to his allotment. The church sponsored [*sic*] the whole thing.”¹¹⁹

¹¹⁸ The site for the Young Brothers Sawmill apparently was not located until the late spring of 1871. To help pay for it, Joseph W. suggested that his brother John R. sell his house in Washington, Utah, to their Uncle Brigham for \$1500.00. Their price would be “such pay as will hire michanics [*sic*]” to build and work the mill. They requested payment in the form of “flour, beef, Store pay, stock, [and] orders on the [Washington Cotton] factory.” The mill was not actually up and running until sometime in or just before August 1872, nearly half a year after the rock work was finished on Winsor Castle. Lumber needed for Winsor Castle was apparently provided by hand-operated whip saws and the Lee-Stewart Sawmill until the Young Brothers Sawmill began production. Once it did, Pipe was almost immediately roofed and the interior finished. A campfire left by careless shepherders burned the Young mill to the ground sometime between 1876 and 1881. Joseph W. Young, St. George, to Pres. B. Young, June 2, 1871; “Orderville Historical Record, 1873–1911,” 224, CHL; and J. W. Jackson, Winsor Castle, Kane Co., U. T., to Prest. Brigham Young, August 25, 1872, BYP.

¹¹⁹ *Deseret News*, July 5, 1871, 1, UDN; *MS*, 33 (July 18, 1871): 462, and 33 (December 12, 1871): 799; Erastus Snow, St. George, to Prest. Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, October 4, 1871, BYP; Joseph W. Young, St. George, to Prest. B. Young, Salt Lake City, October 20, 1871, BYP; James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:101–104; Brigham Young, St. George, to Elder George Reynolds, December 11, 1871, in JH, December 11, 1871, 1; “A

Both the famine and the expansion of the telegraph line slowed construction on Winsor Castle. Tithing labor which could have gone to the fort went to the telegraph line instead, while crop failure reduced the tithing produce that financed “public works” projects like Winsor Castle and the St. George Tabernacle and forced hundreds of laborers from Washington and Kane Counties had to head north to find jobs. Snow complained that “the quarrymen, stone-cutters, masons, tenders, carpenters, rock-haulers, lumbermen and others to the number of about fifty families engaged upon our Tabernacle have consumed most of the Tithing, as fast as it could be collected in Washington and Kane Counties and we have now [had] to begin to haul [tithing produce] from Beaver and Iron [counties]” to feed them. Snow reported that he had called upon Beaver County tithing officers “to the amount of from 1500 to 2000 dollars in stock and grain in making payments on the Telegraph line, though Joseph and I, have done the best we could to accomplish it with the [paltry] class of pay, named in your instructions.” Everyone was pinched by the telegraph expansion project. Snow wrote that “all my own boys and teams have been and still are engaged upon [the telegraph line], without as yet receiving scarcely anything” for their efforts.¹²⁰ Joseph W. flat out asked for compensation for his work erecting the line. “I realize that your time and thoughts are very much occupied at the present time,” he wrote to Brigham Young about the time he learned his uncle was under arrest for unlawful cohabitation, “therefore I briefly say that you have my warmest sympathy and prayers for your final triumph over all your enemies and we hope to see you in this peaceful city before many weeks. I am very much in need of a good two horse wagon; I have done work for Deseret Telegraph Co to the amount of

Historical Story of the Building of Washington County, the Part Accomplished by Tradesmen and the Buildings Erected,” 4, WCL; and Esther Brow Judd, “The Descendants of Thomas Judd,” 9, HL.

¹²⁰ Erastus Snow, St. George, to Prest. Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, October 4, 1871, BYP.

between 4 and 500 dollars and if you could bring me one when you come down, you would confer a very great favor upon me.”¹²¹

“Indian Depredations at Kanab” and National Politics

Around September 8, 1871, a series of events commenced in Kanab that refocused some of the southern Saints on the need to expedite Winsor Castle as a defense against the Navajo. Erastus Snow estimated that “three-fifths of the men of Kanab had gone North” and that the rest were “in a scattered condition” working on the telegraph line when a trading party of “79 Navajo Warriors” lead by “thirteen chiefs” descended upon Kanab. This initial party was the harbinger of others, for according to one eyewitness, over the next several days 500 Navajo assembled at Kanab’s frontier fort. Among them was Patnish, leader of the raiding party that had killed James Whitmore and Robert McIntyre at Pipe Springs five years before. This time, this “very ugly chief came to Kanab [accompanied by] his band [of] 129 renegade Utes, Navajoes and Shivets.” Only twenty Mormon men and boys could be mustered to protect over a hundred women and children. This unusual visit started as a trading venture to make good on Hamblin’s invitation at Ft. Defiance for Navajo to come “to his home” at Kanab and exchange blankets for Mormon horses.¹²² Most of the Navajo showed up on foot, laden with piles of colorful “*palcladdi*” or Navajo Blankets which they had carried on their backs for hundreds of miles. The best of these

¹²¹ Jos. W. Young, St. George, to President Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, October 20, 1871, BYP.

¹²² James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:108–113; *Deseret News*, September 20, 1871, 8, UDN; Moses Franklin Farnsworth, “Journal of Moses Franklin Farnsworth,” 20–22, HL; “Visit of the Chiefs to Kanab,” minutes of council with Navajo, Kanab, September 9, 1871, 1–3, James G. Bleak Papers, CHL, Ms 10587; James G. Bleak, “Condensed History of What is Known as Southern Utah,” unpaginated, in ms5730, b3, f2, CHL; Julius S. Dalley, “Fort Kanab,” 3–4; Elsie Carroll, *History of Kane County*, 26–30; and Adonis Robinson, *History of Kane County*, 31–34.

blankets had taken female weavers “seventy days [apiece] to make,” “with implements of the rudest construction.” The husbands of these native artisans expected to exchange the finest of the blankets for “a mare and a colt” each.¹²³ Anticipating the visit for months, Hamblin had begged Brigham Young to send forty or fifty horses from the tithing herds on Antelope Island in the Great Salt Lake to be traded for Navajo blankets, which in turn could be sold for a profit in Utah’s tithing offices and cooperative stores. Jacob convinced Young that not a cent would be lost, while the exchange would be seen by the Navajo as a significant overture toward peace. Anxious to purchase peace after six seasons of raiding, Young acquiesced, and the horses were sent from the north and were already grazing on the Pipe Springs range when the Navajo arrived at Kanab.¹²⁴

Expecting only a handful of traders, Apostle Snow, Bishop Stewart, and Indian missionaries Jacob Hamblin and Ira Hatch were on hand to welcome the first wave of Navajo to Kanab. They opened the trading exchange by holding peace talks with about a dozen major chieftains. The parley was held in Kanab’s makeshift fort and the Oriba Chief Tuba, whom Hamblin had brought home from the Hopi villages when he returned from Fort Defiance in

¹²³ Francis M. Bishop of the Powell Expedition who encountered these very people at the Colorado fords “coming over to the settlements to trade their wares for horses,” described that the Navajo manufactured three varieties of these blankets. The first were saddle blankets, “generally about four feet long and two and a half to three feet wide, and woven in various designs of different colored wool.” The second, worn by women, were “about a third larger” than the saddle blanket. Bishop described these blankets as “so tightly woven as to be completely waterproof, the hardest rains failing to penetrate or soak through them.” F. M. Bishop, Colorado River Ex., Camp 94, Kanab, Utah, to “Dear Pantagraph,” February 1872. in *The Pantagraph* (Bloomington, Il), March 27, 1872, 2, NPC.

¹²⁴ For some time “church horses” from the tithing herds on Antelope Island had been key to Hamblin’s plan “to cultivate the olive branch. . . we planted at Fort Defiance.” Jacob Hamblin, Kanab, to Prest. Brigham Young, February 11 and March 20, 1871, BYP; Elsie Carroll, *History of Kane County*, 29; and Adonis Robinson, *History of Kane County*, 33. In the Latter-day Saint community the church’s “island-bred” horses were famous for “their fleetness, sureness of foot, and their endurance and style.” They were unbroken “wild” horses of excellent stock. However, if sold anywhere near the Great Salt Lake, “whenever a favorable opportunity presented itself, they would take the nearest cut to the island, swimming the lake wherever they happened to come to it, and kept going until they reached their destination.” This obviously made them hard to sell locally and made them perfect to “unload” on the Navajo. There were reportedly “about five hundred head” on the Island in 1871. Bryant Stringham Hinckley et al., *Briant Stringham and His People*, 54–55.

November 1870, acted as interpreter.¹²⁵ The minutes of these deliberations were dated September 9, 1871. The Navajo chiefs represented bands the Mormons knew to have participated in the raids on their herds, and their spokesman, a headman named Ketchene, admitted that until that very day they considered the Latter-day Saints their “enemies.” In keeping with the Ft. Defiance Treaty, one of the chiefs showed Erastus Snow a “pass” from their government agent granting them permission to visit Utah. Snow accepted the pass and commenced the talks by saying “we are glad to see you come among us as friends, for several of [your] men ha[ve] come for several winters past to steal our cattle & horses as wolves, but now we are glad to meet as brothers to hear the good talk you have to tell us.” A chieftain named Ketchene did most of the speaking for the Navajo and Apostle Snow spoke for the Mormons, stating “Brigham Young was the head chief of the Mormons, and he & all the other [Mormon] chiefs, lov’d Peace and talked with the Lord, and wish’d to live in peace [with the Navajo]” Ketchene responded that “He wanted to be as Brothers and as sons among us, . . . he wanted it to be so that if one of them came over to us he could do so in safety, and that we could do the same in their country, [and that] we might let our stock run at large [and] they would not molest it or us[.]” The Navajo “wanted to forget the past and be Brothers & friends” and “The council Broke up with the usual Token of the Covenant[,] an Indian Embrace. The whole Company being well satisfied[.]”¹²⁶

On the surface all appeared well, but several hundred additional Navajo arrived after the peace talks were finished. Some were hostile and wanted to take Mormon horses without paying for them, as reimbursement for the lives of sons and brothers the settlers had killed while defending their stock. A *Deseret News* report of what happened next stated that “the day after

¹²⁵ “Visit of the Chiefs to Kanab,” 1–3.

¹²⁶ “Visit of the Chiefs to Kanab,” 1–3.

Brother Snow left, the Navajo unmasked themselves and levied a black mail” demanding “70 horses and 17 beeves” as a free gift to buy peace. Patnish, who had made similar demands before, seemed to be at the heart of this change in policy. Bishop Stewart felt the Navajo demand “was too heavy on his small settlement” and along with Jacob Hamblin, Ira Hatch, and interpreter Tuba negotiated again with the Diné leaders, this time to prevent an attack.¹²⁷

According to one account, the Navajo “thought Jacob had deceived them” for he had promised them horses “but no horses were in sight.” They “grew haughty in their demeanor” and refused “to smoke the pipe of peace and trouble seemed imminent.”¹²⁸ Moses F. Farnsworth, clerk and historian of the Kanab Ward later wrote that the unjust demands of the Native Americans were talked over, but the chieftains “refused to listen to reason, and for hours the thing lay in the balance, whether we would have to fight them to the death or not, for [the gathered Navajo] were 10 or more to one, of us.” Both Jacob Hamblin and Ira Hatch, “knew what the result might be, and that there was just cause for apprehension[.]” Farnsworth continued that when the council broke up that afternoon with no resolution the Navajo threateningly “gathered their guns” and went to the top of a hill overlooking the fort “and rode around in circles and fired off their guns [and] whooped as only Indians can whoop.” Taking stock of the situation, the few Latter-day Saint males on hand gathered their families in four large houses inside the fort and bolted the

¹²⁷ *Deseret News*, September 20, 1871, 8, UDN; *Salt Lake Herald*, 24 September 1871, UDN; James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:111–113; Farnsworth, “Journal of Moses Franklin Farnsworth,” 20–22; Julius S. Dalley, “Fort Kanab,” 3–4; Elsie Carroll, *History of Kane County*, 26–30; and Adonis Robinson, *History of Kane County*, 31–34. The *Salt Lake Herald* reported that “the visitors made a demand for eighty horses, some beeves, &c., for which they expressed themselves willing to give one blanket for each, and if they were not brought forward, why they had brought lariats and bridles and they would [simply] help themselves.”

¹²⁸ *Kane County Standard*, April 18, 1930, 1, 8, UDN. While Ira Hatch attempted to reason with the irate Navajo a leader “walked up and jerked Ira’s hat from his head and replaced it with his own shabby hat, placing Ira’s almost new felt on his own head.” Fearing that quibbling over the hat “would probably have brought on a massacre as the Indians greatly outnumbered the whites,” Ira simply accepted the trade.

doors.¹²⁹ At 10:30 p.m. Bishop Stewart directed a pair of teenaged expressmen to slip off to Pipe Springs and the Long Valley settlements to call on their neighbors for assistance. One of the riders was instructed to take word of their predicament to St. George in an effort to officially obtain Nauvoo Legion support by notifying General Erastus Snow. Fifteen years old at the time, Zadok Judd, Jr. reported that he and a companion rode to Pipe Springs in the dark, called on “the settlement” there for aid, and then split up, Judd riding to Long Valley as his counterpart rode on toward Tokerville, the site of the nearest operating telegraph office. Judd found manpower sparse both at Pipe and Long Valley, but riders left for Kanab at once and some arrived at the besieged fort before the sun came up the next morning. Years later, Judd recalled that “a number of men . . . came down the canyon one at a time and rode into the east gate of the fort, dismounted and led their horses out the west gate into the willows of the creek, keeping out of sight of the Indians and then [rode] back down the canyon again riding into the east gate of the fort [again, repeatedly] making a complete circle. In this way they gave the impression of many men coming in and thereby bluffed the Indians and kept them from attacking the fort.” These reinforcements came from Long Valley, Upper Kanab, the Skutumpah sawmill, and the construction site at Pipe Springs.¹³⁰

Upon receiving the dispatch from Bishop Levi Stewart stating “that Navajo, in talk today, threw off [their] friendly mask and demanded seventy horses, seventeen beeves and other smaller things,” or they will commence hostilities immediately, Erastus Snow telegraphed Governor Woods for permission to mobilize Mormon troops to protect the citizens of Kanab.¹³¹

¹²⁹ Farnsworth, “Journal of Moses Franklin Farnsworth,” 21.

¹³⁰ Esther Judd, “Descendants of Thomas Judd,” 9; James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:112; and *Salt Lake Herald*, September 24, 1871, UDN.

¹³¹ James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:112; and *Deseret News*, September 20, 1871, 8, UDN.

The request tested the government's resolve to enforce the year-old proclamations outlawing the Nauvoo Legion and forbidding the Latter-day Saints to bear arms "for any purpose" and provoked another symbolic battle in the "long contested [war] between the ex-Governor [Brigham Young], and the real Governor."¹³² A determined anti-Mormon, Governor Woods, in tandem with Chief Justice McKean, ignored Snow's telegram out of his determination not to legitimize the outlawed Nauvoo Legion for any reason and because he needed his troops at Ft. Douglas to deal with expected turbulence at the impending arrest of Brigham Young. Troops at Ft. Douglas were primarily infantry, and the few horses available for the cavalry units stationed there had just been "condemned" or declared unfit for service. For three days, Snow waited for the governor's response, repeatedly sending follow-up telegrams to be sure Woods had received his original message. At last the St. George telegraph operator received the governor's rebuff: "Governor Woods refuses to give an answer, or any reason" for his silence. The governor, the receiving telegraph operator was sternly told, "will do as he pleases about it and will not answer."¹³³

As they had throughout the duration of the Black Hawk and Navajo Wars, church leaders were forced to take extra-legal military action, and General Snow had already dispatched James Andrus and a Nauvoo Legion force of fifty men from the Virgin River settlements to Kanab before he actually wired Governor Woods for permission.¹³⁴ When Captain Andrus and his

¹³² Erastus Snow, Tokerville, to His Excellency Gov Woods, Salt Lake City, telegram, September 13, [1871], BYP; and James Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Mission," 2:111–112. When Snow sent his request to mobilize Mormon troops, beside his signature he listed the title "Brigadier General Commanding," a reference to his position as commander of the St. George Military District of the outlawed church militia. This insulted the Governor. "The Insult to Our Governor," in *Salt Lake Tribune*, 16 November 1871, 2, UDN. The military title is left off the copy of the telegram in James Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Mission," 2:111.

¹³³ James Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Mission," 2:111; and "St George [Deseret Telegraph] office 16 [September 1871]," immediately following telegram of Erastus Snow, Tokerville, to His Excellency Gov Woods, Salt Lake City, September 13, [1871], BYP.

¹³⁴ James Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Mission," 2:112.

Virgin River soldiers made their appearance, the Navajo “calmed down.” Given native notions of vengeance, however, the situation remained dangerous precisely because Andrus and his “Navajo fighters” were present. According to later accounts, the natives held a council of war while Hamblin secretly sent for the tithing horses at Pipe. At a crucial moment “a dust appeared in the south.” It was the horses coming around the point. The Native Americans, seeing the horses coming, broke up their council and seemed satisfied. Moses Farnsworth reported that the Church Island horses that Jacob Hamblin had pastured at Pipe were driven to Kanab and placed in a large corral for the Navajo to “purchase.” Still grossly outnumbering the Mormons, the Navajo named their own prices for the animals. Farnsworth reported that “an Indian would . . . take his lariat and catch a horse . . . [and] throw down a pile of blankets” and tersely proclaim “what he proposed to give.” Because they had no legal authority to act, Andrus and his men simply watched this “one sided” transaction. In no time at all the horses had been led away and “the corral was a big pile of blankets.” Meanwhile the Navajo helped themselves to the few squashes and ears of corn the grasshoppers had spared in Kanab’s decimated gardens and fields. Symbolic of the nature of the trade, “the chief wore Ira’s hat away when he left.”

Young and Snow got full reports of the “trading” in Kanab,¹³⁵ and Patnish, the Pipe Springs murderer, was chased away by a peace-chief named War Eagle. According to one account, “Old Patnish never dared to come back as he was fearful of losing his scalp. He was the man that led the band that murdered Mr. James M. Whitmore and Robert McIntire at Pipe Springs Jan, 8, 1866, and he felt that venge[a]nce was on his track.”¹³⁶ Without using the term “Nauvoo Legion,” on September 30 Brigham Young ordered Erastus Snow to “put a good file of

¹³⁵ “Indian Depredations at Kanab,” *Deseret News*, September 20, 1871, 8, UDN; and Jacob Hamblin, Kanab, to “Bro Erastus [Snow],” September 13, 1871, BYP.

¹³⁶ Farnsworth, “Journal of Moses Franklin Farnsworth,” 21–22.

men at Pipe Springs, Kanab and Pah-reer through this moon, to watch the Navajo till their raiding season is past.”¹³⁷ The Mormon troops stationed at Pipe were to use the springs’ natural choke point to keep unauthorized Navajo from traveling further west. Meanwhile, Hamblin arranged for sixteen Navajo to visit St. George in hopes of impressing them with the “advantages of civilization.” He also accompanied a large contingent of Diné on a trading visit to Ute living on the Sevier River to ensure that the Navajo did not steal any Latter-day Saint stock while in Utah. As he travelled, Hamblin sought out locations on the Navajo Trail to central Utah on which he could locate strategic villages to block future Navajo incursions.¹³⁸ But the Navajo War was essentially over.

¹³⁷ Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, to E. Snow and D. D. McArthur, telegram, September 30, [1871], in James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:113.

¹³⁸ Jacob Hamblin, Kanab, to “Bro Erastus [Snow],” September 13, 1871, BYP; and variation in James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:110–11; and Ira Hatch, Toquerville, Erastus Snow, September 16, 1871, in James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:112–113.

Chapter 7

Putting Pipe Springs on the Map

One of the first gentiles to grasp the strategic significance of the red rock country straddling the Utah-Arizona line to the survival of Young's entire Latter-day Saint empire was Utah's Territorial Governor George L. Woods. From almost as early as his appointment in January 1871, Woods had petitioned Ulysses S. Grant, Secretary of War Belknap, and the nation's highest military officers to establish a military post at St. George or Beaver to gain control of this Mormon-dominated bastion, protected by untold profusions of natural rock fortresses. "The Mormons are all powerful in that portion of the Territory," Governor Woods wrote President Grant in October 1871, "there being but few 'Gentile' Miners down there, and the whole power of the Church is used to secret persons charged with crime." Though the governor did not specifically reference the unfinished Winsor Castle in his letter, he did mention Young's preparations "for resistance" in the larger southern Utah desert bastion the Mormon prophet planned to use as a remote "place of refuge" for "criminals." He correctly articulated that the Mormons planned to use the "Valley" in which both Kanab and Pipe Springs lay "to secret persons charged with crime." This seems to indicate that he knew of the forts going up Pipe Springs and Kanab. Certainly Governor Woods was aware of Young's determination to see "that no arrests shall be made." With formal arrest warrants about to be served on Brigham Young, Daniel H. Wells, and other Mormon "criminals" in Salt Lake City, Woods feared they would

“take refuge” in Kanab and “resist” arrest and begged Grant to establish a military base in the heart of Brigham’s red rock bastion.¹

Thus, at least by the middle of October 1871, Grant understood the broad outlines of Young’s plan to use the Pipe Springs and Kanab country as a refuge to shelter Mormon criminals. Grant probably had the information even earlier; during the summer of 1871, Woods indicated that he recommended to Generals Augur and Sheridan that a major United States military post be erected in or near Brigham’s fortified retreat to aid in the prosecution of Young and others responsible for the Mountain Meadows Massacre. Major John Wesley Powell’s detailed map of that very country may also have alerted Grant to the Mormon build-up around Kanab and Pipe much earlier, but Governor Woods’ October 1871 letter made clear the need to expedite the mapping of Young’s southern bastion and to build US fortifications. The end result was the establishment of a new federal military installation in southern Utah to be built at Beaver, “about one hundred miles east [of] Knob [Kanab]—the Gibraltar of church fel[on]s—where there are one hundred and twenty men thoroughly armed and where the leaders of [the Mountain Meadows] massacre have taken refuge.”² In time, the new US military base was

¹ Governor George L. Woods, Executive Office, Salt Lake City, Utah Territory, to His Excellency, U. S. Grant President, October 2, 1871, in NA, Microfilm Publications Microcopy no. 666, Letters Received by the Office of the Adjutant General (Main Series) 1871–1880, roll 32, 3774 AGO 1871. “Kanab[,] a remote settlement in the extreme South, exclusively Mormon is a place of refuge; they are prepared for resistance [*sic*] there, and declare that no arrests shall be made. In that Valley the most of the murderers of Mountain Meadow will take refuge and it will be useless for the Marshall, unattended with an efficient Military force, to attempt to take any of them into custody. For that reason, I suggest that we shall want at least one hundred mounted men to go to beaver [*sic*] in the latter part of December to assist the civil authorities in the execution of the law. All of the Federal Officials here, concur in its absolute necessi[ty.]”

² George L. Woods to U. S. Grant, October 2, 1871, and various correspondence in *Military Post, Beaver City, UT: Letter From the Secretary of War, Relative to An Appropriation for a Military Post Near the Town of Beaver City, Utah*, War Department, Washington, DC, May 6, 1872, in H. Exec. Doc. 285, 42nd Cong., 2d Sess.; and *Deseret News*, May 22, 1872, 9, UDN.

named “Ft. Cameron” after Colonel James Cameron, one of the first Union officers to be killed in the American Civil War, at the First Battle of Bull Run in July 1861.³

At least as early as the opening months of 1872, Grant’s Secretary of War, William W. Belknap, was contemplating erecting a major military post near Beaver City, southern Utah, some “200 miles from Salt Lake City.” Its purpose was to breach Young’s “Chinese Wall” in southern Utah and make it possible to prosecute the “Mormon criminals” Pipe Springs and Kanab were designed to protect.⁴ Akin to Young’s reason for fort building, the War Department announced that the new US fort in southern Utah was to be established “to guard against Indian forages.”⁵ The *Alexandria Gazette* (VA) leaked Secretary Belknap’s primary strategy when it announced that “in consequence of repeated [Mormon] massacres [of gentiles], the Secretary of War has recommended an appropriation for a military post near Beaver City, Southern Utah,” because witnesses “who were present at the Mountain Meadow massacre [*sic*] are prevented, by fear of losing their lives [at the hands of other Mormons], from giving evidence in relation to the slaughter, and state that if they receive protection from US soldiers that the leaders of the murders shall be brought to justice.”⁶ In March, General Philip Sheridan sent his brother Lt. Col. Michael V. Sheridan and Lt. Col. George A. Forsyth to southern Utah to select the actual site for this major US military instillation.⁷ On May 6, 1872, Secretary of War Belknap officially

³ David Detzer, *Donnybrook: The Battle of Bull Run, 1861* (Orlando, FL: Harcourt, 2004), 383–384; and Alexander Harris, *A Biographical History of Lancaster County: Being a History of Early Settlers and Eminent Men of the County* (Lancaster, PA: Elias Barr, 1872), 125–129.

⁴ See *Letter From the Secretary of War, Relative to An Appropriation for a Military Post near the town of Beaver*; and Beadle, J. H. *Polygamy; or, The Mysteries and Crimes of Mormonism* (Portland, Me.: E.E. Knowles, 1882), 498.

⁵ For example, see *Massachusetts Spy* (Worcester, MA), March 29, 1872, 1, GBC; and *Salt Lake Tribune*, March 12, 1872, 3, UDN.

⁶ *Alexandria Gazette* (Alexandria, VA), May 13, 1872, 2, GBC; and *New York Herald*, May 13, 1872, 3, GBC.

⁷ *Salt Lake Tribune*, March 12, 1872, 3, UDN; David Dixon, *Hero of Beecher Island: The Life and Military Career of George A. Forsyth* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1994), 98–101;

petitioned Congress for “an early appropriation of \$120,000 for the erection of a five company military post near the town of Beaver City, Utah Territory.” Meanwhile, the national press explained that in all of southern Utah “there are only 200 Gentiles, and that, to try the persons who committed the ‘Mountain Meadow Massacre’ will require an expensive post like this.” Newspapers across the country reported that “100 miles east of Beaver City. . . is Knob [Kanab],—a mountainous place,—where the leaders of the Mountain Meadow Massacre have hidden.”⁸

The Mormon journals minimized Native American trouble in the area and declared that “it would be a sheer waste of public money to appropriate \$120,000 for a military post at Beaver.”⁹ Before 1872 was over, however, Secretary of War Belknap published General EOC Ord’s suggestion that an additional “military station of two companies of cavalry” be constructed “at Saint George’s [*sic*] or Kanab, in Southern Utah, where the United States government and its flag are scarcely known.”¹⁰ Belknap also notified the commander-in-chief that Major John Wesley Powell had submitted a “preliminary report” of his “geological exploration” in this exact region and that Powell was continuing his field-work in the St. George, Pipe Springs, and Kanab area, creating a military map carefully determined by an astronomical baseline. Secretary of War Belknap assured President Grant that Powell’s exploration and mapping afforded valuable

⁸ George L. Woods to U. S. Grant, October 2, 1871; *Newport Daily News* (Newport, RI), May 15, 1872, 2, NPC; Powell, *Utah History Encyclopedia*, s.v. “Fort Cameron,” 197–198; Leonard J. Arrington and Thomas G. Alexander, “The Utah Military Frontier, 1872–1912: Forts Cameron, Thornburgh and Duchesne,” *UHQ* 32 (Fall 1964): 330–354; and *Chicago Daily Tribune*, May 22, 1872, 4, NPC. The fort was “to consist of commanding officer’s quarters, six sets company officers’ quarters, . . . five sets company barracks, hospital, subsistence store-house, quartermaster’s store, house, office building, guard-house, bake-house, cavalry stable, and quarter-master’s stables.”

⁹ *Alexandria Gazette*, May 14, 1872, 3, GBC; *Evening Post* (New York, NY), May 14, 1872, 3, GBC; and *Boston Traveler*, May 14, 1872, 2, GBC.

¹⁰ Civil War hero Brvt. Brigadier-General Edward Otho Cresap Ord was appointed to head up the Department of the Platte (which then included Utah) in December 1871. *Report of the Secretary of War, [1872] Being Part of the Message and Documents communicated to the Two Houses of Congress at the Beginning of the Third Session of the Forty-Second Congress* (Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 1872), 1:53–54.

information not only for mining and immigration, but also for such military operations as might be required in “Saint George’s [sic] or Kanab, in Southern Utah, where the United States Government and its flag are scarcely known.”¹¹

Mapping the Pipe Springs Region

Brigham Young had established a vigorous reconnaissance system that expanded throughout the remainder of his life. He constantly urged his scouts and explorers as well as his missionaries and Nauvoo Legion officers to make rough pencil and ink sketch-maps and written descriptions of the country they passed through. These he painstakingly studied and preserved. The Brigham Young Papers in the Church Archives and the Utah Territorial Militia Papers in the Utah State Archives contain scores of these primitive maps, which, despite their hasty and amateur production are rich testimony to an intense Latter-day Saint interest in the topography of the territory they were conquering. The first contemporary account we have of Mormons visiting Pipe Springs was Hamblin’s Moqui Mission visit of 1858, but the earliest maps on which the term “Pipe Spring” or “Pipe Springs” appear are two crude maps of an 1859 Hamblin missionary expedition from “Washington City to the Moquitch Indians” at Oraibi, Arizona. Both maps were sketched in February 1860 by Thomas Bullock, Brigham Young’s scribe and secretary. One was based on a descriptive letter written by Hamblin’s companion, M. J. Shelton, and the other was drawn up from the verbal report of Hamblin himself as he sat in Brigham Young’s office. Significantly, the term “Pipe Springs” was used on Bullock’s February 7, 1860, map based on Shelton’s letter, and “Pipe Spring” on Bullock’s February 21, 1860. map based on Hamblin’s

¹¹ *Report of the Secretary of War [1872]*, 1:53–54, 12–13.

dictation, showing the variance in the singular and plural usage of the name.¹² A third and much more detailed map covering the two routes Hamblin took from St. George to the Moqui villages around 1863 was sketched that year by John Steele, Hamblin's fellow missionary, and listed "Pipe Springs" in its plural form.¹³ Several Nauvoo Legion maps made during the Black Hawk War in the late 1860s encompassed Pipe Springs, including one made by an expedition under James Andrus, chasing the killers of Whitmore and McIntyre in March 1866. These maps were hand-drawn and primitive; Andrus and his adjutant, urged the First Presidency to "please remember that we are no map-makers and have no instruments [but] under the circumstances this is the best we can do." Young and his advisors poured over these maps, absorbed their details, and carefully stored them for future use. Mormon maps and the geographic and topographic information gathered on these and other trips through the Pipe Springs region were closely guarded and not available to gentiles.¹⁴

By 1869, newspaper editor Samuel Bowles, transcontinental travel companion of Vice President Shuyler Colfax, called for the mapping of what he called "the great mocking mystery of our [national] geography." The terra incognita he wanted explored was the northern part of Arizona, and the southern part of Utah and was traversed by the mighty Colorado and its labyrinthine canyons. Predating George Woods' strategic pronouncements by nearly two years,

¹² See Thos. Bullock, *Sketch of Route from Washington City to the Moquitch Indians*, 7 February 1860, scale 20 miles to one inch, compiled from M. J. Shelton's letter to George A. Smith, 13 Nov 1859, CHD, CR 100/310; and Thomas Bullock, *Route of Jacob Hamlin [sic] from Washington, to the Moquitch Indians Oct 1859*, 21 February 1860, from Hamblin's recollection that day, CHD, CR 100/310.

¹³ John Steele, *Sketch of route traversed by Jacob Hamblin's company from St. George, Utah, to Oraibi (Hopi) Indian villages in northern Arizona, November 1862 to January 1863*, 1863, CHL.

¹⁴ See TMR; James Andrus, Com[manding] Exped[i]tion, and A. P. Hardy, 1st Lieut[en]ant, Grafton, to Hon. Geo. A. Smith, April 3, 1866, and enclosed map, in JH, 3 April 1866, 1–2; Order no. 14, Brigade Head Quarters, Iron Military District, Nauvoo Legion, Erastus Snow, Brig. Genl. Comg., St. George, to Capt. James Andrus, August 15, 1866, in UTMR, 1543; and James Andrus and Franklin B. Woolley, St. George, to Brigadier General Erastus Snow, September 18, 1866, UTMR, 659.

Bowles viewed charting the “great blank” on either side of the Colorado River on contemporary government maps as key to solving the Mormon Problem. While mining and economic development was a major factor in launching the government geological surveys of the late 1860s and early 1870s, so too was the Mormon Problem. Considering what was at stake, Bowles asked his countrymen, “Is any other nation so ignorant of such a [strategically important] piece of itself?”¹⁵ Bowles was voicing a common national concern, and even before he articulated it, Congress was taking steps to become better acquainted with the little known lands “beyond the Hundreth Meridian”—which resulted in the great land surveys of John Wesley Powell, Clarence King, George M. Wheeler, and Ferdinand V. Hayden.¹⁶

The Second Powell Expedition

The Powell Survey’s second expedition is significant for its mapping of Brigham’s Bastion and interaction with Mormons and Native Americans along the Pipe Springs corridor. Plotting the Powell survey’s “Great Map” involved a process that was complex, technical and time consuming. But it produced a state-of-the-art map that was geographically precise and thus extremely valuable to both Mormon and gentile users. It required sophisticated and expensive cutting-edge instrumentation and the mathematical precision of the most up-to-date cartographical practices. The process was presided over by Powell himself, and his brother-in-law Almon H. Thompson, who were both university professors on their way to becoming noted

¹⁵ Bowles, Samuel. *Our New West; Records of Travel between the Mississippi River and the Pacific Ocean*. (New York: Arno Press, 1973), 500–501

¹⁶ See Dale L. Morgan, “The Exploration of the Colorado River and the High Plateaus of Utah by the Second Powell Expedition of 1871–72,” introduction, *UHQ* 16–17 (1848–1949): 1–9.

scientists. Both were willing to get their hands dirty with grueling and labor-intensive fieldwork that not only included the dangers of traversing the wild Colorado River, but also minutely exploring a country just emerging from an extended war. After arranging for Jacob Hamblin and other Mormons to drop off food and supplies at appointed spots on the Green and Colorado rivers, on May 22, 1871, Powell and ten employees embarked in three built-to-order hardwood rowboats near the present location of Green River, Wyoming. One man left the expedition almost as soon as it departed.¹⁷ Having gained a healthy respect for the ferocity of the Navajo while traveling across the reservation to Ft. Defiance with Jacob Hamblin in 1870, Powell presented each of his men with state-of-the-art repeating rifles and ample ammunition supply.¹⁸ All but two of the party were veterans of the Civil War and experienced gunmen, and Powell reported to the newspapers that should they encounter “bands of hostile Indians of the Navajos and Piute tribes, who [had] cut off members of [his] previous expeditions, they will be thoroughly armed and prepared to fight or pow-wow, as the case may be.”¹⁹ Powell and all but two of his men hailed from Illinois (the state that had driven the Mormons out of the United States and into the wilderness) and may have feared Mormon retribution for the death of Joseph Smith.²⁰ The Latter-day Saints collectively held Illinois responsible for the death of their first prophet and many reportedly made sacred covenants to avenge his blood.²¹ Considering the

¹⁷ The ten members who remained with the expedition were Major John W. Powell, Professor Almon H. Thompson, John F. Steward, Stephen V. Jones, E. O. Beaman, Frederick S. Dellenbaugh, Walter Clement Powell, Andrew J. Hatten, John K. Hillers, and Francis M. Bishop. See *UHQ* 15 (1947): 240. For general information on the expedition see “Biographical Sketches and Original Documents of the Second Powell Expedition of 1871–1872,” in *UHQ* 15 (1947), and *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949).

¹⁸ Clem Powell, a first cousin of the major, wrote that Powell equipped him with a Winchester breach loading “17 shooter” and “500 cartridges.” Apparently each man in the group was similarly equipped. See *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 259, 347–348.

¹⁹ *Quincy Daily Whig* (Quincy, IL), June 24, 1871, 3, GBC.

²⁰ Beaman, “Cañon of the Colorado,” 482.

²¹ Will Bagley, *Blood of the Prophets: Brigham Young and the Massacre at Mountain Meadows* (Norman, OK: University of Oklahoma Press, 2002), especially 17, 21, 37, 170.

lengthy string of mysterious gentile deaths at the hands of the Mormons, Powell's sizable group of Illinois non-Mormons traveling in Utah had more to worry about than the boiling rapids of the Green and Colorado rivers.²² Indeed, there were those then that held that the three men murdered by Shivwits after leaving Powell's 1869 expedition had really been "blood atoned" by angry Mormons simply because they were gentiles. It is sure there was enough bad feeling among certain Mormons to have perpetrated such a crime, though there is very little doubt, as Powell believed, that it was indeed the Shivwits that massacred his men in the shadow of the Mt. Dellenbaugh.²³

Congress placed Powell's expedition under the supervision of the Smithsonian Institution and its secretary, Joseph Henry. Henry and Powell expanded the purposes of the expedition far beyond the geographic exploration and mapping expedition which Congress had intended to a full-scale scientific tour de force designed to examine and document various aspects of geography, geology, paleogeography, botany, and ethnography. John Wesley Powell sought to manipulate every facet of his survey project to advance himself or those he cared for politically and financially. He named physical features after family members, friends, or important political allies whose favors he hoped to exploit in the future.²⁴

Near the end of August they reached the Old Spanish Trail crossing at Gunnison Ford, near modern day Green River, Utah.²⁵ Jacob Hamblin's brother, Fred, and son, Lyman, met them

²² For a contemporary account of these murders reflecting how many Americans felt about them, see Beadle, *Life in Utah: Or, the Mysteries and Crimes of Mormonism*.

²³ Wesley P. Larsen, "The 'Letter': or, Were the Powell Men Really Killed by Indians?" in *Canyon Legacy: A Journal of the Dan O'Laurie Museum—Moab, Utah* 17 (Spring 1993): 12–19.

²⁴ *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 176.

²⁵ E. O. Beaman wrote that before the murder of U. S. Government Explorer Captain John W. Gunnison by Indians in 1853, this ford, one of the three most important fords on the river, had been known as "the Old Spanish Crossing." He noted its importance, "being upon the direct trail from Sante Fé to Los Angeles," known then and now as "the Old Spanish Trail." Beaman, "Cañon of the Colorado," 516.

at Gunnison Crossing with their first batch of supplies. Fred Dellenbaugh and Clem Powell appointed Lyman Hamblin “to get us a lot of Indian curiosities, 1/2 dozen pairs each of moccasins . . . a pair of leggins” and “a bow, quiver and arrows” to take home as souvenirs when their adventure was over. Lyman Hamblin promised to deliver the curiosities when they reached Kanab. The Hamblins told the group all about Kanab and the Native Americans and around the campfire that night, with Major Powell’s help, regaled them with “some Indian songs.”²⁶ On September 1, expedition members filled the Hamblins’ empty pack-saddles with relics, fossils, glass-plate negatives, and papers to take with them to Salt Lake City. The next day the flotilla shoved off en route for the next supply drop at Crossing of the Fathers.²⁷ The further south the survey members traveled, the more ruins of the ancient Pueblos they found along the river. Powell believed them to be the ancestors of the Moqui and he adopted a word the Hopi used for themselves, *Shinumo*, meaning “we, the wise,” to refer to them.²⁸ All along the river, especially as they entered the canyons leading to what they were already calling “the Grand Cañon,” they found where the Shinumo had built protective homes in the cliffs. Powell surmised they had been forced into the canyons “to protect themselves from other tribes” and noted that their largest “communal houses” constructed of “stone and mortar” could accommodate “from fifty to two hundred persons each.”²⁹ The group frequently stopped and dug in the ruins, finding pots, baskets, and other artifacts, which they added to their collections.³⁰

²⁶ Dellenbaugh, *A Canyon Voyage*, 99–100; and *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 308–312.

²⁷ *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 313.

²⁸ *UHQ* 15 (1947): 202. Most white observers felt that “the Moquis” were “far superior” to the Utes and Paiute. Those two groups called the Hopi “*Shinumo*,” which means “wisemen.” The Utes and Paiute claimed that “their forefathers conquered [the Hopi] and drove them away.” *UHQ* 15 (1947): 211.

²⁹ *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 323, and J. W. Powell, “Report Preliminary [25 March 1872],” 11.

³⁰ See, for example, *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 323–324.

Visiting so many archaeological sites significantly slowed the expedition's progress and when Powell and his boats did not appear at their planned destination at Ute Ford on September 22, Hamblin left the expedition's goods at the crossing under the care of Pardy Dodds and two other gentile prospectors (George Riley and John Bonnemort) Powell had hired to help him bring the goods in. Hamblin and a small retinue of Mormons determined to follow a group of Navajo who were making their way to the annual distribution of annuities at Ft. Defiance, in an attempt to obtain further payment for the horses and other property extorted from the Kanab Saints. Hamblin was joined on this journey to the Navajo country by Mountain Meadows Massacre participants Isaac C. Haight, George W. Adair, and Joe Mangum, who, with John D. Lee and other fugitives, had been hiding out in the Kanab region from the posses of US Chief Justice James B. McKean. Among others, Hamblin had hired these three as mule wranglers, to help him bring supplies to Major Powell's men. There was irony in the fact that some of the government gold expended to map Brigham's desert bastion went into the pockets of the very men Powell's Great Map was designed to help apprehend.³¹

On October 23, 1871, the day before Brigham Young fled Judge McKean's prosecutions in Salt Lake City, the Second Colorado River Expedition reached the river crossing at the mouth of the Paria, soon to be called Lees Ferry. Clem Powell wrote in his journal that they made their camp "against the cliff" near "the remains of an old house made of straw, sticks and stones," which stood below a crude fort the Mormons had constructed high on the cliffs to guard the crossing against the Navajo. On October 28, Hamblin, Haight, Adair, and Mangum "on their return from the Moquis" appeared at the crossing with a "band of Navajos, 9 in number, with a lot of blankets that they intend to trade off to the Mormons for horses." For most of the survey

³¹ *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 341–342, and 357–358.

crew, this was their first time meeting Jacob Hamblin. After hearing so much about the famous Mormon scout and missionary, Fred Dellenbaugh was initially unimpressed: “We were met by a slow moving, very quiet individual who said his name was Jacob Hamblin. His voice was so low, his manner so simple, his clothing so usual, that I could hardly believe that this was Utah’s famous Indian fighter and manager.”³² The expedition offered to ferry Hamblin and his Navajo across the river. Chief Topographer Almon Thompson observed that some of the Navajo had clearly never seen the Colorado and were “greatly surprised” at its size. They “were rather timid” about crossing the water on the expedition’s “water ponies.” Expedition members used their boats to safely lead the Navajo’s horses across the river. Each boat led two horses at a time, two boatmen battling the swift current “at the oars,” while one sat “in the stern holding onto the lariats and holding up the heads of the ponies as they swam behind.” According to Clem, the horses were “about played out” by the time they reached the shore.³³

The nascent friendship budding between Powell’s men and the Mormons and Navajo they encountered on the banks of the Colorado only deepened as the expedition moved into its second phase—the actual process of surveying the land upon which Powell’s Great Map would be based. On November 6, Powell’s survey team began their journey inland from Lees Ferry toward Kanab, the proposed site of the expedition’s winter quarters. They rode on a motley herd of horses and mules Hamblin had pulled together for Powell. The river rats found dealing with “‘bucking’ mules more difficult than handling our boats in the worst rapids.”³⁴ Six days later, on November 12, all arrived at Kanab, except for a handful that had been assigned to do some exploring and mule herding at House Rock Valley. A site a few miles south of “the Mormon

³² *UHQ* 7 (1938): 59; *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 357–358; and Dellenbaugh, *A Canyon Voyage*, 153.

³³ *UHQ* 7 (1938): 59; and *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 357–358.

³⁴ Beaman, “The Cañon of the Colorado,” 547.

Gibraltar of Kanab” was selected for a headquarters, and Chief Topographer Almon Thompson anxiously waited for Major Powell to return from Salt Lake so he could begin the work of establishing the necessary baseline for his survey, the first step in mapping Brigham’s desert bastion.³⁵

Powell’s men left quaint descriptions of Kanab in 1871. Elias Beaman wrote that “the village is surrounded on three sides—north, east, and west—by the Vermillion Mountains.” Clem Powell wrote that Kanab was “only a small collection of houses” centered around “a log fort” with a “little log hut covered with blankets that they called the Kanab P.O.” Powell employee Frederick Dellenbaugh remembered that the fort enclosed a one-story log stockade and a school house and that there were “probably eight or ten houses outside of the Fort.” Beaman recorded that “the dwellings are generally made of logs, although a few of the more pretentious are of adobes—that is, bricks dried in the sun.” He reported that about forty Mormon families “numbering three hundred souls” lived there. By this time as many as a hundred Kaibabits made Kanab their home at certain parts of the year, sometimes inhabiting vacant houses in the fort, camping in its open enclosure, or sleeping in wickiups they built on the edge of town.³⁶ The site for the expedition’s winter quarters was carefully chosen. Powell’s team desired to be close enough to the village to get mail and provisions, to hire Mormon hands, and to communicate with the world over the Deseret Telegraph Line—but still be far enough away from Kanab’s “strange” Mormon and Kaibab inhabitants. Powell and Thompson had arranged for their wives, the Powells’ new baby, and Mrs. Thompson’s dog Fuzz to join them, and the expedition

³⁵ *UHQ* 7 (1939): 62–64.

³⁶ *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 374, 376, 383, 386; and Frederick S. Dellenbaugh, testimony, September 23, 1929, *Colorado River Trial*, Frederick S. Dellenbaugh Papers, USHS, b1, f9.

established a tiny tent city not far from the present location of modern Fredonia, just south of the Utah-Arizona line.³⁷

Just two weeks after their arrival, Brigham Young visited Kanab on one of his November 1871 desert tours to ready his New Canaan safe-houses of Pipe Springs and Kanab. The evening after Young's arrival a meeting was held in Kanab's new rock schoolhouse. Powell employee Elias Beaman wrote "we were disappointed in not hearing the great prophet, who was so exhausted by the fatigue of travel as not to be able to appear. The closely-packed house was lighted by flickering tallow-dips, suspended from the rafters; and adding not a little to the primitive wildness of the place were the settlers' arms . . . all ready for instant use in case of an attack from hostile Indians [or US troops]."³⁸ Beaman and Clem Powell eventually had the opportunity to listen to Bishop Musser, the pious and stern director of Young's telegraph line, when he spoke to a congregation of armed Latter-day Saints in the schoolhouse that doubled as Kanab's school, courthouse, ballroom, lecture hall, and church on December 1. According to Clem, Musser's preaching consisted of simple rantings regarding "the persecutions of the Mormons" punctuated by anathemas he heaped on "the most unrighteous judge, Judge [James B.] McKean at Salt Lake" who had chased Brigham Young into the Kanab desert by his unlawful oppressions. Bishop Musser shocked gentile listeners by declaring from the pulpit "that he most cordially hated [McKean] and the government." Musser told the Kanab faithful that "it might be necessary for some of them to lay down their lives for their religion" in the war he expected to break out should President Grant or Judge McKean send a posse of US Marshals or

³⁷ *UHQ* 7 (1939): 62–64.

³⁸ Beaman, "Cañon of the Colorado," 547.

the Army to attempt to snatch Young or other high ranking Mormon fugitives from their southern Utah retreat.³⁹

By December Bishop A. Milton Musser, who was also head tithing agent and director of the Deseret Telegraph Company, was in town to install the new telegraph equipment in a side office attached to Bishop Stewart's house in Kanab. On December 15, Musser officially opened the Pipe Springs telegraph office, the very first in the history of Arizona. Bishop Stewart's daughter Ella was appointed by Brigham Young to serve as the telegrapher at Winsor Castle. With Musser standing beside her, young Ella Stewart clicked out the office's first message: "Praise God from whom all blessings flow." The telegraph stations at Pipe Springs and Kanab were the furthest afield from Salt Lake City and key to the success of Young's New Canaan sanctuary.⁴⁰

Most of the Kanab Mormons had seen the "magic" of the telegraph before, but both the Kaibab and Mormons were dazzled by the Powell survey's cache of scientific instruments, which were temporarily stored in Kanab. These included astronomic telescopes, transits, barometers, and high fangled chronometers. What most astonished Kanab's frontiersmen and the bewildered Kaibab were the photographic prints made on the spot from glass-plate negatives shot with the heavy box cameras carried by survey photographers. These were developed in

³⁹ *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 377.

⁴⁰ *Salt Lake Herald*, December 17, 1871, 2, UDN; and *Omaha World Herald*, 30 June 1929, 56, GBC. Eliza Luella Stewart, commonly known as Ella, had been groomed by Brigham Young for this responsibility for over a year and a half. When he directed her father to lead the resettlement of Pipe Springs and the Kanab Country in the spring of 1870, Young asked fifteen-year-old Ella to stop off in Toquerville to learn telegraphy at the Deseret Telegraph Office. Ella and her husband David King Udall produced a posterity prominent in US political history. Their grandson Stewart Lee Udall served three terms as US Congressman from Arizona, and as Secretary of the Interior from 1961 to 1969. Another grandson, Morris King Udall, was US Congressman from Arizona and a candidate for US President in 1976. Their great-grandsons Mark and Tom Udall have each served as both US Senators and Congress members from the states of Colorado and New Mexico, respectively. See "Eliza Luella Stewart Udall," and other family histories in PSLA, VF, FH, Stewart; "Death Claims Kanab's First Telegraph Operator," in *Kane County Standard*, 4 June 1937, 1, UDN; and David Udall and Pearl Nelson, *Arizona Pioneer Mormon*, especially 246–252.

makeshift darkrooms in Kanab's rustic fort. On December 20, Clem wrote that it was "quite amusing to hear the comments of the children on the pictures while we are printing them[:]" Such expressions as 'by heck,' 'Je[e]whiz,' 'Je[e] whitticer just look at them,' &c." New settlements such as Kanab on the extreme edges of Mormon country were havens for young parents just starting out and like everywhere in polygamous Utah there was a superabundance of children.⁴¹ Most if not all of these children had been born in the isolation of Brigham's bastion and had little or no experience with the "dreaded Gentiles" who were so maligned by their elders. Arriving in Kanab sometime after most of his colleagues, Fred wrote that he found Clem Powell and Elias Beaman at work "with their photographic outfit, with a swarm of children peeping through every chink and crevice of the logs to get a view of the 'gentiles,' a kind of animal they had seldom seen."⁴²

While Powell was in Salt Lake City, his employees occasionally traveled the few miles from their base camp south of the Arizona Line to Kanab just "to see what the Mormons are doing." Initially Powell employee Francis M. Bishop, who was the most pious Protestant member of the expedition, was filled with abhorrence when he saw the general "frontier dissipation" of Kanab's Mormons. He confided to his journal, "One can but be amused at the queer style of the Latter-day Saints, as they style themselves. So uncouth in all their movements; so void of grace of look or action." On another occasion he wrote, "If Mormonism rests upon the moral status . . . of the Saints . . . as displayed by the samples we have here, compared with the morality of other Christians *they are all vile, miserable sinners with but few exceptions.*" He complained that "in a community where horse-racing, card playing, dancing, and wine drinking,

⁴¹ David Udall and Pearl Nelson, *Arizona Pioneer Mormon*, 379.

⁴² Dellenbaugh, *A Canyon Voyage*, 167.

and even intoxicating liquors of various stamps are unblushingly used and sold, certainly if all these things are rec[k]oned in as ‘Holiness to the Lord[,]’ there is a most fearful degeneracy from the good Bible standard of our civilized states. Yet these things are done on [the] Sabbath day and none of the Elders say anything to the contrary.”⁴³ The Latter-day Saint predilection for dancing vexed pious Francis Bishop, as did their indifference to traditional eastern United States mores regarding Sabbath day observance. Bishop recorded “A dance again tonight. It is hop all of the time, either by old or young. What a queer set these Mormons are.” Referring to a “*great dance* [?] at the school house,” where music was furnished by fiddlers Lyman Hamblin and Ammon Tenney, he wrote that “a Mormon ball is a queer concern. Everybody goes and all of the family who can dance from lads and lasses of 10 years up to the gray-haired grandfather of 50. The dancing is preceded by prayer, and the whole affair is closed with prayer by some of the Mormon Elders.”⁴⁴

In time Bishop’s feelings for the Mormons changed, as did those of most of his gentile compatriots. They were literally wined and dined by these rough Mormon cowboys until they grew to feel affection for them. They attended their horse races, their dances and parties, and sometimes even their unique worship services, and spent time with their daughters. (Powell’s young men were particularly fond of a beautiful daughter of Isaac Haight who had joined her infamous father hiding in Kanab.) And working beside Mormon expedition employees month after month and eating at their humble tables worked profound changes in them, as it did in their Latter-day Saint counterparts. In a startling twist of fate (and faith), after the conclusion of the

⁴³ *UHQ* 15 (1947): 219.

⁴⁴ *UHQ* 15 (1947): 212, 221. Relative to the Saints’ lack of “due regard” for the Sabbath day, Bishop wrote, “A pleasant day, only no one would ever suppose this to be Sunday in any country except Utah.” *UHQ* 15 (1947): 212, 215, 221–222, italics in original.

Powell expedition's six months in Kanab, Francis M. Bishop moved to Salt Lake City where he became a beloved professor at the Church-owned University of Deseret and eventually became a Mormon and married a daughter of Apostle Orson Pratt. The once vexed and piqued Protestant wrote "[I] Have had a very pleasant time since I have been here with these good people and hope I may be situated so as to repay their kindness. I shall be lonesome enough when I get away, after having been here so long; but they will not miss me [as much] as I shall miss them."⁴⁵

Because of the good will manifested on all sides, Kanab was reaching a height of religious and cultural toleration and acceptance not then widely known on the Mormon frontier. Hamblin, Powell, Captain Frank, and scores of others played roles in this détente in the desert. Hamblin's home was open to all comers and his wives willingly cooked, washed, and mended for Powell's survey team. Powell hired Mormons whenever he could, even taking in a Latter-day Saint teenager named Vina, as a nurse for his infant daughter and as a maid for his wife Emma. Like many others, this relationship served to break down Mormon-gentile animosity.⁴⁶ The long hours spent listening to Paiute, Navajo, and Mormons speak of their respective religions caused members of each of these groups to trust and admire "Ka-pu-rats." Using government gold, Powell bought beef from Bishop Winsor at Pipe Springs and always had enough to share with the Kaibabit and Navajo.⁴⁷ Clem Powell wrote that expedition members had "plenty of chances to give away things, especially tea, coffee and sugar," to local Mormons. The expedition's "hard alcohol" was sought and freely given, as "someone is [always] getting sick and wants 'just enough for a dram.'" In exchange, the Mormons provided Powell's men with all the Dixie wine

⁴⁵ *UHQ* 15 (1947): 235–236.

⁴⁶ *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 108, 372–373, 377, 384, 395.

⁴⁷ *UHQ* 7 (1939): 68–69, 71, 74, 76–78, 89, 107–108; and *UHQ* 15 (1947): 221.

they could drink, though sometimes they got a poor batch and reported it as being “most abominable stuff.”⁴⁸

With Brigham Young’s blessing, Anson Winsor did his part by allowing Powell employees to camp and store supplies in the buildings at Pipe and by allowing the expedition to use the tithing office there as a sort of frontier bank, where he held expedition checks and used his beef as a means of exchange between the expedition and the southern Utah barter economy.⁴⁹ His son Walter joined Jacob Hamblin in a Powell expedition to find and map the head of the Dirty Devil River.⁵⁰ In what were perhaps Winsor’s greatest contributions to the Powell Expedition, the superintendent posted the expedition’s official correspondence from “the Pipe Springs Post Office” and allowed Powell and his men use of Pipe’s telegraph office. At the time, Pipe Springs was the only telegraph station in Arizona. Some members of Powell’s survey team were also private correspondents for a number of eastern papers and they kept Winsor’s telegrapher, young Ella Stewart, busy tapping out lengthy letters describing their experiences to the eastern press.⁵¹ The Native Americans also made their contributions to Powell’s study by sharing their tremendous knowledge of the land, directing them to water, and answering questions about their language and history. They also made their material culture available to Powell by the box-load.⁵²

⁴⁸ *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 383.

⁴⁹ For examples see *UHQ* 15 (1947): 214.

⁵⁰ *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 290.

⁵¹ Clem Powell and Fred Dellenbaugh both sent lengthy dispatches to eastern presses from Winsor Castle.

⁵² Almon H. Thompson, “Colorado River Expedition, 1871–1872–1873: Financial Statement,” especially 1–3, CMC.

The Powell Survey Takes Up Residence in Winsor Castle

For several weeks in March 1872 the Powell Survey made its headquarters at Pipe Springs. The first wave of expedition members seems to have arrived on March 8, and until March 21 the expedition's main camp was at Winsor Castle, while some of Thompson's men "operated around Pipe Spring triangulating and recording the topography, and other data" before moving on to a new camp near Mt. Trumbull.⁵³ William D. Johnson Jr., a new addition to the team hired from among the Mormons in Kanab, wrote the following to the editor of the *Deseret News*:

Leaving Kanab on the 10th day of March we made camp at Winsor Castle, or Pipe Spring, as more commonly called. Here we stopped for ten days, taking observations for longitude, latitude, and time, also taking angles to and from prominent points on the Vermillion cliffs, and Ki[a]bab Mountain. By observation we find that Winsor Castle is eleven miles south of the line between Utah and Arizona [...]

From [the Kanab base line] we triangulate to prominent points, either signal stations or geodetic points, according to the importance of those points. We travel from one mountain or point to another, to get angles and sketch the country, with pack animals, as it would be impossible to travel with a wagon.

⁵³ Dellenbaugh, *A Canyon Voyage*, 185–186.

The party is composed of twelve members at present, and all have their different duties to perform, such as topographers, photographers, geologists, and those who herd and tend to the horses and drive the pack train.⁵⁴

Thompson wanted to locate “Point H,” a special astronomical station, on the Vermillion Cliffs at Pipe Springs Point and on March 11 he and Stephen Jones and Willie Johnson “climbed [the] cliff 1000 feet back of Pipe Springs and put up [a] flag.” Johnson wrote that the wind blew hard, and that they “had a hard time climbing” and that they returned “tired.”⁵⁵ The next day Jones and Johnson “started for Wolf Springs [Northeast of Pipe] for the purpose of getting angles from [the] cliff west of Cottonwood Cañon,” taking their riding horses and one pack animal. On the 13th, Thompson and Dellenbaugh rode out to look at the cliffs behind the fort from a distance, “prospecting” an easier and safer ascent than the one Thompson had used two days before. Meanwhile Jones and Johnson made it to the top of their cliff above Wolf Springs. Carrying a “theodilite [*sic*] and glass” made the climb difficult. They “took all the angles necessary then came on to Pipe Springs.” On the 14th, Thompson, Dellenbaugh, and Johnson went back up the cliffs above Pipe Springs to Point H, where they built another monument and “took bearings.” They stayed on the cliff “all day” taking “20 or 30 angles” on various points they could see from their perch atop Pipe Springs Point. On the 16th and 17th, they plotted the bearings they had measured on tracing paper and otherwise “worked on the map.” On the 19th they went back up the cliff to Point H “to identify [additional] bearings” and to plot their “correspondence” with other triangulation points. In the evening, Thompson and Dellenbaugh

⁵⁴ William D. Johnson Jr., Powell’s Colorado River Exploring Expedition, Windsor Castle, Arizona, to *editor*, *Deseret News*, May 10, 1872, *Deseret News Weekly*, 21 (May 29, 1872): 234–235, CHL.

⁵⁵ Dellenbaugh, “Diary, 1871–1873,” 13 March 1872; and William Johnson, *Diary*, 11 March 1872.

visited Point A to counter-check their observations from ‘Point H.’ Satisfied with their work, on March 20 Fred Dellenbaugh and Willie Johnson finished their preliminary sketch of that part of the survey, having literally put Pipe Springs on the map. That same day James Fennemore, a Latter-day Saint photographer in Powell’s employ, apparently took the first photographs of Winsor Castle and its environs. Unfortunately, these have not been found.

On March 21, 1872, Powell’s survey teams left Pipe to continue their triangulation at Mt. Trumbull.⁵⁶ For various reasons, for the next year Winsor Castle remained a secondary expedition headquarters. The Powell survey rented space in some of Pipe’s outbuildings to stow scientific equipment and saddlery. When not in use, the expedition’s horses and mules were sometimes left in the care of a “Brother Winsor.” At other times extra mounts were rented from the Pipe Springs Ranch.⁵⁷ On occasion, Winsor and his relatives were hired by Powell and Thompson as explorers and mule wranglers. The expedition obtained most of its provisions from the Pipe Springs Ranch; expedition members recorded that in the summer of 1872 Anson Winsor was “milking 100 cows” and making between sixty and seventy pounds of cheese each day. He delivered beef, butter, cheese, and probably even milk to the expedition’s primary headquarters in Kanab or wherever else they required it.⁵⁸ Sitting on a nexus of important roads and trails, the fort was “on the way” to virtually every destination in the area and the explorers frequently used the fort as a temporary hostel where they could eat some of Sister Winsor’s home-cooked meals,

⁵⁶ *UHQ* 7 (1939) :70–72; *UHQ* 15 (1947): 226; Dellenbaugh, “Diary,” 13–21 March 1872; William Johnson, Diary, 11–21 March 1872; and William D. Johnson Jr. to editor, *Deseret News*, May 10, 1872, *Deseret News Weekly*, 21 (May 29, 1872): 234–235.

⁵⁷ For examples see William Johnson, Diary, April 27, 1872, May 27, 1872.

⁵⁸ By December 1871 Winsor had installed a “Ralph’s Oneida [steam] cheese vat” that he said saved “three-quarters of the labor employed in the old fashioned way.” *Salt Lake Herald*, December, 17, 1871, 2, UDN. See also Stephen Jones, “Journal,” *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 140–141; and Almon Thompson, “Diary,” *UHQ* 7 (1939): 68–69, 71, 74, 76–78, 89, 107–108; and Francis M. Bishop, “Journal,” *UHQ* 15 (1947): 221.

get some sleep, take a bath, or otherwise “clean up.”⁵⁹ Clem Powell wrote that expedition members were “indebted” to Bishop Winsor “for many favors” and described him as “a genial host.”⁶⁰ Powell and Thompson did a significant amount of their official survey communication from the Pipe Springs telegraph office. Meanwhile several survey members (including Clem Powell, Francis Marion Bishop and Fred Dellenbaugh) earned a few extra dollars as official Powell Expedition correspondents to several eastern newspapers. Thus various names of Brigham’s “secret” bastion (“Pipe Spring,” “Pipe Springs, and “Winsor Castle,” as well as information regarding the surrounding country) were broadcast throughout the United States and the rest of the English speaking world.⁶¹ Pipe Springs was a major outpost for the Colorado River Survey, as well as a gathering point for Kaibab Paiute to whom Powell made several Indian Office distributions in 1872 and subsequent years.⁶²

Several members of Powell’s survey described Pipe Springs and Winsor Castle in 1872. Fred Dellenbaugh wrote that “a vacant stone house of one very large room and a great fireplace was put at our disposal, by Mr. Winsor the proprietor,” while Professor Thompson pitched a tent for himself and his bride. The “vacant stone house” the survey men occupied was probably one of the stone houses put up to house construction workers or perhaps the original Nauvoo Legion Block House built during the Navajo War, which was used for the same purpose. The fact that

⁵⁹ See, for example, Stephen Jones, “Journal,” *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 113; William D. Johnson Jr. to *editor, Deseret News*, May 10, 1872, *Deseret News Weekly*, 21 (May 29, 1872): 234–235; and William Johnson, *Diary*, April 24, 1872, May 5, 1872, May 25–26, 1872.

⁶⁰ Clement Powell to *Chicago Tribune*, April 5, 1872, *UHQ*, 16–17 (1948–1949): 400–401.

⁶¹ *UHQ* 7 (1939): 130; *Salt Lake Herald*, December 17, 1871, 2, UDN; William D. Johnson Jr. to *editor, Deseret News*, 10 May 1872, UDN; “Letters of Walter Clement Powell to the *Chicago Tribune*,” *UHQ*, 16–17 (1948–1949): especially 397–406; “Letters from F. S. Dellenbaugh to the *Buffalo NY Courier*,” CMC; and “Letters of Captain F. M. Bishop to the *Daily Pantagraph* [Bloomington, IL] 1871–72,” *UHQ* 15 (1947): 239–254.

⁶² See Almon H. Thompson, “Colorado River Expedition, 1871–1872–1873: Financial Statement,” especially 1; and *UHQ* 7 (1939), 15 (1947), and 16–17 (1948–1949), especially Almon Thompson, “Diary,” *UHQ* 7 (1939): 68–69, 71, 74, 76–78, 89, 107–108, 115; Francis M. Bishop, “Journal,” *UHQ* 15 (1947): 221; Stephen Jones, “Journal,” *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 107, 108, 124, 125, 128, 140–141; and Clement Powell, “Journal,” *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 290, 400–401, 404–405, 472.

this stone house was “vacant” suggests that the tithing laborers and other fort building volunteers may have been busy at home putting in crops, or that the masonry work had been completed. Dellenbaugh’s contemporary diary indicates that the fort was already up to the second story but that no roof had been put on, for he could see that the walls were “about three feet in thickness.” On March 8, Dellenbaugh roughly sketched the two floors of Winsor Castle’s two facing buildings in his diary, noting its loopholes, doors, and windows.⁶³

Another wave of survey men arrived on March 11 and were put up in the unfinished castle itself. One of these men was Clem Powell, who, acting as a correspondent for the *Chicago Tribune*, on or about April 5 wrote one of the best contemporary descriptions of Pipe Springs written on-site. Among other things, he wrote:

This is a place of importance. It is 20 miles west of Kanab. The spring gushes from a cliff of red sandstone, and spreads out over a bottom in quite a stream, affording excellent pasturage. The following legend accounts for the name: A company of hunters and trappers, resting here, amused themselves by firing at a mark. Some wild shots being made, one of the men stuck up his pipe near the water, thinking it perfectly safe. The sharp-shooters blazed away, and the pipe was shattered in fragments. Pipe Springs has figured conspicuously in frontier annals.

This barren wilderness of rock and sand offered few inducements and little protection to the emigrant. Forts, posts, soldiers, and even stage-stations were few and remote. There

⁶³ Dellenbaugh, “Diary, 1871–1873,” March 8, 1872; and Dellenbaugh, *A Canyon Voyage*, 185–186.

are now no old settlers, daily papers, Dolly Vardens,⁶⁴ or other luxuries. Mormon people, however, are persevering, and Mormon leaders sagacious. Colonies have lodged along all the mountain-streams, and in every green valley; taking root, like the pine and willow, wherever moisture would nourish and soil support. So fine a pasturage as that of Pipe Springs was speedily used as grazing ground for herds of cattle, sheep, and horses. In 1865 [James M.] Whitmore owned the ranch, living in a stone hut with his son and two hired men. A band of Indians surrounded the premises, drove off the flocks, and killed the white men who rushed out to the rescue. Still later, an Indian surprise was effected, and 600 sheep taken. The savages satisfied themselves with sticking the door full of arrows, and burning the corral. The ranchmen, more prudent than the first owners, did not show themselves, and were saved.

The Navajo Indians, living in Arizona, some 200 miles distant, occupied the time, when not fighting other tribes, in raiding over the river to plunder the whites. They forced the cowardly Pah-Utes to lead them where settlers' stock was herding; then, in true Indian style, the Navajos would suddenly emerge from behind some rock or cliff, seize their booty, and be off in a jiffy. The Mormons, getting intelligence from scouts and sentinels, would promptly arm and mount; and an exciting chase for the river began. As the Colorado is only fordable at "Crossing of the Father's" [*sic*] and mouth of Pahria the pursuers and pursued dashed, at utmost speed for one or both of those points. Moving along parallel routes, the sheep-stealers and sheep-owners often arrived at the fords about

⁶⁴ A "Dolly Varden" was a fancy and colorful woman's dress fashionable in the United States and Britain in the early 1870s. It was also a slang name for the Chicago Attica & Southern Railroad that the *Chicago Tribune's* readers would have been familiar with. It is probably in the latter sense that Clem Powell was using the term.

the same time. The acute savages generally managed to skirmish and cause delays, until the plunder was safe on the farther shore; the warriors then retreated. In this way a few dead Navajos were exchanged for a good many live horses. It is hard enough, and bad enough, to live unmolested on the desert, but, when one is obliged to receive visitors at so much expense, and with so great display, the amusement grows stale. The frontiersmen, undaunted, kept a sharp look-out, learned the trails better, and perfected means of defense. At first alarm, they were at the heels of the Arizona Arabs, better armed, and equal in numbers. The battles then waxed hotter. The 'reds' were severely punished; as the phrase goes, 'they salted a good many Injins.' Finally a fort was built and garrison maintained at the Crossing, and a treaty of peace concluded. Pipe Springs was often the theater of war. President Young and Bishop Winsor secured the peace. Under the supervision of the latter, a large stone structure was projected, and is now building, at considerable cost. Winsor Castle, as we call it, is loopholed for musketry, and is used as a ranch, dairy, and fort. It is on the direct trail leading from the Indian country to the settlement, and forms a strategic point the Navajos or Apaches will find difficult to turn. We are encamped in one of the stone houses within the fortification, and enjoy hugely those rarities to the campaigner—fresh milk and good butter. Eleven thousand sheep, 500 cattle, and some horses are kept here. We are indebted to the Bishop for many favors; he is a genial host.⁶⁵

⁶⁵ Walter Clement Powell to the *Chicago Tribune*, April 5, 1872, *Chicago Tribune*, July 11, 1872, in "Letters of Walter Clement Powell to the *Chicago Tribune*," *UHQ*, 16–17 (1948–1949): 399–401.

In addition to Clem's excellent description, Frederick Dellenbaugh later wrote several descriptions which, along with Clem's, are among the best we have of Winsor Castle in the 1870s. In his 1908 memoir, *A Canyon Voyage*, Dellenbaugh wrote the following of his 1872 visit, which shows that he was aware that it was more than just the fortified ranch house the Mormons represented it as being:

For protection against raiders Mr. Winsor was building a solid double house of blocks of sandstone, making walls three feet thick. The two buildings were placed about twenty feet apart, thus forming an interior court the length of the houses, protected at the ends by high walls and heavy gates. No windows opened on the exterior, but there were plenty of loopholes commanding every approach. A fine large spring was conducted subterraneously into the corner of one of the buildings and out again, insuring plenty of water in case of a siege. Brigham Young was part owner of this establishment, and it was one of the most effective places of defence on a small scale, that I have ever seen. It was never needed so far as I have heard, and even at the time I marvelled that it should be so elaborately prepared—far beyond anything else in the whole country.⁶⁶

In 1875–1876 Fred Dellenbaugh was back in Pipe Springs country participating in additional survey work. At that time he served as a correspondent for the *Buffalo Courier* in New York State and gave the following description of the fort:

⁶⁶ Dellenbaugh, *A Canyon Voyage*, 185–186.

“Winsor Castle” . . . consists of two oblong two-story houses, built parallel [to each other], with a sort of court some thirty feet wide, intervening [between them.] The only windows in both structures open into this court, which is closed at each end by a wall as high as the [tops] of the houses, and a huge gate. The whole castle is of large blocks of red sandstone. One door opens upon the road, but it is small and heavy and designed to resist an attack. At first sight the fortress or castle appears to have no apertures, besides the door, on the outside, but a close inspection reveals a number of narrow loopholes. From these it is evidently intended that the house shall be defended. A plentiful supply of good water, conducted from a spring a few feet away (which is concealed by masonry and earth) into the house, first makes its appearance, gushing from one corner of the front building into a large trough, where passing travelers and the stock of the ranch refresh themselves. One would suppose that it has its source in the house, but as we were on the ground when the “castle” was building, we know that it rises some feet away.

With such a fine supply of water, and an abundance of rations and ammunition, a few men could stand a long siege. Indeed this would be quite a formidable stronghold, as long as no cannon were trained upon it.

In a section of this article entitled “WHAT WAS IT EVER ERECTED FOR[?],” Dellenbaugh publicly cast doubt on Bishop Winsor’s official testimony that “the castle was constructed to guard the ranch against Indians.” He characterized Winsor as a “smooth talking individual” whose statement was dictated by “policy” rather than “truth.” Since a simple “stockade” would better protect Mormon cattle “than this expensive fort, which only admits of [a

more serious plan],” Dellenbaugh wrote that he was “inclined to disbelieve the statement of Mr. W.” A special friend of the Mormons, though, it seems Dellenbaugh may have been loath to disclose all he knew, but at least revealed “the structure is designed for some [other] use.” Perhaps he knowingly painting a skewed but partially true portrait of the fort’s true purpose when he wrote:

More likely is it, that the structure is designed for some future use, which has not yet transpired. The Mormon “prophets” have told of a great contest which is to take place before many years roll by. In this war our United States are to have a fearful struggle; neighbor shall fight neighbor; and ruin shall be pre-eminent. But just as our constitution seems shaken to pieces and our beautiful flag trampled in the dust, up will start the Mormons. The sacred instrument is preserved and the dear old flag once more waves “o’er the home of the brave.” Now, this is all nice enough, but it perplexes one a little to try to imagine 100,000 people saving over 40,000,000. At all events the Mormons already discern the war-cloud rising threateningly on the horizon.⁶⁷

Winsor Castle and the Kanab Gulch-Grand Canyon Gold Rush of 1872

When Powell’s men set up camp at Pipe they found a large party of miners also encamped at the Springs, who “were soon followed by hundreds more.” For months, survey employee George Riley and others had been spreading the word that there were gold deposits

⁶⁷ Frederick S. Dellenbaugh [Untokarowitz, pseud.], Kanab, S. Utah, to the *Buffalo Courier*, April 24, 1876, in “Letters from F. S. Dellenbaugh to the *Buffalo NY Courier*,” 19, CMC.

near the confluence of Kanab Creek and the Colorado where a man with a pan could make fifty dollars a day.⁶⁸ Former Powell employee Elias Beaman wrote that on January 1, 1872 John Wesley Powell and a handful of his employees attended Kanab's New Year's Ball having just returned from a trip down the Kanab Creek Gulch, a deep gorge that begins between Kanab and Pipe Springs, and runs into the Grand Canyon. According to Beaman, "the wash had been hitherto unexplored, and one of the party, who considered himself an expert, claimed to have discovered gold in paying quantities." News of the discovery spread like wildfire and Beaman later wrote that "not long after this supposed discovery . . . all Utah became excited about the Colorado placer-diggings, and at least five hundred miners must have visited the Colorado River, by way of Kanab Cañon, in the spring of 1872."⁶⁹ Expecting "nothing short of a second '49 time,"⁷⁰ miners forsook paying mines in Pioche, Nevada and around Milford and Beaver, Utah, and rushed to Pipe Springs and Kanab in droves. Powell employees reporting their experiences to various newspapers throughout the country contributed to "the gold fever."⁷¹ Clem Powell tried to dampen this excitement in a dispatch he wrote from Winsor Castle to the *Chicago Tribune* on April 5. He wrote that "the placer diggins, on the Colorado [draw] a constant stream of miners to and from Pioche. Those hastening to Grand Cañon are hopeful [and] confident [while] those returning are desponding [and] disgusted.... The excitement broke out so suddenly, [and] the fever ran so high, that people crowded to the auriferous shore without food, ... knowledge of mining, [or] proper implements."⁷²

⁶⁸ *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 372.

⁶⁹ Beaman, "Cañon of the Colorado," 547; see also *Evening Star* (Washington, DC), March 26, 1872, 1, CALOC.

⁷⁰ *Salt Lake Herald*, May 16, 1872, 1, UDN.

⁷¹ See F. M. Bishop, Colorado River Ex., Camp 94, Kanab, Utah, to "Dear Pantagraph," February 1872, *The Pantagraph* (Bloomington, IL), March 27, 1872, 2, NPC.

⁷² Walter Clement Powell to the *Chicago Tribune*, [no date], *Chicago Tribune*, July 11, 1872, in "Letters of Walter Clement Powell to the *Chicago Tribune*," *UHQ*, 16–17 (1948–1949): 402–403.

Winsor Castle was the last outpost of civilization these miners saw before disappearing into Kanab Gulch just a few miles southeast of Pipe Springs. Almost overnight the argonauts' demand for Bishop Winsor's beef and dairy products transformed the unfinished fortress and its titling office into a lively emporium and supply depot. Powell Expedition member Stephen V. Jones wrote that "thousands of dollars were spent here to no purpose" by miners crazed by the rumors.⁷³ The miners of the 1872 Kanab Gulch-Grand Canyon Gold Rush pummeled Powell and his men for geologic information. Fred Dellenbaugh wrote that one miner he met at Pipe Springs, a "jolly little Dutchman" named Mr. Kaiser, got him to sketch out maps to silver beds Powell's geologists had discovered on the Kaibab Plateau. Kaiser promised to "remember" Dellenbaugh should he strike it rich with the information Powell's young artist provided.⁷⁴ Powell's geological survey drew substantial numbers of gentiles into the heart of Brigham's bastion. It was not long, however, before Salt Lake papers announced that the Kanab Gulch Gold Rush was nothing more than an empty rumor allegedly started by "Bishop Stuart, of Kanab" in order "to sell the beef on his range to the miners." Gold panners rushed out of the country just as fast as they had poured into it, "swearing they never were bilked so bad before in their lives" and threatening "vengeance on the originator of the story."⁷⁵

In the meantime "a brisk trade" was carried on at Winsor Castle in butter and beef, as well as in horses, mules and riding gear. The Pipe Springs market continued as long as the gold rush did, which was only a couple of months. On April 5 Clem wrote from Pipe that passing miners reported that "every trail to the Colorado Cañons" was "crowded with men seeking the

⁷³ *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 154.

⁷⁴ Dellenbaugh, "Diary, 1871–1873," 8–9 March 1872.

⁷⁵ *Deseret News*, May 8, 1872, UDN; *Salt Lake Herald*, May 16, 1872, 1, UDN; and Dellenbaugh, *A Canyon Voyage*, 185.

new Eldorado.”⁷⁶ Clem reported that ragtag miners arrived at Winsor Castle in “all sorts of outfits.” They came on foot, astride mules and horses, as well as in wagons and donkey-carts. These “useless” conveyances were therefore probably parked for safekeeping at Pipe “for a price.” Meanwhile Bishop Winsor made a fortune for the cooperative owners of the Pipe Springs Ranch by selling trail-worthy horses and mules. These animals and outfits brought top dollar, Clem noting that “a mule, with saddle and bridle, cost here from \$40 to \$50.” After having spent nearly a half year operating in Kanab’s barter economy, Clem wrote that the cold hard cash Bishop Winsor took from the miners was “fair to see.” The “good bishop” collected “silver dollars, halves, and quarters, five-dollar gold pieces, eagles, and double eagles,” in abundance, with “an occasional greenback [thrown in for] variety.” As if recompense for his exploitation of needy miners, Clem chuckled that “a counterfeit \$10 note was passed on [the unwitting] Mr. Winsor, that greatly puzzled the good Bishop.”⁷⁷ Fred Dellenbaugh also wrote of the immense profit Winsor was taking in, feeling that Winsor may be one of those “individuals, who care far more for the almighty dollar than they do for their own souls.”⁷⁸ Pipe Springs would not see such traffic again until long after it was designated as a national monument in 1923.

Work on the fort at Pipe continued during this period. On April 16, 1872, Francis Bishop passed the construction site as he traveled toward a new life in Salt Lake City. Bishop had been at the Springs with Powell when Young and his surveyor staked out the fort’s footings in September 1870. A year and a half later, he wrote in his diary: “Bishop Winsor has [made] quite an improvement [on the] houses in process of erection at the [Pipe] Springs. Does not look

⁷⁶ Known today as Bull Rush Wash.

⁷⁷ Walter Clement Powell to the *Chicago Tribune*, *Chicago Tribune*, July 11, 1872, in “Letters of Walter Clement Powell to the *Chicago Tribune*,” *UHQ*, 16–17 (1948–1949): 404–405.

⁷⁸ Frederick S. Dellenbaugh [Untokarowitz, pseud.] to the *Buffalo Courier*, April 24, 1876.

[anything] like the place it was 18 mos. ago.”⁷⁹ The urgency with which the fort was commenced had slackened. While the rock work reportedly was completed sometime that spring, by the end of August carpenter Joseph Hopkins was still putting on the roof.⁸⁰ While Thompson and his men triangulated and mapped Young’s sanctuary, the prophet’s need for his fort evaporated. Political developments in Washington, Salt Lake, and throughout the nation dictated that the primary reason the fort had been built ceased to exist before the fort was even finished. The Mormon prophet would never have need to use it for own his personal protection.

Powell’s Map of “The Land of Standing Rocks” and Pipe Springs

In an 1873 report to the Secretary of the Smithsonian Institution, Powell boasted that the “portion of the Colorado between the mouth of the Rio Virgen and the junction of the Grand and Green had never been mapped” until charted by his team.⁸¹ In addition to plotting the area’s unique geographic features and evaluating its arable land and supplies of water, pasture, timber, and mineral products, Powell’s team closely studied its ethnology and natural history. As he reported, the completion of his survey in 1873 had “filled this blank and completed the survey of the [American nation’s] last unexplored region.”⁸² To create their Great Map, Powell, Thompson and their crews made hundreds of precise triangulations in the natural world which were then plotted to scale on paper. Natural features and their contours were then sketched into scale. The

⁷⁹ *UHQ* 15 (1947): 230.

⁸⁰ J. W. Jackson, Winsor Castle, Kane Co., U. T., to Prest. Brigham Young, August 25, 1872, BYP.

⁸¹ J. W. Powell, *Report of Explorations in 1873 of the Colorado of the West and its Tributaries by Professor J. W. Powell, under the Direction of the Smithsonian Institution* (Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 1874), especially 9. Powell’s report is also available in US Congress, *House Misc. Docs.* 43d Cong. 1st Sess., 1873–74, *House Doc.* 265.

⁸² J. W. Powell, *Report of Explorations in 1873*, especially 3, 9.

triangulations emanated from the baseline and meridian Thompson's crew had so painstakingly laid out and were marked by hundreds of geodetic points or geodetic monuments, they established in the desert. These points of measurement were most often cairns or rock pillars, painstakingly constructed atop mountains and cliffs or on the edges of washes or canyons, but trees, bushes, or other lone natural markers could also perform the same function. The geodetic monuments were flagged with strips of bright cloth so they could be seen from a distance as triangulation was calculated with scientific instruments geometrically tying the points back in to the baseline and meridian to assure proper spatial relationships. Once measured with sextants, transits, theodolites, and a zenith telescope, each point was visited with barometers which enabled survey crews to calculate altitude. The geographic relationships and contours obtained by these instruments could then be plotted out to scale on paper with mathematical exactness and sketched by survey artists who created preliminary field maps which were transferred to Washington as "working-plans for the final maps" which were published in the capital.⁸³

Without specifically mentioning the Mormons' planned military use of the area, Powell explained to the congressional financiers of his survey that the most notable topographic features of the province he was mapping were "the lines of cliffs" and "escarpments of rock" that separated one region from another "by bold" and "impassable barriers, hundreds or thousands of

⁸³ William D. Johnson Jr. to editor, *Deseret News*, May 10, 1872, in *Deseret News*, May 29, 1872, UDN; J. W. Powell, *Report of Explorations in 1873*, 7; F. M. Bishop to "Dear Pantagraph," February 1872, *The Pantagraph* (Bloomington, IL), March 27, 1872, 2; J. W. Powell, "Report Preliminary [25 March 1872]," especially 10–11; and Robert W. Olsen, Jr., "The Powell Survey Kanab Base Line," in *UHQ* 37 (Spring 1969): 261–268. The original author thanks Utah geographer and surveyor Ted Biehn who in many discussions between 2010 and 2012 walked him through the technical and complex process of nineteenth-century surveying and cartography. To take exact readings, a baseline nine miles in length was laid out from a specific point in Kanab to a point south of modern Fredonia, AZ. From a stone monument his teams laid out a "48,099 and 4/10"-foot-long baseline which had to be meticulously measured fourteen feet at a time with scientific "leveling rods" and other fragile instruments they had imported. The baseline, which was crossed with an equally precise geometric meridian near Fredonia, was established with "masonic" accuracy and took nearly two months of nerve-racking team effort to delineate.

feet high.” Some of these impassable lines of cliffs, he wrote, extend over a hundred miles in length. Additionally, the territory his map covered was broken up by a dizzying array of escarpments, faults, mountains and stupendous gorges characterized by the Grand Gulch, Kanab Gulch, and the Grand Canyon itself. Even with a detailed map, these landforms and the region’s notorious aridity would make it nearly impossible for an army to penetrate Young’s desert stronghold. As the leader of the Mormons had understood for years, if the possessor of this system of natural fortresses could block the crude roads that entered this tangled battlefield and likewise control its water, the region’s incredibly broken topography could enable him to withstand a superior force indefinitely. In addition to thus protecting a web of old trails that converged at Pipe Springs, Winsor Castle was designed to serve as the Mormon command center should US troops ever actually attempt to enter the area.

Representative of the whole area, Powell wrote of a subregion that the Native Americans called Tum’-pin-wu-neir’-tu-wi[^]p, or “the Land of Standing Rocks.” It was a land littered with “tens of thousands of strange forms of rocks,” a commingling of mighty buttes, pinnacles and towers. Powell described Tum’-pin-wu-neir’-tu-wi[^]p as a “stone forest” made up of “standing forms” carved by erosion from “solid, massive beds” of “naked rock of many different colors” that were at once “weird, strange, and grand.”⁸⁴ Powell sized the challenges of the situation up this way: “Perhaps no other [map] has ever been made, the elements of which are of such magnitude” or where “the geological structure of the country [is so] complex.”⁸⁵ What he learned by observing the Mormons and dealing with the intricacies of “the geological structure” in the country embraced in his survey catapulted Powell into worldwide celebrity as a master

⁸⁴ J. W. Powell, *Report of Explorations in 1873*, 12.

⁸⁵ J. W. Powell, *Report of Explorations in 1873*, 16.

geological theorist and expert on erosion and use of arid lands. Powell, highlighting a feature that contributed to the Brigham Young's strategic interest in this unique province, wrote that the work of erosion had cut "narrow, winding gorge[s] through the solid rock, so that the whole of this region is traversed by a labyrinth of cañons."⁸⁶ As Powell forwarded his preliminary maps to Congress, he wrote that his charts revealed impenetrable "contours." He reported that "rounded hills and gentle valleys" were scarce in the area covered by his map. Instead, "cañons whose walls are everywhere abrupt," and "long lines of cliffs" surrounded by "benches, mesas, and plateaus that terminate in escarpments" all formed "impassable barriers to travel."⁸⁷ In the very days that Powell and Thompson explored an appropriate location for their baseline, Brigham Young himself visited the area "selecting safe havens" in which Latter-day Saints could hide "from eastern Devils" in "these majestic mountains."⁸⁸ Rather than opening Brigham's refuge up to the War Department, Powell's maps worked to underscore the futility of trying to send an army into it. Thus, Powell's maps played a significant role in rendering Young's battlefield and its command center untouchable.

It is important to note that the area immediately around Pipe Springs received more careful attention in the mapping process than areas further removed from Young's fort.⁸⁹ The very first triangulation taken after the baseline and meridian were completed near Kanab zeroed in on Winsor Castle, perhaps quiet testimony to the significance Young's fortress held in the minds of the mapmakers. Thus it was that the first of hundreds of geodetic monuments erected in

⁸⁶ J. W. Powell, *Report of Explorations in 1873*, 23.

⁸⁷ J. W. Powell, *Report of Explorations in 1873*, 23.

⁸⁸ Brigham Young, St. George, to Elder George Reynolds, December 11, 1871, B.Y.P.

⁸⁹ J. W. Powell, *Report of Explorations in 1873*, 8. See also J. W. Powell, Geologist in Charge, A. H. Thompson, Geographer, F. M. Bishop, F. S. Dellenbaugh, and S. V. Jones, Topographers, *Preliminary Map No. 2*. [Transcript of Filed Notes], [n.p., 1873], 55 x 68cm, Department of the Interior, US Geological and Geographical Survey of the territories, Second Division, <http://hdl.loc.gov/loc.gmd/g4332g.ct000172>.

the course of producing the map was located “on the cliff” at “Pipe Springs Point” directly overlooking Brigham’s bastion. The fact that Winsor Castle lies at the very center of Powell’s Great Map and that it was the very first spot to be triangulated is prime evidence that Powell’s survey was in large part intended to locate the sanctuary Young was building in the desert. On December 19, 1871, survey employees Stephen V. Jones and George O. McIntee were sent by Almon Thompson “to Pipe Springs to put up a monument on the cliff.”⁹⁰ On December 22 they erected their cairn on the Vermilion Cliffs overlooking Winsor Castle and placed within it a tin can containing a slip of paper recording the global position of this important spot. Some sixty-four years later, Civil Conservation Corp youths working at Pipe Spring National Monument climbed up to the cairn and retrieved the can and its contents. It serves as an example of similar papers put into untold monuments erected by the Powell survey teams all over southern Utah and northern Arizona—but this one was the first! It read:

Pipe Spring Ranche, Windsor P.O. Dec. 22nd 1871

This monument was erected December 22nd 1871 by order of the U. S. survey of the Colorado River. This point is thirty-nine degrees and forty minutes {39° 40’} South of west of a red mound seven miles south of Kanab, Utah Territory, over which passes a meridian line from which this point was triangulated. From here said point reads thirty

⁹⁰ Almon Thompson, “Diary,” 19 December 1871, in *UHQ* 7 (1939): 64. “Pajo Spring” here is a typographical error for “Pipe Spring,” as is made clear by Walter Clement Powell, “Journal of Walter Clement Powell,” *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 380; and Dellenbaugh, “Diary, 1871–1873,” December 21, 1871. When Jones returned from Pipe Springs the next day he brought “some fresh beef” from Bishop Winsor. *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 379.

nine degrees and forty minutes {39 ° 40'} north of east, distant about fifteen {15} miles.

Variation of the needle fifteen degrees and twenty minutes {15 ° -20'} east. Addeed.

[sic]

Major J. W. Powell, Geologist.

Professor A. H. Thompson, Astronomer.

S. V. Jones, Observer. ⁹¹

Powell's Great Map took several years to complete and resulted in the publication of a series of preliminary maps in Washington, DC.⁹² The "great blank" north of the Colorado River had been delineated and in the process named the Grand Canyon. It took a sizable team of eastern employees augmented by scores of local Mormons, gentiles, and Native Americans to complete the work. Mormon mule wranglers, explorers, cooks, and geodetic monument builders were paid in the form of government checks which could be cashed for gold. This provided a terrific boon for southern Utah's pioneer economy. Native American scouts and helpers were paid with blankets, food, and supplies, while Anson Winsor supplied the Powell survey with

⁹¹ J. W. Powell, "Pipe Spring Rancho," copy in Clay McCulloch Collection, b5, NAU. See also reprinted clipping from the *Price Sun*, 17 April 1936, in Clay McCulloch Collection, b5, NAU. Leonard Heaton, custodian of Pipe Springs National Monument wrote the following on 21 November 1935: "Dr. Freeman brought up a sheet of paper for me to see. Some four CCC boys had found or rather dug out of a mound of rock north west of here about one mile. It was a monument of a survey record of Major Powells [sic] work of December 22, 1871. Some find, hope we can get it from the boys. Went to see them tonight and got their consent to have a photo picture of it, if they will not donate it to the monument where it belongs. I will not give up trying to secure it for our museum collections." C. Leonard Heaton, Notes on Pipe Springs National Monument, in Charles Leonard Heaton Collection, 1879-1990, CHD, r5.

⁹² "Preliminary maps" of "the Country Surveyed in 1872 & 1873" were published in Washington by the Department of the Interior's newly formed "US Geological and Geographical Survey of the Territories, Second Division," listing John Wesley Powell as "Geologist in Charge," and A. H. Thompson as "Geographer." The only other expedition members credited on the published preliminary maps were F. M. Bishop, F. S. Dellenbaugh, and S. V. Jones, who were listed as "Topographers." See Powell et al., "Preliminary Map No.2."

thousands of pounds of Pipe Springs beef and significant quantities of cheese each year the survey operated in the area.⁹³

⁹³ *UHQ* 7 (1939): 68–69, 71, 74, 76–78, 89, 107–108; and *UHQ* 15 (1947): 221.

Chapter 8

Beating the Devil at His Own Game: Hiding from Marshals and Surrendering to the Courts

A Political Wind Change

With Brigham Young's arrest on October 2, 1871, newspapers all over the country rejoiced that the practice of polygamy in Utah was coming to an end for "the Republican party is ready to enforce the will of the people and bury this monstrous relic of barbarism by the side of its hideous twin brother" slavery. The *Emporia Weekly News* exulted that because "Brigham has been arrested and [was] in the hands of [federal authorities,] the days when he could stand up and impudently deliver his treasonable utterances against the United States [and] his blackguard harangues against all decency and his blasphemy against the Creator" were over.¹ Late in 1871, Utah's delegate to Congress, William H. Hooper, "on his own authority" began telling all he met in Washington that Utah was ready to promise to give up polygamy in exchange for statehood. Hooper had never been a staunch believer in (or a practitioner of) polygamy and his statement about Utah's willingness to negotiate for statehood did not reflect Young's actual plans. With Brigham hiding in the desert, troops amassing in Salt Lake City, and the War Department's plan to build a military post in southern Utah, Hooper felt that the practice of polygamy would need to

¹ *Emporia Weekly News* (Emporia, KS), October 20, 1871, 2, NPC.

end. He told eastern papers that the Mormon people's concession of polygamy in exchange for statehood was "our only escape from the dire evils by which we were threatened." He repeatedly asserted that he believed the people of Utah were obliged to give up polygamy, "for there was no other way that we could escape our enemies' wrath and the abandonment of the country." Though he later told George Q. Cannon he was speaking for himself, as Utah's official representative in Washington he was viewed by the Washington establishment as "the Prophet's personal delegate to Congress." As a result some received his remarks as if the people of Utah had already "conceded polygamy."² While it could be surmised that Hooper acted on Young's instructions to falsely produce a needed reprieve, Hooper's days as "Brigham's delegate to Congress" were soon over for good.³

A wealthy capitalist himself, Hooper was well-connected and well-liked in Washington. With Hooper's prodding, many politicians—and the capitalists whose money elected them—believed that Utah's mines were "the richest and most abundant in the world." Most agreed that excitement and interest in Utah's minerals were "daily increasing" in the nation at large. It was common knowledge that the Emma Mine (which Chief Justice McKean happened to be financially involved in) sold that year "to New York Capitalists" for 1.5 million dollars. It was estimated that Utah's population would be bolstered by "at least thirty thousand [new] miners" during the summer of 1871, substantially weakening Mormon power. "Our Hotels are crowded & our mountains are being filled with workers and prospectors," Judge Hawley wrote to Senator

² George Q. Cannon, Washington, DC to "My dear Friend" [Thomas L. Kane], December 25, 1871, TKC. Fearing their letters might fall into enemy hands, high-ranking Mormons often did not refer to Kane by name in their letters to or about him, using instead phrases like "our friend," or "our esteemed friend."

³ In an August 1872 letter, written just after George Q. Cannon was elected to replace William H. Hooper as Utah's delegate to Congress, Brigham Young wrote that Hooper had "requested a release from his labors, *which have been very arduous to a person of his temperament.*" Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, U. T. to Elder Edward Stevenson, Des Moines, Iowa, August 6, 1872, BYP.

Lyman Trumbull that spring.⁴ A potential war with the Mormons was bad for mining and other big money enterprises, and powerful financiers wanted Grant's crusade against the Mormons stopped immediately. Young had never been interested in the mines for the wealth they could bring to his people, but he understood the value of Utah's mineral wealth in currying alliances with important investors. "Sources of wealth are opening up all around us, which are clamoring for development," Young wrote to Thomas Kane in April 1871. "Railroads have to be built; Iron works erected; smelting works & crushing mills; and machinery for all classes of manufactures introduced. The attention of capitalists is being called to these facts and we as a people must either give way, or, as in the case of the UPRR unite our labor with outside capital, and judiciously assist in developing the great resources of our Territory."⁵ This willingness to "unite with outside capital," and "assist in developing the great resources of our Territory," partially explains the church president's support of John Wesley Powell's geologic survey, despite the risks involved in letting gentiles map his country. While a threat to his kingdom on many levels, "the mining interests," like capitalists in general, were now coming to his rescue by advocating against Grant's anti-Mormon agenda. In a letter to Thomas Kane, Brigham Young explained "Utah's resources can never be developed while she remains a Territory subject to such a state of things as we have been and are now passing through. Capitalists are chary of investing wealth with a community where bigoted and partizan [*sic*] Governors & Judges arrogate the right of trampling law and order under their feet, not only rendering capital unsafe, but even life, as well as paralysing [*sic*] every industry and prostrating business of every class."⁶

⁴ C. M. Hawley, Salt Lake City, to Hon L. Trumbull, April 12, 1871, in RG 60, General Records of the Department of Justice, Source Chronological Files, 1871-84, Utah, box 1012, December 1870 to July 1871, NA2.

⁵ Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, U. T., to Gen. Thomas L. Kane, Kane, McKean Co., April 16, 1871, TLKC.

⁶ Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, U. T., to Gen. Thomas L. Kane, Kane, McKean Co., Pa., March 5, 1872, TLK, r10, b15, f6.

Even before his arrest, Young expressed his confidence that economic factors would be his salvation. On August 30, 1871, he wrote to Apostle Orson Hyde “Notwithstanding the incessant howlings of our enemies . . . all is peace, and we expect to continue in the enjoyment thereof, so long as we continue faithful in the service of our God. Active developments are on the increase here, in almost every branch of industry . . . Capitalists and Speculators are flocking in—many of whom are mere adventurers . . . while others represent large interests” who “are generally conservative men who prefer good order and peace to strife and politics.”⁷

John Wesley Powell’s benefactor, Illinois Senator Lyman Trumbull, was keenly interested in opening Utah’s mineral wealth and played a major part in obtaining funding for Powell’s geological survey. Trumbull was also Chair of the Senate Judiciary Committee and was becoming an important point man for attacking the unconstitutionality of Grant’s judicial policies, as implemented through Utah Chief Justice McKean. Though a key leader in Grant’s Republican Party, Trumbull was about to announce that he would support Horace Greeley in the coming election because of Grant’s “excesses.” Even more troublesome for Grant was that US Attorney General Amos T. Akerman broke ranks with the administration’s Utah policy over the same constitutional issues and threatened to bring the issue to the Supreme Court. Akerman’s successor, Attorney General George H. Williams “never sanctioned the proceedings in Utah, and reportedly told the President so.” Like a growing number of public officers he was openly “on the side of the Mormons” for simple constitutional reasons.⁸ While anti-Mormon public opinion remained strong, the national press and its readership were questioning Grant’s abuse of power.

⁷ Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, U.T., to Prest. Orson Hyde, Spring City, San Pete Co., August 30, 1871, BYLB, SCA.

⁸ “Review of Affairs in Utah. By an Outsider: Washington Correspondence of the *Cincinnati Commercial*,” MS 34 (July 9, 1872): 435–436. “Akerman never did know great quantities of law, but he knew enough to understand that we were getting an elephant on our hands in making an illegal crusade against Salt Lake.”

As Young was arrested in Salt Lake, Attorney General Akerman, Senators Trumbull and Morten, Major General William T. Sherman, and a host of other key government leaders —each for his own reasons—silently worked behind the President’s back to thwart McKean’s anti-Mormon judicial crusade. Simultaneously, Utah’s prosecuting attorney Charles H. Hempstead was lured by a love of the constitution (and the prophet’s bankroll) to turn away from McKean and hire on as one of Young’s private attorneys.

Charles Hempstead’s replacement as Utah’s United States District Attorney, George C. Bates, was a fair-minded and constitutionally uncompromising attorney from Chicago. Grant was forced into Bates’ appointment by leaders within his own party who opposed McKean’s roughshod and illegal judicial practices. Mormons knew George Bates was “a Trumbull man” who was scrupulously honest, legally astute, and strictly just.⁹ He was commissioned by Attorney General Akerman to see that Brigham Young was neither lynched symbolically in the court of public opinion nor literally by the soldiers at Camp Douglas. Under the attorney general’s direction, Bates sought to slow down McKean’s court calendar by making a motion “that the criminal cases now on the Docket be postponed until the 8[th] or 15th of January.” Bates’ ulterior motive was to give time for McKean’s proceedings to be brought before the Supreme Court, which would further delay or even quash all of McKean’s cases. There was a risk that McKean would send a posse to haul Young before his court, forcing him to forfeit his bail bond for not showing up in court himself on December 2, 1871, for his unlawful cohabitation case. McKean desperately needed the bail bond to finance his proceedings.¹⁰

⁹ D. H. Wells, G. Q. Cannon, and H S W to Brigham Young & Geo A Smith, December 2, 1871, BYP.

¹⁰ D. H. Wells, G. Q. Cannon, and H S W to Brigham Young & Geo A Smith, December 2, 1871, BYP.

Even before the prophet “absconded,” McKean was poignantly aware that the political winds were shifting in Brigham’s favor. On October 9, 1871, only a week after seeing Young arrested, Judge McKean unburdened himself in a private letter to President Grant that “the obstacles constantly rising up before” him were “too great . . . to surmount.” “The most discouraging of all obstacles” for McKean was “the fact, that so many government officials, outside of Utah, utterly fail to appreciate the situation here.”¹¹ Had Young known the depths of McKean’s despair and the court’s poverty he might have chosen to remain in Salt Lake that October. However, the murder of Joseph Smith by the Illinois State Militia when under the “control” of government authority had great impact on Brigham Young’s psyche and the combined Mormon consciousness. He had seen the smoldering corpse of his prophet, hero, and friend, and had sworn never to put himself or his church in the position Joseph had when he submitted himself to government authority for legal hearings. But with the political wind change, Young was willing to come back and attempt “to beat the Devil at his own game” in the courts, but only if he could be guaranteed not to be held prisoner at Camp Douglas before his trial.

Daniel H. Wells wrote or telegraphed his fellow First Presidency members-in-exile almost every day to inform each of them on their political situation.¹² The *Deseret Telegraph*

¹¹James B. McKean, Chief Justice, Salt Lake City, to his Excellency, U. S. Grant, President, October 9, 1871, in RG 60, General Records of the Department of Justice, Source Chronological Files, 1871–84, Utah, b1012, December 1870 to July 1871, NA2.

¹² Daniel H. Wells to Brigham Young and George A. Smith, December 6, 1871, BYP. On December 7, “at Hurricane Ledge near mouth Rock Cañon[,] No. Arizonia,” while returning to St. George from Pipe Springs, Young and his small exilic entourage received Wells’ daily missive written the day before. After talking “very confidential[ly]” with the new US Attorney, Hempstead was convinced Young’s legal team could accomplish “a good deal through the influence of Mr Bates” especially if Young would voluntarily deliver himself up to the court. On the advice of Hempstead and Bates, Wells wrote Young: “If there should be a fair show for Justice and right before the Court and you should come that long distance through the inclement season of the year & go into court with out even having been arrested it would be a grand good thing & do more to kill the influence of the Ring both here & abroad than any one thing I can imagine I should however not recommend any such thing at present nor until some other developments or assurances can be had all of which I shall give you timely notice & should they be ever so favorable and strong I wish you to act only upon the suggestion of the spirit to yourself.” Wells promised his

ensured that no matter where he went as he examined prospective battlefields and hiding places in his St. George, Ft. Pearce, Pipe Springs, and Kanab bastions, he was never out of contact. Young employed various telegraphic codes through which important encrypted messages could be sent and received. He carried with him a small code booklet¹³ and also employed codes of his own design, including one he named the Secret Mormon Cypher, which he distributed to key leaders up and down his line.¹⁴ He thus remained in constant (and secret) contact with his attorneys as well as his political and ecclesiastical advisors both in Utah and elsewhere throughout the nation. Young was advised by his attorneys to make overtures to the newly arrived US Prosecuting Attorney Bates that he would be willing to return to Salt Lake and stand trial *if* he could be assured that he would not be exposed to unnecessary danger by being incarcerated at Camp Douglas, and *if* he could be assured of obtaining a fair trial. Obtaining bail so he could remain safely at home behind the high walls of his own Salt Lake compound when not actually in court was of the essence.

Before Bates' arrival, Robert Baskin, acting US attorney for Utah, had declared in open court that "Brigham Young was a fugitive from justice," and prophesied that the Prophet "would never again be seen in Salt Lake City unless brought there by the officers of the law." The first week in December, Wells apprised Young of the movements of some 400 US troops being

church president "when I receive such assurance as I think can be depended upon [that you will be safe in returning] I will let you know."

¹³ Charles S. Larrabee, *Larrabee's Cipher and Secret Letter and Telegraph Code, with Hogg's Improvements. The Most Perfect Secret Code ever Invented or Discovered. Impossible to be Read without the Key. Invaluable for Secret, Military, Naval, and Diplomatic Services, as well as for Brokers, Bankers, and Merchants* (New York: D. Van Nostrand, Publisher, 1871), in TLKC, b16, f16.

¹⁴ This cypher, in which letters of the alphabet were scrambled by shared key, was distributed by the First Presidency to apostles, bishops, and other key leaders, with the following instructions: "This cypher must not be lost or shown to a second person, and must be kept for strictly private use. It may be used over the Tel. lines or through the mails. It can be made still more effective if two or more short words are blended or run together, so as to make them appear as one word and all long words divided and made appear as two words. The following persons are each in possession of a copy of this cypher. Don't lose or reveal it." [List of names included.] "Secret Mormon Cypher," TLKC, b17, f10.

shipped from San Francisco, down the coast of California and then up the Colorado River, ostensibly to fight Apaches in Arizona. Simultaneously he imparted intelligence he had obtained that “Gen Morrow contemplates a trip perhaps in March look out a road from Southern Utah into Arizona & if successful wishes to supply troops there from our settlements[.]”¹⁵ Part of Young’s whole strategy was to use the Arizona line to protect himself from McKean’s jurisdiction, which did not stretch across the territorial border. Joseph Smith had set a worthy example for his chief disciple by using state lines and complex and cumbersome interstate jurisdictional law to protect himself from extradition and prosecution. The saints had left the United States behind once already when they settled beside the Great Salt Lake, and would do so again, sheltering large colonies of polygamists in Canada and Mexico. From the start Young needed to be sure his private Pipe Springs fortress was clearly inside Arizona, and this was a primary reason for bringing Utah’s official territorial surveyor along when he selected Winsor Castle’s location in September 1870. Young and Powell and their respective chief surveyors knew the importance of establishing by precise scientific measurement that Winsor Castle was eleven miles *inside* Arizona. Arizona’s paucity of civilized settlement, efficient political organization and law enforcement machinery, buttressed geographically by the great chasm of the Grand Canyon, would keep Young politically and militarily isolated on the Arizona Strip. (This policy was adopted extensively by polygamist Mormon fundamentalists during the twentieth century, as cities of refuge such as Hildale, Utah and Colorado City, Arizona were established near or directly on the Utah-Arizona border to facilitate quick dodging of jurisdiction simply by stepping across the line.)

¹⁵ Daniel H. Wells to Brigham Young and George A. Smith, December 5 and 6, 1871, BYP.

Another motivation for Young's sudden interest in submitting himself to the courts was that he was receiving assurances from Senate Judiciary Committee Chair Trumbull that the US Supreme Court was willing to take up the issue of McKean's illegal judiciary machinations upon which Young's arrest warrants were based and promised that they would certainly be found to be unconstitutional—thus making the charges against the church president null and void. This was complicated by the change of the attorney general in mid-December, and it needed to be ascertained if Akerman's successor could be counted on to bring the issue before the Supreme Court. Coded telegrams and letters flew between Brigham's various hideouts in Dixie and Canaan and Salt Lake City and Washington, arranging Young's submission to a much more subdued and restricted Chief Justice McKean. Young's most trusted gentile political, legal, and financial advisor, Thomas L. Kane, was kept in the center of this; he was, perhaps even more than William H. Hooper (Utah's delegate to Congress), the church president's most important contact with the Washington establishment. A coded telegram found in Thomas Kane's papers seems to have been sent by Kane and John W. Young, on November 30, 1871 from Kane (then in Pennsylvania) to William Dougal, secretary of the Deseret Telegraph Company (in Salt Lake City), advising Young not to submit to the courts nor allow US officials learn of his whereabouts.¹⁶

In Another important piece of correspondence, dated November 30, 1871, written by Thomas L. Kane to Brigham Young in the presence of William H. Hooper and John W. Young in Philadelphia, was apparently carried to Salt Lake City in John W. Young's pocket, and sent on to the elder Young's constantly moving entourage with strict instructions that its

¹⁶ John W. Young visited Thomas L. Kane on this date and it appears that they penned and sent the telegraph that day. Thomas L. Kane and John W. Young to William Dougal, Salt Lake City, telegram, in Thomas Leiper Kane Collection, MS 16717, b16, f18, CHL. See also Thomas L. Kane, Philadelphia, PA, to Brigham Young, November 30, 1871, TLK, b15, f5.

contents “be kept absolutely secret.” This letter was an anomaly, as Kane noted that during Young’s St. George-Pipe Springs exile he corresponded “freely” with Young only usually “declined to correspond with [Young] freely except by cipher.” The letter urged Young to keep his plans to himself and to “Continue in hiding observing every precaution to prevent your place of refuge from being disclosed.” Excerpts from these drafts follow:

In the present crisis, I can think of nothing so essential to the safety of your people as your personal security. It is their first duty to establish you where you will be exempt, not only from arrest or violence, but from every apprehension of it. They stand in need of your unembarrassed judgment on their affairs: Your mind should not be burdened by unnecessary [sic] cares—ought you not to welcome such an occassion [sic] for rest from sordid business thoughts?—Your pecuniary interests cannot suffer very grievously by your neglecting them a single winter.— If your creditors miss you, will they be less likely to lend a hand to help you back to your counting room? — I repeat, for the third time, I myself need to have you in your best and freshest mind to consult with. — So much; for the future of your people, your friends, your family, depends on your having a clear insight into matters now!

Besides yourself, I would also have George A., Taylor, Pratt—all the men of men of the old rock where names are familiar to the public keep out of the way. If we do not want you, we do not want them either to be cited or misquoted as the authority for anything.

We do not want your persecutors to get hold of any man with name enough to help them to a sensation trial. They are at their wits end for their next excitement.¹⁷

It is significant to note that abandoning polygamy altogether in exchange for Utah's statehood was a topic of serious discussion between Young and his closest advisors. So too was the duplicitous policy of pretending to swear off polygamy until statehood was granted, and then treacherously going back to it, a policy that was eventually implemented long after Young's death and continues to taint Utah's Mormon-gentile relations. Kane makes it clear that the later position was championed by Hooper, among others. He did not recommend "the pretended acceptance by your citizens of a [state] Constitution containing features repugnant to their principles." "Duplicity on your part is not good policy," Kane repeatedly wrote. "As regards the actual abandonment of Polygamy," the Pennsylvanian general wrote the prophet, "that is a question between you and your God, And I have naught to say on it." But Kane repeatedly warned him that there were "some members of your Church [that] might gain influence by its nominal proscription by law, and others would be the losers by it." To Kane, Young would be among the losers if such a policy, and its supporters, were to gain influence. Kane was adamant that the time of Young securely hiding in his desert bastion was *not* the time to discuss abandoning polygamy with his opponents. Aware Hooper had recently (and in his mind prematurely) been discussing such a concession with Washington power brokers, Kane suggested that Hooper be muzzled for some time on that and most other points. Kane had already sought to silence Hooper and told Young that there would be time enough to "proffer a

¹⁷ Thomas L. Kane, Philadelphia, PA, to Brigham Young, November 30, 1871, TLK, b15, f5. Quotations from all three drafts are used here. Additional excerpts can be found in the original Historic Resource study, September 2015; mb edits 7/2020.

consideration” such as exchanging polygamy for political deliverance “when the U. S. Government are prepared to bargain with you.” “It is poor bargaining, to offer a consideration before it is asked for,” Young’s advisor cogently advised, and he reiterated one of his reasons for advising Young to remain in hiding by writing “Your absence [from Salt Lake City], as I have said will best keep your non committal for you.” Desert hiding did not just keep the prophet safe, it also preserved “the Principle” along with him.

When it came to the public pronouncements of the hierarchy, Kane emphasized that the political situation called for “Discretion, Discretion, Discretion.” Planning a southern escape route out of Utah and into Arizona—and ultimately to Mexico—was a strategy Kane had urged for over a decade, but complained that the Mormons leaders had belligerently broadcast their intention, giving their enemies time to develop countermeasures. The fact that the Powell survey was at that very moment preparing their Kanab baseline, which would enable them to plot Young’s escape routes on government maps, demonstrates the cost of such lack of discretion. Again, Kane spoke boldly to Young about not telegraphing his intentions to their enemies by unguarded remarks: “I particularly deprecate uncalled for remarks about your removing from Utah or any part of it. . . . No sign [of your intention] should be manifested . . . before your mind is fully resolved to make it [or] before you are certain that your followers will be a unit upon it.” Kane continued: “The effect which I have seen upon the mind of a certain prominent persons, of rumors which have been in circulation of a change in the polygamic dispensation [and of] your removal to Arizona or British Columbia have shown me what would be the evils of premature revelation of any purpose.” Silently bringing the Saints to a “unity of the faith” regarding their collective course must occur without allowing the administration to become aware of their plans.

Submission and House Arrest

Brigham Young ended his self-imposed exile and submitted himself to McKean and Prosecutor Bates on January 2, 1872. His attorneys negotiated his surrender in advance and sought a deal where he could be released on bail. Prosecuting Attorney Bates worked to assure Young's attorneys that some sort of agreement could be made to keep Young out of Fort Douglas, but the ultimate decision was in McKean's hands as chief justice of the territory of Utah. At precisely 11 a.m. on the morning of January 2, as previously arranged, Territorial Marshal A.D. Patrick was admitted to the Lion House and for the second time, read Young the warrant for his arrest for the murder of Yates and Buck on the testimony of "the notorious Bill Hickman." Having had months to think about this moment, Young received his arrest "with the utmost coolness and apparent unconcern." Young, escorted by the marshal and his two counselors in the First Presidency, entered McKean's crowded courtroom. The bail hearing lasted no more than half an hour as the question of bail had been "exhaustively argued" by Young's attorneys "some weeks since." The prophet's counsel pressed the point that a man who "had come back of his own volition, to obey the mandate of the Court" by traveling over four hundred miles "in the dead of Winter, and amid such storms, and over such roads as are peculiar to this country," was not likely to skip bail (though from McKean's point of view he had done precisely that not three months before). He was "an old man, seventy-one years of age, in delicate health" and that "a lengthened imprisonment would seriously, if not fatally, jeopardize his life." Prosecutor Bates "admitted the right of the accused to bail," and even argued for it, citing the recent case of Jefferson Davis, who, as President of the Southern Confederacy, "had shed more blood than any man who ever lived" and was admitted to bail for the high crime of

treason. Bates also cited Utah's peculiar circumstances, there being "no place within the limits of this Territory in which to confine persons charged with high crimes and misdemeanors," except a military prison which was neither designed nor funded for civilian use. Regarding Young's earlier disappearance into the South, Bates declared that "the only issue involved was whether this defendant should be forthcoming to answer for the enormous crimes charged against him." Committed to strict justice, Bates only asked that Young "be treated precisely as any other person would be treated who might be charged with a similar offense." If bail should be accepted, considering the high profile of the case, he suggested that "the amount be fixed at five hundred thousand dollars."

Young's attorney, Thomas Fitch, objected to Bates' suggested amount as being exorbitant and "totally unprecedented" in American history, arguing that even Jefferson Davis was released on bail for the paltry sum of one hundred thousand dollars. These arguments were superfluous, however, for McKean was resolved to proffer no bail. Having saved face by granting Young "no quarter," McKean acknowledging that since the "Government [had] no jail" in Utah, "the Marshal was required to exercise his discretion as to the place of confinement under process from the United States Courts." As "the prisoner is reported to be the owner of several houses in the city," McKean intimated, the marshal was at liberty to hold him under house arrest in one of his own buildings, but this was the duty of the prisoner to suggest and for the marshal to accept at his own option. After leaving the courthouse, Young tendered the Marshal use of the Lion House-president's office-Beehive House complex; Patrick accepted and for the next four months the prophet was to be "a prisoner in his own house." Since many of his wives and children lived there, and his office and a staff of clerks were located there, the situation was amenable to the church president and he entered confinement appearing "perfectly

cool and unconcerned” to the *New York Times* correspondent who reported the day’s proceedings.¹⁸

In Utah, both Mormons and gentiles geared up to watch what many felt would be the certain conclusion of “the irrepressible conflict between the Kingdom and the Republic,” nervous about “what might be expected in the future.”¹⁹ As Young settled down to a period of quiet rest and political consolidation, confident his attorneys would be successful in laying McKean’s illegal court proceedings before the United States Supreme Court, tension between Mormons and gentiles increased. Governor Woods organized a “Christian Bible Class” to meet each Sunday afternoon, which some Mormons felt was simply a front for a newly organized secret society called the Gentile League of Utah, or the GLU. Fearing the church was on the verge of declaring independence and assassinating the leaders of the Utah Ring, the GLU made plans to sustain Woods, McKean, and constitutional government by force of arms.²⁰ Meanwhile, Thomas Fitch led a delegation to Washington to mobilize pro-Mormon forces in helping the admission of “Deseret” into the Union. While continuing his work defending Young in McKean’s court, Fitch had helped write a new constitution for Utah, and hoped to be elected one of the proposed state’s senators for his efforts. Chief of what were called “Jack-Mormons,” or “those who have something to make out of Brigham,” Fitch delivered a passionate and eloquent speech on the floor of Congress making “the consequences of a Mormon war his chief salient point.” He argued a civil war with the Mormons “would cost the nation millions of money and thousands of men and interrupt the progress of the Rocky Mountain country for the next quarter of a century.” Fitch admitted that in such a war “the United States would ultimately conquer and

¹⁸ *New York Times*, January 3, 1872, 8.

¹⁹ *Salt Lake Tribune*, January 22, 1872, 2, UDN.

²⁰ *Salt Lake Tribune*, March 12, 1872, UDN.

Mormondom be utterly annihilated,” but he “affirmed that it would take years to accomplish it.” All along Fitch tried to work a deal where Mormons would give up polygamy in exchange for Utah statehood. While the First Presidency and the twelve apostles occasionally talked about the implications of such a decision, Young wrote his brother Phineas on March 18, 1872, that he “need not be alarmed about our sacrificing any principle of our holy religion for the sake of being admitted; that would be paying ‘too dear for our whistle’ and we would not get it then.”²¹

Test Case: Clinton vs. Englebrecht

Amid this turmoil during the winter of 1871–1872, Eastern observers were impressed with “the almost sublime faith which the Mormons had in the [US] Supreme Court” to save their prophet, polygamy, and their theocratic system.²² The administration and Congress might be “corrupt as Hell,” but Mormons generally held the hope that the high court was still true to the “Divine Principles” of the US constitution. For nearly a decade Young had announced to anyone who would listen that the anti-polygamy law Congress had passed in 1862 was unconstitutional. National press articles noted that “Brigham Young has always avowed himself perfectly willing to submit to the laws of the United States when administered according to law.”²³ He believed that the establishment clause and the related free exercise clause of the First Amendment to the Constitution of the United States, i.e., “Congress shall make no law respecting an establishment of religion, or prohibiting the free exercise thereof,” released the Mormons from observing any

²¹ Brigham Young, S. L. City, to Bishop P. H. Young, Kamas, Summit Co., March 18, 1872, BYLB, SCA, DVD 25, b13, 10–11.

²² “Review of Affairs in Utah. By an Outsider. Washington Correspondence of the *Cincinnati Commercial*,” MS 34 (July 9, 1872): 435.

²³ *New York Herald* article from April 25, 1872 reprinted in the *Salt Lake Tribune*, May 2, 1872, 2, UDN.

laws proscribing their religious practices. To Young, the clauses protected the Latter-day Saints in all their controversial religious practices—from polygamy to establishing their own kingdom inside the boundaries of the American Republic, and included self-rule of their communities according to their own peculiar religious values.

Certain that the US Supreme Court would agree with the “righteousness” of his position, Young desperately wanted to bring not only the 1862 Morrill Anti-Bigamy Act before the highest tribunal of the land, but also a test case to challenge the constitutionality of the Grant-McKean judicial system.²⁴ Bringing a case before the Supreme Court would also shift the focus from Utah to Washington and give Young the opportunity to justify his blatant past “rebellions” before the entire nation. Part of Young’s purpose in absconding to his Kanab-Pipe Springs bastion was to stall for time to allow his attorneys to bring a case testing McKean’s “illegal proceedings” before the Supreme Court. His chief gentile attorney, Thomas Fitch, believed that “under the jury-packing system” in practice in Utah in the fall of 1871, and Judge McKean’s “chargings” to these juries beforehand that Young was indeed guilty, the chief Mormon had “no chance whatever” to obtain a fair trial. “Therefore I say, as counsel to Brigham Young,” he told the reporter, “that if he does absent himself from such a tribunal until the United States Supreme Court at Washington passes on a test case we have sent there, he will only anticipate the advice of his counsel. . . . We expect an early hearing of this case to test the validity of the jury abuse which is involved in all the other [McKean] trials.”²⁵

The test case Young and his attorneys selected to challenge Grant’s judicial crusade in Utah was *Clinton v. Engelbrecht*, a case involving the confiscation and destruction of some

²⁴ “Review of Affairs in Utah. By an Outsider. Washington Correspondence of the *Cincinnati Commercial*,” in *MS* 34 (July 9, 1872): 435.

²⁵ *Deseret News*, November 29, 1871, 9, UDN; and Walker, *Diary*, 1: 341.

\$20,000 worth of alcohol from a pair of gentile liquor wholesalers by a posse comitatus dispatched by Salt Lake City municipal authorities. As in all McKean's cases, the issue was that the chief judge created packed gentile grand juries to indict, which was not in accordance with Utah territorial law. In 1870 the Mormons, "by virtue of their control of [Salt Lake City], discouraged the sale of liquor by a severe tax, a tax so high that it almost amounted to prohibition." Paul Engelbrecht and Christian Rehemke, the pair of liquor wholesalers, were reportedly assessed the exorbitant fee of \$15,000 per annum for a Salt Lake City liquor license. The fee costing nearly as much as their stock, Engelbrecht and his partner refused to pay and sold without a license. In an attempt to "abate illegal whisky selling," Salt Lake City Police Magistrate Jeter Clinton (a Mormon) issued a warrant to a Latter-day Saint marshal "requiring him to destroy their stock of liquor." Their attorney, Robert Baskin, reported that on August 27, 1870, the city marshal and a number of Salt Lake City police "entered their establishment and rolled and carried on to the sidewalk every barrel, keg, bottle and vessel containing liquor, and with axes and hammers broke all of them and poured the contents into the gutters." They likewise "destroyed every fixture and article" used in Engelbrecht and Rehemke's business. The incident was part of a bitter struggle between gentiles and Mormons for the economic and political control of Salt Lake City. Engelbrecht and Rehemke sued the City for "treble damages allowed by the provisions of a Utah statute for the malicious destruction of property." Newspapers throughout the country heralded the assault on Engelbrecht and Rehemke's property as the opening "of the long expected Mormon War."²⁶ Mormons hoped the temperance issue

²⁶ See "Review of Affairs in Utah. By an Outsider: Washington Correspondence of the *Cincinnati Commercial*" in *MS 34* (July 9, 1872): 435; Robert Newton Baskin, *Reminiscences of Early Utah* (n.p., 1914), 32–35; Whitney, *History of Utah*, 2:565–567; JH, September 22, 1870, 1; and *Georgia Weekly Telegraph and Georgia Journal & Messenger* (Macon, GA), September 20, 1870, NCN.

might split the loyalties of religious reformers in the east and thereby deflect some of the focus the assault on McKean's system was likely to bring to Mormon theocracy, polygamy, and the church president's alleged murders.

Young returned to Salt Lake and submitted himself to Judge McKean early in January 1872, only after his test case was taken up by the Supreme Court. McKean was forced to put Young's trial on hold while he waited for Congress to appropriate financing for his prosecutions, and even more importantly, while he waited to see how the Supreme Court would rule on the Engelbrecht case. On April 15, 1872, Chief Justice Salmon P. Chase, in a strong and unanimous decision, delivered an opinion that declared McKean's whole system to be illegal. The Engelbrecht decision ruled that McKean had unlawfully driven the "Mormons out of the jury-box," then "charged them out of court" completely, running "his judicial machine entirely in the interest of the Gentiles."²⁷ The decision was a full repudiation of McKean's regime and destroyed in an instant over two years' worth of intense judicatory maneuvering.²⁸ Some "130 indictments found by grand juries drawn in accordance with the practice in United States courts rather than the territorial statutes" were thrown out, including Brigham Young's lewd and lascivious conduct case, unlawful cohabitation case, and murder case. Within twenty-four hours of the announcement of the Engelbrecht decision, telegrams reached Salt Lake City to the effect that the Justice Department had ordered that all prosecutions against the church president were to cease immediately.²⁹ US Attorney Bates ordered that all prisoners, including Brigham Young, be

²⁷ *Deseret News*, April 17, 1872, and May 8, 1872, UDN; and "Review of Affairs in Utah. By an Outsider: Washington Correspondence of the *Cincinnati Commercial*" in *MS 34* (July 9, 1872): 435–436. The full text of the *Clinton v. Engelbrecht* decision, 879 US S. Ct., December Term, 1871, can be found in *Deseret News*, May 8, 1872, 10, UDN.

²⁸ Thomas G. Alexander, "Federal Authority Versus Polygamic Theocracy: James B. McKean and the Mormons, 1870–1875," in *Dialogue* 1 (Autumn 1966): 87.

²⁹ Blair B. Holmes, ed., "The Journal of James Sherlock Cantwell," 1973, 87, CHD. All other indictments tendered by McKean's gentile grand jury system were similarly "quashed."

released posthaste, while *The New York Tribune* trumpeted that “the blow to the administration by the Supreme Court decision is as great as any it has yet received,” and severely criticized “the action of the President in urging on the prosecution against the wishes and advice of both [US Attorneys Generals] Akerman and Williams.”³⁰

As the San Francisco *Newsletter* cogently affirmed, the Engelbrecht decision was destined to be of crucial importance for Mormons, Utah, United States territorial history, and American religious history. “The decision is a very important one,” the *Newsletter* said, “and is a virtual declaration by the highest authority in the land that no portion of the people of the United States—however abhorrent their religious faith—can be deprived of their liberties except by due process of law[.]”³¹ Despite Grant’s support, McKean and his associates were described by the San Francisco *Newsletter* and papers like the Cincinnati *Commercial* and the Louisville *Courier Journal* as “political intriguers and anti-Mormon religious sect[arians] combined to overthrow the liberties of the Mormon people.” These and scores of other papers throughout the country denounced the “outrages” of these “religious and political bigots, who [had] proved themselves to be even more fanatical than the Mormons.” Such statements delighted the Latter-day Saints, who had suffered for two years under these “anti-Mormon fanatics [who] in their zeal twisted and distorted the law to carry out their purposes.” “They have ignominiously failed,” the *Newsletter* rejoiced, “and the American people can feel grateful and secure that the Supreme Court—always the pride and hope of the nation—will be governed by law and not by passions and prejudices.”

³⁰ *Salt Lake Tribune*, April 23, 1872, 1, UDN; and “Review of Affairs in Utah. By an Outsider: Washington Correspondence of the *Cincinnati Commercial*” in *MS 34* (July 9, 1872): 437.

³¹ *Salt Lake Tribune*, April 24, 1872, UDN.

Many of the same newspapers that lauded the action of the Supreme Court also pointed out that the Engelbrecht decision did not “by any means settle the Mormon problem.” In fact, it was a call to proceed legally against “the political and religious institution[s] of the Mormons [which] are not in harmony with our Republican Government.” They understood that Utah was still “theocratic in every sense” and must gradually be changed by “American and cosmopolitan ideas.” Even as the papers announced news of the High Court’s decision, they spoke of bills, like one Representative Daniel W. Voorhees of Indiana had just introduced in Congress “to aid in enforcing the laws in Utah.” The bill, when passed by both houses, would “cover all the grounds needed to prosecute the Mormons legally.”³² But for now there was some respite for Young and his people.

Brigham Young was released from his imprisonment on April 25, through the medium of a newly resurrected “Mormon Probate Court and a writ of *habeas corpus*.” The *New York Times* reported that Young’s exceptionally large family “crowded around the prophet with congratulations upon his release,” and that his son, Brigham Young Jr. and “Capt. EVANS, the Deputy Marshal, who has acted as his jailor, [were] the first to shake hands with the old man and extend their congratulations.” Although the court was filled with Mormons, the *Times* correspondent noted that “no unseemly demonstrations” or “applause were made.” The scene was so quiet, dignified and familial, that “a stranger ignorant of the *personelle* of the parties present would scarcely have supposed that the greatest criminal of the age—if reports be true—had just been released from incarceration and restored to his liberty.”³³ Though he repeatedly stated he would “cast no reflections” on his persecutors, he apparently could not resist this dig at

³² *Salt Lake Tribune*, April 24, 1872.

³³ *New York Times*, April 26 and May 11, 1872.

President Grant, Governor Woods, and Chief Justice McKean: “A man who sits as President of the United States, as a Governor of a State or Territory, or as a judge upon the bench, . . . who would reduce himself to the feelings, and narrow contracted views of [sectarianism], is not fit for the place.” A subtle reference to Grant’s ongoing campaign for a second term in the presidential chair he said, “He that most desires an office is the least fit for it.” Of his personal jailor, Deputy Marshal Isaac F. Evans, the prophet had nothing but praise. Captain Evans “acted the gentleman as much as any man could” under the circumstances, and Young said, “I have not one word, one lisp or beat of the heart to complain of him. He has been full of kindness, thoughtful, never intruding.” In complimenting Evans, Young gave an unexpectedly open view into the nature of his house arrest.

I have not seen a gentleman in my acquaintance that possesses more of the real spirit of gentility, caution and of true etiquette than Captain Evans. He has passed the window where I have lodged through the winter every morning to his breakfast and every afternoon; he has walked in the street in front of my office and on the opposite side, and he has never yet been seen gazing and looking at my buildings, or to see who was at the window, or even look at my window. He has never looked into the second room in my office unless invited there—never. Can you say that for other gentlemen?

Young’s description of his gentle jailer, Captain Isaac Evans’ “etiquette,” gentlemanliness, and respect of his privacy are an important aspect of the Pipe Springs story. Despite his public persona, or, rather, precisely because of it, Brigham Young was an extraordinarily private man and he zealously guarded access to his homes, offices, and private grounds. He similarly guarded the details of his personal life, his marital and family affairs, and

especially knowledge of his finances, both personal and ecclesiastical. Considering what was at stake, more than anything else he guarded his kingdom-building strategies from all but his very closest advisors. He seldom revealed his mind even to high-ranking church leaders, especially when it came to military planning and political strategy. For over three decades he preached to his people what he called “the Mormon Creed,” which was: “Let every man mind his own business.”³⁴ As he praised Captain Evans for not prying into his personal affairs and for not so much as “gazing” at his buildings, or even looking “to see who was at the window,” he sought to forcefully bring the “mind your own business” mantra again before the people. The praise for his warden was real, but he *also* had obscure purposes for eulogizing him—one of which was to keep his people from looking into the metaphorical “second room in my office unless invited there—ever!” This symbolic place was a “Holy of Holies” where only he and his God (and the very few advisors and counsellors the prophet and high priest chose to invite in) were welcome. Keeping important plans to himself was simply one of the most important characteristics of Young’s leadership. His mentor and role model, Joseph Smith, had famously said, “I can keep a secret till doomsday,” and had “Masonically” taught Young to keep his mouth shut unless publicly revealing his plans could somehow help bring them to fruition.³⁵

True to Smith’s instruction, Young almost always kept his motives secret and worked hard to conceal his actions; he sometimes had his agents send out false or conflicting reports to

³⁴ *JD*, 2:92. Young said that Joseph Smith taught that “a key that would save every man or woman [was] for every man to mind his own business and let other people[’]s business alone.” William Clayton, *An Intimate Chronicle: The Journals of William Clayton*, ed. George D. Smith, (Salt Lake City: Signature Books in association with Smith Research Associates, 1995), 375. As the newspaper war between the Latter-day Saints and the rest of the nation heated up during the mid-1850s, Apostle John Taylor, on assignment from Brigham Young, published a Latter-day Saint newspaper on the same New York City street on which the *New York Herald* and the *New York Tribune* were printed. Called *The Mormon*, Taylor’s paper had a masthead that proclaimed “the Mormon Creed: Mind Your Own Business.” Thus every issue subliminally called on eastern gentiles to “mind their own business” as far as polygamy was concerned.

³⁵ *History of the Church*, 4: 479.

confuse his enemies. When he surreptitiously returned to Salt Lake City in late December, 1871, to surprise McKean by appearing at court, the *Salt Lake Tribune* reported that some of his carriages and returning family members were sighted in the city. A barrage of conflicting reports went forth causing the *Tribune* to expostulate in frustration: “He is [simultaneously] said to have arrived and said not to have arrived. Verily, mysterious are the ways of the Prophet and theocracy, and hard of finding out.” The *Tribune* openly published that Young not only used local sources to obscure his intentions, but that he also adroitly used the national press, and in fact the international press, to “euchre somebody with if possible.”³⁶ Meanwhile his wives and children were instructed not “to commit any thing of importance to paper” even in their private correspondence with other family members.³⁷ Young frequently obscured his primary objectives by emphasizing secondary and tertiary purposes to shield his plans. A prime example of this was his representing the object of building his bastion at Pipe Springs as primarily a fort against the Navajo, or as a herd house for a cooperative cattle company, or even as a headquarters for a tithing ranch, or as an important way station for travelers. Winsor Castle, of course, was all of these things, and much more. But because he seldom spoke openly or directly about its primary purposes (i.e., a fortified hiding place should he need to hide from federal prosecution, a military headquarters should the US Army come against him in the South, or a fortress to secure an escape route should the entire church or any part of it be forced to abandon Utah and flee into the wilderness of Arizona and Mexico), most of his contemporaries and subsequent generations have not clearly understood his most important Pipe Springs objectives. These must be deduced from

³⁶ *Salt Lake Tribune*, December 29, 1872, 2–3, UDN.

³⁷ Luna [Young] Thatcher, Salt Lake City, to “Dear Darling George,” [1870-1872], Philip Blair Family Papers, UU, b4 f5.

the context of surrounding events and pieced together from evidence that seldom comes from Brigham Young himself.

While his trial was in process, Young was permitted to leave the Lion House complex at will, often unattended by his custodian. Sometimes Young took walks, or sleigh and carriage rides “for his health,” and he even attended the theater and private parties in the city. Young wrote his son Willard, whom he had enrolled at West Point, that his whole incarceration was “a farce, and we have many a joke about it.” “The Marshal,” he wrote, “sits in my office or goes outside to walk, or ride, or go to the Theatre or elsewhere, but never follows me, nor asks any questions, nor knows where I go—If I go out to ride I ask him to accompany me if I feel like it—if not, he stays in the office.” To his brother Phineas, Brigham wrote that his “confinement in my own house is all I could desire, for years I have wished for the privilege of sitting still one winter, and now I have got it, this forms an excellent pretext for not going to every meeting and every party—in fact, I have only been to one party this winter and that was last night, and all the meetings I attend (except the Theatre) are held in my offices.” All the while, Young worked daily in his office, assisted by his army of clerks, scribes, and telegraphers, receiving visitors and keeping up on his correspondence and managing his sprawling kingdom as usual. “How long the [incarceration] farce will continue, I do not know,” he wrote Phineas in February, stating that he “would care very little about it, were it not for the [other] brethren who are in confinement and who are less privileged.” In truth, Young’s house arrest was a hollow formality arranged to allow McKean to save political face by not acquiescing to the Mormon prophet’s request for bail. While many Mormons felt the denial of bail was “a trick to keep [him] in their clutches and deprive him of his liberty,”³⁸ Young became convinced that the leniency of his house arrest was

³⁸ Walker, *Diary*, 1: 341.

in part a scheme to allow him to abscond again so that the troops, and not the Supreme Court, could settle the issue. Young wrote to a number of his correspondents, “It soon transpired, however, that it was not my appearance that was wanted, but my dis-appearance.”³⁹

The decision not to release Young on bail was Grant’s, whose obsession with Mormons was noticed even by ardent anti-Mormons.⁴⁰ Grant’s animus against Brigham Young, some believed, was spurred on solely by his minister, Parson Newman, who they viewed as “a back-stairs counselor of the President,” a sort of “spiritual cabinet officer.” The Washington correspondent of the *Cincinnati Commercial* posited that Parson Newman had “been at the President’s back [throughout] the Mormon raid, a power behind the throne greater than the throne itself. He has great influence with the President, and has used that influence to have the power of the government brought to bear against the people of the Salt Lake desert, whose crime is that they have got a religion.” “Of all the blunders of the present administration,” this reporter argued, “there is none equal to this. Parson Newman should be removed out of the cabinet at once as an unsafe adviser.” This “choice gang of law-enforcers, composed about equally of Methodist fanatics and bar-room poker-players, with instructions to go for the Mormons” went after them. “They disregarded law, Gospel and common sense in their blind bigotry, and now have the satisfaction of seeing their work all knocked east, west and crooked by the unanimous opinion of the Supreme Court of the United States.”

³⁹ Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, to Willard Young, West Point, NY, BYLB, SCA, b13, 947–950; Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, to Bishop Phineas H. Young, Kamas, Summit Co., February 7, 1872, BYLB, SCA, b13, 961–962; and Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, to Elders Henry G. Boyle and Thos. H. Daniels, Shady Grove, Hickman Co., TN., March 21, 1872, BYLB, SCA, b13, 16–19.

⁴⁰ Beadle and Hollister, *Polygamy*, 415–416. One reported that “*this curious warfare* lasted through the whole of Grant’s administration.” Many felt it was “a dumb war” that the Great War President waged against the “adherents of the Mormon Church.”

The Utah correspondent of the *New York Times* chronicled Young's first Tabernacle speech as "one of the closing scenes in the contest of 'Federal Authority vs. Polygamic Theocracy.'" He described that among "its distinctive features were an arrogant assumption of prophetic powers, coarse allusions to his enemies and persecutors, interlarded here and there with slang phrases and an occasional touch of profanity, and total disregard of the simplest rules of English grammar." "Underneath all this," he wrote, "was plainly discernible a terrible undercurrent of bitter hatred and a longing for revenge against those who had been instrumental in bringing about the recent prosecutions." The correspondent continued, "not a few Gentiles left the Tabernacle devoutly thankful that they still had the protection of the Federal Judiciary and Gen. Morrow's regiment of bluecoats at Camp Douglas." Fully aware the contest was not over, the *New York Times'* correspondent expressed what many Americans felt:

As to the future of Utah, I venture no predictions. The Mormon problem is one of those rare social and religious phenomena demanding for its solution more real statesmanship than any political issue of the decade. Loyal citizens of the Territory are looking with anxious eyes toward Congress for such legislation as shall restore the supremacy of law in the Territory and afford some earnest of protection to life and property. Prominent leaders of the Mormon Church, charged upon indubitable evidence with the commission of the gravest crimes, are today tur[n]ed free upon our streets, and the Mormon Attorney-General, now the prosecuting officer of the Territory in these cases, refuses to rearrest or to prosecute them. What the end will be, no man can now foretell, but certain it is, that no

weightier responsibility rests upon Congress than that of d[e]vising some means to avert the threatened dangers impending in Utah.”⁴¹

Early into his second term as President, on February 14, 1873, President Grant issued a special message to the Senate and House of Representatives “in relation to the condition of affairs in the Territory of Utah.” He laid before Congress the “pecul[i]ar circumstances” the parent government found itself in. They presided over an entire community determined not to abide by “any act of Congress obnoxious to them,” and who heartily “impede the action of the courts held by the United States judges.” He referred to the Utah Territorial Legislature’s unique control over grand and petit jury selection, and the fact that it essentially freed Utah from “the supervisory control of the Federal Government.” “Circumstances too notorious to require further notice,” Grant wrote, infringed on his right as president to enforce national law in Utah. The territory’s organic law, constitutionally passed September 9, 1850, “was never intended to intrust the territorial legislature with power which would enable it, by creating judicatures of its own, . . . to take the administration of the law out of the hands of the judges appointed by the President, or to interfere with their action.” Since the Supreme Court had upheld this law, the law must be changed and “earnestly” called upon Congress to pass “special legislation” immediately. But this time he threatened military action in Utah was likely his only option if congress did not “at the present session, pass some act which will enable the district courts of Utah to proceed with independence and efficiency in the administration of law and justice.”⁴²

⁴¹ *New York Times*, May 11, 1872.

⁴² Ulysses S. Grant, “Message from the President of the United States, in Relation to the Condition of Affairs in the Territory of Utah, to the Senate and House of Representatives,” February 14, 1873. 42d Cong. 3d Sess. Ex. Doc. No. 44.

Chapter 9

Pipe Springs and the Arizona Mission

Winsor Castle and Pipe Springs played an important role in one of the most significant events in post-Civil War politics, yet the men and women who lived at Pipe Springs 1870–1872 were unaware that the highest officers of the US government and its military were becoming increasingly knowledgeable about their tiny fort, nearby Kanab, and their role in Brigham’s larger Dixie-Canaan bastion. They were, however, keenly aware that they were participating in momentous events relative to the building of the Kingdom of God, and performing a worthy work that had something to do with the building of the St. George Temple. From May 1870 onward, Brigham Young proceeded with his New Canaan cooperative cattle plan. Anson Winsor had been gathering church tithing cattle at Pipe Springs and both horses and cattle had been driven from Church Island in the Great Salt Lake to preserve them from being seized by federal tax collectors. Young had given instructions that all tithing stock from Fillmore south were to be gathered at Pipe Springs in anticipation of the building of the St. George Temple. Immediately, bishops and members of Teacher’s Quorums throughout central and southern Utah preached sermons and harangued their wards “to get paid up” in their tithing, while special missionaries like Charles Pulsipher of Hebron traveled far and wide preaching “temple donation” and gathering up “temple stock” donated toward the construction of the St. George Temple. Mormons in arrears on tithing labor throughout southern Utah were encouraged to pay their tithing by helping to build Winsor Castle and Fort Kanab, by freighting material to the construction sites, or by driving animals to the tithing ranch and temple dairy. By 1872 Anson

Winsor was milking 100 cows and delivering beef, cheese, and butter to the men laying the foundation of the St. George Temple. Winsor's sons and hired hands were herding the tithing and temple cattle, while John R. Young herded the sheep. Near the end of May, Joseph W. Young left St. George to spend the summer at his sawmill in Long Valley, in part to provide lumber for Winsor Castle, then almost ready for roofing. All the while Winsor, Young, and Elijah Averett directed all available manpower in the work of finishing the fort. It is doubtful they knew of Young's primary plans for the fort or that those plans had now changed.¹

When John Wesley Powell's team left Mt. Trumbull country in March 1872, they stowed supplies and gear at the fort and left mules and horses under the care of Bishop Winsor. On April 15, the day the Engelbrecht decision was announced in Washington, DC, Francis M. Bishop arrived at Pipe to exchange a broken down mule for a roan horse Powell's men had named "Mormon Spy." Bishop had been with Powell the day Brigham Young had staked out Winsor Castle's location in September 1870 and had not been back since. Now having left Powell's employ, he wrote in his journal that "Bishop Winsor has quite an improvement in the way of houses in process of erection at the [Pipe] Springs. Does not look like the place it was 18 mos. ago."² There was a significant community there building the fort, operating the dairy, and running the growing tithing ranch. Because of the Kanab Creek Gold Rush, there were also often as many as forty miners encamped at Pipe Spring. Powell's party returned to Winsor Castle near the end of April and the beginning of May for about two more weeks, and used Pipe Spring as a base for their survey activities and as a point to make distributions of food to Kaibabit.

¹ Erastus Snow, St. George, to Prest B. Young, Salt Lake, August 4, 1872, BYP.

² *UHQ* 15 (1947): 230.

During a three month stay in Washington, DC, early in 1872, Powell had been appointed a special commissioner for the Indians of southern Utah, eastern Nevada and northern Arizona. The growth of the Canaan Cooperative Cattle Company (CCCC) operating out of St. George damaged ecosystems the Southern Paiute subsisted on. For its first fourteen months of operation, CCCC paid its investors the incredible dividend of 38%. This reflected the company's natural increase through calving, and such dividends in a poor frontier economy naturally drove the company and its investors to put more and more animals on the range. It was an economic bonanza the virgin range could not maintain for long. These animals, together with the concentration of tithing and temple donation herds at Pipe Springs and its private and cooperatively owned herds, were decimating the natural grasses, creating famine among the Southern Paiute. Meanwhile, the expansion of Mormon settlement as Young built up his southern bastion diminished other natural resources, and the Native Americans reached levels of desperation the Mormons had not yet seen.³

Having spent so much time with the Native Americans the previous season, Powell was aware of their desperate condition and had promised he would seek assistance for them on his return to Washington. Along with all his other duties, Powell was appointed to deliver government assistance to these groups (which really meant he was commissioned "to gather and place on reservations some eight or nine small tribes or bands of Indians inhabiting this region of

³ Erastus Snow to Prest B. Young, August 4, 1872. According to Snow, during the spring and summer 1872 seasons: "Our relations with the Indians too, have been a source of no little anxiety[.] They seem to have gathered from all quarters to eat us up [helping themselves to our] early Barley & Wheat and then upon [our] roasting ears, vegetables & mellons, not forgetting [our] beef. We know of many cattle that they have killed and horses, but, many more missing, mostly such as have been allowed to run without herdsmen. [O]ccasionally one from Canaan Coop Ranche. Our people feel it a heavy tax on them and some would rather fight than feed them in this way; but Indians wish not to fight as long as they can be permitted to eat [our produce] in peace." Several times during 1872 the situation broke out into real bloodshed as Native Americans tried to survive and Mormons sought to preserve their farm produce and cattle.

country”).⁴ In April and May of 1872, Powell’s men gathered hundreds of hungry Paiute together at Washington, St. George, Winsor Castle, Kanab, and other convenient points to distribute beef purchased from Pipe Springs and Canaan ranches, as well small quantities of flour, shirts, and blankets. They also distributed shovels, hoes, and axes shipped from Salt Lake City to encourage Paiute to raise crops themselves. In preparation for these distributions, Almon Thompson “talked with [the] Indians,” writing in his journal that “The Santa Claras say the Mormons will do for them, [but] that the Americans talk but do not do anything. The Shivwits are afraid. [They] think we want to kill them. Can hardly get an Indian to own [up to being] a Urigkavit [Uinkaret] or Shevvit. They want to know what we will give them, if anything. Say they are very poor.”⁵ The native people had been starving, and all winter long Dixie’s Mormons, who were hard pressed to feed themselves because grasshoppers had ravaged much of their crops, had barely kept them alive with their meager donations of beef and biscuits. Dixieites complained that natives “had been troublesome all the spring, encamping in the fields and suffering their horses to run in the growing grain.”⁶ About the time Major Powell’s “Indian Goods” arrived from Salt Lake, Clem Powell was visiting a band of hungry Kaibab at Berry Springs near the modern town of Hurricane. He described that

Frank, Chief of the Kaibab Indians, was bedaubed with yellow, red, and black ochres; gorgeously arrayed in a red flannel shirt, resplendent with beads, and rode a Navajo horse. Soon, other Indians appeared like apparition. They demanded “[f]lour” and meat.

⁴ *Deseret News*, August 21, 1872, 12, UDN.

⁵ *UHQ* 7 (1939): 75.

⁶ *Deseret News*, August 21, 1872, 6, UDN.

The number increased, until a party arrived with a pack-horse, expecting to load it with provisions and other gifts. I gave them a lunch all around, and told them to piqua—go.⁷

The *Deseret News* reported that after making distributions to native peoples in St. George on the 27th, “Maj. Powell’s party” immediately “moved back east to form a camp at Winsor Pipe Springs. . . from whence they [will] radiate up Virgin river, through Long Valley, Upper Kanab, &c.”⁸ Powell’s group actually planned to “divide into 4 parties, go different ways and meet at Pipe Spring.” Thompson and his wife, Fred Dellenbaugh, Clem Powell, and George Adair went down the Grand Wash to erect monuments and to “sketch the country,” two photographers “started up the Virgin River to take picture,” three others “took 5 horses and the wagon to Pipe Springs,” while others went to Pine Valley Mountain and “Established Geodetic point ‘L,’” made some sketches and did some other exploration.⁹ By May 5 all four parties had made it to the Springs. They apparently met Elijah Averett who was still at Pipe Springs, chipping away at Winsor Castle’s stone works. Jacob Hamblin was to have met them there with their rations, but had failed to arrive, so they borrowed some flour from Winsor, and bought some coffee from a party of thirty or forty miners camped there. For roughly two more weeks they used Pipe Springs as a base, Sister Winsor sometimes cooking their meals. By May 14 Powell’s team had moved on to Kanab, picking up all “the things left” at Pipe Springs.¹⁰

There “Frank’s band” of Kaibabites besieged the survey camp “in ever-increasing numbers,” having heard “that goods were on the way for them.” “How many sleeps [until]

⁷ *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 409.

⁸ *Deseret News*, May 8, 1872, 13, UDN.

⁹ *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 121–122; and Dellenbaugh, *Canyon Voyage*, 194.

¹⁰ *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 124–125, 413, 421.

blankets come?” they asked. Clem wrote that “they are always hungry.” Andy, the expedition’s cook, required the Kaibabit to “rustle sage-b[r]ush and pack water in part payment [for] the biscuit they consume,” and some of the others required hungry Kaibabit to “make moccasins for us.” On May 20 at a distribution “pow-wow” Professor Thompson “told them that the Big Chief at Washington wanted very much to see them,” so Clem “accordingly took their pictures,” while Hamblin acted as interpreter. The next morning Powell’s company departed toward the Dirty Devil for more exploration.¹¹

Second Names: Subterfuge in Wild Places

In July 1872 an undercover correspondent for the *Cincinnati Commercial*, traveling incognito, passed through most of Young’s Southern Utah bastion—including Pipe Springs—on a covert fact-finding tour. Journalist John Hanson Beadle had lived in Utah for several years, had recently owned and edited a major Utah-based anti-Mormon newspaper, and in 1870 had even written a famous anti-Mormon book, which was published in two languages.¹² Finding anti-Mormonism lucrative, during the winter of 1871 and 1872 he toured the eastern states selling his book and lecturing against “the Mormon State,” his term for Brigham Young’s current push for Utah statehood. It was common knowledge in Utah that Beadle had been urged by his eastern listeners to “go to Washington and talk sense to those law-makers who are favoring the

¹¹ *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 414–415.

¹² J. H. Beadle, *Life in Utah*. Beadle edited the *Salt Lake Reporter*, which became the *Corrine Reporter* and then failed. For general information on the life and writings of John Hanson Beadle, see Leonard J. Arrington, “American West Lecture: “Kate Field and J. H. Beadle: Manipulators of the Mormon Past,” (American West Lecture, Center for Studies of the American West, University of Utah, Salt Lake City, 1971), 12–20, CHL.

admission of Utah.”¹³ Before the end of 1872 Beadle published the “Confessions” of Mormon murderer Bill Hickman, whose testimony drove Brigham Young into exile.¹⁴ In 1873 he published an account of his “southern Utah researches” in another anti-Mormon work.¹⁵

In late June 1872, Beadle hired Navajo guides at Ft. Defiance, New Mexico, to lead him to the “*Mormoney Hogande*” or “Mormon settlements.” His guides led him through the Navajo-Hopi country and delivered him safely at the Colorado Crossing at the mouth of the Paria, recently occupied by John D. Lee.¹⁶ Beadle planned to gather “in a very quiet way all possible information about the Mountain Meadows Massacre,” the recent “Mormon cases,” and Mormon plans for the future, which he hoped would be “of some value in the interests of justice.”¹⁷ When added to Hickman’s confessions, this information could convict Brigham Young and other “Mormon Murderers.” Fearing Latter-day Saint retribution for his anti-Mormon writings as he traveled through “Five hundred miles of Mormons,” John Hanson Beadle dropped his last name and took his second, traveling from Lees Ferry to Salt Lake City as “Mr. Hanson.”¹⁸ Dressed like a Navajo “in a buckskin suit, with spangled Mexican jacket, moccasins handsomely worked, beaded scarf, and flowered calico head-wrap,” at a distance Beadle “was every-where taken for an Indian.”¹⁹ As war loomed in Salt Lake City at the time of Young’s initial arrest, rumors flew

¹³ *Salt Lake Tribune*, January 22, 1872, 3, Newspaperarchive.com, FHL.

¹⁴ J. H. Beadle, *Brigham’s Destroying Angel*.

¹⁵ J. H. Beadle, *Undeveloped West*.

¹⁶ Beadle, *Undeveloped West*, especially 613, 616, 618, 643–645; and Beadle, *Polygamy*, 645.

¹⁷ *Ibid.*, 444, 452, and 454.

¹⁸ Beadle, *Undeveloped West*, 645; and J.H. Beadle, *Western Wilds: The Men Who Redeem Them*. (Jones Brothers & Company, 1882), 313.

¹⁹ See *Nesho Valley Register* (Iola, KS), July 20, 1871, 3, NPA. Beadle, “Western Wilds,” 314. The anti-Mormon had good reason to hide his identity, as he was known throughout the United States as one who dared enter “Salt Lake City in the face of the very hottest Mormon prejudices, and attack the lion in his den.” *Salt Lake Tribune*, July 30, 1872, 2, NPA. As editor of the Corinne Reporter he was attacked on the street and “nearly killed” in “true Danite fashion” by the son of a Mormon probate judge he had roughly handled in his paper.

that Mormons planned a wholesale slaughter of gentiles. Friends had warned Beadle that because of his writings, “of course they’ll kill you first one.”

At what came to be called Lees Ferry, in part thanks to Beadle’s writing, Mr. Hanson met the ferryman (John Doyle Lee), who similarly obscured his identity by introducing himself as Major Doyle.²⁰ According to Lee family histories, Lee learned of his excommunication at Pipe Springs sometime in November 1870, when a courier handed him “a packet of mail” which notified him of his expulsion from the church without specifying the cause. Initially Lee received the news with a benign spirit, confiding to his diary that he believed “that Prest. Young has Suffered this to take place for a wise purpose & not for any Malicious intent.”²¹ Beadle later surmised that Lee’s excommunication was a masquerade on Young’s part to appease both angry Mormons and gentiles who demanded some church action be taken regarding the Mountain Meadows Massacre. Beadle averred Lee was only “nominally ‘cut off’ from the Mormon Church . . . and was in about as full fellowship as ever” with Young, as evidenced by the fact that he had accepted “a mission” from the Prophet to build the ferry for his people while he tried to stay out of the way of federal lawmen.²² Upon his arrival at “Lonely Dell,” Lee’s ranch at the ferry, Mr. Hanson “found at the house eight or ten children and one women, who treated us most hospitably, but to my questions answered that ‘Major Doyle lived there, and she knew of no Lees Ferry, and no such man as John D. Lee.’”²³ At a certain point after returning to Lonely Dell, Major Doyle unmasked his real identity, although Mr. Hanson continued to conceal his own.²⁴

²⁰ Beadle, *Undeveloped West*, 652, 639, 339–41, 643–645; and Beadle, *Western Wilds*, 313.

²¹ Lee, *Diaries*, 2:146–147; “History of John Doyle Lee (1812–1866),” John D. Lee Family Organization Website, <http://johndlee.net/history-lee.htm>, July 19, 2014.

²² Beadle, *Polygamy*, 445.

²³ *Salt Lake Tribune*, July 29, 1872, 2, NPA.

²⁴ Beadle, *Undeveloped West*, 645–646. “At supper, on [July 3, 1872], I casually inquired [of ‘Major Doyle’] if he knew of such a man in this vicinity as John D. Lee, for the agent had informed me I must cross at Lee’s Ferry.

Within a month, Beadle published the first of several renditions of John D. Lee's account of the Mountain Meadows Massacre in the *Salt Lake Tribune*.²⁵ A few months later he published a second variation, in a book giving the details of his "researches" in the Mormon "Gibraltar."²⁶ Using reasoning that had been applied to Young when he disappeared into his southern Utah and northern Arizona bastion in 1871, Beadle concluded that "if John D. Lee has committed no crime, why is he hiding in a desert, a hundred miles out of the jurisdiction of Utah courts, where he can take horse and boat any minute and in three hours be among wild Indians in alliance with the Mormons? Is it because his high-toned honor forbids him to 'bear witness against his brethren?' Bosh!"²⁷

On July 4 Mr. Hanson left Lees Ferry and rode toward Kanab, backtracking the old trail from Pipe Springs to Pahria Crossing. He spent the night some forty miles west of Lees Ferry at Jacob's Pools in House Rock Valley, where Lee had another plural wife living in "a wickiup," or "a sort of brush tent, making butter and cheese from a herd of twenty cows."²⁸ Mr. Hanson attempted to do some writing at Jacob's Pool and commented on "the general out-door air of poverty and misery" he observed there as he partook of the "scanty meals of milk and cheese, with an allowance of one biscuit" provided by another Sister Lee. The abject poverty experienced there by Rachel Lee and a "son and daughter of sixteen and eighteen years" who with their mother were Jacob's Pool's "sole inhabitants, [with] no neighbors within less than

'That,' he replied, 'is what they sometimes call me.' 'What!' I exclaimed, 'I thought your name was Doyle.' 'So it is,' said he, 'John Doyle Lee.'"

²⁵ See J. H. Beadle, "Interview with Jon. D. Lee of Mountain Meadows Notoriety," in *Salt Lake Tribune*, July 29, 1872, 2, NPA. The article emphasized that his host's house at Lonely Dell was "a perfect arsenal in the way of loaded guns."

²⁶ Beadle, *Undeveloped West*, 637–638, 643–655.

²⁷ Beadle, *Undeveloped West*, 653.

²⁸ Beadle, *Undeveloped West*, 654. Lee's wife Rachel Bachelor ran a small dairy at Jacob's Pools.

forty miles either way” motivated Beadle to write about the adverse effects of polygamy.²⁹ The next day he rode to Navajo Wells, where he found even more “barbarism” to criticize. There around “a barrel sunk in a low place in the sand” filled with “lukewarm, green, slimy” water “full of vile pollywogs” with no course of escape, he found “the brush camp” of “a horribly filthy and repulsive gang of some forty savages.” Most likely they were a portion of Frank’s Kaibabit. “The chief” drew water with “an old coper kettle,” which the white man’s horse “emptied three times” while Beadle himself “indulged in a half pint” of the putrid liquid “after straining it through a handkerchief.” “For this courtesy,” Beadle divided his “stock of meat and cheese with the chief,” who then begged for tobacco.³⁰ With little charity for the Kaibabit or their Latter-day Saint neighbors, Beadle closed his account of his visit at Navajo Wells describing “The degraded natives of this region are of three tribes, known as the Pi-Utes, the Pi-Edes and the Lee-Biches, and are the very lowest of the race.”³¹

Sixteen miles from Navajo Wells, Beadle rode into Kanab early in the morning. He was impressed with the stark beauty of the village’s location, writing “Kanab sits back in a beautiful cove in the mountains, something like a crescent in shape, the mountain’s peaks east and west of the town putting out southward to the Arizona line. All the land within the cove appears rich, and

²⁹ Beadle, *Undeveloped West*, 655–656. “I could but say to myself: This [lonely poverty] is one of the effects of polygamy. Those who are still disposed to apologize for Mormonism should have seen this [lonely woman and her children sheltered from the hot Arizona sun only by]. .. the willow walls of the brush-covered wickiup, .. Here is a man with eleven wives, scattered about on ranches like so many cattle. Let the man be ever so good and kind, ten of these women must be living as widows all the time, and their children as orphans. One of the strongest and most often repeated arguments of the Mormons is, that polygamy is much less of an evil than the Gentile prostitution. I flatly confess that I don’t think so. Prostitution stops with the one victim, polygamy rears a generation to suffer its evils; prostitution affects only the guilty; the direst woes of polygamy fall on the innocent—the women and children; the former takes one in a hundred, the latter degrades the whole sex; the former has coexisted, and continues, with the highest civilization in the most advanced nations, while the latter is invariably the practice of barbarians and retrograde races. Of the two evils, bad as the other is, polygamy is by far the worst.”

³⁰ Beadle, *Undeveloped West*, 657–658.

³¹ Beadle, *Western Wilds*, 311–312; with a variation minus the words “degraded natives” in Beadle, *Undeveloped West*, 658.

the town site is irrigated from a considerable creek running out of a narrow gulch.” There Mr. Hanson sought to converse with more “Mormon Criminals.” Instead he found Jacob Hamblin, who hosted him for several days. A true Mormon Missionary, Hamblin “struck in on the subject of Mormonism the first meal,” but as Beadle was “once more in the land of beef and biscuit, hot coffee and other luxuries, I could stand up to any amount of argument. We had it hot for two days, but parted friends.”³² A portion of Powell’s survey team, including Mr. and Mrs. Almon Thompson, were “resting” a few days under Hamblin’s roof. Finding much in common with the non-Mormons, and considering it “a rare piece of good fortune” to meet “the Powell party,” Beadle wrote that together they enjoyed “a very delightful little Gentile society in this Mormon stronghold.”³³ Only to Mrs. Thompson did Mr. Hanson reveal his true identity.³⁴

Late in the afternoon of July 8, Beadle left Kanab and “rode twenty miles southwest to Pipe Springs—nine miles over the border into Arizona.”³⁵ Beadle noticed that “the Mormons were just then making the most active exertions to extend their settlements down through Arizona” giving nod to Young’s plan “to occupy all the vacant valleys [in Arizona] and control the Territorial government, as in Utah.” Years later, Beadle acknowledged that “this beautiful scheme was defeated by the rapid development of Arizona and the rush of gentiles into its new and rich mining regions,” but as he surreptitiously gathered information along Brigham’s St. George, Pipe Springs, Kanab, and Lees Ferry corridor, he was keenly aware that “the Mormon scheme was in full tide.” He learned that Hamblin had been making frequent visits to the Moqui towns to prepare that people for the imminent Mormon invasion and that Hamblin had gone so

³² Beadle, *Undeveloped West*, 658.

³³ Beadle, *Undeveloped West*, 658–659

³⁴ *UHQ* 7 (1939): 89.

³⁵ Beadle, *Undeveloped West*, 659.

far as to take Chief Tuba and his wife Telashnimki to Salt Lake “to be converted, if possible, to Mormonism,” or at least to “help maintain friendly relations.” “The younger Mormons had been ‘counselled’ to look out for Navajo wives” Beadle observed.³⁶ The very convoluted road he travelled was even then being prepared for the first wave of the “Arizona Mission” scheduled to depart the next winter.³⁷

When he arrived at Pipe Springs after dark on July 8, he found Bishop Winsor “a good landlord” and a “chatty, agreeable companion.” The Castle’s stone work must have been nearly finished, and he mistakenly wrote that “the two stone houses at that place were built nine years before, as a sort of fort and residence; but abandoned soon after, on account of Indian troubles, and only lately re-occupied by Bishop Winsor and one of his families.” Beadle was apparently led to believe Winsor Castle belonged to “landlord” Winsor and it seems that he never knew the large buildings he saw were virtually brand new. Their primary purpose also escaped him. Looking around Pipe Springs Ranch by daylight he noted “the spring from which the place takes its name sends down a large stream of cold, clear water, which the Bishop leads in stone troughs through his houses, using one of them for a cheese factory. He milks eighty cows, and makes the business a splendid success.” Beadle provided an important early descriptions of land use at Pipe Springs. “Even with this large stream,” he wrote, “the Bishop can cultivate but fifteen acres, the porous, sandy soil requiring five times as much irrigation as the land around Salt Lake City.” Surveying the rich grass that stretched before him from the Vermilion Cliffs to the Colorado, he wrote “All this section is rich in pasture, but has so little arable land that most of the few inhabitants have to import their flour, paying for it in butter and cheese.” Perhaps Beadle missed

³⁶ Beadle, *Polygamy*, 444.

³⁷ Beadle, *Undeveloped West*, 653.

Winsor Castle's true significance as a military headquarters and fortified hideout because of his obsession with gathering facts regarding the Mountain Meadows Massacre, which "chatty" and "agreeable" Bishop Winsor seemed suspiciously willing to speak to gentile Hanson about, perhaps to keep the focus off the fort. While Beadle withheld his true identity and purpose, no one at Pipe Springs seems to have mentioned church ownership, tithing herds, cooperative cattle herding, or Pipe Springs' connection to the building of the St. George Temple, let alone its former planned uses as a potential temporary church headquarters, Nauvoo Legion headquarters, or a hideout for the prophet. Instead, Winsor was critical of the perpetrators of the Mountain Meadows Massacre, "and avowed his belief" to Mr. Hanson that "the thing was done only for spoil." In what can be viewed as an interesting act of self-incrimination, "Bishop Winsor of Pipe Springs pointed out to [Beadle] some cattle in his own herd sprung from stock captured at Mountain Meadow."³⁸ With so much manipulation of the truth taking place, it is not certain we can take either Winsor or Beadle's word on this point for fact. The stolen cattle were in fact swallowed up by the Mormon cattle economy, and with tithing and temple donation it is highly likely that offspring of the Fancher-Baker party's cattle ended up there. From Pipe Springs' discovery in 1858 while Hamblin traveled to the Hopi villages ostensibly to find child survivors, to the reports of harboring of animals there "from stock captured at Mountain Meadow," to Latter-day Saint preparations to hide wanted Mormons there, Pipe Springs was tightly knit to Utah's greatest atrocity.

Leaving "Winsor's" fort, Beadle found that "the road [west] from Pipe Springs was so sandy" that it took almost an entire day to reach Canaan Ranch.³⁹ As Beadle traveled through

³⁸ *Salt Lake Tribune*, July 29, 1872, 2, UDN.

³⁹ Beadle, *Undeveloped West*, 659–660.

these southern villages and ranches, he found his Navajo attire caused Mormons to ask him about his knowledge of that people, and they often specifically inquired about Navajo women.

“Marriage with Indian women is a strong point in the religion of these southern Mormons,” he wrote, “and they were delighted with my descriptions of the grace, beauty and general desirableness of the Navajo girls. They fully expect to form a close alliance and lasting friendship with that people by means of intermarriage.” “Some of the young men avowed to me their intention of going at the earliest opportunity to get a Navajo girl.”⁴⁰ To Beadle, this pointed to the fact that Mormonism was poised to attempt to conquer Arizona and he was impressed with the Saints’ ability to look “a long way ahead in regard to their settlements in Arizona, and very judiciously too.”⁴¹ He described Hamblin as a sort of “Church Agent of Indian Affairs,” who had “visited all the tribes in Northern Arizona, making treaties between the Indians and the Church.” He eventually understood that Brigham Young had been looking toward Arizona for years, as evidenced by his locating Winsor Castle in the Pipe Springs Point-Bull Rush Wash bottle neck. By building it atop the Springs’ precious water it was a literal “choke point” to both secure and control the Arizona road. Beadle wrote,

The Mormons have taken measures to construct a wagon road to the ferry, and for cutting out a rock way on the other side, to enable them to get up to the main plateau of northern Arizona. They informed me that a large body of Mormons would be “called on a mission” soon to settle the first convenient valley on the other side, from which they will extend rapidly down to the great Sinoita (Sin-o-ee-ta) Valley, northwest of Prescott.⁴²

⁴⁰ Beadle, *Undeveloped West*, 661–662.

⁴¹ Beadle, *Undeveloped West*, 658, 661–662; and Beadle, *Western Wilds*, 314–315.

⁴² Beadle, *Undeveloped West*, 653.

At Toquerville, Mr. Hanson looked up and overnighted with Isaac C. Haight, “another leader in the Mountain Meadow Massacre.”⁴³ Perhaps because he had worn both himself and his horse out on his ride thus far through “five hundred miles of Mormons,” Beadle turned north instead of continuing his researches in St. George. As he reentered the gentile world in Beaver sometime before July 18, he was delighted to find a new US military base being constructed there, bringing even more gentiles into a previously Mormon town which had been “revolutionized by the mining excitement.” He rejoiced that Beaver had lost much of its Mormon character. “Every hotel and boarding-house is full of miners, prospectors and speculators,” he wrote, and “the streets wear a very un-Saintly look of life and business, and as the evil seems to come with the good, two saloons have been opened . . . furnishing Mormon preachers a fine point for savage sermons on the ‘vile practices of the Gentile world.’” The Star Mining District, “some thirty miles west of town,” and “so many other mining camps are scattered through the mountains that it is claimed Beaver County now has a majority of male voters [who are] Gentile.” Noting this transformation was not yet complete, Beadle complained that “the Mormon Legislature of Utah 1870 was sharp enough to provide for just such contingencies by conferring the suffrage on women. This a little more than doubles the Mormon vote, and does not increase that of the Gentiles in Beaver Country five per cent.” Having ridden through much of Brigham’s southern bastion on horseback, he fully grasped the potency of its ramparts and its potential to isolate, strengthen, and protect the Mormons.⁴⁴ Like many gentiles, Beadle hoped that mining would “revolutionize” Brigham’s bastion. The impact of the mines, even on Cedar City (the

⁴³ Beadle, *Western Wilds*, 315.

⁴⁴ Beadle, *Polygamy*, 498.

Mormon village that played the leading role in the Mountain Meadows Massacre), was fantastic. “It has already shaken [Cedar City] out of its old style Mormon dullness, and the very home of the miscreants who perpetrated the Mountain Meadow massacre bids fair to become a lively miners’ town.” Thinking of the evidence he so easily gathered on his tour as he talked with the likes of Lee, Hamblin, Haight, and Winsor, he said “It is one of the strangest things in American history that there should be so much evidence, and so easily obtainable, upon this affair, and yet no legal inquiry made. The jury system and the peculiar statu[t]es of Utah explain it.” Under the system the Supreme Court had just reinstated for Utah, “no grand jury regularly impanelled will indict, and no petit jury convict. The general feeling among Mormons is, that though those men are guilty, the Church has passed upon their case [by excommunication] and handed them over to the ‘buffetings of Satan,’ and the civil law has no business with it.”⁴⁵

“The Lord Endorses Greeley”:

Pipe Springs and the 1872 Presidential Election

While J. H. Beadle made his two-month trip from Santa Fe, NM to Salt Lake City between May 22 and July 21, 1872, the national presidential election heated up. Ulysses Grant would not have Mormon support. The new Liberal Republican Party nominated Horace Greeley and the Democratic Party moved to support him. Brigham Young was quick to give Greeley the nod, adopting an “anybody but Grant” position. The *Salt Lake Tribune* chronicled Greeley’s selection “as the Lord’s Candidate.”⁴⁶ Greeley’s candidacy was often called “the Old White

⁴⁵ Beadle, *Undeveloped West*, 663–665.

⁴⁶ *Salt Lake Tribune*, June 26, 1872, 2, UDN.

Hat” or “Uncle Horace” during the campaign. As editor of the *New York Tribune* (which often was soft on the Mormons), Greeley opposed Grant’s “radical reconstruction” of the South (and of Utah). He was favorable to the Mormons, and a champion of the opening of the West, as epitomized by his famous mantra “Go West Young Man, Go West!” Once endorsed by President Young, Latter-day Saints even in the furthest flung reaches of “the Kingdom,” both literally and figuratively were soon wearing white hats as a sign of rebellion against President Grant. J. H. Beadle captured the spirit of the times, writing that Mormons everywhere “were wearing white hats and yelling themselves hoarse for Greeley for President.”⁴⁷ Even the small community at Pipe Springs became a self-contained voting precinct in the national election of 1872.

On August 25, James Webb Jackson, a jocular thirty-five year old from St. George who described himself as Winsor Castle’s “Clerk[,] Water Master & Scape Goat” wrote two short letters and a brief account of a recent territorial and national primary election at Pipe Springs. Although concise and hastily written, together these three documents provide insight into Winsor Castle and the small Mormon community clustered around it near the time of its completion. One letter was written to Brigham Young and the second to presidential candidate Greeley himself, and copied to the church president. To the latter was attached a part-serious, part-nonsensical report of a primary election that took place at “Winsor Pricinct” [*sic*] August 7. James W. Jackson possessed a fun loving sense of humor and addressed his dead-serious-minded prophet and the presidential candidate in a jocose spirit of “nonsense” that very few of his coreligionists would have dared.

J. W. Jackson, Winsor Castle, Kane Co. U. T.⁴⁸ to Prest B. Young, 25 August 1872.

⁴⁷ Beadle, *Undeveloped West*, 680.

⁴⁸ Even though all knew Winsor Castle was in Arizona, because of its connection to the Mormon settlements local settlers often referred to it as being in Utah and in Kane County as Jackson did here.

We are all well & flourishing. peace & plenty. Indians peaceible [sic]. Maj' Powell & co are no doubt about this time "gliding down" the far famed Colorado of the West in the "Daisy Dean" & "Candeta"—as it goes on its widening way to the sea.⁴⁹ From the grafic descriptions of Bro Johns Topogapher some beautiful homes wait the Saints in the Vallies of Potato & Boulder.⁵⁰ Nothing very new stock are doing well, Butter & Cheese business lively especially the cheese Riley & few men are working the Colorado placers expect them up soon for supplies.⁵¹ John R & the sheep are all right⁵²—Joseph W.'s Saw

⁴⁹ Powell's group were then finishing their exploration of the Colorado by attempting to float down the river in the boats they had cached the previous season at Crossing of the Fathers and at Lees Ferry. The original plan was to examine the river from the two previously named points to the mouth of the Virgin. At the mouth of Kanab Creek prospector George Riley brought them "news that all the Indians in the territory are on the war-path; that some Mormons killed a family of the Shebwitches [Shivwits] and that the tribe are on the lookout for our part for revenge." As a result on September 9 Powell scuttled the trip at the mouth of Kanab Creek. *UHQ* 16–17 (1948–1949): 449. Jackson is slightly wrong on the names of the *Emma Dean*, which was cached at Lees Ferry, and the *Cañonita*, which was cached at Crossing of the Fathers.

⁵⁰ Calling John Wesley Powell "Brother John" was a term of endearment evidencing how local Latter-day Saints felt about him. Jackson was clearly aware the Powell Expedition was contributing to Mormon expansion by discovering new places for the Saints to settle. Potato Valley is the name of the valley where Escalante, UT is.

⁵¹ This is a reference to prospector George Riley, a one-time Powell employee and father of the 1872 Kanab Creek-Colorado River Gold Rush. This and other sources demonstrate that the Gold Rush was still going strong and that Pipe Springs was still, along with Kanab, its major supply base.

⁵² John R. Young, brother of Joseph W. Young and nephew of Brigham Young, lived at Pipe Springs with at least part of his family and watched the sheep that were gathered there. "Tithing sheep" and "temple offering sheep" were gathered by southern Utah bishops and turned over to "Bro Winsor who [was appointed to] gather up all the Tithing sheep in that region." See minutes of "Meeting of Bps, Counselors Etc of Southern Mission" St. George Tabernacle, November 3, 1872, in James G. Bleak, "Historical Memoranda of Southern Mission," DSUSC, b5. Like the cattle at Pipe Springs, the sheep there probably comprised a mixture of church owned animals, animals owned privately by Brigham Young, Anson Winsor, John R. Young, and other key investors in the Ranch, and still other sheep cooperatively owned by the yet unincorporated Winsor Castle Stock Growing Company. Young and his agents encouraged cooperative stock companies to exchange horses for "Cash sheep or horned stock." For example, see A. Milton Musser, Salt Lake City, to Bishop Thomas Callister, Fillmore, June 17, 1873, BYLB, SCA, dvd 25, b13, f4, 395.

mill is making Lumber;⁵³ Bishop Winsor started for Dixie today⁵⁴—crops look well, The back building of the Fort is nearly roofed⁵⁵ Joe Hopkins⁵⁶ has made a pretty Cupola an top of it—a 26 ft white pine Liberty pole projects through it & we have hoisted a White Deseret Silk Flag⁵⁷ on it with [2] the letters H G & B sewed on—the H G and B are blue cloth the & is red representating Red, white & Blue emblematic of peace, purity, divinity, simplicity, & economy.⁵⁸ We gave three hearty cheers as it gracefully waved to the breeze & three for Greeley & Brown & three more for Greeley & Brigham⁵⁹ with a Coyote instead of a Tiger.⁶⁰ We have just writtn [sic] several letters to several prominent Gentlemen on the issue of the Presidential Campaign & one to Horace himself pledging

⁵³ Joseph W. Young was the trusted nephew of Brigham Young, St. George Stake President, and *ex officio* superintendent of construction at Pipe Springs. By August 1872 he was also superintending the building of the St. George Temple, a new house in St. George for his Uncle Brigham, and “the Arizona Road” then under construction from St. George to Lees Ferry and beyond, not to mention personally providing lumber for the finishing of Winsor Castle. As this letter later indicates, construction at the fort was then in its last stages as roofing and shingling and finish carpentry were taking place. By this point Joseph Young’s Long Valley mill provided much, if not all, of the lumber for Winsor Castle.

⁵⁴ Bishop Winsor was already delivering beef, butter, and cheese to hands working on the St. George Temple. He was also often away from the Ranch receiving tithing and temple donation stock and moving stock to the Temple Lumber Mills at Mt. Trumbull to feed lumber workers and haulers there.

⁵⁵ “The back building” refers to the northernmost building closest to the Pipe Springs Point outcropping of the Vermillion Cliffs. This reference to the fact that the “back building” was “nearly roofed” is the best documentation we have to approximate the completion of the construction of Winsor Castle.

⁵⁶ Joseph LePrelete Hopkins was a blacksmith and carpenter from Long Valley. Originally a sailor from Rhode Island, Hopkins came to Utah with Johnston’s army in 1858 as a teamster. According to family histories, he ultimately deserted the army, was baptized a Latter-day Saint, and accompanied James Andrus to Pipe Springs as a militiaman in the aftermath of the Whitmore-McIntyre killings in January 1866. See Ellen S. Ence, “Lydia Ellen Hopkins Snow, Handmaiden of God,” May 1998, 2–10, FHL.

⁵⁷ One of the features of Brigham Young’s plan for Mormon “Independence” was the “home manufacture” of all products the Saints needed, including silk, and on his instruction priesthood leaders throughout “Deseret” pushed sericulture.

⁵⁸ Anson Winsor’s wife Emeline Zennetta was an excellent seamstress, quilter, weaver, and spinner of silk and linen and probably made this unique Mormon campaign banner by hand. She was an expert at the spinning wheel and loom; four years after this letter was written she sent a sample of her handiwork to the 1876 Centennial Exhibition in Philadelphia where she won first prize and received a gold medal. See Emeline Winsor McBride, “Handwork of Pioneer Days,” in “Winsor Family History,” dvd2, FHL; and Luther M. Winsor, “Life History of Luther M. Winsor,” 4–5, FHL.

⁵⁹ Greeley’s running mate was Benjamin Gratz Brown. The “H G & B” apparently stood for “Horace Greeley and Brown” as well as for “Horace Greeley and Brigham [Young].”

⁶⁰ Thomas Nast, the political cartoonist who made famous the symbols of a donkey for the Democratic party and an elephant for the Republican party, also used a tiger to represent the Democratic party with which Greeley aligned himself in the 1872 election.

him the Faith & prayers of Utah in Common with her sister Territories and also requesting him H. G. to remember us when he comes into Power. Will all be happy to see you this fall.⁶¹ We have had several showers lately, last night rained several hours It has rained about an hour already & it still going on & looks very cloudy—time 7 pm—May the Lord bless you & all of us

Your brother, J. W. Jackson

Winsor Castle Kane Co U

Aug 25th /72

Horace Greeley Ex Editor of Tribune & Future President of US

Dir Sr Permit an humble champion in the Cause of “Truth & Liberty” to pen you a few lines expressive of the opinion of the voters of this far off precinct in the Wiles of Arizona, Winsor Township Mojave Co Ariz’a generally Known as Winsor Kane Co U.T. The Election Territorial Aug 5th resulted in a unanimous vote for yourself & Gratz Brown. Vigilance & action will ensure success.” Utah in common with her sister Territories gives her Faith & Prayers to the Cause of Trust & Liberty, of which Yourself & Gratz Brown are the Noble Standard Bearers. A Beautiful white Deseret silk Flag with the letters H. G. & B in Blue colors & the character & in Red representing Red white & Blue emblematic of peace Purity, sincerity simplicity & economy gracefully waves in the

⁶¹ A reference to Young’s anticipated annual winter tour to Dixie.

breeze, wafted from the “Far Famed Buckskin Mts suspended from the Top of a 24 foot pole fastened in the cupola of Brigham Young’s Fine New Fort Built as a defence against the Navajoes. Have Faith —Persevere—Keep your Old White Hat & Coat & wear occasionally, & we prophecy U. S. Grant’s Star will be eclipsed thereby on the 5th of next November visibly felt in Washington causing greater darkness to him & his Cohorts & that produced by the Eclipse of the Sun on the 14th Same month. Hoping you will remember us when you get in power, we subscribe ourselves your obnt servts citizens of Winsor⁶² per JWJackson

Returns of Election Held at Winsor Pricinct Aug 7th [or 5th] 72– J W J Clerk

For President & Vice

H Greeley & Gratz Brown

For Congress George Q Cannon

“ Counsellor Genl E Snow⁶³

“ Assembly Jos W Young⁶⁴

“ Colorado Explras [sic] Maj Powell & co

“ Bishop AP Winsor & also Post Master

“ Clerk Water Master & Scape Goat JWJackson

“ Justice of Peace Alonso L Winsor

⁶² The “citizens of Winsor” considered their community more than a ranch. In addition to being called “Pipe Spring,” “Pipe Springs,” “Pipe Spring Ranche,” “Winsor Castle” and “Winsor’s Castle,” and “Winsor’s,” the tiny community is also here simply referred to as “Winsor.” Perhaps this usage died out because another community of that name had existed in nearby Long Valley before its abandonment during the Black Hawk War. Upon that “Winsor’s” resettlement, its name was changed to Mt. Carmel.

⁶³ Office in the Utah Territorial Legislature equivalent to the Senate.

⁶⁴ Office in the Utah Territorial Legislature equivalent to the House of Representatives.

“ Constable & Asay – [no name given]

“ Coyote Killer & Rabbit Catcher – Don Alonzo Winsor

“ Chief Musician Real Allen⁶⁵

“ “ Cook shaker dairy maid & Medler

Mademosela Rachel Smith (Indian Girl)

“ “ Future Husband

Mr A hool [or Mr P hool]

(Archect & Mason [sic]

E Avrett

Carpenter Joe Hopkins)

“ Pahrea Expressman Jim Sharpe⁶⁶

“ mail contractor Bishop [Anson Winsor]

“ “ Carrier A Young⁶⁷

“This Ticket unanimously Elected True Report JWJ Clerk

The above report was not sent in Greeley’s letter

JWJ clk

“Excuse nonsense”

JWJ

⁶⁵ Rial Allen, son of Lewis Allen who had purchased Moccasin Ranch when the family moved from the Muddy in 1870. Rial was born in 1844.

⁶⁶ Son of Bishop John Sharp, one of Brigham Young’s chief business agents.

⁶⁷ Alfred Young, a young Kanab Mormon who sometimes worked for John Wesley Powell.

(PS)

Bishop Winsor on hearing this read second time – said not to send it,” Sister

W[insor] said scratch “for Wins witty own” & let it go.”⁶⁸

Jackson’s letters provide a rare snapshot of life at Pipe Springs in 1872. The nonsense of “chief musicians,” “scape goats,” “coyote killers,” and “rabbit catchers” remind us that real human beings lived, laughed, and enjoyed life as this frontier fort went up. Preserved, although not even in a complete sentence, is that “Mademosela Rachel Smith (Indian Girl),” with her superimposed American name, nurtured a romance with a potential white husband bespeaks the complexity of interracial relationships as the Mormons invaded Indian lands.

Other sources inform us that “Constable E[leazer] Asay,” who was only sixteen at the time, fell in love with thirteen-year-old Nettie Winsor and their youthful romance resulted in Pipe Springs’ first recorded marriage on September 15, 1872. For unspoken reasons Asay’s mother was heartbroken. (The young girl may well have been pregnant.) Meanwhile Bishop Winsor’s sweet wife Emeline welcomed the young cowpuncher into her family as the future father of her grandchildren. Significantly, a letter written in October 1872 by Eleazer’s mother revealed that the sixteen-year-old had “three hundred and fifty dollars coming to him clear, and a horse, saddle and bridle” for his cowboying at Pipe and for his help building Winsor Castle.⁶⁹

⁶⁸ Bishop Winsor had a better sense of what the prophet would deem appropriate than either Jackson or the Bishop’s wife, Emeline Winsor. See James W. Jackson, Winsor Castle, Kane Co., U. T., to Brigham Young, August 25, 1872, BYP, CHL, CR 1234/1, r47, b34, f14, no. 186–193.

⁶⁹ Eleazer Asay married Emmeline Zenetta (Nettie) Winsor at Pipe Springs, September 15, 1872. See Flossie W. Asay, *Descendants of Joseph and Sarah Ann Asay* (Provo, UT: J. Grant Stevenson, 1964), 286–287; and Asay, PSLA, VF, FH.

Winsor Castle stands as stark testimony to the difficulty of human relationships and disagreements relative to religion and the appropriation of natural resources. Its protected waters bear witness to the battles humans have fought with nature and each other to survive and maintain their ways of life. Sadly, James Jackson, who tried to lighten a hard life with laughter, met disaster on the Pipe Springs to Lees Ferry road and was the first to be buried in the tiny cemetery at Lonely Dell. The image Jackson painted of the pure white flag of “deseret silk” marked with bold blue letters waving “gracefully” in the breeze “suspended from the Top of a 24 foot pole fastened in the cupola of Brigham Young’s Fine New Fort” is significant. The political banner was undoubtedly made by Emeline Winsor, who was an excellent seamstress and quilter and was one of the few women in the south to own a treadle sewing machine in the 1870s.⁷⁰ Despite repeated claims that Winsor Castle was “Built as a defence against the Navajoes,” the blue letters emblazoned on Sister Winsor’s white-fielded “Standard of ‘Truth’” mutedly tell another story. Like the names Major Doyle, and Mr. Hanson, the statement “Built as a defence against the Navajoes” is technically true, but the kind of truth designed to conceal a more important truth. When Jackson called it “Brigham Young’s Fine New Fort,” something more than protecting stock from hungry Navajo was insinuated. That Winsor Castle was Brigham’s is clear, for as the Lord’s steward, all in the Mormon kingdom was his. The letters “H. G. & B.,” as Jackson made clear, in part stood for “Horace Greeley and Brigham” but also had a secondary meaning. The doubly significant initials of Horace Greeley and his running mate Benjamin Gratz Brown “wafting” in the breeze formed the focal point of the entire structure that was the silent testimony of Young’s defense against Ulysses S. Grant, and the greater “U.S.” he epitomized.

⁷⁰ In 1875 teamsters carrying supplies for the St. George Temple and its workers apparently brought replacement parts south from Salt Lake for Emeline’s sewing machine. See A. M. Musser to A. F. Macdonald, St. George, April 10 [1875], BYLB, SCA, dvd 1:25, MS2736, b13,f5, no. 725.

This flag, rather than Old Glory, flew from the new cupola carpenter Hopkins was finishing. As Jackson's letter to Greeley demonstrates, even "the red, white and blue" colors of Sister Winsor's unique banner took on unique Mormon meanings.

Preceding the April 1872 Englebrecht decision, President Grant, Governor Woods, Chief Justice McKean, and their allies reevaluated their position and developed new strategies for destroying Brigham's kingdom by working more closely with Congress to legally overturn Utah's territorial laws. The *New York Times* detailed that within "24 hours" of the announcement of the Englebrecht decision "many members of Congress," undoubtedly goaded by angry constituents, "expressed a warmth over the Utah trouble that promise[d] to turn McKean's defeat into McKean's victory."⁷¹ Paradoxically, Young's victory in the Supreme Court caused the administration and Congress to unite as never before on "the Mormon Problem," and though neither Grant nor Young would live to see it, the administrative, legislative, and judicial branches of American government converged to force the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints to unwillingly give up plural marriage, and to a lesser degree theocracy, and begin a painful and protracted acculturation process that eventually turned Mormons into patriotic Americans.

The *Salt Lake Tribune* noted "Times Are Changing." Church hierarchy wisely curtailed the usual "overt demonstrations of joy . . . whenever the Kingdom triumphed over its enemies," and "the priesthood are accordingly much more guarded in their utterances, now that other than saintly ears are ready to listen to outpourings and make report abroad." The *Tribune* postulated that the Saints had come so close to actual "civil war and bloodshed in Utah" that "it is our conviction that the experience of Brigham Young, Geo. Q. Cannon and other leading men of the

⁷¹ As quoted in *Salt Lake Tribune*, April 27, 1872, 2, UDN.

church has taught them thoroughly that in the future the laws of the land must be respected even to the breaking up of polygamy, and that the first act of violence on their part would so arouse the feelings of the nation that a terrible state of affairs would be brought about.” Speaking of Young and his inner circle, the *Tribune* continued, “We therefore believe that it is the policy of, these men, by all means to avert such a calamity.” The New York paper made a prophesy about the Prophet’s future policy that turned out to be accurate:

we believe that [if] in the future the arrogance and despotism of the Priesthood would be again exercised as [it was] during the days of Utah’s isolation, we should be justified in saying that bloodshed and civil strife would prevail to an alarming extent; but believing that the most obnoxious and highhanded phases of Mormonism were the result of a fanaticism engendered by isolation—a condition which has been entirely changed within the last few years and no longer possible—we are of [the] opinion that the vast change in our Territorial circumstances, which every day is greater, is tending to a rapid change in the church tactics.⁷²

In his first formal address to Congress after the Englebrecht decision, Grant publicly announced that he was not conceding victory to the Mormon prophet. Speaking of the nation’s territories, he said, “in but one of them (Utah) is the condition of affairs unsatisfactory.” He declared that “it has seemed to be the policy of the legislature of Utah to evade all responsibility to the Government of the United States, and even to hold a position in hostility to it,” and recommended that Utah’s “unsatisfactory” territorial laws be revised in such a manner “as will

⁷² *Salt Lake Tribune*, April 27, 1872, 2, UDN.

secure peace, the equality of all citizens before the law, and the ultimate extinguishment of polygamy.”⁷³ Elsewhere his supporters were more direct in lauding his commitment to “check[ing] Mormon insolence and aggression” and for providing for the “ultimate and speedy extinction” of Mormonism itself.⁷⁴

With renewed attacks from Congress and the Grant administration looming, and with physical isolation at an end, thousands of Saints were, to use Young’s own words, becoming “lukewarm.” He was losing power and influence in Utah Territory and he knew it. At seventy-one years of age, his legion was outlawed, his desert bastion was mapped, and a new United States military base was being built near Beaver in southern Utah. Locomotives could flood Salt Lake City with troops almost overnight. Military rebellion, even if just feigned, was finally out of the question. At his age, and with most of his family and personal wealth attached to the territory of Utah, personal flight or the mass exodus of the entire church to Arizona or Mexico had also ceased to be viable options. The “rapid change in Church tactics” the Tribune spoke of was finally forced upon him. He was determined to reinforce the crumbling walls of his people’s physical isolation by energetically restructuring and reinforcing a series of secondary barriers the Latter-day Saints had already erected to help keep themselves “apart” from “the world.” With the community’s physical detachment waning, Young launched a series of symbolic walls, redoubts, barricades and fences that kept the Saints “herded together” and worked to “keep the wolves out.” The social corrals, sheepfolds, and fortifications Young was building were supported by the all-encompassing “Doctrine of Gathering,” which in some ways was the single most distinctive

⁷³ Ulysses S. Grant, “Fourth Annual Message” [to Congress], December 2, 1872, <http://www.presidency.ucsb.edu/ws/index.php?pid=29513#axzz1z0dhblf5>.

⁷⁴ Edward McPherson, Clerk of the House of Representatives of the United States, *A Hand-Book of Politics for 1872: Being a Record of Important Political Action, National and State, from July 15, 1870, to July 15, 1872* (Washington City: Philp [sic] & Solomons, 1872), 152–153, GB.

doctrinal notion of nineteenth-century Mormonism. It rested on the premise that the Latter-day Saints were a restoration of Ancient Israel and that they had been called to “flee Babylon” and gather out of the world to create Zion, or the New Jerusalem. Aggressive world-wide proselytizing, immigration, and colonization were fundamental to the “literal gathering of Israel.” It was the essence of what Brigham’s larger and smaller bastions were all about.⁷⁵

Most notable among these social barriers were 1) the bastions of economic isolation, represented by Young’s cooperative movement and the Order of Enoch; 2) the bastion of doctrinal alienation, especially represented in the persistent preaching of unique Latter-day Saint doctrines that emphasized their sense of “peculiarity”; 3) the bastion of emphasizing the world’s hatred of the Saints and the “persecution” that had been “heaped” upon them and now raged against them; 4) the bastion of Mormonism’s masterful ecclesiastical organization, which from the start had been a significant wall to hide behind and which Brigham would tinker with to the last days of his life; 5) the bastion of Mormon pioneering itself, which gave them the sense that they were doing something special—it was the notion that they had been “foreordained from the foundations of the earth” to lay the foundation of the Celestial Kingdom itself (the opening of Arizona to colonization in 1873 was expressive of this idea); and 6) the bastion of temple building and emphasizing the sacred covenants of the exclusive fraternal-sororal Holy Order of the Temple Endowment that symbolically set Latter-day Saints apart by placing them in a sacred communal order represented by holy vestments which only they wore and which they kept on their person “both day and night.” All of these isolators required that most powerful of

⁷⁵ During Young’s lifetime, the official version of the tenth Article of Faith read: “We believe in the literal gathering of Israel, and in the restoration of the Ten Tribes. That Zion will be built upon this (American) continent. That Christ will reign personally upon the earth, and that the earth will be renewed and receive its paradisiac glory.” Article of Faith 10, *History of the Church*, 4: 540–541; and Richards, *Pearl of Great Price*, 55.

Brigham's Bastions—the barrier that then, as now, sets Latter-day Saints apart from most other Christians—the never failing bastion of extreme work. Perceptive apostate Frank Cannon wrote that “Brigham had found in the days of Nauvoo the superlative value of work for his people when they were assailed by dangers from without or doubts from within. He continued to magnify the hope and courage of his followers, and quell nearly all questioning of his Divine authority by finding prodigious tasks for his people to perform.”⁷⁶ With Mormonism under fire during the early 1870s, Young ramped up “prodigious tasks” to help keep his people in isolation.

Young worked assiduously to focus on the preaching of distinctive Latter-day Saint doctrines, a recommitment to temples and temple building, and on pioneering—the things that had made Mormonism what it was from the beginning. The protective walls of the temples, and particularly the strength of the sacred and secret Covenants of the Latter-day Saint endowment provided an important barrier to which not even the Vermilion Cliffs could compare. As a result Young drastically (and unrealistically) moved up the deadline for the completion of the St. George Temple and sent a cadre of missionaries throughout his kingdom to preach temple donation and press for free volunteer labor of all kinds to speed up “the work.” This resulted in hundreds of quarrymen, stonemasons, carpenters, mechanics, lumbermen, and freighters coming with a sense of urgency to St. George or Mt. Trumbull on “Temple Building Missions,” some bringing their families with them. All would have to be fed, and their beef, butter, and cheese came primarily from the Pipe Springs Ranch.⁷⁷

⁷⁶ Cannon, Frank J, and George L Knapp. *Brigham Young and His Mormon Empire* (Fleming H. Revell Co: New York, Chicago., 1913), 353–354.

⁷⁷ Brigham Young, George A. Smith, and Daniel H. Wells, epistle to “the Bishop and the Board of the United Order in Your Ward,” Salt Lake City, August 1874, CHL.

Simultaneously Young geared up for the invasion of Arizona. Frank Canon insightfully wrote that Young’s “work of colonization” was carried on consistently, but that it always surged in “intensity” during times of special trouble. In the spring of 1873, under Young’s direction, the ranch at Winsor Castle was transformed into the assembly point and staging ground for special wagon trains of missionaries and explorers the prophet was sending over the Colorado to establish major Mormon colonies in greater Arizona.⁷⁸ After he resigned as Trustee in trust at the April 1873 General Conference, it took thirteen men to replace Young in the church’s highest official financial position, to oversee such church-owned entities the Bank of Deseret and the Utah Southern Railroad. Frank Cannon wrote that as questions regarding Young’s financial practices multiplied both within and outside of the church, “Brigham wished a legal dummy” to occupy the Trustee in trust office, and sometime after George A. Smith was appointed, “Brigham, George, and the Mormon people promptly forgot the whole matter; and church business was transacted” by Brigham Young as usual.⁷⁹

The month after Grant’s December 1872 address to Congress outlining his continued opposition to Mormonism, Brigham Young stood before the assembled congregation in the basement of the unfinished St. George Tabernacle and in essence declared Mormon independence from the gentile world—as he had numerous times over the years. This time he said that “some twelve years ago,” i.e., in 1861 when he established Utah’s Dixie in southern Utah, “the Lord had put it into his heart to establish this mission and make us here an

⁷⁸ Cannon and Knapp, *Mormon Empire*, 353, 347. Young had always understood the importance of “God-given assignments” or “mission calls” and diligent labor in controlling his people. *Doctrine and Covenants*, section 28; *History of the Church*, 1: 109–111, and 118–120; Phillip R. Legg, *Oliver Cowdery: The Elusive Second Elder of the Restoration* (Independence, MO: Herald Publishing House, 1989), 47–58; Stanley R. Gunn, *Oliver Cowdery: Second Elder and Scribe* (Salt Lake City: Bookcraft, 1962), 71–78

⁷⁹ Cannon and Knapp, *Mormon Empire*, 203.

independent people.” He connected the Washington Cotton and Woolen Factory, and other local southern Utah cooperative efforts such as the CCCC to this “declaration of independence” and “urged the necessity of [the Saints] becoming self-sustaining” by not buying anything from the gentiles. Again and again he “referred to co-operation and its necessity in all things” and said he would “labor with the people until they felt to sustain themselves and to cease to build up the gentiles” economically.⁸⁰

The Winsor Castle Stock Growing Company, Pipe Springs, and the Arizona Mission

Thomas Kane personally advised Brigham Young in the organization of the Winsor Castle Stock Growing Company (WCSGC). Designed to function as the backbone of Young’s economic strategy in southern Utah, this cooperative joint-stock company was to be based at both St. George and Pipe Springs. Elizabeth Kane relates that Young was up until midnight on the night of January 1 doing preliminary work. The next morning, he lunched with the Kanes, perhaps seeking legal advice from the general, and later that afternoon Young officially met in the St. George tithing office with key church leaders and investors, including Anson Winsor. An elaborate set of company bylaws were discussed and approved and Young made sure that he was personally elected the president of the WCSGC. Before the day was over, the WCSGC was formally incorporated before William Snow, Erastus Snow’s brother and the probate judge of Washington County. Testimony to the degree of Thomas Kane’s involvement in founding the company, a draft of the company’s founding legal instrument (“Article of Agreement of Windsor Castle Stock Growing Company”), with Kane’s personal (and substantial) editing notes,

⁸⁰ James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:163–166.

additions, and deletions, was carefully preserved among Kane's other papers relating to Young. The company was not legally incorporated until January 1873, by which time it had been operating for two years. The Article of Agreement documents the operation of the cooperative cattle ranch that functioned at Winsor Castle from 1873 at least until 1878 when the Pipe Springs Ranch was absorbed by the CCCC. It also gives limited insight into the complex private and church interests that overlaid the tithing ranch there and is representative of the "articles of agreement" of other Mormon cooperative cattle companies which functioned during the period.⁸¹ Notwithstanding much of its operation would take place in Arizona, the Article of Agreement was made in accordance with an act the Utah Territorial Legislature had enacted at Young's behest in February 1870 entitled "An Act for Incorporating Associations for Mining, Manufacturing, Commercial and Other Industrial Pursuits." Incorporated before Utah's Washington County probate judge, the Article of Agreement was signed by eight men. Brigham Young, Lorenzo D. Young, A. Milton Musser, and Elijah F. Sheets were all residents of Salt Lake County. Joseph W. Young, Alexander F. MacDonald, and John W. Freeman were residents of Washington County. Only Anson P. Winsor was listed as being from Kane County.

The company, WCSGC, was to continue for twenty years "unless sooner dissolved." The "objects of this company" were to be "the buying, growing, and marketing of stock, and the manufacturing of Butter and Cheese and marketing the same." Formalizing Pipe Springs' connection with St. George and its ecclesiastical officers and its temple then under construction, the Article of Agreement spelled out that while "the principal place of [the company's] business shall be in the City of St. George, County of Washington, and Territory of Utah," the herd

⁸¹ James Bleak, "Annals of the Southern Mission," 2:161-162; SGSMH, January 2, 1873; Elizabeth Kane, *Life in Utah's Dixie*, 18; and "Article of Agreement of 'Winsor Castle' Stock Growing Company," draft, sworn by Brigham Young, et al. before William Snow, Probate Judge of Washington County, January 2, 1873, TLK, b17, f7.

ground and dairies would be “at Winsor Castle Ranche in Kane County, and at such other places as are suitable for the business, and accessible to the company.” The incorporators knew Pipe Springs was actually in Arizona, but because of its important connections to Utah’s Mormon settlements it was listed as being in Kane County, Utah. The article of incorporation specified that the business of the company was to be controlled by a board of seven directors elected annually by stock holders; the board to elect a president and vice president and treasurer from among themselves. The capital stock of the company was limited to a maximum of \$500,000 divided into individual shares of \$25, each share constituting one vote toward choosing the seven directors and voting in other stockholder business. Shares could be purchased with “horned stock,” cash, “or such other property, as may be accepted by the board of directors” at cash values. Purchases of stock shares were to be entered meticulously on the company’s books by the secretary and certificates documenting the same issued to stockholders. Each year the board of directors were to “cause to be made out a list of all live stock and other property, belonging to the company, with its cash market value, showing the loss or gains and exhibit the expenses of carrying on the business of the company.” The board was to declare a dividend of gains “to be paid to the stockholders or placed to their credit [i]n capital stock, at the discretion of the board.” While elected by the stockholders, the board was all-powerful. It fixed its own rate of compensation for its services and was to have “full power to bargain[,] buy, sell or exchange, receive, convey or deliver under seal or otherwise any and all species of property, pertaining to the company.” The board was empowered to “make such Bye-Laws” as would be necessary from time to time “for conducting the business of the company,” and was authorized to “employ all work hands and discharge them at pleasure.” At its founding, the capital stock of the WCSGC was valued at \$7,350, with Anson Winsor the largest shareholder at \$3,000. Brigham Young

invested \$2,350, and Alexander MacDonald \$1,000. The remaining five charter members (Lorenzo D. Young, Joseph W. Young, Elijah F. Sheets, A. Milton Musser, and John W. Freeman) each invested only \$200.⁸² These founding investments were mostly made in livestock already at the Pipe Springs Ranch.

In accordance with the loosely interpreted “Law of Consecration,” Winsor, like Brigham Young, had both ecclesiastic and personal property involved in the company. Fundamental to the ideas upon which Joseph Smith’s “Law of Consecration” and United Order were founded was the notion that all property was the Lord’s, that the Saints were simply the stewards of his property, and that they were to use “all things in common” for the purpose of building up his kingdom. Wasting valuable time making distinctions as to “who owned what” was superfluous when there was a kingdom to be built to hasten the Lord’s Coming. In a speech Young gave in general conference as he ramped up his cooperation policy, he touched on this unique Latter-day Saint understanding of property ownership. The charter members of the WCSGC apparently had both private and ecclesiastical interests at Pipe Springs, which, in their minds, they owned jointly and privately at the same time. This muddy problem of unclear title had always been the bane of Latter-day Saint joint-stock efforts and though they seemed blissfully unaware of it, the arrangement carried the seeds of the entire system’s eventual undoing. Keeping this church and private ownership separate in the hearts and minds of the company’s board of directors was difficult, but keeping it straight in the company’s books was simply impossible. While making a show at record keeping, Joseph W. Young and Anson Winsor, and the others involved in the company, trusted each other “like good Mormons,” to be fair whether their transactions made it into the record books or not. Several important ledgers regarding WCSGC in the 1870s and

⁸² “Article of Agreement of ‘Winsor Castle’ Stock Growing Company,” draft.

1880s have been preserved, which provide a general picture of this peculiar Latter-day Saint economic undertaking. Among other things, these accounts show that recording their “holy doings” was important to them, and that the mundane business of herding, branding, and castrating beef cattle, as well as haymaking and milking dairy cattle to make “temple cheese” was done in the spirit of “Holiness to the Lord.”⁸³

In a memorandum of agreement made between the company and Anson P. Winsor on February 15, 1873 “in [the] presence of Pres. Brigham Young, vice-president Jos. W. Young and secretary Alexander F. MacDonald, at St. George,” Winsor agreed to “do the work of herding at the ranches of the company,” as well as the “farming and fencing connected therewith at Winsor Castle and Mocassin Springs, and the dairy work at the ranche for \$3500 per annum.” One thousand dollars of this total was to be remuneration for Winsor, his wife and children, and the remaining \$2,500 was to be used for salary, board, and expenses for four additional hired men and one woman to help Sister Winsor. The day this memorandum was signed, Young gave Winsor careful instructions “on the business of the company.” Young was concerned with the minute details of the company’s operation and directed Winsor to see that only “*one man*” did all the branding and that the iron “be heated to a cherry red with charcoal, in a small suitable furnace.” Though the company was officially owned by the eight original stockholders, it was to be considered property of the church. Young directed that the church’s tithing brand was to be used on the ranch’s stock—a plus sign or cross inside a 3 1/2 circle. The prophet directed Winsor to procure “two brands,” one half the size of the other, to be used on “calves and young stock.” Young was far less precise, however, when it came to paying Saints the money that he owed

⁸³ Ferreting this all out now is impossible, especially without access to restricted and uncatalogued financial records in the church archives.

them. It had been nearly three years since he had agreed to give Elizabeth Whitmore \$1,000 for her interest in Pipe Springs, and he now directed that she only be offered that amount in capital stock in the newly incorporated WCSGC “if she will accept it.” The record shows that that same day, Young, as a private party, paid for his personal amount of capital stock, and then as Trustee in trust for the church put in \$10,000.⁸⁴

Twenty days after organizing the WCSGC on January 2, 1873, Young and Kane organized an exploratory expedition to the San Francisco Peaks region south of the Grand Canyon. To help prepare Arizona’s indigenous peoples for mass Mormon migration into their lands, the expedition’s “Indian Department” included some of Young’s very best “Indian men,” among them Jacob Hamblin, Ira Hatch, Andrew Gibbons, Thales Haskel, and Jehile McConnel. Young instructed Hamblin to organize “a corps” of Kaibabit scouts and expressmen “sufficient to send back word to Kanab and to carry word from Kanab to the company.” Reports could be telegraphed to Salt Lake from the telegraph office attached to Bishop Stewart’s house in Kanab. The Company was to assess the “character [*sic*] of the country; the nature of soil, facilities for irrigation [*sic*], timber, stock range, water power” and locate settlement sites. The company gathered “specimens of Fossills, Rocks, surfis [*sic*], and sub soil, carefully, labelling the same; noting the place from whence each came, with the general course, and dip of the mountains” and kept “a journal of each days travel and doings.”⁸⁵ Young planned to lead the actual migration company himself later in the spring but was advised by Kane to protect himself from new legal threats “and if pursued by the Government [to] cross the borders into Mexico.”⁸⁶ Exaggerated

⁸⁴ SGMH, 400.

⁸⁵ Memorandum, Organization and instructions to the San FranCisco [*sic*] Mountain Exploring Company, January 22, 1873, Toquerville, in James G. Bleak Papers, USHS, Mss B 171.

⁸⁶ *Boston Post*, April 11, 1873, 2, MANI.

reports in the national press speculated that the church president planned to “take 20,000 of the Mormons with him down into Arizona and there end his days.”⁸⁷ The *Salt Lake Tribune*, much more exact in its observations of Brigham Young, however, explained “When he was ‘hiding at Kanab,’ and the papers, generally were publishing that he would never show his head again in Salt lake City, we affirmed that he could not afford to run away from all his power and property—for Mormondom is a property, and not a mere faith—and that he would only hide in times of danger and come back to the metropolis of Zion in the seasons of safety”⁸⁸

The official minutes of the organization of Young’s Arizona Exploring Company on January 22, 1873, included these edited lines, apparently dictated by Brigham Young himself: “~~When you meet white men, represent yourselves, as Miners, but~~ To the Indians, show yourselves ~~not to be miners, but~~ to be their friends, and that you come to their country to do them good.” To help win support among the Native Americans they wished to settle among, Young issued orders that the company “Kill no game, unless you actually need it.”⁸⁹ The party completed their exploration and returned to Kanab on March 3, and historian McConnel and Jacob Hamblin sent their report to President Young. While covered with fine black pine, they found the soil around the San Francisco Peaks (near modern Flagstaff, Arizona), to be “one volcanic mass which has long since been thrown from the bowels of the Earth.” There was little water and prospects for Mormon-style agriculture in the shadow of the Peaks were limited. Traveling up the Little Colorado to the east, however, they found “some excellent land, good water. . . & abundance of good stock range & some cotton wood timber.” Hamblin reported that

⁸⁷ For example, see the *Boston Post*, April 11, 1873, 2.

⁸⁸ *Salt Lake Tribune*, May 17, 1873, 2, UDN.

⁸⁹ Memorandum, Organization and instructions to the San FranCisco [*sic*] Mountain Exploring Company, January 22, 1873.

he and his corps of Kaibab and white missionaries contacted representatives of some 30,000 Native Americans who were anxious to have the Mormons come live among them. Thus, based on the reports of this February–March 1873 expedition, and intelligence Young had been gathering for years, Moencopi Wash near the Hopi village of Oraibi, and the more distant Little Colorado Country, would be the Mormons’ first settlement targets in Arizona beyond Lees Ferry.⁹⁰

Grant’s renewed interest in solving the “Mormon problem” pushed Young to act before he was fully ready. On March 8, 1873, 165 “Missionaries for Arizona” met in the Old Tabernacle on Temple Square in Salt Lake City, apparently representing some 250 who had been called. Their job was to build a road from Lees Ferry to Moenkopi Wash and beyond to the Little Colorado, to locate settlement sites on both drainages, and to put in crops to support the large immigration that Young intended for later that year. Brigham Young directed them “to get ready, and start” as soon as the snow-covered roads were “fit to travel.” Their orders were “to proceed to Winsor Castle [at] Pipe Springs and there be organized, and from that point, proper guides would accompany them to their destination” on the Little Colorado.⁹¹ The compound at Pipe Springs was to serve as a launching pad for Young’s colonization of Arizona. Nine days later, Brigham wrote Joseph W. Young reminding him that “a call had been made upon you to fix the

⁹⁰ Levi Stewart, Kanab, to Prest. B. Young, March 4, 1873, BYP; Jehiel McConnell, Kanab, to Prest B Young, March 8, 1873, BYP; and Jacob Hamblin, Kanab, to President Brigham Young, March 19, 1873, BYP. “The first question generally asked by them,” Hamblin wrote Young, “was ‘When are your people going to come over here to live.’ I generally answered, there will be some come pretty soon. They said, ‘we hope so—we want to be one with you.’” According to Hamblin, this was especially true of the Hopi, who were “Desirous of assistance on the Moencoppe this spring. . . they want some one to shew them how to build a strong store house and mill.” Hamblin wrote that “This Mo-en-coppe as it is called by the Moquis is a cleft of Rocks for about 25 miles, ranging East & West[,] out of the south face of which ooses many springs of pure water. I counted 40; some 8 or 10 of them run a mile or 2 before sinking[.] One of them I think yields water enough to turn a small mill.” Hamblin described that “Moencoppe wash runs thro a rich grass country for 100 miles, no cactus, or sage, but some scrub cedar.”

⁹¹ Brigham Young, S. L. City, to Elder Joseph W. Young, St. George, Washington, CO, March 10, 1873, BYLB, SCA, DVD 25, b13, f3; CHOJ, March 8, 1873; and Charles Peterson, *Take Up Your Mission*, 10; HOJ, March 8, 1873.

road out from the Pariah, so [the Arizona Missionaries] should not be detained” or “prevented from putting in a crop this season.” The road Brigham was directing Joseph to explore, locate, and build, would rise from the Ferry over an almost insurmountable set of cliffs then called “the Devil’s Backbone.” President Young informed Joseph that it would be his duty to “receive and organize” the missionaries as they arrived at Pipe Springs and send them forth “under the direction of a proper guide in parties large enough to be safe with as little delay as possible.”⁹²

The Pipe Springs Corridor

While the San Francisco Mountain Exploring Company completed their expedition, and Congress and the President attempted to address the “Mormon Problem,” work on the Hurricane–Pipe Springs–Lees Ferry road ramped up. Winsor Castle’s existence secured Pipe Springs’ precious water to make possible the major migration artery Young and Kane envisioned.⁹³ Throughout 1870, 1871, and 1872, every time Young was in the south he spent time “straightening” his road, as part of a master plan for Mormon migration to Arizona and potentially to Mexico. Even during his fall 1871 exile, Young devoted time to the road and he continued to use routine preaching tours that required church leaders to travel throughout the corridor in 1872 an excuse to continue its improvement. In May of 1872, for example, sometime

⁹² Brigham Young to Joseph W. Young, March 10, 1873. “Out from the Pariah” referred to the indescribably difficult three-mile haul up out of the confluence of the Glen, Marble, and Paria canyons that made Lees Ferry possible and onto the high plateau on the east side of the Colorado.

⁹³ George A. Smith articulated the First Presidency policy that had already inspired the building of Winsor Castle when he wrote the following to Jacob Hamblin in February 1873: “It will be necessary to make a wagon road to the Colorado, and to establish a safe and sufficient ferry, if the brethren could establish fortified houses at the principal watering places on the route, such as are safe; keep herds of cattle and a few Indians who could exercise a wholesome influence among the Indians who reside there, it would do much to render traveling safe. A fortified house at the crossing of the Colorado to protect the boat and ferrymen would also be important.” George A. Smith, Salt Lake City, to Jacob Hamblin, February 16, 1873, PTR, s8, b3, f37.

after Powell's men vacated the unfinished portions of Winsor Castle, Erastus Snow and wife Elizabeth on their way to meetings in Kanab, "slept on the ground near the end of Bro Winsor's stone house." On the way back they were joined by a number of Kanab road workers armed with "tools for repairing road," who filled a water barrel at Pipe and "started from Winsors' to break a new track for St George." Camping that night at Cedar Ridge, they "trimmed cedars and made track over the ridge." Joseph W. Young and Erastus Snow rode ahead carefully choosing "the most direct and feasible track for the road."⁹⁴ James Bunting, a diarist from Kanab working the road behind them, suggested that their purpose was to "break" a new road "from 4 miles west of pipe springs to rock Kanyon," a steep chasm in the Hurricane fault where Brigham Young was then having a new dug-way built to facilitate Arizona travel.⁹⁵ The Hurricane fault was by far the most challenging obstacle on the western portion of the route. Erastus Snow had previously selected a dangerous track over the 1,000 foot precipice that was sarcastically called "the Snow Slide," named for President Snow and nature's effect on any one who attempted to use it. Such a dangerous track had to be improved if it was to accommodate hundreds of wagons heading to plant new colonies in Arizona. Brigham and Joseph scouted and surveyed the new trail and gave strict instructions to David H. Cannon—who was in charge of building the new dug-way up Rock Canyon near Fort Pearce. On May 22, Erastus Snow was the first to take a carriage over the new-dug way, then being blasted through the solid rock on the future "Honeymoon Trail."

Brigham gave his overworked nephew the assignment "to locate a ferry and superintend the making of a road to the crossing of [the Colorado] river, to enable the missionaries appointed

⁹⁴ Bleak, "Historical Memoranda of [the] Southern Mission," May 16–21, 1872.

⁹⁵ James L. Bunting, *Journal*, March 9 and May 18, 1872, BYU.

for the [Arizona] mission to pass over without difficulty.”⁹⁶ Among the heavy assignments the younger Young already carried were his callings as St. George Stake president, President of the Southern Mission, member of the House of Representatives in the Utah Territorial Legislature, superintendent of the finishing of the St. George Tabernacle, superintendent of the building of the St. George Temple, (which was then being rushed by the prophet’s indomitable drive), as well as superintendent of all other public works in the whole Southern Mission. He was essentially responsible for everything in Brigham’s southern bastion, south of the rim of the basin.⁹⁷ In March, Brigham directed him to prevent some twenty-four quarter-sections of prime timber around Mt. Trumbull from being claimed by “outsiders” by hurriedly surveying and claiming this unusually stout stand of ponderosa pine; his uncle needed this lumber to finish the inside of the St. George Tabernacle and to build, roof, and finish the temple. Joseph was assigned to see that a massive cooperative sawmill was constructed at “the Mount Trumbull Pinery” and to develop an eighty-mile-long wagon road nearly to the north rim of the Grand Canyon so the lumber could be brought out.⁹⁸ A month later, at the church’s General Conference in April 1873, Joseph was formally sustained as “Assistant Trustee in trust” and he, along with a new council of thirteen men, was placed in charge of the kingdom’s financial empire.⁹⁹

⁹⁶ *Deseret News*, June 25, 1873, 10, UDN. Correspondence between Brigham and Joseph W. Young, CHL; Joseph W. Young, St. George, to Pres. B. Young, Salt Lake City, April 17, 1873, BYP. Joseph W. sought to reduce Brigham’s load by taking upon himself what he could. “I feel for one to do all in my power to lighten your burdens,” he wrote his uncle on April 17, 1873. The aging and weary prophet was only too glad to “throw off some of [his] business cares” onto the stocky shoulders of his willing nephew.

⁹⁷ *Deseret News*, June 25, 1873, 10.

⁹⁸ Richard Bentley, Secretary, Mount Trumbull Lumber Co, St. George, to President G. A. Smith, Trustee in trust of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, June 19, 1874, BYP; and John N. Pike, Office of John W. Young, to Pres. B. Young, June 25, 1874, BYP.

⁹⁹ At the general conference in April 1873, Young relinquished the title “Trustee in trust,” appointing George A. Smith as his successor in that office. A dozen younger energetic men, including Joseph W. Young, were appointed as Smith’s assistants. See *Salt Lake Herald*, April 9, 1873, 1, UDN.

To feed his plural family, Joseph still nominally ran his sawmill and at least one ranch in Long Valley, both of which he shared with his brother, John R., and the latter's father-in-law, William M. Black. Joseph was also heavily involved in private and cooperative ranching at the Pipe Springs Ranch and to some degree, as president of the Southern Mission and St. George stake president, he still maintained at least an ex officio supervisory role over the fort at Pipe, its stock, and its tithing office. If all this were not enough, Brigham asked Joseph to act as general contractor for a spacious new winter home the prophet was having built for himself in St. George. The house would be built with money local Saints owed the church president and Brigham asked Joseph to "assist me in collecting those debts so as to accomplish the job" and "superintend [the building of my house] and make a nice job of it."¹⁰⁰ To add to Joseph's burdens, the spot Brigham had selected for the temple contained several springs and as soon as substantial foundation work commenced, Joseph and his workers found themselves in a quagmire of quicksand which promised to swallow any ashlar they laid.¹⁰¹ Simultaneously, the nearly finished St. George Tabernacle was found to have been built on a subterranean aquifer and it too promised to sink into a pool of quicksand without quick action. It stressed Joseph to write to his impatient relative that he hoped his efforts would "draw off[f] the water and save the building. If it does not something else must be done." In addition to improving and lengthening the road into Arizona, as president of the Southern Mission, Joseph W. was to take charge of the

¹⁰⁰ Joseph W. Young, St. George, to Pres. B. Young, Salt Lake City, February 22, 1873, March 19, 1873, and April 17, 1873, BYP; and Brigham Young to Joseph W. Young, St. George, March 10, 1873, BYLB. President Young's instructions stated there should be "a verandah one story high, running all along the north side, with a door opening on to it from the house, which would be a good place to sleep in the summer time."

¹⁰¹ Edward L. Parry, "A Brief History of the Erection of the St. George Temple," WCLSC; Janice Force DeMille, *The St. George Temple: First 100 Years* (Hurricane, UT: Homestead Publishers, 1977), 23–27; and Joseph W. Young, St. George, to Pres. B. Young, Salt Lake City, March 19, 1873, BYP. Joseph W. and construction teams spent weeks building a complex drainage system and pounding tons of stone into the mud to create a firm base upon which to build.

entire immigration to Arizona. Brigham gave instructions for Joseph to gather, organize, and instruct the Arizona Pioneers at Pipe Springs.

When the church president pressed Joseph to be in attendance at the general conference in Salt Lake to be sustained in his new position as “Assistant Trustee in Trust,” Joseph, in a notable understatement, wrote, “I would be glad to come to conference but don’t see that I can leave.” He ended a missive gently excusing himself from attending the conference with a prayer that the Lord would bless Brigham “in all your labor as also all the faithful laborers in Zion” in theirs.¹⁰² Joseph was forty-four years old and already sick from “overwork.” As the Prophet of the Lord saw it, the temporal and spiritual salvation of the whole human family was “a mighty work” that the creator had yoked squarely on the shoulders of the Latter-day Saints in tandem with their savior. For four decades Young’s message of temporal and spiritual toil was the same: he told his people: “The work we have upon us is an immense one[;] it is great, powerful and divine; it is an almighty work.” Of the calling they had received from God “as a people,” he said: “When I look at it, I do not want to rest a great deal, but be industrious all the day long; for when we come to think upon it, we have no time to lose, for it is a pretty laborious work.”¹⁰³ Part of the reason for shifting so much work to the shoulders of “younger men” in 1873 was that he knew it would take considerable preaching on his part to more fully establish the Law of Consecration and the United Order of Enoch. Since the prophet had shouldered unspeakably great burdens for the kingdom, he was not afraid to load every man and woman with all they could carry—and sometimes, as in the case of Joseph W., with much more. The church president

¹⁰² Brigham Young to Joseph W. Young, St. George, March 10 and March 19, 1873, BYLB; and Joseph W. Young, St. George, to Pres. B. Young, Salt Lake City, March 19, 1873 and April 17, 1873, BYP.

¹⁰³ *JD*, 6:295, 19:93.

sometimes confessed that the “toil and labor” required of him by the Gospel, including the vexations of polygamy, sometimes caused him to “desire the grave” in order to escape.¹⁰⁴

“The Devil’s Backbone” and the Passing of Joseph W. Young

The trail Joseph W. Young and his road-builders engineered up the far side of Lees Ferry was even more treacherous than the road up the Hurricane Fault, which they improved during the spring of 1873.¹⁰⁵ Levi Stewart and Jacob Hamblin alerted Joseph W. that it would require considerable blasting to push a road through. Joseph gathered up powder, fuses, ropes, drills, and twenty-one men, and hurried to Lees Ferry. His multiple jobs required days of grueling back-and-forth travel on what he called “the new road to Winsor.”¹⁰⁶ In his comings and goings he received and branded the tithing and temple donation livestock constantly arriving at Pipe Springs, and in mid-April he organized the Arizona immigrant party Brigham Young had appointed to rendezvous at Winsor Castle. Sending them off in small groups of about ten wagons each—large enough groups to protect themselves from native groups, but not so large that they would overwhelm the small springs and seeps that provided drinking water along the route from the Colorado to Moenkopi Wash—Joseph W. Young hustled ahead to make sure the ferry and road up the Devil’s Backbone were in order. Brigham Young described the significance of Pipe

¹⁰⁴ *JD*, 3:266. Brigham Young told the people, “I have had to examine myself, from that day to this, and watch my faith, and carefully meditate, lest I should be found desiring the grave more than I ought to do.”

¹⁰⁵ See John R. Young, *Memoirs*, 149. Initially called the “Devil’s Backbone,” the new ascent they blasted and scraped from Lees Ferry in the Colorado River bottoms to the top of the adjacent plateau became known as “Lee’s Backbone.”

¹⁰⁶ Joseph W. Young to Pres. B. Young, March 19, 1873; and Joseph W. Young to Pres. B. Young, April 17, 1873.

Springs to his Arizona mission and what he hoped the mission to accomplish in a letter to Apostle Albert Carrington on April 19:

The Missionaries for Arizona are starting out from the various settlements and [are] gathering at Winsor Castle, where they will be organized under the direction of Elder Joseph W. Young, and sent forward to make settlements among the Moquitch Indians. We expect them in time to make acquaintance with the Pimas, Maricopas, Navajoes, Apaches, and other Indians, as we hope by the blessing of our Heavenly Father to be able to induce many of those to abandon their present habits, and labor as we do We hope to found a city on the Colorado river, on the line of the projected Southern Pacific Railroad (35° parallel) and continue on south to the 32° parallel, and bring a large portion of our emigration that way to settle the southern country. They are pushing that road with vigor, and may be through to the point we allude to within two years.¹⁰⁷

Joseph Young worked himself to death attempting to fulfill the duties placed upon him by his prophetic uncle. Young returned to St. George from Lees Ferry on April 23 “quite unwell” and “was taken with a chill and had quite a high fever that night.” On April 26 “he ventured to start for Pipe Springs” again “to meet some of the brethren on their way to the Colorado Mission.” When he arrived at the Ranch the next day, he was taken again with “a severe chill, which confined him to his bed.” Hardly able to walk, he attempted to make it back to St. George to preside over the semiannual Conference of the Southern Mission and on April 29 and 30, he was driven back to St. George in a carriage. By now it was apparent that Joseph was in mortal

¹⁰⁷ Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, to President A. Carrington, April 19, 1873, in *MS 35* (May 20, 1873): 314.

danger.¹⁰⁸ John R. Young was telegraphed at Pipe Springs, and along with his father-in-law, William Morley Black, quickly saddled their horses and rode to St. George.¹⁰⁹ By now Joseph was suffering from “an aggravated form of diarrhæa or dysentery, also erysipelas on his face and head” and “the protracted sickness [had] reduced his flesh very materially, so much so that it became painful for his friends to look upon his emaciated limbs” but he still insisted on being taken north to the cooler climate of Salt Lake City.¹¹⁰ His doctor resolutely warned “that if he was moved it would kill him.” He died in heat of the day, June 7, 1873.¹¹¹ Even Brigham acknowledged that the first superintendent of Pipe Springs died of “general debility, aggravated by over work.” His younger brother John R. Young, still caring for the sheep at Pipe Springs at the time of Joseph’s death, wrote that his sibling naturally “felt great anxiety” regarding his duties. “In the spring of 1873,” John R. wrote in his memoirs, “my Brother Joseph W., with a company of brethren, was working a road over the ‘Devil’s Backbone,’ near Lees ferry, Arizona, when he received a partial sunstroke, from which he never fully recovered. He was further prostrated by overwork, taking stock and branding cattle at the church Pipe Spring Ranch.”¹¹² Henry Eyring, assistant historian of the Southern Mission, in announcing Joseph Young’s death to the readers of the *Deseret News* wrote that “in the month of March of the present year, he went to the Colorado River to locate a ferry and superintend the making of a road to the crossing of

¹⁰⁸ Joseph W. was unable to attend the conference, but Anson Winsor spoke, reporting that “quite a number of the brethren, who were called on the Colorado mission, had passed through Pipe Springs, feeling well in spirit, and determined to fulfil their mission.” *Deseret News*, June 25, 1873, 10, UDN; and John R. Young, *Memoirs*, 149–151.

¹⁰⁹ Black was also father-in-law to Lorenzo Z. Young, a younger brother of both Joseph W. and John R. Young. Black worked extensively with grist and sawmills and helped with the Young brothers sawmill in Long Valley. He was also an experienced stonemason and because of his connection to the Young brothers probably helped build Winsor Castle. See William Morley Black, “Sketch of the Life of William Morley Black,” especially 4–5, 7, 10–12, 18. <http://archive.org/details/SketchOfTheLifeOfWilliamMorleyBlack1826-1915>. See also John R. Young, *Memoirs*, 149.

¹¹⁰ *Deseret News*, June 25, 1873, 10, UDN.

¹¹¹ *Salt Lake Herald*, June 8, 1873, 3, UDN.

¹¹² John R. Young, *Memoirs*, 149.

said river, to enable the missionaries appointed for the Colorado Mission to pass over without difficulty. Exposure at that time and a multiplicity of mental cares connected with it brought on the sickness which finally terminated his eventful life.” The *Deseret News* wrote that “the disease which carried him off was mainly an affection of the chest, but a life of severe and almost unremitting mental and physical toil had also caused a general wearing out of the system.”

On Sunday June 8, Joseph W.’s funeral was held in the unfinished St. George Tabernacle, whose construction he had superintended. By chance or design, most of Joseph’s pall bearers had something to do with Pipe Springs. There was Erastus Snow’s son Mahonri, and William P. McIntire, and John M. Moody, brother and stepfather of Robert McIntire who was killed at Pipe Springs early in 1866. There was Charles L. Walker, who had worked periodically as a stonecutter there, and Edwin D. Woolley, Jr., who would one day superintend Pipe Springs Ranch himself and eventually come to own it privately.¹¹³ In some ways the St. George Temple, Tabernacle, and Winsor Castle are cenotaphs to Joseph W. Young and the Pipe Springs corridor his funerary path. Certainly all are monuments to the work ethic and pioneering spirit of nineteenth century Latter-day Saints and the Kingdom they strove to build in the American West.

For all Joseph W. Young’s efforts, the 1873 invasion of Arizona was not a success. In fact, some discouraged and despondent Arizona Missionaries themselves declared it “dead” not quite a week after Joseph W. Young’s death. They went so far as to raise a crude headstone “in a conspicuous place” near Moenkopi upon which they scrawled “Arizona mission Dead—1873.”¹¹⁴ The haphazard organization the missionaries encountered at Winsor Castle, and

¹¹³ James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:192–193.

¹¹⁴ Charles Peterson, *Take Up Your Mission*, 12–13.

especially the poor quality of the road and ferry contributed to a “leaven of discontent” that doomed the mission almost from the start. John D. Lee, who at the time owned Lees Ferry in partnership with Jacob Hamblin, recorded in his diary his declaration that the “company never Should have been Sent on a Mission until a good Road and Ferry had been Made first.” What really peeved the impertinent captain was not the road, or the ferry, but the prophet’s judgement in sending them to “God forsaken” Arizona in the first place.¹¹⁵ But the road, and its ferry, as crude as they might have been, were not what killed the Arizona mission: it was the utter desolation of the destination and a subtle weakening of the Prophet’s grasp over his people in the face of the growing American pluralism in Utah. As the missionaries trudged up Moenkopi Wash on their way to the Little Colorado, they encountered one of the stiff dust storms the entire region is known for, and were pelted for two days with sand, dust, and tiny rocks. “After eating the sand of those two wind scorched days,” one of them “found wry comfort in the fact that ‘we will hev suffishent gritt to stand a few hardships.’” Despite the fact that Latter-day Saints were known far and wide for their “gritt” and desert hardiness, they were not prepared for the desolation they encountered in Arizona. Once on the Little Colorado, they discovered that river was “a loathsome little stream” as “disgusting” as any “on the continent.” Utterly overwhelmed by the desert country they confronted, and shocked that the Little Colorado was evaporating into a dry wash before their very eyes, they sent messengers back to Kanab’s telegraph line to alert Brigham Young to the failure of the water and the lack of grass necessary for their animals to move forward. Most of them undoubtedly secretly hoped the prophet would call the mission off,

¹¹⁵ Charles Peterson, *Take Up Your Mission*, 11; and Lee, *Mormon Chronicle*, 2:240–241.

but knew such an outcome was not likely, given Young's commitment to opening up an escape route and additional places of refuge in Arizona.¹¹⁶

Congress adjourned on March 4 without passing any of "those unconstitutional Bills against the Saints in Utah," and in the minds of some had overruled the immediate need for the Arizona mission. Young had instructed them "to Settle upon a Cooperative principle and not ask what they are going to have for their labor but labor to build up Zion & Convert the Lamanites to the gospel & baptize them & set them to work." But some of the precursors to the Panic of 1873 were already settling in over Utah and many of the missionaries had left their families in distress. Working for free with no hope of "having something for their labor" was tremendously difficult, especially when the gentile mines of Utah were clamoring for Mormon labor and paying in cash. The slowing of Utah's agrarian economy was bringing the question of "prophet or profit" to the forefront.¹¹⁷ Then there was the issue of the Arizona mission's connection to railroad building: apostates and the *Salt Lake Tribune* generated public awareness that Young had made a fortune by contracting "the Priesthood" to build the transcontinental line while many Mormon subcontractors below him lost their shirts. All along there were those among them who believed "this remarkable pioneering mission was really planned by [the President of the Southern Pacific], and not the 'Lord'" and they would again be asked to sacrifice for the economic gain of a select few. When the missionaries themselves abandoned their mission, the *Tribune*, and newspapers throughout the nation reported mockingly that the returning colonists had their eyes opened to the truth after "living on mule meat in the endeavor to reach that paradise of a country

¹¹⁶ Charles Peterson, *Take Up Your Mission*, 11–12. Powell's 1869 expedition had learned this four years earlier.

¹¹⁷ Woodruff, *Journal*, 7:126–127.

once described by Bishop Musser as ‘abounding with walnut timber, fat turkeys, good grass and plenty of water.’”¹¹⁸

It was something new in Brigham’s kingdom, a whole mission crumbling before adversity and retreating without his authorization. It signaled cracks in Brigham’s bastion and he spent the rest of his life shoring up his fracturing authority system, ultimately revamping the Priesthood’s entire organization.¹¹⁹ As the daunted missionaries beat the fast track home, a perceptive poet among them wrote a string of verses when he saw the makeshift tombstone marking the death of the mission. Showing he too knew something of his prophet’s determination and endurance, the poem’s opening line read, “Thou Fool, This Mission is not dead, it only sleeps.” The Arizona mission was revived in 1876 when a more direct route from northern Utah from the Sevier Valley to Kanab was improved, ensuring that much of the missionary traffic would by-pass Pipe Springs.

¹¹⁸ *Salt Lake Tribune*, July 15, 1873, 2, UDN. The *Bath Daily Times*, in Bath, ME, published the following on July 16: “The San Francisco Arizona Mormon mission, projected by Brigham Young to settle in that territory and build that section of the Southern Pacific Railway, has proved a disastrous failure. The entire Colony, more than seven hundred, is [on] the way [back] to Utah. Many have already arrived. Others will remain on the other side of Colorado river for want of boats, which were lost. . . The emigrants experienced terrible sufferings. The country was completely misrepresented. It is sterile, and water and pasturage are scarce. . . . On their return the emigrants were compelled to throw away their stores and all heavy articles to enable them to reach the water and feed for the teams. The condition of the people and the train is extremely bad. The result has shaken faith in the infallibility of the head if the church as an inspired prophet.” *Bath Daily Times*, July 16, 1873, 2, MANI.

¹¹⁹ William G. Hartley, “The Priesthood Reorganization of 1877: Brigham Young’s Last Achievement,” *BYU Studies* 20 (Fall 1979): 3–36.

Chapter 10

The Temple, the United Order, and Lamanite Baptisms

Young's Reaction to the Failure of the Arizona Mission—the United Order

Brigham Young's reaction to the collapse of the Arizona mission was to push forward with the establishment of the United Order (UO) and the building of the St. George Temple. Trusting in the "superlative value of work" to keep his people together, some of his most perceptive followers saw the UO as the First Presidency's "best efforts to organize the people into working companies."¹²⁰ The ultimate purpose of the UO was to further isolate his people and build economic bulwarks around them to protect them from their enemies. Frank J. Cannon perceptively wrote that "Brigham did not build his kingdom as a business enterprise, but as a holy sanctuary for a distressed Church."¹²¹ Young himself explained in a letter to his son Willard that "Our commercial enterprises, such as the Mercantile Institution, Deseret National Bank, Railroads &c. . . . have a powerful effect in heading off those who would introduce strife and discord in our midst."¹²² The Panic of 1873 and the resulting mine closures dried up gentile cash in Utah. Young wrote that "by this scarcity of money we hope to starve some of these adventurers out; the Devil cannot work without money, whereas the Lord can; we lived here about twenty years without hardly a dollar circulating among us, and we not only lived but

¹²⁰ Black, *Sketch*, 12.

¹²¹ Frank Cannon and George Knapp, *Mormon Empire*, 380.

¹²² Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, U. T. to Willard Young, West Point, M[ilitary] A[cademy], April 14, 1873, BYLB, SCA, dvd1:25, MS2736, b13, f4.

improved and grew rich.”¹²³ Systematizing, controlling, and focusing the labor of his people was clearly one of Young’s most formidable strategies in his fight against Babylon.¹²⁴

The “boggy” spot upon which Young chose to build his temple in St. George turned out to be located directly over a sizable spring partially “composed of mud, water and sinkholes in the gypsum formation” As the result it took over a year and a quarter to prepare the foundation for building—fully one-fourth of the five year period it took to build the edifice. Edward L. Parry, supervisor of the temple’s foundation and stonework, wrote that the ground was so “wet and soft” that in places “a fence pole could be pressed in from twelve to fifteen feet with ease.” According to Parry, “this caused considerable anxiety as to the best way of making [the foundation] substantial enough to sustain the enor[m]ous weight” of the size of building Young had proposed.¹²⁵ Many locals suggested moving the site to a better location, but Young held tenaciously to his original plan. To remedy the problem, 750 cords of crushed basalt lava stones were driven into the mud at the temple site with a pile driver improvised from an old cannon. The cannon was filled with lead, encased in logs; the whole, weighing near 1,000 pounds, was drawn to the top of a derrick by horse, mule, and ox power and dropped over and over again to pound the rock into the muddy earth to create a rock solid platform. The cannon, which can still be seen today at the St. George Temple Visitor Center, has several unique origin stories. One version claims it

was manufactured in France and was taken by Napoleon in his siege of Moscow
and abandoned in his retreat from the burning city. From there it was dragged into

¹²³ Brigham Young, Salt Lake, to Dear Morris, September, 7, 1874, BYLB, SC, dvd 1:25, MS2736, b13, f5.

¹²⁴ Charles Walker, *Diary*, 1:382.

¹²⁵ “The Temple at St. George: A Brief History of its Erection,” *Deseret News*, 21 May 1879, 7, UDN; Edward L. Parry, “A Brief History of the Erection of the St. George Temple,” WCLSC; and DeMille, Janice Force, *The St. George Temple: First 100 Years* (Hurricane, UT: Homestead Publishers, 1977), 23–27.

Siberia, thence to Alaska, and finally landed at Fort Ross in California. When Sutter bought the fort, he acquired the artillery with it. Members of the Mormon Battalion, coming north after their historic march of 1846, were employed by Sutter to build a mill race, where gold was discovered. When these men decided to return to Utah, they accepted as pay from Sutter, along with other items, two brass cannon mounted on wheels. These they dragged over the northern route to Salt Lake City in 1848; in 1851 one was brought south to Parowan and thence on to St. George in 1861.¹²⁶

According to another story, the cannon was “taken off the ships of Commodore Stockton and used by the Commodore and Colonel John C. Fremont as field artillery, [*sic*] to take possession of California for the United States,” and subsequently brought to St. George by Jesse W. Crosby. One way or the other, the cannon played a major role in “taking possession” of Utah too. It serves as a symbolic reminder of the role of the Mormon military in establishing theocratic Utah as a foundation for modern Latter-day Saint temple culture.¹²⁷

“It Took Good Old Beef to Keep Those Men Going on Such Heavy Work.”

¹²⁶ See Edward L. Parry, “A Brief History of the Erection of the St. George Temple,” WCLSC; Roxey S. Romney, et al, “How The Temple Was Built,” WCLSC; Janice DeMille, “St. George Temple,” 27–28; and Howard R. Driggs as quoted in Juanita Brooks, “To the Glory of God: The Story of the Mormon Temple at St. George, Utah,” *Arizona Highways*, 23 (April 1947): 1, and 32. For more information on the provenance of the St. George Temple Canon, see Charles Walker, “Diary,” 1: 362, footnote 3; Cap Cresap, “Clearing up the Confusion about California Canon of John Sutter,” *The Artilleryman* 27 (Spring 2006), http://artillerymanmagazine.com/Archives/2006/sutter_sp06.html; and Robert G. Larsen, “Where, O, Where, Have those Cannon Gone?,” October 2012 draft of a paper delivered at Mormon History Association Conference, Layton, Utah, 2013. My thanks to Joseph Soderborg who brought this paper to my attention, and to Sharyn Larsen of Moraga, CA, who provided me with a copy. See JAP.

¹²⁷ Albert E. and Mary Ann Cottam Miller, “Building of the St. George Temple,” 5, CHL.

Anson Winsor's eight-year-old son Frank remembered that starting in the spring of 1872, and continuing on for twelve months, he helped drive a small herd of thirty beef cattle the sixty miles from Pipe Springs to St. George each month "to feed the temple hands working on the construction." Nearly seventy years later he remembered the process of pounding rock into the temple's foundation:

I saw the men pounding in the rock for the foundation of the temple. The cannon now displayed on the temple grounds was in operation. Everything had to be done by manpower. To see that [cannon] forced into the air and then fall into place was fascinating to a small boy. . . . It took good old beef to keep those men going on such heavy work. I saw the men dressing the black rocks that went on the foundation. These rocks came from the black ridge west of St. George. Then came the laying of the black rock for the first foundation story.¹²⁸

During the cold winter months of 1871–72 when the foundation work began, it appears that there were some forty volunteers from settlements outside St. George who joined local laborers in working on the temple "for free." Young expressed his justification for requiring the Saints to work building temples without pay by explaining "The Gospel is free, its ordinances are free, and we are at liberty to rear this Temple to the name of the Lord without charging anybody for our services. . . . Let this work be commenced forthwith; and as soon as possible we shall expect from 50 to 100 men every working day throughout the season to labor here. . . . no man need come here to work expecting wages for his services." He expressed his temple building philosophy succinctly at the dedication of the site for a new temple in Manti in April 1877, by

¹²⁸ Joseph Frank Winsor, "Life," 1.

saying “if any person should enquire what wages is to be paid for work done on this Temple, let the answer be, ‘Not one dime.’ And when the Temple is completed, we will work in God’s holy house without inquiring what we are going to get, or who is going to pay us, but we will trust in the Lord for our reward, and he will not forget us.” Young allowed construction workers to “get credit on Labor Tithing or on Donation Account for their services,” but expected them “to work until this Temple is completed without asking for wages,” for “It is not in keeping with the character of Saints to make the building of Temples a matter of merchandize.”¹²⁹

Beginning as early as May 1870, before building of the new tithing ranch at Pipe Springs or the St. George Temple had started, Anson Winsor gathered some 2,000 head of tithing and temple donation stock there with the view of feeding workers on the proposed St. George Temple. Gathering and driving these animals from places as far away as Fillmore (some 200 miles) over hard cattle trails kept the supervisor of the Pipe Springs Ranch so occupied that although he was a “master carpenter,” he had little time to work on fort building. Winsor also gathered stock for other church-owned institutions (which had their own herds) such as the Rio Virgen Manufacturing Company’s cotton factory. Understandably, Anson Winsor’s sons told their descendants that they built the fort without much help from their father.¹³⁰ The volunteers laboring on the St. George Temple were asked to provide much of their own victuals, but considering the austerity of the local pioneer economy and the volunteerism of most temple laborers, they were dependent upon the St. George tithing office and Bishop Winsor’s beef, cheese, and butter from Pipe Springs for sustenance. Many of the volunteers brought their

¹²⁹ *MS 39* (June 11, 1877): 373.

¹³⁰ See PSLA, VF, FH, Winsor, especially Joseph Winsor, “Life”; “Interview of Luther M. Winsor,” especially 1; and LaVar Winsor, “Anson Perry Winsor & Emeline Zenetta Brower.” For Winsor gathering stock for other church institutions, see J. Birch, Washington, to Thos. W. Ellerbeck, 26 November 1871, and Jos. Birch, Washington, to David Cannon, April 17, 1871, in James Godson Bleak Papers, letters 1870–75, 76, and 37–41, USHS.

families to St. George with them,¹³¹ and the flour, corn, potatoes, dried fruit and other stored produce of the tithing office failed almost immediately. Hebron carpenter and millwright Charles Pulsipher, who was wealthy enough to fit himself and his family out with a load of flour he had purchased, described how the lack of food to feed the “Temple hands” almost immediately created a crisis. This crisis catapulted him into a four-year stint as head of a team of special “home missionaries” called to canvass every settlement as far north as Nephi foraging for donations of food, clothing, and funds. This work prepared Pulsipher to eventually succeed Anson Winsor as superintendent of the Pipe Springs Ranch.¹³² From January 1872 to June 1876 he solicited donations of flour and other staples needed to feed the temple builders and cash and livestock to finance the other heavy investments required by the “noble work” of temple building. Coming from a family that dominated livestock production in northern Washington County’s Hebron (named for the seat of the Old Testament cattle industry of Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob), Pulsipher paid special attention to soliciting cattle as temple donations. He and others drove these donated animals to Pipe Springs Ranch to be fattened up for consumption. This naturally drew Pulsipher in to the WCSGC’s purview and he had much to do with Bishop Winsor and other tithing office employees and church resource managers. According to Pulsipher’s own account, he performed his duty with such diligence, enthusiasm, and success that Brigham Young eventually sacked Anson Winsor and hired Pulsipher to work in his place as supervisor of the Pipe Springs Ranch and manager of the WCSGC.¹³³

¹³¹ Brigham Young, George A. Smith, and Daniel H. Wells, Salt Lake City, “to the Bishop and the Board of the United Order in your Ward,” August 1874, St. George Temple, Broadside, 1874, CHL. Young directed temple construction volunteers to bring “with them such portions of their families as they may wish to assist in household labors.”

¹³² “Home missionaries” were missionaries called to work from their homes in Zion rather than traveling into the world as proselyting missionaries did.

¹³³ Without giving details, Pulsipher reported that Brigham Young became dissatisfied with Winsor’s management of the precious tithing and temple donation resources kept at the Rancho and appointed him as a willing substitute.

Pulsipher remembered that early in January 1872 several men were gathered around a stove after a meeting in St. George. Bishop Daniel D. McArthur, who was then in charge of the St. George Tithing Office, asked Brother Snow, “what are we going to do for provisions to keep these Temple hands at work. . . . We have sent for the last load of corn that I have any account of.” Snow “studied a little” and replied “Don’t you think considerable could be raised by free will offerings?” “Well,” Bishop McArthur responded, “perhaps a little might be got in that way but nothing to what it takes to feed those forty hands and their families.” Apostle Snow asked Pulsipher his thoughts on the matter and unaware how his answer was about to change his life, he responded: “About three weeks ago I was up to Cedar City to get my flour for the winter and I found quite a lively interest manifested in regard [to] the building [of the St. George] Temple and I think that if some thorough arrangements [*sic*] was entered into and persevering missionaries sent that considerable means could be gathered.” Typical of the character of frontier Mormon society, Snow slapped Pulsipher on the shoulder and asked the surprised carpenter, “Won’t *you* start out and see what can be done[?]” Acquiescing to “the Call” Pulsipher responded “Well, if you say so of course I will go and do the best I can.”¹³⁴ Knowing intuitively the need to account for every dollar, Pulsipher and his partner improvised their own bookkeeping system where they kept three different accounts in “little note books,” one copy to leave with the bishop in the ward in which the donation was made, one to send to the St. George tithing office with the donated items, and one to keep for their own records. As “home missionaries” they went “from one

Charles Pulsipher, “Record of Charles Pulsipher and Family,” 24–27, 30–39, in Cleon David Tucker Collection, CHL.

¹³⁴ Charles Pulsipher, “Record,” 25–26. Snow told Pulsipher to hunt up a missionary companion of his choice. He induced Elder H. M. Church to serve as his companion and “we drove around to President Snow’s office the next day and told him we were ready.” Rushing to “a meeting,” Snow dictated his authorization for their mission and with a scribe created a homemade missionary certificate on a scrap of paper. “Brother Pulsipher and Church,” it read, “go with our faith and blessing to gather tithes and offerings for the Temple.”

settlement to the next holding a meeting at every settlement urging the necessity of donating of our means to help along the noble work [of temple building].” Pulsipher noted that as soon as they “got a lead” on any provisions whatsoever, they sent someone “to go and take it right down so that the hands might keep at work and thus we kept them a going.” Donation-hauling teamsters were paid out of the loads they carried, but the missionaries encouraged them to do at least half their hauling gratis as a temple offering. Pulsipher paid for all the food and clothing he appropriated out of the temple donations for his own use.

Traveling “through Washington, Iron and Be[a]ver County, visiting every settlement gathering offerings from all that we could reach,” Pulsipher wrote, “ I found that we had traveled three hundred miles by team and held 22 public meetings and gathered about 8000 dollars in cash, flour, goods of all kinds and such things as was needed for the forwarding of the work” from just these three counties. Snow made Pulsipher’s calling permanent and announced that he had “appointed him Traveling Agent to do the [temple donation] business through the different Stakes.” For four years Pulsipher and his team of “home missionaries” kept supplies and donations, often in the form of cattle, rolling into church coffers by preaching “Temple Donation” in Washington, Kane, Iron, Beaver, Millard, Sanpete, and Severe counties. As time went on, their duties expanded from raising food, clothing, and means to drumming up volunteers to serve as quarrymen, stone masons, hod-carriers, loggers, freighters, and carpenters.¹³⁵ Pulsipher was a man of great faith and deep spirituality and testified that his ministry was divinely aided by dreams and visions—he even claimed the spirit of prophecy and the gift of tongues were manifest in his work.¹³⁶

¹³⁵ Pulsipher, “Record,” 26–27, and 31–33.

¹³⁶ Pulsipher, “Record,” 33–35. On one occasion, he reported he preached for forty-five minutes to a Danish congregation in their own language—a language he did not know. “I suppose I must have spoke the Danish

Aware his prophet was aging, Pulsipher felt an urgency to “push the work forward as fast as possible while President Young was alive that he might get the ordinances established.”¹³⁷ Young himself was anxious to communicate “the Keys of the Priesthood” Joseph Smith had given to him before he himself passed on. And this, he said, must occur in a dedicated House of the Lord. Young could see he would never live to see the much larger and more intricate and ornate Salt Lake Temple finished. Charles Pulsipher promised the Saints that if they freely gave of their substance and time toward the building of the Temple, the Lord would bless them spiritually and temporally. Poverty on the Mormon frontier was great, and Pulsipher was often hesitant to ask for donations from so many who had so little to give. Capturing the spirit of sacrifice that reared the substantial pioneer edifice in St. George out of abject poverty, Pulsipher wrote that he “asked Brother Snow at one time about taking offerings from a poor family.” Snow responded that Pulsipher should “Accept their offering and get their names on the Temple records but be sure and leave a blessing with them that they shall be abundantly rewarded in return.”¹³⁸

The Men from the North, the United Order, and Preaching

From March 10, 1873 to February 21, 1874 the stonemasons at the temple laid the foundation with hard black volcanic basalt designed to “last through the Millenium.” The first week in January 1874, Charles Walker wrote that there were “Brethren at work on the Temple and in the Quarry from San Pete, Fillmore, Beaver, Kanab, Rockville, Virgin City, Minersville,

language for them to understand it so well for I know they understood me by the liberal offerings they made just as fast as the clerk could write.”

¹³⁷ Pulsipher, “Record,” 33.

¹³⁸ Pulsipher, “Record,” 34.

Panguitch, [Holden], Washington, Santa Clara, and St George, all as busy as bees; in fact all the people seem spirited and interested about the Building of the Temple.”¹³⁹ Young wrote his son that during his stay in St. George from December 1873 to April 1874 while “masons, tenders, teamsters, quarrymen, and other laborers came from the settlements farther north, to assist through the winter,” the plan was for “the masons, most or all of them,” to continue their labors through the spring and summer. Young was pleased with the diligence of the various laborers and that by the time he left on April 6, “the basement walls were nearly finished.”¹⁴⁰ It was now time to lay the upper walls themselves with the region’s softer and more workable red sandstone. But planting time had arrived and the majority of the northern hands returned to their homes.¹⁴¹

By mid-June most of the southern Utah settlements had been transformed into UO “working companies.” Concerning the UO however, Charles Walker (the premier St. George diarist) wrote that “many people are doubtfull [*sic*] of its success,” for there were many “who love this world[‘s] goods and have but little faith in [God’s] promises.”¹⁴² By August the First Presidency had posted broadsides all over northern Utah calling for bishops and UO boards to fit out laborers to work on the St. George Temple from October 1874 to April 1875. Workers were to bring “such portions of their families as they may wish to assist [them] in household labors.” Northern communities were to supply these building missionaries with “groceries, flour, beans, peas, dried apples, salt, and pork and bacon” sufficient to last six months, but “beef, dried peaches, raisins and vegetables it is expected can be supplied by the brethren in the southern settlements.” As per Young’s general temple policy, the broadside made it clear that “all labor

¹³⁹ Charles Walker, *Diary*, 1:381.

¹⁴⁰ Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, U. T. to My Dear Son Morris, May 5, 1874, BYLB, SCA, dvd 1:25, b13, f5.

¹⁴¹ JH, 6 April 1874, 1, and 7 April 1874, 1; and James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:262.

¹⁴² Charles Walker, *Diary*, 383–384, 387–388.

and furnishings, as above called for, *are designed to be a free donation.*”¹⁴³ By December 1874, one hundred men “from San Pete” were actively engaged “some on the walls of the Temple, some on the roads and in the Stone quarry and others hauling wood, lime, Sand &c &c, all busy pushing the good work along.” The seventy-mile stretch that extended east from St. George over the Hurricane Fault and then south to the sturdy stands of ponderosa pine around Mt. Trumbull had been selected to provide the heavy timbers necessary for roofing.¹⁴⁴

To expedite the work, Erastus Snow, who had returned from his short European mission, moved his family out of his St. George mansion and rented it to the tithing office to house visiting laborers. According to one account, sometimes as many as seventy men took their meals and slept there. Bishop Alexander F. MacDonald, now head of the Southern Utah Tithing Office (SUTO), moved into Snow’s “Big House” so his wife Elizabeth could oversee the massive work of boarding “the public hands.” MacDonald was in St. George because he had been charged with “murder, arson, treason and other grave offences [*sic*]” relative to the Utah War, including alleged involvement the 1857 “Parrish-Potter Killings.” Young had advised the MacDonalds to flee northern Utah after unruly federal troops from Fort Rawlings attacked their Provo home in September 1870.¹⁴⁵ Erastus Snow’s mansion was temporarily renamed “the St. George House Hotel.” With twenty rooms it was also sometimes called “the Church Hotel,” “the Church Boarding House,” “the Big House,” the “Snow House,” or “the Snow Hotel.”¹⁴⁶ Meanwhile

¹⁴³ Brigham Young, George A. Smith, and Daniel H. Wells, Salt Lake City, “to the Bishop and the Board of the United Order in your Ward,” August 1874, St. George Temple, Broadside, 1874, CHL, italics mine. The goal was to complete all rock work “by the 1st of April next, *if possible.*”

¹⁴⁴ Charles Walker, *Diary*, 1:379.

¹⁴⁵ George A. Smith, Journal, March 9, 1874, George A. Smith Family Papers, UU; George A. Smith, St. George, Utah, to President Joseph F. Smith, March 15, 1874, in *MS*, 36 (1874): 252; Elizabeth Graham MacDonald, “Autobiography,” especially 20–28, and 33–38, CHL; and Brigham Young and George A. Smith, Nephi, U. T., to President Daniel H. Wells and others such as you call to your aid as councilors, October 26, 1871, BYP.

¹⁴⁶ See Woodruff, *Journal*, 7:291; Elizabeth MacDonald, 37–38; Edward Hunter Snow, “Autobiography of E. H. Snow 1931,” 1, in USHS, Juanita Brooks Papers, Mss B 103, B18, F11; and Clorinda Schlappi Schmutz and Zina

scores of other families “freely” took in temple building borders who could not be accommodated at the “Hotel.” Tents, sheds and shanties also provided lodging, and when the temple’s walls were high enough to provide shelter from the wind, Brigham Young suggested building sheds and shanties *inside* the structure to use as workshops by day and sleeping quarters by night.¹⁴⁷ In addition to the work of Pulsipher’s “home missionaries,” various stake and ward tithing offices, mercantile institutions and cooperative herds, including the Winsor Stock Growing Company began supporting them on an *ad hoc* basis. Alexander MacDonald managed all these resources as head “of the church tithing, and dispensing office, where means from all sources of the church was cared for.”¹⁴⁸

Since cash was hard to come by in the southern Utah economy, various local currencies, or scrip, were adapted to pay the temple hands for their labors, to allow volunteers to feed themselves and their families while working “for free.” Since these workers were technically serving as missionaries without wages, or working to pay back tithing or to pay off PE Fund indebtedness, scrip allowed temple builders to purchase food and other necessities from tithing offices and church-run mercantile institutions, bakeries, and butcher shops. Scrip notes were sometimes called coupons and functioned as legal tender within the community. In the eyes of the Latter-day Saints, scrip was still not cash, and while begrudgingly honoring it in the general market because Brigham Young told them to, they bartered on its value like on any commodity notwithstanding its written face value. As might be expected, Mormon scrip was most often spurned by gentiles, which helped Young keep Zion’s economy separate from Babylon’s. During

Schmutz Coates, “Life Story of John Schmutz and Clorinda Schlappi Schmutz as told by Clorinda and Compiled by Zina Schmutz Coates,” 6, in Juanita Brooks Papers, b18, f3, USHS.

¹⁴⁷ Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, to Bishop Robert Gardner, August 6, 1874, BYLB, SCA, dvd 1:25, ms2736, b13, f5.

¹⁴⁸ “The Building of the St. George Temple,” 7, WCLSC.

the years the St. George Temple was under construction, there was territory scrip, tithing office Scrip (colloquially called “TO” and issued by the various tithing offices throughout the Kingdom), Rio Virgen Manufacturing Company scrip (paid out to employees of the Washington Cotton and Woolen Mill), Canaan Ranch scrip, WCSGC, St. George Zion’s Cooperative Mercantile Association (ZCMI) scrip, and a host of others. These were augmented by scrip issued by the multitude of stake and ward UOs that were created starting in 1874.¹⁴⁹ Thus the massive pioneer construction project was completed using a primitive barter economy as individuals, families, and various church institutions throughout Mormondom were expected to voluntarily contribute labor, building supplies, produce, flour, beef, clothing, shelter, cash, and scrip to help move the temple forward.¹⁵⁰

Under the life and death expediencies of persecution, migration, settlement in Indian country, war, and the general vicissitudes of kingdom-building on a wild frontier, Young at times quite naturally engaged in “compulsory means” that occasionally caused some of his followers to accuse him of exercising “unrighteous dominion” contrary to the revelations. Despite the remarkable power of Young’s personality and the forceful intensity of his governmental style,

¹⁴⁹ It has been estimated that there were over 200 different types of scrip in territorial Utah. See “Old Mormon Scrip: Pioneers Had ‘All Kinds of Money,’” *Deseret News*, 28 April 1962. See also Arrington, *Great Basin Kingdom*, 72, 144–145, 189–190, 312–313, and 325; Sheridan L. McGarry, “Mormon Money,” reprint from the *Numismatist*, (Salt Lake City, [1950]), CHL; Leonard J. Arrington, “Coin and Currency in Early Utah,” *UHQ* 20 (Jan. 1952): 60–61; Don L. Penrod, “Coin, Currency, and Barter in Early Utah,” 1966, CHL; Norman K. Johnson, “Early Mormon and Utah Holographic Scrip,” *UHQ* 57 (Summer 1989): 216–239; SGMH, 325f; Eliza R. Snow, *Biography and Family Record of Lorenzo Snow, One of the Twelve Apostles of the Twelve Apostles of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints* (Salt Lake City: Deseret News Company, 1884), 306–318; Richard G. Bowman, “Mormon Pioneer Currency,” *Denver Westerners Brand Book* 29 (1973): 107–141; “Extract from a Letter of Leo Snow to Josephine Sanberg,” 2–3, WCL; “Kinds of Early Money in Kanab as Told by Ray [Woolley],” WSC, b4, fl.

¹⁵⁰ Doctrine and Covenants, 58:26–29. According to Joseph Smith’s revelations on the Law of Consecration and Stewardship, the Saints, whether acting as individuals, wards, or in cooperative or United Order companies, were technically “agents unto themselves” and were supposed to be free to choose for themselves what, how, and when they donated, as “stewards” of the Lord’s property based on *their* wants, needs, and individual circumstances. The whole system rested on “free-will donation.” Under the spirit of Joseph Smith’s revelations, church leaders were not to mandate or require donations, but to simply *ask* for them. This principle extended to tithing, mission calls, colonization, and everything else in the Mormon system.

his people generally knew their “God given rights,” and when it mattered, many quietly (or not so quietly) displayed the backbone necessary to claim them. While most were compelled by social pressure and faith to patiently endure Young’s “jawing,” many Latter-day Saints often “voted with their feet” by quietly deserting settlement missions, purchasing goods from gentiles, or by neglecting to pay full tithes. In the long run their actions generally demonstrated a powerful commitment to Joseph Smith’s more democratic revelations regarding Common Consent, Agency, and the Freedom of the Will. The result was that incredibly strong-willed Brigham Young found himself in the frustrating position of occupying the office in a theocratic kingdom whose subjects were Americanizing away from his kingdom ideals at what he felt was an alarming rate.¹⁵¹

Young’s was a kingdom made up of individuals increasingly choosing to govern themselves—especially in the north, where the presence of large numbers of gentiles and related economic and governmental conditions allowed them to do so. Imbued by the same spirit of free will and independence that permeated the general American social landscape, many Mormons chose to quietly declare their independence through their actions. While Young was sure he held the same “Keys of the Kingdom” Christ had delivered to St. Peter, Joseph Smith had set up certain democratic checks and balances which Young sometimes chose to ignore. Indeed, Smith taught that the secret to Mormon power was expressed in his maxim “I teach them correct principles and they govern themselves.”¹⁵² The central paradox of the whole Latter-day Saint

¹⁵¹ Doctrine and Covenants, 121:36-46. Sometimes, even under Joseph Smith, church leaders were tempted to exact obedience by strong measures, but the Lord through His Prophet unequivocally called this “unrighteous dominion,” which caused the Heavens to withdraw authority from the men who sought to exercise it. According to Joseph’s revelations, ecclesiastical influence was only to be maintained by persuasion, kindness, gentleness, long-suffering, “unfeigned” love, “and pure knowledge.” It was never to be maintained by compulsion, fiat, or by superior rank in the Priesthood.

¹⁵² One of Joseph’s brothers-in-law in plural marriage, wrote that “the principle of his government or influence over his people is explained in his reply to a church dignitary (I think a Catholic bishop) who at the Nauvoo Mansion

ecclesiastical system, then as now, is that Mormonism is a theocratic monarchy totally based on principles of Christian “free will”—which is called “agency” in the Mormon scriptures. The Lord had made the Saints “agents unto themselves.” They were commanded to “do many things of their own free will,” and to be “anxiously engaged” in good works of their own choosing. Divided into quorums, congregations, and councils, they were to “sit in counsel together” and hear what every man had to say, and to do all things with “common consent” which originally meant something much more democratic than it did by the time Brigham Young used the term. In essence, Young presided over a kingdom where each subject was hypothetically his own master yet simultaneously constrained to obey the words of the prophet, “as if from [God’s] own mouth.”¹⁵³ The constant juxtaposition between the principles of monarchy and democracy, and between the king, his own free will, and that of empowered, free-willed subjects, is key to understanding the convoluted private and ecclesiastical economic forces operating at Pipe Springs, and the entire Latter-day Saint Kingdom. It animated the distinct private and church aspects of the Pipe Springs Ranch, as well as the private, public and ecclesiastical natures of the Winsor Castle Stock Growing Company, which was called upon to contribute to building the temple, causing these forces to sometimes operate at cross-currents with each other. The collective kingdom vs. individual agency conundrum contributed to a situation where the right

asked him He replied, ‘I do not govern them—I teach them correct principles and they govern themselves.’” Benjamin F. Johnson to George S. Gibbs, April—October 1903, in E. Dale LeBaron, *Benjamin Franklin Johnson: Friend to the Prophets* (Provo, UT: Grandin Book Company, 1997), 230. John Taylor quoted Joseph’s maxim as early as 1851 in *MS*, 13 (15 November 1851): 339. George A. Smith said “A feeling has been engendered and sent abroad that the Latter-day Saints are subject to bondage; but instead of this being so, they are controlled wholly on the principle to which I have just referred, as having been enunciated by Joseph—they are taught correct principles and then govern themselves.” George A. Smith, April 6, 1869, *JD*, 13:20. For other usages of the maxim, see *JD*, 10:57; *JD*, 24:159; and “An Epistle of the First Presidency to the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints in General Conference Assembled,” March 1886, 7, GB. Brigham Young was not prone to use the phrase for it was not in harmony with leadership style.

¹⁵³ Doctrine and Covenants, 21:4–6; 26:2; 58:25–29; 102; and 107.

hand often did not know what the left hand was doing, often leading to very high levels of inefficiency.¹⁵⁴ A major purpose of Young's UO was to systematize the chaos of "free will" action and bring it to order under one unified head. The UO under Brigham Young in the 1870s was designed to make the Prophet the sole agent of the entire Mormon commonwealth, and to place control of all Latter-day Saint energies, enterprises, and endeavors firmly in his hands. Even apostate Frank Cannon pointed out that this was done with the best of intentions by a leader who gave "wonderful service and unquestionable loyalty to his people" to better protect them from their enemies.¹⁵⁵ Had the UO succeeded, it would have subtly allowed a handful of scriptural verses about unity, to trump at least twenty-six revelations about "free will," "stewardship," and "agency."¹⁵⁶ The primary reason Young's UO failed was that the great majority of the people exercised their agency by refusing to submit to it.

In Young's experience, preaching played an important role in transforming individual agency into unity, and Young's preaching tours significantly expanded in 1873 and 1874. In what was becoming their normal routine, Young and First Counselor George A. Smith spent the winter of 1873–1874 in St. George which by now was indeed becoming Mormondom's southern capital. On February 9, 1874, Brigham Young moved to commence the UO in St. George and the next Saturday, at the first major meeting held in "the upper part" of the nearly completed St. George Tabernacle, Young announced that "the time had arrived when we should conform to the Revelations contained in [the] Book of Covenants, *to be one*." The duty "to enter into this

¹⁵⁴ Cannon and Knapp, *Mormon Empire*, 379–380.

¹⁵⁵ Cannon and Knapp, *Mormon Empire*, 380.

¹⁵⁶ A good starting point for information on Latter-day Saint theology concerning "the Law of Consecration and Stewardship" are the revelations of Joseph Smith highlighted in "Significant Revelations about the Law of Consecration and the United Order," in the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *Church History in the Fulness of Times Student Manual*, Institute Manual Religion 341 through 343, (Salt Lake City: The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 2003), 98; and Arrington, Fox, and May, *Building the City of God*.

friendly, brotherly, labor,” he said, “is the present duty of the Saints, and has been during the past forty years,” though the Saints had thus far refused to shoulder it. “The question,” he asked the Saints in his usual rhetorical style, “is are we ready, and are we willing?” Demonstrating that he understood he could not force the people into the Order, he acknowledged that “the answer, is with the people themselves.” He wished the people of the Stake “to give sober consideration to the question of entering into the Holy Order of the Gospel in classifying and combining their labor.” He connected the work of the UO to the finishing of the temple by speaking of “the advantages of co-operative labor.”¹⁵⁷ The next day, Sunday February 15, 1874, in a meeting of all priesthood bearers of the Southern Mission, Brigham Young commenced fully organizing the St. George Stake UO.

The *Deseret News* reported that as Young or his representatives visited each community preparatory to organizing local branches of the UO, he outlined “the benefits that would be derived in the people uniting together in all their [property and] labors.” One of his objectives was to keep the Saints “self-sustaining” so as “not to import anything that can be manufactured in the mountains.” Another, was to “classify labor, so that every man can work at his own trade as much as possible, or wherever he will be the most useful.” By cooperating “in all kinds of business” and by “all working to each other’s interest” they would “all fare alike.” Typical of his speeches pushing the UO, in Beaver on April 19, Young promised that he “himself with the rest would put in all he possessed for the accomplishment of the work he was engaged in, and it would all become common stock.” He testified that “the intention [was] to elevate the poor, and make them comfortable and happy as well as the rich. He wanted no poor in our midst, nor would there be any when the Order got fully established.” He connected the Order to the Second

¹⁵⁷ SGMH, 2A:414-418.

Coming and proclaimed “the people must become of one heart and of one mind before they would be prepared to meet the Savior.” He also represented the Order as a means to triumph over gentile schemes to drive the Saints from their property. The Prophet Joseph Smith “had tried to establish this Order in his day.” Speaking as their modern prophet, he told them “the time had now come when the people would receive it, and [that] they would be blessed.”¹⁵⁸ In other places Young connected the UO to temple building and to “the saving of our dead,” saying “Now is the time to build Temples, and if the people are united no power on earth or in hell can prevent them [from building them].”¹⁵⁹ He also connected the Order to the Saints’ wealth and freedoms—which he believed Congress was attempting to take away—by working to pass a bill which effectively made Grant and Chief Justice McKean’s attacks on Utah’s judicial system legal following the Supreme Court’s ruling in the Engelbrecht decision. Speaking especially to the Saints in the South, Young had said, “The elements of wealth and independence are here. If the people will be dictated in the use of their time and of the talents which God has endowed them [with], we will increase in wealth and independence.”¹⁶⁰ Hypothetically now, all pockets in the church would be emptied into one “united” purse, including the Winsor Castle Stock Growing Company and the Pipe Springs Ranch.¹⁶¹ In time, Winsor Castle and its neighbor, Moccasin

¹⁵⁸ *Deseret News*, April 22, 1874, 1, UDN.

¹⁵⁹ For example, see SGMH, 2A:421.

¹⁶⁰ SGMH, 2A:431

¹⁶¹ See Brigham Young, Salt Lake, to Dear Morris, September 7, 1874, BYLB, SCA, dvd 1:25, MS2736, b13, f5. WCSGC became property of the St. George Stake UO as did other cooperatives like Canaan Ranch and the new Church lumber mill at Mt. Trumbull; integrating the most profitable of these cooperative institutions into the UO was difficult, since powerful capitalists interested in turning personal profits offered stiff opposition. The success of the WCSGC and the high dividends it paid worked to keep it out of the Order. Young himself had a sizable amount stock in the company. It perplexed many Mormons and gentiles of the period that despite Young’s fervor for the UO, he never put his personal property in to it. In May 1874, Erastus Snow wrote Brigham Young, “I often find my mind wandering toward our Dixie and anxious feelings for the success of Our institutions in that region and reflect that as yet our Coop Store, Factory, Stock & Sheep herds Dairy &c are not yet Properly merged in the Order.” Erastus Snow, Ogden, to Brigham Young, 19 May 1874, BYP, underlining in original. The WCSGC and CCC never fully merged with the Order, but the Mt. Trumbull Sawmills did, in part to have the Order take over some outstanding debts. Robert Gardner and James G. Bleak, St. George, to Prest. B. Young, Salt Lake City, July 1, 1874,

Ranche, together with their respective springs, became the property of the most successful order in LDS history, the Orderville UO.

The Pipe Springs Ranche and “The St. George House”

After the temple’s foundation was laid, Frank Winsor reported that the demands of hungry men necessitated doubling the number of Pipe Springs cattle delivered to the SUTO in St. George each month. Now he and his brothers and other ranch hands drove “thirty head of beef in *twice* a month.” He reported that his father “rode along with us and drove [a] baggage wagon loaded with butter and cheese made on the ranch.” The bi-monthly allotment from Emeline Winsor’s pioneer cheese and butter plant consisted of about a dozen giant cheese wheels, each weighing from forty to eighty pounds. Young Winsor was proud of the fact that “the ranch boasted the best equipped dairy in the church territory at that time.” They milked “100–150 cows during the spring, summer, and fall” and “all this milk made into cheese and butter [went] to feed the temple hands.” Frank remembered that “both beef and dairy cows ran yearlong on the open range,” at the Pipe Springs Ranch and that “the grass was so plentiful that good fat beef were supplied every month of the year.”¹⁶² A granddaughter of Anson and Emeline remembered that

BYP. Everywhere bishops, UO administrators and tithing office employees complained that “the love of money and what it will procure has a great influence on the minds of some People.” See for example, Wm. A. Bringhurt, Toquerville, to President B. Young, BYP. As the Board of Directors of the St. George UO wrote Brigham Young, the problem was that “Many Members are in the Order with their time and all their substance, fully controlled. Others are partly in and partly out, both in time and property. The first class move along with little trouble; the latter class are mostly of the fault finding and hard-to-please kind. Those who have interests separate from the Order often have to use part of their time to see to those interests.” Therefore, notwithstanding the fact that “the Order is established and working in every settlement in the St George Stake,” it met with “varying success as might be expected.” Robert Gardner, President, Daniel McArthur, Jas. W. Nixon, Vice Presidents, and E. G. Woolley, Asst. Sec., for the Board, St. George, to Prest. B. Young, August 2, 1874, BYP.

¹⁶² Frank Winsor, “Life.”

her grandparents had trouble getting the butter to St. George, especially during the summer months when temperatures frequently reached over 110°. Emeline used her ingenuity to “figure out a way” to keep the butter from perishing by taking “a big barrel and” putting “a layer of flour in it, then a layer of patties of butter, until the barrel was filled. Then the butter would melt and form a crust holding the butter. When they reached St. George, they put the keg into the ice house. When they removed the butter, the ladies used the crust that had formed for pie crust.”¹⁶³ Clorinda Schlappi, who later married Arizona Strip cowboy John Schmutz, left a record that described her experience preparing the beef, cheese, and butter that was produced at the Pipe Springs Ranch when she worked in St. George. Seventeen years old in 1874, Clorinda worked with four other girls about her age at the St. George House. She remembered that seventy volunteers found cramped sleeping quarters in the large house (with fourteen rooms) and that her team of five young women cooked and cleaned for them under the direction of an overseer named Hannah Faucett. Clorinda remembered:

We had to get up at four o'clock every morning, help with the breakfast and put up 70 lunches for those men. I would cut the bread, some other girls the meat and cheese; others put them together and fill 70 buckets. Then Sarah Smith and I would go up stairs and clean their rooms and make the beds. At 11 o'clock it was time to get dinner for the McDonald family. Brother McDonald took care of all the business and his wife took charge of the housework. We had to clean the dining room every day, get down on our hands and knees and scrub the floor where 70 men had been and had their meals. By that time it was time to get supper for all and do the dishes. There never was a moment to sit

¹⁶³ Nettie May Winsor Irving, “The History of Anson Perry Winsor,” 2, in JAP, Winsor.

down during the day only to eat our meals. It was 9:30 p.m. before we were through with the dishes and the table was set for breakfast [again].

The young housekeeper reported that she was to be paid two dollars each week—\$1.00 each in St. George Mercantile Association scrip and Rio Virgen Manufacturing Company scrip. Because of the grueling hours and the meagre remuneration, Clorinda wrote that she only “worked there for two weeks and could stay no longer.” When she and another young co-worker quit, their supervisor docked their pay threw “only \$2.50” on the ground in front of the Church Hotel “for two weeks work, working 17 ½ hours a day,” telling them they “hadn’t even earned that much.” “Such foolish girls [we were] to have picked that money up,” she later wrote, “we ought to have walked off and left it laying there.”¹⁶⁴

The size of the crews working on various aspects of temple construction—in the quarries, working the roads, felling or hauling timber in “the pineries,” shaping stone, burning lime, or building walls—was dictated by how many men the tithing office and all its subsidiaries could feed. This included the products of the tithing ranch at Pipe Springs, augmented by the donations Charles Pulsipher and his missionaries could scrape together, as well as contributions from various branches of Zion’s Cooperative Mercantile Association and other cooperatives and UOs. The strength of the cooperative herds kept at Canaan and Winsor Castle were major factors in determining the size of the temple work force. Throughout the project, Erastus Snow kept the First Presidency apprised of the availability of supplies, especially when it came to beef, cheese,

¹⁶⁴ Clorinda Schlappi Schmutz, “Memories & Incidents made known by Mrs. John Schmutz,” 5-6, WCL; and variant version in Clorinda Schlappi Schmutz and Zina Schmutz Coates, “Life Story of John Schmutz and Clorinda Schlappi Schmutz as told by Clorinda and Compiled by Zina Schmutz Coates,” 6, in Juanita Brooks Papers, b18, f3, USHS.

butter, potatoes, wheat, and dried fruit. When the stock of supplies were high, so were the numbers of workers—but the reverse was also true. In November 1873, for example, Erastus Snow wrote George A. Smith that “we can furnish a fair supply of beef and potatoes for a good corps of hands say one hundred and fifty.” He complained that Washington County’s supply of wheat was “already exhausted” and that a “moderate supply” of it was being drummed up in Beaver and Iron Counties to be brought to the St. George Tithing Office. “We would be glad for some fifty to one hundred able men including ten masons from the north” if “they can bring some groceries” such as “dried fruit[,] pork[,] and butter” with them.¹⁶⁵

Even though a formal request was issued by the First Presidency for 400 men from the north to work on the temple between October 1874 and April 1875, a bad harvest in 1874 seriously limited the labor force. On December 13, 1874, President George A. Smith announced that “the scarcity of grain in the Southern Mission and in Millard, Sevier, and San Pete Counties, necessitated the discharge of some of the residents of St. George who have been supported by their labor on the Temple.”¹⁶⁶ Things became so desperate that temple donation missionaries went after one hundred bushels of corn appropriated to Jacob Hamblin to feed Native Americans, guards, and missionaries at the Colorado Crossings. The 1874–75 wheat crisis revealed Mormon priorities.¹⁶⁷ Each winter Brigham Young and George A. Smith personally watched over the building project, usually visiting the site each day, convinced their presence would encourage the workers.¹⁶⁸ Fully aware of the scarcity of resources, they repeatedly urged temple workers to “be

¹⁶⁵ Telegram of Erastus Snow, St. George, to Prest Geo A. Smith, November 13, 1873, B.Y.P.

¹⁶⁶ SGMH, 530.

¹⁶⁷ J. W. Crosby and Lorenzo Brown, St. George, to G. A. Smith, B.Y.P.

¹⁶⁸ Telegraphic Meeting of the First Presidency and Quorum of the Twelve and Others, February 15, 1874, Brigham Young, Geo. A. Smith, and E. Snow in St. George, D. H. Wells, A. Carrington, O. Pratt, Jno. Taylor, W. Woodruff, Lorenzo Snow, J. A. Young, J. N. Smith, and S. S. Smith, Salt Lake City, B.Y.P. They told their Apostolic co-laborers in Salt Lake City that they intended staying in the South as long as they could to “keep the Brethren at work

prudent and economical in the use of provisions and supplies for yourselves and the teams you may have in charge.” They urged local farmers to plant every available weed patch in grain to facilitate construction of the temple. “The building of such a temple is one of the greatest missions which can be performed,” Brigham Young wrote in January 1875 in a letter to the “Saints of St. George and adjacent settlements.” “To go and preach the Gospel and baptize people, is but a comparatively small work,” he said, “But when we engage in erecting a Temple to the Lord in which to administer the ordinances of the Gospel, for and in behalf of our dead who have slept without any of the advantages of that Gospel, it should be considered, as it really is, one of the most important works in which man can engage.”¹⁶⁹

Throughout the entire period of temple construction, Anson Winsor and his crew at Pipe Springs did what they could to contribute to the all-consuming pioneer building project. In addition to running a personal herd and dairy at the ranch, Winsor himself was the caretaker of the church tithing herd, master of a church-owned dairy, bishop of a functioning tithing storehouse,¹⁷⁰ superintendent of the privately owned WCSGC cooperative, and manager of the Deseret Telegraph Office. All of these played important roles in building the temple, and each ostensibly had its own purse. Others at Pipe occupied similar but probably less complex positions of financial responsibility unique to Mormondom, including Winsor’s wife Zenetta, their adult and teenaged children, in-laws, and a host of cowboys and other employees, most of whom were paid in stock, which they in turn also ran on the Pipe Springs range. Charles

on the Temple as long as possible.” “We feel,” they told them, “that if we went home now it would slacken the work on the Temple too much.”

¹⁶⁹ Brigham Young, St. George, to the Saints of St. George and adjacent settlements and to those who have come from the north to assist on the St. George Temple, January 10, 1875, SGSMH, 536–539.

¹⁷⁰ For example, see memorandums of A. M. Musser to Z. C. M. I., October 12 and 28, 1874, BYLB, SCA, dvd 1:25, MS2736, b13, f5, #648-649.

Pulsipher and his traveling temple donation missionaries stopped at Winsor Castle occasionally in hopes of obtaining donations of the privately owned animals ranging there to augment the tithing stock which were already committed to temple building.¹⁷¹ Because there were multiple overlapping church entities at the Pipe Springs Ranch—the tithing stock operation, the tithing office, the church dairy, the Deseret Telegraph Office, and the cooperative stock company—and because we only have access to the records of the latter, only a partial portrait of its contribution to the building of the Temple can be sketched. A perusal of “Ledger B” of the WCSGC shows that its account with the SUTO was one of its largest. Under this heading were many subdivisions related to temple construction, including the St. George House, the St. George Slaughter House, the St. George Meat Market, and the St. George Bakery. In addition to its heavy drain on beef, the St. George House was a major outlet for the company’s cheese and butter. Representative of many such interactions, between April 3 and May 6, 1874, Winsor delivered 154 pounds of butter to the temple boarding house. For a similar one-month period the next year the amount of butter was nearly 200 pounds. WCSGC employees sometimes boarded at the St. George House when in town on company business.¹⁷² The company bought one-third interest in the St. George Slaughter House, adjacent corrals, and a meat market run by tithing office employee David H. Cannon.¹⁷³ In addition to the sixty head of cattle delivered monthly to the St. George tithing office from the tithing ranch at Pipe Springs, when demand was at its

¹⁷¹ In February 1875 Jesse W. Crosby and Lorenzo Brown claimed to be the first Temple Donation Missionaries to seek private donations at Pipe Springs. They reported to George A. Smith that they had “held 12 meetings in 9 days & traveled nearly 200 miles [and] visited & preached at Harrisburg[,] Leeds[,] Toquerville[,] Vergin City[,] Duncans retreat[,] Graften[,] Rockville[,] Shunesberg[,] thence accompanied by 2 guards . . . crossed over to Long Valley . . . held meetings at Carmal & glendale[,] thence to Kanab[,] thence to Winsor castle & got credit of being the first missionaries that called & held meeting there[.] In all these Places the People came together on the shortest notice & seemed anxious to hear what we had to say & willing to do all we required[.] [A] universal good feeling prevailed [in] relation to the Temple[.]” J. W. Crosby and Lorenzo Brown, St. George, to G. A. Smith, B.Y.P.

¹⁷² “Ledger B,” 43, and 191.

¹⁷³ “Ledger B,” 48, 49, 265, and 410.

heaviest smaller numbers of animals owned by the WCSGC were also delivered regularly to Cannon at the slaughter yard, presumably to be sold for profit.¹⁷⁴

Public hands used scrip to purchase beef from Cannon's meat market and from a church-owned bakery built by construction workers themselves.¹⁷⁵ Scrip was also used to purchase cheese and butter directly from Anson Winsor on his bimonthly visits to St. George, or from various departments of Zion's Cooperative Mercantile Association and the SUTO where it was also sold to the public and "temple hands." Scrip or "circulating medium" was frequently created by the WCSGC to infuse into the local economy. Giving some idea of the general poverty in southern Utah, and the meagre sizes of scrip values, WCSGC scrip or was issued in "5¢, 10¢, 15¢, 25¢, 50¢" and one dollar denominations.¹⁷⁶ The WCSGC distributed its beef, butter, and cheese at many different outlets and its wares could also be purchased directly at the ranch by travelers, immigrants, miners, and cowboys. Representative of the company's "ledger B" entries, on August 8, 1875, Winsor delivered 239 pounds of cheese to the Southern Utah Tithing Office.¹⁷⁷ In May and June of the same year, 158 3/4 pounds of butter were delivered to the St. George Bakery.¹⁷⁸ The company regularly delivered cattle, cheese and butter to feed the men working in the pineries and temple sawmills on Mt. Trumbull.¹⁷⁹ Similarly, the Pipe Springs tithing office stored and issued oats and other grains for consumption by the oxen used to pull timber to the sawmills or to freight cut lumber from Mt. Trumbull to the St. George. It appears that 1,000 bushels of oats and barley were sent from Richfield to Pipe Springs late in 1874 "for

¹⁷⁴ "Ledger B," 48, 49, and 265.

¹⁷⁵ Verna L. Dewsnup and Katharine M. Larson, *Relief Society Memories: A History of Relief Society in St. George Stake, 1867-1956* (Springville, UT: Art City Publishing Company, 1956), 12.

¹⁷⁶ "Ledger B," 326-328, and 382.

¹⁷⁷ "Ledger B," 48.

¹⁷⁸ "Ledger B," 191.

¹⁷⁹ "Ledger B," 98.

use of teams hauling lumber from Mt Trumbull to [the] St. Geo. Temple.”¹⁸⁰ Pipe Springs also needed to feed the Native American community who continually clustered around Pipe Springs looking for subsistence. With the sacred edifice going up, however, feeding Native Americans was simply not a priority. Throughout Mormondom, and certainly at Winsor Castle, Native Americans were employed and compensated with flour, bread, vegetables, and scraps of beef.

The St. George and Pipe Springs-based WCSGC paid taxes both to Kane and Washington counties, and to Utah Territory, at first ignoring any obligation to Arizona. The prevailing attitude at Pipe Springs seemed to be that “if Arizona wants her taxes, she can come collect them.”¹⁸¹ Instead, the WCSGC paid “County Taxes” to the SUTO in Washington County “for Labor etc on [the] St George & Kanab Road.”¹⁸² In addition to paying “taxes” to both “church and state” for road building, the inhabitants of Pipe Springs also joined with the people of Moccasin, Kanab, Virgin, Rockville, and Toquerville (and the various ranches surrounding them) to improve and repair their desert roads, often putting their time in as “labor tithing.” Simultaneously, they participated in “Kanab Desert” cattle roundups where stockmen from Kanab, Pahreah, Johnson, and the Long Valley settlements joined with the cowboys from the Canaan and Winsor Castle stock cooperatives in community drives. Because of Pipe Springs’ central location, its water, the number of WCSGC and church tithing cattle on the range, and the excellent juniper- and pinion-picketed stockyards Winsor and his cowboys had built, these roundups most often centered at Winsor Castle. Setting a precedent that would continue for over

¹⁸⁰ Memorandums of A. M. Musser to Z. C. M. I., October 12 and 28, 1874.

¹⁸¹ As late as 1891 tax assessors complained that in “the country along the line between Utah and Arizona . . . the cattle men adopt all manner of means of evading the payment of taxes. When a Utah assessor call upon a cattle man, his cattle are all over in Arizona and when the Arizona assessor calls, the cattle are in Utah.” At last Utah and Arizona began to cooperate and gather taxes for one another. See *Provo Daily Enquirer*, 1 April 1891, 4, UDN.

¹⁸² “Ledger B,” 51.

half-a-century, the first common Kanab Desert stock drive centered at Pipe occurred at least as early as October 1874. Cooperative cattle company supervisors like Anson Winsor, James Andrus, and later Charles Pulsipher often organized and took the lead in the biannual communal roundups. Because they occurred in the spring and fall of each year, as did the church's general conference, stockmen often used the timing of the massive ecclesiastical gatherings in Salt Lake City to regulate their cattle drives, the goal being to round up their cattle "before Conference."¹⁸³ Thus, as in all economic undertakings, the church continued to dominate everything in the cattle industry from roundups to roadbuilding.

"Damn old Canaan": The Cattle Companies, the Rape of the Range, and its Legacy

The first years after its founding, the Winsor Castle Stock Growing Company did extremely well, providing strong evidence that Young's cooperative system had the potential to enrich his people. At the urging of their church leaders, a large portion of the Dixie and Kane County communities invested in both the WCSGC and its sister company, the Canaan Cooperative Stock Company (CCSC). They did this by turning their cattle over to the stock companies to be commercially herded on the rich grasslands east of the Hurricane Fault and south of the Vermillion Cliffs. They were credited with "paper stock" on company books for the actual "livestock" they turned in. As the herds reproduced, "stockholders" were credited with "shares" of "the increase" based on their initial investment. For the first eighteen months of its existence, (January 1873 to June 1874) the WCSGC reported a 49% increase on an original capital investment of \$50,000.00. Perhaps because so much stock was skimmed off the top to

¹⁸³ Kanab United Order Records, 1873–1880, especially 1:106.

pay for temple materials and to feed workers in the form of company tithing, the WSCGC only passed on dividends of 40% to its investors, who were nonetheless astounded by such lucrative returns.¹⁸⁴ The next year the company declared a 30% dividend.

It is unclear to what extent Mormons understood the severe environmental impact this growth in number of cattle had on the land. In 1880, government explorer and surveyor Clarence Dutton published graphic description of the ravaged condition of the Pipe Springs' range, noting that "hardly a blade of grass is to be found within ten miles of the spring." Explaining the cause as twofold he continued, as "the climate of the surrounding country has grown more arid" and with "long summer and autumn droughts the grasses perished even to their roots before they had time to seed." These varieties of grasses "reproduce from seed, and whose roots live but three or four years." He described that an excessive number of Mormon-owned cattle ate reproductive grass-seeds along with the plant before they could germinate, even pulling up the roots of the superior native gramma grasses that had given the cooperative companies their initial success. Simultaneously, in wet weather the massive herds trampled delicate desert soils and in many places turned them into impenetrable concrete. Drought destroyed any sprig of gramma which chanced to survive. When it did finally rain, the rich nutrient-bearing gramma grasses were replaced, if at all, by inferior species of nutrient poor grasses and the ubiquitous tumble weeds that roll across the Arizona Strip.¹⁸⁵ The profits of those early years were based on a limited grass resource which the Saints exploited with little thought of conservation or renewal and were never as high as they were in 1873 and 1874. The range's pristine bounty was destroyed forever

¹⁸⁴ The SGMH contradicts itself in giving two different figures for dividends paid out by the WSCGC the first 18 months of its existence. On p. 484 it is listed as 33 1/3% and on p. 503 it is listed as 40%. Either way this was an amazingly high rate of return for a frontier business.

¹⁸⁵ Clarence E. Dutton, Captain of Ordnance, US Army, *Tertiary History of the Grand Cañon District* (Washington: Government Printing Office, 1882), 78–79.

in a few seasons of unrestrained cupidity. But for the Mormons, the pure white-washed walls of the St. George Temple are a lasting legacy. Perhaps it is fitting that in the very heart of this sacred structure, a huge bronze baptismal font sits on the backs of twelve colossal bronzed bovines—latent symbols of the stock that in the course of just a few years transformed the verdure of the Latter-day Saints' Canaan into a hard-crustured waste land.¹⁸⁶ The amazing richness of the Short Creek, Pipe Springs, and Kanab ranges became a casualty of Young's aggressive push to complete the St. George Temple.

WCSGC records demonstrate that most of its shareholders were “small investors,” originally contributing only a few head of cattle each—but there were hundreds of them. Rather than being paid out in scrip, “checks,” or other “circulating medium,” dividends were most often credited on the company's books, and the herds grew larger. Sadly for the future of the Latter-day Saint cooperative system, “big investors” or “large capitalists” who owned many shares in the WCSGC and the Cooperative Cattle Companies (CCC) seized control of the companies and managed things to their own benefit, making them far less profitable for rank and file Latter-day Saints. In the end, despite all Young's talk of Union, Order, and “shared wealth,” the tremendous cost of the temple itself, and the capitalists, gobbled up the profits of the cooperative system almost as fast as the cattle destroyed the lushness of the range. Many rank and file Latter-day Saints began to realize that Young's cooperative system, which was supposed to enrich them all on an equal basis, was severely tilted in favor of those with means. Priesthood position and economic opportunity went hand in hand as positions of authority in the church and its business organizations usually went to those with more property than the rank and file. Their wealth

¹⁸⁶ For a revisionist interpretation of the environmental legacy of the frontier, see Patricia Nelson Limerick, *Legacy of Conquest: The Unbroken Past of the American West* (New York City: W. W. Norton & Company, 1987).

quickly increased from the economic opportunities their positions proffered. While enthusiastically touting from the pulpit the scriptural promises that cooperation and the UO in Zion would have a dramatic leveling effect in that “the poor would be exalted while the rich were made low,” these very “church capitalists,” whether they fully understood it or not, were foisting themselves up on the backs of the poor.¹⁸⁷ The stated purpose of the whole Mormon system was to “build up the Kingdom of God on Earth” and enrich all Latter-day Saints in the process. The rich in Young’s communal system were not “made low” as Smith’s revelations had promised. As in the chaotic capitalism most Mormons sought to escape, in their unified and orderly world the rich still got richer, while the poor, as the Savior had prophesied, remained eternally poor.¹⁸⁸ Representative of hosts of his coreligionists, faithful Mosiah Hancock confided in his autobiography his frustration with how the Mormon economy seemed to enrich the church’s leaders. Of his years in southern Utah he recounted how he “struggled with [the] poverty of the country and worked like a slave” and “fared hard,” and when he finally acquired a small farm, “the dignitaries” took a portion “because of what they call authority.” He complained that “the dignitaries of a certain part of the country built their own places at the expense of [the] more honest [Saints] around them.”¹⁸⁹ Latter-day Saints were taught by Brigham Young and other dignitaries that how church funds were used was “none of their business.”¹⁹⁰ While

¹⁸⁷ In a revelation to Joseph Smith concerning the United Order, the Lord told His church, “this is the way that I, the Lord, have decreed to provide for my saints, that the poor shall be exalted, in that the rich are made low.” See *History of the Church*, 2:54–60; and Doctrine and Covenants, 104:16, and heading.

¹⁸⁸ Benjamin G. Ferris, *Utah and the Mormons: The History, Government, Doctrines, Customs, and Prospects of the Latter-day Saints, from Personal Observation during a Six Months’ Residence at Great Salt Lake City*, by Benjamin G. Ferris, *Late Secretary of Utah Territory* (New York: Harper & Brothers, 1854), especially 179, and 196–200. Critical gentiles eagerly pointed out these inequalities including Territorial Secretary Benjamin G. Ferris who stated the “experiment totally failed, because the smaller ones fell a prey to the ferocity of the larger.” As far as Secretary Ferris was concerned, the whole “machinery” of the church was driven by “knaves” whose purpose was “the complete stripping of the Latter-day dupe of nearly all his available means.”

¹⁸⁹ Mosiah L. Hancock, “Autobiography of Mosiah Lyman Hancock,” NMS.

¹⁹⁰ Characteristic of similar statements made throughout his lifetime, in 1853 Young told his people: “The doctrine of brother Joseph is, that not one dollar you possess is your own; and if the Lord wants it to use, let it go, and it is

donating his team and his time to haul rock for the St. George Temple, Hancock saw that a certain dignitary's hogs were fed better than the men donating their services to the building of the sacred edifice. Speaking for himself and his class, he recorded that "Honest hard working men would have been glad to have recovered the bread from the hog's trough" and eaten it themselves.¹⁹¹

Anthony W. Ivins, who became one of southern Utah's wealthiest cattlemen and eventually elevated to the First Presidency, described how cattle company big shots wrestled cattle from the hands of hungry Mormon families to fill their own pockets. As the CCC were organized, "Tone" Ivins was not yet a grown man. He described how through hard work and careful management he scraped together a few head of cattle that he put into his father's small herd. While Tone was in Salt Lake City with his father, Israel Ivins, the latter's plural wife obediently followed "counsel" from church leaders to sign away the family herd into the CCC. Tone complained that neither he nor his father were consulted and their entire "brand" went to the CCC. Though they had stock "on paper," they could do little with it. "This was the end of my [first] small investment in livestock," Tone later remembered bitterly. At first, "the Canaan herd prospered," he remembered, "the cattle rapidly increased and the price of beef brought money into the treasury which made the stock valuable [on paper]." But big investors naturally controlled the board of directors, and managed the huge herds to their own advantage. When CCC and the WCSGC profits began to fail, Erastus Snow and other big investors presided over a CCC takeover of the Pipe Springs-based company to prop up the Canaan Cattle Company. In the

none of your business what He does with it. . . . No man need judge me. You know nothing about it, whether I am sent [of God] or not; furthermore, it is none of your business, only to listen with open ears to what is taught you, and serve God with an undivided heart." *JD*, 1:340–341.

¹⁹¹ Mosiah Hancock, "Autobiography."

process power and wealth flowed from the small investors to the larger investors. Careful not to name many names or to complain too vociferously, Tone Ivins explained that Brigham Young had sold his failing Washington Cotton Factory to the Saints in Dixie. (Other sources make it clear that he pushed the factory off on the Dixie Saints because it was no longer profitable *for him*. Erastus Snow and nearly everyone else in Dixie was unhappy about their forced “purchase.”) Since the factory cost more to run than the income it produced, Erastus Snow and other leading St. George capitalists merged the cotton concern with the CCC so that Canaan’s wealth could bail out the factory.¹⁹² Among those who profited substantially from such moves were Captain James Andrus, Apostle Erastus Snow and his sons-in-law, Edwin D. Woolley, Jr., and Daniel Seegmiller, who are all connected to Winsor Castle.

Indian Baptisms: “Surely the Lord is Working Upon the Hearts of the Red Men.”

The consumption of range grasses by Mormon cattle devastated local natives, especially the Paiute, for whom grass seed had always been a primary staple. More and more the Paiute clustered around the settlements and ranching centers as food begged from the Mormons increasingly became their primary staple. Like all of Utah’s Native Americans, they complained

¹⁹² Anthony W. Ivins, Notebook “No. 4,” AWIP, b7, f9; and Henry Eyring, Sec’y Canaan Co-op Stock Co., St. George, to Bp. James G. Bleak, St. George, December 11, 1880, JTPP. Umpstead Rencher, Jr., of Grass Valley, a wealthy southern plantation owner who “had held a large interest in the Canaan Herd,” but lost it when the cotton factory tanked and he and others were left holding the bag. Apparently, Brigham Young had censured Rencher for not donating enough toward the construction of the St. George Temple. Piqued, the southern Utah capitalist retorted “When another man puts his hand in my pocket and thinks he can tell me what to do, he’ll find that he is mistaken.” A growing breach between Rencher and his prophet gave his brethren license to rob him by not warning him to transfer his stock out of the Washington Cotton Factory within the thirty day deadline. Tone Ivins bitterly remembered that through this and other shady dealings “the Canaan ranch & cattle finally passed into the hands of speculators [i.e. big investors, and that] the cattle and ranch were [eventually] sold, and the [Canaan Cattle Company] as a corporation ceased to exist.” Umpstead Rencher abruptly left Utah and the church and returned to Texas. Life Sketches of Umpstead Rencher, Jr., and Elizabeth Philpott,” JAP; *Deseret News* 1875, October 13, 1875, UDN, 10; *Salt Lake Tribune*, December 31, 1899, 14, and January 1, 1900, 15, UDN.

with good reason that they were ignored by the government Indian agents. Mormons close to them, like Dimick B. Huntington and Andrew S. Gibbons, corroborated “the enormities” of the graft of the government agents hired to feed the scattered bands. Captain Fenton was commissioned to feed the Southern Paiute in eastern Nevada, southwestern Utah, and northwestern Arizona and acknowledged himself that “his Indians” received nothing from the federal government. Paiute informed Mormons that Agent Fenton exploited their hunger by hiring some of their young men to steal Latter-day Saint-owned stock which the agent then sold to meat markets in Nevada mining towns.¹⁹³ In a December 1872 interview with Thomas Kane, the Pahvant chief Kanosh summed up that “I ain’t eaten none of Grant’s potatoes nor flour: all the gifts I had have been from the Bishops here: flour and beef. . . . One snow time since I got blankets: no flour, no beef but a little last spring: no flour, no wheat: no oats: no corn: no bullets.” The natives were fully aware of the bad blood between President Grant and the Mormons and experience had shown them that the Mormon tithing system would at least give them *something*. Bishops, missionaries, and rank and file Latter-day Saints exploited the situation by representing the government to the Native Americans in its worst light. Mormons often told them that the government hated Native Americans and Mormons and wanted to exterminate both. The Pahvant Chief Kanosh innocently asked Thomas Kane, “[I] hear Grant doesn’t like *me*, and wants to . . . cut Brigham’s throat, is it so?” Kanosh told Kane: I “understand Grant’s mad because Brigham’s got five wives: Indians got two.” Kanosh stated that only fifty-eight members of his band were still living. “It is death by disease, not battle. ‘All

¹⁹³ Elizabeth Kane, “Notes of Kanosh’s Interview with [Thomas L. Kane], Taken at Filmore [*sic*], December 17, 1872,” TKP, r23, b32; Elizabeth Kane, “Account given by Dimick B. Huntington,” TKP, r23, b32, f15; and James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:108.

sick‘ he said ‘no shoot.’” Kanosh had fathered ten children, “six boys and four girls” but “all are dead now, dying as they reached eleven or twelve years of age.”¹⁹⁴

Feeding hungry Native Americans was an ongoing part of life at Pipe Springs. If Native Americans were not fed, they simply helped themselves to Winsor Castle and Canaan Ranch stock or pilfered Toquerville, Moccasin, and Kanab wheat, corn, potatoes, and melons. Bishops, including “Bishop Winsor,” constantly doled out very limited amounts of food to the Native Americans and worked with their leaders to try to influence tribesmen to stop petty thefts. In August 1875 for example, Kanab’s Bishop Stewart and missionary John Oakley “had a talk with Frank, the Indian Chief [of Kanab,]: subject stealing [of] Wheat & Potatoes.” Frank argued “he could not control some of his people, no more then [*sic*] the Bp. Could his.” He acknowledged that the natives had “no cow herd” of their own, and until they did there was bound to be “much destruction” of Mormon property.¹⁹⁵ Therefore, occasional beeves, wheat, flour, potatoes, and other vegetables were of necessity tendered to hungry Native Americans—but it was never enough. Bishop Winsor’s son remembered that on one occasion in 1873 or 1874, fifty Navajo visited the Castle. His father killed a steer and his older brothers “went to Moccasin and brought back a double wagon box full of corn.” The Navajo “cleaned up the corn and beef,” and Frank recounted that “Next morning when I looked out to where the beef had hung the night before, I saw nothing but a skeleton. The bones had been stripped bare and left hanging there.”¹⁹⁶

The destruction of native seed crops of hundreds of thousands of acres of natural grasslands that the Native Americans had lived off for generations throughout Mormon

¹⁹⁴ Elizabeth Kane, “Notes of Kanosh’s interview.” Kanosh said, “this land we all live on is the home of me and my men: the houses and improvements Merrikins have made. . . . is the land the Mormons’ the Pi-utes, the Navajoes’ [or] the Spanish’s?” “No,” he said, answering his own question, “[it’s] God’s.”

¹⁹⁵ John Oakley, Kanab, Kane Co., to Prest B. Young, August 1, 1875, BYP.

¹⁹⁶ Joseph Winsor, “Life.”

settlements was turning Native peoples into wards of the church by the hundreds. Coinciding precisely with the wholesale destruction of the ranges, from 1874 to 1878 there was a dramatic upsurge in Native American baptisms into the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, as starving natives all over Utah and her bordering states and territories suddenly professed a marked and growing interest in the religion of the conquerors of their land. This phenomenon had begun as a trickle some time before, and had something to do with the rise of the Ghost Dance Religion, a syncretistic movement which mixed parts of Mormonism and mainstream Christianity with various aspects of indigenous belief.¹⁹⁷ But by the spring of 1874 the catastrophe brought to Native Americans by Mormon settlement created the need for religious strength (and for food) in destitute indigenous communities. Native American names in the records of the St. George stake provide minimal documentation of the communities who once lived in the southern Utah-northern Arizona region. Male converts include Tah-pahn-wah, Kwantah-rah, Tah-Khab, and Sah-nah-poots, females include Mah-roo-witz, Tah-yah-gwib, Tzum-gah-rumb, and Kaw-yoo, and children include Daragoonah Gatz, Pam-poo-nee, Mo-pats and Pe-nakits.¹⁹⁸ The unusual phenomenon of hundreds of Native Americans seeking baptism continued through 1875. Chief Pokotello and his entire band of Shoshones came from Idaho to Salt Lake City to be baptized, while Chief Alma “with twenty-two of his people from the Salmon River country came down and were baptized into the Church.” The latter prophesied “that there would be hundreds and thousands of the Indians come into the Church,” and his prophesy was soon fulfilled. During the spring and summer of 1875, Elder George Washington Hill baptized three hundred, “mostly of the Shoshone, Bannock, and Pah Ute tribes,” who came “forward and

¹⁹⁷ For a discussion of the rise of the Ghost Dance Religion in Nevada and Utah, see John Peterson, *Utah's Black Hawk War*, 360–368.

¹⁹⁸ SGMH, 548–553.

demanded to be baptized.” In June, Apostle Orson Pratt “baptized fifty-two and blessed nine papooses down at Mount Pleasant,” and in July “eighty-five of Kanosh’s band” entered the waters of baptism.¹⁹⁹

Learning through informants that hundreds of Native Americans had been baptized, the national press reported that the Native Americans had been promised that if they would “come into the Mormon camp, be baptized, etc., (washed and greased, as the Indians term it) that the old and infirm would become young, and that the young would not grow old; that to be clothed in their garments, gentile bullets would not penetrate them, etc.; that by retaining possession of the ground then occupied, the eradication of [the gentiles] was only a question of time.”²⁰⁰ Eastern papers thundered that the strange religious movement in the West was obviously “planned by the Mormon priesthood, who publicly proclaim that the Native Americans are the lost tribes of Israel” to gather forces of the “religiously sworn to go forth as the battle-axes of the Lord God of the Mormons.”²⁰¹ Wells and Woodruff understood the political ramifications of these rumors inspired by initiating Native Americans into the controversial and secret endowment ritual and which forced Brigham Young to immediately suspended “the giving of endowments to the Lamanites.”²⁰² On February 9, Young wrote a letter instructing bishops and Saints of St. George ward to furnish the new converts with “land and implements and patient considerate instruction

¹⁹⁹ Geo. W. Hill, Camp on Bear River, to President Young, July 16, 1875, BYP; *Deseret News*, July 14, 1875, 10, UDN; *Deseret Evening News*, July 22, 1875, 3, CHL; and related items quoted in *Conference Reports of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints*, October 1947: 17. “Hill reported that his Indians “declare[d] their intention to wander about no more, but to lead industrious lives, at peace with all their fellow creatures, refraining from stealing and from all manner of bad practices, and [to] abide by the conditions of their baptism, which are that they shall cease every species of wrongdoing.” He therefore established “a colony” for them in Malad Valley, in Idaho Territory.”

²⁰⁰ See for example, *Chicago Inter Ocean*, August 27, 1875, 3, NCN.

²⁰¹ See for example *Georgia Weekly Telegraph and Georgia Journal & Messenger*, (Macon, Georgia), June 25, 1878, NCN.

²⁰² Brigham Young, President’s Office, Salt Lake City, to Elder Dimick B. Huntington, May 18, 1875, SCA, dvd 1: 25, MS2736, b13, f5, italics mine.

where needed; and [to] use them in such other labors, [in addition to] farming, as may be advantageous to them and to us.” Young was convinced “the good spirit of the Lord [was] working upon them, prompting them to improve their mode of life, and causing them to turn to the saints and seek instruction in the Gospel.” In harmony with *Book of Mormon* teachings concerning the Lamanites, he urged the Saints: “In all your labors and associations with them, seek to raise them [from] their condition; let one and all act as missionaries to bring about the time when they may be called a white and delightsome people in fulfilment [*sic*] of the promise made to their fathers.”²⁰³ In mid-March 1875, virtually the entire Shivwits band came into St. George and “demanded baptism.”²⁰⁴ Nearly a century later, the descendants of these Native Americans spoke of how the Mormon would periodically “come through and baptize [their forefathers] and give them shirts.” Admitting that baptism was simply the price their ancestors paid to be fed and clothed by the whites, they remembered that when the shirts wore out, “they wanted to be baptized agin.”²⁰⁵

Captain Frank’s Kaibabits were not baptized until July 5, 1876. It seems that at least part of the reason for their delay had to do with the establishment of the UO. Young mandated the Saints live the UO, but allowed each community to democratically determine *how* they would do

²⁰³ Brigham Young, Geo. A. Smith, and Erastus Snow, St. George, to the Bishops and Saints of the St. George Ward, February 9, 1875, and related text in SGSMH, 545–546. Again he wrote, “In talking of being baptized the Indians have expressed a repugnance of being baptized in water that is not clear; this expression of their feeling we consider very proper and suggest that a suitable place for baptism be prepared in St. George to be supplied with water from the springs which flow into the city. The bishops and the brethren should consider themselves on a mission to the Lamanites and should feel blessed in having the privilege to labor in this important matter in their own neighborhood.”

²⁰⁴ SGMH, 547–554; James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:394–397; JH, March 5, 1875, 2, March 6, 1875, 4, and March 21, 1875, 1; Edward Hunter Snow, “Autobiography of E. H. Snow 1931,” 3, in Juanita Brooks Papers, USHS, Mss B 103, b18, F11; “Southern Utah—Baptism of Qui-Tuss, Chief of the Shebit Tribe of Indians, together with One Hundred and Thirty of the Same Tribe, at St. George—Photographed by C. R. Savage,” and “Reception of Indians into the Mormon Church by Baptism,” in *Frank Leslie’s Illustrated Newspaper*, May 22, 1875, [n.p.], 169–171, CHL, Nq M234.632 R 295 1875; and Charles Walker, *Diary*, 1:402–405.

²⁰⁵ Interview of Margaret Cox Heaton by Kay S. Fowler, July 14, 1967, 28, Doris Duke American Indian History Project, Western History Center, UU.

so. In Kanab two very different approaches to living the UO centered around two strong personalities, Bishop Levi Stewart and John R. Young. Each felt he had a mandate from the president of the Church to personally organize and preside over the Order. As a result of disagreements between them, instead of their being one “United” Order in Kanab, there were two competing factions bogged down in an unhappy state of schism and disorder. This ecclesiastical discord impacted the region’s Native Americans who simply did not know which Mormon to follow. When Brigham Young took the matter in hand, he stripped Stewart of the Kanab bishopric and cashiered John R. Young as head of the Kanab UO. He replaced them both, calling a strong outside leader, L. John Nuttall, as bishop *and* head of the Order.²⁰⁶ Nuttall arrived in Kanab with orders to bring peace to the struggling community and things turned around almost immediately.²⁰⁷ Once the infighting factions among the Whites made peace, Captain Frank and his Kaibabite were baptized. Bishop Nuttall himself baptized Frank Chuarumpeak, whose Indian name was now listed as So-rum-pah. Jacob Hamblin baptized Frank So-rum-pah’s wife Ah-wants. In all, forty-one males and thirty-nine females of the Kaibab band were baptized July 5, 1876. The list of names gives us the best view we have of the size of the Kaibab Band of Paiute in the mid-1870s. Among those baptized were subchief Chug, Ti-gar-ump (Jack), Qui-went (Jim), We-cheets (little Jack), Un-ca-hutes (Bush head), and Ta-co-tah (Humpy).²⁰⁸

During 1876 a number of Hopi visited Kanab and also received baptism of Bishop Nuttall.²⁰⁹ All the while Indian Agent Dimmick Huntington was kept busy in Salt Lake City

²⁰⁶ Kanab Ward General Minutes, CHL, especially 28–29; and Kanab United Order Records, 1873–1880, CHL.

²⁰⁷ By April 1876 “through the exertions of . . . Bishop, L. John Nuttall, the United Order [was] running along smoothly,” and “almost every family” in Kanab was connected with it. JH, April 5, 1876, 3.

²⁰⁸ “Baptism of Lamanites at Kanab,” July 5, 187[6], L. John Nuttall Papers, CHL, ms 1269, r6, b7, f9.

²⁰⁹ JH, April 5, 1876, 3.

baptizing the Native Americans that came to his door for food. The first week in June 1875, Huntington wrote that he had “more or less to convert every week.” At the same time he reported that Brigham Young estimated that 2,000 Native Americans had been “baptized already & not one apostatized yet.” So many were coming that Huntington feared that “I would have to convert from morning until night & it would take years to do it.”²¹⁰ “Huntington reported that during this period many Indians seemed “to be willing to go anywhere we desire and perform any kind of labor.”²¹¹ It seems that only the Navajo resisted “the spirits” telling them to join the Mormon Church.²¹² This had at least something to do with the killing of three young Navajo on a trading visit to the Mormons in central Utah’s Grass Valley early in 1874 by a group of gentiles.²¹³ Preparing for an intense renewal of Navajo hostilities, Brigham Young directed that another fort be built along the Navajo trail into “Mormoney hogande.” This one was a “34 x 30 ft” rock structure build on a cliff overlooking Lees Ferry. Hamblin took an embassy of Navajo to the site of the Grass Valley Murders to learn for themselves that it was “Gentiles and not Mormons” that had killed their traders. Notwithstanding this success, for several years, the Grass Valley affair threatened to destroy not only Hamblin’s influence with the Diné, but also any goodwill the Navajo might have had toward Brigham Young and his people. As a result, the Navajo were the

²¹⁰ Dimick B. Huntington, Salt Lake City, to Brother Joseph F. [Smith], June 6, 1875, Joseph F. Smith Papers, CHL, SCA, Dvd 1: 27, b11, f10.

²¹¹ Brigham Young, Jr., Logan, to Prest. Brigham Young, June 25, 1874, BYP; and D. B. Huntington, Salt Lake City, to President Young, August 6, 1875, BYP.

²¹² All along Jacob Hamblin had reported that the Navajo, like other Native Americans in the region, had “some religious notion that has impelled them to seek intercourse with the Mormons.” See Elizabeth Kane, “St. George Accounts,” 5, TKP, b32, f9.

²¹³ Geo. W. Bean, Prattville, Sevier Co., U. T. to Prest. B. Young, June 20, 1874, BYP; According to Latter-day Saint accounts, a group of gentiles led by a Mr. McCarty had settled “lower Grass Valley” and promised to “shoot every Indian that came in their reach.” When four Navajo traders helped themselves to McCarty’s stock the gentiles made good on their promise. The one survivor reported that Mormons had done the killing, breaking the Mormon-Navajo treaty negotiated by Jacob Hamblin in 1871. For months the tribe threatened that if the Saints did not give them “two hundred head of Horses and one hundred head of cattle” to pay for the loss of their sons they would “Kill the Brethren over the River and never cease raiding on our settlements untill they are satisfied.”

grand exception among the Mormon's Native American neighbors and few participated in the great native religious movement of the mid-1870s.²¹⁴ While Jacob Hamblin succeeded in baptizing a handful of former Navajo raiders in 1875, Kanab missionary John Oakley wrote that “probably near 100” Navajo and “Oribes” had crossed the river and approached the Mormon settlements, not seeking religion—but horses. “They have horse on the brain,” Oakley told Brigham Young, and “not much manifestation yet for a desire for our principles.”²¹⁵

Within days of the St. George baptism of the Shivwits band of Paiute in February and March of 1875, papers throughout the United States announced it to the nation.²¹⁶ The *Salt Lake Tribune* described that the Sheebits had established a camp between St. George and Washington and were “awaiting orders from Brigham.” Fearing something sinister, the *Tribune* further alleged that “these red devils are enticed off their reservations by Mormon missionaries sent among them by Brigham Young, and their minds poisoned against the Gentiles and the Government.”²¹⁷ The *Pittsburg Leader* wondered “whether our religious people of this vicinity will be more inclined to rejoice or to mourn over this Mormon conversion of Indians. . . . We suspect there are many Christians who would think that it were better for the Indians to remain as they are than to be converted [*sic*] to the—— gospel as it is in Joseph Smith.”²¹⁸ A letter to the editors of the *Salt Lake Tribune* from Beaver, Utah, suggested the rash of baptisms was all part of a plot designed by Brigham Young to “drive out” gentiles. The letter declared that Young’s missionaries intended to teach the natives “disloyalty and encourage them in their hatred against

²¹⁴ Bean, Prattville, Sevier Co., U. T. to Prest. B. Young, June 20, 1874, BYP; See “Purport of Express from Mohencopy [*sic*] Via Kanab which was telegraphed to Prest B Young Ap[ri]l 18th [1874],” and “Historian Notes Augt 23d 1874 to Sept 27 [18]74,” both in St. George Utah Stake, General Minutes, vol. 3, CHL;

²¹⁵ John Oakley, Kanab, to Prest. B. Young, August 1, 1875, BYP.

²¹⁶ For examples see *New York Herald*, March 21, 1875, 11, GBC; *Springfield Republican* (MA), March 22, 1875, 5, GBC; and *Alexandria Gazette* (Alexandria, VA), March 22, 1875, 2, GBC;

²¹⁷ *Salt Lake Tribune*, May 1, 1875, 1, GBC.

²¹⁸ *Pittsburg Leader*, March 22, 1875, as quoted in *Deseret News*, April 31, 1875, 3 UDN.

the Gentiles and the General Government” so as to use them militarily against the United States.²¹⁹ The Prescott *Arizona Weekly Miner* wrote that the church was “accused” of baptizing and admitting “into the Order scores of Indians” as a means of tackling “their Gentile enemies.” The Mormons “are all the time emigrating southward,” it speculated, “with the view, we think, of ‘gobbling’ Arizona and making friends and neighbors in Mexico, in which country Brigham sees plenty of ‘raw material’ to aid him in a fight with the Government.” The *Miner* feared that Young planned to use Native Americans against the United States and urged the government to “keep its weather eye in this direction.”²²⁰

In 1875 there was again talk of using the military to stop Mormon “meddling with the Indians.” In fact, Utah Territorial Governor George W. Emery made repeated calls for troops to quash Native Americans answering “the purpose of their blasphemous baptism” by participating in “plots” to “clean out” the gentiles from Utah, “*a la* Mountain Meadows.” In August 1875, the War Department sent US troops from Fort Douglas to Box Elder County, Utah, and from Fort Cameron to Spring Valley, Utah, to break up native religious gatherings presided over by Mormons. Governor Lewis R. Bradley of Nevada called on General John M. Schofield, commander of the Military Division of the Pacific, headquartered in San Francisco, to mobilize troops because “Injins are tearing around like mad in the wilds of Nevada” inspired by “Mormon Machinations.” The *San Francisco Chronicle* reported that many of these Nevada bands “went to Deer[p] Creek, so the General was told, and were baptized by the Mormons. The Indians said the Mormons had promised them that with water ‘fixing’ they (the Indians) would be ‘made all [the] same [as] white men.’ In conclusion the General stated there were rumors that the Indians had

²¹⁹ *Salt Lake Tribune*, May 1, 1875, 3, GBC.

²²⁰ Prescott *Arizona Weekly Miner*, August 7, 1874, NCUSN, FHL.

been encouraged by the Mormons to begin warfare upon the Gentile settlers.” Reacting to these rumors, over a hundred armed miners at Pioche and Cherry Valley, Nevada, sought permission from Governor Bradley and General Schofield to “march against the Indians.” At last Schofield himself actually took to the field with troops, driving the Native Americans into even closer strategic relations with their Latter-day Saint teachers.²²¹ Brigham Young explained his interracial proselytizing policy in a private letter to one of his eastern agents, explicitly pointing out that if the “Methodists, the Baptists, the Catholics, or any other denomination had converted a few hundreds, poor, degraded Native Americans; had gathered them together, and were teaching them the arts of peace and civilization. How the Churches would have extolled their efforts, how their successes would have been heralded throughout Christendom.” He decried the threat of military intervention in his righteous cause, exclaiming “I am at a loss to know what warrant such, find in the Constitution, or laws of our country by which they could prevent us proclaiming to the ignorant the powers of the Gospel of Christ, and from baptizing them when they believed our words.”²²²

Once Native peoples were baptized, Brigham Young felt an even greater responsibility to provide for their temporal needs—despite the tremendous drain of resources needed for building temples. Doing what he could to protect precious tithing funds, he directed priesthood leaders to furnish the new indigenous converts with land, implements, and careful instruction so that they could “settle down” and learn to care for themselves. Three hundred acres were set apart for Shoshone, a sizable Indian farm was set aside at Ibapah, and 120 acres in Skull Valley for

²²¹ St. Louis *Globe-Democrat*, August 11, 1875, UCUSN, FHL; Milwaukee *Daily Sentinel*, September 4, 1875, 3, NCUSN, FHL; Chicago *Inter Ocean*, August 19, 1875, 2, and August 27, 1875, 3, NCUSN, FHL.

²²² Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, to W. C. Staines, Esq., New York, August 27, 1875, CHL, SC, dvd vol 1:25, ms2736, b15, fl.

Goshute. Kanosh's people settled down on even less land in the Pahvant Valley, while "32 lodges of Indians interested in the farming" were promised land in Grass Valley once the government had surveyed it.²²³ It appears the further south the Native Americans lived the less land they were given. The Shivwits, now joined by the remnants of the disintegrated St. George and Santa Clara Tonoquint bands as well as a few surviving Uinkaret were originally provided with only ten acres in the St. George region.²²⁴ In Kanab, Frank's people fared little better, as even before their baptism Bishop Stewart provided them with "some fifteen acres of good land" near Kanab, which they were required to fence themselves in order to keep Mormon-owned livestock off their little farms. Jacob Hamblin furnished the Kaibabit "1000 pounds of corn to feed them while they [were] fencing." Sadly for the Kaibabit, much of this supply Hamblin provided was commandeered by Mormons who felt oxen hauling lumber to the Temple from Mt. Trumbull took priority over then needs of Native Americans who were learning to farm. But it appears from at least March 1875 this small plot would be their main farming claim until church leaders would "furnish" them more permanent lands near Moccasin in 1882.²²⁵

For believers in *Book of Mormon's* promises regarding the destiny of the descendants of the Lamanites, this was a glorious time in Dixie. Indeed, it seemed to St. George Mormons that the Lord appeared to be pouring out a multitude of blessings on his people. On March 5, 1875, "the last stone" was laid on the temple and on March 16 "the welcome tidings" arrived by telegram "that the unjust and oppressive judge, James B. McKean, had been removed from his office as Judge of the Supreme Court of Utah and of the 3rd Judicial District."

²²³ Geo. W. Bean, Provo City, to President B Young, August 20, 1874, BYP.

²²⁴ Isabel T. Kelly and Catherine S. Fowler, "Southern Paiute," 389.

²²⁵ Jacob Hamblin and John Oakley, Kanab Kane Co, U. T. to Prest. Brigham Young, March 14, 1875, BYP.

Chapter 11

Pipe Springs and the Cattle Cooperatives

By the first week in October 1875 the political climate had changed sufficiently that while on a tour of Utah, Ulysses S. Grant met with Brigham Young. The first time that a sitting US president had visited Utah, Grant spent parts of two days visiting federal officials, as well as Gentile leaders and church leaders. According to the *Salt Lake Tribune* the visit was made on the spur of the moment when Utah Territorial Governor Emery invited the president, who was already as far west as St. Louis, to come further “to look in and see this troublous portion of his dominions.”¹ Grant assured wary Mormons that his visit was “strictly a social and sight-seeing one, and was not in the least of an official character.”² Young and other church leaders travelled by train to meet Grant in Ogden and escort him back to Salt Lake City. Apostle Woodruff journalized that when Grant’s special train arrived in Ogden, the church’s “Utah Central Engine hitched onto Preside[n]t Grants Cars [and] at this point Preside[n]t Brigham Young was introduced to President U S. Grant, One the Preside[n]t of the Kingdom of God on the Earth & a law giver unto Israel in this last dispensation and fullness of times & the other the Presid[en]t of the United States and of this Great Nation.”³ Young was invited into Grant’s “special” Pullman and had the opportunity to speak with the president’s wife, Julia Dent Grant. After determining that the title of “General” suited him best, General Young and Mrs. Grant had a short but honest

¹ JH, October 2, 1875, 1, and October 4, 1875, 1–6; and *Salt Lake Tribune*, October 2, 1875, 2, and October 5, 1875, 4, UDN.

² JH, October 4, 1875, 4.

³ Woodruff, *Journal*, 7: 247.

conversation about polygamy, where the First Lady expressed her respect and admiration for the “endurance, perseverance, and faith” of the people of Utah, but firmly told the church president that both she and the nation entertained “one [serious] objection to your people, [and] to you[,] General.” Young answered “with a slight dash of impatience, ‘Well, and without that we would not have the population we have.’” Rising with indignation she stated that polygamy “would have been wiped out long ago by the strong arm of the government except through charity for the young and innocent that would necessarily suffer.” Lucky for Young, a staff officer summoned him to join President Grant in the observation car.⁴ When the presidential entourage reached Salt Lake City and disembarked, Young shook Grant’s hand, saying, “President Grant[,] this [is] the first time that I ever had the pleasure of seeing a Preside[n]t of the United States and of shaking hands with him.”⁵

Despite Grant’s claims that the trip was “unofficial” he visited with gentile leaders, including the governor and members of the Salt Lake Ring, and took special pains to visit the military officers at Camp Douglas. He went out of his way to ride to the top of the hill overlooking the city “where he could have a view of the City.”⁶ Today called “Capitol Hill” because the modern Capitol Building of the State of Utah now stands there, the steep incline was then called “Arsenal Hill” after the old Nauvoo Legion depot that then graced the site. The Old Arsenal had raised suspicion for years. Despite the fact that the federal government ostensibly had taken control of the Nauvoo Legion’s heavy weapons, anti-Mormons continued “to whisper” as they always had, that the old Nauvoo Legion Arsenal contained “cannon, mortars, and other

⁴ Woodruff, *Journal*, 7: 247–248; and Julia Dent Grant, *The Personal Memoirs of Julia Dent Grant (Mrs. Ulysses S. Grant)*, ed. John Y. Simon, (New York: Putnam, 1975), 184–185.

⁵ Woodruff, *Journal*, 7:248.

⁶ Woodruff, *Journal*, 7:248.

large-scaled implements of destruction, prepared, of course, for treasonable purposes.”⁷ Part of the Old Arsenal had burned to the ground in October 1870⁸ and by 1875 apparently no heavy weapons were stored there. Rather, its four large stone and cement warehouses (called “magazines,”) stored a gargantuan stash of “forty tons” of “commercial” gunpowder. Though now ostensibly owned by private companies, few doubted that the church would reclaim the Arsenal and its contents if war ever broke out between the Church and the Nation. Though outwardly no longer under Young’s control, the Arsenal was still a huge and tangible symbol of the Prophet’s military power. While visiting “Arsenal Hill” that day, it is likely Grant saw this as an opportunity to examine the well stocked depot, learn of its contents, and most importantly, to inquire into the governor’s plan to control it in a time of trouble. Interestingly, on 5 April 1876, just six months to the day after Grant visited “Arsenal Hill,” the four stone and cement magazines stuffed with 80,000 pounds of powder mysteriously exploded, shaking “the whole City to its foundations.” Local newspaper headlines announced that the explosion was “Salt Lake’s Fiercest and Most Terrible Disaster.” Woodruff wrote that a series of tremendous blasts “done tens of thousands of Dollars of Damage in glass alone” throughout the city. The fact that there were “ownly four persons killed” as “Rock, Cobble, Iron & Concrete” rained down upon a city “with a population of 20,000” was a miracle to Wilford Woodruff.⁹ (For Brigham Young’s description of the explosion, see appendix)

⁷ Richard Burton, *City of the Saints*, 354.

⁸ Andrew Jenson, comp. *Church Chronology: A Record of Important Events Pertaining to the History of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints*, 2d ed., rev. and enl., (Salt Lake: Deseret News, 1914), 84.

⁹ JH, April 5, 1876, 1–3, and April 6, 1876, 6–8; Woodruff, *Journal*, 7: 248, 269–270; DN, 12 April 1876, 1, UDN; and Mel Baysore, “The Arsenal Hill Explosion,” 255. “I do not know of one house in the City that Entirely escaped damage,” he wrote, describing the spectacle of “four building[s] made of Rock, Cobble, Iron & Concrete” being “blown high into the air & scattered over the City for a circuit of more than a mile.”

While President Grant visited Arsenal Hill, George Q. Cannon took Mrs. Grant, her son Colonel Fred Grant, the latter's wife, and a few others on a tour of the nearby Salt Lake Tabernacle. While the famous Tabernacle Organ played, Mrs. Grant bowed her head and prayed for the people of Utah. This sign of good will was not wasted on the Latter-day Saints. Shortly thereafter, President Grant's entourage was on its way back to Ogden and the transcontinental Railroad line. While in Salt Lake their Pullman was so richly decorated with flowers that the Grants occupied Brigham Young's car on their ride back to Ogden. Julia Grant "enjoyed herself in Occupying Preside[n]t Youngs Chair" and in talking with "the Utah Sisters." George Q. Cannon reported that President Grant's son was also very cordial. As they parted he signaled a thaw in relations to Utah's delegate to Congress by pleasantly and sincerely offering: "If there is any thing I Can do for you let me know." He reassured Cannon that having seen the Mormon capital for himself, he certainly did not "believe *all* that is Said about the people of Utah."¹⁰

Powell Expedition Returns & Fred Dellenbaugh's Impressions of the Fortress and its Host

In 1875 Frederick Dellenbaugh returned to Kanab country to sketch various geological features that had been missed or inadequately documented on earlier visits. As during his 1871-1873 tours, Dellenbaugh kept a detailed journal and sent letters to at least one eastern newspaper as a "Western Correspondent" using the Paiute pseudonym "Untokarowitz." Dellenbaugh and a small team of associates again used Pipe Springs as an occasional base of operation and he renewed his association with Anson Winsor and other Pipe Spring Mormons. Winsor Castle was then an official United States Post Office and Dellenbaugh posted some of his letters to the

¹⁰ Woodruff, *Journal*, 7: 248-249, italics mine.

Buffalo *Courier* from that point. One of them briefly described Winsor Castle, Anson Winsor, and the church cattle operation on the Pipe Springs Ranch and also included Dellenbaugh's insightful ruminations as to what the mysterious Mormon "border fortress... was ever erected for" in the first place. One of the few contemporary gentiles (or Mormons) who wrote anything at all regarding Brigham Young's plans to use Winsor Castle in a conflict with the United States, Dellenbaugh's April 24, 1876 letter to the *Courier* is a significant piece of Pipe Springs History. He incorrectly guessed that its main purpose pertained to some future battle between the Church and the Nation, instead of the 1870–1872 crisis created when U.S. Grant and James B. McKean sought to prosecute Young for murder and polygamy. But he was spot on in doubting Anson Winsor's postulations "that the castle was constructed to guard the ranch against Indians." To Dellenbaugh, a simple and cheap adobe, rock, or log stockade like those he found in almost all Mormon villages would have served that purpose better than "this expensive fort." Its obvious cost and its unique and elaborate design and construction were keys to unlocking what he called "a Mormon Mystery," i.e., the ultimate purpose of Winsor Castle's construction. To him, its "fine supply of water," with "an abundance of rations and ammunition," which could easily be stored within the Castle's strong walls, "a few men could stand a long siege." "Indeed," Dellenbaugh surmised, Winsor Castle "would be quite a formidable stronghold, as long as no cannon were trained upon it."¹¹

Because of its significance portions of Dellenbaugh's letter April 24, 1876 letter to the *Buffalo Daily Courier* are included here:

¹¹ *Buffalo Daily Courier*, May 11, 1876, copy in OMC, b339, f16, HL. See also Dellenbaugh, *A Canyon Voyage*, 185–186.

FAR WESTERN WANDERINGS

Description of a Border Fortress—A Mormon Mystery—...

From Our Own Correspondent.

KANAB, S. Utah, April 24th, 1876.

When we left this place in December, we went to Moccasin Run, and camped for a few days. Two miles from there is situated what is often called "Winsor Castle." It consists of two oblong two-story houses, built parallel, with a sort of court some thirty feet wide, intervening. The only windows in both structures open into this court, which is closed at each end by a wall as high as the eaves of the house, and a huge gate. The whole castle is of large blocks of red sandstone. One door opens upon the road, but it is small and heavy and designed to resist an attack. At first sight the fortress or castle appears to have no apertures, besides the door, on the outside, but a close inspection reveals a number of narrow loopholes. From these it is evidently intended that the house shall be defended. A plentiful supply of good water, conducted from a spring a few feet away (which is concealed by masonry and earth) into the house, first makes its appearance, gushing from the one corner of the front building, into a large trough, where passing travelers and the stock of the ranch refresh themselves. One would suppose that it has its source in the house, but as we were on the ground when the "castle" was building, we know that it rises some feet away.

With such a fine supply of water, and an abundance of rations and ammunition, a few men could stand a long siege. Indeed this would be quite a formidable stronghold, as long as no cannon were trained upon it.

WHAT IT WAS EVER ERECTED FOR,

we can only surmise. It is a significant fact that Brigham Young owns the greater part of the ranch, if not all of it. Here also are the church herds. The place is occupied by a “Brother” Winsor, who impresses one as being of that class of smooth talking Individuals, who care far more for the almighty dollar than they do for their own souls. It is very evident that he is what might be termed a “policy” Mormon. And right here we may assert that there are really two classes of Saints—“true believers,” and “policy.” The policy class are below par, even amongst their brethren.

And there is no longer any danger of Indian raids in this locality—and if there was a stockade would be better than this expensive fort, which only admits of defense—we are inclined to disbelieve the statement of Mr. W., that the castle was constructed to guard the ranch against Indians. More likely is it, that the structure is designed for some future use, which has not yet transpired. The Mormon “prophets” have told of a great contest which is to take place before many years roll by. In this war our United States are to have a fearful struggle; neighbor shall fight neighbor; and ruin shall be pre-eminent. But just as our constitution seems shaken to pieces and our beautiful flag trampled in the dust, up will start the Mormons. The sacred instrument is preserved and the dear old flag once more waves ‘o’er the home of the brave.” Now, this is all nice enough, but it perplexes

one a little to try to imagine 100,000 people saving over 40,000,000. At all events the Mormons already discern the war-cloud rising threateningly on the horizon.¹²

A Change in Superintendency

Sometime in the spring of 1876, Brigham Young called Charles Pulsipher to replace Anson Winsor as the superintendent of the Pipe Springs Ranch and the Winsor Castle Stock Growing Company.¹³ Pulsipher reported that the Trustee in Trust and chief WCSGC stockholder was displeased with Winsor's managing ability and hinted that the Prophet not only questioned the accuracy of his books, but also his integrity.¹⁴ Winsor's descendants, on the other hand, claimed that Young needed Anson's carpentry skills at the St. George Temple and had plans to install him as one of the chief ordinance workers in the almost finished structure. Since both Winsor and Pulsipher were "master carpenters," Pulsipher could likely have worked on the temple as well as Winsor.¹⁵ The outgoing superintendent was indeed soon called on an important temple ordinance mission. By January 1877 he was serving directly under the newly called St. George Temple President Wilford Woodruff as one of the most important Temple officers. This was not a call for a dishonest, or disloyal man, but rather a position of the highest honor in the

¹² *Buffalo Daily Courier*, May 11, 1876, copy in OMC, b339, f16, HL.

¹³ Winsor's son Joseph simply wrote that his father was replaced by Pulsipher "in the spring of '76." Winsor's daughter in law (who happened to be a niece of Pulsipher) was more specific, remembering that the switch came "in June of 1876." See Joseph F. Winsor, "The Life of Joseph F. Winsor, Written by Marilla Cook as told by Brother Winsor, Autumn of 1948–Spring and Summer of 1949," PSLA, VF, FH, Winsor; and Sarah Alydia Terry Winsor, "Autobiographical Sketch of Her Life by Sarah Alydia Terry Winsor," 2, PSLA, VF, FH, Winsor.

¹⁴ Pulsipher, "Record," 36–38.

¹⁵ For Winsor as "master carpenter," see Interview of Luther M. Winsor, Pipe Springs, July 4, 1965, PSLA, VF, FH, Winsor; Anson Perry Winsor, III, "History of Anson Perry and Emeline Zenetta Brower Winsor," 2, PSLA, VF, FH, Winsor; and Luther Winsor, "Life History," 5. For Pulsipher, see "Samuel William & Adelia Estella (Terry) Mackelprang," <http://www.hirf.org/history-bio.asp>.

Mormon community to be viewed as a singular promotion rather than a punishment. Anson Winsor built the complex wooden frames and seals for the “round windows in the upper part of the temple,” indicating that his presence was actually required at the construction site. Winsor family sources note that Anson also built some of the interior doors and helped to build its imposing spiral staircases. A grandson of Anson Winsor wrote that his grandfather told him that “his final job on the Temple was that of building the tower and dome.” Because Anson Winsor was a comparatively small man he was also tapped to help whitewash the temple’s plaster exterior while suspended on a chair from the top of the temple by a system of ropes.¹⁶ In his role as an Ordinance Officiator, performed “Baptisms for the dead for more than One Hundred Thousand people.” It is likely Young’s advance planning for this calling had as much to do with the switch in superintendency at Pipe Springs as anything.¹⁷

By 1876 WCSGC and CCSC cattle and drought had destroyed the lushness of the Canaan-Short Creek-Pipe Springs-Kanab range. Compounding this human-caused disaster, the winter, spring and summer of 1875–1876 were seasons of acute drought in southern Utah. Indeed, there had been no rains of consequence since the fall of 1875. The same month Young tapped Pulsipher to replace Winsor, Erastus Snow complained that “the Lord had not shed down rain that grass might grow” and that the “drought of our ranges had not been so severe since we

¹⁶ Blaine M. Yorgason, Richard A. Schmutz and Douglas D. Alder, *All That Was Promised: The St. George Temple and the Unfolding of the Restoration* (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book, 2013), 222–223; *Our Pioneer Heritage*, 14:404; Adelia Winsor Shurtliff, “History of Grandfather Winsor: His work for and on the St. George Temple,” 1–2, and other items in “Winsor Family History,” JAP, Winsor, and PSLA, VF, Winsor; and Luther Winsor, “Life History,” 1, and 5.

¹⁷ In the quarter century after the Temple’s dedication, absolutely no one was more involved in the sacred ordinance work of the St. George Temple than was Anson Perry Winsor, Sr. See Adelia Winsor Shurtliff, “History of Grandfather Winsor: His work for and on the St. George Temple,” 1–2, and other items in “Winsor Family History,” JAP, Winsor, and PSLA, VF, Winsor. See also, Maurine Winsor Farnsworth, “Pipe Spring National Monument: A Pioneer Heritage: Winsor Family Stories compiled by Maurine Winsor Farnsworth,” especially 23, 121, and 17, FHL; and Anson P. Winsor, “Anson P. Winsor Temple Record: Covering Temple Ordinance Performed between 1884 and 1898,” FHL.

had come to the country.” A St. George correspondent for the Salt Lake *Herald* wrote on 18 June that “There has been no rain since last fall, and all is very dry and parched. There is no feed on the range; and our beef is very poor, and no butter and cheese, making it extremely difficult to get a ‘square meal.’”¹⁸ Like the baptismal font in the St. George Temple, the whole southern Utah economy rested firmly on the backs of cattle, and when the herds suffered, so did the people. And since the whole temple building project was based on tithing, church cattle, and private donation, when the people were pinched economically, so was Young’s pet project.¹⁹ By 1876 the WCSGC and the CCSC annual dividends of their first years (ranging from 38–49%) had dropped to around 10% and were still falling.²⁰ Young hoped Pulsipher would be able to stabilize the plummeting WCSGC profits and actually turn them around. Pulsipher remembered that Young telegraphed him at Hebron ordering him to come “immediately” to meet with him in his St. George office. Pulsipher promptly harnessed two unbroken colts to his wagon and completed the forty mile ride before dark. Considering the distance, Young was surprised to see Pulsipher so soon but received him upon arrival, explaining that “We have been looking around for some suitable hand to take the church ranch and superintend it and Brother Snow has recommended you for the job.” Pulsipher accepted Young’s offer to give him “a thousand a year to handle it and furnish” him and his family, that included two wives and four children. Within

¹⁸ JH, June 18, 1876, 1, and June 25, 1876, 1.

¹⁹ During the winter and spring of 1875–1876 northern Utah had received too much moisture in the form of snow and northern cattle and sheep perished by the thousands. The *Deseret News* reported that “The past winter has been one of unusual length and severity. Quite a percentage of stock have fallen victims to gaunt starvation, and the short-sightedness of their owners in not providing plenty of provender and comfortable places for them.” JH, May 15, 1876, 1.

²⁰ After the first fourteen months of the CCSC’s existence it posted a return of 38.5%. See *DN*, 30 August 1871, 1, *UDN*, and James Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:106. Twelve months later it paid out the incredibly high annual dividend of 48%. See *DN*, 21 August 1872, 6, *UDN*. As has been pointed out, in 1874 the Winsor Castle Stock Growing Company declared a dividend of 38% for its first eighteen months with 49% “being the actual gains.” *Deseret News*, September 30, 1874, 7, *UDN*.

the conversation Brigham acknowledged that Pulsipher “had quite a lengthy mission without pay, now this will pay well for your labors. We shall want you to travel and gather the tithing stock and bring the beef into St. George and keep the accounts correctly. Our former Supt. has not given very good satisfaction.”²¹ A grandchild of Anson Winsor, who was also a close relative of Charles Pulsipher, wrote that Young escorted the latter to Pipe Springs to personally “take care of the exchange.”²²

They apparently overnighted both at Rockville and at Canaan Ranch in wet weather. As by previous arrangement, Charles brought his nineteen-year-old niece Alydia Terry from Hebron to be the new telegrapher at Pipe.²³ Apparently Winsor Castle had been without a telegrapher for some time as there was high-turnover in the position as the young women who were often hired as telegraphers often married or were needed at other stations. Ella Stewart, the first telegraph operator at the Pipe Springs Office, was called back to Kanab to operate the telegraph office that was opened in her father’s house. She probably left Pipe long before she married David Udall in February 1875.²⁴ Alydia Terry’s children claimed she was the second telegraph operator there arriving in June of 1876. To keep the line staffed, experienced telegraphers were constantly training new operators throughout the territory. Fifteen year-old Alydia and three others practiced on home made telegraphic keys in a class held in Hebron under the tutelage of Beaver’s twenty-two year-old telegrapher Daniel M. Tyler. At sixteen Alydia had been put in

²¹ This statement contributes to the supposition that the WCSGC’s “Ledger B” is one of the “memo books” referred to. It is not comprehensive and contains no running totals of the company’s total assets. The WCSGC’s complete record still waits to be found among the records of SUTO kept by Henry Eyring and other tithing clerks. A number of uncatalogued collections regarding the SUTO, the General Tithing Office, the Office of the Trustee in Trust, The Office of the Presiding Bishopric, and other papers regarding general church properties were unavailable for research at the Church Historical Department at time of this writing in 2015.

²² Anonymous grandchild of Anson Winsor, “History of Anson Perry and Emeline Zenetta Brower Winsor,” in PSLA, VF, FH, Winsor.

²³ Charles Pulsipher, “Record,” 38.

²⁴ David Udall and Pearl Nelson, *Arizona Pioneer Mormon*, 15–19.

charge of the Hebron office and before going to Pipe she spent time working the key at Panaca, Nevada. Alydia later recorded that she rode with her Uncle Charles to Pipe Springs in the carriage of Deseret Telegraph Superintendent A. Milton Musser. It was his job to keep all the far flung offices of the line staffed with competent operators. By the time Alydia reached Pipe she was deathly ill with typhoid fever, her hair falling out by the fist full. Emeline Winsor carefully nursed her back to health and the two became fast friends. Most of the Winsors did not move to St. George until October, and that summer a romance blossomed between Alydia and Pipe Springs cowboy Anson Perry Winsor, Jr. When the Winsors left Pipe Springs in October 1876, Alydia followed them there “soon after.” She and Perry were among the first couples married in the St. George Temple.²⁵ Alydia taught her aunt (Charles Pulsipher’s wife Ann Beers) telegraphy, and turned the Winsor Castle Deseret Telegraph Office over to her.²⁶

For the rest of her life Alydia fondly remembered Emeline Winsor’s care during her first three weeks at Pipe as her life hung in the balance. Her writings offer a rare glimpse into the experience of women at Winsor Castle in the mid-1870s. She wrote:

By the time we arrived at the fort (Pipe Springs) I was sick.... Uncle Charles went on to Kanab with [the President’s] party. On his return he found me quite ill. Mother Winsor had been doing all she could to cool my fever and relieve my aching head. Uncle Charles stayed one night. After blessing me he returned to settle up his affairs at home and

²⁵ Sarah Alydia Terry Winsor, “Autobiographical Sketch of Her Life by Sarah Alydia Terry Winsor”; Orilla W. Hafen, “Sarah Alydia Terry Winsor: Pioneer Telegraph Operator”; Sarah Alydia Terry Winsor, “Pioneer Ghost Town”; Alydia Terry Winsor Seventieth Wedding Anniversary [and] Ninetith [*sic*] Birthday” program; “Ninety-Second Birthday [f]or Alydia Winsor Observed,” undated newspaper clipping, n.p.; and Anonymous son or daughter of Sarah Alydia Terry Winsor, “History of Anson Perry and Emeline Zenetta Brower Winsor;” all in PSLA, VF, FH, Winsor. See also Adonis Robinson, *History of Kane County*, 491.

²⁶ Winsor, “Pioneer Ghost Town.”

prepare to move his family out. A. P. Winsor also began making preparations to move to St. George. He had been called by President Young to come to St. George and help finish the Temple ready for ordinance work. Mother Winsor stayed with me at night and took all the care of me that my own dear mother could have done. But she belonged to the old school, thought that fever had to run its course. After three weeks I recovered. But my hair came out so fast I was nearly baldheaded before the new had time to grow. Lucky for me, it came in thick and curly as my hair had been before. By the 4th of July, I watched the boys in a water fight. By July 24, I went with the young man that afterwards became my husband to Kanab to the celebration.

The telegraph operator of Kanab, Ella Ud[a]ll, had invited me over. Telegraph operators are always anxious to see their sister operators.... I found the Winsor family to be very splendid people. I became greatly attached to Mother Winsor during the time she nursed me through my illness. I admired her son for his manly demeanor, the straight forward look of his clear blue eyes, and his truthful way in which he told me of his faults.²⁷

When Charles Pulsipher parted from Brigham Young in Kanab in June 1876, Young gave Pulsipher instructions on what he was to do at the Ranch, specifically directing him to “divide off that large upper room [at Winsor Castle] into bedrooms so that when the Brethren come along you can make them comfortable.” This emphasized Winsor Castle’s role as a hotel of sorts for traveling ecclesiastical leaders, and that part of his calling to attend to “the business of caring for the travelling public.” Pulsipher promised that he would divide the room as directed and

²⁷ Alydia Winsor, “Autobiographical Sketch,” 2–3.

quipped that when it was ready he would expect a visit from his prophet. Still doing poorly, Young “shook his head and said, ‘No. I shall never visit this country again.’” The Prophet prophesied to Pulsipher that he had made his last trip to Pipe Springs.²⁸

When Brigham Young called Charles Pulsipher to serve as superintendent of the Pipe Springs Ranch he called an exceedingly devoted, pious, and generous Latter-day Saint. Pulsipher’s parents had been baptized before both Charles and their new church were yet a year and half old. (Charles was born the same month the church was organized in April 1830.) The family moved to Kirtland, Ohio when Charles was five years of age just in time see the roof put on the church’s first temple. The Kirtland Temple was built during a time of great poverty by the sacrifice, generosity, and free labor of the Saints, and their response to “the call of duty” made a deep impression on the young boy and others of the first generation raised in the church. Like many of his coreligionists, Charles Pulsipher grew up ready and willing to sacrifice all for temples and for the Kingdom of God. He viewed service as divine “missions” given to him by God’s Servant and his experiences with persecution and defending the Saints shaped his worldview. When he was seven his family fled to Missouri with a company called “Kirtland Camp.” Pulsipher wrote that part of that company ended up at Haun’s Mill where they were “shot down like so many rats, all the men killed or wounded excepting one and he ran off and hid until it was all over with. There bodies were thrown into a dry well for burial.” Pulsipher remembered that Joseph Smith sent his portion of “Kirtland Camp” to Davies County, Missouri, and as they responded to that “call” Charles reported that he was “shot at by the mob considerable.” The Mormon exodus from Missouri during the winter of 1838–1839, forced nine

²⁸ Pulsipher, “Record,” 38; JH, 20 June 1876, 3; and Elizabeth Jensen, “The Pulsipher Family Comes to Pipe Springs,” 2, in BYU, WSC, Mss 1403, b3, f9. Pulsipher wrote that he was “much surprised for I thought he might live for years yet.”

Pulsiphers to pack into a single “little wagon” in “very disagreeable” weather” as they headed for Illinois.²⁹ Pulsipher’s autobiography, like those of other Latter-day Saints that experienced the persecutions of Ohio, Missouri, and Illinois, is replete with references to persecution and negative references to the United States of America. He wrote that when renewed threats of anti-Mormon violence drove himself and his leaders out of Illinois in February 1846, he was happy to be “bidding good bye to the home of my childhood and start[ing] out into the wilderness to hunt for some place to make a new home.” For Charles Pulsipher, leaving the United States was easy. “My Faith,” he said, “would not permit me to stay.”³⁰

At the Missouri River he used his carpentry skills to build houses “to help shelter the poor” wandering outcasts. For years he suffered the privations and poverty of eking out a living in Utah. When President Buchanan sent an army to Utah in 1857, Pulsipher was called out with other “minute men” to prevent them from entering the territory.³¹ Charles wrote that “our orders were to do all we could to hinder their progress but not take life only in self defence. There was 46 of us Minute Men under command of Col. R. T. Burton and three thousand of the choice of the U. S. Army well fitted out with everything that they could think of that they would want, while we had but a scanty fit out with little ponies to ride and a saddle tree with a few straps on it.” He rejoiced that he was called to “harry them,” by “stampeding their animals,” burning grazing lands before them, running off their “beef stock,” and most of all by burning their supply trains. He was especially proud that his group of raiders absconded with Colonel Albert Sidney

²⁹ See Pulsipher, “Record,” especially 4–5. Only “a few days” into the journey, his beloved “Grandma Pulsipher took cold and died,” a victim to religious intolerance

³⁰ Pulsipher, “Record,” 8.

³¹ Pulsipher, “Record,” 15. “Clothing was very scarce,” he remembered. “My folks took off a cotton bed tick, washed it and made me a pair of garments, before I started and I went without a coat because I could not get one but that did not stop me from going and filling the call.”

Johnston's fine bay "race horse."³² The combined efforts of Pulsipher and hundreds of other Mormon Raiders forced U. S. troops into winter quarters in the mountains. As spring came they prepared to enter the Mormon community. Pulsipher remembered that Young told the "peace commissioners" sent by Buchanan "in plain terms what he would do if they persisted to come in with hostile feelings[,] for said he[,] we have been persecuted and driven and... killed for the last time[!]" Young told them that if the troops entered with hostile intent the Saints would burn "every house and destroy all good improvements that we could and leave the country desolate for them to inhabit." "As proof of our sayings," Fort Bridger, Fort Supply, and other Mormon improvements in the area of the troops' winter quarters were burned to the ground. Pulsipher remembered, "I set fire to [a] house which I had worked hard to build and then went down and set fire to the mill and a large lot of choice good lumber and rode off by the light of it."³³

In October 1860, Pulsipher was called to Dixie. Among the first to arrive at the site chosen for the new city of St. George, the Pulsiphers lived in a crude shelter made of willows and sagebrush and slept in their wagon boxes that winter while Charles helped to layout the streets and city blocks of the new town. Already by February the new community's substantial cattle herds had decimated the range grass around St. George. Pulsipher and his brothers John and William were called to explore and locate a range where they could watch over St. George's communal cattle herd. Pulsipher wrote: "In February, my older brother John and myself went out to hunt out a summer range for the stock and as there had been trouble with the Indians and one of them had been killed it seemed a little dangerous to go off 50 or 60 miles into their country

³² Charles Pulsipher, "History and Record of Charles Pulsipher, by Charles Pulsipher, Born 20 April 1830, Son of Zerah and Mary Brown Pulsipher," 20–26, Digital Interpretation File, PSLA.

³³ Pulsipher, "Record," 20.

but duty required it and we went.”³⁴ As a granddaughter of Erastus Snow explained, whose own father filled such a mission “it was no small matter to be asked to go to Pipe Springs. Its many disadvantages as a home were well known throughout Dixie. There was the hazard of its location on the highway or rather the ‘raiding trail’ of the Navajo from across the Colorado River. There was the great distance—not in miles but in accessibility [*sic*]—from settlements where help could be had in times of sickness or accidents. There was the loneliness [*sic*] of the desert & lack of school for the children... Men who were asked to go to Pipe Springs looked upon the request as a “call to a mission” & not as a choice place for mar[r]iage [and] home[.]”³⁵

Just three weeks after parting with Young in Kanab, Pulsipher had “sold out” and gathered up his family and a small personal herd, and left his brothers and other extended family members in Hebron. Young had directed Pulsipher to move his own stock onto the Pipe Springs Ranch as he had Anson Winsor before him. Erastus Snow reported to Young that he ran on to Pulsipher and his family at Antelope Springs on the Hurricane Plateau making their way to their new home on July 15, 1876.³⁶ In addition to telegrapher Alydia Terry, Pulsipher was joined at Pipe by another niece, Sarah Ann Alger, and her husband William E. Cowley. Sarah was with child as they made the move and gave birth at Pipe Springs in October. In addition to the superintendency, Pulsipher was appointed Presiding Elder of the Pipe Springs and Moccasin branch of the Kanab Stake, while Cowley was to function as blacksmith and foreman of the cowboys at the Ranch. Cowley’s daughter later remembered that Erastus Snow had pushed to

³⁴ Pulsipher, “Record,” 23–24; Sarah Alydia Terry Winsor, “Pioneer Ghost Town,” PSLA, VF, FH, Winsor; and Orson W. Huntsman, “Journal,” 2: 92–93, as recorded in William R. Palmer Research Notes, in William R. Palmer Papers, CHL, ms1268, b2, f3.

³⁵ Elizabeth Jensen, “The Pulsipher Family Comes to Pipe Springs,” WSC, b3, f9.

³⁶ Pulsipher, “Record,” 38; and Telegram of Erastus Snow, St. George, to Brigham Young, July 16, 1876, BYP.

have two of his “relatives” appointed to those positions, but that Young had “insisted” on Pulsipher and Cowley.³⁷

When Charles Pulsipher took charge of the Pipe Springs Ranch sometime after July 16, 1876, the WCSGC owned approximately \$50,000.00 worth of livestock.³⁸ Because of severe drought the animals were scattered over the immensity of the high plateau between Short Creek and Kanab wherever they could find a parched blade of grass and a mouthful of water. Under such circumstances, to round them up was to kill them. It appears that for nearly a year after the new superintendent’s arrival they simply could not be counted and that therefore no dividend could be reported to stockholders.³⁹ But earlier estimates of the Ranch’s net worth were available. Anson Winsor and John W. Young had valued “the buildings and equipment” at \$10,000.⁴⁰ Young Perry Winsor told Pulsipher that a stock count had been made the year before, which tallied some 40 bulls, 1100 cows including 256 “Church owned dairy cows,” and 400 “marketable steers.” These 1796 bovines and a total of 138 horses “of which sixty were brood mares” appear to have been owned by the WCSGC. Mixed in with the cooperative herd, were another 329 steers and heifers and 6 oxen Anson Winsor had “collected for tithing.” When

³⁷ A.K. Hafen, *Devoted Empire Builders (Pioneers of St. George)* (St. George, UT: Sun Publishing Co., 1969), 37, CHL; Adella Cowley Gibson, “Life History,” in DUP, *An Enduring Legacy* (Salt Lake City: Daughters of Utah Pioneers, 1983), 6:226–229; and various letters of Adella Cowley Gibson and assorted Cowley family histories in PSLA, VF, FH, Cowley. Those “relatives” of Apostle Snow were undoubtedly his sons-in-law Edwin D. Woolley and Daniel Seegmiller who eventually obtained control of Winsor Castle and the Pipe Springs Ranch.

³⁸ Telegram of Erastus Snow, St. George, to Brigham Young, July 16, 1876, BYP.; and Ray B. Heaps, excerpts “from the rough draft of a book I am working on,” in Ray B. Heaps, Kearns, Utah, to Jeff Frank, Pipe Spring National Monument, no date, in File, “History of Northern Arizona & Southern Utah,” in VF 2, PSLA.

³⁹ In his autobiography Pulsipher remembered “helping” to “gather the Co. stock” that season “which took about two months.” But other sources indicate that because of the drought they could not be gathered or easily numbered. Pulsipher, “Record,” 38. The scattering of stock because of “the dryness of the feed” and the resultant difficulty in obtaining accurate figures as to numbers of animals on the range were a frequent problem on the Arizona Strip. The superintendent of the CCSC, for example, reported to his Board of Directors in May 1879 “that the ranges are very dry, no rains for a long time, and in consequence it had become necessary to scatter the stock about on the best ranges, thereby making it impossible to gather and count the stock this year, without danger of sevier loss.” As a result for some years firm stock inventories do not exist. See CCSC Minutes, 52–53, and 96.

⁴⁰ WCSGC, “Ledger B,” 102.

Winsor family left in the fall of 1876, they drew their stock out of the WCSGC. Sometime after April 1877, Erastus Snow's son-in-law Edwin D. Woolley, Jr. (called Dee to differentiate him from his father and a polygamous brother his own age of the same given name,)⁴¹ was sent by the apostle to help Pulsipher take a more exact count. This enumeration did not differ substantially from the figure Perry Winsor had given, but reflected the increase of 215 spring calves, making a total of 2,173 cattle held on the Pipe Springs Ranch. Natural increase and tithing donation had also increased the horse herd to 240.⁴² By 1876 the WCSGC had its main ranch at Pipe, one nearby at Two-Mile Springs, and a ranch and dairy in House Rock Valley. It also had some interest at Moccasin where the family of Pipe Springs Ranch Foreman Bill Cowley raised sugarcane and processed it into molasses. By 1877 Pulsipher said that he was running "three dairies." One was at Pipe, another was at House Rock Valley where Anson Winsor had located ranch hand William Swap, his wife, and a hired girl. In addition to the dairy and the beef cattle held at the WCSGC's House Rock Ranch, Jacob Hamblin and Anson Winsor kept "scrub horses" there to trade with Navajo crossing the Colorado with blankets. Perhaps the third dairy Pulsipher mentioned was at Two Mile Ranch located just two miles northeast of Pipe Springs where Anson Winsor had built a corral and was building a ranch house when Pulsipher took over.⁴³ Upon completion of the St. George Temple just a little more than six months after Pulsipher took over, "the demand for the products of Winsor Ranch" greatly diminished, as "300

⁴¹ Edwin D. Woolley, Sr. was an important Salt Lake City bishop and merchant, and a stockholder in both the WCSGC and CCSC, as were his sons Edwin G. and Edwin D., Jr. Edwin G. was a few months older than his brother Edwin D. Since both played prominent roles in CCSC and WCSGC history, and since both of their names appear frequently in both companies' records, as does their father's, it is important make distinction between them. To minimize confusion, brothers were called "Dee" (Edwin D.) and "Dub" (Edwin G.)

⁴² Ray B. Heaps, excerpts "from the rough draft of a book I am working on," in Ray B. Heaps, Kearns, Utah, to Jeff Frank, Pipe Spring National Monument, no date, in "History of Northern Arizona & Southern Utah," VF 2, PSLA.

⁴³ Adella Cowley Gibson, "Life History," in DUP, *An Enduring Legacy* (Salt Lake City: Daughters of Utah Pioneers, 1983), 6:227; Jacob Hamblin and John Oakley, Kanab Kane Co., U. T. to Prest. Brigham Young, March 14, 1875, BYP; and WCSGC, "Ledger B," 102, 235, 238, and 245.

to 400” volunteer temple construction workers returned to their homes and livelihoods.

Simultaneously, the Gentile mines at Silver Reef and Pioche “were now no longer bonanzas for the livestock and dairy business that they had been.” As a result, for reasons beyond Pulsipher’s control, the rich market Winsor had enjoyed dried up not long after he took over. In fact there is some evidence that dairy production ceased altogether.⁴⁴

From the start Pulsipher found the relationship between the Winsor Castle Stock Growing Company and the Canaan Cooperative Stock Company to be close but somewhat strained. Many big southern Utah investors were stockholders in both, and for at least some of the time Pulsipher was at Pipe, Apostle Erastus Snow was president of both companies. Both were “private” companies founded and run under priesthood direction, and the church was heavily invested in both. Like dozens of other cooperative cattle companies associated with the Stakes of Zion, they existed to enrich the Saints and to provide capital for the building of the Kingdom and the development of Dixie. The CCSC and WCSGC occasionally held “joint meetings,” sometimes sent representatives to each others meetings, and “acted in concert” in jointly owning and operating the St. George Slaughter yard, the St. George slaughterhouse, and the St. George Cooperative Meat Market in conjunction with the Southern Utah Tithing Office. Each of these three associations owned a third part of the slaughter operation and shared in the meat market’s profits. The scrip notes of the WCSGC, CCSC, and the SUTO, together with “the Meat Tickets” of their common market, provided the backbone medium of the southern Utah economy. While

⁴⁴ Elizabeth Woolley Jensen, “The Pulsipher Family Comes to Pipe Springs,” 2, in WSC, BYU, Mss 1403, b3, f9. If Charles Pulsipher shut down the dairy operation, as Winsor descendants affirm, he did not do it immediately, for in November 1876 a visiting Relief Society dignitary visited Pipe Springs and found that “considerable beef, butter, and cheese” were still being produced there. Elvira Stevens Barney, “My Trip South,” in Elvira Stevens Barney, *The Stevens Genealogy: Embracing Branches of the Family Descended from Puritan Ancestry, New England Families not Traceable to Puritan Ancestry, and Miscellaneous Branches Wherever Found, Together with an Extended Account of the Line of Descent from 1650 to the Present Time of the Author* (Salt Lake City: Skelton Pub. Co., 1907), 270, 277–280, especially 278.

the sister cooperative cattle companies thus functioned in “copartnership” on some points, they were clearly two separate capitalistic enterprises and that operated with “cooperation” and “union” but also competed vigorously with one another.⁴⁵

Lack of fencing left the large horse and cattle herds of both companies drifting and mixing in one heterogeneous farrago over the immense range that stretched from the Hurricane Fault on the west to Kanab Gulch on the east, and from the Vermillion Cliffs on the north to the Grand Canyon on the south. As Charles Pulsipher explained it, “I found that our stock was mixing up with the Can[aa]n stock and theirs was mixing with ours so that we had to ride over the same ground with our hands to separate and get each others stock and I came to the conclusion that if the two co[mpanies] was combined together in one the whole of the stock could be handled with considerable less expense than to keep two sets of hands.”⁴⁶ From time to time both companies occasionally accused the other of branding cattle their animals and at least once the CCSC threatened to bring Anson Winsor before an ecclesiastical court presided over the Stake Presidency and High Council of the St. George Stake to force him to “vent” or remove his brand from cattle they claimed.⁴⁷ Notwithstanding these stresses, after his removal from the Winsor Castle superintendency Winsor sought a job with the CCSC. Apparently he was unsuccessful.⁴⁸ Early on Pulsipher began suggesting that the since both companies used the same range and both were controlled by the church, that the easiest solution to this problem was to unite the two companies under one brand and one superintendent.

⁴⁵ See CCSC Minutes, especially 40–41, 56, 58–69, 83, and 87–88; and WCSGC, “Ledger B,” especially 48, 326–328, 382, 265, and 410.

⁴⁶ Pulsipher, “Record,” 39.

⁴⁷ CCSC Minutes, 24. “Venting a brand” consists of voiding an existing brand by branding through or over it, and placing a new valid brand nearby.

⁴⁸ While making the transition to his new life in St. George, and before he began to receive a wage for his service at the Temple, Anson Winsor and Joseph Hamblin offered “to take charge of some of the cows of the Company.” CCSC Minutes, 39.

Growing problems between the two major cooperative cattle companies on the Arizona Strip were compounded by the fact that many small private herds were also crowding in to compete on a worn out and limited range. “Herds were being brought in from near and far, brands were multiplying into confusion” and the unique Mormon *modus operandi* of mixing private and ecclesiastic interests made it “very hard for the Supervisor in charge to keep some degree of equity among the stock owners.” Kanab cattleman Brigham A. Riggs, who worked for Charles Pulsipher as a WCSGC cowboy while herding some of his own animals on the same range, highlighted some of the many problems of mixing church and private interests on the diminishing Canaan and Pipe Springs range when he wrote:

[Because of the dwindling grass resources on the desert] the church herd was the only herd, so the Presiding Bishop said, that paid a dividend. Jim Andrus had been Supt. of the church herd at Canaan for a while and he wanted to get the job back, so he sent a complaint to the authorities of the Church that Pulsipher who was running the Church herd at Pipe, was hiring men with cattle of their own and these men were getting their own cattle tended for nothing and not doing the work of the Company. Well, [as a result] Pulsipher turned me off [i.e. fired me,] and when he did, the other helper, Jim Emmett, quit also [for he was running private animals on the Pipe Springs Ranche as well.]⁴⁹

Brigham Young’s death on August 29, 1877, and the knotty problem of unravelling the church and private interests of his estate, as well as the continuation of drought and overgrazing on the Arizona Strip, caused a shift in Mormon spirit from cooperation to one of intense self-

⁴⁹ Elizabeth Woolley Jensen, “The Pulsipher Family Comes to Pipe Springs,” 2.

interest. Near the end of 1877, when Pulsipher had only been at Pipe a year and a half, there was a move to replace him with a son-in-law of Anson Winsor. Still a heavy investor in the WCSGC, Anson Winsor was slated to be elected president of the company and appears to have been using his influence to install one of his relatives as superintendent at Pipe Springs. John W. Young, representing his father's heirs—who together still rivaled Winsor as the company's largest private shareholders—squelched the Winsors' designs on both the company's presidency and its superintendency. He accomplished this by telegraphing the new Trustee in Trust, John Taylor, that since the Winsors had "just purchased [a] Rancho Six miles from Pipe Springs" that "it would make confusion" for them to manage the WCSGC herd in addition to their own in the same locality. "I would suggest making Erastus Snow President [of the] Winsor Cooperative herd instead of A P Winsor," he wrote the man who would succeed his father as the leader of the church, "and for Bro Pulsifer [*sic*] present Supt to remain in the position instead of [the] change Proposed by Bro Winsor to put in his son in law."⁵⁰ Ironically, John W. Young would soon be running his own cattle on various ranges of the Pipe Springs Ranch and "confusing" his own cattle with those of the WCSGC and in little over a decade would obtain most of them under questionable circumstances.⁵¹

Brigham Young's dreams for cooperation and UO were threatened by the politics of fathers advancing sons in the Mormon financial and ecclesiastical system. Anson Winsor wrote

⁵⁰ Telegraph of John W. Young, St. George, to Prest John Taylor, December 25, 1877, PTR, s8, b4, f48, NAU.

⁵¹ John W. Young was sustained as First Counselor in the First Presidency on October 8, 1876. On October 6, John W. had been elevated to First Counselor in the First Presidency before his father's death and was retained as Counselor to the Quorum of the Twelve Apostles when that body succeeded Young as "interim President of the Church" a few weeks after his father's death, he was sustained as Counselor to the Quorum of the Twelve Apostles, a quorum he was never made a member of. Telegraph of John W. Young, St. George, to Prest John Taylor, December 25, 1877. It appears that Winsor Castle played some role in John W.'s bid to maintain some semblance of power after his father's death, and in church politics in the immediate wake of Brigham Young's death the prophet's son somehow felt keeping the Winsors from having too much power in the WCSGC was "greatly to [the] advantage of [the] trustee in trust and [to] father[']s estate."

to President Taylor that having been “called to labor in the Temple, and desiring to assist my sons, and having recently purchased an additional interest in the Moccasin Springs, near Winsor, [I wish] to locate my sons there, that they may be enabled to assist me, and I also to assist them, by our Co-operation, the better enabling me to carry out the Mission whereunto I am called.” Winsor lobbied President Taylor to release his son Walter J. from a call to move deeper into Arizona so he could help manage Winsor family interests in Moccasin. Fully aware that such a request could have political consequences, he expressed his desire for “nothing that would in the least militate against the future usefulness or interest of my son, or the upbuilding of the Kingdom of God.”⁵² President Taylor and the Council of the Apostles obliged Winsor and released Walter from his Arizona mission and gave “permission and approval for him to settle at Moccasin Springs.”⁵³ While John W. Young “militated” against the interests of the sons and sons-in-law of Anson Winsor, other powerful forces operated against him.⁵⁴

Colloquially called “Canaan Ranche” after its central Ranch located at Andrus Springs on the high plateau some twelve miles south of Rockville, the CCSC was significantly larger than the WCSGC. In 1876 Canaan ran some **4,700 cattle** in contrast to the **2,000** head run by the WCSGC. Like Pipe Springs Ranch, Canaan Ranch had expanded to engulf a number of dairies and ranches. Among Canaan’s dairies were the Antelope Springs Ranch run on shares by

⁵² Anson P. Winsor, St. George, to Prest. John Taylor, November 30, 1877, JTPP, b1, fd 8.

⁵³ John Taylor, Salt Lake City, to Elder Anson P. Winsor, St. George, December 13, 1877, in JAP, Winsor, typescript in PTR, s8, b21, f329.

⁵⁴ Kane wrote that when it became clear that Brigham Young was dying, an Indian was dispatched to call John W. to his father’s bedside. Suffering with “Colora Morbus followed by inflammation of the Bowels,” at the end the great prophet struggled to breathe. John W. was the most grasping of Young’s sons and fully expected that his father would designate him as his successor on his deathbed. Showing the importance of the friendship of Thomas Kane not only to Brigham Young but to the hierarchy **en todo**, within five minutes of Young’s “last breath” a telegraph was sent to the Pennsylvania general. According to the dead prophet’s special friend, the very next act was that George Q. Cannon began “to cut” Young’s “highfalut[ant]” son “Johnny” down to size. Kane reported that John W. “had supposed himself Head and Successor [but] found himself unmentioned by any special manifesto [left by his father].”

Claybourne Elder. There were also two other dairies in Upper Kanab, one of them soon to be taken over by Dee Woolley and Dan Seegmiller, young, energetic, and ambitious sons-in-law of Erastus Snow who, with the help of their father-in-law and benefactor, were becoming forces to be reckoned with in the CCSC.⁵⁵ As Pulsipher was settling on the dry and wasted range at Pipe in July of 1876, the bleak conditions of CCSC grasslands forced the company to seek new ranges. That year they moved onto the Parashont Range located near the Grand Canyon southwest of St. George. They found the Parashont lush with rich grass, but despite its name,⁵⁶ it had very few springs and seeps to support their cattle. To use the resources there, Canaan was forced to develop what few seeps and springs existed. Cowboys dug out and cleaned up every available seep and installed wind powered water pumps where they could. Of necessity in the Parashont country, and in fact throughout the whole Arizona Strip, the drought that began in the fall of 1875 and extended into the 1880s and came again in the 1890s required that cattlemen engineered crude earthen “dams” to capture spring runoff and rain water anywhere they could in makeshift reservoirs called “tanks.” Made by team and scrapper, many of these pioneer tanks have been expanded by modern earthmoving equipment and are still used today.⁵⁷

“The People Were Becoming Discouraged About the Idea of Paying their Tithing”

Overgrazing and the drought of the late 1870s and early 1880s brought great changes to the cattle industry on the Arizona Strip. But so did the succession of John Taylor to

⁵⁵ To compare the two companies, see CCSCM and “Winsor Castle Stock Growing Company, Ledger ‘B,’” DSUSC, digital copy PSLA. See also Andrew Karl Larson, *I Was Called to Dixie: The Virgin River Basin: Unique Experiences in Mormon Pioneering* (St. George, Utah: Deseret News Press, 1961), 238.

⁵⁶ *Parashont* is a Paiute word meaning “much water.”

⁵⁷ See CCSCM, especially 1:16–18.

Mormonism's top offices between 1877 and 1880, including the position of "Trustee in Trust of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints."⁵⁸ Taylor was not the consummate entrepreneur and business magnate Brigham Young had been. He was much more fiscally conservative and less willing to take risks with church funds. Although he followed Young's example in trying to protect church property from government confiscation by sheltering it under private ownership, he drew a much sharper line between church and personal property, both for himself and for others. Just as importantly, he cared far more than Young what rank-and-file church members felt about how their leaders used their donated funds. Young "damned" from the pulpit any who disagreed with his financial decisions, frequently excommunicating them or punitively sending recalcitrant Saints on missions.⁵⁹

Concerns about Young's management of church funds were shared by many Mormons, especially those living in Salt Lake City who could see the opulent manner in which Young and his huge family lived. Gentile newspapers kept a constant focus on the "un-American" character of the Mormon financial system and thousands left the church as Young pressed his exclusive cooperative system upon them, excommunicating those who shopped at gentile mercantile

⁵⁸ Brigham Young died in August 1877. By October, John Taylor, as President of the Quorum of the Twelve, took over church leadership though the First Presidency, with Taylor at its head, would not be reorganized until 1880.

⁵⁹ Ronald Walker, *Wayward Saints: The Godbeites and Brigham Young* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1998), especially 1–2. A classic example of Brigham Young and his First Presidency using threats of mission calls to subdue recalcitrant Saints occurred on July 23, 1870. At a meeting of "the Salt Lake School of the Prophets" Young attacked Salt Lake Thirteen Ward bishop Edwin D. Woolley, Sr., for publicly murmuring against the Prophet's financial policies. First Presidency member George A. Smith made a motion that Woolley "take a Mission to Europe" to help him repent of his obstinacy. Knowing the social and economic impact of such a "punishment," Woolley immediately buckled. Before the large assembly of Salt Lake ecclesiastical leaders he "expressed a deep regret at having hurt the feelings of his brethren [i.e. the First Presidency] and asked their forgiveness." Young denied sending men on missions "to punish [them], but to do them good, and give them a chance to get the spirit of God." Since Woolley had publicly confessed and begged forgiveness, George A. Smith "withdrew his motion, and another Motion [was put forth] and carried That [Woolley] be allowed a further trial as a Bishop." Woolley served in that position until his death eleven years later. See Excerpts from the Minutes of the Salt Lake School of the Prophets, found in Leonard J. Arrington Collection, s9, b16, f5, 72–74, USU; Leonard J. Arrington and Davis Bitton, *Saints Without Halos: The Human Side of Mormon History* (Salt Lake City: Signature Books, 1981), 59–61; and *Salt Lake Tribune*, June 16, 1877, 1, GBC.

institutions. Others left because of economic injustices and social pressures associated with instituting and running the UO. A greater number of frustrated Latter-day Saints, however, stayed in the church but ceased paying tithes and offerings because of the inequities they saw in how church funds were used. It appeared to many that the tithes and donations as well as cooperative economics and the UO unfairly prospered church officers at the expense of average members. As a result of this and other natural financial concerns, apathy toward the UO was widespread.⁶⁰ The collapse of most UOs in the first year or two of the program's existence took its toll on the faith of many Latter-day Saints. It galled them that Young and most of the apostles fervently preached the Order, even declaring "it was necessary for salvation," but did not enter it themselves. Some outspoken members of the Orderville UO went so far as to say "that when the Twelve were willing to live in the Order like we are. . . then they could give us council [on financial affairs], but until they did so, we do not want their council."⁶¹ Others pointed out that in untangling the property of failed orders, local priesthood leaders often benefited while the rank were left bankrupt. After one such a collapse and redistribution, a son of Brigham Young walked away with \$200,000 and the average Saint was left with nothing.⁶²

Orson Hyde, who had served as President of the Quorum of the Twelve under Brigham Young for nearly three decades, averred to John Taylor half a year after Young's death that the church's own "tyrannical administration [*sic*]" had taken a serious toll on its membership. "In the Church," he wrote, "oppression has too often fallen upon portions of the Saints which has caused

⁶⁰ Mosiah Hancock of Washington complained in a letter to John Taylor that he "went into the Order 5 diferent [*sic*] times" because he "felt just about scared to death" because "Brigham Young said that if We as a People did not go into the U O the Curse of God would rest upon us." Each time he entered the Order, he wrote, it was "under the direction of Enterprising [*sic*] spirits" that "all (more or less) knew well how to feather their own Nests." Mosiah L. Hancock, Washington, Washington County, [Utah], to President Taylor, April 20, 1881, JTPP.

⁶¹ L. John Nuttall, Kanab, to President John Taylor, August 17, 1878, JTPP.

⁶² Orson Hyde, Spring City, to Prest. John Taylor, March 10, 1878, JTPP.

them to do things that were wrong for which they have been [unjustly] expelled [from] the Church.” Hyde suggested it was time for a change.⁶³ Hyde knew that Taylor, now leading the church as President of the Quorum of the Twelve Apostles, was disposed to make the changes he suggested and that he was safe in making them to him. To the extent that he could, even while Young lived, Taylor hesitated in his support of radical Mormon economic experiments such as Young’s cooperative system and the UO. He quietly censured injustices he saw in Young’s economic machine which he felt unfairly enriched certain individuals but left the rank and file poor despite promises that in Zion there would be no rich nor no poor.⁶⁴ Upon Young’s death, Taylor’s more moderate economic policies and leadership prevailed. He did what he could to help the UO die a natural death and eventually even lifted the longstanding boycott forbidding Mormons from patronizing gentile businesses.⁶⁵

The 1880 Jubilee and Pipe Springs

To prevent the collapse of the Kingdom into abject poverty, Taylor launched a new commitment to “free-will donation.” His Jubilee of 1880 was in part an attempt to make things right with aggrieved Latter-day Saints and perhaps win some lapsed Mormons back to the faith. Most of all it was an attempt to urge Latter-day Saints who had stopped paying tithing because of

⁶³ Orson Hyde, Spring City, to Prest John Taylor, February 25, 1878, JTPP. “I feel that justice and right should be more liberally dealt out to the Saints in many instances than have, heretofore, sometimes been done.” Such a change could only be effected by “by curbing the selfish[ness] and ambitions” of church leaders “in their grasping and overreaching dispositions,” and by extending “a little more latitude and generosity” by protecting the rights of average church members who tended to be much “more modest and humble in their course of life.”

⁶⁴ Woodruff, *Journal*, 7:342–343; and Charles Walker, *Diary*, 1:454. At an April 1, 1877, meeting in the St. George Tabernacle, Young ripped in to the Twelve for not more fully supporting the United Order and threatened to strip them all of their position and Priesthood. Eleven of the Twelve were present.

⁶⁵ Thomas G. Alexander, “Mormonism,” in Leonard Schlup and James G. Ryan, *Historical Dictionary of the Gilded Age*, (Armonk, NY: M. E. Sharpe, 2003), 320–321.

problems endemic to Young's economic system to "pay their tithing and be blest." As part of the 1880 Jubilee Taylor canceled \$800,000.00 in old debts to the PE Fund, nullified \$76,000 worth of "back-tithing" debts of "the deserving poor," and gave a token gift of cattle and sheep from church ranches like Pipe Springs as gifts to "the worthy poor," distributing one thousand head of cattle and five thousand sheep. Demonstrating the "nearly or quite empty" condition of the church's treasury, however, the General Church itself only gave 300 cattle to the poor while calling upon the stakes to raise another 700 for the purpose. Similarly the church only donated 2,000 sheep to the poor, while the stakes provided 3,000. While this property was miniscule in comparison to the size of the Young estate, it was an important symbol. But there were strings attached. The General Authorities taught that if "a poor widow received one of these cows that were to be donated," she was to commit herself ever after to paying "tithing butter from that cow, just as well as the rich man of his abundance." The closing mantra of the Jubilee Conference was "*Let us all pay our Tithing and be blest.*"⁶⁶

Some six weeks after Young's death, the Presiding Bishopric urged President Taylor to call for "a complete *Inventory . . .* of the entire church property, from the head of every department, so that you may have a thorough knowledge of *everything*, including Stock, Office Furniture, Grain, Hay &c &c Blacksmith's Tool's &c."⁶⁷ As part of this attempt to inventory all

⁶⁶ For general information regarding the life of John Taylor and his 1880 Jubilee, see B. H. Roberts, *The Life of John Taylor, Third President of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints* (Salt Lake City: George Q. Cannon & Sons, 1892), especially 329–338; Samuel W. Taylor, *The Kingdom or Nothing: The Life of John Taylor, Militant Mormon* (1976); Francis M. Gibbons, *John Taylor: Mormon Philosopher, Prophet of God*; Paul Thomas Smith, "John Taylor," in Leonard Arrington, ed., *The Presidents of the Church: Biographical Essays* (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book, 1986), 75–114; Edward H Anderson, *A Brief History of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints: From the Birth of the Prophet Joseph Smith to the Present Time*. (Zion, 1928), 154–156; M. F. Maxwell, "Year of the Jubilee," *New Era*, 1980. For this interpretation of the 1880 Jubilee, see JTPP and John Taylor Family Papers, UU. For specific quotations used here, see *MS 42* (1880): 294–295, and 820.

⁶⁷ Edward Hunter and L W Hardy, General Tithing Office Store, to President John Taylor, October 15, 1877, JTPP, italics in original.

church property, over the next year the Saint George stake and SUTO forwarded several lists “of the assets and Liabilities of the Church in the St George Stake.” In a September 1878 report issued by SUTO, the church was listed as owning the fort at Pipe Springs itself and adjacent real estate, which together was valued at \$13,169.40. This was “treated as Capital Stock drawing Dividend” in the WCSGC. Additionally, church cattle held by the company were valued at \$2076.24. Altogether church interests at Pipe totaled \$15,225.64.⁶⁸ About the same time this report was issued (September 1878) the WCSGC paid taxes on 70 acres of land at Pipe Springs, as well as on some “900 head of cattle and 100 head of horses.”⁶⁹ While 70 acres is not much, that same year a St. George newspaper reported that “the Winsor Herd is spread over a section of country 90 miles long by 60 wide, and they are running three da[i]ries in that section. Hurrah, we may look for some butter and cheese sometime from that quarter.”⁷⁰ What the Young estate held in the WCSGC is unknown, but when one considers the estate in its entirety was valued at 3.7 million dollars, it puts the church’s \$15,225.64 at Pipe Springs in perspective. The value of stock reported as being owned by the church in southern Utah in Taylor’s 1878 inventory was remarkably low. James G. Bleak, Clerk of SUTO in St. George provided him with the following list:

Dear Brother,

Following please find detailed statement of Amounts sent by Telegraph to you to-day of Stock held by the Church in sundry Stock Herds as per the Books of this Office:—

Canaan Co”op. Stock Co. Cattle 2617.90

⁶⁸ See John D. T. McAllister & James B. Bleak, Southern Utah Tithing Office, to President John Taylor, Salt Lake City, April 2, 1878;

⁶⁹ “Ownership of Pipe Spring,” 2, PTR, s8, b21, f329.

⁷⁰ *The St. George Union*, July 26, 1878, CHL.

Winsor Castle “ “ “	2076.24
Kanarra “ “ “	2629.48
Kolob “ “ “	168.75
Beaver “ “ “	454.05
Cedar “ “ “	511.18
Pangwich “ “ “	55.00
Parowan “ “ “	203.05
Fillmore “ “ “	86.39
Rio Virgen “ “ “	376.13
Total	\$9178.17

Of this amount \$650 is Donation to Manti Temple.

R. J. Cutler’s Herd, Sheep	6656.00
J. A. Little’s “ “	4024.00
Kane County “ “	1710.00
St George “ “	375.83
Pinto “ “	2113.13
Canfield’s “ “	88.00
Little & Co Bal. “ “	140.97
Cedar “ “	477.91
Paragoonah “ “	9.61
[Total]	\$15,595.45
Cashmere Goat Herd Total	\$325.50

Canaan Co"op. Horse Herd Total \$509.26⁷¹

Not long after assuming control of the church, Taylor sought to sell Winsor Castle and the Pipe Springs Ranch to “the cattle companies.” It appears that they had a preliminary deal early on, for on March 7, 1878 Apostle Wilford Woodruff wrote that “Fort Winsor which was built by the Church at A cost of some \$10,000. . . . was sold to the Herd Companies for \$10,000 at 10 per cent interest.” During his visit he acknowledged that “Brother Charles Pulsipher has Charge of the fort” which “had one of the best springs of soda. Cold water breaks out from under the Mountains in the fort and runs out into the farming land and waters quite a number of Acres.”⁷² With the decline of the value of the Pipe Springs range because of overgrazing and drought, the church had a difficult time enticing “herd companies” to purchase the ranch and the deal fell through. The church found itself “stuck” with Pipe Springs because no one wanted it at the price the church was asking. The Canaan and Winsor Castle cooperative stock companies now both held large parcels of damaged and unproductive rangelands. Realizing this, certain savvy stockholders began quietly withdrawing their investments in the form of livestock, leaving the companies short in actual saleable livestock, with much of their remaining capital stock tied up in real estate.⁷³ James Andrus, a heavy investor in Canaan Ranch and superintendent of the whole operation, quietly began withdrawing his huge capital investment in the form of livestock at least as early as 1877 and moving them to new ranges, leaving other investors collectively holding huge—but worn out—pieces of real estate whose value now plummeted. This left CCSC

⁷¹ James G. Bleak, Clerk, Southern Utah Tithing Office, St. George, to President John Taylor, Salt Lake City, September 10, 1878, JTPP.

⁷² Woodruff, *Journal*, 7: 402.

⁷³ Henry Eyring, Sec’y Canaan Co-op Stock Co, St. George, to Bp. James G. Bleak, St. George, December 11, 1880, JTPP.

with a poor livestock to real estate ratio. Andrus' foresight and stealthy action contributed to making him one of the wealthiest, if not the wealthiest, cattlemen in southern Utah. Eventually both the WCSGC and the CCSC issued rules prohibiting stockholders from withdrawing livestock as capital stock. Simultaneously they sought to raise funds by divesting themselves of real estate at tremendous losses. In this desperate situation, Taylor (acting as Trustee in trust) repeatedly tried to unload the Pipe Springs property onto the struggling cooperative cattle companies, and repeatedly they refused. For some time both companies "merely used" the Pipe Springs property, but eventually paid the Trustee in Trust \$200 to \$300 for rent.⁷⁴

As the range south of the Vermilion Cliffs was destroyed, various cattle companies throughout the region were forced to streamline their activities and consolidate. As early as July 1877 Kanab's cooperative cattle company, now owned by the Kanab UO, disbanded altogether and placed its cattle in the WCSGC.⁷⁵ By the spring of 1878 economic conditions had forced the WCSGC and the CCSC to begin discussing a merger.⁷⁶ Sometime near the end of 1878 a joint committee appointed by the boards of the Winsor and Canaan herds recommended the two companies merge and on January 1, 1879, "the stockholders of the Winsor Castle stock Growing Co. . . . voted unanimously to transfer the property of the Winsor Co. to the Canaan Co'op Stock Co., upon the basis proposed by the committee of the ~~joint~~ Boards." Immediately the Winsor company began "closing out their business" and Canaan voted to approve a new brand of "C & P" (standing for Canaan and Pipe Springs) to be applied to the left side of all "young stock and all the stock received into the company" from the WCSGC. On January 30, 1879, the boards of both companies met in a joint meeting and voted to turn Pipe Springs Ranch's cattle, riding

⁷⁴ CCCMM, especially 1:169–176, 122, and 2:54.

⁷⁵ L. John Nuttall, "Journal," 7 July 1877, UU.

⁷⁶ CCSCM, 1:68.

horses, equipment, hay and grain over to Canaan's superintendent James Andrus. The same day they ordered "that Supt. Pulsipher of the Winsor Co be instructed to immediately turn over to Supt Andrus of the Canaan Co, as much room in the buildings at the Winsor Ranch, as he may need for the use of himself and hands," and that Pulsipher turn over all other miscellaneous property at Pipe Springs Ranch "at a price to be agreed upon by them and in case of disagreement, James S Emmett to act as umpire."⁷⁷

Water resources were discussed in detail. Pulsipher and Andrus and a "committee appointed to locate reservoirs on the Ranches," reported they had selected a spot for an earthen tank to catch rainwater at "Sheep Gulch about 12 miles from Winsor Castle" requiring "a wall and bank about 18 Rods long and 4 feet high to raise the water the necessary height." They employed Archibald McNeill "to improve the watering places at the Cottonwood[,] Antelope & Cedar Ridge Springs, and that the work be done immediately."⁷⁸ Apparently James Andrus, his wife Manomus, and an adopted Paiute son (all three of whom had been living at the ranch house at Canaan Ranch) moved directly to Pipe Springs, and by mid-March the Canaan Company voted that Andrus be authorized "to furnish the Winsor Castle House with the necessary furniture and fittings for the convenience of the family or families residing there, *and for keeping travelers.*" Thus it appears that Andrus replaced Pulsipher by March 1879 and that the CCSC had fully swallowed up the WCSCG, though its board continued to operate for some time.⁷⁹ The church still owned Winsor Castle and its range, and while it repeatedly offered to sell the Pipe

CCSCM, 1:68.

1:85–88.

⁷⁸ CCSCM, 1:90–91.

⁷⁹ CCSCM, 1:92–93, and 173.

Springs Ranch to the Canaan Co-op, the latter chose only to rent to avoid tying too much of its wealth in real estate.

On May 5, 1879, Superintendent Andrus telegraphed Erastus Snow and the Canaan Board of Directors that there was no longer any edible grass in the entire Kanab-Pipe Springs region. He warned that the cattle “will die if not moved” at once “to upper Kanab” or more distant ranges. “Answer immediately,” he pled, “as there is a drive here today & tomorrow.” Within hours Andrus received permission and he and his cowboys saved the suffering herds.⁸⁰ Three weeks later Andrus reported to the board that “the ranges are very dry, no rains for a long time, and in consequence it had become necessary to scatter the stock about on the best ranges, thereby making it impossible to gather and count the stock this year, without danger of sevier loss.” By July 21, 1879, Andrus reported that the ranges were still “very dry and the cattle are suffering considerably.” Throughout the summer and fall hundreds of cattle “died from the scarcity of water & grass.” Unable to number livestock scattered over a gigantic range, losses or gains could not be passed on to stockholders and therefore no dividends could be declared. Stockholders naturally grumbled. In the midst of the crisis, cagey James Andrus tendered his resignation as superintendent (while still functioning as vice president and remaining a powerful political force to be reckoned with in the company) and he continued to draw his own substantial investment out of the Canaan Co-op.⁸¹ This did not significantly diminish his role in the CCSC, nor of his leadership among Arizona Strip cowboys. For nearly three decades to come he presided over gigantic biannual multi-company pan-Hurricane Plateau roundups, most of which were held at Pipe Springs.

⁸⁰ James Andrus, Supt, Kanab, to Prest E Snow or Board of Directors Canaan Stock Co., May 5, 1879, in CCSCM, 1:93-94.

⁸¹ CCSCM, 1:96-98.

James Andrus, Bishop of the Cowboys

Popular and energetic former Native American-fighter James Andrus had widespread support throughout Dixie.⁸² Making no pretense at piety, James Andrus was idolized by the hundreds of young Mormon cowboys who rode for him as he directed roundups at Pipe Springs for decades. But the more pious sort, including many of the Dixie women, felt he “was one of the worst examples ever given the young people,” especially because of his unbridled profanity and his unabashed use of alcohol and tobacco. But that very quality fitted him well to command the rougher sort that congregated around the corrals, branding fires, chuck wagons, and company bunkhouses on the Arizona Strip. A cowboy of a somewhat more pious breed, Dee Woolley, described that the Canaan boss “was quite a character, but he was also a detriment to the living of a Christian life and morality in the early days of S.T. George [*sic*].” But for all that, he was a respected cattle company executive who got things done and he seemed the better fit for the task of amalgamating the Canaan and Winsor Castle companies than the less experienced and more

⁸² Dee Woolley said that Andrus was “profane, ignorant, unreliable, [and] a hard drinker and smoker,” none of which were supposed to be traits of a good Mormon. Elizabeth Woolley Jensen, “Notes on Father[’s] Life,” **WSC unnumbered 1:27,5**. Unless otherwise stated, the information in this section on James Andrus comes from “James Andrus, Ex-Representative,” in S.A. Kenner, *Utah As It Is: With a Comprehensive Statement of Utah As it Was, Showing the Founding, Growth and Present Status of the Commonwealth* (Salt Lake City, The Deseret News, 1904), 60, and 462–463; Datie Webb, “James Andrus History,” in “Southern Utah Pioneers,” WCL; Alexander Burto Andrus, “Biographical Sketch of James Andrus,” “The Life of Laura Altha Gibson Andrus,” and “A Brief History of the Life of Manomas Lovina Gibson Andrus,” all in *The Andrus Recorder*, 11 (December 1975), miloandrus.org; “Bishop James Andrus,” in *Washington County News*, December 12, 1914, 14, UDN; “James Andrus—Biographical,” Charles Kelly Papers, USHS; “Capt. James Andrus,” in *Washington County Biographies*, http://genealogytrails.com/utah/washington/bios_andrus.html; Mable Jarvis, “Pioneer Personal History Interview with Manomas Lavinia Gibson Andrus, St. George, Utah, Wife of: Captain James Andrus,” WCL; Mable Jarvis, “Biography of Manomas Lavinia Gibson Andrus, 1842–1922,” BYU, 4–6; and CCSCM.

pious Pulsipher. Perhaps sensing he was out of his element, Pulsipher authored and promoted the WCSGC/CCSC merger that ultimately ended his career at Pipe Springs.⁸³

James Andrus dominated the Canaan-Pipe range for over half a century and had much to do with Winsor Castle itself. The oldest son of early Mormon convert Milo Andrus, James had been baptized as a boy by First Counsellor to Joseph Smith. He experienced all of the persecutions and tumultuous events of Mormonism's Missouri and Illinois periods, and in his early teens Andrus was brought into significant contact with the Ponca, Pawnee, Pottawatomie, and Sioux as part of various Mormon emigration groups. He even lived for an extended period in a Pawnee village in Nebraska before crossing the plains for the first time at fourteen years of age. Tough, wiry, and well-built, Andrus was described as the perfect pattern of virility. "No finer specimen [*sic*] of manhood ever sat upon a horse," it was said. "Six feet [and] one inch in height, and weighing in his prime 230 pounds, he was always riding on the finest horses that money and breeding could produce." Comparing his father to the finest of his stallions, one of Andrus' sons wrote that "Cow horses are not raised, but are 'born,' just like cowboys. Many men worked at the cow business all their lives and never became efficient cow-hands. A good cowpuncher can ride a hackamore colt into a herd of cattle, and he will know at once whether the animal is a good cow horse." According to all accounts, James Andrus was a born cowboy.⁸⁴

Andrus was representative of an entire generation of frontier Mormons who were only nominally religious, having been hardened by the scrappy, bite-and-scratch violence of the early Mormon experience and steeled by the fighting for a livelihood in their new homeland in the wilderness. Like other Mormons, Andrus was willing to follow his church and prophet anywhere

⁸³ Charles Pulsipher, "Record," 39.

⁸⁴ Alexander Andrus, "Biographical Sketch of James Andrus," in *The Andrus Recorder* 11 (December 1975), in www.miloandrus.org.

and became Brigham Young's right-hand man in the St. George cattle industry. The success of Young's New Canaan plan was to Andrus's credit; early on Andrus and his coreligionists discovered he had a knack for dealing with Native Americans. Andrus was a man of action and could wield quick, stern, and unequivocal force when he felt it necessary. Though this caused many natives to fear him, they were just the qualities that made local Native Americans whisper his name with a strange mixture of dread, love, hate, and respect. Known throughout Utah and Arizona as an Indian Killer, Andrus nonetheless spent his life among Native Americans and reportedly "could do more with the Indians than any other resident of this part of the state and [he] had the faculty of making friends of them all."⁸⁵

During the winter of 1860–1861, Andrus traded horses among the Nez Perce, Flathead, Black Foot, and Shoshone of Washington Territory. He and several other enterprising young Mormons established trading posts "in Deer Lodge Valley, on the head waters of the Missouri, directly on Lieut. Mullen's wagon road from Fort Benton on the Missouri, to Walla Walla, Oregon" some "four hundred and thirty miles distant from Great Sal[t] Lake City." In the spring of 1861 he returned to Mormondom with a band of "eighty or ninety" horses to trade off.⁸⁶ Called to Dixie in 1861, he settled in Grafton, and almost immediately moved his cattle onto the Hurricane Plateau. A true pioneer of the cattle industry on the Arizona Strip, throughout the 1860s he based his large herds of horses and cattle at a spring he named after himself. Andrus went east to bring Mormon emigrants from the Missouri River several times. He reportedly crossed the Great Plains seven times and "made three round trips over the old trail from Utah to

⁸⁵ Andrus, "Biographical Sketch"; and Noble Warrum, *Utah Since Statehood: Historical and Biographical* (Chicago: The S. J. Clarke Publishing Company, 1920), 745.

⁸⁶ *Deseret News*, 1 May 1861, UDN.

California.”⁸⁷ He led one of the Nauvoo Legion detachments that went out to Pipe Springs in January 1865 to retrieve the bodies of James M. Whitmore and Robert McIntyre, and played a role in the brutal slaughter of Paiute that followed. Referring to his service in the Black Hawk and Navajo Wars, it was said, “there was ‘heaps of fighting’ before it was all over, in which James Andrus, now bishop of St. George, showed himself to be one of the most intrepid and sagacious Indian fighters in the business.”⁸⁸

When the Canaan Cooperative was established in 1870, Andrus’ herd was the nucleus around which others were gathered.⁸⁹ The grasslands around Andrus Springs and nearby Short Creek were designated as Canaan Ranch’s “home ranges.” Andrus moved his plural wife Manomus Gibson to Andrus Springs, where for several years she lived in a wagon box set on the ground and covered with canvas. There she cooked meals for the large cadre of Canaan cowboys who congregated there. Eventually a rock house was built for Manomus at Andrus Springs, which served as headquarters of Canaan Ranch, and Andrus Springs began to be called Canaan Springs. There Manomus lived with her husband and an adopted Paiute son skimming “thirty pans of milk a day” to make butter, which she “sent to St. George to the stockholders of the company.” In 1879 James, Manomus, and their son moved to Winsor Castle when it became headquarters of the CCSC. James and Manomus reportedly lived at Pipe Springs for a year.⁹⁰

After Andrus “tendered his resignation” as superintendent of the combined CCSC on July 21, 1879,⁹¹ James Emmett succeeded him as superintendent. However Andrus continued to play an

⁸⁷ “Capt. James Andrus,” Washington County Biographies.

⁸⁸ S. A. Kenner, *Utah As It Is: With a Comprehensive Statement of Utah As it Was, Showing the Founding, Growth and Present Status of the Commonwealth* (Salt Lake City, The Deseret News, 1904), 60.

⁸⁹ Warrum, *Utah Since Statehood*, 745. One early Utah historian wrote that “the success which he achieved in his young manhood led to his being given charge of the common herd of the Mormon church.”

⁹⁰ “Brief History of Manomas Andrus.”

⁹¹ CCSCM, 2:98.

executive role in the company and Emmett never saw fit to fully release him from his role as General Manager. According to his son Alexander, James Andrus remained “in charge of this company for twenty-five years.” After he resigned as superintendent, he remained on company payroll and was asked to market its cattle and direct its roundups.⁹² No matter who was officially superintendent of Canaan Range, Andrus held the position as chief or “bishop” of the cowboys by acclamation. When he resigned and went into business for himself, he became “the leading stockraiser” in the entire section. He eventually purchased the largest commercial organization in southern Utah (Woolley, Lund, and Judd Mercantile Company) which was renamed “James Andrus & Sons,” and he became vice president of the Bank of St. George. When a portion of the old Deseret Telegraph Company became a telephone company, he purchased it and presided over it for years. In 1896 the bishop of the cowboys was actually called as the bishop of the “consolidated four wards of St. George for nine years.”⁹³ Andrus was highly involved in local, territorial, and even national politics. He served in important roles as Washington County Commissioner, Utah Territorial Legislator, and he even served as “presidential elector from Utah on the Democratic ticket in the election of 1912.” As it announced his death, the *Washington County News* stated that “in financial matters he acquired more means than any man in this part of the country, being eminently successful as a stockman, merchant and banker. . . . With his passing goes a splendid type of the kind of men that build well.”⁹⁴ Ten years before his death, an early history of Utah made this bold but substantially true claim: “Foremost among the

⁹² See for example CCSCM, 2:28.

⁹³ S. A. Kenner, *Utah As It Is: With a Comprehensive Statement of Utah As it Was, Showing the Founding, Growth and Present Status of the Commonwealth* (Salt Lake City, The Deseret News, 1904), 463.

⁹⁴ “Bishop James Andrus,” *Washington County News*, December 10, 1914, 14.

frontiersmen, colonizers and community builders of the great West stands the man whose name appears above . . . James Andrus.”⁹⁵

On the Road to Arizona

As the decade of the 1870s closed, traffic on various spurs of the Mormon Corridor increased dramatically, driven by national attention to the practice of polygamy. Brigham Young had secured federal promises not to prosecute high church leaders, but in 1876 the Utah Territorial Supreme Court upheld a lower court’s decision which sentenced George Reynolds, Young’s personal secretary. Convicted just before Christmas in 1875, George Reynolds was sentenced to pay a \$500 fine and to spend two years at hard labor in the Federal house of corrections in Detroit. Church leaders in Kanab prepared for an immediate and massive immigration of threatened polygamists. The Detroit *Free Press* reported that “the Mormons will soon emigrate to New Mexico or Arizona” as “Brigham admits that Congress and the Courts have begun to make the situation of the Mormon brethern in Salt Lake City rather unpleasant.” Meanwhile the *Salt Lake Tribune* reported that Young was at Kanab ready “to cross the border” if “the Grand Jury has found indictments” against him.⁹⁶ The first major waves of Mormon emigrants into Arizona since the collapse of the 1873 mission began to sweep across the Colorado. From 1876 to 1878, hundreds of families left their homes and livelihoods in Utah and headed to Arizona, fleeing anti-polygamy prosecution. This freshet turned into a torrent in 1878 when *Reynolds vs. the United States* was finally heard by the US Supreme Court, and swelled

⁹⁵ S. A. Kenner, *Utah*, 462–463.

⁹⁶ *Salt Lake Tribune*, June 18, 1876, 4, UDN.

even more dramatically after January 1879, when the court announced its decision that the laws prohibiting plural marriage were indeed constitutional and that Mormons could be prosecuted to the full extent of the law.

By then the route from northern Utah down the Sevier Valley to Kanab was open and much of the traffic from the north missed Pipe Springs. But hundreds of polygamists fleeing their homes in southwestern Utah and the numerous northerners who wanted to secure their blessings in the St. George Temple before leaving Utah, watered their animals in the small ponds and cattle troughs that had been built beside Winsor Castle. They filled their barrels with cold pure water from the spring as they headed across the desert towards the Colorado. For years to come, this unhappy immigration continued and hundreds upon hundreds of wagons loaded with supplies, household goods, sorrowing wives and children passed literally *through* Winsor Castle, the main spur of road still running through its massive gates, under its wooden catwalks, and between its buildings. Thus over many years the old fort at Pipe Springs fulfilled one of the major purposes it was built for. Part of a Mormon master plan, President George A. Smith had written to Jacob Hamblin: “It will be necessary to make a wagon road to the Colorado, and to establish a safe and sufficient ferry, [and to] establish fortified houses at the principal watering places on the route, such as are safe [to] keep herds of cattle . . . it would do much to render traveling safe.”⁹⁷

Simultaneous to the greatly increased exodus of Latter-day Saints to Arizona in the wake of the 1879 Reynolds decision, drought, overgrazing, and further damage to the range wrought by grasshopper infestations caused some Mormon stockmen to move their cattle into Arizona. Joseph W. Smith wrote that the ferry-boat at Lees Ferry was “overworked crossing cattle”

⁹⁷ George A. Smith, SLC, to Jacob Hamblin, February 16, 1873, **PTR, Incoming BY, NAU, taken from HBY 175.**

because “Utah was at this time driving a great many of her surplus herds into Arizona.”⁹⁸ Canaan and Winsor Castle company scrip, along with SUTO and Rio Virgin Manufacturing Company scrip, were the primary currencies in use in Utah’s Dixie during this period. Mormons also used tithing offices and church-controlled cattle companies to transfer wealth on paper “through the Tithing Office” rather than physically transport it “over land” as they moved to Arizona and New Mexico and later to Mexico. When Charles N. Carroll of Heber City in Northern Utah joined the UO in Orderville in 1877, Orderville’s bishop directed him to “exchange” his Heber City cattle “for stock in the Winsor herd down here,” thus saving himself and the Order the trouble and expense of driving the herd overland. This was done by delivering cattle to one tithing office and withdrawing the same number from another. Such transfers were usually authorized verbally by high ranking church leaders, but accounts were kept at participating tithing office and entered at the General Tithing Office in Salt Lake City.⁹⁹

As more and more cattle-owning Mormons moved from Northern Utah to Arizona, the practice of transferring stock via tithing office or cooperative herd exchange accelerated. They exchanged flour in the same way. When Lorenzo Hill Hatch, the bishop of Franklin, Idaho, was called as a Native American missionary to serve in Arizona and New Mexico, he had 125 bushels of wheat credited to his account in the Franklin tithing office, and wrote President Taylor asking to exchange it for “Tithing wheat at Sunset Brigham City or St Joseph” in Arizona. Rather than drive his personal herd six or seven hundred miles, he turned them over to the Franklin tithing office which he, as bishop, was in charge of. Hatch obtained a draft which he

⁹⁸ Joseph West Smith, *Journal of Joseph West Smith: The Life Story of an Arizona Pioneer, 1859–1944* (Mesa, AZ: Children of Joseph W. Smith, n.d.), 21, CHL. Special thanks to Michael Landon of the CHL staff for bringing this to my attention.

⁹⁹ Howard O. Spencer, Orderville, to Brother Carroll, June 1, 1877, in Annie Porter Seaman, “Alvin Franklin Heaton,” note 12, CHL.

presented to the proprietors of the CCSC and withdrew the exact number of cattle at Pipe Springs as he had delivered to the tithing office in Idaho.¹⁰⁰ This transfer of cattle through tithing offices happened again and again, from just a head or two, to hundreds. In this sense, Pipe Springs and its related cattle companies and tithing offices functioned as components of a pioneer banking system capable of transferring funds in the form of livestock from one locale to another by simply changing numbers in account books. Winsor Castle, Canaan Co-op, or TO scrip as well as handwritten drafts constituted “the paper” facilitating and documenting such transactions.¹⁰¹

Mormons were simply reinventing a system developed centuries earlier by Knights Templars and other religious capitalists during the heyday of the great medieval pilgrimages and crusades as they transferred wealth deposited at one spot on a great pilgrimage trail and transferred its value on paper to another. With confiscation of church and personal property again looming in Utah, church authorities and individuals were anxious to send as many cattle south into Arizona as possible. But the whole process of exchange and transfer was contingent on the willingness and competency of bishops and tithing office functionaries and cooperative herd employees. Rank and file Latter-day Saints sometimes felt that the quality of stock they “deposited” in the north was much higher than the quality they drew out in the South, or that they waited unreasonable lengths of time to obtain their cattle from newly founded, unorganized, and barren Arizona tithing offices and cooperative herds. As Eastern Arizona stake President

¹⁰⁰ L. H. Hatch, Franklin, Idaho, to Prest John Taylor, November 9, 1877, JTPP; and L. H. Hatch, Woodruff, Arizona, to President Taylor, October 28, 1878, JTPP.

¹⁰¹ L. John Nuttall, SLC, U. T., to Bp. W. D. Johnson, Jr., Kanab, June 28, 1880, PTR, b20, f317; and Thomas J. Jones, Parowan, to Prest John Taylor, May 7, 1881, JTPP.

Jesse N. Smith wrote to John Taylor, these “tithing exchanges” were often resulted in “unhappy experiences” for both leaders and Saints.¹⁰²

In 1879 Ammon Tenney, one of the original discoverers of Pipe Springs some twenty-one years earlier, was directed by Apostle Wilford Woodruff to purchase a large tract of land at the site of modern St. Johns, near Arizona’s White Mountains. The remote location, flush with grama grass, was to be a major sanctuary for polygamists fleeing Utah. Apostle Woodruff, himself a polygamist fugitive in Arizona going under the pseudonym “Lewis Allen,” instructed Tenney to purchase some 12,000 acres from Jewish-Prussian merchant brothers named Barth who allegedly had won the land in poker game. A deal had been struck and tentatively approved by local church leaders to purchase the land for 750 “American cows” to be delivered one year from the date of purchase. At San Juan, a nearby village, a population of approximately 100 Hispanic families was augmented by a rough crowd of approximately 600 American cowboys, freighters, merchants, highwaymen, and gamblers who felt that they had some claim to the same acreage the Barths proposed to sell to the Mormons.¹⁰³ Woodruff confided to his personal journal that when he learned that Barth brothers had accepted a tentative offer, he “went to bed, slept until 12 o’clock and [abruptly] awoke.” Then the “Spirit of the Lord . . . said to me, arise[,] tarry not” and “close the bargain, buy St John and send the missionaries to take possession of the Colorado Meadows.” A wagon train of polygamists was promptly dispatched to take possession of what he called the “Colorado meadows” near San Juan. The missionaries sent to St. Johns

¹⁰² Ibid., L. John Nuttall, Salt Lake City, U. T., to Elder David K. Udall, Kanab, July 12, 1880, David K. Udall Correspondence, CHL; L. John Nuttall, SLC, UT, to Bp. W. D. Johnson, Jr., Kanab, June 28, 1880; Wilford Woodruff, Sunset, Apache County, Arizona, to Prest. John Taylor, January 13, 1880, JTPP; and Jesse N. Smith, Snowflake, to President John Taylor, November 22, 1880.

¹⁰³ Woodruff, *Journal*, 7:531–532; Cameron Udall, *St. Johns*, Images of America Series, (Charleston, SC: Arcadia Publishing, in partnership with the Arizona Historical Foundation, 2008), especially 9–10; and David Udall and Pearl Nelson, *Arizona Pioneer Mormon*, 66–96.

were directed “to turn out in payment for the land, oxen, horses, wagons, harness, or anything they have to help pay for it,” but they did not have the 750 head of high quality American cattle nor the means to purchase them. Tenney, president of the New Mexican Lamanite Mission, had acted under Apostle Woodruff’s direction in signing the contract, but was now told that *he* was responsible to fill it. Unable to raise the animals the contract demanded among the Arizona immigrants, Tenney attempted to get out from under the financial obligation by tendering his resignation as president of the mission. Apostles Erastus Snow and Brigham Young, Jr., however, refused to accept it, saying he could not “well be released” from his responsibility “untill [*sic*] after the next payment is made in November . . . and until Bishop Udall, who is now here on his way to St. Johns, is enabled to receive the business from your and assume your contract.”

When David K. Udall and his wife (Ella Stewart, Winsor Castle’s first telegrapher) arrived at St. Johns in October 1880, he inherited the debt and responsibility for blocking Hispanic expansion into “Mormon lands.”¹⁰⁴ It appears that private saints and nascent tithing offices south of the Colorado provided the first 300 of the 750 head tally to pay for St. Johns, but the deal was still in jeopardy and both the Barths and Mexican settlers pressed their claims to the same lands. Desperate for a solution, in the dead of winter Udall rode the 700 mile trip to Utah from Southeastern Arizona on horseback to lay the situation before President Taylor. Udall later wrote that “President John Taylor and his associates received me kindly” and eventually “requested the presiding bishop, Edward Hunter, to give me an order for 450 cows from the

¹⁰⁴ Cameron Udall, *St. Johns*, 9–10; David Udall and Pearl Nelson, *Arizona Pioneer Mormon*, especially 74; and Wilford Woodruff, SLC, to Ammon M. Tenney, May 27, 1880, in JH, 31 May 1880, 9; Erastus Snow and Brigham Young, Jr., Brigham City, Apache County, Arizona, to Ammon M. Tenney, September 30, 1880, in JH, September 30, 1880, 7–8.

Canaan herd of Church cattle running on the range near Pipe Springs. . . . The local cowboys helped us gather our 450 cows and drive them to the Colorado River at Lee’s Ferry.” Some of the cowboys “were Ella’s brothers.” Udall reflected “This was my first and only experience in the role of cowboy. . . . We reached St. Johns the middle of February 1881.” Bishop Udall wrote that it had been “a strenuous winter’s work,” but that they lost very few cattle. He turned the Pipe Springs animals over to the Barth brothers “in complete payment of the purchase debt.” The loan of the cattle was not a gift and would somehow have to be paid back.¹⁰⁵ Half a century later, when David K. Udall became the first president of the Mesa Arizona Temple of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, his drive of “wild” cattle from the Canaan herd at Pipe Springs had assumed almost mythic qualities, and Udall was heralded as having almost single-handedly saved Mormon settlement in Arizona through this and other monumental acts.¹⁰⁶

By the time David K. Udall rode south with several hundred head of church cattle in January 1881, the Pipe Springs Ranch was desolate and both the Church and the CCSC were

¹⁰⁵ Udall and Nelson, *Arizona Pioneer*, 81–83. Bishop Udall wrote that “the Church did not buy the land to give to our people. It advanced the payment as a loan and expected the settlers gradually to pay the debt. But droughts and persecutions came, and it took many years to meet the obligation. Many settlers stayed only a short time and then moved elsewhere, turning the land back to the ward. The land proved to be poor. There was much dissatisfaction and it was a difficult situation from many angles. Finally there were compromises and concessions, and the St. Johns’ purchase accounts were settled, thus closing that particular chapter in our history.” Udall and Nelson, *Arizona Pioneer*, 83. See also David K. Udall, St. Johns, Arizona, to Prest John Taylor, Salt Lake City, October 23, 1880, JTPP. In addition to the specific citations used above, references for this section on the St. Johns purchase include C. LeRoy and Mabel R. Wilhelm, *A History of the St. Johns Arizona Stake: The Triumph of Man and His Religion Over the Perils of a Raw Frontier* (Orem, UT: Historical Publications, 1982), especially 20–37; Udall and Nelson, *Arizona Pioneer*, 66–83, and 88; Charles B. Wolf, *Sol Barth of St. Johns: The Story of an Arizona Pioneer* (n.p., 2002), especially 19–22; Correspondence of David K. Udall with John Taylor, in JTPP; Jesse N. Smith, Snowflake, to President John Taylor, November 22, 1880, JTPP; John Taylor, President’s Office, to the Superintendent of the Canaan and Winsor Stock Growing Companies, December 11, 1880, JTPP; L. John Nuttall, Salt Lake City, to Bp Wm. D. Johnson, Jr., December 11, 1880, JTPP; Henry Eyring, Sec’y Canaan Co-op Stock Co., St. George, to Bp. James G. Bleak, St. George, December 11, 1880, JTPP; JH, November 22, 1879, 5, November 25, 1879, 9, November 24, 1879, 3, January 1, 1880, 2, May 27, 1880, 7, May 31, 1880, 9, September 30, 1880, 7; L. John Nuttall to Bp. W. D. Johnson, Kanab, June 12, 1880, and January 5, 1881, in PTR, b20, f317.

¹⁰⁶ “Fighting Mormon Dave Udall: For 50 Years He Has Used His Fists to Establish and Maintain Peace and Build Up in the Arizona Desert a Million Dollar Mecca for Disciples of the Church of Latter Day Saints,” in *Miami Daily News-Record* (Miami, OK), June 30, 1921, 21, NPC.

making every effort to close down their connections with the foundering operation. With the range thus left desolate, using some of the church cattle to purchase St. Johns nearly destroyed the co-op. The company had tried to prevent such a large withdrawal of stock and the Board originally refused Taylor, explaining that days before his request they had passed a measure “that no more horned stock be paid out on Capital stock accounts except milch cows and beeves for individual family use.” They explained that “This measure became necessary for the protection of the Company, to prevent large stock holders from withdrawing their interest and leaving the heavy proportion of Real Estate, owned by the Company in the hands of a few.” They further attempted to excuse themselves by stating that “even were the Board fully at liberty to act in this matter, it would be impossible to collect stock at this season of the year, without endangering their lives.” Taylor knew that his authority permitted him to demand the cattle for the St. Johns purchase. The CCSC Board reacted almost immediately against Taylor’s coercing the withdrawal and on January 8, 1881, the CCSC Board of Directors turned the real estate of the Pipe Springs Ranch out of its stewardship and back to the management of the Trustee in Trust. The CCSC superintendent was then living at Winsor Castle. Desiring to use him elsewhere, the Board requested Taylor to immediately “send some person there to take charge of it in behalf of the church.” The terse note explained that “owing to the Company owning a large proportion of real estate as compared with Live Stock, we are of necessity compelled to curtail our expenses,” and that they were thus forced “to dispense with the use of the Winsor Castle Property.”¹⁰⁷

With the failure of the range, many were convinced the Canaan Cooperative was dying and opportunists both within and outside of the church were watching it like vultures. For some

¹⁰⁷ Henry Eyring, Sec’y Canaan Co-op Stock Co., St. George, to Bp. James G. Bleak, St. George, December 11, 1880, JTPP.

time representatives of the much smaller Kanab Cooperative Cattle Company or KCCC (which along with other investors had already taken their stock out of the Winsor Castle-Canaan Ranch conglomerate) had been watching the CCSC implode and wanted to obtain portions of its property for “pennies on the dollar.” As early as October 12, 1880, the Bishop of Kanab, William D. Johnson, Jr., was laying plans to obtain two important pieces of CCSC property. First, Bishop Johnson wrote Kanab Stake President John Nuttall: “I made arrangements with Pres’t Snow whereby I think we will purchase the moccasin farm of Canaan Herd for our Indians for \$1,000.00.” Second, Johnson made an offer on the Pipe Springs Ranch on behalf of the KCCC. A year earlier the Winsor Castle property had been valued at \$13,000, but because of the collapse of the range, Johnson wrote, “The fort & many improvements that have been made there would be of no use to any company or Herd now [except Kanab’s] & I think \$3000.00 would be enough for it. Will you please think of this & if you deem wise for us to buy it for our herd see if Bro Taylor will let us have it at our proposition.”¹⁰⁸ At first the presiding bishopric’s office, which administered church properties under the Trustee in Trust, “recommended that it be placed in the care of some suitable person in behalf of the Church.” Trustee in Trust Taylor directed Nuttall to “have a suitable person *called* from the Kanab Stake” to care for the property in such a manner as there would be no “expense to the Church.” Nuttall had tendered the Kanab Co-op’s offer to purchase Pipe for \$3,000, but deeming it a bad time to sell, Taylor was willing for the Kanab Herd to occupy the premises rent-free in exchange for maintenance of the property. Church leaders were determined to keep Pipe from getting “jumped by outsiders.” They needed a

¹⁰⁸ W. D. Johnson, Jr., Kanab, to L. Jon Nutall, Salt Lake, October 12, 1880, JTPP. “I am not surprised at the condition of the Canaan Herd, and look for their dissolution.”

reliable man or men “to take care of houses-stables-corrals-yards-Reservoir etc. and see that no portion thereof go to waste, or is destroyed.”¹⁰⁹

The KCCC was slow to act on President Taylor’s offer. With the range depleted, many Kanab families were taking their starving cattle and permanently leaving the area. Despite the initial interest in renting or buying Pipe Springs when Canaan Ranch handed it back to the church, finding “a good reliable man with [a] wife and small family” actually willing to take it over became a difficult task. President Nuttall and Bishop Johnson pushed the KCCC and individual stockmen to take possession of it for free, but considering its barren range no one was willing. Believing the range would come back, cattle dealers Frank Webber and Joseph Sawyer occupied the vacant Winsor Castle while they improved Anson Winsor’s abandoned ranch at nearby Two Mile Run in a blatant attempt to jump them both. To keep Webber from obtaining Pipe, Nuttall finally prevailed upon the Orderville UO (OUO) to take up the Pipe Springs Ranch for a time.¹¹⁰ After applying significant pressure to get someone from Kanab to take possession of Pipe Springs, on February President 24, L. John Nuttall wrote Bishop Johnson that he was “sorry there does not appear to be any person at Kanab interested in taking care of the Winsor property.” As a last ditch effort to “wake up” the Kanab Co-op to the opportunity, he threatened to “apply to Bros Spencer and Chamberlain” heads of the OUO, “and should I fail there, some party from the city [Salt Lake] may be induced to go as the property *must* be cared for.”¹¹¹ There had been serious talk of wealthy Salt Lake City businessman William Jennings bringing cattle from the north to run at Pipe Springs, but at a March 15, 1881, board meeting of the OUO “a

¹⁰⁹ L. John Nuttall to Bp. W. D. Johnson, Jr., Kanab, January 5, 1881, JTPP.

¹¹⁰ See L. John Nuttall correspondence in PTR, s8, b20, f317.

¹¹¹ L. John Nuttall to Bp. W. D. Johnson, Kanab, February 24, 1881, and L. John Nuttall to Elder James L. Bunting, Kanab, January 2, 1883, both in PTR, s8, b20, f317, italics mine.

letter was read from Pres. L. John Nuttall concerning the Winsor and Pipe Spring properties, Requesting that we take charge and protect it for the Church from destruction and evil disposed travelers.” The property came rent-free with the only stipulation “to care for the property.”¹¹²

Isaac Losee, on behalf of the OUO, officially took charge of Pipe Springs Ranch on April 10, 1881. Though Winsor Castle was less than ten years old, irresponsible travelers and hard-living cowboys had already made a wreck of the buildings. The understanding between the church and the Order was that the buildings would be repaired. Orderville’s leaders, however, were shrewd and parsimonious businesses men and kept Isaac Losee occupied with the Order’s stock interests. This caused James Bleak, an officer of the St. George Stake, the tithing office, and the CCSC to complain to his diary that under the Losee’s occupancy “nothing [was] done to repair the buildg[s].”¹¹³ To raise some much needed cash, the leaders of the OUO rented Sawyer and Webber “a room at the castle” under the watch of Losee and his young family. Nuttall, under President Taylor’s direction, had tried to keep Sawyer and Webber out of Winsor Castle.

Apparently feeling their rent payments came with entitlements, Sawyer and Webber gathered some 800 head of cattle on the Pipe Springs range without paying for it, intending to winter them there and drive them to California in the spring of 1882. When Erastus Snow was made aware of the situation, he telegraphed President Taylor asking: “should not [Webber and Sawyer] be required to pay also for use of [the] range [at Pipe Springs and Moccasin?]” The church could not “afford to allow strangers to occupy those ranges and possibly pray [*sic*] upon our Stock,

¹¹² “Historical Items of the O. U. O.” in James Godson Bleak Papers, USHS, b2, f4.

¹¹³ James Bleak, Diary, July 7, 1881, CHL.

without a definite recognition of our rights.”¹¹⁴ The next day Taylor directed Nuttall to send Canaan Superintendent James Emmett to collect rent from Webber and Sawyer.¹¹⁵

Little is known of the Losse’s year-and-a-half long tenure at Pipe “holding down the fort” for both the Church and the Order. On the roughly twenty acres then irrigated by the springs, Isaac raised corn and hay which was hauled off to Orderville. Isaac’s wife Esther bore a child there on April 27, 1882.¹¹⁶ The OUO showed better than any other order in all Mormondom that Brigham Young’s economic ideas could actually work—at least in the short run. During this time of economic downturn, the OUO gobbled up ranches, farms, and herd grounds and probably found that they simply could not manage their own massive holdings and the church’s too, and they pulled the Losees back to their farm at Moccasin.¹¹⁷ Orderville’s oversight at Pipe seems to have concluded by November 1882, for by the 18th of that month President Taylor was again pressing for the Kanab Co-op or other responsible parties in Kanab to take charge of Winsor Castle. Nuttall wrote to Bishop Johnson in Kanab that the Pipe Springs Ranch’s “valuable property must be taken care of and kept out of the hands of outsiders.” Referring to the leaders of the church, he wrote that “the owners do not want to sell but it can be rented.” Nuttall stated he was definitely “in favor” of “the Kanab Stock Herd Company renting the Pipe Springs property which I think they should do and ought to have done so [more than] a year ago when the matter was presented to them.” In addition to preserving the investment of the church by caring for the

¹¹⁴ Telegraph of Erastus Snow, Toquerville, to John Taylor, Kanab, November 16, 1881, JTPP.

¹¹⁵ Nuttall, “Diary,” November 17, 1881, in PTR, s8, b20, f317.

¹¹⁶ Thomas Chamberlain, Diary, September 17, 1881; and PSLA, VH, FH, Losee. The child was named Warren and will be heard of again in these pages.

¹¹⁷ For inventory of properties owned by OUO, see “Financial Statement of Orderville United Order for the year [1884],” in “Papers Pertaining to the Orderville United Order,” 1874–1885, CHL, LR 6543/27. See also “Orderville Historical Record, 1873–1911,” CHL, LR 6543/29, especially 200–208, and 211–215.

fortress and related buildings, he hated “to let our enemies use the range and deprive our people of the benefits thereof.”¹¹⁸

That “outsider Webber” was still in the country, and he and Sawyer and their cowboys (who included both Mormons and gentiles) were suspected of stealing cattle from the Canaan herd and placing their own and Webber’s brands on them. During the early eighties, Erastus Snow, President Taylor, President Nuttall, and the CCSC Board of Directors were convinced that Webber and his growing operation planned on jumping both the Pipe Springs and Two Mile ranches. They believed Webber actually had a Mormon surrogate named Oliver L. Robison, Jr. “jump” Two Mile Springs on his behalf late in 1881. Erastus Snow, acting as President of the CCSC, sent Robison a threatening letter reminding him that the WCSGC had transferred the property to the CCSC and that company was in the process of selling Two Mile to the KCCC. The springs at Two Mile, he wrote,

were dug out and otherwise improved and fenced and a temporary dwelling and corall built [there] many years ago. And the rights of possession have been recognized and respected by all the residents of this Southern country. The Coop. Companies of Winsor, Canaan, and Kanab include nearly every substancial [*sic*] family in the country, and no sane man can for a moment expect to enjoy quiet possession of that property, on the highway between these settlements in defiance of the rights of the people.

Common prudence would dictate that you refrain from any operations there or any inter[fer]ence with attempts of the Kanab Company to occupy it.¹¹⁹

¹¹⁸ L. John Nuttall to Prest. James L. Bunting, Kanab, November 18, 1882, PTR, s8, b20, f317.

¹¹⁹ CCSC Minutes, 2: 59–62.

Threatened by the power of the companies representing “nearly every substantial family in the country” Webber and his surrogates vacated that property. “Webber’s movements” convinced the Canaan superintendent and board that “they calculate to Jump one or the other of the Springs East of Short Creek.” Precautions were taken to secure company property at Pipe Springs, Moccasin, Cane Beds, and Cottonwood Springs to keep Webber and other “strangers” from obtaining a foothold.¹²⁰

The church and the CCSC repeatedly sent Latter-day Saint cowboy-spies to shadow Webber, Sawyer, and their cowhands, who now included former Canaan Ranch employees. Even James Emmett worked for Webber after the CCSC failed to renew his contract as their cattle boss. After briefly using the C&P or Canaan and Pipe Springs brand after the CCSC and WCSGC merger in 1879, Canaan Ranch had gone back to using the church’s old single cross (+) brand, previously used by both Canaan and Pipe, as the church was a primary holder of their stock. This brand could be added to very easily.¹²¹ In 1882 Canaan’s cowboy spies discovered that Webber employees had indeed been stealing cattle. On June 10, Canaan’s current superintendent, Virgil Kelly, “suggested that a new brand be chosen for the Companys use on their stock as quite a number of persons in the upper country were using brands placed on left ribs and made in a shape as to be easily used to alter the Company brand.”¹²²

Canaan immediately adopted a new brand that could not so easily be counterfeited. For cattle it was the old 2 1/2-inch church cross but this time encircled in a four-inch circle and

¹²⁰ CCSC Minutes, 2: 81.

¹²¹ The Canaan Board voted to discontinue the *C&P* brand and return to the old church cross + on May 28, 1881, CCSC Minutes, 2: 36.

¹²² CCSC Minutes, 2: 84.

switched to the right side. The new brands were officially registered in Salt Lake City and ordered to be made at “Blacksmith Croffs [sic] shop” in St. George.¹²³ Erastus Snow was immediately made aware of “the organization of cattle thieves in the vicinity of Kanab” and informed of the new brands.¹²⁴ Several of Sawyer and Webber’s men were found guilty but Frank Webber claimed he had not been a part of “the gang’s” dishonesty and Joseph Sawyer was able to produce evidence that he had branded Canaan Ranch property “by mistake.”¹²⁵ Some of the guilty men fled the country forever, some were excommunicated or disfellowshipped from the church, and at least one reportedly did ten years in the Utah Territorial Penitentiary for cattle theft and brand fixing.¹²⁶ Significantly, the crisis caused the CCSC to attempt to shut down the practice of keeping church and private livestock on the same range, mixed up together. As trials proceeded against the Kanab rustlers, the Canaan board passed the following resolution unanimously:

Be it resolved by the Board of Canaan Coop. Stock Co. that no herdsman or employee of the Company shall be allowed to have or use his own brand on the Companys herdgrounds for the purpose of branding cattle. Or [to have] mor[e] than one horse of his own, or to herd other individuals stock on the Companys herdgrounds.¹²⁷

¹²³ CCSC Minutes 2: 84–86.

¹²⁴ CCSC Minutes 2: 90.

¹²⁵ CCSC Minutes, 2: 106. Joseph Sawyer’s brother Arthur and Wilf Halliday were both incarcerated in the nearest jail in Toquerville.

¹²⁶ Reilly, *Lee’s Ferry*, 145–149; and Lorin A. Little, St. George, to Leonard Heaton, March 12, 1955, PSLA, transcription of PISP-1623.

¹²⁷ CCSC Minutes, 2: 101.

Mormon cattle companies were “cooperative” and were meant to have been “joint stock companies” but large numbers of Latter-day Saints followed Brigham Young’s example and indiscriminately mixed private and community interests on the same range. Anson Winsor, Charles Pulsipher, James Andrus, James Emmett, and many another coop employees ran personal stock with company stock. Some, if not all of them, also contracted to watch the stock of private parties not associated with the company, while working on company time. Cowboys often worked for competing cattle companies at the same time. Of necessity they carried multiple brands with them as they worked the range and oftentimes came across calves whose ownership was questionable. These animals were called “long-ears” because they had neither been branded nor had their ears cropped with personalized cuts to indicate ownership. With various personal and company brands in hand, and no one to oversee their deeds on the vast range, the temptation existed to slap personal brands and marks on animals they knew were not theirs. In time, it became “widely accepted . . . that any critter without a brand or earmark was free to the first taker.” One writer has called cowboying on the Arizona Strip during this general period “like living in a cow thief’s paradise with a legal license to steal.” CCSC minutes reveal that a good number of cowboys adopted brands similar to the CCSC or “church brand” so that they could more easily appropriate church stock. Kanabites Joseph and Arthur Sawyer, for example, adopted the number 14 as their brand. It was sized so as to place directly over the church brand which was a small cross or plus sign (+). Not quite so elaborate in his subterfuge, Joseph Hamblin’s brand was a double cross (++) placed in the same location as the church brand. This problem caused the church sponsored CCSC to officially change its brand and closely monitor who was authorized to carry brands of any kind out on the open range. Meanwhile, CCSC

leaders notified Erastus Snow that an organized ring of cattle thieves were operating “in the vicinity of Kanab.”¹²⁸

Despite Webber’s cooperation in bringing some of his employees to justice, he lost the trust of church leaders who continued to refuse his requests to lease Winsor Castle and its traditional range rights. Mormon leaders did not want this key waterhole and its range in the hands of an outsider. Bishop Johnson wrote President Nuttall that “we dont want Webber or any other outsider to have it.” In the meantime, Webber and his outfit returned to Two Mile Ranche, making “considerable improvement” by “putting up buildings and making a resourvoy [*sic*] so that should they leave here themselves they will have something to sell to some other outsider so that they can occupy the country.”¹²⁹ To protect Winsor Castle from being jumped by Webber, or the property being damaged by his and other cowboys, Nuttall redoubled his efforts to find someone to lease it.

When Nuttall’s counsellor in the Kanab stake presidency, James L. Bunting, wrote him that the “Kanab Herd” was not interested in leasing Pipe, Nuttall wrote him back on January 2, 1883, emphasizing that the Pipe Springs Ranch was “key to all that section of grazing country.” Nuttall expressed his astonishment and grief over the “apathy and indifference of our Kanab Stock Co in not taking hold of the Ranch.” He chided:

¹²⁸ CCSC Minutes, especially 1: 24, 1: 78, 2: 84–102, 106 and 109; P. T. Reilley to LeRoy Harris, March 26, 1966, and LeRoy Harris, Provo, Utah, to P. T. Reilley, March 31, 1966, PTR; and Grant B. Harris, *Shanley: Pennies Wise—Dollars Foolish* (New York: Vantage Press, 1980), especially 205, and 209. Joseph Sawyer and his brother Arthur used the number fourteen as their brand, placed in the exact spot on the left ribs as the Canaan’s + brand. The center of the 4 in this brand was constructed in the exact size as the church’s + brand so that the Sawyer 14 could be placed over Canaan’s brand. Jacob Hamlin’s son Joseph was also suspect for he had registered the double cross (++) also on the left ribs. While Canaan only suspected Joseph Hamlin appropriated their stock by adding an extra cross to their brand, their spies had picked up hard evidence that Arthur Sawyer was actually altering brands. Jim Emmett, his brother Tom, and a cowboy named Wid Fuller, all Webber employees, carried Canaan Ranch’s brands with them on the range, presumably to help turn the + into a 14 more easily.

¹²⁹ William D. Johnson, Jr., to L. John Nuttall, Salt Lake City, L. John Nuttall Papers, CHL; and L. John Nuttall, to Prest. James L. Bunting, Kanab, February 12, 1883, and James L. Bunting, Kanab, to L. John Nuttall, January 24, 1883, both in PTR, s8, b20, f317.

If there was not so much individual speculation among some of our brethren in these matters and more of the spirit of liberality and working for the public good, which will, in the end, pay the greater dividend, there would not be so much difficulty for them to see what is for their best interest. I would like you to see Bro. Riggs and see if he and his sons will take charge of Pipe Springs Ranch and put the place with the fence, sheds &c in repair and keep them so, for the use of the premises for a term of one or more years.

We have had applications from outsiders who know the value of the situation and will pay the church for a lease thereon, or would buy if possible; but having the welfare of the people at heart, more than they seem to have for themselves, no such action to sell or lease has been taken here. Have these Cattle men wake up and let me hear from you on this matter.¹³⁰

Agreeing with Nuttall that Pipe Springs was not only “key to all that section of grazing country,” but also a prime economic plum for the picking, for a time Apostle Brigham Young, Jr., talked of taking the lease himself. His apostolic duties in Salt Lake City, however, made his taking over Winsor Castle an unrealistic solution to the problem of who would hold Pipe Springs for the church. Stewardship of this key piece of real estate, though, was kept in the Young family. Perhaps because of the amount of stock held by various relatives of Brigham, Sr. in the original WCSGC, and that the deceased prophet’s nephews Joseph W. and John R. Young played such important roles in building the fort, their sister’s husband was tapped to take the

¹³⁰ L. John Nuttall, to Elder James L. Bunting, Kanab, January 2, 1883, PTR, s8, b20, f317.

lease. Joseph Gurnsey Brown (known as Gurnsey) and his wife Harriett took the lease and saved not only Winsor Castle, but “all that section of grazing country” from “the outsider.” Since he was first councilor to Bishop Johnson, Gurnsey was called to care for Winsor Castle as a priesthood duty as President Nuttall had pushed for all along. Gurnsey Brown’s first wife, Harriet Maria Young, was a sister of Joseph W. Young and John R. Young, who both played prominent roles in the construction of Winsor Castle and had run stock at Pipe. Harriet was also a daughter of Lorenzo D. Young, one of the original investors in the WCSGC, and was the niece of Brigham Young himself. Gurnsey and Harriet’s daughter was married to Howard Spencer, the president of the OUO, which had only recently relinquished possession of the fort. Additionally, Gurnsey had property he farmed in Cottonwood Canyon, some eight miles from Pipe Springs. By the end of February 1883 an agreement had been made between Brown and the Trustee in Trust’s agent. Taylor’s desire that the fort be held at all costs was confirmed in Nuttall’s urging that “Bro. Brown go onto the place forthwith [and] take possession and assume control.” Dated carvings in Winsor Castle’s soft red sandstone walls, door jams, and window sills (which still survive,) indicate that they did.¹³¹

Like other Pipe Springs matrons before her, part of Harriet Brown’s lot at Pipe Springs was to maintain a hostel for “the traveling public.” This small window into her experience survives in Brown family histories:

In the 1880s the family lived in Pipe Springs. One spring while the men were busy with the cattle Harriet took advantage of their absence to “clean house,” which must have been

¹³¹ Brown Family Histories and related papers in PSLA, VF, FH, Brown; and L. John Nuttall to Bp. W. D. Johnson, Jr., Kanab, February 28, 1883, PTR, s8, b20, f317.

an arduous task in the “fort” where they lived. As they finished one evening Harriet said to daughter Rose, “I hope we do not have to take in any travelers tonight. I am so tired I would not be glad to see my own grandfather.” Following on the heels of her words came a knock on the door. She opened it to see Jacob Hamblin. She said, “Oh! Brother Hamblin, I am so glad to see you.” Rose burst out laughing and reminded her she wouldn’t be glad to see her own grandfather. Harriet said, “Maybe I wouldn’t *but I am glad to see Brother Hamblin.*” They made supper for him and then sat by the fireplace listening to him talk in his soft, quiet voice until late bedtime.¹³²

Another family story highlights the difficulties obtaining medical help while living at such a remote location. Seventeen year old Isaac Brown, son of Gurnsey and a deceased wife, being raised by his wife Harriet, had a serious accident while hunting with a contraption they called a cross gun. A sort of cross bow, the weapon misfired and sent the arrow into Isaac’s eye. One account says Gurnsey and Harriet dropped everything and took him by horseback to Richfield and then by train to Salt Lake City, only to see him lose his sight in his right eye. Another account says the suffering boy made the long trek to receive medical assistance in the city entirely alone.¹³³

¹³² There are several versions of this family story in PSLA, VF, FH, Brown, italics mine.

¹³³ See PSLA, VF, FH, Brown.

Chapter 12

Indians, Cowboys and a Parisian Artist

“No More than Humanity Requires”:

A Foothold for the Kaibab

While the church scrambled to keep possession of its foothold at Pipe Springs, many Kaibab pressed to obtain a secure position at nearby Moccasin Springs. Their ancestral lands extended north into Long Valley, east to include the Kaibab Plateau, south to the Colorado and west to the Virgin where the three major water sources of Pipe Springs, Moccasin Springs, and Two Mile Run lay less than three miles long in the heart of the Kababit homeland.¹³⁴ The immediate area around these water-holes naturally constituted an important ceremonial site, council ground, and social center. Generations of Kababit established small farms there, and the children and grandchildren of the generation that witnessed the first arrival of Jacob Hamblin into the Pipe-Moccasin area were told that at that time “there was lots of Indians ther[e].”¹³⁵ As Mormon cattle destroyed the grass seed the Piedes depended on, on land that had once been theirs, Jacob Hamblin attempted to obtain some ground and water for them at their ancestral center. In 1869, Before Winsor Castle was established, Hamblin, with Kaibab helpers, had

¹³⁴ J. Graham, “Pipe Spring National Monument Geologic Resources Inventory Report,” Natural Resource Report NPS/NRPC/NRR-2009/164, National Park Service, Denver, Colorado, v; T. J. Weeks, “Geology, People, and Pipe Spring,” ed. by hydrologist Dave Sharrow, 20072008, 1–4, Pipe Spring Interpretive Files, PSLA; and Larry Stevens and Jeri Ledbetter, “Pipe Spring, Pipe Spring National Monument, Arizona,” http://www.azheritagewaters.nau.edu/loc_PipeSprings.html.

¹³⁵ For example see account written by Ted Pikyavit in *Millard County Chronicle*, January 8, 1931, UDN.

planted fields of turnips at both Pipe Springs and Kanab, calling these two locations “Indian Farms.” That effort, though swept aside by “Mormon progress,” was likely the earliest step in the development of a reservation for the Kaibab Band of Paiute Indians. Indian commissioners John Wesley Powell and George W. Ingalls had spoken of providing a reservation for all the Native Americans in the region on the Muddy in Nevada and delivered farming implements and supplies. Not long after the Kaibab baptisms of July 1876, Bishop Stewart gave Hamblin a tiny plot in Kanab upon which to teach the Indians to plant corn and squash. But as the range collapsed and drought dried up their produce, Hamblin, on his own initiative, from 1877 to 1880, wrote letters to John Taylor (to enlist the help of the church) and to John Wesley Powell (to enlist the help of the government), reminding them both of promises made to the Kaibab regarding the need for land and water to be reserved just for them.

In December 1877 Hamblin wrote John Taylor that “during the past two years [the Kaibabit] have manifested more th[a]n usual interest in settleing down & cultivating the earth.” Referring to the plot of ground in Kanab that Bishop Stewart had given the Kaibabit to fence and farm, Hamblin reported that “the Indians of this place have made a very commendable effort this season to cultivate the Earth with what few implements were furnished them by the white citizens.” Hamblin viewed these Indians as extremely honest, writing that theft among them “can generally be traced to sheer necessity [*sic*]” or to the provocation of whites. He wrote of the promises made to provide these Indians with land they could cultivate and offered a list of the region’s bands explaining that they all needed special lands set aside and protected for their use. First he noted the “Kibabs inhabiting [the] Kibab Mountains in the South East part of Utah Tery,” the “Parowants inhabiting the Severe Country,” the “Paranagates inhabiting the west bordering on Nevada,” and the “Yanawants or Clara Indians Inhabiting the country surrounding

St George Washington Co.” Perhaps he left the Shivwits off his list, considering them Arizona dwellers, though like most Mormons of his time he considered the Kaibab Plateau, in its entirety, as belonging to Utah. Or more likely, he simply grouped the disintegrating Shivwits and Uinkarit bands with the Kaibab as he did in subsequent letters to Powell. During this time of crisis bands combined and sometimes evaporated entirely.¹³⁶

Seeing little help coming from church headquarters, in November 1880 Hamblin wrote a pair of letters to Powell in Washington, DC, in which he reminded the major of promises he had made on behalf of the government to provide them with land, water, farming implements, and seed. These letters enumerated the size of the Kababit band at the time as they painfully described their “destitute cituacion” [*sic*] as Hamblin saw it. He told Powell that all the

fertile places are now being occupied by the white population, thus cutting off the means of subsistence except game, which you are aware is quite limited. . . . The foot hills that yielded hundreds of acres of Sunflower which produced quantities of rich seed, the grass also that grew so luxuriantly when you were here, the seed of which was gathered with little labor, and many other plants that produced food for the natives, is all eat out [*sic*] by stock.

As cold [weather] is now approaching and seeing them gathering around their camp fires, and hearing them talk over their sufferings, I feel that it is no more than humanity requires of me to communicate this to you[.]

¹³⁶ Jacob Hamblin, Kanab, Kane Co., to President John Taylor, December 4, 1877, JTPP.

There are about 40 families including those we visited near Mount Trumble. . . . I visited them some this last season to put in some corn and squash [but] they got nothing on account of the drouth [*sic*]. They are now living on cactus fruit and cos[,] no pine nuts this season... They claim that you gave them some [promises in] regard to assisting them to eake [*sic*] out an existence they tell me that I recommended you to them, as being a good man, who had a good heart for them, which is all true, as I did tell them so . . . It being improbable that any appropriation could be made in their behalf at this time, I should esteeme it a great favor if you could secure some surplus merchandise for the immediate relief of their utter destitution.¹³⁷

President Taylor's position was that the Lamanites (the Mormon understanding of Native Americans, read through the Book of Mormon) should "make a living for themselves without being any annoyance to the whites." In the spring of 1880 President Nuttall wrote Bishop Johnson of Kanab that he had talked with Orderville's President Howard Spencer regarding their common "Indian problem." Nuttall and Spencer proposed that "the Kanab and Long Valley Indians go together at some place west from Orderville." Nuttall enumerated that there were "25 Long Valley and 69 Kanab Pieves—a total of 94." Having been joined by various Shivwit and Uinkarit individuals and families, and by clansmen from still yet other bands, the modern Kaibab Band of Paiute Indians was coalescing around Captains Frank Chuarumpeak and Chugg. President Taylor's intention, expressed succinctly through his private secretary L. John Nuttall, was to have the Kaibabits "provided for and not discarded and thrown off altogether." This was to be done by buying adequate land, water rights, "sufficient tools, teams &c" and by calling "a

¹³⁷ Jacob Hamblin, Kanab, to J. W. Powell, Washington, November 1 and 19, 1880, PTR.

suitable man . . . to go and give them a start” by assisting them. Taylor wanted them located at some distance from any white settlement to prevent their begging.¹³⁸ President Nuttall, Bishop Johnson and other Kanab residents favored locating them at Moccasin, which would put some twenty miles between Kanab and the Indians.

Kanab’s Bishop William Derby Johnson, Jr., who had once worked as a surveyor for John Wesley Powell, desired to buy the whole of Moccasin for the exclusive “use of the Indians” but neither the Kanab ward, nor Nuttall’s Kanab stake could afford to purchase it for them. The CCSC was anxious to sell its third part of Moccasin’s little coved valley and its accompanying water rights. While Nuttall thought Moccasin “would be a most desirable location” for the Indians, he wondered how “the brethren of Orderville would feel to give up that place.” Knowing the Kaibab desperately wanted Moccasin, Nuttall felt that it should be purchased by the church and given to them, so “the Indians would know we had their interest at heart.”¹³⁹ Over the next half year Johnson, on behalf of the Kanab stake, negotiated with the CCSC, and by October 12, 1880, he could report “I made arrangements with Pres’t Snow whereby I think we will purchase the moccasin farm of Canaan Herd *for our Indians* for \$1,000.00.”¹⁴⁰ The OUO, however, considering its large landholdings and its wealth in stock, did not support the sale. At the next Stake Conference it was decided that an “Indian Farm” would be located “on the Pahriah.” The only problem was that the Indians refused to go to the Paria’s desolate country—they wanted Moccasin *and its water*. Nuttall subsequently asked “Have they been consulted?

¹³⁸ L. John Nuttall, Salt Lake City, U. T., to Bp. Wm. D. Johnson, Jr., Kanab, March 27 and May 14, 1880, both P. T. Reilly transcripts in L. John Nuttall, USHS; and L. John Nuttall to President J. L. Bunting, Kanab, January 24, 1881, letterbook 1: 370–371, in LJNP. See also P. T. Reilly typescript of this letter in L. John Nuttall, USHS.

¹³⁹ L. John Nuttall, Salt Lake City, to Bp. W. D. Johnson, Jr., Kanab, June 14, 1880, letterbook 1:236-237, LJNP; and CCSC, especially 2:47–48.

¹⁴⁰ See L. John Nuttall correspondence generally in LJNP. See also W. D. Johnson, Jr., Kanab, to L. John Nuttall, Salt Lake, October 12, 1880, LJNP, italics mine.

Will they [g]o there under the arrangements proposed. . . ?” He also questioned the permanency of the measure explaining that “These are questions that I will have to answer in presenting the matter to Prest. Taylor and the brethren, in obtaining church aid for farming utensils, provisions, clothing, seed, grain &c, all of which will be needed.”¹⁴¹ Because the Native Americans “would not go” to the proposed Indian Farm on the Paria, Nuttall finessed the focus back to Moccasin, apparently with the firm backing of the president of the Church. By August 1881 there was talk about using “Jubilee donations” to help purchase Orderville’s Moccasin Farm for the Indians, but overtures made by wealthy St. George stockman James W. Nixon to purchase Moccasin for himself seem to have stymied the Kanab stake from purchasing it for the Indians. Orderville would cling to Moccasin for the time being, and even the CCSC, who had not yet actually sold its portion of Moccasin to the stake, upped its price from \$1,000 to \$1,500, but was willing to throw Two Mile Ranch in with the bargain. On October 22 the CCSC board approved the sale of both Two Mile Ranch and their portion of Moccasin. The Kanab stake had raised \$1,000 and asked President Taylor for the remaining \$500.¹⁴²

While President Taylor considered this request, he toured the area. On the afternoon of November 15, 1881, his party arrived at a virtually empty Winsor Castle (the CCSC had sold off its furniture when they turned the place back to the church). “Beds and bedding” were brought from Kanab to accommodate them and provisions came from Moccasin to allow the ecclesiastical leaders to host President Taylor to “a sumptuous supper” in his empty castle. Ten-year-old Clarissa Terry came out with her mother, Susan Terry, as did Eliza R. Snow, a former

¹⁴¹ L. John Nuttall, to President J. L. Bunting, Kanab, January 24, 1881, letterbook 1:370–371, LJJN.

¹⁴² CCSCM, 1:149, 179, and 2:47–48, 50–51, and 60; L. John Nuttall to Prest. Jas. L. Bunting, Kanab, August 26, 1881, letterbook 1:505–506, LJNP; and L. John Nuttall to Bp. W. D. Johnson, Jr., Kanab, April 22, 1882, letterbook 2:129, LJNP.

plural wife of both Joseph Smith and Brigham Young. She had with her the gold watch Joseph Smith wore in Carthage jail, which had been struck with a musket ball as the mob stormed the jail, stopping the time piece and recording the actual time of the martyrdom. Snow traveled throughout the country allowing children to see and touch the treasured time piece, hoping it would connect them to their martyred prophet. Clarissa wrote “mother and Lucy Spencer went to Pipe Springs, Arizona taking bedding and food with them. President John Taylor and Eliza R. Snow were on their way . . . for conference and were to spend the night at Pipe Springs. I shall never forget while there Eliza R. Snow placed the Prophet Joseph Smith’s watch in my hands.”¹⁴³ On November 17, President Taylor met with Captain Frank “& his Indians” and agreed that the remaining \$500.00 “to complete the payment for the Mocassin Farm [*sic*] in behalf of the Kanab Indians” would “be appropriated by the Church.” This portion of the purchase price was paid in “Canaan & Winsor Stock growing Company” capital stock. Bishop Johnson’s instructions were to have the deeds made out “to yourself as Bishop of Kanab Ward and to your successors in Office, to be held for the use and benefit of the Kanab Indians.” The church still planned to control the land, and Nuttall wrote Johnson, “It is not intended that the Indians shall own this land, but to have the use of it, for themselves and families.” The Native Americans were expected to take possession immediately, and Nuttall concluded his instructions “I can send down the Wagon, Harness and Tools as soon as I can learn of a team to take them—I also enclose a GTO [general tithing office] Order . . . for \$100.00 in tithing produce which amount will help the Indians some while working their land. Prest Taylor does not feel called upon to

¹⁴³ Whether the Isaac Losee family was present at Pipe Springs is unknown. Regarding the CCSC selling Winsor Castle’s furniture, see CCSCM, 1:93, and 1:119. For information regarding Taylor’s trip, see L. John Nuttall, Kanab, to *Editor Deseret News*, November 17, 1881, in JH, November 17, 1881, 5; Woodruff, *Journal*, 8:65–66, and “Transcript of Oral Interview Clarissa Amy Terry Carroll on March 31, 1959 by Clifton My. Pyne,” on Heaton Family History dvd, copy JAP. See also Mary Chamberlain, *Handmaiden of the Lord* (N.p.), 23–24, UUSC.

supply them with all they need. You must use your best judgement in the matter.”¹⁴⁴ Canaan Ranch’s portion of the Moccasin property (apparently about 10 acres) was officially transferred from the CCSC to the Kanab ward of the Kanab stake on April 29, 1882, leaving the Kanab Stake only owning one-third of the property and water rights at Moccasin.¹⁴⁵

Church authorities pressured Orderville to sell their portion of Moccasin to the church to be used by the Native Americans, but like other orders before it, the OUO was beginning to fall apart. By September 1883 the Board reluctantly agreed to sell their “whole claim & improvements” at Moccasin including their “large pasture” for \$2500. They considered it “well worth \$3000” and complained that they “would not have parted with it for less, had the [general] Church not wanted it.” Unfortunately both Orderville and the general church experienced hardships that caused the Moccasin deal to fall through. The church never recovered financially from splitting Young’s estate with its heirs, and faced an insurmountable financial crisis as renewed anti-polygamy legislation resulting from the 1882 Edmonds Act was again threatening to escheat its property. Erastus Snow wrote that funds were “being hoarded” by the church itself and by individual members of means “under fears of political disturbances growing out of the attempts to enforce the Edmunds Bill.” Money simply was “not so easy [to come by] as it was during the [previous] winter.”¹⁴⁶

Kaibabit had returned to a third of their ancient farms in Moccasin by 1883. In October of that year leaders of the OUO reported to church headquarters that they had “furnished considerable to the Indians at Moccasin.” But on December 3, Bishop Johnson wrote President

¹⁴⁴ L. John Nuttall, Diary, November 17, 1881, LJNP, UUSC; L. John Nuttall, to Bp W. D. Johnson, Jr., Kanab, April 22, 1882, letter books 2:128–129, LJNP; and E. M. Webb, Orderville, to Prest. Nuttall, July 21, 1883, LJNP.

¹⁴⁵ CCSCM, 2:76. For the approximate size of the original Moccasin purchase see *Deseret News*, January 31, 1908, 4, UDN.

¹⁴⁶ Erastus Snow, Salt Lake City, to E. D. Woolley, St. George, April 28, 1882, WSC, b1, fd4.

Nuttall that Captain Frank and his people were asking in frustration, “what about the [rest of] Moccasin farm?” Equally exasperated, President Nuttall wrote Bishop Johnson on December 24 that “I have not been able to get any action on the [rest of] Moccasin farm. Orderville [has] written me that they do not want to dispose of it, so you see that kind of blocks the way of purchase.”¹⁴⁷ Throughout the spring of 1884 the church and Orderville, both still in distress, continued haggling over Moccasin. In April the OUO directors wrote Nuttall they were willing to exchange Moccasin Farm for teams and wagons to pass on as “moveable property” to the large numbers of their members who were then leaving the Order. Faced with dissolving their order, the directors wrote that if they had “to divide up,” they would “need a great many more teams than when we work together . . . so if the Church will buy Moccasin & turn out this kind of property, it will help us out, and be a great blessing to us.”¹⁴⁸

With federal confiscation of its property actually on the horizon, the church could not subsidize its most successful united order nor could it afford to focus means on the welfare of the 100 Kaibab and Long Valley Native Americans now clamoring for the Moccasin Farm. For one thing, there were many other and much larger groups of Native Americans calling for the same kind of help all over Mormondom, and wagons of poverty stricken polygamists rolling to Arizona and Mexico required church support. As a result, Captain Frank’s distressed people starved. Seeing their extremity, Bishop Johnson risked the displeasure of “the authorities” by spending more tithing on them than ever before. Sometime near May 6, 1884, Bishop Johnson

¹⁴⁷ Thos. Chamberlain, Orderville, to Nephi Johnson, September 15, 1883, LJNP; Thos. Chamberlain, Orderville, to Prest. L. John Nuttall, October 19, and November 5, 1883, LJNP; W. D. Johnson, Jr., Kanab, to L. John Nuttall, Salt Lake City, 3, December 1883, LJNP; and L. John Nuttall to Bp. W. D. Johnson, Jr., Kanab, December 24, 1883, LJNP.

¹⁴⁸ Bp. Thos. Chamberlain, Orderville, to Prest. L. John Nuttall, April 7, 1884, LJNP. “Our present system . . . does not give satisfaction, and when men are not satisfied they will not stay, and when they go, they must have something to go with, and to continue to turn out movable property to those who leave, will continue to keep those who stay in straightened circumstances and will not give satisfaction to either party.”

visited with the Kaibabit and reported to Nuttall that “they feel very bad about not getting the Moccasin Farm as they understood from what Prest Snow said to them that they should have it.” Still hopeful that Nuttall’s influence with President Taylor could make the purchase happen, Johnson wrote, “if they are going to have it, it should be given to them [immediately] so a crop could be put in this spring.”¹⁴⁹ The Kaibabit did farm their small plots on the church’s portion of Moccasin the 1884 season, but by the end of the year, Johnson reported that “on [account] of sickness among the Indians last spring & summer [and the] scarcity of bread among the people and the small amount raised at Moccasin Farm I had to give them more than ever before & then the amount seemed small when you divide the amount among 100 indians.” Indeed, he reported that he dispersed \$281.41 in tithing funds to the Indians in 1884 when he only gave the poor among the whites \$202.47. This left the tithing office “in debt for indians \$151.51 & Poor \$77.47.” This was the second time he was censured by headquarters for overspending. “Take the counsel that has been given,” Nuttall chided him, “and do not issue [tithing office goods] in future, until you have the order [approved by the GTO] in hand.”¹⁵⁰

Sadly for the Kaibabit, the chance to obtain Moccasin in its entirety was lost in the economic mayhem brought on by three factors—the passage of the Edmunds Act of 1882, the slow collapse of the OUO, and successive crop failures in and around Kanab. When the OUO finally broke up in 1885, the Moccasin Farm was dealt out as the private inheritance of the Heaton Family and most of Moccasin is still owned by the Heaton’s descendants to this day.¹⁵¹

¹⁴⁹ L. John Nuttall to Elder L. C. Marriger [*sic*], Kanab, April 14, 1884, letterbook 3:107–8, LJNP; W. D. Johnson, Jr., Kanab, to Prest L. John Nuttall, May 6, 1884, LJNP; W. D. Johnson, Jr., Kanab, to L. John Nuttall, Salt Lake City, June 30 and December 28, 1884, LJNP.

¹⁵⁰ W. D. Johnson, Jr., Kanab, to L. John Nuttall, December 28, 1884, LJNP; and L. John Nuttall, to Bishop Wm. D. Johnson, Jr., Kanab, January 10, 1885, letter book, 3:283, LJNP.

¹⁵¹ See Jennie H. Brown and Nora M. Heaton, comp., “Moccasin and her People”

But with help from local, stake, and general authorities of the church, by 1882 the Kaibab had obtained a tiny toehold at Moccasin that would one day help them secure legal title to a sizable portion of their traditional lands and waters

The Snows, Woolleys and Seegmillers Take Over Pipe Springs Ranch

In 1881 Erastus Snow and his sons-in-law Edwin D. (Dee) Woolley, Jr. and Daniel Seegmiller rented the CCSC's Upper Kanab dairy and ranch near modern day Alton, Utah. Eventually they purchased the two thousand acre ranch outright.¹⁵² Seegmiller and Woolley were partners and by their own choice lived "a United Order of two" wherein their families had "all things in common."¹⁵³ Both were polygamists who had married daughters of Erastus Snow. Woolley's second wife was Florence Snow (called Flora), and Seegmiller had married Artemisia Snow (called Mishie). As part of their partnership they did a considerable amount of business with and for Apostle Snow and got their start in the cattle business by watching his stock. As

¹⁵² As early as April 1881 Woolley, Seegmiller and Snow talked of buying the Upper Kanab Dairy, but financial troubles prohibited them. See CCSCM, especially 2:33–34, and 38–47. Erastus Snow reportedly "called" Dee Woolley to rent it on shares from the CCSC to keep it from being jumped. Woolley took possession of the ranch in the spring of 1882 and Seegmiller joined him the next year. Later, the two men purchased it jointly. Seegmiller reportedly "spent five years in Flagstaff, Arizona, working for money to pay for the ranch." Robert E. Seegmiller, comp. and ed., *Legacy of Eternal Worth: A Biographical History of the Seegmillers of North America* (Provo, UT: Creative Publications of Utah, 1997), 39–44, and 106; and Mary Chamberlain, *Handmaiden of the Lord*, 45–49, and 57.

¹⁵³ A prosecutor in a court case in which Woolley and Seegmiller were involved said of the partners: "With Dee Woolley to make the bullets and Dan Seegmiller to fire them they could beat the world." Virginia J. Weight, "Daniel Seegmiller, A Short Sketch of his History," 1–6, in Virginia J. Weight, *Grandfathers Twelve: Histories of Twelve Remarkable Ancestor Grandfathers* (St. George, UT: n.p., 2001), FHL. See also Robert Seegmiller, *Biographical History of the Seegmillers*, 33; and Mary E. Woolley Chamberlain, "A Short Sketch of the Life of Edwin Dilworth Woolley, Junior, Written by his Daughter . . . for the Daughters of Utah Pioneers, Camp 17, Salt Lake City, Utah, December 1934," 3, USHS; and Mary Chamberlain, *Handmaiden of the Lord*, especially 33.

president of the CCSC, Snow also made sure that his sons-in-law had opportunities to make money with the company.¹⁵⁴

Dee and Dan had been implicated in the 1866 murder of a prominent gentile named Dr. J. King Robinson in Salt Lake City. In truth, Seegmiller, Woolley, and Howard Spencer at one time or another had all been members of a semi-clandestine group of church sponsored vigilantes officially called “the secret police” but Mormons also referred to them by various slang terms such as “the Bhoys,” “the Sodality Party,” and “the Danites.” Gentiles variously called this secret organization by such names as “Brigham’s Destroying Angels,” “Brigham’s thugs,” “Brigham’s Danites,” or “the church mob” and described it as a “band of assassins” who “did the dirty work of the Church” by willingly shedding blood “for the building up of the Kingdom.” Vigilantism flourished throughout the United States during the nineteenth century when the country’s emerging social order was particularly precarious and violent.¹⁵⁵ It was at the heart of the mob violence that brought Mormons to Utah and nineteenth-century Latter-day Saints employed vigilante tactics as enthusiastically as did their contemporaries.¹⁵⁶ For more than a generation, virtually every mysterious murder in one of Utah’s villages or cities, or in fact, nearly every death, Mormon or gentile, was blamed on the Danites. The belief was so prevalent that in April of 1866 General William Tecumseh Sherman telegraphed Brigham Young that if Danite murders

¹⁵⁴ See WSC and CCSCM.

¹⁵⁵ Arnold Madison, *Vigilantism in America* (New York: Seabury Press, 1973); Richard Maxwell Brown, *Strain of Violence: Historical Studies of American Violence and Vigilantism* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1975); David A. Johnson, “Vigilance and the Law: The Moral Authority of Popular Justice in the Far West,” *American Quarterly* 33 (Winter 1981): 558–586; William Culbertson, *Vigilantism: A Political History of Private Power in America* (New York: Greenwood Press, 1990); and Jared Keller, “Pax Vigilanticus: Vigilantism, Order, and Law in the Nineteenth Century American West” (master’s thesis, Wesleyan University, 2009).

¹⁵⁶ For Latter-day Saint use of vigilantism during the Missouri and Illinois periods, see Stephen C. LeSueur, *The 1838 Mormon War in Missouri* (Columbia: University of Missouri Press, 1987); Leland H. Gentry and Todd M. Compton, *Fire and Sword: A History of the Latter-day Saints in Northern Missouri, 1836–39* (Salt Lake City: Greg Kofford Books, 2011); and John E. Hallwas and Roger D. Launius, *Cultures in Conflict: A Documentary History of the Mormon War in Illinois* (Logan: Utah State University Press, 1995).

did not stop he would bring troops just released from the American Civil War “to avenge any wrongs” church leaders or their vigilantes dared commit.¹⁵⁷

As members of the Mormon vigilante group, Daniel Seegmiller, Dee Woolley, and Howard Spencer were each said to have played some role in the murder of Dr. J. King Robinson, a former US Army physician turned claim jumper, in October 1866. Ignoring the “squatters’ rights” of the Latter-day Saints, Dr. Robinson fenced and preempted the springs that Mormons used as public bathing area as he prepared to turn the place into a gentile hospital and private health resort. At the time a host of gentiles were jumping Latter-day Saint land claims all over Utah, because the government had no legal means for Mormons to obtain deeds to property they had claimed and lived on for years. Seegmiller and Spencer were both accused of participating in Robinson’s murder and some felt Robinson was killed to send a message that the Latter-day Saints meant to maintain their property whether the federal government issued them land patents for it or not.¹⁵⁸ Dee Woolley and Daniel Seegmiller were also “accused of killing Colonel Pike in Salt Lake City many years before, and under existing conditions had to be on the underground.” Uncle Dee boasted to his children about his involvement in the Secret Police, but in the histories

¹⁵⁷ John Peterson, *Utah’s Black Hawk War*, especially 28, 33–34, 174, and 251.

¹⁵⁸ For information regarding the Robinson murder, see *Union Vedette* (Camp Douglas, UT), April 6, 1865, 1, October 24, 1866, 2, and November 8, 1866, 2, UDN; *New York Tribune*, October 26, 1866, 8, GBC; Testimony of Robert N. Baskin in “Execution of the Laws in Utah [to accompany bill H. R. No. 1089],” H. Rpt. 21, Pt. 1, 41st Cong., 2d Session, February 3, 1870, 15–16, Serial Set Vol. No. 1436, GBC; *Deseret News*, January 31, 1872, 7, UDN; *Salt Lake Tribune*, March 17, 1877, 4, UDN; *Salt Lake Tribune*, October 21, 1910, 7, UDN; Fanny Stenhouse, “*Tell It All*”: *The Story of a Life’s Experience in Mormonism, An Autobiography* (Hartford, CN: A. D. Worthington & Co., Publishers, 1875), 338–339; Beadle, *Mysteries and Crimes of Mormonism*, 206–208; Dennis O’Sullivan, *Famous Assassinations of History, From the Time of Julius Caesar Down to the Present Day*. (New York: Frank Tousey, Publisher, 1882), 87; Robert N. Baskin, *Reminiscences of Early Utah* (N.p., 1914), 13–16; and Bigler, *Forgotten Kingdom*, 247–258. Robinson’s attorney, Robert N. Baskin testified before the House Committee on Territories in 1871 that at least seven Mormons were seen running away from the murder scene. “The Salt Lake City police” who were then controlled by the church, made “no vigilant attempt” to discover who they were. For Seegmiller and Spencer’s alleged involvement in the Robinson affair, their declarations of innocence, their trial, and eventual acquittal, see *New York Herald*, April 22, 1872, GBC; L. John Nuttall, *Diaries*, May 12 and 15, 1879, CHL; *Deseret News*, May 21, 1879, 1, and February 18, 1880, 1, UDN; *Salt Lake Tribune*, February 9, 1910, 6, UDN; and *Deseret Weekly*, 38 (May 18, 1889): 646–647, GB.

he left he was only too “happy to say that through [his] many years as a peace officer he never once had to use a gun or a club.”¹⁵⁹

Just as those who were implicated in the Mountain Meadows Massacre had been advised to take refuge in remote areas, Seegmiller and Spencer were directed to make themselves scarce by moving to southern Utah. Woolley had already spent part of the previous winter living with a brother in St. George. Before Daniel Seegmiller’s move south he lived for a time “in one of Brigham Young’s homes, working as a tanner.” He reportedly served as a member of President Young’s bodyguard and as “Captain of the Secret Police force in Salt Lake City.” The fact that Woolley and Seegmiller could be pursued at any time by federal authorities motivated them to form a “total partnership,” wherein they pooled their resources. If one were forced to go on the lam, the other could provide for his family in his absence. At first “Woolley and Seegmiller, Inc.” followed Dan’s interest in leatherwork and ran a tannery and harness shop in St. George. As the years went by, they expanded into farming, stock raising, and freighting. When federal authorities got on Dee’s track in 1877, he was called on a mission to Great Britain to help keep him out of the way. In Dee’s absence, Dan maintained their joint business interests and supported the partnership’s women and children.¹⁶⁰ When federal authorities turned their

¹⁵⁹ *Washington County News*, June 24, 1937, 1, and 6, UDN; Flora Snow Woolley, “Memoirs of Flora Snow Woolley,” 2, WSC, b1, f14; and “Notes on Father [E. D. Woolley, Jr.] from Rachel’s Story in the Yellow Notebook.” In a conflict between US troops and Mormon cowboys during the spring of 1859, Army Sergeant Ralph Pike struck Howard Spencer “over the head with the butt of his musket” with “all his might.” Howard Spencer vowed to take vengeance on his assailant and when Pike appeared in Salt Lake City to answer charges in the affair on August 11, 1859 Howard shot him dead. US troops and other gentiles who witnessed the murder attempted to apprehend Spencer, but members of the Danites and the Salt Lake Police helped him melt into a mob of sympathetic Mormons. For example of stories told to descendants, see William R. Palmer, “Pioneers of Southern Utah: Edwin D. Woolley, Jr.,” *Instructor*, 80 (March 1945): 109. See also various histories in WSC.

¹⁶⁰ See Weight, *Grandfathers Twelve*, 2; Robert Seegmiller, *Biographical History of the Seegmillers*, 29–36; Anthony W Ivins, *Journal*, 2:198–200, 22 March 1877, AWIP; Elizabeth Oberdick Anderson, *Cowboy Apostle: The Diaries of Anthony W. Ivins, 1875–1932* (Salt Lake City: Signature Books, 2013), 104–105; “Notes on Father [E. D. Woolley, Jr.] from Rachel’s Story in the Yellow Notebook,” WSC, b1, f13; Erastus Snow, Salina, to John Taylor, August 22, 1878, JTPP; and Mary Woolley Chamberlain, *Handmaiden of the Lord*, 34. Howard O. Spencer

attention to Seegmiller, their father-in-law Erastus Snow wrote Brigham Young a letter addressed in secret cypher that if the prophet wanted the pair “to continue the[ir] game of hide and seek” he suggested that “the two exchange places soon as possible or let Dan go to Switzerland as he speaks german and [let] Dee return with [the] fall emigration” to take care of their families. The CCSC’s remote Upper Kanab Ranch in Kane County’s veritable mountain stronghold “in the middle of no-where” was a perfect place to “lose themselves” in the vastness of a region that was fairly inaccessible to government officers.¹⁶¹

Both Seegmiller and Dee Woolley were ambitious and talented businessmen and serious stock men who had Erastus Snow’s name, influence, and money behind them as a co-investor in their company. At first Woolley and Seegmiller ran Canaan Ranch’s Upper Kanab Dairy for the CCSC on shares. Woolley learned the craft of cheese-making from a neighbor and according to his family became the best cheese maker “in the whole dixie country.”¹⁶² Snow, Woolley, and Seegmiller also had designs of renting or buying the Pipe Springs Ranch, but before they could execute their plan, Gurnsey Brown obtained the lease from the Trustee in Trust. Meanwhile, Erastus Snow worked behind the scenes to bring the lease to himself and his sons-in-law.¹⁶³ In November 1883, Erastus Snow telegraphed President Nuttall, asking: “Did [Brigham Young,

allegedly was also part of the “band of assassins” that murdered Robinson. See *San Francisco Chronicle*, August 12, 1888, 15, GBC.

¹⁶¹ Erastus Snow, St. George, to Brigham Young or John W. Young, August 17, 1877, BYP, and Mary Woolley Chamberlain, *Handmaiden of the Lord*, especially 33–72.

¹⁶² Robert Seegmiller, 39; Mary Chamberlain, *Handmaiden*, 45–72, especially 49–54. They claimed Woolley’s cheese “was noted from one end of the Territory to the other for years.”

¹⁶³ L. John Nuttall, Diary, 10 September 1883, LJNP, UUSC; J. L. Bunting, Kanab, Kane Co., Utah, to Prest. L. J. Nuttall, January 10, 1883, LJNP, CHL; Erastus Snow, Salt Lake City, to E. D. Woolley, October 19, 1883, WSC, b1, f4; J. G. Brown, Kanab, to, Salt Lake, November 7, 1883, PTR. At first Brown was able to hold his ground. On November 7, 1883, he wrote to John W. “I received a letter from Brigham[.jr.,] asking me upon what terms I would relinquish my lease on the Pipe Spring Ranch or would allow you and him to join me in occupying the place. In reply would say that I do not desire to give up the lease on any conditions and would say if you or Brigham have cattle you wish taken care of I will put them on the Pipe Spring Ranch and take [care] of them for you.”

Jr.,] arrange for Pipe Ranch before he left? If not E.D. Woolley and myself will take up Browns lease and pay trustee one hundred dollars a year[.] [C]onsult [the Trustee in Trust] and answer.”¹⁶⁴ When President Taylor visited Kanab in November 1881 he apologized to the people for “robbing” their stake president by appointing L. John Nuttall as his personal secretary.¹⁶⁵ For more than four years after drafting President Nuttall as his secretary, John Taylor looked for a suitable replacement for Kanab’s highest post. Meanwhile Erastus Snow vigorously put forth the name of his son-in-law Dee Woolley. When Woolley succeeded to Nuttall’s position as stake president in June 1884, he became the *ex officio* overseer of the Pipe Springs property on behalf of the Trustee in Trust. Brown could not refuse his own stake president (Woolley), and the acting president of the Southern Mission (Snow) and Woolley and Seegmiller soon joined Brown in the lease under the auspices of Erastus Snow.¹⁶⁶

With this call to the stake presidency, Edwin D. Woolley, Jr., assumed control of deeds to the so-called Indian farms at Moccasin and Two Mile. He also instantly became responsible for at least some of the church herds that Canaan Ranch cared for. And while the Trustee in Trust actually held the deed to Winsor Castle and the Pipe Springs Ranch, as the president of the stake in which it resided he automatically had the supervisory role in caring for it. This arrangement allowed for Snow, Woolley, and Seegmiller to add Winsor Castle and the Pipe Springs Ranch to their Upper Kanab holdings. At first it appeared that Snow and Woolley shared Gurnsey Brown’s lease, Woolley occupying the property with Brown. Exactly how it transpired is

¹⁶⁴ Telegram of Erastus Snow, St. George, to L. J. Nuttall, Salt Lake City, November , 1883.

¹⁶⁵ *Deseret News*, December 21, 1881, 2, UDN.

¹⁶⁶ Two of Woolley’s daughters wrote conflicting accounts as to when their father took charge of the Pipe Springs Ranch. Mary wrote that “*before* his appointment as Stake President he had taken over the management of a cattle ranch at Pipe Springs.” Mary E. W. Chamberlain, “Life of Edwin Dilworth Woolley, Junior,” 5. Daughter Elizabeth wrote that his involvement at Pipe was an “extra duty” that fell on him by virtue of his call to the stake presidency. Elizabeth Woolley Jensen, “Sketch of the Life of Edwin Dilworth Woolley, Jr.,” 14, WSC, b1, fd2.

unclear, but sometime during the winter of 1885–1886, Brown left Pipe and Woolley was caring for private stock owned by himself, his partner, and his father-in-law, and for the large numbers of church-owned cattle ranging on the Pipe Springs Ranch. The church still owned it, but Woolley had completely taken over its management. His daughter Elizabeth wrote that “At that time the Pres. of a Stake was expected to look after the business affairs of the church in his locality, so he became ex officio superintendent of the church livestock which Pres. Young had place[d] on the Pipe Springs Range, a herd of several thousand. . . . This work, together with that of taking care of his own herd which he was acquiring on the same range, required his presence at the fortress many months of the year.”¹⁶⁷

In a draft of a chapter entitled “The Cattle Business” Elizabeth wrote for inclusion in a book she hoped to write on Pipe Springs but never finished, she captured the essence of her father’s cattle operation on the Winsor Castle range. “The work of a cattle man is seasonal,” she explained, for “most of the year the animals take care of themselves on the open plain as nature had taught them to do.” With the biannual roundups, “the hard work came in the spring and fall months.” Her father’s “church work” was planned around these seasons: “At the end of winter,” she explained,

preparations for the Round-up began: men were employed; saddle horses gathered from the winter ranges; saddles and camp equipment coll[e]cted from forgetful borrowers—also horses—The chuck-wagon was overhauled and stocked with the cow-camp staples,

¹⁶⁷ Erastus Snow, Salt Lake City, to E. D. Woolley, St. George, April 28, 1882, and Erastus Snow and Richard Bentley, St. George, to Messers Woolley and Seegmiller, June 18, 1883, and Erastus Snow, Salt Lake City, to Brother E. D. Woolley, October 19, 1883, all in WSC, b1, f4; and Elizabeth Jensen, “Sketch of the Life of Edwin Dilworth Woolley, Jr.,” 14.

i.e. bacon, flour, sugar, coffee, baking powder, salt, dried beans, rice, dried fruits (if any were left in the household). The four cooking utensils were the Dutch oven, coffee pot, and frying pan, a six quart milk pan for mixing the famous cow-camp bread; a tin plate and cup, knife and fork and spoon for each man. The cupboard must be cleaned (a little for the natural color was greace [*sic*] mixed with smoke) and put in its place in the back of the wagon. It is made to fit snugly to the sides and under the wagon bows and cover. The rear door lets down to form a kitchen work desk for the cook. The chuck wagon was more convenient than the average kitchen of the period. . . . When the preparations were finished, spring was here and the men went to Pipe Springs for the round-up. [T]hey went to gather the calves that had been born since the previous spring, and the steers to be sold. The calves were branded and marked.

Elizabeth's older brother Dilworth remembered that their father built "several corrals down in the little sandflat north of the fenced-in fields and south of the ponds." The corrals could hold "about 2,000 head" and were "arranged conveniently for separating and cuttin[g]-out [*sic*] and branding." Pressed into the work of an adult cowboy at age eight, Dilworth remembered a stampede at Pipe Springs of which he was an eye-witness. "Every outfit having cattle on the [Pipe Springs] range" had its steers packed into his father's corrals as they readied them to take them to the railhead at Milford for shipment. It was between "daylight and sunrise" and the cowboys were at breakfast, with their saddle horses "standing around with the reins hanging."

Late in 1887, James Andrus, one of Woolley and Seegmiller's greatest competitors, informed the editor of the *Salt Lake Herald* that "our Pipe Spring . . . neighbors have taken great interest in breeding up their stock with imported bulls." He wrote that "during 1886 Seegmiller

& Woolley imported fifteen head of high grade [bulls] and two full blood Galloway and polled Angus bulls, and later two full blooded Holstein bulls and heifers, and six each Shorthorn bulls and heifers.” They similarly invested in “blooded” breeding stock for their substantial herd of extraordinarily fine horses. The *Herald* acknowledged that Woolley and Seegmiller were participating in a territory-wide “spirit of high breeding in live stock” and asserted that “two or three good bulls in a herd make a vast difference in its character in [just] a few years.”¹⁶⁸ Woolley usually presided over the partnership’s cattle which kept him tethered to Pipe Springs, while Seegmiller spent much of his time at Upper Kanab and in House Rock Valley watching over their extensive equestrian interests. Both partners raced horses and invested heavily in expensive Norman and Lexington stallions and bred “from no other kind.” Their Upper-Kanab Ranch was “known all over the South” as the “ideal Dixie Ranch.” It was “the home of the fastest horses, the best cows, [and] the highest-grade stock of every kind.” The wealthy partners also owned “the only hay-baler in Dixie.”¹⁶⁹

These two members of the Kanab Stake Presidency and a few of their friends built an impressive race track about a mile and a half south of Kanab, and sponsored weekend and holiday races. They hired special trainers to get their race horses in shape and employed their small sons as jockeys. From its inception in the late 1880s or early 1890s “an almost phenomenal interest” was manifest in the stake presidency’s racetrack and crowds numbering “a thousand people” turned out to see the running of “fine grades of horses.” Seegmiller and Woolley also

¹⁶⁸ *Salt Lake Herald*, December 25, 1887, 25, UDN; and *Deseret News*, April 8, 1886, 3, UDN.

¹⁶⁹ See *Salt Lake Tribune*, August 2, 1896, 5, NC. Dilworth Woolley reported that the firm of Woolley and Seegmiller owned hundreds of horses. Dilworth Erastus Woolley Oral History, Interviewed by Inez C. Cooper, especially 11. For descriptions of Woolley and Seegmiller’s partnership and its operations see Elizabeth Jensen, “The Cattle Business”; Dilworth Erastus Woolley Oral History, Interviewed by Inez C. Cooper; Robert Seegmiller, especially 33 and 43–48; and *Deseret News*, April 8, 1886, 3, UDN.

raced their fine horses throughout the territory, including at the tracks in Salt Lake City.¹⁷⁰ Of Seegmiller, *The Salt Lake Tribune* reported: “Regularly at Christmas he takes one or more of his flyers to St. George to race and enjoy life. Just as regularly he wallops the St. Georgites and makes them very sick. Pioneer day he spends at Panguitch Lake where the racers congregate and where he and his stable get more than the lion’s share of the glory.”¹⁷¹ To the consternation of some members of the Kanab stake (especially Kanab’s Female Relief Society), Presidents Woolley and Seegmiller often held three days of horse races at their track directly after the Quarterly stake conference, when Saints from the whole county gathered in Kanab. More people showed up to the races than attended the conferences. Kanab resident Rebecca Mace complained to her diary that “as soon as Conference ends Horse racing begins, the excitement engendered thereby puts a stop to all labor, school is dismissed early and a general turn out to the race track for three days” ensues. Sister Mace wrote of the sport’s origin “dare I say it[?] yes[!] it was the Stake Presidency, Segmiller is the for[e]most in it.” The primary problem was not the racing itself, but the wagering on the outcome—and gambling was supposed to be against the moral code of Mormonism. By 1892 there was “quite a feeling among the people against Bros. Woolley and Seegmiller on account of horse racing, gambling, etc.” James L. Bunting of the Stake High Council and Sunday school superintendency wrote to George Q. Cannon of the First Presidency that “Just about the time our Sunday School [starts,] the racers would be going to the track which has taken a good many of our young men away from school.” The abundance of

¹⁷⁰ See letter of Calvin Reasoner, Kanab, Utah to the *Deseret News*, March 7, 1892, in *Deseret News*, March 26, 1892, 6, UDN, and *Deseret Weekly*, 44 (1992): 488–489, GB; *Deseret News*, October 18, 1890, 3, UDN; *St. George Union*, January 1, 1896, 1, UDN; *Salt Lake Herald*, July 25, 1899, 1, UDN; Verla Lamb Raymond, “Biography of Royal B. Woolley,” unpaginated, PSLA, VF, FM, Woolley; Dilworth Erastus Woolley Oral History, Interviewed by Inez C. Cooper, especially 15–17; and Mary Chamberlain, *Handmaiden of the Lord*, 59, and 74–75.

¹⁷¹ *Salt Lake Tribune*, August 2, 1896, 5, NC.

complaints against the Kanab Stake Presidency forced Cannon to use the church press against them, complaining that “every little boy almost that can raise a nickel bets with other boys, and . . . who can blame them when they see men holding the Melchisedek [*sic*] Priesthood and men high in authority, too setting the example?” Cannon went so far as to threaten such unworthy examples with excommunication. Eventually Harriet Young Brown, niece of Brigham Young and former matron of Winsor Castle, led the Relief Society Sisters of the Kanab Stake in a crusade against “the evils of Horse racing.” Under pressure, the cowboy high priests Woolley and Seegmiller confessed their “gambling” and urged others to stop it—but the “quarterly Races” continued.¹⁷²

Seegmiller and Woolley’s imported studs and bulls as well as their “blooded” mares and heifers represented an enormous investment. One of Seegmiller’s son’s reported that Woolley and Seegmiller “were the first to import blooded horses and pure bred bulls for breeding” on the Arizona Strip and that the effects of their improvement of the stock was seen in the region for several years.¹⁷³ The firm’s “breeding up their stock with imported bulls” was part of a general phenomenon that hit the entire Utah market during the mid to late 1880s.¹⁷⁴ During these years, a gentile stock buyer from St. Joseph, Missouri named Benjamin Franklin Saunders discovered the quality of beef produced in Southern Utah and on the Arizona Sstrip and sought to monopolize the market in his role as a middleman between the stockmen and eastern stockyards. “B.F.

¹⁷² Dilworth Erastus Woolley Oral History, Interviewed by Inez C. Cooper, especially 15; Warren Foote, *Autobiography*, 1892: 265–268; Rebecca Elizabeth Howell Mace, Journal, especially 2–7 and March 17, 1895, and March 8, and September 5, 1896, CHL; James L. Bunting, Kanab, Kane County, Utah, to Prest. Geo. Q. Cannon, December 24, 1892, Wilford Woodruff Presidential Papers, CHL; and George Q. Cannon, “Gambling. . .,” *Juvenile Instructor* 27: (1 February 1892): 91–92.

¹⁷³ “I remember when I was a little boy of going after the pure bred cattle (to Salt Lake City). There was great curiosity [manifested in what we were doing, for as we passed] through the country, people would come out for miles around a settlement to see [our expensive breeding stock] as we passed by.” William W. Seegmiller as quoted in Elizabeth Jensen, “The Tourist Industry Continued,” 2, WSC, b1, f8.

¹⁷⁴ Salt Lake *Herald*, December 25, 1887, 25, UDN.

Saunders,” as his name almost always appears in the sources, with his network of eastern investors, cattle buyers, and stock yard connections, became a great boon to the southern Utah-Arizona Strip economy. He won the Mormon cattlemen’s trust, funneled eastern gold into their pockets, and turned a blind-eye to their polygamy. As a result, Saunders was not given the proverbial cold shoulder most outsiders still received from Mormons in Brigham’s southern bastion. In fact, he was treated as an insider and briefly, in 1895, was allowed to purchase the Pipe Springs Ranch. Preston Nutter, another gentile cattleman who came into the country during this period, also worked well with the Mormons at first, but eventually lost the respect of many cattlemen by using various government land scrips to secure private rights to what had always been public watering holes in the Arizona Strip. Seegmiller and Woolley worked with both Nutter and Saunders and their happy and willing mutual collaboration expanded their operations and enriched them all.¹⁷⁵

Cowboys at Pipe Springs, 1885

From at least as early as 1863 there were cowboys at Pipe Springs. James M. Whitmore and Robert McIntyre tended cattle, sheep, and horses there when they were killed in 1866. “Cowboying” intensified at Pipe when Anson Winsor opened up the cattle business there in 1870, and Winsor Castle itself, among other purposes, was constructed to protect the burgeoning Mormon cattle industry. Year in and year out a unique breed of boys and men dressed in leather chaps, cowboy hats, boots, and spurs worked on the Pipe Springs range. Western stock raising

¹⁷⁵ *Salt Lake Telegram*, August 28, 1907, 42, UDN; *Salt Lake Herald*, July 27, 1909, 12, UDN; *Salt Lake Tribune*, July 27, 1909, 12, UDN; *Goodwin’s Weekly* (Salt Lake City), July 31, 1909, 3, UDN; and Anonymous, “Peace Maker,” AWI, b1, f3, 2–4.

and its unique cowboy culture provided a background at Pipe Springs almost as distinctive and colorful as the Vermilion Cliffs themselves. By the early 1880s and throughout the 1890s and beyond, the Pipe Springs range and its cattle were part of thriving national cattle industry where thousands of animals were fattened on wide open ranges, purchased by cattle buyers, rounded-up, driven to the nearest railroad terminal, and shipped to massive stockyards and slaughter houses. Cowboys learned to use their horses for shade from the oppressive Arizona sun on the nearly treeless Pipe Springs range, nestled on the eastern edge of the massive Antelope Valley which stretched clear to the Hurricane Ledge. Cattle ready for market were rounded up at least twice a year and driven more than a hundred miles of dusty cattle trails to Milford, Utah,¹⁷⁶ where sixteen to twenty head were loaded into each railroad car and shipped to stockyards and slaughter houses in Kansas City, St. Louis, Omaha, Chicago, and dozens of smaller centers including Salt Lake City and San Francisco. In 1895, B.F. Saunders, said they “were shipped annually from Milford at the lowest estimate eight hundred cars of cattle, one hundred cars of sheep and one hundred cars of wool.” These southern Utah exports were generally paid for in gold coin, and were the mainstay of the local economy.¹⁷⁷

During the 1880s and 1890s, Pipe was usually chosen as the center for the entire region’s biennial roundups. Its springs, troughs, and ponds provided one of the few gathering places that could meet the water and grazing needs of thousands of cattle. Over the years, substantial corrals and watering systems had been built up at Pipe to facilitate these roundups, and Winsor Castle itself provided comfortable quarters for the wives and family members who often accompanied

¹⁷⁶ Dilworth Woolley, who visited Milford with his father’s cowboys as an eight-year-old described that Milford was “a rip roaring” gentile mining and railroad town filled with saloons and houses of prostitution. He remembered the streets littered with drunk men. See “Notes from Dilworth on Pipe Springs,” WSC, b3, f9.

¹⁷⁷ Abraham Cannon, Journal, June 7, 1895.

the cowboys. Risk of stampede increased dramatically during roundups, so all hands generally slept fully dressed near the herd with a saddled horse staked nearby in case of trouble. Cowboys preferred to sleep on the ground in their cattle camps to be close to their branding fires, chuck-wagons and the nightly campfires that became the center of their culture. Thus Pipe Springs at roundup time is often described in documents as a huge camp site—a place of hard work, hilarity, excitement, and fun. Throughout the year, cowboys used Pipe and its buildings for shelter, for dances, and even for honeymoons. When no one was there to protect the buildings, some careless cowpunchers mistreated them, sometimes pulling up floorboards or smashing door and window casings to feed their fires. Examples of cowboy graffiti carved into Winsor Castle’s sandstone walls and doorjambs survive.

A number of cowpunchers have left accounts of their experiences cowboying around Pipe Springs, which add to our understanding and appreciation of this ongoing work which played such an important part in the history of Winsor Castle. According to some of his descendants, Ezekiel (Zeke) Johnson (a member of the important stock family who settled Johnson Canyon some twelve miles east of Kanab) dictated his life’s story to his wife Elsie Eyre, who wrote them up in the form of a novel.¹⁷⁸ The novel portrays Johnson as a seventeen year old Mormon cowhand for gentile cattleman John Kitchen, who owned the “‘Mollies Nipple’ Cattle Ranch” located about twenty-five miles northeast of Kanab.

A Parisian Tourist Encounters Highly Cultured

“Farming Women” and Vivacious Cowboys “Living in Wild, Forsaken Places.”

¹⁷⁸ “Zeke Johnson: A Biography,” in Zeke Johnson Papers, 1869–1957, UUSC, hereafter cited as Zeke Johnson; and Notes of telephone interview of Donald Northern, St. George, Utah, by John Peterson, February 15, 2013.

While cowboys used the Pipe Springs range year round and annually drove thousands of cattle north, east, and west over a series of trails radiating out from Winsor Castle, explorers, immigrants, travelers, and pleasure seekers continued to use the fort as a way station. Traveling salesmen called “drummers” beat the roads between the various Mormon villages in southern Utah and northern Arizona selling their wares often stopping at Winsor Castle. Occasionally adventurers came to see the Grand Canyon and adjacent country John Wesley Powell had made famous. In May of 1885, Albert Tissandier, a 46 year-old French artist and adventurer, made his way to the Grand Canyon by way of Pipe Springs and Kanab. Tissandier lived an illustrious life; he attended the *Ecole des Beaux Arts* in Paris and became a noted artist, and with his brother had become a famous French hot air balloonist and aspiring aeronaut who designed and flew a dirigible airship.

As he traveled through the United States he made artistic sketches and notes for a book entitled *Six Mois Aux Etats-Unis* (“Six Months in the United States” published in 1886). He became “one of the first Europeans to make a detailed description of the wonders of Southern Utah and on the Arizona strip” and his articles and sketches appeared in the French travel journal *Le Tour du Monde* and the general science periodical *La Nature*. The Frenchman conducted background research before making the trip, seeking guidance from John Wesley Powell himself. Powell presented Tissandier with copies of the maps he and Thompson had published a decade earlier and provided him with a letter of introduction to former Powell employee and Kanab resident Nathan Adams whom the Parisian tourist hired to guide him to Mt. Trumbull, Toroweap, the Kaibab Plateau, Marble Canyon, and other sites in the vicinity of the Grand

Canyon.¹⁷⁹ Tissandier traveled by train from Salt Lake City to the end of the Utah Central Railroad at Milford, northwest of Cedar City. From there he traveled in a stiff and bumpy “postal coach” which he described as “a primitive cart, with room for one passenger” before transferring to a private carriage to get to Kanab. He described the primitive roads he and his drivers traversed as well as the “thick shroud of dust” that “almost continually robbed us of the sight of beautiful flowers that grow in these forsaken lands and of the skyline of blue mountains.”¹⁸⁰ He and his driver travelled long after dark, “the moonlight [beaming] a fairy light on all this grandiose scenery.” At midnight “our horses, tired with their fifteen hours’ journeying, halted before Pipe Spring, a [ranch] completely isolated in the sands and scrublands.” Despite their late-night arrival, when he and his driver knocked on the door, they “were graciously received,” a huge “hangar door” opening, letting them into the enclosure where “we spent the rest of the night there wrapped in our blankets.” Within the next few days, Tissandier sketched Winsor Castle, the earliest known detailed image of the fort still extant.¹⁸¹

At Kanab, Tissandier noted one of the characteristics of the rivers and streams of southern Utah and northern Arizona. “Kanab,” he wrote, “lies beside a river that is almost always close to dried-up, but with the snowmelt, it swells and overflows extensively in floods, washing away sand and putting the entire country roundabout under water.” He found “perhaps 500 inhabitants” at Kanab, sheltered on one side by “huge red-sandstone rocks” and on the other by “the scrublands” which stretched “away out of sight.” The people’s “isolation would have been

¹⁷⁹ A translation of Tissandier’s account of visiting Pipe Springs and the Arizona Strip can be found in “Albert Tissandier: Wild, Forsaken Places,” in Michael W. Homer, *On the Way to Somewhere Else: European Sojourners in the Mormon West, 1834–1930*, (Spokane, WA: The Arthur H. Clark Company, 2006), 265–289, hereafter Tissandier, “Forsaken Places.” For biographical information on Albert Tissandier, see Tissandier, “Forsaken Places,” 265–266.

¹⁸⁰ Tissandier, “Forsaken Places,” especially 266–268, and 288.

¹⁸¹ Tissandier, “Forsaken Places,” especially 271–272. This sketch, along with some 240 others, is located in the Albert Tissandier Collection, Museum of Fine Arts, University of Utah.

complete,” the French observer wrote, “but their own industriousness has succeeded in forging links with the most prosperous and civilized in their country,” by means of the Deseret Telegraph Line. The perceptive artist wrote: “I could not help thinking that many French villages were less remote than little Kanab, at the confines of the province of Utah, and yet our farmers would hardly have dreamed of setting up at their own expense a telegraphic network to receive interesting news of their locality, even if they had permission to do so.”

Tissandier was impressed with the nature of the Mormon village and described it this way:

Each house is bounded by an enclosure of yellow-rose hedges. The avenues are lined with acacias. The water of the Kanab river was brought into the center of town by an open wooden aqueduct a few miles long. By paying a water subscription charge, the townsfolk can cultivate a few vegetables and fruit. The Mormons love gardens and take great care of them. In each enclosure, they even have a few vines, which give them a very small yield, but they appreciate it as the reward of their work and of their constant struggle against drought.

He also noted the skittishness of the Kanab populace at the arrival of “an outsider.” “My entry into Kanab,” he wrote,

caused great emotion. The Mormons at the time were watchful. The government of the United States, tired of their eccentric ways, wished to bring them under the general rule of law and prohibit their bigamy. Since the decree of 1882 against polygamy and “cohabitation,” they were prosecuted, sentenced to jail and to pay fines. In the small

village of Panguitch, two men were abducted and borne off to jail. They were being required to repudiate their non-legitimate spouses and only keep the one they had married first, along with her children. Under these threats, the Mormons were in constant fear of police patrols and of being taken by surprise. Instead of making a boast of having several wives as in the old days, they deny the fact, especially in front of strangers, whom they always mistrust. . . . My arrival having been reported, a few inhabitants had crept out of the village and hidden among the rocks. . . . I was made thoroughly welcome by all these poor people as soon as they were convinced that I was coming to them simply as a tourist and not as a government *detective*.

He continued to explain to his readers that Kanab and Winsor Castle were “focal points” from which “one can branch out and embark upon the main excursions to the grand cañons.” At the only store in Kanab, where there “was scarcely any variety or choice available,” they purchased “tin cans, tea, coffee, and a few other necessaries” before launching his trip to the Grand Canyon.¹⁸² On this second visit to Winsor Castle, Tissandier described Pipe Springs and “its amiable inhabitants,” as well as its cattle and cowboys which appeared under the byline “*Les Mormons de Pipe Spring*” in his article “*Voyage d’Exploration Dans L’Utah et L’Arizona, Kanab et le Plateau de Kaibab*,” in *Le Tour du Monde*, in 1886.¹⁸³ He wrote that Pipe Spring was “one of the few places with a freshwater spring. Its amiable inhabitants had already extended to me their hospitality; this time, I was received with a cordial eagerness by the mistress of the house and her daughters. If I was astonished in Cedar City by the welcome and the style of the

¹⁸² Tissandier, “Forsaken Places,” 272–275.

¹⁸³ Albert Tissandier, “*Voyage d’Exploration Dans L’Utah et L’Arizona, Kanab et le Plateau de Kaibab*,” in *Le Tour du Monde, Nouveau Journal des Voyages*, 51 (1886): 353-368.

bishop's dwelling, I was still more so at Pipe Spring." In an effort to impress his French readers with the high degree of culture possessed by the women who served him at Winsor Castle—probably Harriet Young Brown and some or perhaps all of her six daughters.¹⁸⁴ Tissandier wrote "These Mormon ladies are distinguished and well-educated, even though in reality they are nothing but farming women living in wild, forsaken places. Deep in our French countryside, in the most forgotten corners of our provinces, our rural lady fellow-citizens are certainly in less deserted environments than those in Utah or Arizona, and yet, I have to admit that they are usually less civilized." Of Pipe Springs' "hardy young men" he wrote:

Alone, living always in these vast scrublands, completely remote from all society, these Mormon shepherds nevertheless lead an active existence, and not devoid of interest. For entertainment they have hunting and the contemplation of the grandiose natural scenery of these desert regions. Then, still on horseback, chasing their cattle or bringing it back, often from very far away in various parts of the scrubland, the work is toilsome and arduous.

They have to see to the reproduction of their animals. The totally wild state of the latter often makes this occupation difficult and even dangerous at times. Among other duties, they must brand the newborn calves. Each owner has his own brand, which is marked on the flanks of the young animal. Without this precaution, it would be impossible to recognize his own property.

¹⁸⁴ Harriet had six daughters living at the time. They were Persis Ann, Lucy, Angeline, Elizabeth, Jennie and Willmia. See www.new.familysearch.org.

The perceptive French observer of nature paid careful attention to the conditions of the Pipe Springs Range. He reported that he was told that “fifteen years before, the cattle had been more numerous than was the case today in the neighborhood of Pipe Spring.” He wrote in concise words that “the reason” for the drastic change in the range, was “that the animals, when they eat grass, pull up the roots, which can scarcely hold in the sandy soil. Consequently, the seeds dry up before they can shoot, the prairie is not re-seeded.” He described “numerous skeletons of animals on the wayside” attesting to “this degradation of the scrubland.” He also noted “that antelopes and wild horses, which were formerly abundant,” were forced to range “farther and farther away, or die in the sand.”¹⁸⁵

Speaking generally of the Mormons he met living at Pipe and the dozens of other scattered ranches he passed on his way, Tissandier described the Mormon families who lived in these remote regions as:

often isolated. All that can be seen in their houses are a few books and maps pinned to the wall of the family living room. Seldom do these solitary folk receive news from outside: there are not many letters to look forward to in the prairies. Even so, a postman makes his rounds fairly regularly in a primitive cart, with room for one passenger, but he does not often call at the door to deliver mail. In a spot known to all, on the barest outline of a road in through the grass, a small white-wood box is fastened to a post to receive letters or parcels. The Mormon who is expecting news of a friend or relative often comes from a

¹⁸⁵ Ibid., 276–277.

long way off on horseback to see if this box has something addressed to him, and he returns happily to his log cabin if he has found what he was hoping to receive.¹⁸⁶

Tissandier wrote that when he “said goodbye to my gracious hosts at Pipe Spring” a few cowboys helped him saddle his horse and wished him “good health and ‘fresh water to drink’ during [his] excursion.” He told how he and his two Mormon guides, with a riding horse each and one pack horse between them, “left the high escarpments of the Vermilion Cliffs and soon entered the true desert with its desolate prospects.” Their unshod mounts “walked with difficulty in the dusty, yielding sand,” and that under their feet “grew numerous flowers in widely spaced clumps forming bouquets.”¹⁸⁷ He passed by Pipe Spring first in May, and later in June, and saw the region again in July or August, when all was “burned by the sun, and on the earth nothing [was] left save an arid, mournful drought.”¹⁸⁸ The visitor was struck with “the difficulty in finding water in the deserts.” His guides continually discussed where to “make the next resting stop so that it would be close to a spring to fill our water flasks and water our horses.” They sometimes “spent the entire day without any drinking water. The burning heat of the sand made the stored water barely drinkable; the only recourse was to content ourselves with a little coffee. The horses, on the other hand, were lucky if they could find in some hole in the rock a remnant of water from the snow-melt or from a recent thunderstorm.” They rested in the hottest hours of the afternoon and ate tinned salmon, bacon, and bread “patties” Nathan Adams baked “three times a day for each meal” in “a frying-pan over a fire of dry branches that are nearly always easy to find in these deserts.” In the cool of the evening they travelled until nearly dark when

¹⁸⁶ Ibid., 288.

¹⁸⁷ Ibid., 277.

¹⁸⁸ Ibid., especially 275 and 278.

they stretched out their blankets “on the desert sand, or in the forest, and went to sleep under the stars.” “That is the way Mormons journey in Arizona,” he later wrote, noting that “a Parisian tourist may quite legitimately wonder about it during the first day of the journey, but the originality and splendor of the scenery greatly compensate for the utter lack of comfort.” Besides, “one soon gets used to such small discomforts.”¹⁸⁹

Passing back through Pipe again after a week’s absence, Tissandier and the Adamses returned to Kanab to restock supplies and set off again for an excursion of several more weeks to the Kaibab Plateau. They stopped to get a Kaibabit guide at Mangum Spring, on the western slope of Buckskin Mountain, where some “twenty Indians” were camped “with their wives and few children” who were still living in traditional Kaibabit style in “eight or nine” brush wickiups that the Frenchman called “tents.” These “tents” were “made of a few branches cut from nearby trees and tied together in [a] pyramidal bundle. A wretched piece of cloth or an animal skin covered these simple shelters.” They camped near the Kaibabit so that they too “could take advantage of the spring.” After their evening meal, “two almost-naked children drew close” eyeing Tissandier’s fire. He remembered “their hair was all tousled and they looked at me with the expression of little wild beasts,” but he wrote that he “tamed” them “instantly” with a little sugar and they joined him at his fire. Other Kaibabit also came, “two or three” with painted faces, their skin “colored with yellow ochre, except for a little vermilion under the brows and on the eyelids, and two roundels of the same color, as big as a 5-Franc piece (a silver dollar), painted on their checks.” Writing for publication in French tourism and scientific journals, Tissandier elaborated on this “wretched” and “gentle” little band of Kaibabit:

¹⁸⁹ Ibid., especially 275–276.

Ethnically, these savages are of fairly characteristic type. Their face is slightly flat, with very prominent cheekbones. Their eyes are large. They have dark skin of a golden-yellow tint resembling that of old Florentine bronzes. Magnificent jet-black hair grows down to their shoulders, plaited in front, forming long tresses interwoven with red cotton, like the ancient Gauls. Around their necks shine a few rows of glass beads. Their clothes are in poor condition, most of them even in rags and tatters, being of European cut and consisting only of trousers and a sort of calico print shirt adorned with floral designs. On their heads they wear a small cap of oriental form.¹⁹⁰

Tissandier and his Mormon guides hired a Kaibabit named John Panichkos “for 6.25 Francs for himself and his horse.” The Parisian explorer wrote that he “could not have dreamed of a handsomer guide.” John’s painted face soon wore off and Tissandier remarked that the lack of paint rendered John “much handsomer in my opinion, with his natural skin, white teeth and magnificent eyes.” For nearly two weeks the Frenchman, two Mormons, and their Kaibabit guide “lived in the virgin forest of Kaibab” and Tissandier wrote that “nothing could be more interesting.” He was impressed that John could find his way through the “never-ending” hills and dales of the “centuries-old pine forests and dense thickets” that covered the Kaibab Plateau without losing his way. The Parisian recorded an important piece of ethnohistory when we wrote that “some parts” of the Kaibab forest “had been burned by the Indians.” He explained that “to heat themselves during the night and to cook their meager meals,” the Kaibabit “choose the biggest pine tree in the forest and set fire to it. The resin-filled tree burns easily and often sets fire to nearby branches until there occurs, if there is wind, thoroughgoing disasters in these vast

¹⁹⁰ Ibid., 278-280.

forests. The Indians give such things little thought and go and camp elsewhere, burning more trees without ever thinking of taking a few precautions.”¹⁹¹

Directing his tourists through the tangled underbrush of the plateau’s Ponderosa forest, “at the top of a rise, which was covered with the most magnificent trees, John suddenly cried out and pointed to the marvelous panorama. There lay the Grand Canyon,” which John called by its Kaibabit name, “the *Scotingat*.”¹⁹² In beautiful prose the Parisian explorer wrote what may be the first description in the French language of the profound thoughts and emotions seeing the Grand Canyon can produce. “I stopped, astounded and fascinated at such an unparalleled heap of walls built one on top of another, giant amphitheaters, fairytale palaces, towers and fortresses the like of which the Titans might have built,” to illustrate it as the country of apotheoses. “For several days,” he “felt the same sentiment of awe.” From “one of the highest points on the Kaibab plateau at 8,500 feet above sea level” he could see “the entire cañon country of Arizona” and considered it is “the most interesting of all the plateaus of Arizona, since it is covered with forest up to its highest peaks, unlike the other plateaus discovered from Sublime Point, which are bare, giving an endless prospect of arid, fearsome desert.”¹⁹³

Despite his “curious stay in the province of Utah and in Arizona,” Tissandier affirmed “that the Mormons are hospitable, kind to strangers, gentle, and fairly well-educated. Most of them take an interest in all matters of civilization. I shall always remember with pleasure their cordial, touching welcome.”¹⁹⁴ But notwithstanding the Latter-day Saints’ kindness and hospitality, to Tissandier “their bizarre religion” “remains very mysterious for a person who does

¹⁹¹ Ibid., 281.

¹⁹² John explained “that he called those huge gorges by that name on account of the plants growing in the rocks that covered many places.” Tissandier, “Forsaken Places,” 281.

¹⁹³ Tissandier, “Forsaken Places,” 282.

¹⁹⁴ Tissandier, “Forsaken Places,” 289.

not stay for long in the country.” He reported the Mormons “say that their will is to follow Biblical customs as closely as possible. Thus they defend their polygamy: ‘Abraham and Jacob had several wives.’” Considering the revived and more severe anti-polygamy raid was underway in 1885, most Mormons hid their polygamy from Tissandier. Though the southern Utah villages he travelled through were fairly seething with it, he wrote that he “scarcely saw any bigamous household” on his entire journey.¹⁹⁵

Albert Tissandier toured at almost the exact moment the Latter-day Saints were again forced into southern Utah and northern Arizona canyon country for protection against a hostile American society. The Frenchman gave accounts of Kanab polygamists frantically scattering into the rocks on his arrival, and the emotion his presence initially caused. His accounts portray Mormons’ fear of “police patrols” as well as their manifest good will once they became convinced he was “simply as a tourist” and not a government detective.¹⁹⁶ In comparison to the early 1870s when Young repeatedly lost himself in the badlands between St. George and Kanab, the mid to late 1880s and early 1890s was the time the Mormons most needed the actual bastion at Pipe Springs and the larger natural fortress constituted by the surrounding country. Tissandier commenced his “*Voyage d’exploration dans l’Utah et l’Arizona, Kanab et le plateau de Kaibab,*” (published in the widely read French travel journal *Le Tour du Monde*) with this observation: “The regions of southern Utah, the province of the Mormons, and of the Kaibab plateau, in northern Arizona, are virtually unknown to the Americans.” Despite the fact that “for fifteen years, Mr. Powell, the director of the Washington Geological Survey, has been conducting numerous explorations into this curious country,” the whole region remained *terra*

¹⁹⁵ Tissandier, “Forsaken Places,” 288, 272, and 275, italics mine.

¹⁹⁶ Tissandier, “Forsaken Places,” 272–275.

incognita except to Mormons and Paiute and a tiny handful of gentile explorers, cattlemen, cowboys and miners. Tissandier published the map crafted by John Wesley Powell, Almon Thompson, and Frederick Dellenbaugh in his article in *Le Tour du Monde* in 1886 which clearly fixed its location for an international readership. Similarly Winsor Castle itself was rendered in careful artistic detail while the article's byline touted that it dealt with "Les Mormons de Pipe Spring." The map, sketch, and descriptive writing he published in his "Voyage of Exploration through Utah and Arizona, Kanab and the Kaibab Plateau" was part of a growing international awareness that polygamists were again hiding in the "wild, forsaken places" that the Powell survey had mapped.¹⁹⁷

¹⁹⁷ Albert Tissandier, "Voyage d'Exploration Dans L'Utah et L'Arizona, Kanab et le Plateau de Kaibab," in *Le Tour du Monde, Nouveau Journal des Voyages*, 51 (1886): 353–368.

Chapter 13

Pipe Springs and the Anti-Polygamy Crusade

Dee and Flora Woolley's daughter Elizabeth (called Bessie), whose own young life was seriously impacted by the anti-polygamy raid of the 1880s wrote that "by the middle of the eighties the polygamy raid had become cruelly aggressive."¹ The passage of the Edmunds Act for the Suppression of Polygamy in 1882, and various amendments and related pieces of legislation that followed, had significant impact on the history of Pipe Springs. The castle's location some ten miles south of the Utah-Arizona line placed it unquestionably outside the jurisdiction of Utah's federal officials. Meanwhile, the nearly insurmountable natural barrier of the Grand Canyon almost guaranteed that Arizona's officials would not trouble polygamists who sought asylum at Pipe.

The US Supreme Court, in the 1879 Reynolds decision, ruled that anti-polygamy legislation such as the 1862 Morrill Anti-Bigamy Act and its stepchild, the 1874 Poland Act, were indeed constitutional. These pieces of legislation allowed the federal government to confiscate and escheat to itself any property in excess of \$50,000 belonging to "any church in the Territories" which taught the practice of polygamy. In effect, these laws were specifically aimed at Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints members. The 1882 Edmunds Act has been described as "an amendment to strengthen the Anti-Bigamy Law of 1862" and sought to disqualify Apostle George Q. Cannon as Utah's delegate to Congress. It advanced substantiated

¹ Elizabeth Jensen, "Pipe Springs Becomes a Place of Refuge," 1, WSC, b3, f9.

polygamy from a misdemeanor to a felony with a penalty of “not more than five years imprisonment and/or a \$500 fine.” Proving that marriages had actually taken place was almost impossible since the church held its own marriage records and husbands and wives were unwilling to incriminate themselves. The Edmunds Act therefore identified the state of “polygamous living,” even without proof of marriage, by the term “unlawful cohabitation.” Differentiating between proven “polygamy” and “unlawful cohabitation,” the Edmunds Act declared the latter to be a misdemeanor and punishable “by six months imprisonment and/or a \$300 fine.” The act disenfranchised polygamists and made them ineligible to hold public office. The mere belief in polygamy disqualified one from jury duty. In an act of major political upheaval, Edmunds declared all elective offices in Utah Territory vacant. With polygamists thrown out of office and unable to vote, the act placed Utah territorial politics firmly in the hands of gentiles. In time, various amendments and additions to the Edmunds Act were advanced. The 1884 Hoar bill, for example, sought to “compel” wives “of the persons accused” to testify against their husbands. The number of US Deputy Marshals in the Utah Territory was dramatically increased and their powers drastically enlarged. Terrific sums of federal funds paid for these deputies who in turn hired spies and “spotters,” i.e. Mormon, lapsed-Mormon, and gentile informers who provided intelligence and otherwise helped the deputies to capture their “guilty” neighbors.²

² The Edmunds Act, 1882, in Utah Commission, *The Edmunds Act, Reports of the Commission, Rules, Regulations and Decisions, and Population, Registration and Election Tables, &c. For the Information of Registration and Election Officers in Utah* (Salt Lake City: Tribune Printing and Publishing Company, 1883), 3–5; Gustive Larson, “Americanization” of Utah for Statehood, especially **95, and 104**; and *Deseret News*, February 6, 1884, 6, UDN. See also Richard S. Van Wagoner, *Mormon Polygamy: A History* (Salt Lake City: Signature Books, 1986); and B. Carmon Hardy, *Solemn Covenant: The Mormon Polygamous Passage* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1992).

The fierce pressures brought to bear against the Mormon Church by the federal government as it attempted to stop polygamy from the 1880s into the first decade of the twentieth century created gut wrenching moral dilemmas that tarnished almost every person and institution involved in the controversy. Church and state and individuals representing both were pitted against each other in ways that challenged the basic ideals upon which each stood. In addition to moral, legislative, legal, and economic carnage that resulted, a handful of Mormons were killed during the anti-polygamy crusade, and when President John Taylor died in hiding Mormons called him “a double martyr” because he had also been shot four times in Carthage jail.³ When Congress passed the Edmunds-Tucker Bill, and it passed into law without the signature of President Grover Cleveland on March 3 1887, the door was thrown open for the actual confiscation of church property to the United States. The 1862 Morrill Anti-bigamy Law prohibited “churches in the territories” which taught polygamy from owning property valued at more than \$50,000. The Edmunds-Tucker Act of 1887 provided the machinery to actually disincorporate the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints and to escheat its property to the federal government.

While public opinion was clearly in favor of this bold legislation, there was unease about how it threatened to undermine American principles of religious freedom and the rights to property and the pursuit of happiness in a crusade to affirm America’s “moral virtue.” The

³ For example, on July 21, 1879 Joseph Standing was murdered while serving as a missionary in Varnel Station, Georgia. On August 10, 1884, William S. Berry, whose brothers and sister-in-law had been killed in the Berry Massacre near Short Creek, was killed along with fellow missionary John H. Gibbs and local members W. Martin Conder and John Riley Hutson during LDS church services held in the Conder home on Cane Creek, Lewis County, Tennessee. Edward Dalton was shot and killed by Deputy Marshal William Thompson, Jr., while avoiding arrest for unlawful cohabitation in Parowan, Utah, on December 16, 1886. Mormon missionary, Alma P. Richards, mysteriously disappeared in Meridian, Mississippi in August 1888 and was assumed to have been murdered. Similarly, a number of missionaries were emasculated while serving missions in the Southern United States. See for example Roberts, *Life of John Taylor*, 414.

Deseret News frequently quoted “the patriotic portion of the American press” which called the whole confiscation process “uncalled for and irredeemably [*sic*] unjust and dishonest.” The York (Pennsylvania) *Daily* protested against “the legislative and judicial Jesuitism by which the Church is robbed of its property” by stating that “however objectionable” Mormon polygamy “should not be brought [down] by disregarding the plain commands of the Constitution.”⁴ The Denver *Republican* asked, “Why should not Congress be just, even to the Mormons? Thousands of members of the Mormon Church have never lived in polygamy. Ought they to be made to suffer because of the crimes of others, or because their Church teaches the doctrine of polygamy? The proposed confiscation is unnecessary. It would be unjust and unfair.”⁵ The Fairfax (Virginia) *Herald*, “in commenting upon Senator Edmunds’ supplemental bill to insure the confiscation of the property of the ‘Mormon’ Church, expresses sympathy with the end sought to be accomplished by the unconstitutional measure, but somewhat quaintly and frankly admits that ‘the means cannot be considered edifying.’” The New York *Sun* was “emphatic in its denunciation of the Edmunds supplemental measure for the confiscation of the property of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints. It holds that it would only be common fairness and decency to vest in the representatives of the Church the funds arising from the confiscation.”⁶ The Albany *Times* feared that “the shameful and unjustly discriminative treatment accorded the ‘Mormons’ would widen out until it reached others who are now in the enjoyment of all the rights and privileges guaranteed by the Constitution.” The *Times* hoped for the day “when public sentiment will demand” that the church’s property “be restored with interest to the persons who contributed it under the mistaken impression that church property was sacred in this land where

⁴ *Deseret News*, June 28, 1890, 4, UDN.

⁵ *Deseret News*, June 28, 1890, 4, UDN.

⁶ As quoted in *Deseret News*, June 30, 1890, UDN.

no religion is supposed to be established by law.” As far as the *Times* was concerned, the Edmunds Act and the Edmunds-Tucker Act provided the ominous precedent that “Senator Edmunds and the American Congress shall hereafter [at will] be able to confiscate the religious property of other churches and sects of which they may not approve.”⁷

The nation’s reaction to “the Mormon Problem” similarly caused Latter-day Saints to react in ways that challenged their own core values. Not only was polygamy eventually jettisoned, (which contemporary Mormons then called “*the Principle*,”) but other fundamental principles were likewise stretched, twisted, and torn. Among them were the divine injunctions for the Latter-day Saints to obey the laws of the land and to be strictly honest in their dealings with their fellow men. The anti-polygamy crusade, and especially its emphasis on the confiscation of millions of dollars worth of church property, plunged Mormon leaders into a period of subterfuge and shady dealing. Prophets and apostles went into hiding and wore disguises as wanted posters with their pictures on them went up on walls and telegraph poles in Salt Lake City. The old Deseret Telegraph cyphers and code books were dragged out again as Mormon patriarchs taught their children to mislead and outright lie to “outsiders” who might be deputy marshals and others seeking polygamists or inquiring into property which the church was trying to protect from confiscation.

The Hunt for Cohabs

By the end of 1884 the slow turning “wheels of justice” had only “ground out three convictions with prison sentences” in Utah. The first case to be tried was that of Rodger

⁷ *Deseret News*, June 28, 1890, 4, UDN.

Clawson. Presidents Taylor and George Q. Cannon of the First Presidency were subpoenaed as witnesses but refused to testify and immediately disappeared. Taylor fled into Arizona while Canon led the church from a secret hideout in a tithing office barn in Salt Lake City. Clawson's plural wife, Lydia Spencer, was discovered in hiding and forced to testify against her husband. Once convicted, Clawson stated the Latter-day Saint case for resisting the anti-polygamy laws:

I very much regret that the laws of my country should come in conflict with the laws of God; but whenever they do, I shall invariably choose the latter. If I did not so express myself, I should feel unworthy of the cause I represent. . . . The law of 1862 and the Edmunds Law were expressly designed to operate against marriage as practised and believed by the Latter-day Saints. They are therefore, unconstitutional, and, of course, cannot command the respect that a Constitutional law would.

Utah Territorial Chief Justice Charles S. Zane, who tried the case, expressed the position of the US government:

The Constitution of the United States . . . as construed by the Supreme Court, does not protect any person in the practice of polygamy. While all men have the right to worship God according to the dictates of their own conscience, and to entertain any religious belief that their conscience and judgement may reasonably dictate, they do not have the right to engage in a practice which the American people, through the laws of their country, declare to be unlawful and injurious to society.

On January 19, 1885, the US Supreme Court upheld the rulings of the Utah courts affirming the constitutionality of the Edmunds Act.⁸

In December 1884 Arizona prosecuted five Latter-day Saint leaders who were eventually “fined \$500 each and sentenced to three years and six months in prison at hard labor.” Two were sent to the territorial prison at Yuma, Arizona, while the others were “shipped two thousand miles away to serve their sentences in the Detroit House of Correction.” In 1885 David K. Udall (who had driven cattle from Pipe Springs to use to purchase St. Johns, Arizona) was sentenced to time in the Detroit House of Correction for perjury in the polygamy trial of Miles Romney, ancestor of 2012 presidential candidate Mitt Romney. In 1885, eighty-three polygamists were indicted in Utah. By the end of that year, twenty-three of them were in prison, forty-three still awaiting trial, while seventeen avoided punishment by promising to obey the law. In a notable case that year, John Nicholson—a prominent newspaper editor and husband of two wives—stood up against Utah’s Chief Justice Charles S. Zane insisting that the laws under which he was being tried were unconstitutional. “My purpose is fixed,” he said. “I shall stand by my allegiance to God, fidelity to my family, and what I conceive to be my duty to the Constitution, which guarantees the fullest religious liberty to a citizen.” Setting the tone for Utah for the next few years, the highest US judicial authority in Utah territory tersely told Nicholson that both he and his church must “submit” to the law or “take the consequences.” Chief Justice Zane assured Nicholson that “the will of the American people and this law will go on and *grind your institution to powder.*”⁹

⁸ Ibid., 107–110.

⁹ Ibid., especially 103, and 107–111.

Despite the hard line taken by Utah's federal officials, after a very short crusade Arizona adopted "a policy of moderation" in its anti-polygamy prosecution and became a place of semi-safe "escape colonies" for polygamists seeking refuge. The corridor of settlements Brigham Young had planned and John Taylor had strengthened also provided a safe escape route all the way to Mexico, should a full withdrawal from the American jurisdiction be required to save "The Principle."¹⁰ In January 1885 Erastus Snow wrote his wife Elisabeth that pressure in Utah was such that "immediate assylum" [*sic*] was indeed necessary. He also told her that the church had just purchased land for "escape colonies" in Mexico.¹¹

Fleeing prosecution himself, John Taylor and his second councilor, Joseph F. Smith, visited their fledgling polygamist havens in southern Arizona in January 1885. At St. David, just forty miles from the Mexican border, Taylor met with the presidents of four stakes made up primarily of polygamist refugees who had already fled Utah. Feeling the danger of their situation, church leaders sent two exploring parties into Mexico to search out places of refuge outside the reach of the United States. Taylor was fulfilling "escape colonization" plans Brigham Young and Thomas Kane had hatched up years before. Taylor himself visited Hermosillo, the capital of the Mexican state of Sonora, where he was warmly received by the governor at his personal residence with assurances that his people (and their money) would be welcome there. The church president took steps which resulted in the immediate colonization of the Mexican states of Sonora and Chihuahua. By July 1885, Erastus Snow could report from Mexico City that

¹⁰ Ibid., "*Americanization*" of Utah for Statehood, especially 112.

¹¹ Erastus Snow, Salt Lake City, to My Dear Elisabeth, January 30, 1885, Erastus Snow Correspondence, USHS. "Salt Lake City and all northern & southern towns as far as I hear are full of Deputy Marshalls & spies entrapping whom they can and hunting up witnesses to force into court and before commissioners and Grand Juries to criminate the Brethren on Polygamy and unlawfull cohabitation. It is producing quite a sensation among our people and although great care and vigilance is being used to avoid surprize, every day or two some trap is sprung on a poor fellow or some family is betrayed by a thoughtless friend or secret enemy. Most of our leading men are menaced and those not actually hunted with warrents and indictments feel insecure and are adapting precautionary measures."

“the federal officials here and State Governors all Welcome gladly our people to Mexico.” The next year this “escape colonization” expanded to include Canada.¹²

After visiting Arizona and Mexico, President John Taylor sneaked back into Utah to join his first counselor George Q. Cannon, and his private secretary L. John Nuttall, who were hiding in their secret quarters in a barn behind the tithing office on a block just east of Temple Square. A clandestine meeting of the General Authorities was held to consider what course the church should pursue. Apostle Abraham H. Cannon recorded that “there is a determination among the brethren not to allow President Taylor to get into the hands of our enemies and all felt to sustain him in keeping out of the way.” On February 1 Taylor boldly appeared in the Salt Lake Tabernacle for Sunday Services and delivered the last public discourse of his life. His speech set the course of the church (and of Pipe Springs), that their policy would be to defy the “unconstitutional anti-polygamy laws,” to do all in their power to protect their people from being prosecuted and incarcerated, and to protect church property from being escheated. Born an Englishman, Taylor had always admired and cherished American freedom and had long been outspoken in defending it. He was at the Joseph Smith’s side in Carthage jail when Smith was murdered and was himself shot four times. This he laid squarely at the feet of the US government. “They killed your prophets,” he told the Saints that day, “and I saw them martyred [with my own eyes], and was shot unmercifully myself, under the pledge of protection from the Governor.”¹³ The piqued church leader then brusquely left the Tabernacle and was never seen in public again, for he died two-and-a-half years later on “the underground,” a fugitive from justice.

¹² Gustive Larson, *“Americanization” of Utah for Statehood*, 112–114; and Erastus Snow, Mexico City, to Dear Elisabeth, family & friends . . . July 23, 1885, Erastus Snow Correspondence, USHS.

¹³ Gustive Larson, *“Americanization” of Utah for Statehood*, 117–119. Taylor preached “When such a condition of affairs exists, it is no longer a land of liberty and it is certainly no longer a land of equal rights, and we must take care of ourselves, as best we may, and avoid being caught in any of their snares.”

For the next five-and-a-half years the energies of the whole church were combined to hide the “cohabits” or polygamists attempting to stay out of the way of the deputies and their spotters. Secret hideouts were built in houses, barns, and haystacks to be used close to home, while caves, dugouts, and shanties were used to provide shelter for absconders hiding in the mountains and canyons. They developed a communication system with elaborate telegraphic codes to warn Mormons up and down various spurs of the Deseret Telegraph Line when the “Deps” or deputies were on the prowl in their brand-new government financed white-and-black topped carriages.¹⁴ Polygamists moved plural wives into different homes, and even to different towns to avoid being suspected of “cohabitation.” Forced to act like fugitives and thieves, men wore clever disguises or visited their wives and children under the cover of darkness. Children were taught to keep an eye out for strangers and to provide false or misleading information when questioned by outsiders. Following Taylor’s lead, the whole community “pulled up their collars,” “buttoned up,” waiting for “the storm to blow past,” having no idea how long it might last. A steady stream of Mormon wagons rolled past Pipe Springs, their inmates and teams refreshing themselves with Winsor Castle’s water. The place thus once again provided one of the services for which its forward-looking builder had constructed it.¹⁵ The church and its members also developed strategies to protect church property from federal escheatment. One of them was to transfer as much property as possible to “stake associations” owned ostensibly by groups of local church members instead of by the trustee in trust of the whole church. The church could thus

¹⁴ There is some confusion in the sources whether the marshals came in “black-topped” or “white-topped” buggies--perhaps they used both. For white-topped buggies See Mary Chamberlain, “Life of Edwin Dilworth Woolley, Junior,” 7. For black-topped, see “Story of Bert [Woolley] at Pipe Springs,” 1, WSC, b3, f10. Maggie Heaton stated that polygamists scattered at the approach of any buggy because small town southern Utah Mormons “didn’t have buggies in those days.” She described how runners and scouts watched for buggies and “spread the word right quick” so that “the men were all gone when [the marshals] got there.” Interview of Margaret Cox Heaton by Kay S. Fowler, 14 July 1967, 24–25, Doris Duke American Indian History Project, Western History Center, UU.

¹⁵ Roberts, *Life of John Taylor*, 360–418.

claim it did not own or control this property. A related strategy was to hide church property by placing it in the hands of private individuals who could be trusted to return it when “the storm was over.” Despite these efforts, over 1,300 polygamists were captured, convicted, and imprisoned and in a complicated deal with federal authorities, the church conceded \$75,000 in property.

In a political demonstration on July 4, 1885, church leaders arranged for flags on Salt Lake City buildings—including City Hall, the County Court House, the *Deseret News* Office, the Salt Lake Theatre, the tithing office, the Tabernacle, the Gardo House, and in fact “all the public buildings controlled by the Utah church”—to be lowered to half-mast to publicly mourn the death of religious freedom in the United States. Taken as affront to Americanism and an “insult against the flag,” the calculated slight caused an uproar throughout the nation. The *Salt Lake Tribune* decried it as “the Mormon method of expressing their hatred of this nation and their contempt for its power.” Mormons had long prided themselves in their loyalty to the constitutional principles of the United States of America, and the *Tribune* used the Salt Lake City flag incident to declare “the boasted loyalty of the Mormon people” a “damnable hypocrisy.” The *Deseret News* responded in kind, asking “Who could rejoice on the Fourth of July, and make it a day of revelry and mirth, and indulge in gratulations over liberty when some of our best men are languishing in prison, committed there, as we believe, in gross violation of law and of every right that belongs to citizens of this Republic?” For several days eastern newspapers “kept the public under the impression that troops were needed in Salt Lake City to quell Mormon treason, and President Cleveland ordered General Howard to hold troops in readiness for this service.” In a controversy that drew the attention of the whole nation, the governor of Utah forbade the flying of the flag at half-mast on the Mormons’ special 24th of July “Pioneer Day” holiday.

From December 1884 to his death on May 27, 1888, Erastus Snow spent most of his time conducting church business “in retirement” on “the UG” or “underground” in Salt Lake City, or traveling back and forth to Mexico where he was engaged in purchasing huge parcels of ground for the settlement of polygamist exiles. When on the UG, Snow used his middle name (Fairbanks) as an alias. Always on the move, there were times the marshals were “only half an hour behind” him. On one occasion he was in the room when First Presidency member George Q. Cannon was captured, but because they did not have a warrant with his name, Snow was allowed to go free. When Snow travelled between Salt Lake City and Mexico by wagon or carriage he stopped for extended periods at St. George and the family’s ranches at Pipe Springs and Upper Kanab to visit his family. Once when he could not visit he wrote his wife Elisabeth that “I begin to feel it hardly prudent to attempt to go down south and back in haste least I draw too much attention to myself. I find I have already showed myself a little more than I ought in this city as I had considerable business to do.¹⁶ Another time he wrote his son Ashby, “I shall be glad to have your Mother come with [the Buggy] and meet me at Pipe on Sunday or Monday 13th & 14th prepared to spend a few days and return by way of Rockville.” He desired Tony Ivins to bring his wife Elisabeth from St. George to Pipe Springs, but “if not convenient . . . D. [Dee Woolley] says he will send a hand to meet her at foot of Hurricane hill from Pipe and let you return to St George only so she telegraphs D- at Kanab on Saturday.” Snow closed this letter “hand this to Mother & keep contents to yourselves. Yours in love[,] E. Fairbanks.”¹⁷

¹⁶ See Erastus Snow Correspondence, USHS, especially Erastus Snow, Mesa, Marracapa [*sic*] Co., A. T., to Dear Elisabeth, December 15, 1885, and Erastus Snow, Historian’s Office, Salt Lake City, to My Dear Elisabeth, September 19, 1885, and Erastus Snow, Salt Lake City, to Dear Elisabeth, January 15, 1886, and E. Snow, in retirement at Lucy’s, to Dear Georgia, 16 September 1887. Snow’s granddaughter Elizabeth Woolley Jensen wrote on the last cited letter that “grandfather did not like his middle name, Fairbanks, and used it only when “in hiding.”

¹⁷ E. Fairbanks, Manti City, Sanpete, to Ashby Snow, St. George, November 5, 1887, Erastus Snow Correspondence, USHS.

Flora's Prison: Pipe Springs As Refuge for Polygamists

In the spring of 1886 Dee Woolley moved his second wife Flora, a daughter of Apostle Snow, into Winsor Castle to take charge as matron there. Flora later remembered that her husband “conceived the idea of moving me there” as a result of the anti-polygamy raid then gearing up in Utah. She wrote that she boarded her husband’s “hired men” and “entertained the traveling public.”¹⁸ At the top of the US Marshal’s list of “Mormon criminals” slated for immediate capture were the names of all twenty-six general church officers—including the First Presidency, the Quorum of the Twelve Apostles, the Seven Presidents of the Seventy, the Presiding Bishopric, and the Church Patriarch. Most, if not all, of these twenty-six men were polygamists. The next priority were the local leaders of each “stake of Zion,” the majority of whom were also practicing polygamists, who were generally required to be examples “of all we teach.” In fact, John Taylor had announced a revelation that *only* those living the law of celestial plural marriage should be called “to preside over the Saints.”¹⁹ In addition to disrupting the church’s leadership, the marshal and his deputies sought to arrest thousands of rank and file polygamists. Hundreds of subpoenas were issued, and in time over 1,300 Utah Mormons served time for polygamy and “unlawful cohabitation.” Thousands of others escaped through the

¹⁸ Elsie Carroll, *Kane County*, 65.

¹⁹ In a letter to “The Relief Societies” of the St. George Stake, Erastus Snow reminded them of the Revelation to President John Taylor that “‘it is not my will that any should be called to preside over my Priesthood who do not obey my law,’ meaning the law of Celestial Marriage, and we think that Officers of Relief Societies, if not practically obedient, should at least, honor it in their hearts and with their lips.” Erastus Snow, John D. T. McAllister, Henry Eyring, and Daniel D. McArthur, to Mrs. Minevera W. Snow, and Counselors and the Relief Societies of St. George Stake of Zion, December 1, 1884, in SGMH.

church's well-orchestrated defensive system.²⁰ As one of about twenty-three stake presidents in Utah, Dee Woolley was high on the list of those desired for capture. Indeed, as his daughter Elizabeth later wrote, Dee Woolley "became a special 'target' for the aim of the two Deputy [marshals], [John] Armstrong and [James] McGearry, whose jurisdiction comprised the southern part of [the territory of Utah.]"²¹ His daughter Bessie wrote that he contemplated moving to Mexico "many times" to escape going to the penitentiary but that he "finally decided to take his chances and dodge his enemies as best he could."²² As president of the Kanab Stake, he and his second counselor, Dan Seegmiller, turned their remote Upper Kanab Ranch into an "underground station" where "many of the leading [cohabs] from different parts of the country came and hid away for days and weeks at a time." The Upper Kanab Ranch was primarily a haven for hiding male polygamists and Pipe Springs Ranch became a place of refuge for plural wives and their children. In addition to the obscure caves, makeshift cowboy shanties, and other hideouts in the incredibly picturesque cliffs, badlands, mountains, and forests which surround the Upper Kanab Ranch, Woolley built "a secret hiding place in the hay-loft" of the Ranch's barn "where he could be quite safe for a short time."²³

When the raid commenced in 1885, Dee's two wives, Emma Bentley and Flora Snow, and their children, lived on the Upper Kanab Ranch.²⁴ Referring to the Upper Kanab Ranch, Dee

²⁰ Davis Bitton, *George Q. Cannon*, 263–302; Melvin L. Bashore, "Life behind Bars: Mormon Cohabs of the 1880s," *UHQ* 47 (Winter 1979): 22–41; Kimberly Jensen James, "'Between Two Fires': Women on the 'Underground' of Mormon Polygamy," *Journal of Mormon History* 8 (1981): 49–61; Martha Sontagg Bradley, "'Hide and Seek': Children on the Underground," *UHQ* 51 (Spring 1983) 133–153; and Rosa Mae McClellan Evans, "Judicial Prosecution of Prisoners for LDS Plural Marriage: Prison Sentences, 1884–1995" (master's thesis, BYU, 1986).

²¹ See "Names of Presidency and Bishops of the Organized Stakes of Zion," in *Deseret News*, June 12, 1890, 5, UDN. Elizabeth Jensen, "Sketch of the Life of Edwin Dilworth Woolley, Jr.," 14; Mary Chamberlain, "Life of Edwin Dilworth Woolley, Junior," 8; and Flora Woolley, *Reminiscences*, 44.

²² Elizabeth Jensen, "Chapter on Ranch Life," 10–12, WSC, b1, f13.

²³ Mary Chamberlain, "Life of Edwin Dilworth Woolley, Junior," 7.

²⁴ Flora wrote that Dee moved Emma and her family to Upper Kanab as soon as Woolley and Seegmiller took possession of it in the Spring of 1882. The next year he moved Flora there. At some point in 1884 Flora moved into

and Emma's daughter Mary wrote that while staying there, the family "lived in constant fear and dread and were always on the lookout for a white-top buggy coming up the road, as the Deputy Marshalls were about the only ones who drove them at that time and even the little children were taught to be on the watch and to give the alarm if one approached." The Woolley children were taught "never to answer questions from a stranger, even if money were offered to induce them." The deputies' "white-topped buggy" came repeatedly to the Woolley homes in both Upper and Lower Kanab. Mary described that "they often came to our home and mother entertained them while father got out of the way."²⁵ Armstrong and McGeary frequently overnighted at the Snow House in St. George, now a half-residence, half-hotel run by Erastus Snow's wife Elisabeth and some of her daughters. While in Kane County, they sometimes stayed in Dee Woolley's Kanab home which was also a hotel of sorts kept by Dee's "legal wife" Emma Bentley. As the Woolleys and the Snows served their boarders, a good natured relationship was fostered that resulted in favors being exchanged on both sides. Apparently writing of their home in Lower Kanab, Emma Bentley Woolley's daughter Mary remembered that once, Armstrong was so "desperately sick" that her mother gave him her "unfailing remedy for everything," a "lobelia emetic," and a foot-soaking in "hot mustard water," and put him to bed, knowing her "remedy" would "detain him for several hours and give father a chance to get out of the country." Armstrong "was nursed through a protracted sickness . . . in the home of the man he had come to arrest." Deputy Marshal Armstrong later declared Emma Woolley "had saved his life and could

the village of Kanab where she lived until the fall of 1885 when she moved back to Upper Kanab, where she remained until the Spring of 1886 when Dee moved her and their children to Pipe Springs. Flora Snow Woolley, "Memoirs of Flora Snow Woolley," 3-4, in Julius Woolley Dalley, "Experiences in the Life of Edwin Dilworthy Woolley, Jr., and His Family," CHD.

²⁵ Mary Chamberlain, "Life of Edwin Dilworth Woolley, Junior," 7.

not be grateful enough to her.” According to Dee’s children, these two deputies purposely “passed father up many times.”²⁶

Like many polygamists during the raid, the Woolleys and the Snows had occasion to develop pleasant relationships with the US Marshal and his deputies. Some of the deputies were harsh and unyielding, but others sympathized with the plight of polygamist families they were hired to break up. Based in Beaver, seat of the Second District of the United States Court, both John Armstrong and James McGeary were thorough investigators and brave enforcers of the law. They arrested scores of polygamists but had compassion for the unique situation in Utah and knew that to adequately do their jobs they must maintain amicable relations with the Mormon populace. Despite the Saints’ animus toward these two deputies, most Mormons reported that Amrstrong and McGeary “conducted themselves as gentlemen.” Thus, “however unpopular their job,” these particular deputies “were not unpopular” in the southern Utah communities. McGeary and Armstrong reportedly “had a habit of calling at the homes of polygamists, where they were often invited to stop for something to eat; and, while eating, they would jokingly say: ‘We know your husband is out hiding somewhere. Maybe we’ll catch him next time we come to town.’” They appreciated Latter-day Saint hospitality and kindheartedness and responded in kind. John S. Stucki of Santa Clara, for example, told how he once came home from his orchard to find Armstrong and McGeary waiting for him. Despite the fact that they were there to arrest him, he graciously loaded them up with fruit and invited them to dinner. When they offered to pay for their meal, he kindly declined. Expecting them to arrest him and carry him away, he was surprised when they simply thanked him for his kindness and departed. Another polygamist reported that Armstrong and McGeary showed up at his house at 6:00 a.m. on a Sunday morning,

²⁶ William R. Palmer, “Pioneers of Southern Utah: Edwin D. Woolley, Jr.,” *Instructor*, 80 (March 1945): 110–111.

just an hour-and-a-half after one of his wives had passed away. When “the condition of the house was made known unto them,” they politely excused themselves and waited until after the funeral to arrest the grieving “cohab.” Grateful for this consideration, their prisoner went out of his way to publish in the *Deseret News* “to the credit of the officers, that they treated me with all the kindness and respect I could wish under the circumstances.” Armstrong had family members who were Mormons. His brother had helped build the St. George Temple, and his niece had “embraced polygamy.” But true to his commission, he still “determined to arrest her,” and even succeeded in catching her.²⁷

During a raid on Woolley’s “underground station” on the Upper Kanab Ranch, Dee had an accident that may well have been the decisive factor in causing him to move his “principle witness” to Pipe. As Armstrong and McGear’s “white-top” approached the ranch, an alarm was given and Dee scurried under a pile of hay inside the barn. Unaware their father was buried in the hay, “the boys” accidentally “ran the pitch-fork through his leg, wounding him quite seriously, so he did not try that [trick] again.” Given that it was their job, the deputies came again and again. Dee was often forced “to ride all night to get beyond their reach” while his family entertained them. Notwithstanding all the kindness and consideration manifested by the deputies, the drama of enduring the raids took its toll. According to Woolley’s daughter Mary, the constant “hunting and hounding” by the deputy marshals, and specifically the stress caused by their unannounced visits, constituted “the main reason for his moving his wife Flora to Pipe Springs,

²⁷ Anderson, *Desert Saints*, 413–415; *The Deseret Weekly*, 39 (November 23, 1889): 703, GB; *Deseret News*, April 18, 1888, 9, UDN; and Gardner, 24.

Arizona, which [soon] became a rendezvous for plural wives” and children, just as Upper Kanab had become an “underground station” for men.²⁸

Dee had shared the lease of the Pipe Springs Ranch with Gurnsey Brown of Kanab and sometime during the winter of 1885–1886, Brown and his family left Pipe and returned to Kanab, enabling Woolley to move his “principle witness” there in the spring of 1886. On March 3, 1886, Erastus Snow wrote his wife Elizabeth from Mexico City: “I am glad Dee and Dan have got Pipe Spring Ranch. It may be a help in dogeing [deputies] as well as keeping [church] Stock [safe] being in Arizona.” He explained to Elisabeth that an “indictment may follow a man anywhere in the United States,” but that warrants issued to bring one before a grand jury for indictment could not reach outside the territory in which it was issued. Now that Pipe was in Dee and Dan’s sole possession, polygamists and principle witnesses could use it as a refuge.²⁹ Even before he settled Flora at Pipe, President Woolley had organized a company of guards and messengers made up of “young and middle aged men and Indians” whose job was to help polygamists and principle witnesses escape “into the mountains or hid in other places in order to elude the Deputy Marshalls in order to avoid being arrested or suppoened [*sic*] as witnesses.” The initial Kanab Guard was organized on March 6, 1885, after “about all the Polygamists and principal witnesses” in Kanab had been forced to hide out in the mountains for part of the month of February. These guards were essentially a corps of church spies, messengers, and “minute men” who did what ever was necessary to help undergrounders escape capture. Similar

²⁸ Mary Chamberlain, “Life of Edwin Dilworth Woolley, Junior,” 7; and “Charley Jones, the hired man’s story,” 2, in WSC, b1, f13.

²⁹ Erastus Snow, *Calle de Seto*, no. 2, Mexico City, to Dear Elizabeth, March 3, 1886, Erastus Snow Correspondence, CHD. Elisabeth was Erastus’ third wife but the one he made his “legal” home with. “Should you or your children be [subpoenaed] before a Grand Jury at Beaver, [you] must learn to only tell [the court] what they [already] know, that I make your house my home and [that you] know nothing of my living with any other wife during [the] last three years.”

companies of guards were organized throughout Utah, and for at least the next five years the wires of the Deseret Telegraph hummed as the approach of suspicious-looking persons was telegraphed from station to station. Woolley's employees at both of his ranches were automatically enlisted as guards. On one occasion, one of Dee's hired hands rode all night to warn Dee of the approach of the deputies, and then turned around and rode back thirty miles to give the deputies information that put them on a false track.

At the same time he organized his Kanab Stake guards corps, he separated his wives by moving Flora to Kanab, where their daughter Elizabeth (Bessie) was born on March 11.³⁰ As the raid heated up, Dee thought better of keeping Flora in Utah and he moved her to Pipe early in 1886. This move was part of a well conceived master plan that succeeded in keeping Dee out of prison even though he was captured at least twice.³¹ Woolley was never convicted because his principle witness (Flora) was never captured, although she had a number of close calls at Pipe and several closer calls when she risked visiting St. George and Salt Lake City. At first their detection system was cumbersome and ineffective, as Pipe's old telegraph office was either out of commission or they lacked a telegrapher. Utah's deputy marshals repeatedly tried to capture polygamists living in the Arizona Strip, even though it was technically out of their jurisdiction.

³⁰ Flora Woolley, *Reminiscences*, 40; KSMH, March 6, 1885, CHL; "Father as revealed in the Kanab Stake Records," 2, WSC, **No Number 1**; Elizabeth Woolley, "Notes on Father's life given in an interview with W. W. Seegmiller of Kanab, Utah," 2; and Jenson, *Latter-day Saints Biographical Encyclopedial*, 1: 709-711.

³¹ Brought before the court twice on the charge of "unlawful cohabitation," Dee was acquitted both times because his "principal witness," i. e. Flora, could not be located to give testimony. Of his first arrest Woolley described that he was traveling "up the Sevier River" south of Panguitch in a damaged buggy when he saw Armstrong and McGearly hastening toward him. He later reported: "My first impression was to make for the sage, but was afraid my wheel would stick. They pulled out a warrant and told me to appear on a certain date and bring witnesses. . . I was dismissed for lack of evidence." His daughter Mary wrote: "Father escaped many, many, times but finally fell into their hands. In October 1887 he was arrested, and after a preliminary hearing before a U. S. Commissioner at Silver Reef, Utah, he was acquitted. Again in September 1890, he was arrested and taken before a Grand Jury at Beaver, Utah, but the case was dismissed for lack of evidence as Aunt Flora was still in Arizona and they were unable to get her as the material witness." Edwin D. Woolley, Jr., "From Father's reminiscences," 1, WSC, b1, f13; and Mary Chamberlain, "Life of Edwin Dilworth Woolley, Junior," 8.

Anson Winsor's son Andrew reported that the deputies usually approached "by way of the Virgin River settlements, and traveled to Pipe Springs by team and buggy [the] long way around the mountain," traveling on the road at the base of the Vermilion Cliffs. Before they could surprise Pipe Springs, a messenger riding horseback "over the mountains on a short cut trail" warned the polygamists. The women scattered "in the brush like a flock of quail," Winsor said, and were "well tucked away in hideouts before the officers could arrive."³²

As a chief target, President Woolley found himself spending much of his time and energy just staying out of the deputies' way. Flora's daughter Elizabeth wrote that it had become "impossible" for her father to fulfill his ecclesiastical duties while "hiding in a cave to escape being 'captured by the enemy' or by going into a neighboring territory whenever the 'grapevine' signals warned that the 'Deputies are coming.'" Knowing that the deputies would only go after him if Flora could also be captured and forced to provide evidence to convict him, sometime in the spring of 1886 Dee moved Flora to Winsor Castle, where Armstrong and McGear's warrants were useless. Dee and Flora's daughter Mary wrote that "during the 'Raid' of the 80s, father was hounded with many of his brethren [*sic*], and that was the main reason for his moving his wife Flora to Pipe Springs, Arizona, which became a rendezvous [*sic*] for plural wives." Mary's half-sister Elizabeth explained that "Since the plural wife and her baby were needed as chief witnesses to convict a man in court, it was logical that she should go into hiding under [a] fictitious [*sic*] name, or [move] into other states such as Colorado, Idaho, Arizona (then a Territory), or to find other places of refuge. This system was called 'going on the under-

³² Interview of Andrew N. Winsor by Donald K. Walker, St. George, in "Pipe Springs, Mohave County, Arizona, 1941," WPA Main Collection, USHS, **b392, f53**.

ground.”³³ Elizabeth further explained that her father solved his polygamy problem “by moving his plural wife and her three children to Pipe Springs,” and that so long as his “material witnesses” stayed there, he “was at liberty to go and come in comparative safety.” Edwin Woolley also located a larger place of refuge just across the Utah-Arizona boarder directly south of Kanab. At first just a collection of wagon boxes, tents, and “willow sheds” in the desert, the place was originally called “Hardscrable,” descriptive not only of its terrain but also of the type of life the polygamists seeking refuge there could expect. Erastus Snow changed Hardscrable’s name to “*Fredonia*” which supposedly was a Spanish term meaning “Free Women.” Like Pipe Springs, Fredonia was a place where women could be “free” from the persecution which hounded them just over the line in Utah. Only seven miles from Kanab, but still south of the Utah-Arizona border, Fredonia could easily be visited by husbands living in Utah.³⁴ Though Pipe was more than twice Fredonia’s distance from Kanab, it was far more comfortable and remote than “Hardscrable.”

Having been raised in the small but bustling city of St. George, Flora often found her “solitary confinement” at Winsor Castle oppressive. Its prison-like configuration, with its

³³ Mary Chamberlain, “Life of Edwin Dilworth Woolley, Junior,” 7; and Elizabeth Jensen, “Pipe Springs Story,” 36–37. Flora corroborated this statement by writing that “since it was necessary for the Deputies to have the plural wife as a witness against her husband in the court, as well as her children, it was necessary for these wives to live in hiding or on the ‘underground’ as it was called.” Flora Woolley, *Reminiscences*, 44.

³⁴ Elizabeth Woolley Jensen, “Notes on Father’s life given in an interview with W. W. Seegmiller of Kanab, Utah,” 2, in WSC, b1, f13; Apostle Abraham H. Cannon visited Fredonia in 1890 and wrote that “a number of the brethren” had “located their plural families [there] in order to be free from arrest on cohabitation charge[s.]” Since there was “no organized [governmental] district embracing Fredonia,” the Saints had “thus far been left in peace.” Abraham Cannon, “Journal,” September 17, 1890, UU. Flora and Dee Woolley’s son Dilworth remembered that the name Hardscrable “was given to the small village four miles south of the Utah Arizona border because of the terrible hardships the plural wives of Kanab endured there in order to keep their husbands out of the penitentiary [*sic*]. They lived in wagon-boxes and tents and dugouts, carrying water in buckets from Kanab Creek that ran on the west of the improvised town, and having their provisions brought to them under darkness of midnight.” At a dinner gathering at Pipe “Grandfather was telling that he had changed the name Hardscrable to Fredonia while passing through that day, because Fredonia in English and Spanish means ‘free women.’ Every body had a good laugh.” Elizabeth Woolley Jensen, “The Pipe Spring Story,” 39, PSLA, VF, FH, Woolley. Mary Woolley Chamberlain also described the naming of Fredonia by Erastus Snow. Mary Chamberlain, “Life of Edwin Dilworth Woolley, Junior,” 7.

windowless outer walls, its huge batten gates, and its tightly enclosed courtyard actually reminded her of a penitentiary, and she repeatedly wrote that she “went to the pen to keep Dee out of it.”³⁵ Flora also wrote that she was far too busy for her time there to “drag.” Since the old fort was “the only stopping place between the settlements on the west and those to the east of us, the unexpected guest was a very common one.” As wife of the manager of the Pipe Springs Ranch, Flora suddenly found herself the matron of a frontier boarding house and roadside inn. Lucky for her, she had helped her mother run the Snow house in St. George. Additionally she had experience serving the “traveling public” in her husband’s Kanab home. She remembered that since Winsor Castle was “on the highway” between Utah and the Mormon settlements in Arizona and Mexico, the “Woolley latch string” was always out for fleeing polygamists. “Spare bedrooms,” she said, “were always occupied.” Some of her guests were “young people” coming from the South over “the Honeymoon Trail” to be married to the St. George Temple. She wrote that her rooms were occupied “sometimes with paying guests but oftener by the wayfarer and the ‘friend in need.’” Since the place was technically still owned by the church, traveling or hiding general authorities and other general officers of the church had first dibs on lodging. Apostle Brigham Young, Jr., for example, “often came to stay ‘a while’ when he was avoiding the ‘Deputies’ who were exceptionally interested in him and his several families.” A. Milton Musser, who had connected Pipe to the Deseret Telegraph Line, “was a frequent guest for the same reasons.” Flora’s own father, Apostle Erastus Snow, and her brothers-in-law Apostle Moses Thatcher and Joseph Marion Tanner, were also frequent guests. Apostles Wilford Woodruff, Heber J. Grant, Francis M. Lyman, and John Henry Smith were also known to have stayed there

³⁵ Elizabeth Jensen, “Sketch of the Life of Edwin Dilworth Woolley, Jr.,” 15; and Flora Snow Woolley, “In Two Worlds: The Recollections of Florence Snow Woolley, a Pioneer Daughter of Utah’s Dixie, as Dictated to her Daughter, Elizabeth Woolley Jensen,” 45, WSC, b1, f15.

during Flora's tenure. She wrote that "many friends and relatives from Kanab and St. George whose way of living made it necessary to seek solitude at times, also visited us in our 'safety zone.'" These visitors, she wrote, "would often remain several weeks at a time but needless to say that compensation was never asked or received from *these* guests." People from as far away as Cache Valley on the north and Sonora, Mexico on the south, availed themselves of what Apostle Orson F. Whitney called the Woolley's "whole-souled hospitality."³⁶

Flora repeatedly wrote that "this old Indian Fortress had become a safety zone during the worst part of the polygamy raids." It was a place where General Authorities felt secure and it soon gained the reputation of being "so 'safe' that other men felt safe in bringing their 'chief Witnesses' there" too.³⁷ Deputies needed the plural wife as a witness, as well as her children, and "the condition" of pregnant plural wives was proof positive that they were guilty of relatively recent "cohabitation." Pregnancy made flight difficult, and even dangerous, should deputy marshals attempt to arrest them. Dee and Flora's daughter Elizabeth wrote that it was "necessary that a place be found near each community where the plural wives could be safe while the[ir] babies were being born. The Old Indian Fortress in Arizona was proving to be a safety Zone within easy reach of a wide territory. . . . so popular did it become that it was referred to as Woolley's lambing ground." Pregnant women "usually occupied the upstairs rooms of the south building. But as the number increased, a temporary frame building was built below the pond south-east of the fort. It was a small room with one window, a door and a fireplace, but it could and did accomodate two women at a time, albiet, very uncomfortably. Frequently these expectant

³⁶ Flora Woolley, *Reminiscences*, 48–50, and other documents in WSC, italics mine; and Orson F. Whitney, *History of Utah*, 4:168.

³⁷ Flora Woolley, *Reminiscences*, 51.

mothers would bring several older children with them.”³⁸ According to another woman who was there, the small temporary frame building Elizabeth Woolley described was “a one room lumber house,” about “12 by 14 ft,” located “at the east end of the ponds.”³⁹

Wives of church leaders whose husbands were in prison could stay and be cared for by tithing funds at Pipe Springs. The Ranch’s tithing beef and the dairy’s butter, milk, and cheese supplemented by the Castle’s fruit trees, currant bushes, and substantial gardens could feed a small army.⁴⁰ Aware that she had presided as matron over a desert “sanctuary” that was unique even in Mormon history, later in life Flora Woolley sought to preserve the experience on paper in a host of histories and reminiscences.⁴¹ On several occasions she listed the names of the women who undergrounded with her there from 1886 to 1891, and included Georgiana Snow Thatcher, Josephine Snow Taner, Emma Carroll Seegmiller, Ellen Carling Chamberlain, Ann Carling Chamberlain, Lynda Farnsworth Marriger, Mary Caroline Poulsen Woolley, Mary Janette Stapley Bringhurst, and a “Mrs. Langford of Toquerville.”⁴² Despite Flora’s multiple and consistent lists, conclusive evidence demonstrates there were other women who undergrounded at Winsor Castle. It is possible Flora only counted plural wives who spent *significant* amounts of time at Pipe, or perhaps she forgot some of the facts later in life when she wrote her memoirs. There were also women and children at Pipe Springs during the period for reasons other than polygamy. Some of them accompanied foremen, cowboys, ranch hands, and other hired men employed by Woolley and Seegmiller. Cowboy Parley Allred, for example, kept his wife and

³⁸ Elizabeth Jensen, “Sanctuary,” 1–2.

³⁹ Interview of Min Adams, Kanab, Utah, by Leonard Heaton, Acting Superintendent, Pipe Spring National Monument, June 1, 1949, 2, in PSLA, FH, Adams.

⁴⁰ Florence Snow Woolley, “Pipe Springs according to Mother’s Paper given before her D. U. P. Camp,” 1–2, WSC, b3, f9.

⁴¹ Many of these can be found in WSC.

⁴² Florence Snow Woolley, “Pologymist [*sic*] wives living at Pipe Springs, from 1886 to 1891,” WSC, b3, f9.

baby son at Winsor Castle. Thornton Hepworth's wife Elzina was there with two small children as was Squire Hepworth's wife Sarah, with Squire's infant namesake (nicknamed Ted). At different times George Hicks, Squire Hepworth, and Lorin Little and perhaps others served as foreman at Pipe Springs, and Hicks and Little may have each had a wife there as well.⁴³ There were so many females at Pipe that Woolley's general handyman, Max McArthur, left sometime in 1888 "because he could not stand to be bossed around by so many women." John Adams replaced McArthur as handyman in July 1888, thinking "he could stand any thing" this unique bevy of women in the desert could require of him. He brought his wife Minnie and their baby daughter "out to the fort." "Flora's Prison" was so crowded at the time that John and Minnie Adams "made their home in the east room, ground floor of the south wing of the fort" which was also called "the Spring Room." Normally not a living space, this large room had a trough with Pipe Spring itself running through it. The moving water and rock walls kept the temperature cool and the room was used to store milk, cheese, beef, and other perishables. John and Minnie Adams had to do their cooking in the courtyard and eat their meals on the porch.

John served as "handy man for 13 women who was in Arizona to get away from the US Marshals" and Minnie told of how when she and John first arrived at Pipe in July 1888 the newly married couple attempted to follow general Mormon standards of hospitality and freely fed the "Drummers" or traveling salesmen who passed through "and did not charge them for it." "There was a lot of Drummers in those days and they always had to stop at Pipe [and] it soon got around that the Adams was giving free meals to all who came that way." When "Min and John got their

⁴³ Dee Woolley's daughter Elizabeth wrote that "A foreman was a necessity for carrying on the many activities connected with the church herd, father's personal herd, the gardens and domesti[c] live stock, and the oversight and care of mother and her children." She indicated that while the job of Foreman was "a big task," it was "not usually a twelve-month assignment." See Elizabeth Jensen, "The Cattle Business," 3-4, WSC, b1, f7.

monthly pay check” they were surprised to find that they had “paid out more for [groceries] to feed their guests than what their check was.” Minnie asked Flora Woolley “to do some thing about it.” Minnie reported that “Mrs Wooley said, ‘do you re[a]lize that you have taken my cash customers away from me . . . you are to blame not me[!]” Sixty years later, Minnie told Pipe Spring’s National Monument Assistant Superintendent Leonard Heaton: “Well[,] we Adams desid[ed] that we would not give any more free meals and Mrs Wooley go[t] her borders back and we [then] got along just fine” though two drummers “got so sore” at the whole establishment “for not giving them free meals” that they never stopped at Pipe again.⁴⁴

In addition to acting as a cow hand, John’s job was to “get the wood, cut it up and milk the cows night & morning, tend the gardens and fields, and to do any other odd jobs that might come along.” More than sixty years later Minnie Adams bitterly remembered that all those women kept her husband “busy all the time.” In March 1889 Georgie Thatcher “jumped” all over John “for not doing as she wanted him to *when she first asked him.*” According the Minnie, “the wood was getting low at the fort and John left as soon as the morning work was done for another load of wood from the near by hills and [it] was about two oclock when he returned with the load. He unloaded the wood and took care of the team,” while Minnie prepared his lunch. He had just sat down to eat when Flora’s small boys, LeGrand, Dillworth, and Roy “came to the back window and shouted that Aunt Georgia wanted some wood *right now.*” John calmly “told the boys to tell Aunt Georgia he would get the wood as soon as he finished his dinner, and went on eating.” Minnie remembered, “Pretty soon the boys were back and said Aunt Georgia said she wanted . . . that wood right now and not to keep her waiting for it. Mr. Adams again told the boys to tell Aunt Georgia that . . . as soon as he had his dinner he would get the wood.” “When Aunt

⁴⁴ Interview of Min Adams, Kanab, Utah, by Leonard Heaton, June 1, 1949, 1–2, PSLA, VF, FH

Georgia Ann saw him at the wood pile she came out and gave Mr. Adams to understand that when she wanted any thing it was his place to drop anything he was doing and come.” After enduring several insults, “Mr Adams laid the ax down and told her he did not have to work for her for a living and that [very] after noon [he] hooked up the team on the wagon[,] loaded his wife and child and their belonging[s,] and moved to Kanab.”⁴⁵ After John Adams abruptly left, Ed Pugh was hired to take his place but it is not known if he brought a wife or how long he stayed.⁴⁶ In addition to a constant stream of handymen, it seems teenaged girls were sometimes brought to Pipe to work for the women, including two sisters named Abbie and Alvira, whose father apparently also worked at Pipe Springs.

Mary Agnes (Molly) Lund Judd, another resident who was not included on Flora’s list, had a son named Robert (Bertie) Lund Judd who was born on the underground in 1885. Her husband, Bishop Thomas Judd of the St. George First Ward, was a wealthy Mormon merchant and one of the founders of the St. George mercantile firm Woolley, Lund, & Judd. (The Woolley was Dee’s “twin,” Edwin G. Woolley). Judd had also been a member of the Board of Directors of the CCCC and had worked closely in that connection with Erastus Snow, Dee Woolley, and Dan Seegmiller. Judd was “the active spirit and manager of the cotton and woolen mills” at Washington, was heavily involved in mining at Silver Reef, and had large interest in “the La Verkin ranch near Toquerville.” A true economic visionary, he dreamed of bringing a canal along the edge of the Hurricane Cliffs to bring water to his ranch, which he hoped to turn into a giant fruit orchard in the desert. A marvel in pioneer engineering, his Hurricane Canal was a

⁴⁵ Interview of Min Adams, Kanab, Utah, by Leonard Heaton, June 1, 1949, 4–5

⁴⁶ Ellen Chamberlain to Leonard Heaton, undated, typescript, PSLA, PISP1619; and Interview of Min Adams, Kanab, Utah, by Leonard Heaton, 1 June 1949, 1–5.

success and is still in use.⁴⁷ A man of considerable means, Bishop Judd spared no expense in keeping his plural wife hidden from deputies. Molly went as far afield as Europe to avoid capture and her son Bertie was said to have learned to walk on a ship while crossing the ocean.⁴⁸ Thomas Judd was captured in the spring of 1888 and held over while the deputies attempted to roundup his “evidence,” i.e., Molly and Bertie. At the time of his capture, Molly, Bertie, and Josephine Snow had been undergrounding in Salt Lake City. Arrangements had already been made for Molly and her son to join the little colony at Pipe Spring after a “fling” in Utah’s capital city but once Tom Judd was held over, Molly fled. Writing from her hidden quarters in downtown Salt Lake City the day Molly left, Josephine wrote Georgiana at Pipe, conveying her loneliness and informing her that Molly had stopped along the way. “I don’t think it will interfere with her going to Pipe” she assured Georgiana, “but I don’t think you better let anyone know she is going there. These things give me the blues most horribly . . . I almost made up my mind to go home with the folks but have decided to stay a month longer [as] there may never be another opportunity like the present. If Martie goes to Pipe I shall go with her[.] if not [I] will go home when Pa and Mother start to Mexico. I can’t bear to think of Ma going off again, but of course he [Erastus Snow] can’t go alone. He expects to go about the middle of May.” The grand jury was forced to dismiss all charges against Bishop Judd because Molly could not be found and her husband was liberated for lack of evidence.⁴⁹

⁴⁷ *Salt Lake Tribune*, 21 June 1896, 9, UDN. Judd’s “energy and public spirit have identified him with almost every enterprise of any magnitude in Washington county since his young manhood.”

⁴⁸ Various histories of Mary Agnes Lund Judd, in <http://www.glennperry.co.uk/MARY%20LUND%20JUDD%20BIO.html>; and various Lund and Judd family histories in <http://www.russbateman.com/wilsonlund.html>.

⁴⁹ Erastus Snow, “in retirement at Lucy’s,” to Dear Georgia [Snow Thatcher], September 16, 1887, and Josephine [Snow Tanner], Salt Lake City, to Dear Georgie [Snow Thatcher], April 10, 1888, in Erastus Snow Letters and Correspondence, USHS “When Tom was held over Mollie decided it was best to leave the city till it was settled, and has been intending to leave in a few days, but last night just as she had got the Babe ready for bed a telegram came setting her to change quarters quickly,”; *Deseret News*, May 30, 1888, 1, and June 13, 1888, 14, UDN; Joyce

The plural wives, their children, and female helpers living at Pipe Springs were often accompanied by native women and children. The Kaibab came from their farms at nearby Moccasin begging for bread, and the Mormon women at Pipe frequently put them to work in exchange for bread, flour, beef, milk, butter, or a few coins. Kaibab children played with the white children and they learned bits and pieces of each others' language and culture. Pipe Springs was alive with the chatter and banter of women and children, supplemented by deeper voices of the cowboys and other hired hands, as well as the drummers and other travelers who came and went as their business required.⁵⁰ The west room of the main floor of the south building was used as a storage and fit-out room for the cowboys. Despite the constant activity at the fort, women who were deprived of the company of their husbands felt lonely in their exile. The residents of Pipe Springs relied heavily on the similar sized community at nearby Moccasin, which was also sheltering polygamists. Ellen Chamberlain wrote that "Sister Woolley had a phone in her house but there was no cars then around us. Bro. Wooley [*sic*] had a buckboard there we used to go to Moccasin every Sunday" for church services. Flora's young son Dilworth was old enough to load the buckboard and "drive us over [to Moccasin] to Sunday school which was a comfort to me." Ellen explained that before coming to Pipe, she "had never been away from home [or] from the folks before." "I would [so] enjoy [*sic*] the Moccasin people," she wrote, especially since they were all from her home town of Orderville. Truvey Heaton, an old friend, always gave them melons to take back to Pipe. Knowing that the large band of women at

Kinkead, ed., *A Schoolmarm All My Life: Personal Narratives from Frontier Utah* (Salt Lake City: Signature Books, 1996), 212; Dixie Judd Burgess and Margaret Reid Oxborrow, "Thomas and Mary Ashworth Judd," chapter 49 in Margaret Reid Oxborrow, et al, *White River Valley: Then and Now, 1898–1980* (Provo, UT: Melayne Printing, n.d.), <http://whiterivervalley.org>; Thomas Judd Obituary in JH, 7 June 1922, 4; and in *Ogden Standard Examiner*, July 5, 1945, 9, ancestry.com.

⁵⁰ Ellen Chamberlain to Leonard Heaton. Ellen remembered "I don't know what I would have done without the Moccasin folks."

Pipe were dependent solely on Flora's garden, when the weekly wagonload of women and children from Pipe Springs came to church services in Moccasin, Howard Spencer loaded their wagon up with vegetables and melons. A regular attendee of these church services, Ellen Chamberlain wrote that the women of Pipe Springs, or at least those from Orderville, got their "garden stuff from Moccasin mostly."⁵¹

All the women on Flora's list of Pipe Springs' plural wives were either relatives or connections of Erastus Snow and Dee Woolley, or the wives of prominent local church leaders. In the priesthood-driven hierarchy of southern Utah, Apostle Snow ultimately decided who lived at Pipe Springs and three of his daughters resided there. In addition to his *ex officio* presidency over Winsor Castle, as patron, benefactor, father-in-law, and sometimes business partner of Edwin D. Woolley, Jr., and as father of the matron of Pipe Springs, Erastus Snow maintained a filial presidency over the entire establishment. He often stayed there with his family members "for weeks at a time" as he travelled between St. George and Mexico with his son-in-law, Apostle Moses Thatcher.⁵² Snow's daughter Georgiana (called Georgie) was the plural wife of Thatcher and sister of Flora Woolley. Georgie spent an extended period at the fort as did her sister Josephine. During Josephine's stay at Pipe, her husband, Joseph Tanner, returned from a three and a half year mission in Europe and the Ottoman Empire to become the temporary president of Brigham Young Academy in Provo.⁵³ Sometimes another sister, Elisabeth, who had married Antony W. Ivins of St. George, made extended visits to Pipe with other Snow family

⁵¹ Ellen Chamberlain to Leonard Heaton.

⁵² Erastus Snow Letters and Correspondence, USHS, especially E. Fairbanks [code for Erastus Fairbanks Snow], Manti City, Sanpete, to Ashby Snow, St. George, 5 November 1887; WSC; and Heber Grant Ivins, "Autobiography of H. Grant Ivins," 2–3, H. Grant Ivins Papers, b4, f18, UU.

⁵³ See Orson F. Whitney, *History of Utah*, 4: 354–355; and Margery W. Ward, *A Life Divided: The Biography of Joseph Marion Tanner 1859–1927* (Salt Lake City: Publishers Press, 1980), 24–25.

members to keep their relatives company in their confinement at the lonely desert outpost.

Daniel Seegmiller sent his plural wife Emma Isabella Carroll to give birth at Pipe. Her baby, named Daniel after his father, “came normally and on schedule and Emma was soon back in her home [on the] Upper Kanab Ranch.”⁵⁴

Husbands (those who were not incarcerated) visited frequently, as did a host of relatives and friends. Thomas Chamberlain, Dee’s first counsellor in the stake presidency, lived in Orderville and kept two wives, Ann and Ellen Carling, at “Woolleys’ lambing ground.” He came monthly to “bring supplies and [to] make sure all was well with them.” Ellen remembered Josephine Snow’s husband, Joseph M. Tanner, who had recently returned from a mission to Constantinople and the Holy Land, telling a gaggle of interested women and children about “his trip around the world as we would sit on the rocks on the east entryway of the Fort.” Isaac Carling came frequently to visit his daughters, Ellen and Ann Chamberlain, and his grandchildren, sometimes bringing his sons Jessie and Isaac, Jr., for company. A superb carpenter, Isaac Carling brought boxes of hand-crafted wooden toys. Fondly remembering his visits at Pipe, Carling’s granddaughter Lucy Chamberlain wrote, “Grandpa brought us some little trinkets he had made with the scrawl saw [*sic*]. He was an expert carpenter, and used to make all kinds of things, such as little churns, doll cupboards, tables, cribs, etc. for us at Christmas time.” Arriving in a buckboard “loaded with fruit and toys he had made” along with “his violin to play sweet music to cheer them.” Isaac Carling, Jr., brought an accordion and together with “Grandpa Carling” they filled Pipe’s courtyard with music as the children accompanied them with Jew’s harps, harmonicas, and their happy voices. Young Lucy Chamberlain later remembered: “Seems like I never did hear such sweet music.” According to her, Flora Woolley “held school for the

⁵⁴ Elizabeth Jensen, “Pipe Springs Becomes a Sanctuary,” 4, WSC, b3, f10.

children” to usefully occupy their time.⁵⁵ During this period, children were entertained by the excitement of cattle and horses and their young frolicking around the corrals and troughs as well as the fascinating work of the cowboys. Old Indian trails on Pipe Springs Point provided children with countless hours of exploring and adventure as they scoured the hillside behind Winsor Castle gathering ancient pottery sherds and broken arrow points cast off by generations of Kaibab and other indigenous peoples. Older boys like Dilworth Woolley manufactured homemade stilts and took turns “storking” around the courtyard. Once while stilting on the fort’s second story balconies and catwalks he tripped and went head over heels, slamming into the courtyard’s hard surface with his head and neck. He was stiff and sore for days, but survived.

The numbers of children at Pipe were augmented by what Flora called the “little outlaws” who were born there during the raid. She left conflicting reports of how many were born. On one occasion she wrote that during her time at Pipe (1886 to 1891) six “little outlaws” were born there, 5 boys and 1 girl—not very good odds for the continuance of polygamy.⁵⁶ Another time she wrote that there were “ten children born there during those five hard years of the raid . . . so the presence of a mid wife was almost a necessity.”⁵⁷ At least four different midwives spent time

⁵⁵ Mrs. Howard Thompson, “Thomas Chamberlain Family Bulletin Featuring Ann Carling Chamberlain, 1967,” 4–5, and 25, CHD; and Ellen Chamberlain to Leonard Heaton.

⁵⁶ Adonis Robinson, *Kane County*, 70; and Flora Woolley, “History of the Pipe Springs Monument, by Flora Snow Woolley, to the ‘Camp Cleone’ Daughters of Pioneers, Kanab, Nov. 9, 1934,” 2, WSC, b3, f9.

⁵⁷ Flora Woolley, “Reminiscences,” 52. Other sources verify that the following children were born at Pipe Springs during the Raid. Verda Thatcher, daughter of Moses Thatcher and Georgiana Snow, born 21 August 1886, new.familysearch.org; Veda Bringhurst, daughter of Mary Jeanette Stapley and William Bringhurst, 8 December 1888, new.familysearch.org; Marion Snow Tanner, son of Joseph Marion Tanner and Josephine Snow, born 15 December 1888, Maurice Tanner, *Descendants of John Tanner* (u.p.: The Tanner Family Association, 1923), 96; Arthur Woolley, son of Flora Snow and Edwin D. Woolley, Jr., was born on 10 April 1889, Julius Woolley Dalley, “Experiences in the Life of Edwin Dilworth Woolley, Jr., and His Family,” PSLA, VF, FH, Woolley, Salt Lake *Telegram*, 20 April 1940, 9, UDN, and *Utah Since Statehood*, 2: 564; Unnamed twin daughters were born in 1889 to Mary Caroline Poulsen, wife of Hyrum Smith Woolley, brother of Dee Woolley. Elizabeth Jensen, “Refuge,” 6–7; Edwin Chamberlain, son of Thomas Chamberlain and Ellen Elvira Carling was born 12 February 1890. **Earl Harrison Davis, Hobson (Long Beach, CA: n.p., 1957), 47 or 335, probably FHL**; and Francis A. Esplin, *One Hundred Years of Chamberlains, 1854–1954* (N.p., 1954), 122. Joseph Chamberlain, son of Thomas Chamberlain

living at Pipe including Mary Meeks from Orderville, Macey Stewart from Kanab, a Sister Emit, and a Sister Bowers. Mary Meeks had studied pioneer medicine with her husband Priddy Meeks, “who was the principal doctor or physician in the communities of Kane County.” Once when no midwife was to be found, Flora was thrust in to service. Calling upon a similarly inexperienced woman from Moccasin named Kazia Esplin to help her assist Ellen Chamberlain, Flora viewed delivering this child “one of the great experiences of her long and busy life.” She repeatedly told her children how “the baby came after a particularly long hard labor.” He was “a blue baby,” she told them, “all but dead when he arrived. In the emergency I did everything common sense and tradition could suggest and they must have been the right things to do for the little boy lived and the grateful mother gave him my husband’s name, Edwin, in my honor.”⁵⁸

The birth of a pair of female twins born sometime in 1889, was “the one sad and unfortunate birth of all these troubled years at Pipe Springs,” according to Woolley family histories. Caroline Poulsen, plural wife of Dee’s brother Hyrum Smith Woolley, lived in Ogden. Hyrum arranged for Caroline to travel south during her confinement and for a time she lived in Kanab under the alias of Caddie Jacobs. At some point before delivery she moved to be near the midwives at Pipe Springs. Tragically, her twin daughters lived only a few hours and Caroline herself nearly died from complications. Her husband could only stay a few days and left his wife in desperate condition. Three weeks after giving birth, Caddie had been moved back to Kanab. Apostle Abraham Cannon wrote in his diary that he and his colleagues “administer[ed] to Sister Jacobs, an ‘underground,’ who three weeks ago gave birth to still born twins. She had a terrible time,” he wrote, “and her life was only saved by faith.” Bessie remembered that she and her

and Ann Carling, was born 27 April 1891. See Francis A. Esplin, *One Hundred Years of Chamberlains, 1854–1954* (N.p., 1954), 101.

⁵⁸ Elizabeth Jensen, “Sanctuary,” 2–3; Flora Woolley, “Reminiscences,” 51.

siblings were “continually cautioned never to divulge” Aunt Caddie’s secret though she admitted they “knew very little to divulge, only that there was deep mystery surrounding some people. We knew better than to ask questions. [Aunt Caddie] left as she came[,] in the darkness of night[,] and took her secrets with her.” Bessie, who was only about four years of age at the time, later wrote: “We little girls used to gather wild flowers near the cemetery and decorate the graves of these tiny babies who had lived so brief a life. To lose a baby at any time is a tragedy, but to lose two at one time and under such trying circumstances is a double tragedy. Truly, these women paid a big price for their underground babies.”⁵⁹

Mary Melinda (Linda) Farnsworth Mariger , wife of Lawrence Mariger (Kanab’s new bishop)⁶⁰ also gave birth at the fort, and having served as Kanab’s telegraph operator she made a lucrative living for a time serving as Winsor Castle’s telegrapher. Dee’s daughter Mary (through his wife Emma) wrote that she “lived with Aunt Flora at Pipe Springs one summer and took lessons in telegraphy from Linda Marriger [*sic*] and became proficient enough that she left me to take charge of the office while she took a week’s vacation.” The telegraph line was operational when both Linda Mariger and Josephine Tanner were available to operate it. Flora wrote that “this little instrument made us feel almost within the bounds of civilization.” Through the telegraph, they could be alerted of the deputies approach at least a day before their arrival and their “scattering” into the brush could be more orderly. Deputy Marshals “often stopped to partake of the hospitality of Pipe Springs when their duties called them to the settlements of southern Utah.” When she got word the deputies were headed for Pipe Springs, Flora wrote that she picked “up my little brood” and escaped “to Moccasin, a small ranch three miles north.” The

⁵⁹ Elizabeth Jensen, “Refuge,” 6–7; and Abraham Cannon, “Journal,” September 18, 1890, UU.

⁶⁰ Lawrence C. Mariger was sustained as bishop of the Kanab Ward on December 18, 1887. See Kanab Stake Manuscript History, December 18, 1887, CHL.

trip required “several hours of hard traveling in a lumber wagon through heavy white sand up to the hubs of the wheels, and around rocky foothills, over sage brush as high as the horses’ backs.” By 1888 the telegraph was augmented by the telephone line President Woolley and Bishop Mariger extended from Kanab to Pipe Springs.⁶¹ Captain Frank Chururumpeak, who was spending much of his time in nearby Moccasin, was on hand to test the modern marvel. Dilworth Woolley remembered that on installing the instrument, which he described as “a piece of board with a little box-like structure holding a black mouth piece” attached on a door frame in the parlor in the west room of the north building, his father invited “Old Frank Indian to come to the phone.” Winsor Castle’s parlor was apparently packed with onlookers including several Kaibabit. Captain Frank “put the receiver to his ear with manifestations of fear in every move—listened a second or two, dropped the receiver, shook his head and mumbled something in Indian, and departed quickly.” Dilworth remembered that Frank’s reaction to the new technology “caused an explosion of laughter” from the crowd in Pipe’s parlor.⁶²

Mary Janette Stapley Bringhurst, the wife of Toquerville’s bishop, gave birth to a daughter named Veda at Pipe Springs on December 8, 1888 a few months after the bishop’s release.⁶³ Two wives of Dee Woolley’s first counsellor in the Kanab stake presidency, Thomas Chamberlain (sisters Ellen and Ann Carroll), were cared for at Pipe during their husband’s

⁶¹ Marietta M. Mariger, *Saga of Three Towns: Harrisburg, Leeds, Silver Reef* (St. George, UT: Washington County News, n.d.), and Flora Woolley, “Reminiscence,” 52. Flora indicated that the telephone was installed while Linda Mariger “was with us.”

⁶² Lenard Heaton reported that Dee Woolley connected his phone to the telegraph line in 1886 “or about that time.” See Robert C. Heaton, et al, “Moccasin and Her People,” 75. See also Marietta M. Mariger, *Saga of Three Towns: Harrisburg, Leeds, Silver Reef* (Panguitch, UT: Garfield County News, [1951]), 97–98; Mary Chamberlain, *Handmaiden*, 89; Elizabeth Jensen, “Refuge,” 4; C. Leonard Heaton, “Some Memories of Indians: Indians and the Telephone,” in Robert C. Heaton, et al, “Moccasin and Her People,” 2:88; and “Telegraph and Telephone,” 3, WSC, b3.

⁶³ See Elizabeth Jensen, “Refuge,” 6. Ironically, Bishop William A. Bringhurst was captured for marrying too many women on Valentine’s Day 1888. He served a regular six months sentence at the penitentiary in Salt Lake City, and another month in lieu of paying required fines. See *Deseret News*, April 18, 1888, 9, and September 26, 1888, 9, UDN.

incarceration.⁶⁴ Flora listed another Toquerville woman, a “Sister Langford,” who also stayed at Pipe while her husband “wore the stripes.” This may well have been twenty-three-year-old Rose Ellen Jackson Langford, second wife of James Harvey Langford, Jr. As in the biblical story of Jacob, Rachel, and Leah, Harvey had fallen in love with Rose Ellen and was coerced by his father-in-law-to-be to marry her older sister Mary Lydia first to obtain his beloved’s hand. While he married the sisters the same day, according to family tradition Harvey only took his second but favorite wife on the honeymoon. The husband of two sisters, Harvey was captured at the same time as Thomas Chamberlain, and went to prison on the very same day. At the time of Harvey’s capture, he and Rose Ellen were living at Junction in Long Valley not far from Chamberlain’s Orderville. Rose Ellen had just given birth, and in order to convict her husband, the deputies had tried to take her to Beaver. Harvey’s mother, Mary Caroline Turnbaugh Langford, while acting as midwife for her daughter-in-law, drove the deputies from her son’s young wife and new baby with loaded shotgun. The persistent deputies returned three weeks later, however, and took Rose Ellen to Beaver to testify against her husband. Incensed by the indignity of the whole ordeal, Rose Ellen reportedly refused to cooperate, boldly answering “I don’t know” to every question the Judge asked. Perhaps she did time at Pipe to escape doing time in “the Pen” for contempt of court like some other recalcitrant female witnesses did. Harvey Langford spent his time in the penitentiary carving baby rattles and other toys out of wood for his five young children with a common table knife.⁶⁵ Martie Snow, a younger sister of Flora,

⁶⁴ Flora Woolley, “History of the Pipe Springs Monument”; and Flora Woolley, “Pipe Springs according to Mother’s Paper,” 1–2.

⁶⁵ See Ida-Rose Langford Hall, “The Progenitors and Descendants of Fielding Langford,” (1970), 140–148, FHL. A number of women did time in “the Pen” for not testifying against their husbands. For example, in February 1888 Isabella Adamson of American Fork, “who refused to testify in a case under the Edmunds law, was imprisoned in the Utah Pen. for contempt.” See “Chronology for 1888,” in *Deseret News*, March 28, 1891, 25, UDN.

Georgie, and Josephine, spent considerable time at Pipe visiting her sisters. She wrote their father in 1887 that cowboy Budd Andrus, a son of James Andrus, “passed Pipe and heard a cry and on enquiry of the hired man was told that a child was crying [for] its Papa!”⁶⁶

Flora Woolley ruled as matron of Winsor Castle from 1886 until 1891, when the raid subsided after church President Wilford Woodruff’s “Manifesto” of 1890 that ostensibly ended Mormon plural marriage. Like most of the women who spent time at Pipe Springs, Flora often felt isolated and alone—even though she undoubtedly saw more of her husband than any of the others because of his connection with the Ranch. But Dee Woolley was a busy man. As stake president he estimated he travelled some 3,000 miles yearly, ministering to the people of his stake and attending semi-annual General Conferences in Salt Lake City. His daughter Mary reported that her father “tried to visit the remotest branches” of his stake “at least once a year.” The Kanab stake extended from the Kane and Garfield County Line on the north to Lees Ferry on the Colorado River on the south. Mary remembered that “He always told the newly appointed Apostles that they were not fully initiated until they had visited the Kanab Stake, it being the farthest away from a railroad of any Stake in the Church.”⁶⁷ Flora wrote that Dee “had charge of the church cattle at that time, as well as having a growing herd of his own” on the same range. Dee took pains to see that “the rooms were ‘really fixed up nice.’” Notwithstanding, Flora repeatedly wrote that she felt that Winsor Castle and its desert were as much a prison as was “the mud palace,” the name by which some polygamists referred to the adobe territorial penitentiary in Sugarhouse, just south of Salt Lake City.⁶⁸ “It was in appearance very much like a prison,” she

⁶⁶ E. Snow, “in retirement at Lucy’s,” to Dear Georgia, September 16, 1887, Erastus Snow Letters and Correspondence, USHS.

⁶⁷ Mary Chamberlain, “Life of Edwin Dilworth Woolley, Junior,” 4–5.

⁶⁸ Elizabeth Jensen, “Refuge,” 9; Flora Snow Woolley, “Pipe Springs according to Mother’s Paper Given Before her D. U. P. Camp,” 1, WSC, b3, f9; and Flora Snow Woolley, *Reminiscences*, 45.

wrote, describing the castle's "two great red sand stone houses, of two stories each, built facing each other, with a court yard between," secured by "heavy batten double gates" which "closed both ends of the court." "There were no doors or windows opening on the outside" except these "heavy batten double gates" which, when shut, truly incarcerated Winsor Castle's inmates. Upon moving to Pipe Springs she took down Winsor Castle's massive batten gates. "I presume I would be called a vandal today," she wrote, "for one of the first things I did was to order the large batten doors taken down, as I felt so much like a prisoner. It was virtually [*sic*] a safety zone, so safe that other men felt safe to bring their witnesses there."⁶⁹

Flora's sister Georgiana stayed at Pipe Springs for two full years. Georgie found life "most trying," at "this isolated and . . . dreary desert refuge." Her husband Moses Thatcher was a prominent northern Utah businessman who, along with his father-in-law Erastus Snow, played a huge part in obtaining lands in Mexico for polygamist exiles. According to a niece, Georgie's

husband was a man of means and was able to provide some comforts that would make life under such harsh conditions less irksome, such as having the walls [of her rooms at Pipe] attractively papered instead of white-washed, and thus relieved the institutional-like appearance of her dwelling. The floors were covered with 'states carpet' instead of the woven rag carpets, which added a strange bit of elegance, on the out-skirts of civilization. But [Apostle Thatcher's] greatest gift of all was the sewing machine; it was almost an anachronism in the still very primitive culture of pioneer Utah. Another luxury was the privilege of having two rooms of her own in the south building.

⁶⁹ Flora Woolley, "History of the Pipe Springs Monument," 2; and Flora Snow Woolley, "Memories of the 'Raid,'" 1, in WSC, b1, f19.

Georgie gave birth to a daughter she named Verda (but called Verdie) on August 21, 1886. She took her meals with Flora in the great room on the first floor of the north building. Georgie's husband passed through Pipe often as he traveled back and forth between Utah and Mexico, preparing for the evacuation and resettlement of thousands of fleeing polygamists. "His visits to his little family were frequent. He always referred to . . . having 'visited her in the Wilderness.'" Fearing arrest, Moses' letters to Georgie were never addressed to her nor sent by regular mail. They were simply directed to "Flora Woolley, Kanab" and were "delivered by trusted friends whose interests took them by way of [Pipe's] oasis in Arizona." Money, books, boxes of material for making dresses, and other items "were sent by Dee or Marion Tanner whom [Moses] would always meet at the general conference twice each year in Salt Lake City." Early in 1888 Georgie left her Pipe Springs exile to visit her mother in St. George. In a letter dated March 24, 1888, in Salt Lake City, Moses wrote: "I am glad you returned to Pipe Springs when you did! I feel that you are safer there, at least for the present."

In the late 1880s, Winsor Castle was not surrounded by the foliage of tall trees as it is today. Anytime a new buggy of the sort the deputies travelled in came along, it caused chaos among Pipe Springs' residents until the travelers were identified. Moses, in another letter to Georgie, wrote "Dee tells me about your occasional scares! Now, you must not permit yourself to get frightened and nervous. Do just as Dee has advised and don't get uneasy. I cannot think that you will be troubled at all (i.e. by the deputies, . . .) but if you are, refuse to go one step. [Since you are in Arizona and out of the jurisdiction of Utah's marshal, the deputies] have no right to require it and if you resist they will be liable."⁷⁰ A favorite Woolley/Snow family story

⁷⁰ Elizabeth Jensen, "Refuge," 2-4.

told of a “scare” that occurred on the day before Georgie delivered her baby. A mysterious vehicle made its way toward Winsor Castle and as it approached, fun-loving Dee Woolley shouted “Run, Run, Georgie!” Considering her size and condition, the scared and exasperated mother-to-be shouted back, “No, Dee, you run!”⁷¹ Moses Thatcher considered hiding Georgie in “several other places of refuge” including out of the way places in Wyoming, Colorado, and Mexico, but to him “all seemed to be less safe” than Pipe Springs and were even more “remote from his places of business.” Located as it was on the well-beaten track between Utah and Mexico, Thatcher could visit his plural wife at Pipe conveniently and in relative safety.⁷²

The women and children at Pipe and Woolley’s ranch hands constantly watched the road to prevent the deputies from surprising them. One of Dee and Flora’s sons, wrote that “any man who was not known to be a friend was assumed to be an enemy, a spy, or a deputy U. [S.] Marshal with a warrant for father’s arrest and a suppoena for mother as a material witness.” Telescopes and field glasses were kept handy on the second story of the Castle’s main buildings and in the stone bunkhouse that commanded the west road to allow its residents to examine and identify travelers while still miles away. The castle’s “watch tower” on the north building and an outcropping of rocks on the hill just behind it called “look-out rock” were especially valuable vantage points used for this purpose.⁷³ Dee and Flora’s son Herbert wrote:

My earliest recollections are of Pipe Springs—the underground station over which [Mother] presided in martyr-majesty for so many years. She was the Queen of the

⁷¹ Elizabeth Jensen, “Refuge,” 4.

⁷² Elizabeth Jensen, “Refuge,” 4.

⁷³ [Dilworth Woolley,] “Out Law Days,” and Elizabeth Jensen, “From Dils Story and Polygamy,” both in WSC, b3, f10; and Elizabeth Jensen, “Refuge,” 15–16.

Underground. Pipe Springs to me is the symbol of devoted Mormon Women, Aunt Georgia, Aunt Josephine and others who came and went, escaping persecution, yet persecuted, withal, by the isolation of their desert retreat.

He continued that the “Deps” often came “in the night, always dreaded, unexpected and unwelcome.” From the “back of the Fort [on] the look-out rock from which a broad view of the thin road to east and west revealed to our eager gaze the approach of friend or foe.”

I well recall rushing in with the alarm that the “Deps” were coming. It was tragic news. The anticipated “Deps” held more terror for us than the prevelent [*sic*] rattlers. Mother bundled us off to Aunt Georgia’s. Too many youngsters was bad evidence against the “Polygs.” I shall not forget the consternation when Johnnie Armstrong and his pal, knowing Aunt Georgia as well as the ways of the underground, pulled in on her for dinner. We were double-quickened out the back way again and Mother gathered the two broods beneath her wing while Aunt Georgia dinned” [*sic*] the Deps. It took brave women to service Pipe Springs even after the red men ceased their macinations” [*sic*].⁷⁴

Through an elaborate system of signal flags, which could be seen for miles, Dee could quickly scamper into the cliffs with his .45-60 Winchester rifle to call his cowboys in when there was trouble. Similarly, a sheet or tablecloth thrown over a clothes line signaled “all clear,” calling Dee in from the various mountain hideouts he established in the Vermilion Cliffs overlooking

⁷⁴ Herbert Elliott Woolley, “My Reflections,” 4, PSLA, VF, FH, Woolley.

Pipe Springs. Dee's white and Native American friends from miles around took it upon themselves to warn him when strangers were in the area.⁷⁵

“Truly an Oasis in the Desert.”

Notwithstanding the “desolate barrenness” and the isolation Flora Woolley felt there, she wrote that “Pipe Springs was truly an oasis in the desert.” She described that as one looked away from Winsor Castle, “as far as the eye could see” in three different directions there was “nothing . . . but the desert sage and cactus.” But at Pipe itself “a large alfalfa patch” and a “few trees and shrubs” looked incredibly verdant “in such a setting.” She reported that former inhabitants of the old fort had brought “many acres” under cultivation. “A row of red plum trees, and one of black native currants, & apple trees furnished our fruit,” she said, while “the very fertile little vegetable garden supplied our needs for that kind of food.” She wrote that “this miniature farm was located south of the houses and was irrigated by a stream taken from two small ponds which were artificially made by storing the water from the spring that issued from in the cellar.” With so many children on the premises, these ponds were “a source of great worry” to Flora. “Whenever a child was missing for an unusual length of time,” she explained, “I was always sure that he had fallen into the pond.” On two separate occasions she had the hired men drain the ponds to find tiny bodies that thankfully turned up elsewhere—alive. Pipe’s water attracted all sorts of wild animals, including wolves and coyotes, as well as dangerous mustangs and feral cattle. Enough to make any mother frantic, the place also abounded tarantulas, scorpions, and rattlesnakes.⁷⁶

⁷⁵ Elizabeth Jensen, “Refuge,” 15–16. Edwin D. Woolley, Jr., “From Father’s reminiscences,” 1, WSC, b1, f13; and Mary Chamberlain, “Life of Edwin Dilworth Woolley, Junior,” 8.

⁷⁶ Flora Woolley, *Reminiscences*, 57–58.

Flora remembered that they always had plenty to eat at Pipe Springs. “We always milked several cows, kept pigs and chickens,” she said, “and the meat supply was cheap and abundant as it was our custom to have a steer killed whenever the need occurred. We would keep what we could conveniently use before it spoiled and would share the rest among neighbors, who in their turn would kill a beef or mutton and repay their obligation in kind. This meat was often varied with haunch of venison brought in from the mountains [usually by Indians].⁷⁷ One cohab resident, however, wrote that “we used to feel there was quite a class distinction” at Winsor Castle “because the Woolleys had so much and we had so little.” She was also cognizant that “Sister Woolley and her family lived in the north house *all by themselves*” which was “fixed up very nice” while the rest crowded into what space was left.⁷⁸

The matron of Winsor Castle wrote that “this little oasis was also the headquarters for the cowboys who looked after the cattle that were owned and run on this range.” “Several large brands or herds were owned by local people,” she wrote, “as well as the church cattle that were managed by my husband.”⁷⁹ The Woolleys described that during their tenure at Pipe, the west ground floor room of the south building was used as a “camp house for the cowpokes and ranch hands.” Though on occasion it was also inhabited “by the ‘hunted’ woman on the underground and her children,” it was mostly used for storing the cowboys’ “camp equipment and all the stuff which goes with a cattle ranch.” It was packed with saddles, bridles, hobbles, bedrolls, ropes, branding irons and the like, and the cowboys’ Winchesters hung on the walls. When vacant, the cowboys could use the fireplace in the east end for cooking, but they usually preferred eating out

⁷⁷ Flora Woolley, *Reminiscences*, 58.

⁷⁸ Lucy Chamberlain, “Early Life of Lucy Chamberlain,” in Ann Esplin Thompson, *History of Henry Cox Esplin and Lucy Chamberlain: Roots and Branches* (St. George, UT: Published independently by Howard and Ann Thompson, 1983), 137, FHL, italics mine.

⁷⁹ Flora Woolley, *Reminiscences*, 58.

of doors. The cowpokes' "culinary equipment," which consisted of heavy iron dutch ovens, frying pans, coffee pots, and kettles, were stored in this camp house. Dee and his foreman may have also kept a small business office there.⁸⁰ Acknowledging that much of "the work of the cowboys" was seasonal, Flora described that during spring and fall roundups all the cowboys that could bunked in the small rock houses around the fort the Winsors and the Youngs and other construction workers had lived in while Winsor Castle was being built. During the spring roundup, calves and long ears were branded, castrated, and marked with earmarks and waddles to further delineate ownership. During the summer "buyers" came to purchase marketable cattle and arrange for their delivery at the railheads for shipment east or west in the fall. Those not purchased by the buyers were scattered out again on the various ranges for wintering and another season of reproduction and fattening.

Flora and her children wrote great descriptions of the gigantic herds of thirsty cattle that gathered at Pipe Springs during the dry seasons when "rain was scarce and the watering holes" on the desert evaporated. Daughter Elizabeth wrote that during wet seasons there were "seep holes, or low spots where rainwater collected" where animals could find water at various places on the Hurricane Plateau. When it was especially wet there were even great shallow lakes which developed, such as Canaan Lake near Canaan Ranch, in which stock could slake their thirst. But "in dry seasons these would all dry up and the stock would have to come to this one spring to drink." "The little spring of water" Elizabeth wrote, "was the one watering place that never failed the stock and other living creatures of the Pipe spring plains." Before the Woolleys' arrival, several rock-lined ponds had been built to collect spring water as it emerged from Winsor Castle's south building. (Water from this main spring was augmented from other small springs

⁸⁰ Elizabeth Jensen, "Pipe Springs Story," 44.

which together gave rise to the plural “Pipe Springs.”) Head gates in the ponds could divert this water into ditches that irrigated the garden and about fifty acres of alfalfa or into great troughs made from the hollowed trunks of giant cottonwood trees to water thousands of head of cattle and horses. These homemade troughs were “set partly in the ground and kept full by diverting a stream” from the ponds through ditches and pipes. The ponds were enclosed in a “stockade” to keep animals away from the source.

When the Woolley’s arrived, Dee expanded this massive stock-watering system by adding “four large wooden tanks,” each six feet wide, twelve feet long and four feet deep crafted out of 3” x 12” planks. Together the tanks and great troughs provided water for thousands of cattle, range horses, and wild mustangs. Elizabeth wrote that

both tanks and troughs were . . . coated with slimy green moss which looked so cool in the hot sun to us, and must have looked inviting to the thirsty animals coming in from a scorching desert. In times of drought[,] live stock would come from a distance of 50 miles or more to drink. At such times thousands of cattle would [come to Pipe Springs] and the plain would be one vast undulating mass of brown shaggy backs, as the weary famished creatures walked with their heads almost touching the ground as if the neck were too weary to hold them up.

During the driest months the whole area was engulfed in giant clouds of fine white dust that lay like snow over a foot deep in some places. The only relief from the dust was from water splashed or leaked from the troughs, or from the thousands of “cow pies” which moistened the incredibly dry earth. Dee and Flora’s daughter Rachel recalled that one of their pastimes “was to sit on the

high pole fence and watch the cattle trailing in single file heads to tails (much like bumper to bumper now a days) as far out over the parched earth as the eye could see. When they reached the water troughs and had drunk their fill—many weaker ones being trampled under foot by the stronger, they seemed scarcely able to make the long tedious march back to find a few scarce blades of grass, only to have to repeat the pilgrimage in another two or three days.” Flora wrote that the “crystal cool water was nectar to the famished herds that would smell it far out on the desert.” As the gathering cattle pushed, stamped, bellowed, and competed for prime watering positions around the troughs and tanks, bull fights happened frequently. “When two of these enraged animals would begin a duel,” Flora wrote, “it was usually fought to the death.” Spectators could watch these spontaneous bull fights from the elevation of the walls, ramparts, and balconies. During one memorable feud, Flora wrote that “one bull lifted his adversary upon his horns and landed him [on his back] in one of the troughs of water . . . It took several men many hours of hard work to get the subdued creature out of his bath tub.”⁸¹

Usually these bovine visitors to Pipe Springs were harmless enough as they “would come and drink their fill” and then return to their grazing. But once these wild creatures were corralled, Flora observed, they “were not so docile.” One time during a spring roundup when a thousand of these frustrated critters were corralled for the night,

some prowling animal must have frightened them, for with a terrifying bellow they stampeded, knocking down the whole side of the corral, [and] they scattered over the range. This meant many more days of hard work for the cowboys and expense for the owners who must gather them from the four quarters again. It is well that the stampede

⁸¹ Elizabeth Jensen, “The Cattle Business,” 10–11.

took place in the night time when no children were out playing, for life was full enough of dangers for them as it was. One day the cowboys were trying to saddle and [bridle] a bronco for “breaking” when it broke loose in its mad frenzy and dashed up into the courtyard [of the fort], rearing on its hind legs and pawing the air with its front feet. It dashed under the porch of my home where the baby LeGrand was playing, [and] reared and pawed at the windows. I rushed out to find the child under the hind legs of the frantic animal. It was a narrow escape but the baby received only a scratch on his foot where the hoof of the animal had grazed it.⁸²

Flora wrote that rattlesnakes were as plentiful as “jack-rabbits on the desert” in her “Adamless eden” and were a grave threat to the children. One day as she was picking peas in the garden and came across a great rattler, she chose to kill it herself with a stone, rather than calling one of the “boys or men to dispose of it.” “I was not always so resourceful or so courageous,” Flora reflected, “or I should have treated, in a similar manner, a coyote that intruded in my family affairs.” One of the more curious architectural features of Winsor Castle is a door that leads from the master bedroom on the second floor of the north building onto the side of the hill. One summer evening Flora put “little daughter Bessie” to bed, leaving that door slightly ajar for air circulation. When she came back after dark to put her older children to bed, she was shocked to find a large coyote asleep with Bessie “on the foot of the little girl’s trundle bed.” Equally startled by the light in Flora’s hand, the coyote arose and gaped at her. The mother instinctively

⁸² Flora Woolley, *Reminiscences*, 60.

screamed and ran to call “the men” but by the time they arrived “the animal had taken his leave.”⁸³

The desert climate made Flora complain that “it was hot and so dry that when the wind storms came the red sand drifted” into the fort “like snow.” When one of these storms arose, she reported, “I never preten[d]ed to do any housework, other than the cooking and eating and keeping the food away from the drifting sand. But after it had blown itself out which usually took two or three days, I would have a thorough housecleaning and would literally shovel the sand up from the floors.”⁸⁴ She and Dee planted a row of elm trees “in the wake of the prevailing winds” to try to “obviate much of this unpleasantness.” Their young sons Dilworth and Bert carried water in buckets from the spring in the cellar to water the trees. It was a daunting task for two small boys. Flora wrote that “the trees all lived, which speaks well for the faithfulness of the water-carriers.” For their reward Dee gave them a year’s subscription to the *Juvenile Instructor*, a Mormon magazine for children and youth. Flora wrote that the family moved away before the trees “were large enough to serve the purpose for which they were planted.” “One who plants a tree,” she philosophized, “always plants for those who come after, and so did we.” Late in her life she wrote: “I have seen many [a] tourist enjoying their shade since the Castle has been made a National Monument so I know the little elm trees are serving the purpose of their creation.”⁸⁵ Dee further improved the property by purchasing a barrel of carp from William D. Johnson in Kanab and planted them in the Pipe’s ponds and reservoirs.⁸⁶ Flora had Winsor Castle’s huge

⁸³ Flora Woolley, *Reminiscences*, 61.

⁸⁴ Flora Woolley, *Reminiscences*, 62.

⁸⁵ Flora Woolley, *Reminiscences*, 62.

⁸⁶ About 1883 William D. Johnson raised fish in some ponds he constructed in Kanab. Dee Woolley paid “\$1 each for two year olds” and stocked the reservoirs at Pipe Springs. The Heatons of Moccasin also stocked at least one of their ponds with “the finny tribe.” *Deseret News*, 25 May 1887, 15, UDN.

gates removed and since the “Indian Wars” were over, she cut window holes into exterior walls and had glass installed.⁸⁷

Flora said that “this oasis had always been the natural gathering place of the Piute Indian Tribe, because of the spring of water and its accessibility to other haunts, as well as being in the pathway of other tribes of these nomads.” “Fortunately for us dwellers in this out of the way fortress,” she wrote, the Indians they encountered were “friendly and peaceable.” Their “main object” was to “beg for food and clothing, or if it were the right season of the year, to trade pinon nuts and pine gum for articles they most desired.” Flora wrote that the Kaibabit’s manner of living “was so meagre and their conditions so pitiable that even under most stringent economic conditions one could never refuse them a bit of flour or a loaf of bread.”⁸⁸ Flora hired Kaibabit women to help the White women in their work, and Dee hired males as laborers and cowboys, including “Danny Bullets” whom Woolley loved like a son. According to all accounts, their table was always open to Native Americans. Little Lucy Chamberlain recalled a memorable Thanksgiving dinner at Pipe Springs when her father came to visit his two wives and their families. The Woolleys and the Chamberlains and perhaps the whole Pipe Springs “colony” shared a sumptuous feast. “The grownups ate first,” Lucy remembered, “then a friendly old Indian sat down to eat with the children He started blessing the Wo[o]lleys family[,] then the Chamberlains, then started blessing the food, naming . . . each kind of food [individually], opening his eyes and looking around to see what next to bless. One of the Woolley boys started to giggle. The Indian looked at him rather angrily, then went [right] on praying.”⁸⁹

⁸⁷ Elisabeth R. Snow, St. George, “to Dear Daughters Flora and Georga,” [Pipe Springs], April 1, 1888, Erastus Snow Letters and Correspondence, USHS.

⁸⁸ Flora Woolley, *Reminiscences*, 61

⁸⁹ Lucy C. Esplin, “Ann Carling Chamberlain, by her Daughter,” in Francis A. and Annie C. Esplin, *One Hundred Years of Chamberlains* (N.p.), 76, CHD.

Sometime late in his mother's declining years, Flora's son Herbert wrote a lengthy tribute to his mother in which he highlighted the underground station at Pipe Springs "over which she presided in martyr-majesty for so many years." Calling her "the Queen of the Underground," he wrote that polygamy was both Flora's "trial and her devotion." "Not once," he asserted, "have I heard her rail against the principle. Her loyalty to the system, so far as my observation goes, has been a constant. Its trials and abuses, I suppose no on[e] knows better." Capturing something of the heroic significance of the desert sojourn of Flora and her sister plural wives, he wrote: "Pipe Springs to me is the symbol of devoted Mormon Women, Aunt Georgia, Aunt Josephine and others who came and went, escaping persecution, yet persecuted, withal, by the isolation of their desert retreat." Herbert remembered as a small boy accompanying his mother on a 400 mile hegira from Salt Lake City where she had dared to visit her husband and other family members only to be chased away by deputies who learned of her presence. To Herbert, Flora's flight was "literal[l]y that of a lone woman of Israel escaping to her desert for safety." Although he was just a child at the time, he remembered the relief the young mother and children felt after riding all night from Pine Valley to find themselves "next morning on top of Hurrican[e] Ridge as the sun rose over the Desert . . . [at last] in Arizona and safe."

Herbert Woolley described that the entire episode of "Deps" chasing "Cohabs" and brave Mormon women hiding their children in desert places to keep their husbands from going to jail struck him "as the greatest game of hide-and-seek ever played [and] certainly the most serious." Waxing philosophical, Herbert declared that the heroic action of these women "deserves it's page in history beside" the actions of Latter-day Saint men like "the famous march of the Mormon Battalion." A colossal monument to the Mormon Battalion had been built on the grounds of the Utah State Capital and upon its unveiling in 1927 and Herbert asked: "Where is

the Monument to the Underground Women? Men are quick to erect [*sic*] stony memorials to their feats. Why slight the women? The place, certainly, for such [a] memorial to the women is on the point of the Mountain at Pipe Springs.” Looking to the future, Herbert visualized that the “descendants of the many women who found refuge” at Pipe Springs, could garner “sufficient support . . . to underwrite the idea, with Church help. Let the sculptor chisel from pink marble to match the red sandstone, a composite figure of two vigelent [*sic*] women with hand-shaded eyes scanning the horizon east and west. Let the women be shown back to back for mutual support and combined fortitude, surrounded by a plentious group of the rising generation. A bronze plaque should tell the story.” He then proposed “Mother and Linda Mar[*i*]nger as models for the figures.”⁹⁰

Pipe Springs and the Confiscation of Church Property

When Dee Woolley took charge of the Pipe Springs Ranch early in 1886 he and his partner Daniel Seegmiller increased both their private herds and that portion of the church’s livestock they now cared for. Bessie Woolley wrote that “the Pipe Range was almost the size of the Kanab Stake: it extended from Pahreah on the east, the Pink Cliffs to the north, Grand Canyon on the south and Hurricane Hill on the west, what Dil speaks of as the ‘Whole dog-gond territory.’” Bessie explained that the Woolley children “never knew the size of Father’s herd, and doubt[ed] if he knew it himself.” Like other Arizona Strip cattlemen, Dee Woolley used a system for counting cattle called “tallying,” where the numbers of calves branded each year were counted and multiplied by five on supposition that there were “five head of cattle” scattered on

⁹⁰ Herbert Woolley, “My Reflections,” 4–6.

the range for “each calf” rounded up and branded. Woolley kept his “tallying” accounts “in a little black leather pocket memo-book which he carried in his vest pocket with a stub of a pencil folded in it” and its contents “were known only to him and the foreman.” Woolley managed his own brand, the DE, and the “cross” brand for the church. His cowboys also worked at roundup time in tandem with Canaan Ranch’s cowboys and other large outfits. His son Dilworth remembered that they branded “between 3,000 and 4,000 calves” for Canaan “every spring.” Dilworth Woolley remembered that his father supervised “vast numbers” of church-owned cattle on the Pipe Springs range. After federal confiscation of church property was legalized under the Edmunds-Tucker Act of 1887 Dee Woolley immediately minimized the number he held for the church. He ambiguously stated under oath that there were only 800 or 1108 “Church cattle.”⁹¹

After only having managed Pipe for about two years, Woolley and Seegmiller became “the owners” of the place in the spring of 1888.⁹² This was a move on behalf of the church to prevent the ranch’s escheatment by ostensibly placing it under the “false ownership” of the trusted stake presidency members. As church property thus went into the darkness of “the underground,” so do our hopes of tracking it today. All over Mormondom similar subterfuges took place as the church scrambled to protect its property—and records documenting these transactions were of necessity suppressed if they were kept at all. The idea was that the property would be restored to the church when “the storm” had fully blown over. Woolley and Seegmiller probably did not have any idea of how many cattle were on the ranch or who exactly owned them. Woolley’s daughter could only vouch that “the herd was large enough to provide a generous living” for her polygamist father’s two families. Woolley and Seegmiller had their

⁹¹ Dilworth Erastus Woolley Oral History, Interviewed by Inez C. Cooper, Manti, Utah, June 6, 1967 and June 28, 1968, 11, SUU; and *Deseret News*, February 13, 1889, 3, UDN.

⁹² *Salt Lake Tribune*, February 7, 1889, 4, NPA.

dairy and horse herd at the Upper Kanab Ranch, and augmented their horse and horned stock with substantial herds of sheep. Because “the cattle business was so uncertain in its yearly returns as well as being expensive to run,” Elizabeth explained that her “father often said ‘It takes a sheep herd to run a cattle herd.’”

Ever since the passage of the anti-bigamist Morrill Act in 1862, the church and its attorneys had been studying how to protect its assets should the federal government ever actually attempt to enforce it. Brigham Young put enormous amounts of church property in his own name as a “secret trust” and once Taylor succeeded him as trustee in trust, the duty of protecting church property fell upon him. As early as 1878 and 1879, as the Reynolds case went before the Supreme Court, John Taylor prepared to move church property into the underground. George Q. Cannon, who Taylor eventually elevated to be his first counsellor, became the new prophet’s point man in developing a comprehensive Latter-day Saint defensive strategy. Cannon and Taylor transferred a great deal of property into the private custody of trusted individuals, both church leaders and otherwise, who were to hold it in secret trust for the church; it was this strategy that temporarily delivered the ownership of the Pipe Springs Ranch into the hands of the firm of Woolley and Seegmiller. In other cases, property owned by the general church was transferred to stake and ward associations and temple associations which were, at least on paper, supposed to be independent of the General Church Corporation. Thus the church itself could hold \$50,000 or less, as the law specified, while the associations and private individuals held her wealth in trust. According to the Attorney General and Solicitor General of the United States, these transfers of church assets was illegal.

In 1887 the federal government believed the disincorporated body it called “the *late* corporation of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints” owned property valued at

\$3,000,000 while the similarly disincorporated Perpetual Emigration Fund (PE Fund) owned \$1,000,000. Seeking to minimize its losses, the church denied these figures as gross exaggerations. In truth the PE Fund was by then little more than a holder of bad debts, but it is impossible to know how much property the church actually possessed. Allegedly just three days before the passage of the Edmunds-Tucker Act, \$38,185.77 of general church property was transferred into “The Church Association of the Kanab Stake of Zion.” Substantial amounts of other property had already been transferred into it. Each ward within each of the twenty-plus stakes of Zion could likewise incorporate its own ecclesiastical association and hold its own property. The idea was to protect general church property by legally deeding it over to these stake and ward associations which were ostensibly “owned” by associations of local members rather than by the church itself. Despite the fact that the deeds were actually now in local hands, the central church still controlled this property just as much as it had when it held the deeds. Indeed, much of this property, especially property associated with generating and caring for tithing, was leased back to the Presiding Bishopric of the whole church. It was an elaborate scheme to control and use the property without actually owning it on paper. The same day Taylor transferred \$38,185.77 to the Kanab Stake Association, he moved a total of \$268,982.39 into a sixteen stake associations located within the territory of Utah. Other property was transferred to the several stakes in Idaho and Arizona. The Kanab Stake received a significant portion of church property, likely because of its remote distance from Salt Lake City.⁹³

Late in July, US Attorney General Augustus H. Garland instituted a “mammoth suit . . . against the church to recover the neat little sum of \$4,000,000, \$1,000,00 from the Perpetual Emigration [*sic*] fund, and \$3,000,000 . . . in Church property.” As “provided in the seventeenth

⁹³ *Deseret News*, November 9, 1887, 4, and December 14, 1887, 1, UDN.

section of the Edmunds Tucker law” the suit sought “to annul the incorporation of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints” and “to escheat to the United States for the benefit of the common school fund of this Territory the property held by that church in excess of the limit of \$50,000 set by the law of July 1, 1862.”⁹⁴ By September 29, the threat of actually losing all church property caused the general authorities to discuss “the propriety of making a conditional promise to the Court [on behalf of all polygamists in the church] not to live with any of our wives,” but not surprisingly “the feelings of the brethren were against making any [such] promise.”⁹⁵ On November 7, 1887, the territorial Supreme Court appointed a receiver to begin the legal process of wresting property away from the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints and appropriating it for public education. Already functioning as Utah’s US marshal, Frank H. Dyer was appointed as receiver, presumably because he already had an efficient corps of well-trained deputies and attorneys to help him in this complex work. In the meantime, church attorneys had reserved some conspicuous properties to be confiscated to allow the church time to appeal the loss of its property before the US Supreme Court. These properties included the unfinished Salt Lake Temple, the Salt Lake Tabernacle, the President’s Residence (the Gardo House), the president’s office (in the historian’s office, located between Brigham Young’s old mansions), as well as the Salt Lake Tithing Office and adjacent tithing yard, and the Salt Lake Theatre.

As cases against two stake associations that refused to turn over property demanded by Dyer and Williams made their way through the courts, Mormons took additional precautions to secure church property from seizure. On March 15, 1888, the twelve met and “agreed to sell the

⁹⁴ Provo *Daily Enquirer*, August 2, 1887, 2, UDN.

⁹⁵ John Henry Smith, *Diaries*, 180–181.

Pipe Spring Ranch and cattle and invest the money in Mexico.” Perhaps Erastus Snow and his sons-in-law again hoped to buy it, but Snow died within six weeks and for unknown reasons Pipe was not sold. The anti-polygamy crusade, with its confiscation of huge amounts of property, and the obscuring of even larger amounts, had paralyzed the whole Utah economy. The twelve were simply forced to allow “Pipe Spring to be jumped by anyone who wants to, we not being able to hold it.”⁹⁶ Woolley, several polygamist women, and Seegmiller and Woolley’s horses and cows as well as the tithing cattle were all firmly ensconced there. In the end, the Ranch’s lessees apparently took it on in secret trust, for when the whole confiscation fiasco was over, the church was still in possession of Pipe Springs, though Woolley testified under oath that he and Seegmiller obtained it sometime between April and June 1888. It is likely that as Kanab stake presidency members, or as sons-in-law of Apostle Snow, Dee Woolley and Daniel Seegmiller only ostensibly became “the owners” of Pipe Springs Ranch, holding it and at least 1200 cattle in secret trust for the church. The cattle that had once been “turned over to the Stake Association” were now “theirs.” Similarly, during 1888 they leased some 3,000 to 4,000 head of church sheep, probably also only a front for holding them in secret trust. Within eight or ten months these transactions caught up with the partners and they were both subpoenaed to testify in federal investigations.⁹⁷

Such maneuvering caused some Latter-day Saint leaders to question whether keeping church property was worth the questionable moral position it put them in. Apostle John Henry Smith who also held church property in secret trust in the Kanab area, including large numbers of cattle on the Kanab and Pipe Springs range, was somehow involved financially with Dee

⁹⁶ John Henry Smith, *Diaries*, 193 and 195.

⁹⁷ *Salt Lake Tribune*, February 7, 1889, 4, NA, FHL.

Woolley in the southern Utah cattle industry. By June 1889 he had been elected with Dee Woolley, Daniel Seegmiller, J. W. Crosby and Lawrence C. Mariger as directors of the Kanab Cooperative Cattle herd, which was then rising under the leadership of Woolley and Seegmiller.⁹⁸ As a member of the Quorum of the Twelve he was cognizant of the Latter-day Saints' strategic effort to preserve their property and he was not proud of everything he knew. On March 2, 1888, John Henry wrote his cousin Joseph F. Smith, who was quietly lobbying politicians against "the Church Steal Bill" in Washington, DC, and expressed his feeling in his "inmost soul that the Lord is not pleased with our methods and the shifts to which we are resorting to avoid the issues he has permitted to be raised to test us as to our faith. Would it not be better to suffer bonds, imprisonment, Exile and even death than to so connive and plot that one almost loses his own self respect, his love for Truth, and feel he is a trickster, if not a confirmed rogue? I am getting fearful we will lose our claim upon the Lord and will meet with his sore displeasure."⁹⁹

For years John Taylor's first counselor George Q. Cannon had been directing the financial and political policy of the church, but several of his brethren disagreed with the moral tack of Cannon's program. With Taylor's death in July 1887, there was some pointed discussion among the twelve as to whether they would allow either of Taylor's counselors to "be restored to [their] place in the Quorum of the Twelve" when the First Presidency dissolved on the demise of the president. John Henry Smith confided to his diary that after speaking in "great plainness" and exchanging "a few mutual explanations" [*sic*] Cannon "took upon himself much responsibility [for the bad feelings in the Hierarchy] and said he was willing to do what[ever] his brethren

⁹⁸ John Henry Smith, *Diaries*, 181–182, and 223.

⁹⁹ John Henry Smith assumed name of Jason Mack in some of his letters. John Henry Smith, Salt Lake City, Utah, to Jason Mack [Joseph F. Smith], March 12, 1888, JFSP, SCA, v1, dvd28, ms1325, b16.

might require.” Thereafter, “we forgave each other and shook hands and were happy.”¹⁰⁰ The policy pursued in saving polygamy and property were indeed shaking the kingdom to its core. John Henry closed by praying “for the blessings of the Lord to be upon you and your helps in this not pleasant work and that he will forgive us all if we should resort to things [of which] he does not approve.”¹⁰¹

“The Edmunds-Tucker law is responsible for the most peculiar and tangled-up situations that ever grew out of a statutory enactment since the creation of the world”

The situation that brought the actions of Woolley and Seegmiller to be questioned by federal examiners and to have their actions scrutinized by the Quorum of the Twelve Apostles started with “policy” originating in what was then the highest quorum of the church.¹⁰² On June 29, 1888, church attorneys F. S. Richards and LeGrand Young met with President Wilford Woodruff and six other apostles and “decided to Compromise with the Government in the Church suits if possible.”¹⁰³ In actuality, church attorneys and the receiver’s attorneys had been designing the compromise for weeks. For the Mormons, the object of the compromise was to quickly bring about a final decree in the confiscation case so it could be appealed to the US Supreme Court.¹⁰⁴ John R. Winder of the Presiding Bishopric testified before Federal

¹⁰⁰ John Henry Smith, *Diaries*, 175.

¹⁰¹ John Henry Smith, Salt Lake City, Utah, to Jason Mack [Joseph F. Smith], March 12, 1888.

¹⁰² After John Taylor’s death on 25 July 1887, Wilford Woodruff led the church as President of the Quorum of the Twelve until he was ordained President of the Church when the First Presidency was reorganized in April 1889.

¹⁰³ John Henry Smith, *Diaries*, 205.

¹⁰⁴ “The Church Cases,” Testimony before Commissioner Stone, *Deseret News*, September 13, 1890, UDN, hereafter “Testimony before Commissioner Stone.” Church Attorney LeGrand Young later testified that “one great reason why the Church turned over the . . . property was because it relied greatly on the unconstitutionality of the law, and [believed the property] would be” returned.

investigators that “we believed the [Edmunds-Tucker] law to be cruel, oppressive and unjust, and wished to get the matter before the Supreme Court of the United States, otherwise the compromise would not have been made.” He told investigators that the church agreed “to turn over 30,000 sheep, and I paid Mr. Dyer over \$157,000; we were also to turn over \$75,000 in live stock or its value; there was also [some] gas stock and other property.” The \$75,000 in livestock was the keystone of the whole deal, and was offered in lieu of “all of the personal property of the Church,” which had been turned over to the stake associations. This property included Pipe Springs and several other large church ranches and large numbers of tithing cattle. It also included “between 300 and 400 [tithing] offices” scattered throughout the territory and their contents—“butter, eggs, meat, vegetables, office furniture, etc.” Undervalued at \$268,000 by the Mormons, this amount allegedly constituted “all the personal property of the Church.” The receiver would accept \$75,000 in head of cattle in lieu of the larger amount and promised not to come after any additional property. Because it held the largest single herd of church cattle anywhere in Mormondom, the Pipe Springs Ranch was at the center of compromise.¹⁰⁵

Convinced the deal compromised the opportunity to obtain millions of dollars in exchange for just a few hundred thousand, Utah Supreme Court Justice Charles A. Zane (soon to be appointed Utah’s Chief Justice) accused Receiver Dyer of selling his soul to the Devil by selling it to “the Servants of Lord.” According to Judge Zane, Receiver Dyer promised to go easy on the church if its attorneys would help him obtain the exorbitantly high personal compensation of \$25,000 for less than a year’s work as receiver. Dyer’s two attorneys were also to receive \$10,000 each. The combined sum of \$45,000 was a significant portion of total amount the receiver and his attorneys had been able to extract from the church. To Justice Zane, Mormon

¹⁰⁵ *Deseret News*, February 9, 1889, 3, DNHA.

support for such “unconscionable compensation” was doubly offensive, for not only was it a gross overpayment for the work the receiver had done, it was a bribe of sorts offered on behalf of the church out of funds already escheated to the government. Such a backhanded “buy off” of the receiver would cost the church nothing and save the lion’s share of its property from confiscation. Dyer had confiscated only a few hundred thousand dollars worth of property because his deputies were so busy going after cohabits. In addition to acting as receiver under the Edmunds-Tucker Act, as United States Marshal for Utah territory, Dyer was also personally in charge of rounding up thousands of polygamists.¹⁰⁶

The church had been forced to divulge that it had sheltered some \$269,000 worth of personal property in sixteen stake associations in Utah Territory but provided no inventories specifying these assets. Church attorneys claimed it was mostly perishable tithing matter such as hay and grain and other produce. Given the nature of church subterfuge in the case, it is likely that the amount reported was far below the amount actually transferred to the stakes. Federal authorities believed that the stake associations sheltered much, much more, including “\$250,000.00 worth of Church cattle.”¹⁰⁷ According to testimony that came forth in federal investigations and court cases, the church’s attorneys made an offer to Dyer’s attorneys in June 1888. Before seeing the details, the Utah Supreme Court granted permission for negotiations to

¹⁰⁶ Unless specifically mentioned, information and quotations in this entire section on the receiver’s “compromise” with the Late Corporation of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, come from “United States, Complainant, v. Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints and Others, Respondents,” January 1889, in *Reports of Cases Determined in The Supreme Court of the Territory of Utah, from the January Term, 1889, to the June Term, 1890, John M. Zane, Reporter*, vol 6: (Chicago: Gallagher & Co, 1892), 9–83, hereafter *Utah Supreme Court, 1889*; and “United States v. Late Corporation of Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints et al, Supreme Court of Utah,” in *The Pacific Reporter, Volume 21, Containing all the Decisions of the Supreme Courts of California, Colorado, Kansas, Oregon, Nevada, Arizona, Idaho, Montana, Washington, Wyoming, Utah, and New Mexico, April 18–August 15, 1889* (St. Paul: West Publishing Co., 1889,) 503–525, hereafter *Pacific Reporter*; *Deseret Weekly*, vol. 38; and articles too numerous to cite appearing in both the *Deseret News* and the *Salt Lake Tribune* between November 1888 and March 1889, UDN.

¹⁰⁷ *Deseret Weekly*, 38 (February 16, 1889): 243.

commence. These details were worked out in Washington, where church agents “greased the palms” of power brokers who secured the approval of Zane’s superiors in the Justice Department.¹⁰⁸ According to the final settlement the church would voluntarily turn over several important pieces of real estate, and large sums of cash and investment stock, if the receiver would agree to file a final decree, altogether ending confiscation under the Edmunds-Tucker Act.¹⁰⁹ It is important to note that “the turning over of the Pipe Springs cattle and the Star Valley herd were voluntary acts on the part of the defendants.” In fact, Dyer testified that he and his investigators had no idea these church ranches even existed until the church offered their cattle to him.¹¹⁰ The church’s plan was to sacrifice “a little” to save the lion share of the church’s property, by quickly bringing the completed confiscation cases and the Edmunds-Tucker Act before the US Supreme Court, which they prayed would see its unconstitutionality and strike it down.

The 3,000 to 6,000 head of tithing cattle and a substantial brood of church “saddle horses” at Pipe Springs under the control Edwin D. Woolley as president of the Church Association of the Kanab Stake of Zion was to make up most of the \$75,000 settlement.¹¹¹ Utah

¹⁰⁸ John Henry Smith, Salt Lake City, Utah, to Jason Mack [Joseph F. Smith], March 12, 1888.

¹⁰⁹ Chief church attorney Franklin S. Richards testified that he, along with Solicitor General George A. Jenks, Dyer’s attorney George S. Peters and two high powered Washington attorneys the Church had retained worked out the details of the compromise in Washington, DC in July 1888. Receiver Dyer was not present. Peters testified that after he returned from Washington to Salt Lake City “the settlement was approved by the Attorney General.” *Deseret Weekly*, 38: 280–281.

¹¹⁰ *Salt Lake Herald*, February 26, 1889, 8, LOCCA. Dyer testified that he “did not look up any Church ranch, because I did not know of the existence of such.” He just knew the church reportedly had large numbers of cattle. JH, February 14, 1889.

¹¹¹ Records of the investigation and newspapers give conflicting accounts as to the numbers of church cattle and horses at Pipe Springs in 1888. Part of the difficulty was that it was also known that there were privately owned animals mixed in with them. George S. Crosby, for example, testified that “there were about 4000 of everybody’s cattle on the Pipe Springs ranch” in the fall of 1888. His father, Jesse W. Crosby, Jr., testified that “there were about 3000 head of cattle on this ranch in 1888.” He carefully worded his statement so as not to disclose who owned them, saying “I saw a variety of brands on the cattle.” He testified that he saw “about 2,000 head rounded up” at Pipe in 1888 “to deliver to Receiver Dyer.” Confusing his own testimony, he said that the “2,000 head rounded up” was “probably not one-third” of the total number on the ranch, suggesting there were 6,000 there. Convoluting testimony

Supreme Court’s examiner concluded after sifting through all the evidence that the compromise was “made in good faith by all the parties” and “the law officers of the United States were informed of the facts, made no objection, and approved the compromise.”¹¹² To the exasperation of the leaders of the Church and their attorneys, however, Woolley and Seegmiller almost ruined the fortuitous opportunity to bring the entire confiscation process to an end. Evidence presented by Examiners’ investigations as well as in subsequent court cases, newspaper accounts, and other records show that the partners sought to gouge the receiver by substituting prime animals supposed to be worth \$18 to \$23 a head, for inferior “scrubs” that the receiver and his agent would only give \$10 for.¹¹³ Details of the compromise had been hammered out in July 1888 and in October of that year Woolley and Seegmiller gathered up and exchanged superior church owned stock for their own inferior “scrubs.” By now, Apostle John Henry Smith was somehow involved in their partnership, and was perhaps even advising them. Whether they acted as private individuals, as members of the Kanab Stake Presidency, as agents of the Kanab Cattle Company, as agents of the Presiding Bishopric’s Office, or as directors of the Church Association of the Kanab Stake of Zion is unclear. Neither is it known whether they intended to hold this property in secret trust for the church to be returned later, or whether it was simply “secret theft.” Considering the “peculiar and tangled-up situation” Edmunds-Tucker had put them in, it may well be that in their minds they were defrauding no one, but rather heroically saving what actually belonged to their church. Woolley’s son Dilworth later defended his father by saying

shows that Woolley had transferred some church cattle to other stakes, and had also sold some to private parties. By the time Receiver Dyer’s agent came to Pipe Springs to take possession of them he claimed Woolley only had gathered 1000 to 1100 head, and these were poor quality “scrubs,” which he refused to accept. George Crosby testified that Pipe’s “fat steers” were “taken to Salt Lake” in 1888. Other testimony indicates a large portion of them were sold to John W. Young. See *Deseret Weekly*, 38:243–244, 250.

¹¹² *Utah Supreme Court, 1889*, especially 11–13.

¹¹³ *Salt Lake Tribune*, February 12, 1889, 4, Newspaper Archive, FHL.

“he got his teachings direct from Brigham and lived by the light from that lamp.”¹¹⁴ Certainly protecting the church from the actions of the federal government had been part of the Mormon *modus operandi* for as long as Woolley could remember.

Historian P.T. Reilly, however, who spent a lifetime studying the Arizona Strip cattle business, was convinced the two stake presidency members used the unusual circumstances to systematically rob both church and state. According to Reilly, former First Presidency member and apostle John W. Young hid church cattle in a private company called the Kaibab Cattle Company, which he incorporated “under the laws of New York” in August 1887. When Pipe’s “scrubs” ostensibly owned by the Kanab Stake Association were rejected by the receiver, the church, through the presiding bishop, “sold” at least some of them to Young’s Kaibab Cattle Company (KCC) to hold them in secret trust. Young paid \$15 per head for 1,056 Pipe Spring “scrubs” with uncoun­ted “calves thrown in.” It is likely that some of the church’s higher quality animals were hidden by Young. John M. Whitaker, a Salt Lake-based agent of John W. Young, wrote in his journal that Young had “just purchased from the Church \$20,000 of church cattle and is placing them on his big ranch on the Kaibab to keep them from being seized by the U.S. Gov’t.” Young hired Woolley and Seegmiller to manage these cattle (which they had been managing all along). Evidence that the church still actually owned them, Young mortgaged the KCC to the New York-based Knickerbocker Trust Company “for \$200,000 to finance the English Mission.” Reilly wrote that Erastus Snow’s “sons-in-law Dan Seegmiller and Dee Woolley were foreman and background man respectively, *but were stealing the outfit blind.*” Others simply marveled that President Woolley “seemed to put all his time and energy into his calling yet [mysteriously still] prospered materially.” According to Reilly, “When the church

¹¹⁴ Dilworth Woolley in “Notes from Correspondence of Dilworth and Bert on Pipe Springs,” 2, WSC, b3, f10.

wised up” to Woolley and Seegmiller’s deceit, Anthony W. Ivins, took charge, redeemed the mortgage, and transferred the KCC to a Salt Lake banking firm which itself was used as a “secret trust” to shield church property. Ivins reported that he found the KCC in “a very poor condition” and immediately fired Seegmiller. Despite Reilly’s charges, the numerous children of both Woolley and Seegmiller maintained that their fathers were “faultless” in their loyalty to their leaders. A son of Dan averred that his father “would have given his life at any time for those who presided over him” and the same was said of his partner.

When Dyer sent agent Alfred Thompson to take possession of the church cattle at Pipe Springs, he immediately ascertained that the Pipe Springs herd had been “culled” and that the substituted scrubs represented only a fraction of the stipulated \$75,000 value he was to take claim. Thompson testified that “the cattle were to be turned in at \$18 per head” but that he refused to receive them for more than \$10 per head because of their poor quality. Church correspondence indicates that Woolley, even in his dealings with other Mormons, had a “disposition to turn over old mares and old cows and few colts and calves, saying it is Bishop Preston’s order.” In the herd Woolley and Seegmiller assembled for the receiver were “over 100” extremely old and broken down cows “over twelve years” of age. Thompson testified that he was successful in taking possession of “3120 sheep” President Woolley had at “Pipe Springs and near Kanab.” He was assisted in gathering this flock by J.H. Woolcott who complained that the sheep turned over to the receiver were “of an inferior quality, consisting mostly of widows, orphans and cripples.” It is unknown what happened to all the higher quality animals originally owned by the church at Pipe, but it seems that Woolley sold some of them for “\$20 a head” to President

Murdock of the Beaver Stake, who privately dealt in the cattle business. Woolley and Seegmiller were accused of filching the church's cattle.¹¹⁵

Woolley's and Seegmiller's actions led to a federal investigation launched shortly thereafter. Panguitch Stake President Jesse W. Crosby, Jr., and his son George, who both participated in rounding up cattle for the receiver at Pipe, testified before the Examiner that 2,000 head were rounded up there, while other testimony put the figure at only 1,000, 1,100, 1,200 or 1,400.¹¹⁶ President Crosby's convoluted testimony suggests that there may have been as many as 6,000 head of cattle on the Pipe Springs Ranch at the time, some owned by the church and some held privately.¹¹⁷ President Crosby's son George testified that "there were about 4000 of *everybody's cattle* on the Pipe Springs ranch" in the fall of 1888. He testified that Pipe's "fat"

¹¹⁵ John M. Whitaker, Salt Lake City, Utah, to Hon. John W. Young, New York City, November 1 and 21, 1888, and Reilly's notes on typescript, John W. Young Correspondence, PTR, NAU; *Deseret Weekly*, 38: 244; 250, and 271; Reilly, "Pipe Spring—Primary Sources," PTR, NAU; Pipe Springs Manuscript History, CHL; typescript of church record of receipts of the sale of Pipe Springs stock to John W. Young, in John W. Young correspondence, PTR, NAU; John M. Whitaker, Journal, October 18, 1888, as quoted in John W. Young Chronology, and in "Daily Journal of John Mills Whitaker, 1883–1897, both in PTR, NAU; "History of VT Park, Taken from Interview with Edward Lamb, Sr., 1920 at Orderville," especially 2, WSC, b4, f1; "The Life of Daniel Seegmiller," especially 5; *Salt Lake Tribune*, February 12, 1889, 4, Newspaper Archive, FHL; *Deseret News*, February 9, 1889, 3, DNA; various letters and documents in "Pipe Spring" folder, PTR, b21, f329, especially P. T. Reilly, No. Hollywood, CA, to Raymond J. Geerdes, Pipe Spring National Monument, February 11, 1970; P. T. Reilly, *Lee's Ferry*, 173, "Excerpts from Journal of Abraham Cannon," July 15 to Dec. 31, 1891; William R. Palmer, "Pioneers of Southern Utah: Edwin D. Woolley, Jr.," *Instructor*, 80 (March 1945): 110; and other papers in my possession, italics mine.

¹¹⁶ *Deseret Weekly*, 38 (February 16, 1889): 243–244. For the figures 1,000, 1,100, and 1,400, see *Utah Supreme Court*, 1889, 62–63; *Deseret Weekly*, 38 (February 16, 1889): 244; *Pacific Reporter*, 513; Jenson, *Encyclopedic History*, 658–659; and Pipe Springs Manuscript History, CHL.

¹¹⁷ Crosby stated "I am not able to approximate the number; could not say whether he took 100 or 500; *I should say there were about 3000 head of cattle on this ranch in 1888*; do not know who was the reputed owner of the cattle upon this ranch prior to 1887; I saw a variety of brands on the cattle; do not know of any cattle having been sold to John W. Young in 1888; *saw about 2,000 head rounded up there in that year to deliver to Receiver Dyer*; in 1888 there were probably seventy head of saddle horses on the ranch; *I was there for the purpose of helping round up the cattle*; *could not say how great a percentage was rounded up—probably not one-third of them was gathered*; when we decided with Dyer's agent that we could not agree upon a price, they were turned out again; they were native cattle of not a very fair grade—they were mostly yearlings, heifers and old cows. The steers had all been driven away—about 300 head being taken to Panguitch." *Deseret Weekly*, 38 (16 February 1889): 243, italics mine.

and expensive steers were “taken to Salt Lake” by undisclosed parties in the fall of 1888.¹¹⁸ Both Crosbys repeatedly testified 2,000 head had been gathered for the receiver.¹¹⁹

When Dee Woolley was called to testify before the Examiner, at first he “objected most decidedly” to take the stand “*unless some one would guarantee his witness fee.*” The court overruled his objection, and “the witness then came forward *reluctantly.*”¹²⁰ Woolley’s testimony differed to a large extent from that offered by the Crosbys. When called to the witness stand, he testified that he “was in charge of the Church cattle at Pipe Springs ranch” when “these cattle were transferred to the Kanab Stake by the Church” in March 1887 and that his involvement at Pipe was part of his assignment as Kanab Stake president. He said that in April some “308 head were driven to Panguitch, to Mr. Crosby’s, they were being taken to the upper range,” to fatten them up “for beef.” Woolley explained that this left the Pipe Springs Ranch entirely bereft of church cattle for a while, but he indicated that cattle were “constantly being received on tithing.” He testified that there were only “about 800 head of Church cattle” at Pipe when Dyer’s agent came for them, and some of these “were sold to pay the expense of the round-up when the cattle were being gathered for the receiver.”¹²¹

¹¹⁸ *Deseret Weekly*, 38 (16 February 1889): 250, and 243. It is important to note that after all the “blooded bulls” and other “high breeding stock” Woolley and Seegmiller had introduced on the Pipe Springs Range that President Crosby testified that the scrubs gathered for the receiver “were native cattle of not a very fair grade—they were mostly yearlings, heifers and old cows. The [more expensive] steers had all been driven away.”

¹¹⁹ *Salt Lake Tribune*, March 3, 1889, 7, NPA.

¹²⁰ *Salt Lake Tribune*, February 7, 1889, 4, Newspaper Archive, FHL, italics mine.

¹²¹ *Deseret Weekly*, 38: 273; and *Salt Lake Herald*, February 14, 1889, 8, CALOC. Another time on the witness stand, Woolley slightly contradicted some of his original testimony when he stated “in the spring of 1887 there were about 800 head of mixed horn cattle, and thirty or forty head of horses; the cattle were worth about \$10 or \$11 per head, and the horses about \$25; in 1888 there were upwards of 1,000 head, know of a bunch of steers being sold to Murdock & Farnsworth—they brought \$20 a head; 1,056 head of cattle were delivered to John W. Young; they were worth about \$10 or \$11 per head; heard cow-camp talk to the effect that he paid \$15 per head with the calves thrown in; Young bought eighteen head of mustangs at the same time the cattle were taken away; know of no other church cattle there; we gathered as clean as we could, but left probably 200 head.”

With the entire deal potentially stymied because of Woolley and Seegmiller’s chicanery, the church rushed to cough up the entire \$75,000 in cash, feeling much relieved when the put-out receiver accepted it, consummating the Compromise.¹²² As promised, Dyer issued the final decree on October 8, 1888, putting a formal end to confiscation at that time, as well as to “the active duties of the receiver” and his attorneys.¹²³ Mormon general authorities and their attorneys were piqued that Woolley and Seegmiller’s duplicity had almost cost them the entire compromise—and potentially millions of dollars—and launched an investigation of their own into actions of the Pipe Springs partners. At last it was agreed that Woolley and Seegmiller, as directors of the Church Association of the Kanab Stake, had “misunderstood” some instructions of Presiding Bishop William B. Preston. Since the compromise with the receiver was finally sanctioned by the courts, the Pipe Springs partners were completely “exonerated” by the hierarchy from “any intentional blame in the sale of cattle.” Considering “the spirit of the times” and the pressures they were all under to preserve the property of the church, “all concerned [exonerated Woolley and Seegmiller] from intentional wrong doing.”¹²⁴

The Trustee in Trust and the Council of the Twelve had agreed on March 15, 1888, to sell the Pipe Springs Ranch and its cattle altogether “and invest the money in Mexico.” This decision may have played some role in Woolley and Seegmiller’s sale of church cattle to Presidents Murdock and Crosby as well as to John W. Young, and indeed, even to themselves. Two weeks later, on March 29, at a meeting of the Twelve attended by Erastus Snow and Moses Thatcher, it was decided that the ranch be allowed “to be jumped by anyone who wants to, we not being able

¹²² *Utah Supreme Court, 1889*, 62–63; and *Deseret Weekly*, 38: 244

¹²³ *Utah Supreme Court, 1889*, especially 11, 41, 43–44, 76 and 77; and *Deseret News*, October 23, 1890, UDN.

¹²⁴ John Henry Smith, *Diaries*, 211; L. John Nuttall, *Diary*, October 26 and 29, 1888, LJNP, UU; and Wilford Woodruff, *Diaries*, 8:522.

to hold it.”¹²⁵ Whether this was code for putting Pipe in secret trust, or that Snow and Thatcher (and their kinsmen Woolley and Seegmiller) were anxious to permanently put it into the family business is not clear. But on May 3, Dan Seegmiller made application at a federal land office to legally assume possession of Pipe Springs for himself and his partner by filing “Valentine Scrip” on the property.¹²⁶ Woolley and Snow family histories written long after the Raid, however, never refer the family as having “owned” Pipe—from start to finish, they were at Pipe as caretakers for the church even though the church wanted the escheaters to think that it had been “jumped.”¹²⁷ One thing is certain—even during the turbulent days of the Raid, stake presidency members did not “jump” church real estate and then still remain in office. When the raid was finally over, Winsor Castle and its claims to the springs and the range were quietly returned to the church.

In 1889 Woolley and Seegmiller had a falling out which caused them to abruptly dissolve their partnership after pleasantly holding their assets in common for two decades. Their problems were undoubtedly related to the complicated financial entanglements they entered into both as members of the stake presidency and as private parties to help the church maintain its property-saving subterfuges. Stresses related to their nearly having cost the entire church its compromise with the receiver and the resultant church and federal investigations into their joint finances also played a role. According to Seegmiller family histories, Dee felt he was a better manager than

¹²⁵ John Henry Smith, *Diaries*, 203, and 193.

¹²⁶ Valentine scrip was a scrip issued to veterans that could be used to obtain title to unsurveyed government lands. It could be bought from veterans and filed by the purchaser. From the late 1880s thru the first decade of the twentieth century Valentine Scrip was filed on many springs on the Arizona strip which had previously been used as public watering holes. Valentine scrip was often filed by individuals or stock companies seeking to control important waterholes for their own exclusive use and to lock all others out. Seegmiller’s filing of Valentine Scrip on Pipe Springs was apparently later rejected because he did not permanently live there. “Pipe Springs” folder, PTR, b21, f329.

¹²⁷ Various family histories in WSC.

Dan, and Dan sometimes wondered “if President Woolley was really worthy of the position he held” as president of the Kanab Stake of Zion. Things eventually got so nasty between these partners and former “best friends” that other church leaders had to step in and act as mediators in untangling and severing their joint economic affairs.¹²⁸ Dee moved Flora and her children from Pipe to Kanab during the summer of 1891 and Seegmiller seemed to be in possession of the fort at the end of that year.¹²⁹ In March 1892, while gathering historical information for the church in the southern settlements, Andrew Jenson reported that the Pipe Springs Ranch was still “owned by President E. D. Woolley, of Kanab.”¹³⁰

The 1890 Woodruff Manifesto and the “Official” End of Plural Marriage

About the time church attorneys first broached the compromise to the Solicitor General of the United States, Wilford Woodruff, leading the church as President of the Quorum of the Twelve, secretly dedicated the Manti Temple on May 17, 1888. It was the second temple after St. George to be finished in Utah. On that joyous occasion, Woodruff exultantly told those assembled that “We won’t quit practicing Plural Marriage until Christ shall come.”¹³¹ In December 1888, shortly after Receiver Dyer refused to accept Pipe’s “culled scrubs” but before the receiver issued his final decree, and thus ending confiscation, President Woodruff and the other apostles discussed a communication from “some outside friends” in Washington, DC, offering them “amnesty” and a cessation of escheatment if the church would abandon polygamy.

¹²⁸ See Seegmiller family histories in PSLA, VF, FH, Seegmiller, especially “The Life of Daniel Seegmiller,” 4–5.

¹²⁹ *Deseret News*, December 29, 1891, 3, DNA.

¹³⁰ *Deseret Weekly*, 44 (1892): 467.

¹³¹ John Henry Smith, *Diaries*, 201.

Each and every apostle spoke against the offer. Woodruff said “all of the brethren had spoken right and had we accepted the proposition the Lord would have rejected us, as the Doctrine of celestial marriage had come to stay for all time.”¹³² Despite the success of the church’s compromise with Receiver Dyer, threats of escheatment, the wholesale imprisonment of polygamists and the economic and ecclesiastical upheaval they caused, amid threats of new congressional legislation, nothing diminished Mormon resolve to publicly continue the church’s peculiar marital practice. The general authorities decided to at least outwardly give in to nearly thirty years worth of anti-polygamy legislation. On October 6, 1890, President Wilford Woodruff’s famous Manifesto officially ending the practice of plural marriage in the United States was unanimously accepted as authoritative and binding by the vote of the church in general conference.¹³³

As Dee Woolley made his way north to attend the very conference that ostensibly ended Mormon polygamy, he was arrested by Deputy Marshals James McGeary and John Armstrong. Keeping Flora in her “prison” south of the Utah-Arizona border had kept Dee free for nearly half a decade, but word was out that Flora was visiting relatives in Salt Lake. Despite his friendly relations with the deputies, according to Woolley’s family members, circumstances were such that this time arrest “was unavoidable,” or the deputies “would be reported up and loose their jobs.”¹³⁴ Weeks before his capture, Flora had taken a much needed break from her “incarceration” at Pipe Springs, and took her youngest children to spend several months visiting relatives on the underground in the north. Once Dee was in custody, deputies throughout the

¹³² John Henry Smith, *Diaries*, 214.

¹³³ Official Declaration—1, Doctrine and Covenants; Abraham Cannon, “Journal,” 26 and 30 September, and 1 October 1890; and Kenneth W. Godfrey, “The Coming of the Manifesto,” *Dialogue: A Journal of Mormon Thought* 5 (Autumn 1970): 11–25.

¹³⁴ Elizabeth Woolley Jensen, “Chapter on Ranch Life,” 10–12, in WSC, b1, f13; and *Deseret News*.

territory scoured the country for his principle witness, without whom there was insufficient evidence for an unlawful cohabitation conviction. But the well-organized Mormon underground intelligence system alerted Flora of her husband's capture and of the officers' plans to arrest her. A Latter-day Saint policeman working as a counter-agent learned that Flora had been spotted on the streets of Salt Lake with a "babe" in her arms and that federal authorities were planning an immediate raid on her underground quarters. Flora wrote, "I had been doing a little washing that day, but I gathered the clothes partly dried and my cousin Lucy put me and the children into the surrey and took us over to Dee's half-sister, Minnie Wardrup['s] home where I remained several days. The deputies searched seven homes of my relatives and were greatly chagrined when they did not find me. When they were convinced that they could not arrest me they let Dee free."¹³⁵ To celebrate this fortuitous turn of events, good natured Dee "invited his captors to dine with him at the rest[a]urant" and cohab and depts together enjoyed "a most friendly afternoon."¹³⁶ Once released, Dee "came on to conference," where he heard President Woodruff's Manifesto. Flora remembered that "the attitude our husbands would take toward this manifesto meant a great deal to the happiness of us plural wives. While my husband voted to sustain Pres. Woodruff in this step he also vowed that he would never give up his [wives] and children." Knowing they would be captured if found together, Dee surreptitiously took Flora and their children to his brother's home in Centerville. "Uncle John's home had been dedicated as a safe refuge for many of the leading church officials," and sometimes served as the underground headquarters of the

¹³⁵ Flora Woolley, *Reminiscences*, 54–56, and 45.

¹³⁶ A young man came for Flora and her children and they took backroads to St. George to avoid attracting attention. When all was clear, Woolley sent a telegram that said "that 'his freight' must be shipped immediately to Pipe Springs." "So again," Flora wrote, "I gathered up my family and loaded them onto the buckboards and started out." "We ate our supper at the foot of the Hurricane Ridge and travelled all night, arriving at Pipe Springs just as day was breaking. It certainly felt like a haven of refuge to me at that time." Flora Woolley, *Reminiscences*, 45.

First Presidency. Dee returned to Pipe Springs while Flora waited for safe, but separate, conveyance.¹³⁷

While it would take several years for the machinery of the anti-Mormon crusade to wind down, the Woodruff Manifesto ensured that the Raid was close to over. Dee and Flora's son Herbert called the Raid, with its hiding cohabs and hunting deps the "greatest game of hide-and-seek ever played."¹³⁸ Throughout, Pipe Springs had played a significant role in keeping Apostles Erastus Snow, Brigham Young, Jr., Moses Thatcher, and important church bureaucrats like A. Milton Musser out of the territorial penitentiary. It continued to be an important way station on the Mormon road to exile and safety in Arizona and Mexico. Erastus Snow's extended family and their friends found special sanctuary there. The entire Kanab Stake Presidency, including President Edwin D. Woolley, Jr., councilors Daniel Seegmiller and Thomas Chamberlain, and Stake Clerk Lawrence Mariger, and their wives took refuge there as did others protecting themselves from some of the era's greatest drama.

¹³⁷ Flora Woolley, *Reminiscences*, 54–57; and alternate version in Flora Woolley, *Memoirs of Flora Snow Woolley*," in Julius Dalley.

¹³⁸ Kimberly James, 49.

Chapter 14

“The Possibilities of our Surroundings”: Tourism and Livestock

*“The Mormons are Now Passing Through
a Transition Stage in the Practice of Polygamy.”*

In the minds of many of the general authorities, the Woodruff Manifesto had originated as a ruse to make the federal government believe polygamy was ending. The President of the United States, through the Secretary of the Interior, sought to put teeth into the Manifesto by demanding that it be presented in general conference and accepted as binding upon every member of the church. In an unprecedented violation of the traditional American separation of church and state, the federal government mandated that the Woodruff Manifesto be canonized and bound “as a Revelation” in the Latter-day Saints’ scripture. This was done in hopes that Woodruff’s “advice” to his followers “to refrain from contracting any marriage forbidden by the law of the land,” would end plural marriage among all believers. The church was not in a position to reject this mandate and the Woodruff Manifesto was reluctantly added to the Mormon canon where it remains to this day. For the next fourteen years the federal government, the church, and its members, negotiated what the Woodruff Manifesto had actually meant. When the Senate questioned the seating of newly-elected Senator Reed Smoot, a member of the Quorum of Twelve, President Joseph F. Smith issued an April 1904 “Second Manifesto,” which ended church-sanctioned plural marriage. Between 1890 and 1904, however, a significant number of

polygamous unions were contracted with the knowledge and sanction of the highest authorities of the church.¹

Florence A. Merriam, an insightful young scientist who came to Utah in 1893 or 1894 to study ornithology, found herself an observer of Mormons. In a book she published in 1894 entitled *My Summer in a Mormon Village*, she described the state of polygamy in Utah during the early 1890s as “passing through a transition stage. . . . Theoretically, the practice has been abolished; but while it is reasonable to imagine that the law has reduced the number of annual polygamous marriages, the law requiring old polygamists to give up all but their first wives is openly disregarded.” Agreeing that this retrogressive aspect of the law was “unjust” in that “It seems rather a refinement of cruelty to make amends for breaking up a woman’s home, by sending her to the almshouse. What the law has done is this: it has put a premium on bribery, hypocrisy, and deceit. At one time the administration became so rotten that when the marshal died, one of our village polygamists openly boasted that he no longer had to pay tithes to [the marshal to keep himself out of the Penn].” Merriam intimated further that gentile financial interests in Utah had been hurt long enough by the anti-polygamy crusade and that many non-Mormon power-brokers were simply disposed to let the significantly reduced practice of polygamy go, “no further questions being asked.”²

¹ Kenneth L. Cannon, II, “Beyond the Manifesto: Polygamous Cohabitation among LDS General Authorities after 1890,” *UHQ*, 46 (Winter 1978): 24–36; Kenneth L. Cannon, II, “After the Manifesto: Mormon Polygamy, 1890–1906,” *Sunstone* 8 (January–April, 1983): 27–35; D. Michael Quinn, “LDS Church Authority and New Plural Marriages, 1890–1904,” *Dialogue* 18 (Spring 1985): 9–105; Thomas G. Alexander, *Mormonism in Transition: A History of the Latter-day Saints, 1890–1930* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1986), 60–73; Carmon Hardy, *Mormon Polygamous Passage* and Davis Bitton, *George Q. Cannon: A Biography* (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book Company, 1999), 407–408. Kathleen Flake, *The Politics of American Religious Identity: The Seating of Senator Reed Smoot, Mormon Apostle* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2004); US Senate, Committee on Privileges and Elections, *Proceedings Before the Committee on Privileges and Elections of the United States Senate in the Matter of the Protests Against the Right of Hon. Reed Smoot, a Senator from the State of Utah, to Hold His Seat*, 4 vols., 59th Cong., 1st Sess. S. Doc. No. 486, (Washington: Government Printing Office, 1906).

² Florence A. Merriam, *My Summer in a Mormon Village* (Boston: Houghton, Mifflin and Company, the Riverside Press, Cambridge, 1894), 124–125.

With the general understanding that polygamy had been abolished only as far as it concerned the contraction of new (after 1890) plural marriages, Dee Woolley—like most of his coreligionists—continued to disregard the law as far as cohabitating with plural wives was concerned.³ Since there was a dramatic cessation in the prosecution of cohabs after the canonization of the Woodruff Manifesto, and since there was also talk in Washington, DC, of amnesty being granted for plural marriages entered into before October 6, 1890, Dee released Flora from her prison at Pipe in 1891 by moving her back across the Utah line to Kanab. To avoid attracting attention to his situation, however, President Woolley kept Flora and Emma and their respective children in separate homes in Kanab.⁴ Dee sold Dan his portion of the Upper Kanab Ranch, and seems to have relinquished control of Winsor Castle to him. The two members of the Kanab Stake Presidency maintained friendly relations and though they no longer “held all things in common,” they were still partners and jointly claimed large portions of the Pipe Springs range. For a time Woolley and Seegmiller, Inc. was still heavily involved in managing the large herds of John W. Young, scattered over the Pipe Springs range and Kaibab Plateau. The church surreptitiously owned much of John W. Young’s stock, clandestinely shielded under the double front of a New York-based holding company called the Kaibab Land and Cattle Company. A large number of church cattle still bore the “W” for WCSGC, which had long since been acquired by the CCCC. Young’s employees (Woolley and Seegmiller and others), simply added a J and a Y to either side of the W to create John W. Young’s brand, “JWY.”⁵ Seegmiller spent much of his time in Flagstaff helping Young manage a number of

³ Merriam, *Summer in a Mormon Village* .

⁴ WSC

⁵ Rowland W. Rider as told to Deirdre Murray Paulsen, *The Roll Away Saloon: Cowboy Tales of the Arizona Strip* (Logan: Utah State University Press, 1985), 25–26.

large and risky railroad projects. When he was not in Flagstaff, however, Seegmiller often lived with one of his plural wives in Winsor Castle. There he presided over the tangled business interests of John W. Young, the church, the Kaibab Land and Cattle Company (KLCC), and the Knickerbocker Trust Company, while expanding the Seegmiller-Woolley partnership's private horse and cattle herds on the Pipe Springs, Buckskin Mountain, and House Rock Valley ranges.⁶

With actual ownership of livestock on these ranges purposely buried under multiple layers of corporate subterfuge, it was easy for Woolley and Seegmiller to engage in financial shenanigans. It was commonly believed that the two stake presidency members were robbing these sheltering companies blind by branding large numbers of the KLCC's yearly crop of calves with their private brand. Hearing rumors of what the "D E" schemers were up to, Anthony (Tone) W. Ivins was appointed to supervise the pair in the interest of the church and went out to Pipe Springs to assess the situation. In addition to his prominence in the church, Tone Ivins had the distinction of being known far and wide for his impeccable honesty.⁷ Years after Ivins' death, the son of one of the KLCC's cowboys shared with a National Park Service investigator a revealing episode his father had witnessed. Ivins had come to Pipe Springs and for several days observed many young heifers coming in to drink "branded DE instead of [with] the Church's K on the left rib." Ivins reportedly asked, him "why are all those heifers branded DE instead of

⁶ Deseret News, December 29, 1891, 3, DNA.

⁷ Ivins used his growing political influence to pressure Congress to establish the Shivwits reservation in 1891. He secured an appropriation of \$10,000.00 and had himself appointed "Disbursing Agent to expend this money for the benefit of the Indians." Over the years Ivins used his influence as St. George Mayor, BIA employee, local church leader, territorial and state politician, and Counselor in the church's First Presidency to benefit them. In 1925 he and William J. Palmer became the first white men since Jacob Hamblin and John Wesley Powell to be ritualistically adopted into the tribe with the status of chief. For years he gave tribal members Christmas gifts, and in 1931 they returned the favor by presenting him with a beaded buckskin vest emblazoned with the phrase, "Tony Ivins, he no Cheat." See Anthony Ivins, *Journal*, 2:202–203, AWI; Elizabeth Anderson, *Diaries of Anthony W. Ivins*, 105–107; Anonymous and untitled document in AWI, b1, f3, 6; Heber Grant Ivins, "Autobiography," 8–10; *Salt Lake Telegram*, December 26, 1931, 5, UDN; October 5, 1934, 1, UDN; William R. Palmer, "Anthony W. Ivins: Indian Memorial Service for President Anthony W. Ivins," *Instructor* (July 1944): 311–314; and Martha C. Knack, *Boundaries Between: The Southern Paiute, 1775–1995* (Lincoln: Nebraska University Press, 2001), 136–138.

with the Church brand?” Brother Woolley responded, “That means Daniel and Edwin (Daniel Seegmiller and Edwin D. Woolley). We took 500 heifers and branded them with our brand.” “But isn’t that stealing from the Church, Brother Wooley” [*sic*] Ivins asked. To this Woolley replied, “No, not stealing Brother Ivins, just manipulating.”⁸

By 1892 things had reached such a state that the church dropped Woolley and Seegmiller as managers of the KLCC and appointed their brother-in-law Tone Ivins to take their place. Ivins wrote in his memoirs that he found the various ranches owned by the KLCC on the Buckskin Mountains and in House Rock Valley “in a very bad condition.” He described that “the cattle had been traded for horses which were of very little value and the taxes had not been paid for several years” and that there were many outstanding debts. Ivins retained Woolley and Seegmiller’s foreman, Ed Lamb, and together they “revived the business and put it on a better [financial] basis.”⁹

Dee Woolley’s Grand Canyon Epiphany

With his two families comfortably living in two separate homes in Kanab, after 1891 Dee Woolley continued to travel all over the Kanab stake and managed his own business interests. As the president of the Kanab stake, he was keenly aware of the economic distress of the people living in Kane County and on the Arizona Strip. Livestock was the area’s only industry and the range was decreasing in productivity with every passing year. Either new means of wresting a living from the desert must be found, or the handful of ranches, tiny villages, and towns he

⁸ Raymond J. Geerdes, memorandum and report to Karl T. Gilbert, 1 January 1970, “The Ownership of Pipe Spring: A Legal and Historical Brief,” 47–54.

⁹ Anthony W. Ivins, Journal, 2:204-205, AW, and Elizabeth Anderson, *Diaries of Anthony W. Ivins*, 107.

presided over would eventually disappear. For years the population of Kane County had been in decline as threatened polygamists and impoverished saints moved their families and herds to greener pastures. Surveying the economic possibilities, Woolley saw only two resources that could augment the flagging livestock industry: tourism and harvesting of the Kaibab Plateau's seemingly inexhaustible timber.¹⁰

Woolley's plan to exploit these resources required settling the Kaibab band of Paiute on some permanent reservation to "get them out of the way." As the church's official guardian of the Kaibab, President Woolley plotted their eventual wholesale removal to the yet unofficial reservation or "Indian Farm" the church had created near Moccasin Ranch three miles north of Pipe. Some Kaibab were already located at Moccasin, but most wandered widely through the Kanab country and east on to the Kaibab Plateau, into House Rock Valley, and beyond. Some were reportedly mixing with the Navajo and again running off horses and cattle. There were reports in Woolley's jurisdiction of ranchers arming themselves and giving chase again to Native Americans. Most of the Kaibab, however, spent much of the year begging and working for the settlers in Kanab. The saints perennially complained about the tax feeding hungry Native Americans placed upon their meager finances. Now that Woolley himself had permanently moved to Kanab, and that the Pipe Springs range was nearly depleted, moving the Kaibab to Moccasin became a priority.¹¹

Sometime in 1888, when Dee had been gathering stock, several mavericks had plunged out of the rich grasslands of Greenland Point and DeMotte's Park. As he and other cowboys followed them to the edge of the Grand Canyon, Dee Woolley got his first view of that

¹⁰ WSC.

¹¹ *Salt Lake Herald*, December 20, 1891, 3, CALOC.

“sublimely magnificent gorge.” His daughter Mary remembered the story as he so often told it. He “was so overcome with awe” that he “almost fell from his horse. As he stood there gazing into the depths he felt like the tiniest atom, and bared his head in reverence to the wonderful works of the Creator.” Then and there the idea struck him that he was looking at a resource worth far more than grass and livestock. President Woolley’s Grand Canyon epiphany convinced him that tourism would “line our pockets with the increase God intends to give us.” Mary wrote that “For years he worked assiduously to accomplish this end. [In the meantime] he took many notable parties, often at his own expense, out to see the canyon” in hope of furthering his dream by

interesting someone in the feasibility of a railroad into the Kaibab Forest, the largest virgin forest in America, and also to transport tourists to the Canyon. For the rest of his life he was one of the region’s most important promoters of tourism, roads, railroads, and hotels. Some twenty years after his death on July 20, 1920, the *Deseret News* bore witness that ‘Uncle Dee Woolley’ was ‘the ‘father’ of the Grand Canyon of the Colorado movement that later led to the setting aside of the North Rim as a national Monument and the creation of the Kaibab National Forest.¹²

Wooley and his wives had already transformed their homes into boarding houses and their kitchens into restaurants. The half-decade of experience Dee and Flora had garnered operating Flora’s “Cohab lambing ground” and hotel for the traveling public at Pipe had prepared them both for this service. They bought other buildings in Kanab and turned them into actual hotels and Dee built cabins and boarding houses on the Kaibab and on the North Rim

¹² *Deseret News*, June 15, 1940, 8, in WSC, b1,f9.

itself. Dee's epiphany eventually helped to save Winsor Castle from certain ruin as it transformed first into a watering hole for motorists on their way to the Grand Canyon, and then into a automobile campground, motor lodge, refreshment shop, restaurant, and gasoline station. It was generally agreed that the primary reason Pipe Springs became a national monument was to provide tourists with water, food, gasoline, and rest facilities as they traveled between the Grand Canyon and other pearls of the National Park Service like Zion Canyon, Bryce Canyon, and Cedar Breaks.¹³ Early Grand Canyon explorers had stopped at Pipe Springs throughout the late nineteenth century, including John Wesley Powell and Alber Tissander, and, during the summer of 1887, Brigham Young Academy Professor James E. Talmage brought a handful of students from Provo, using Pipe and Kanab as way stations and staging grounds for a descent into the canyon to study geology. One of Talmage's students wrote a letter from Pipe to the editor of the *Deseret News* giving many details of their trip, but only indicating that at Winsor Castle they found "the bread burning" and "the sand blowing into the cabinet." Talmage, who would one day become the President of the University of Utah, followed John Wesley Powell's track to the river from Mt. Dellenbaugh and found the skulls of two of the major's mules which had fallen off a cliff and perished in the canyon. The young professor retrieved at least one of the skulls and placed it in his specimen cabinet to inspire young scholars at what soon became Brigham Young University.¹⁴

¹³ Warren G. Harding, "Proclamation 1663—Establishing the Pipe Spring National Monument, Arizona," May 31, 1923, in *The American Presidency Project*, <http://www.presidency.ucsb.edu/ws/?pid=76668>.

¹⁴ S. H. Allen to the Editor of the *Deseret News*, Pipe Springs, Arizona, June 18, 1887, in *Deseret News*, July 13, 1887, 14, and July 19, 1887, 1; and John R. Talmage, *The Talmage Story: Life of James E. Talmage—Educator, Scientist, Apostle* (Salt Lake City: Bookcraft Publishers, 1972), 61—64, UUSC. While returning from the canyon Talmage's "fine Morgan horse" gave out and he was forced to trade it, perhaps at Pipe Springs, for a "wild and unbroken" desert pony more "suited to the country." The future apostle provided his students the entertainment of watching "some violent bucking episodes." The total cost of the expedition of over 700 miles was "\$50—not per person, but for the [entire] party." The party's only complaint was the renting of "overnight pasture for the animals at what was described in at least one instance as 'an exorbitant rate.'"

The Scream of the Wild Horse and the European Style Hunting Park

Part of Woolley's dream was to turn the Kaibab Plateau into a colossal recreation and adventure park for hunting and provide access the beauties of the Grand Canyon. He based this idea in part on the grand British hunting reserves set apart for aristocrats and other people of means that his sometime partner and employer John W. Young had told him about. Brigham Young's extravagant and flamboyant son had spent much time in Britain and on the continent, fraternizing with European blue-bloods and in the process had spent considerable time on their hunting reserves. The idea Young and Woolley jointly hatched was to entice European and American plutocrats to hire local Kane cowboys to show them the wonders of the Grand Canyon and lead them to the superb hunting of the Kaibab Plateau. The Kaibab was teeming with elk and mule deer and predators to the Saints' cattle and sheep—wolves, coyotes, bears, bobcats and mountain lions—which Woolley hoped “big paying hunters” would help control. The plan included chasing and wantonly slaughtering for sport some of the ubiquitous bands of wild horses that ran on the Buckskin Mountain and on the adjacent deserts. These horses, which had infested the region at least since the opening of the Old Spanish Trail, were increasing in numbers and had helped turn the Pipe Range into a dust bowl. It was estimated that “one can feed three steers on the range . . . on what it takes to keep one horse.”¹⁵ Some twelve miles southwest of Pipe there was a natural seep and waterhole named Wild Band Pocket where bands of mustangs watered to avoid Pipe and Moccasin's humans. As Wild Band Pocket dried up, mustangs were forced to water at Pipe and Moccasin. Since the days of Anson Winsor, cowboys

¹⁵ Salt Lake *Tribune*, October 1, 1899, UDN.

had attempted to run off the wild horses to keep them from competing with their cattle for the springs' precious desert water. As early as the 1870s, murderous and bloody mustang hunts involving forced runs, round-ups, and mass slaughter were staged at Moccasin and Pipe. Rodeo, bronc busting, roping, and pistol shooting paled in comparison to the screaming excitement of the Mustang Hunt. Because its water naturally drew the mustangs in, Pipe Springs became the center for this cruel but utilitarian and necessary extreme sport. The mustangs often drank too much water and became sluggish, making it easier for riders to round-up and corral them by strategically using the hills, ridges, and arroyos of the Pipe and Antelope valleys and the natural rock enclosures of the Vermillion Cliffs. Sometimes they drove whole thundering herds racing at breakneck speeds over the precipices of Hack and Gramma canyons and the sheer cliffs of Kanab Gulch. Other times they corralled them, took their pick to break and turn into tough desert saddle horses, and slaughtered the rest. To these hardened men of the Kanab and Pipe Springs desert, mustang killing was an exhilarating sport of speed and strategy. Like the buffalo who had already met a similar fate, their hides were valuable when collected hundreds at a time. In time the mustangs would be rounded up by the thousands and driven to the railroad, where they were whipped into cattle cars and driven to distant packing plants to become dog food. Others would be shipped to far away military posts in the British Empire to carry soldiers and drag cannons. But as Woolley contemplated his plan in the 1880s and 1890s, they were a nuisance that contributed to the desolation of the range. Liquidating at least some of the mustangs would be a double blessing for the local economy by conserving what little grass remained for cattle and sheep and by providing an exciting extreme sport for wealthy visitors.

“The Last Wild Horse of the Kanab Desert”

One of the earliest and best accounts of a mustang drive involving Pipe Springs tells the story of a, 1877 drive, before Pipe's range was overrun by the equine pests. The article, entitled "The Last Wild Horse of the Kanab Desert," appeared in the October 1891–March 1892 volume of *Outing, An Illustrated Monthly Magazine of Sport, Travel and Recreation*, about the time that Dee Woolley and John W. Young launched their campaign to bring sportsmen into the Arizona Strip and transform the Buckskin Mountains into a "Gentleman's Hunting Park." Young had inherited his father's interest in big business and was involved in several railroad projects and multiple smaller ventures. In the last years of his life, Brigham Young had sent his son to St. George and Kanab to oversee, as a member of the First Presidency, all of the church's interests in the South. From 1874 on, John W. spent much time in southern Utah with Erastus Snow operating as an overseer of the region's united orders and cooperative Herds. He also spent much time in the East and in Europe with movers and shakers of the United States and Great Britain, where he became a good friend and potential business partner of William F. Cody, otherwise known as Buffalo Bill. In November 1892, a little over half a year after "The Last Wild Horse of the Kanab Desert," appeared in *Outing*, Young, Woolley, and Seegmiller brought Buffalo Bill and a retinue of English lords, military officers, and American businessmen on an outing to the North Rim and the Kanab Desert seeking their investment. Young and Woolley promised them a horse hunt, though traveling in winter when there was plenty of water would make this nearly impossible. Among Cody's retinue was his amanuensis, the prolific author Prentiss Ingraham, who had written hundreds of western novels, scores of them having to do with the exploits of Buffalo Bill. Could John W. Young have been "Honda," and Prentiss Ingraham, who published frequently in *Outlook*, have been his amanuensis? What Honda called the "Kanab Desert" was

the Hurricane Plateau, which he described as “a dry, elevated plain, about 120 miles long by 80 at its widest point” just north of “the grand cañon of the Colorado River.” Appearing in a magazine that promoted “Sport, Travel and Recreation,” Honda’s “Last Wild Horse of the Kanab Desert” was designed to awaken a nostalgia for a wildness that was passing, as represented by the proud black stallion “dying on his knees.” It was a nostalgia that was already being successfully marketed by eastern capitalists. William F. Cody himself, for example, and his traveling “Buffalo Bill’s Wild West and Congress of Rough Riders,” was just one such Wild West Show making hundreds of thousands of dollars traveling throughout the United States and Europe. Whether Ingraham, Buffalo Bill, John W. Young, Dee Woolley, or Dan Seegmiller were behind the article or not, its publication drew attention to “the Kanab desert,” the jumping off place for their new park.

John W. Young had purchased vast holdings from the OUO as it came undone in 1885. As president of the stake in which Orderville was situated, Woolley presided over the dissolution of the OUO and charged the handsome commission of \$3,000 for his role in helping Young obtain the Order’s huge land holdings and range rights in the House Rock Valley and on the Kaibab Plateau.¹⁶ Young had also purchased the VT Ranch, which owned large holdings and grazing rights on the Kaibab Plateau on the north rim of the Grand Canyon. The area covered in VT’s domain included DeMotte Park, the location of today’s Grand Canyon North Rim Visitor’s Center, the Grand Canyon Lodge, and renowned points for viewing the Grand Canyon exemplified by Point Sublime, Bright Angel Point and Cape Royal Point. John W. Young was a master at identifying and exploiting opportunities to make big money, and if Woolley should be given credit for seeing the regions’ potential to bring paying tourists into the Arizona Strip, so

¹⁶ Citation from WSC.

too should Young. While Woolley was certainly the great promoter of Kane County and the eastern portion of the Arizona Strip, Young, during the last two decades of the nineteenth century, was frequently called “Utah’s Great Promoter.”¹⁷ Young spent much of his time in New York, London, and other financial capitols raising funds; he viewed all his business deals in the context of a divine mission to “build up the Kingdom God on Earth.”¹⁸ Like his father, he mixed church and private business in a confusing fabric of economic chaos that eventually alienated him from his fellow apostles and led to his bankruptcy. (John W. Young spent his last years as an elevator operator in an exclusive New York hotel in which he had once lived.)¹⁹

Sometime in 1892 or before, Young approached Cody to see if Buffalo Bill’s star power could be used to advance his and Woolley’s scheme to turn the Kaibab Plateau into a European-style hunting park. The plan involved building a massive lodge at DeMotte Park near the north rim of the Grand Canyon. Cody had just returned from a long tour in Europe, exciting that continent with his Wild West Show. The Pope had given him “and his Indians a lot of medals, chaplets and crosses,” and after performing for the Queen Victoria she “bestowed upon him a locket containing her portrait, around which are clustered fifty-two diamonds” bearing the inscription, “Her Majesty Queen Victoria to Colonel W. F. Cody, June 25, 1892.”²⁰ Noble lords and ladies, and high ranking military and governmental officers sought him out as the incarnation of all that fascinated them with the American West. Cody was famously cashing in

¹⁷ The *Intermountain Catholic*, October 19, 1901, 4, UDN.

¹⁸ Among many other projects, in 1891 John W. Young was involved in the church’s purchase of 2,500,000 acres in the Mexican State of Chihuahua for members who were fleeing the United States during the Anti-Polygamy Raids. Newspapers reported that by 1891 there were 5,000 Mormons settled in three colonies in Mexico. To provide these exiles with employment while simultaneously boosting the church’s “prestige in Mexico,” Young and hundreds of Latter-day Saint employees were “engaged in building 1500 miles of railroad in Mexico.” See *Deseret News*, February 2, 1891, 5, September 6, 1890, 6, April 14, 1891, 8, and April 17, 1891, 4, UDN.

¹⁹ Todd Compton, “John Willard Young, Brigham Young, and the Development of Presidential Succession in the LDS Church,” *Dialogue: A Journal of Mormon Thought* 35 (Winter 2002): 111–134, especially 129.

²⁰ Salt Lake *Herald*, March 4, 1890, UDN; and *Salt Lake Tribune*, October 26, 1, UDN.

on this immense fascination with the American frontier, and Young was convinced that wealthy and mature “boys” would follow Cody to the North Rim to a lodge and hunting park perhaps named after and partially owned by the popular folk icon. Cody initially supported the idea and helped to court American and British investors by planning an exploratory expedition for October and November 1892.²¹ Unable to get away himself, Young put Cody in touch with his employees Dan Seegmiller and Dee Woolley, who were in charge of making arrangements for the whole expedition. Unfortunately, on the front end of the trip valuable October weeks were wasted waiting for representatives of investors, some of whom never showed up, and November blizzards and deep snow eventually drove them off the Kaibab Plateau, perhaps negatively influencing the investors who eventually chose not to bankroll in the project.²²

On October 30, 1892, Cody left his ranch near North Platt, Nebraska, with a large retinue of hunters, investors, and publicists for the expedition’s point of departure in Flagstaff, Arizona. The expedition’s party proper consisted of sixteen gentlemen, but as they left Flagstaff they were joined by a retinue of over forty cowboys, mostly Mormons, whom Woolley and Seegmiller assembled to serve as guides, horse wranglers, baggage wagon drivers, gun keepers, and animal skinners. Designed to be an international media event, a professional photographer was hired to accompany the group. Dime novelist Prentiss Ingraham came along as historian and wrote reports of the trip for publication in US and European newspapers. To attract public attention, Cody brought some of the most popular members of his Wild West Show, including Johnny Baker, who was represented as “the world’s best shot,” and “Pony Bob” Haslam, who had won

²¹ See Sarah J. Blackstone, *The Business of Being Buffalo Bill: Selected Letters of William F. Cody, 1879–1917* (New York: Praeger Publishers, a division of Greenwood Press, Inc., 1988).

²² *Daily Inter Ocean* (Chicago), December 23, 1892, 11, NCN; [Elizabeth Jensen], “Buffalo Bill’s Trip to Buckskin Mountains (Copy made to read to DUP,” and related materials in WSC, b1 f9. *Salt Lake Tribune*, January 2, 1893, 3, UDN.

notoriety by riding the first leg of the Pony Express. Originally Cody announced to the press that “a party of ten Russian and English noblemen” were to join his expedition to the north rim of the Grand Canyon, but when the time came to go only two English lords actually showed up at the rendezvous site at Cody’s Ranch. Cody hired a gourmet French chef, who, it was sadly soon discovered, “couldn’t cook unless he was in a French kitchen.” But enough fine Scotch imported from the aristocrats home country (and the cooking of the cowboys) kept them happy. The excursion included Cody’s son-in-law and manager of his Wild West Show and Colonel Frank D. Baldwin, who was assigned by the US Army to appropriately escort these high ranking officers of Britain’s military. A number of industrialists and businessmen completed the genteel portion of the party, including Edward C. Bradford of the Union Pacific who may have been along to gain some idea of whether or not a rail line could be brought to the site of John W. Young’s proposed lodge on the North Rim. Tone Ivins, president of the St. George Stake, accompanied the group for at least part of the trip. John W. Young’s son Brigham was remembered in Ingraham’s writings as being “chief of the [Mormon] cowboys” who attended them.

Organized under the direction of John W. Young, this was a church-sponsored business venture and despite the presence of lords, generals and Wild West Show celebrities, the priesthood was in charge. When it was all over Buffalo Bill made this comment of his Mormon guides:

They are the greatest people to pray . . . and they have the regular old Methodist twang about it. They can pray for more things and a longer space of time than any set of people I ever saw. They had me down on my knees eight or ten times a day. When Young

Brigham [a son of John W. Young] would go for the mail they would pray for his speedy return and that each one present might receive a letter.

It took four days from Flagstaff to reach the South Rim. They descended to the Colorado River on the Hance trail, posing for photographs with the Canyon's spectacular cliffs and formations in the background. On the way down to the river one of their pack animals slipped and fell some 3,000 feet to its death. After visiting the South Rim, a handful of Cody's retinue returned to Flagstaff while the rest took a circuitous journey of ten days on the Mormon Trail over Lees Ferry to advance to a point on the North Rim just seventeen miles from where they started. Their complaints of this inconvenience inspired Dee Woolley later to invest time and thousands of dollars to develop a trail and a tramway to cross the river from rim to rim and avoid this difficult journey.

Dee Woolley met the group at John W. Young's ranch headquarters at Kane Ranch and they "entered into [the North Rim's] promised land under the protection of Elder Dan Siegmiller [*sic*], President Woolley of the Kanab stake, and President Ivins of the St. George stake."²³ Now penetrating what the newspapers called "the wilds of the least known section of the United States,"²⁴ Woolley and a Kaibab guide led the group onto the North Rim where hunting began in earnest. Woolley led them to DeMotte Park and then to Greenland Point, Point Sublime, and other now famous places to view the Grand Canyon. Splitting up into small hunting parties, they bagged mountain lion, bear, elk, and untold numbers of mule deer. At a place they named McKinnon Point after one of the English lords who accompanied them, Buffalo Bill, McKinnon

²³ *Deseret News*, December 7, 1892, 8.

²⁴ *Deseret News*, December 7, 1892, 8.

and others scratched a short message onto a piece of paper, signed it, and stuffed it into a tin can which was discovered where they left it in 1928 by a Grand Canyon park ranger.²⁵

Prentiss Ingraham, who eventually published a dime novel based on the journey entitled *The Girl Rough Riders* tells us through his fiction that his party visited “a half-ruined cabin” near Point Sublime which their guide told them “had been the home of Major Powell.”²⁶ Though no women in reality made the 1892 trip, Woolley sent his daughter Mary and a mixed group of about twenty of her adolescent friends on a similar trip in 1896.²⁷ Perhaps learning of this second trip as Woolley urged him to help bring publicity to “this promised land,” Ingraham wrote a novel seemingly merging the two trips based on the 1892 itinerary. In his fictional *The Girl Rough Riders*, finished in 1899 but first published in 1903, a group of young women follow the same itinerary as the 1892 trip and have many of the same experiences the actual group had. Individuals from the 1892 trip, such as Woolley, Seegmiller, Ivins, and John W. Young’s son Brigham, are presented in their actual roles. Ingraham’s introduction to the work bears witness to the fact that “the adventures met with in what he says cannot be classed wholly as a novel,” were “realities of an adventurous trail lately taken” by himself and Buffalo Bill.²⁸

In his fictional account of his real trip, Ingraham described through the eyes of his “Girl Rough Riders” what he actually experienced there. In all the Grand Canyon’s length and breadth, he wrote, “from either side and from mountain heights, from its depths and from its thousands of pinnacles, no spot surpasses Point Sublime as an objective point from which to view the

²⁵ Byrd H. Granger, *Grand Canyon Place Names* (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1960), 25; and “Buffalo Bill Signature,” Grand Canyon Museum, Grand Canyon Arizona, grca #14634.

²⁶ Colonel Prentiss Ingraham, *The Girl Rough Riders: A Romantic and Adventurous Trial of Fair Rough Riders through the Wonderland of Mystery and Silence* (Boston: Dana Estes & Company, 1903), 271.

²⁷ Mary Chamberlain, *Handmaiden of the Lord*, 122–139.

²⁸ Ingraham, *Girl Rough Riders*, v–xi.

Wonderland of the Colorado.” Colonel Ingraham portrayed the country that stretched before him at Point Sublime as the very heart of “American Greatness.” Standing under an American flag hoisted on a pole “on the very spot where Major Powell had once floated Old Glory over the Grand Cañon,” the dime novel writer described seeing Old Glory mystically depicted twenty miles across the canyon in “cliffs and walls of [solid] rock.” He saw before him “cliffs of a dozen hues,” one of them “striped with immense layers of rock of red and white, and by some strange freak of nature at one upper end appeared what by a little effort of imagination could be called white stars set in a blue field.” With the mighty Colorado as his sculpting tool, through millions of years of erosion God himself had carved the banner of Manifest Destiny at the most sublime point on the face of the earth. Ingraham and his companions named the divinely inscribed rock face “Old Glory Cliff.”²⁹

After many “thrilling adventures” Cody, Woolley and Seegmiller’s actual rough riders rode off the Kaibab Plateau overnighting in Fredonia’s Hardscrable. This was the first settlement they had seen since leaving Flagstaff and to them it was “primitive in the extreme,” though they found its rude log-cabins and adobe houses “comfortable and neat in every particular.” The sudden appearance of the world-renowned Buffalo Bill and his compatriots all dressed “in leather jackets, leather leggings and beaver trimmed top coats” shocked the Hardscrable saints in their utter isolation, but a warm welcome was nevertheless proffered. Colonel Ingraham described to a Chicago newspaper that the Hardscrable saints “gave a dance in our honor.” In the Mormons’ “peculiar dances,” he said, “Colonel Cody, two Mormon elders, [Lord] Mildmay, and two cowboys” danced with Mormon belles “to the music of a melodian and a violin.”³⁰

²⁹ Ingraham, *Girl Rough Riders*, 273–275.

³⁰ Ingraham, *Girl Rough Riders*, 296–297; *Salt Lake Herald*, December 7, 1892, 8, and *Chicago Inter Ocean*, December 23, 1892, both in CALOC.

At nearby Kanab they rested for several days while their worn-out horses recuperated. Splitting up, they ate and slept at Dee Woolley's two homes, wife Emma caring for one bunch and Flora for the other. By 1892, Emma's house already had running water and the only bathtub in town. Dee and Emma's daughter Mary wrote that the Woolley's home featured "the first steel range, extension table, dinner set, window-drapes, and 'States Carpet' in the [whole] town."³¹ Flora's twelve year-old son Dilworth remembered Buffalo Bill's company "coming into Kanab full of the success of the hunt and overflowing with praise for the grandeur of the forest and the Grand Canyon." He remembered that "the greater part of the company stayed at Aunt Emma's home," but that "Lord Milme and Col. Ingrham [*sic*] were Mother's guests." Young Dilworth was enamored by Cody's persona and many years later he wrote that "Buffalo Bill wore a buckskin shirt with fringe down the back of the sleeves, doeskin britches, calfskin boots with high tops above the knees, a fancy vest, gold chain across the breast, a stetson hat (it cost \$30.00) the brim slightly turned up; hair long, combed back over the head and tied in the back. A gotee and mustache completed the picture. I can see him as plain as the day I first saw him."

While their horses recuperated they made at least one trip to Pipe Spring. Cody wanted to see the horses owned by Seegmiller, Woolley, and John W. Young. He was taking his Wild West Show to the Columbian Exposition in Chicago the next season and wanted to buy some handsome and spirited geldings. Woolley and Seegmiller's cowhands gathered up 125 horses from the Pipe Springs range. Ever the showman, Cody pitted his world renowned lassoing

³¹ Mary Chamberlain, "Life of Edwin Dilworth Woolley, Junior," 5-6; and Mary Chamberlain, *Handmaiden of the Lord*, 90-93. Referring to her family's makeshift hotel in Kanab, Mary wrote, "There was no hotel in the town and we were about the only ones who had a spare room, and it was usually occupied. We never knew what it was to eat a meal alone, and the best of everything was always served for company. We entertained all the General Authorities of the Church. . . also, lords and noblemen from England, senators, congressmen, governors, Colonel Cody (Buffalo Bill) and party, railroad officials, drummers, post office inspectors . . . We also hosted cattle buyers, sheep and wool contractors, land commissioners and surveyors, artists, sectarian ministers, and novelists, including Zane Grey and others."

against that of the Kanab-Pipe Springs cowboys. One of them, Ed Lamb, remembered, however, that “soon as I saw him do up his lasso I knew I could out do him. *We could all out do him.*” Dilworth remembered, that he “went with Ed Lamb to gather a herd of geldings from the VT Outfit from the Pipe Spring Range for Buffalo Bill to take for use in his show, fine looking animals, but only half-broke.” Lamb told Dee Woolley’s daughter Elizabeth that young Mormon “bronco busters helped furnish [some] fun” for Cody and his friends by riding the “half-broke” animals. “It was also great fun,” Lamb told Elizabeth, “to put [Cody’s men] on our horses and watch them *try* to ride.”³²

Dilworth enjoyed sharing his retelling of when Emma Woolley prepared a feast for the guests. Her table was “actually groaning [under] its load of everything imaginable to eat.” Dilworth reported that “this day the dessert was custard pie, one of those pies for which [Emma Woolley’s] home was famous—large in size, deep in depth and luscious in texture and the color of pure gold.” As they sat down to eat, “Buffalo Bill could not take his eyes off’ Emma’s custard pie. At that point, according to Dilworth, “Father, from the seat at the head of the table looked over at the distinguished guest opposit[e] him at the other end of the long table and said, ‘Col. Cody, will you ask the blessing on the food?’ Buffalo Bill started with surprise, gazed around at the faces . . . before him, pulled himself together, bowed his head and said, ‘Oh, Lord bless the woman who made that custard pie.’”³³

³² Edward Lamb, “Col. Cody’s Trip to the Grand Canyon as Told by Edward Lamb, to Elizabeth [Woolley Jensen], July 1820,” in WSC, b1, f9; and various other papers in WSC, especially in b1, f9.

³³ WSC, b1, f9. Cody purchased four geldings from Pipe’s horse herd which were brought to Dee’s stables in Kanab for Dilworth’s duty to feed and care for them. He wrote that Buffalo Bill “entered the stables to greet [his] new horses, which he did with a slap on the rump and a ‘Well, Old Napoleon; Well, Old star.’ He got by all right with only a startled turn of the head and a cold stare from the first two, but at the third stall when he gave the slap on the soft place and [said] ‘Well, Old Pat’, the horse met the greeting with his two hind feet in the pit of the great man’s stomach. B. B. grabbed his middle with two hands doubling over with a great ‘ugh.’ In a moment he stra[i]ghtened up, felt himself all over to see if all parts were still in place, then seeing me standing there, eyes and mouth wide open in fright, he put his hand in his pocket, brought out a half-dollar saying: ‘Take this, boy, and say nothing about

After their expensive expedition, however, “the syndicate” reportedly backing them to the tune of \$6,000,000 reneged. Wise investors concluded that a “mammoth game preserve” on the Kaibab Plateau, which could only be reached by a 300-mile journey on horseback was far too remote to bring in wealthy (and soft) tourists, despite the singular allure of the Grand Canyon and the promise of true wilderness hunting. The truth is, the Old West still existed on the Arizona Strip, and it was still far too harsh and rough to sell to tourists. Cody’s investors concluded it needed to be tamed some before it could be successfully marketed. Despite its short-term failure, their efforts succeeded in planting the idea of opening the incredible scenery of southern Utah and northern Arizona to tourist travel. Buffalo Bill took his geldings from Pipe Springs to perform in his Wild West Show at the Chicago World’s Fair in 1893, and his positive account of his experience during the expedition eventually helped facilitate interest in Grand Canyon tourism. The gentile-Mormon cooperation and goodwill that characterized the 1892 expedition, as well as the mutual desire “to have [the] country improved and to bring wealth and emigration into it, independent of creed,” that John W. Young, Dee Woolley, and William F. Cody designed eventually culminated in making the Grand Canyon a national park in 1905 followed by the designation of Pipe Springs as a national monument in 1923. The bold lines that Brigham Young had drawn between his people and gentiles were softening—his grand bastion was weakening and becoming permeable.

A New Quieter Era for Pipe Springs—

The Church Sells the Ranch to “an Outsider”

this.’ It was a great big piece of money in those days, first I ever had.” Unfortunately, Dilworth lost the half-dollar on the way home and “never found it.”

Several markers during the early 1890s heralded the coming of a new era to Winsor Castle at Pipe Springs, and to the territory of Utah. Among these were the alleged passing of the frontier, the proclamation of the Woodruff Manifesto, President Benjamin Harrison's January 4, 1893, proclamation of full amnesty and pardon for polygamists, and the end of vigorous prosecution of the anti-polygamy laws. President Grover Cleveland signed the statehood bill on July 18, 1894 "to enable the people of Utah to form a Constitution and State Government, and to be admitted into the Union on an equal footing with the original States."³⁴ With these changes and the slow demise of the Pipe Springs Range, Winsor Castle had fulfilled its purpose and was becoming obsolete. As a result, the old fort that Brigham Young constructed on the Arizona Strip was essentially abandoned. The national panic of 1893, which continued for some time beyond the year of its name, topped by several more years of acute drought, made the cattle industry on the Arizona Strip particularly unstable. Despite the fact that Seegmiller still technically owned Pipe on paper, and that he and Woolley and other cattlemen still ran livestock on its range, the old fort was virtually worthless and was usually empty. The springs and their ponds and troughs were still valuable to cowboys and with no one to keep them from it, cowboys, careless drummers, and travelers pulled up floorboards for firewood and smashed cupboards and window sills for kindling. Cowboys still used it to store their tack and other equipment, but usually preferring to sleep out of doors, believing that the empty old fort attracted Native Americans, wolves, and coyotes. Imbued with the spirit of cooperation and sharing Mormonism required of them, the cowboys that used the range readily shared its water with all, even with the Kaibabit,

³⁴ <http://archives.utah.gov/research/exhibits/Statehood/1894text.htm>

who were spending more time in the Moccasin-Pipe Springs region as whites continued to drive them from Kanab.

Signaling that the church's passing of the ownership of the Pipe Springs Ranch to Seegmiller and Woolley had simply been an act of deception forced upon them by the raid (and that these trusted members of the Kanab Stake Presidency had actually just held it for the church in secret trust all along), once President Benjamin Harrison's amnesty was declared, all considered the place church property again.³⁵ The bulk of the property of the cattle cooperatives established in the 1870s had long since passed into the hands of a few large Mormon capitalists, like James Andrus, who used periods of economic downturn to their advantage, pushing many of the small stockholders out and gobbling up their livestock at low prices. Backed by the firm Woolley, Lund, & Judd, of which he was now part-owner, Andrus not only superintended, but also totally controlled the CCCC. Salt Lake newspapers now called the hero of the Navajo War one of the great "southern Utah cattle barons." Andrus and his firm, in fact, were by far the largest stock owners south of the rim of the basin.³⁶ By the mid-1890s, however, an even larger cattle syndicate, financed by far bigger money than Andrus and his firm could muster, was poised to take over.

The chief representative of this syndicate was Benjamin Franklin Saunders, then becoming "one of the cattle kings of Utah." Behind Saunders were funds he brought to Utah

³⁵ Assistant Church Historian Andrew Jenson, passed through Pipe and Moccasin on official Church Historian's Office business in March 1892. Of Pipe he wrote: "West of Fredonia, at a distance of about fifteen miles, is the renowned Pipe Spring, near which Dr. J. H. Whitmore [*sic*] and Robert McIntire were killed by Indians in January, 1866. Here stands the old rock fort, constructed during the Indian war, and *the ranch is now owned by President E. D. Woolley, of Kanab.*" Of Moccasin he wrote: "Three miles north of P[i]pe Springs ranch, in a romantic little cove, are the Moccasin springs, from which about one hundred acres of some of the best and most productive farming land in Southern Utah are irrigated. Only two families reside here at present, who belong to the Orderville ward." Andrew Jenson, Arizona, to Editor *Deseret News*, March 10, 1892, 11, DNHA, italics mine.

³⁶ *Salt Lake Herald*, October 7, 1894, 14, UDN.

from big cattle interests in midwestern states like Missouri, Kansas, and Illinois. Saunders hailed from St. Joseph, Missouri, and came into Mormon country as early as 1882 as a buyer for large midwestern slaughter houses. Saunders bought cattle from local owners and then freighted whole trainloads of Mormon beef to eastern and western markets. It was said that B.F. Saunders sometimes handled over half a million head of stock annually. By 1895 he had a near monopoly on cattle-buying in the south, though Preston Nutter, another gentile, was slowly elbowing his way into Saunders' lucrative Mormon market. In 1895, Saunders almost single-handedly shipped eight hundred railroad cars full of cattle from Milford, bought largely from southern Utah Latter-day Saints. He also bought the lion's share of "one hundred cars of sheep and one hundred cars of wool" that left Milford that same year. A decade later he was touted as "the largest sheep dealer in the world," and did an annual business of \$3,000,000 a year, buying stock in Utah, Nevada, Idaho, Wyoming, Colorado, and Oregon. On his death in 1909, the *Salt Lake Tribune* reported that for years he had been "the largest individual livestock dealer in the United States." B.F. Saunders had become the prime capitalist behind the southern Utah economy and Mormon papers boasted that "there is no man in the intermountain country who has done more than he to build up the interests of the State of Utah."

Latter-day Saints trusted Saunders because he was a kind, soft-spoken man who shared many of their values and was scrupulously fair and honest in his business dealings. But most of all they trusted Saunders for the respect he showed their "peculiar religion"—and for the quiet fealty he gave to the Mormon hierarchy, who were, of course, his partners in big business. Even decades after his death it was whispered that this wealthy gentile paid the Brethren a full tithe for his piece of the action. Saunders was so close to church leaders that some historians have felt his ownership of certain Canaan Ranch properties—including Pipe Springs—was really a front to

shield actual church ownership from the US Government. Over the years he hired hundreds of Mormon cowboys, whom he treated with such consideration that many of them gave him the same loyalty and respect they did their church leaders. To show his commitment to Utah and to Mormonism, he established a residence in Salt Lake City and purchased the large Parashont Ranch on the Arizona Strip, convincing Mormons he not only meant to buy from them, but also to live among them and “build up” their commonwealth.³⁷

In the 1880s and early 1890s Saunders repeatedly tried to buy Pipe Springs.³⁸ The panic of 1893, which only deepened in 1894 and 1895, resulted in a steep fall in the national demand for beef and the bottom fell out of the southern Utah/northern Arizona cattle market. This problem was exacerbated by continued depletion of the ranges because of overgrazing, drought, and a devastating winter in 1893–1894, in which it was estimated that fifty percent of the livestock in parts of southern Utah would perish. Cattle-baron Andrus and his firm suddenly found themselves drowning in debt. Contributing to their desperation, by January 1895 sheep men were moving huge flocks on to “the Canaan, Pipe Springs and Trumbull ranches [and] out toward the breaks of the Colorado,” cropping what little grass there was to the ground and their cattle were starving. Economic tensions were such that Salt Lake papers warned that “the sheep have no business on the [cattle] ranges,” and prophesied that “their owners may yet be so

³⁷ Elisabeth Snow, St. George, to Erastus Snow, December 21, 1882, Erastus Snow Letters and Correspondence, USHS; *Daily Illinois State Register* (Springfield, ILL), March 21, 1897, 166, GBC; “Men Who Have Made Utah Famous . . . B. F. Saunders,” *Salt Lake Telegram*, July 16, 1906, 10, GBC; Spangler, passim; McKoy, passim; Reilly, *Lee’s Ferry*, 151–152, 174, 185–186, 192–196, 198–200, 203–205, 207, 209, and 213; Abraham Cannon, *Journal*, June 27, 1895; Karl Larson, *Erastus Snow*, 601, and 613; Raymond J. Geerdes, memorandum and report to Karl T. Gilbert, January 1, 1970, “The Ownership of Pipe Spring: A Legal and Historical Brief,” especially, 20, and 40–69, PSLA; B. F. Saunders folder, PTR, s8, b24, f363; P. T. Reilly, No. Hollywood, CA, to Raymond J. Geerdes, Pipe Spring National Monument, Moccasin, AZ, February 11, 1970, PTR, s8, b21, f329; *Salt Lake Telegram*, June 17, 1909, 6, GBC; *Salt Lake Herald*, July 27, 1909, 12, UDN; *Deseret News*, July 26, 1909, 2, UDN; and *Salt Lake Tribune*, July 27, 1909, 12, UDN.

³⁸ For example, see L. John Nuttall to James G. Bleak, St. George, December 30, 1882, typescript taken from First Presidency Letter Press Copy Books, PTR, b21, f329.

convinced,” for violence would certainly be the result “if the woolgrowers encroach too closely on the winter ranges of the cattlemen.” These factors all worked together to enable Saunders and his syndicate to buy much of the Arizona Strip in 1895 with their outside money. Where the land was owned collectively by the saints—who actually held no titles because the government had not surveyed it and put it up for preemption, Saunders quietly placed “Valentine Scrip” on small pieces of land in the desert containing springs, seeps, and reservoirs in an effort to gain control of the whole range.³⁹

In what was described as “by far the heaviest deal of its kind ever made” in “the history of the Territory of Utah,” in April and May 1895 Saunders negotiated the purchase of “the great Canaan Co-operative Stock company brand, the delivery to be finally effected before the first day of October.” While the exact price was not publicized, the Salt Lake *Herald* stated that it had learned that “the deal involves a total amount of not less than \$100,000.” The newspaper announced that “the Canaan ranches embrace a great stretch of country in southern Utah and northern Arizona, extending back over what is known as the Hurricane Heights to the Pipe Springs on the east and out to the breaks of the Colorado on the south. There are three home ranches and an abundance of water. Taken altogether it is an ideal breeding range and the steers which come from there are the equal of any in the territory.”

As Saunders signed his contract with Andrus for the sprawling Canaan Ranch, he was involved in secret negotiations with the Presiding Bishopric and the First Presidency for the purchase of “the Pipe Springs Ranches.” It seems it was only Winsor Castle, its 40 acres, and Pipe’s spring water he was interested in, for by now the church apparently ranged no cattle there. On May 8, 1895, Saunders purchased “the Pipe Spring Ranch with all its apurtenences” [*sic*] for

³⁹ *Salt Lake Tribune*, February 17, 1894, UDN; and *Salt Lake Herald*, January 26, 1895, 5, CALOC.

\$2500. He paid Presiding Bishop William B. Preston \$200 down, and gave him his note for the remainder, the Bishop promising to provide “a good and sufficient deed to the above mentioned ranch on or before August 1st 1895.” The purchase price demonstrated that the value of the fort and its springs had fallen by at least 75% since its construction, when the fort, the spring, and 40 acres was valued at \$10,000.⁴⁰

Saunders got a bargain, for the church too was in desperate straits. It would be years before it would recover from the confiscation of its property, even though Congress and the courts were ruling that it should be returned.⁴¹ Compared to the days before the raid, tithing income had dwindled to a mere trickle. The wholesale government seizure of ecclesiastical property and church leaders’ questionable efforts to hide property under their own names had convinced many Mormons that paying tithing was pointless. Countless articles the *Salt Lake Tribune* describing fraud which grew with one’s level of priesthood had taken their toll on church culture. Men like Kanab Stake President Dee Woolley, his counsellor Dan Seegmiller, and Panguitch Stake President Jesse W. Crosby, were openly accused by some of their coreligionists of embezzlement.⁴² Official court investigations of how church funds were disposed of under Brigham Young and John Taylor had opened a veritable Pandora’s Box. A widespread distrust among church members themselves for how “their Profits” had handled

⁴⁰ “Escrow Agreement of Wm. B. Preston, dated May [8]th, 1895, Agreeing to Sell B. F. Saunders the Pipe Springs Ranch in Arizona,” First Presidency, Political and Contractual Documents, CR 1/7, b3, f4, CHL; and Abraham Cannon, “Journal,” August 15, 1895.

⁴¹ On January 11, 1894 the Supreme Court of Utah entered a decree “returning to the Church 439 thousand dollars.” John Henry Smith, *Diaries*, 304.

⁴² The First Presidency and Quorum of the Twelve had to attempt to settle the morass of problems that arose when “some of the prominent brethren” of the Panguitch Stake accused President Crosby of embezzlement. Similarly, Anthony W. Ivins of St. George testified against his two brothers-in-law of the Kanab Stake Presidency saying that the business of the Kaibab Cattle Company, in which the church had “a heavy interest,” had “been run by E. D. Woolley and Dan Seegmiller in a most extravagant manner, and so as to bring great profit to them[selves at the expense of the church].” Abraham Cannon, “Journal,” August 15, 1895, and January 10, 1894; and John Henry Smith, *Diaries*, 333–334.

tithing funds worked with the whole Escheatment fiasco to convince many to stop paying tithing altogether. By the mid-1890s church leaders estimated that fewer than a fourth of their members paid any tithing at all, and that only a slice of that fraction paid a full tithe. In April 1895, George Q. Cannon of the First Presidency complained that “the average amount paid by each tithe-payer [annually was] only \$19.05” acknowledging that “an idea prevails that the tithings are not properly used by the officers of the Church, and this is used by some as an excuse for not paying tithing.” The president of the San Juan Stake suggested his stake had nothing to contribute, for “most of their donations were paid to Indians, of which there is a great number in his Stake.”⁴³ Capturing the depressed spirit that pervaded church, state, and national economics for several years to come, Apostle John Henry Smith drearily confided to his diary on the last day of 1893 “My affairs at this writing are in [a] bad fix. I owe much money and am paying no interest on it. Times are hard. Many people are without the necessities of life. My heart bleeds for my Kind. Confidence seems lacking in the breast of men everywhere in the world.”⁴⁴

Saunders quietly continued his buying spree, procuring a number of smaller ranches at pennies on the dollar, including a ranch at Cane Beds between Pipe and Short Creek. He also bought cattle wherever and whenever he could, including a large herd of cattle known as the Blackfoot herd, bringing the number of cattle he had acquired from distressed Mormons to at least “fifteen thousand head.” He could not keep his purchase of Pipe quiet for long, for the church asked Daniel Seegmiller and his wife Artimesia Snow to execute a quitclaim deed in favor of Saunders, which they did on July 23, 1885.⁴⁵ Meanwhile it appears Winsor Castle was bereft of both caretakers and beds that summer. Two traveling churchman from Salt Lake

⁴³ Abraham Cannon, “Journal,” April 8, 1895.

⁴⁴ John Henry Smith, *Diaries*, 303–304.

⁴⁵ McKoy, *Cultures at a Crossroads*, 651; *Deseret News*, April 27, 1895, 24.

holding Sunday School conferences found Brother James Andrus at Canaan Ranch “in a crude kind of a domicile, with extensive corrals, where sheep and cattle herders usually shelter.” There they learned “that the entire Canaan herd and ranch had recently been sold to a Mr. Saunders.” One of these travelers, wrote that: “we pursued our journey to Pipe Springs or Windsor Castle, another ranch abode and shelter, where our bones longed for the morning light, being in such close proximity to the hard floor, but I was thankful to find a place to sleep where we could not see the stars, nor feel the midnight blasts.”⁴⁶

Though Dee Woolley had virtually ignored Winsor Castle since he moved Flora and her children from Pipe to Kanab in 1891, when he heard of its sale to Saunders he fired off a short but bold telegram of complaint to President Woodruff. “Sale of Pipe springs to Cattle syndicate means serious loss to the people of our stake,” he told the church president, adding that if Pipe “must be sold, the people of the stake wish to buy” and forwarded a petition signed by prominent members of his stake urging that they be given a chance to buy Pipe Springs.⁴⁷ Woolley had support for his position in the highest quorums of the church, for Apostle John Henry Smith and his son George Albert were heavily involved in the KCCC. It is remarkable that the KCCC, or individual cattlemen like Woolley, Seegmiller, or the rising Alec Findlay, had not been given the opportunity to buy Pipe Springs. Perhaps the sale to a gentile was part of a move by the First Presidency to win gentile support by demonstrating its willingness to work financially with non-church members as Utah headed toward statehood. In any case, on receiving President Woolley’s telegram there was an immediate reaction in the Quorum of the Twelve Apostles. Apostle

⁴⁶ “Travels of Elders Goddard and Reynolds,” in *Deseret News*, June 13, 1895, UDN.

⁴⁷ Telegram of E. D. Woolley, Kanab, to President Woodruff, June 7, 1895, PISP, 2160.

Abraham H. Cannon wrote in his diary that at a meeting of the First Presidency, the Twelve, and the Presiding Bishopric of the church held on August 16, 1895 that it was

reported that the Pipe Springs Ranches near Kanab [had] been sold to B. F. Saunders—a Gentile. A protest against this action was filed signed by many of the staunch men of Kanab Stake, who think they should be given the chance to buy this property if it was for sale. Bishop Preston had sold the property with the consent of Presidents Woodruff and Smith, for \$2,500. After considerable talk in which the value of this ranch was presented, it was decided to try and repurchase it [so it could be sold to Kanab Church members.]⁴⁸

Of this meeting President Woodruff recorded that “the sale of Pipe Spring was also brought up And a motion made to try to Get it Back.”⁴⁹ Apostle John Henry Smith wrote in his diary that the First Presidency and Council of the Twelve “voted to save Pipe Spring Ranch *if possible*.”⁵⁰

But the transaction had taken place, and asking to get the property back put both the church and Saunders in difficult positions. Exactly what happened next is unknown, but by the end of the year both the Canaan Cooperative and Pipe Springs Ranch were back in the hands of Mormons. Did Saunders simply return these properties at the request of the leaders of the Mormon Church? Saunders made much of his living buying cattle throughout Mormondom, not just on the Arizona Strip, and he could ill afford offending his faithful clients. The Provo *Daily Enquirer*, however, seemed to place the blame on the ongoing Depression and a deepening drought which promised to endure for years to come. It reported that “the loss of cattle was more

⁴⁸ Abraham H. Cannon, “Diaries,” August 16, 1895, UUSC.

⁴⁹ Woodruff, *Journal*, 9:365.

⁵⁰ John Henry Smith, *Diaries*, 333.

than the purchaser bargained for, and he disposed of his property at considerable loss—Pipe springs to Cedar and Canaan to a Kanab outfit.” The fact that Saunders lost Canaan too suggests that the sale of Pipe back to Mormons was not simply because the church begged to get it back.⁵¹ Either way, after owning Pipe for less than half a year, on December 2, 1895, B.F. Saunders and his wife Tacy E. Saunders transferred ownership to Latter-day Saint stockmen David Dunn Bulloch and Lehi Willard Jones of Cedar City.

“Rawhide and Baling Wire”—

Bulloch and Jones of Cedar City Take Over Pipe Springs

Despite Dee Woolley’s complaints registered with the First Presidency, there was apparently no one from Kane County, or for that matter, from St. George’s Washington County, who possessed both the money and the will to buy Pipe Springs. But Saunders found a potential buyer in Cedar City’s David Dunn Bulloch. Dave Bulloch was described by his peers as Cedar City’s “Veteran Cattleman.”⁵² Bulloch’s parents joined the church in Scotland when he was a child and immigrated to Utah, settling in Cedar City in 1851. Bulloch apparently got his start in the cattle industry in 1871, when Cedar City organized its first cooperative herd. He and his brother were hired to watch it, their pay being “1/3 of the increase and growth at the end of four years” which amounted to 500 head of cattle. For years the Bulloch brothers made a good living selling cattle to the booming mining town of Pioche, Nevada. In 1875, Dave Bulloch became a

⁵¹ *Provo Daily Enquirer*, June 1, 1896, 1, UDN.

⁵² *Cedar City Iron County Record*, October 24, 1903, 16, UDN. *Our Pioneer Heritage*, 18: 217–218, 243. A cattleman’s cattleman, his last name meant “young bull,” and he named his oldest son David “Cattle” Bulloch. “Cattle” also happened to be one of his wife Alice’s ancestral surnames.

director in the newly created Cedar City Cattle Company (CCCC) and in 1884, he and his brother bought the company out. By dint of hard work, wise investment, and the choice of a fortuitous partner in fellow Cedar City businessman Lehi Willard Jones, he had gradually transformed himself into the proud owner of “one of the largest livestock dealers in southern Utah.” He “bought and sold many thousands of head of cattle and sheep” each year and was well known in various markets “from Chicago to Los Angeles.”⁵³ By selling to Bulloch, B.F. Saunders could please the church by getting it back into the hands of its members, while making a handsome profit.⁵⁴ By the winter of 1895 Bulloch had long been selling cattle and sheep to Saunders and the two men liked and trusted each other. Saunders offered to sell Bulloch the Pipe Springs Ranch apparently for about twice what he had paid for it only a few months earlier.

Bulloch reported to his wife Alice in December 1895 that Saunders told him the ranch occupied some 40 acres, and that there were “about five thousand dollars worth of improvements on the place” including “two large buildings two stories with five rooms in each and quite a number of small buildings.” In addition to the structures, there was an alfalfa field, “all kinds of fruit trees,” and even “a fish pond.” Bulloch visited Pipe Springs and liking what he saw, on December 2, 1895, he and Alice signed a contract purchasing the Pipe Springs Ranch for \$5,000.⁵⁵ Since the Pipe Springs Ranch came with no animals, Bulloch’s first task was to stock it with cattle, which cost far more than the Ranch itself. In need of funds, Bulloch quickly involved his partner Lehi Jones in his new ranch. Like so many of their contemporaries, Dave Bulloch and

⁵³ *Our Pioneer Heritage*, 18: 217, 233–234, 238, and 240.

⁵⁴ For more information on David Dunn Bulloch, see David Dunn Bulloch, Autobiography, “Recollections of David D. Bulloch—(verbatim),” “Experiences of David Bulloch as told to William R. Palmer,” and related material in David Dunn Bulloch folder, JAP. My thanks to Lillian Bulloch of Cedar City for providing me with these items.

⁵⁵ York F. and Evelyn Jones, *Lehi Willard Jones—Biography—His Life—Centering in Cedar City, Utah, 1854–1947, and History of Much of the Development of Southern Utah* (Salt Lake City: Woodruff Printing Company, 1972), 116; and David Dunn Bulloch, Cedar City, Utah, to Sarah Bulloch, Salt Lake City, PISP#1633, PSLA.

Lehi Jones together pulled themselves up by their bootstraps to become men of some means. But living in rustic Cedar City they had never drifted far from their pioneer roots. Because “Dave was continually using rawhide to repair or to make something with, and Lehi could fix most anything with a piece of baling wire,” a local had given the partnership the informal appellation “Rawhide and Baling Wire,” and it stuck. For the rest of their lives Bulloch-Jones happily used the nicknames to identify themselves, their partnership, and their abiding friendship.⁵⁶

“Rawhide and Baling Wire” was a particularly apt nickname for the cattle raising outfit they were about to string together.⁵⁷ They had purchased the ranch at the beginning of a long drought cycle that proved to be one of the worst, if not the worst in recorded Arizona Strip history. This drought eventually killed a high percentage of the animals they went into great debt to purchase. Drought and poor economic conditions forced them to expand their partnership to include a pair of northern Utah investors who eventually pulled out their funding and forced “Rawhide and Baling Wire” to sell the Pipe Springs Ranch in 1902. Newcomers to the Hurricane Plateau, they were not prepared for the extent to which cattle drifted on the Strip and mixed with the herds of others, and they found that local cowboys and herd bosses took advantage of them.⁵⁸ A related problem was theft. The Joneses remembered that “in the Pipe Spring area there was a great deal of cattle rustling going on, this being a remote area where the cattle owners could not constantly ride herd. Brand changing, range pushing, drouth [*sic*] and the ‘Cleveland Depression’

⁵⁶ York and Evelyn Jones, *Lehi Willard Jones*, especially, 185.

⁵⁷ York and Evelyn Jones, *Lehi Willard Jones*, 113. Once before they had made a purchase from Saunders that nearly ended in disaster because they did not fully understand what they were getting themselves into.

⁵⁸ Lehi’s grandson put the problem this way, their cows “were not respectors [*sic*] of so-called public property range lines, and there were other cattle companies in the same area.” As Anson Winsor, Charles Pulsipher, Dee Woolley, and a host of others before them had learned, cooperation with other “outfits” in working the range was paramount to their success. Not being locals sometimes made this difficult. York and Evelyn Jones, *Lehi Willard Jones*, 116.

[all] added to Lehi's and Dave's troubles." Furthermore, none of their children or hired hands "seemed to want to go out to the Arizona Strip and live— being so far away [from Cedar and] the travel back and forth was difficult and time consuming." But despite the challenges, Bulloch and Jones set forth to string a long distance cattle company together. The first herd of cattle they put on the Pipe Springs Ranch they purchased in the vicinity of Deep Creek. These cattle were referred to as "the Circle Two cattle" because of their brand.⁵⁹ They imported other animals and determined to adopt a company brand as "near like the Pipe that was shot by [Gunlock] Hamblin to give the place the name of Pipe Spring." At first they devised a tobacco pipe with a curved stem ♂ but "that did not look good," so they designed a brand that was a circle with "a streight [*sic*] stem ♀" to be placed on the left hip.⁶⁰

The worsening drought, however, wiped many of these cattle out in 1896. By June 15 of that year, Tone Ivins spoke at a conference in St. George "of the desolation of the country with no feed for the cattle and many of them dying, literally starved to death." Northern Utah papers reported that southern Utah cattlemen were "thoroughly discouraged" because of "the extreme draught." The Provo *Enquirer* reported that "from Milford to St. George, *and especially around the watering places of Kane county, cattle and sheep have died by scores of sheer starvation.* Stockmen seem willing to sell at any price, for unless the July rains [come] both summer and winter range will be ruined." Many Mormons felt that the severe cycles of drought that devastated their lands in the mid-1890s was an outpouring of God's wrath meted out to punish a growing Latter-day Saint indifference toward the principle of tithing. Saints fasted and prayed for forgiveness and promised to pay their tithing. Jens Christian Johansen of Richfield wrote that

⁵⁹ York and Evelyn Jones, *Lehi Willard Jones*, 116.

⁶⁰ "Interview of Robert Bulloch of Cedar City, Son of David [D]. Bulloch, Who Owne[d] Pipe Spring Ranch Fall of 1895 to Spring 1902," Pipe Springs National Monument, March 13, 1955, in PSLA, VF, FH, Bulloch.

after “eight weeks and one day without rain” in the summer of 1896 he promised the Lord in prayer that “if he would send us enough rain to mature my crops, I would pay one-third of my crops in tithing.” He wrote in his autobiography that God accepted his offer and “filled the canal.” “My crops matured,” he gratefully remembered, “and I gave one third in tithing.”⁶¹ Early in January 1897, St. George was blessed by “the heaviest rain [it had received] in twenty years.” Salt Lake papers exulted that even in parched Kanab it snowed and rained for an entire week. The coming of rain filled the southern Utah community with hope.⁶²

Before the rains came, the drought nearly bankrupted Bulloch and Jones and their entire Cedar City-based “Rawhide and Baling Wire” partnership. Knowing they would be forced to default on their loans and lose the ranch altogether unless they were strengthened by outside capital, the partners enlisted two northern Utah cattlemen—Aquila Nebeker and Joseph L. Heywood, Jr.—to join them in incorporating a new Salt Lake-based company to be called the Pipe Springs Cattle Company (PSCC).⁶³ The idea was to use Nebeker and Heywood’s access to northern capital to restock Pipe’s drought-depleted range and integrate its cattle more fully into the urban industrial market of Utah’s northern valleys and beyond.⁶⁴ Nebeker lived far to the north in Rich County near the Idaho border, but had lived for a time in southern Utah and still ran cattle on the Kaibab Plateau. An important Utah stockman, businessman, mining entrepreneur, and politician, “Quil” Nebeker was also President of the Utah State Senate.⁶⁵

⁶¹ Tithing, of course, means a “tenth.” Jens Christian Johansen, “Autobiography of Jens Christian Johansen, 1832–1915,” July 1896, CHL.

⁶² *Salt Lake Tribune*, January 17, 1897, 5, UDN.

⁶³ *Deseret News*, May 20, 1897, 2, UDN; and *Salt Lake Herald*, May 21, 1897, 8, NPC.

⁶⁴ Lehi Jones’ descendants remembered that “Nebeker and Heywood had access to credit, and Bulloch and Jones had the experience and knowledge of running cattle.” Reportedly the four borrowed \$60,000 to finance the Pipe Springs Cattle Company. York and Evelyn Jones, *Lehi Willard Jones*, 115 and 120.

⁶⁵ See Scipio A. Kenner, *Utah As it Is: With a Comprehensive Statement of Utah As it Was* (Salt Lake City: the Deseret News, 1904), 434; “Aquila Nebeker,” in Press Club of Salt Lake, *Men of Affairs in the State of Utah: A Newspaper Reference Work* (Salt Lake City: Western Printing Co., 1914), unpaginated; **Lund, *Diaries*, 91**; *Salt*

Joe Heywood was general manager of the Utah Slaughtering Company, a slaughterhouse and meat packing operation associated with the mammoth Lehi Feed Yard, which was built contiguous to the Slaughtering Company's buildings. The feed yard in Lehi was the largest stock yard between Omaha and San Francisco and consisted of ten gargantuan corrals, each equipped with automated wells and an elaborate system of sheds and mangers. The giant feed yard used discarded beet pulp to feed about 2,000 cattle waiting to be slaughtered or shipped to external markets. When mixed with alfalfa and native grasses "on a strictly scientific basis," the "refuse of the factory" was found to possess "special flesh-making qualities" perfect for fattening cattle in deep winter when other foods were hard to come by and animals thinned. The cattle had to be starved for 48 hours before they would eat the strange concoction but soon came to relish it. The system was only economical when the pulp was transported a very short distance from the factory, and as a result the Utah Slaughtering Company built its complex near the Utah Sugar Company and made a five-year contract to take away all of its pulp. Horse-drawn tramcars pulled wagonloads of pulp over a short rail line and dumped it into 1,000 feet of mangers built on either side of the track. To capitalize on the beet pulp, the ten giant corrals and their adjacent slaughterhouse and packing plant, built in the shadow of the sugar beet factory, was also near the railroad, from which beef products could be shipped out in refrigerated cars. By making the PSCC's animals the primary source for the Lehi Feed Yard and Utah Slaughter Company's winter beef, Pipe Springs became part of an automated industrial system designed by Chicago slaughterers and meatpackers for assembly line-type efficiency. Shipped by locomotive from Lund or Milford, Pipe's cattle were fattened in an automated feed yard on beet pulp until ready

Lake Herald, May 17, 1895, 6, UDN; *New York Times*, September 22, 1900; and *Deseret News*, September 7, 1900, 2, UDN.

to be shipped or slaughtered on-site at the state-of-the-art packing plant, where some of the meat was turned into mincemeat, sausage, and processed cuts, which were then boxed for shipping and frozen. Utah's newspapers boasted that "such an industry means a good deal to this territory, for it will keep a great deal of money here at home that would otherwise be sent outside."⁶⁶

On May 20, 1897 the articles of incorporation of the PSCC were filed with the Salt Lake County Clerk. Its capital was fixed at \$50,000 and "divided into 500 shares at the par value of \$100 each." The *Deseret News* announced that "the principal place of business" would be in Salt Lake City, but obviously "the Pipe Springs ranch, in Kane County, 20 miles southwest of Kanab," was to be the actual "base of operations." Northern Utah papers stated that the company already had 3,000 head on its range, and that the company had just purchased "1,300 head of cattle, ranging near Ibapah, in the Deep Creek country," besides "several hundred head" under contract with B.F. Saunders.⁶⁷

On May 24, 1897, David Bulloch, his wife Alice, Lehi W. Jones, and his wife Henrietta transferred the title of Pipe Springs from "Bulloch and Jones" to the Pipe Springs Cattle Company for \$5,000. The deed of sale conveyed

The tract of land known as the Pipe Spring survey as described in plat of survey made by

John M. McFarlane, December 3rd and 4th, 1886, and more particularly described as

⁶⁶ See "Cattle and Sugar Beets," in *Deseret News*, October 28, 1894, 7, UDN; *Deseret News*, November 9, 1895, 28, UDN; *Salt Lake Herald*, October 26, 1895, 5, and November 29, 1897, 6, UDN; "The Lehi Sugar Factory," in *Deseret News*, February 6, 1897, 25, UDN; *Salt Lake Tribune*, November 7, 1897, 15, UDN; Upton Sinclair, *The Jungle* (New York: Doubleday, Page & Company, 1906); Jimmy M. Skaggs, *Prime Cut: Livestock Raising and Meatpacking in the United States, 1607-1983* (College Station, TX: Texas A & M University Press, 1986); Louise Carroll Wade, *Chicago's Pride: The Stockyards, Packingtown, and Environs in the Nineteenth Century* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1987).

⁶⁷ *Deseret News*, May 20, 1897, 2, UDN; *Salt Lake Herald*, May 20, 1897, 8, and May 21, 1897, 8, UDN; and *Ogden Standard*, May 21, 1897, UDN.

follows, to wit: Beginning at a pine tree at the southwest corner of said survey and running thence north eighty rods; thence east eighty rods; thence south eighty rods; thence west eighty rods to the southwest corner, the place of beginning, containing forty acres . . . together with all the corrals, buildings, improvements and appurtenances thereunto appertaining, situated in Mohave County, Arizona.⁶⁸

By incorporating the Salt Lake-based PSCC with northern Utah investors Nebeker and Heywood, Bulloch and Jones attached their Arizona Strip stock-growing operation much more directly to the urban industrial capitalism of Salt Lake City, Ogden, and Provo. Pipe's new sister companies, the Utah Slaughtering Company and the Lehi Cattle Feeding Company, boasted the largest stockyards "between Omaha and San Francisco." An incarnation of Brigham Young's desire to strengthen the Mormon Kingdom by "Home Industry," the Utah Slaughtering Company sought "to get all the home trade [as] a home industry instead of allowing eastern companies to get Utah trade." Cattle that originated at Pipe Springs formed the bulk of the Utah Slaughtering Company's cattle and when wintered on sugar beet pulp in the company's Lehi feedlots, they formed the largest single herd in the Salt Lake-Provo metropolitan area.⁶⁹

At first it appeared the risk Bulloch and Jones had taken in expanding their operation to outside investors was a good one.⁷⁰ Heywood shipped "one of the finest lots of young bulls" in the State of Utah, owned by some of his other Utah Slaughtering Company partners to the Pipe Springs Cattle Company to build up Pipe's herd, announcing to the papers that the company

⁶⁸ Deed of Sale of Pipe Spring from Bulloch & Jones to Pipe Springs Cattle Company, PSLA, 1604.

⁶⁹ *Deseret News*, March 31, 1891, 8, and November 9, 1895, 28, UDN; *Salt Lake Herald*, March 31, 1893, 8, UDN; *Ogden Standard*, November 16, 1895, 1, UDN; and *Salt Lake Tribune*, August 1, 1897, and November 7, 1897, 15, UDN.

⁷⁰ *Salt Lake Herald*, September 5, 1897, 6, CALOC.

“proposes to have one of the [most] select herds in the [region in the] near future.” In his opinion, it was “certainly journeying in that direction” already.⁷¹ In July, massive rainstorms almost turned the Pipe Springs range into a swamp. A businessman named Peter Jensen, on an extended trip in southern Utah, described that after eighteen months with no rain, people in Kanab “were rejoicing” and “wouldn’t go to bed till way in the night because [they] were so glad to hear it rain.” As he passed Fredonia, he noted that “the whole male population was out . . . working with shovels and hoes to protect their houses from the flood.” At Pipe Springs he and his party “had to lay over for two days,” held hostage by the downpours. A few days later as he traveled west across the Hurricane Plateau he wrote that “Canaan Ranch was in the middle of lakes that reached for fifty miles,” and that “you could see the water standing [on the plains] clear over to Mount Trumbull.” For a year and a half before this providential storm, “the country was drying up and those who now have crops will have good ones. The country is wet from four inches to four feet deep and the ranges were terribly in need of the wetting.”⁷²

As range conditions improved, Bulloch and Jones and their children worked the large herds at Pipe and traveled back and forth between Pipe and Salt Lake. In November, the *Salt Lake Herald* printed Dave Bulloch’s report “that the cattle and sheep interests of that section [were] looking up, and that he ha[d] his range, at Pipe Springs, well stocked with the former.”⁷³ Throughout the winter, Salt Lake newspapers tracked the delivery of Pipe Springs cattle at the Lehi Feeding Company’s stockyards.⁷⁴ As the summer of 1898 commenced, Salt Lake papers reported that the southern cattle “never looked better or in finer shape for shipping than at

⁷¹ *Salt Lake Tribune*, August 1, 1897, UDN.

⁷² *Salt Lake Herald*, July 28, 1897, 7, CALOC.

⁷³ *Salt Lake Herald*, 3, CALOC.

⁷⁴ See for example *Salt Lake Tribune*, November 7, 1897, UDN; and *Salt Lake Tribune*, January 4, 1898, 7, NCN.

present,” and that owners received “fancy prices” for them ranging from \$17 to \$25.⁷⁵ Dee Woolley seized upon the flushness of cash in Kanab to convince its citizens to spend \$5,000 for a new water system. Joseph E. Robinson of Kanab rejoiced that “this business has been strong and profitable in the last year, good prices having prevailed generally.” He described that “we have a great many cattle and more sheep in our country,” than usual, estimating that “two hundred thousand” head of Utah sheep were grazing on the Arizona Strip as were “fifteen thousand head of cattle [in] Kane [C]ounty” alone.

With Utah’s stock business on the Strip booming, Robinson and others used their success to argue again for the Strip’s speedy annexation by Utah. Only a year after Utah became a state in 1896, Woolley reported that he was “perfectly satisfied” that the Strip would “eventually be transferred to Utah.” The Strip embraced 800,000 square miles of territory in Coconino and Mohave counties, and that out of that mammoth area there was only “about 200 acres available for agricultural purposes, for lack of irrigation water.” Utah’s legislature had requested that all lands north of the Colorado River be ceded to Utah. Wooley argued that the Strip “naturally and geographically” belonged to Utah and that since the cattle and sheep men who used it were all from Utah, the state ought to own it. The obstacle of the Grand Canyon kept the territory of Arizona from surveying her lands, from building or maintaining roads, and since she sent no lawmen there, the Strip had become “the paradise of horse thieves, and other lawless men.” Dee Woolley and Robert Lund travelled to Phoenix as special commissioners for the State of Utah to formally ask Arizona’s governor and territorial legislature to hand the Strip over to Utah—some Utah lands south of the San Juan River were offered in return. The Utahans felt that since the Strip was “practically cut off from the rest of the Territory of Arizona,” was “of no earthly use to

⁷⁵ *Salt Lake Tribune*, June 4, 1898, UDN.

. . . our neighbors . . . to the south,” and had been colonized and developed by the Mormons, that by the laws of reason and justice it rightly belonged to new State of Utah. Arizona’s governor, Benjamin J. Franklin, was “decidedly opposed” to Utah’s proposal and told Commissioners Woolley and Lund that frankly “we will not willingly share any part of it with anybody else.”⁷⁶ Almost two years after Wooley’s failed request, Robinson expressed his hope that “the people of Arizona would be willing to cede it to us at this time, providing a proper effort were made in that direction, such as sending a commission to Washington to take up a labor with the committee on territories.” Robinson felt that Arizona’s refusal to cede the Strip to Utah two years earlier was related to a complication in Arizona’s bid for statehood. “The people from Arizona willingly admit that it is ours geographically,” he wrote. “We can get to it and they cannot, besides it is a rendezvous for thieves and has almost depleted the treasury of Kane County in the attempt to convict them.”⁷⁷ Unfortunately, the drought returned with a vengeance in 1899. It seems most of the 1897–98 boom had come from that single heavy storm of late July 1897 that had turned the flatlands between Canaan Ranch and Mt. Trumbull into “fifty miles” of shallow lakes. Late in 1898 and for most of 1899, the rain-deprived ranges failed to bring forth grass. Again, an overabundance of sheep on the Strip cropped what grass did spring forth from the parched ground, and the cattle starved, their dried carcasses dotting the range by the thousands, bearing grizzly witness to the boom or bust nature of the single industry upon which the economy of the whole region depended.

⁷⁶ The Provo *Daily Enquirer*, January 27, 1896, 2, UDN; *Salt Lake Herald*, January 27, 1897, 5, February 26, 1897, 6, and March 9, 1897, 6, UDN; *Salt Lake Telegram*, April 8, 1902, 1, UDN; *Salt Lake Tribune*, June 23, 1896, 9, and February 9, 1897, 8, UDN; *Deseret News*, March 12, 1897, 2, November 21, 1901, 4, March 19, 1902, 4, February 26, 1903, 1, November 12, 1903, 1, December 14, 1904, 1, February 1, 1905, 3, December 16, 1905, 13, and February 16, 1910, 1, UDN; and *Davis County Clipper*, February 18, 1910, 2, UDN.

⁷⁷ *Deseret News*, January 12, 1899, 6, UDN.

“About as Cheerless a Domain as One Could Find Outside of Siberia”:

A Snapshot of the Pipe Springs Corridor in 1896

Pipe Springs greatest importance was the water it provided for sojourners plying the ancient desert trails that skirted the Vermilion Cliffs. Throughout the seventy-five years focused on in this study, a constant stream of wanderers traveled these same trails, which through constant use were becoming major thoroughfares. Most of these wayfarers naturally stopped at Pipe for water and many stopped to rest. Two separate and well written accounts of travel across the Pipe Springs corridor in 1896, one gentile and one Mormon, are briefly included here to represent the thousands who passed over this developing thoroughfare. A Salt Lake newspaperman named William Ingleheart travelled across the Arizona Strip just as Bulloch and Jones were setting up their operation at Pipe and published a charming account of his trip in the *Salt Lake Tribune*, of which he was then City Editor.⁷⁸ Ingleheart was in the country to draw attention to a proposal to bring a railroad to St. George, which was being pushed by James G. Bleak, Thomas Judd, and State Senator E. H. Snow, who estimated that 20,000 steers, 5,000 horses, 50,000 sheep and 1,200,000 pounds of wool could annually be shipped from a depot in

⁷⁸ William Ingleheart was an important Utah newspaperman and author, described as “one of the brightest and most successful journalist[s] that ever made Salt Lake his home.” During the early 1890s he “won [his] reputation as a Reporter,” working for the Chicago *Daily News* and the *Record*, during which time he co-authored a book on the 1893 Chicago World’s Fair. In 1894 his health failed him and he came to Utah and from 1894 to October 1898 he served as “telegraph editor and city editor” of the *Salt Lake Tribune*. He became the general manager of the *Salt Lake Herald* in 1898 and part owner of the paper in 1901. He was involved in Utah politics and was a member of the Commercial Club. He used his pen to promote Utah’s resources and business. See *Salt Lake Herald*, February 1, 1910, 4, and 12, UDN; *Ogden Standard Examiner*, September 24, 1923, 6, UDN; *Intermountain Catholic*, February 5, 1910, 4, UDN; *Salt Lake Herald*, July 2, 1901, 8, UDN; *Deseret News*, August 3, 1901, 1, February 10, 1902, 8, January 31, 1905, 5, and February 1, 1910, 1, and 4, UDN.

St. George if the line were extended that far south.⁷⁹ After examining the economic resources of St. George and Silver Reef, Ingleheart was transferred in “Thomas Judd’s rig” to a spot west of the foot of the Hurricane Ledge where he got into a “mountain wagon headed for Kanab and driven by Dan Seegmiller.” Ingleheart wrote that “looking at the road from the foot of the ledge, it seemed impossible for horses to climb it at all, much less pull a wagon and its load up that steep grade.” After scaling the cliff, Ingleheart attempted to describe “the magnificent view” he enjoyed looking back over the St. George Valley. “A man in a balloon,” he wrote, “could scarcely have a more extended sweep of country laid below him. As far as eye could reach stretched a panor[a]ma of valleys, plateaux [*sic*] and mountains, the ever-present craters with their masses of black accenting the green of the valleys and the gorgeous reds of the cliffs along the river.” Canaan Ranch was the travelers’ destination that night, “but the roads were sandy,” and “the teams weary with the hard pulling,” so they camped in the desert. The enchanted newspaperman wrote that

Uncle Dan had come prepared for such an emergency. His “chuck-box” under the seat had a store of provisions and the inevitable water keg was filled for a dry camp, so a stop was made about 9 o’clock in the grease-wood. Supper by a camp-fire and blankets spread on the plain completed the programme. Two of the campers had their first experience with this sort of Arab life, but the guide took to it like a duck to water. When a few stray thunder showers drifted that way, Uncle Dan pulled the canvas wagon-cover over his head and calmly snored defiance at the thunder. When the storms rolled by and the

⁷⁹ *Salt Lake Tribune*, May 30, 1896, 1, UDN.

wagon-cover got too warm for comfort, he emerged from the canvas far enough to catch a whiff of the cool desert breeze, and slept on.

Pipe Springs and the country at the foot of the Vermillion Cliffs captured his imagination “chiefly because of the wildness of the country and the occasional glimpses one catches of cowboy life on the Canaan and Pipe ranges.” “Pipe Springs itself,” he wrote

is an oasis in the desert, where an old fort reminds one that it has not been long since defense against the raids of the Navajo Indians was one of the diversions of ranch life there. Not far from the fort we were shown where the Indians killed Witmer [*sic*] and McIntire, a tragedy that had its sequel in the death of fifteen or sixteen of the redskins who were captured with the booty of the victims still in their possession. The sole occupant of the ranch-house was young T.W. Jones of Cedar City,⁸⁰ who was monarch of about as cheerless a domain as one could find outside of Siberia. It was a welcome haven, though, for the wind had swept up a sand-storm that literally made it impossible for one to see objects more than twenty feet distant.

Because of its stunningly beautiful location, Ingleheart was convinced that once Kanab’s water problems were conquered there would be “no more desirable spot in Utah so far as climate and surroundings are concerned.” The insightful reporter discussed the region’s greatest political concern post-polygamy and after statehood. He reported that

⁸⁰ Thomas Willard Jones, who would have been seventeen-years-old at the time Ingleheart describes, was the oldest son of Lehi W. Jones and Henriette Lunt. He had the lonely duty of watching over Winsor Castle so cowboys, drummers, and other travelers did not further harm the deteriorating buildings. His mother had served John Wesley Powell as a telegraph operator. York and Evelyn Jones, *Lehi Willard Jones*, especially 53 and 181.

The Kanab people are largely interested in the cattle and sheep that cover the range in Arizona just south of them and are very anxious to have the northern part of Coconino county annexed to Utah. As it is now, they pay taxes in Arizona for which they receive no return of any kind. In a strip of country nearly one hundred miles wide and twice as long there is no officer of the peace and none is available except at Flagstaff, which can be reached only by a journey of nearly two hundred miles by team through a most uninviting country. It needs only a visit to the region to convince anybody that the Coconino strip should be made a part of Utah in name as it is already in fact.⁸¹

Not long after Ingleheart passed through Winsor Castle as he crossed the Pipe Springs corridor in 1896, a rather unique entourage followed the same route. This one consisted of a number of women leaders of the Mormon Primary Association, an organization for children, who were “holding conferences” in the various southern stakes. On June 18 they took dinner at Canaan Ranch, which along with Pipe, was one of the two most important way stations on the Hurricane Plateau on the road running between St. George and Kanab. The Sisters were accompanied by a male driver and escort from Kanab named Lorin Little. One of the sisters calling herself “Lula,” published an account of their trip in *The Juvenile Instructor*, a church magazine for youth. “Our first resting place was at Canaan’s ranch,” she wrote, and in the afternoon “we went on to Pipe Springs, another ranch, where we remained over night, feeling more like real missionaries, and farther away from home than ever when we learned that we were in Mojave County, Arizona.” Lula wrote that she found Pipe Springs to be a “romantic

⁸¹ *Salt Lake Tribune*, June 23, 1896, 9, UDN.

place.” Expressing the general attitudes of her people and time, she wrote that Pipe “had a very interesting history, in portions of which Indians figure prominently in a blood-thirsty and murderous manner,” reassuring her young readers that since these events the Indians “had been taught the more peaceful, better ways they are [now] learning.” “Later on,” she continued, “Pipe Springs became a note-worthy place in incidents connected with our own Church history.” Lula captured the desolate nature of the range and the drought that had caused both Canaan and Pipe to be sold, by giving these details: “A long and severe drouth [*sic*] has so dried up the country through that region that when we were there in June, all the cattle that had not starved on the range, had been driven away to find feed in other places. For this reason the ranch was almost deserted.” As they arrived in the heat of the summer, “Brother Little, being well acquainted with the place, told us that the balcony would be the best place for us to sleep.” Before they slept, “our attention was attracted to a flock of swallows, as we thought, which flitted about over us in a fearless and friendly manner. We wondered at their flying about so late, and why they did not fold their wings and go to rest.” They slept peacefully but when they awoke, they “found, to our surprise and disgust, that our little winged associates of the night were bats! We felt, that like many disagreeable things in life, this fact had been mercifully withheld from us until ‘the night of danger’ was past; or we might not have slept so well.”⁸²

⁸² *Juvenile Instructor* 31 (September 16, 1896): 566–568.

Chapter 15

The Moncurs, Alex Findlay, and Heaton's Partnership with God

"High Born Ladies of Pipe Springs":

Louise Moncur, Maggie Cox, and Their Men

The family members of "Rawhide and Baling Wire" preferred living at Cedar City rather than at distant Pipe Springs, and at some point Bulloch and Jones hired Heber Moncur and his wife Louise to move into Winsor Castle and care for the place and its cattle on a semi-permanent basis.¹ In addition to "caring for the traveling public" and protecting the buildings from carelessness and vandalism, the Moncurs were "to work for Bullock and Jones of Cedar City caring for their cattle on [the] range [at] Pipe Valley." This included the important work of maintaining the spring itself, which occasionally had to be cleaned out and "fixed," maintaining Pipe's extensive water troughs, and extricating the livestock that got stuck in them or mired in the mud holes that developed around them.² In August 1946, a half century after their time at the fort, the Moncurs visited Pipe Springs National Monument and told caretaker C. Leonard Heaton that they lived at the fort from 1895 to 1897 and that Heber had served as "the foreman for Bullocks & Jones cattle company" for "about 2 years." The Moncurs remembered that "when the

¹ Lehi Jones' son York wrote that during the time Bulloch and Jones owned the Pipe Springs Rancho "no one seemed to want to go out to the Arizona Strip and live—being so far away from a community, the travel back and forth was difficult and time consuming." York and Evelyn Jones, *Lehi Willard Jones*, 119.

² Mr & Mrs Heber Moncur of Burley Idaho, statement, August 19, 1946, in "Handwritten Field Notes of C. Leonard Heaton, 1941," in "Pipe Spring National Monument Field Notes 1941, PISP 1610," PISP Transcriptions, PSLA; and Margaret Cox Heaton, "Maggie Cox's Journal [*sic*], Orderville. 1900," especially January 1, January 31, 1900, in "Heaton Family History DVD" (hereafter Margaret Heaton, "Journal").

drouth [*sic*] hit their country in 1896 most all the cattle [were] gathered & sold & just after the cattle were ship[p]ed there were a lot of good rain[s] & how the grass did grow[!]" Heber remembered rounding up "great hurds [*sic*] of wild horses" to preserve the precious range grasses. The cowboys took what few ponies they wanted and massacred the rest.

The Moncurs told Heaton that "when they were living here there was a stockaid fence" built of cedar posts which surrounded Winsor Castle to keep Cattle off the premises and that there was a "big gate at the west and east end of the enclouser [*sic*]." They reported that the "big [batten] gates between the buildings" and the rock ramparts that once stood above them were long gone by the time they came, confirming Flora Woolley's testimony that she had taken them down a decade earlier. Heber and Louise remembered there being "a trap door in the floor of the up[p]er building, west room, ground floor, and in the Southwest corner, under the window, which could be raised to get water but they never used it while they lived there." They told him the "old cook stove" that still exists in the upper building's kitchen was the very one "Mrs. Moncur used while living there." They "claimed to have finished the ponds in front of the fort" and that they traded some wine to Jonathan Heaton "for a barrel full of carp" out of his fishpond in Moccasin and transferred them to Pipe. They reported that during their time at Winsor Castle, "there was a nice young orchard south of the ponds and a garden plot" and that "the only shade trees then were up near the fort." They also told Leonard Heaton that Pipe's massive troughs were then located "just west of the ponds."³

If the Moncurs actually left Pipe in 1897, they were back again for about four months during the winter of 1899–1900. Early in January 1900, the Moncurs hired an eighteen-year-old

³ Mr & Mrs Heber Moncur of Burley Idaho, statement, August 19, 1946. Leonard Heaton doubted the Moncurs' claim relative to finishing the ponds and stocking them with carp because the Woolleys had made that claim before them.

woman from Orderville named Margaret (Maggie) Cox to join them at Winsor Castle as a cook and chore girl.⁴ Only twenty-two years of age herself, in 1900 Louise Moncur was in delicate health. Married at sixteen, she had already lost at least two babies and was now weak, childless, and emotionally fragile. Louise was under a doctor's care and it seems Maggie was hired to help her because she could not single-handedly perform the large amount of housework and cooking required to maintain Winsor Castle as a lodge and eating establishment for cowboys, shepherders, and travelers on the Pipe Springs corridor which was then sometimes called "the Utah Road." In an oral interview conducted in 1974, when Maggie was ninety-three, she said that Heber Moncur did not want Louise "to go out there alone. So they got me and I was hired to do the work. I was cook and bed maker. . . . [I] took the travel and cared for people, fed them and gave them beds." She was paid two dollars a week and explained that her primary job entailed "taking care of the travel," as the old fort was "like a hotel." "We welcomed lots of strangers and made pies and cakes and bread for them," as well as "mush and eggs" and fresh beef. Maggie explained that "the travellers always had to stop and feed their horses and camp overnight because they couldn't get to another place."⁵ In another oral interview conducted in 1973, Maggie explained that

Of course there had to be someone there then for all the watering for all the cattle, you know, watered at Pipe and it was everybody's cattle in the country. It was open range for

⁴ Maggie's journal makes it clear she was at Pipe during the winter, from January 3 to March 5, 1900. See Margaret Heaton, "Journal," January 3–March 5, 1900. But in various oral interviews conducted when she was in her nineties Maggie remembered having been there during the summers of 1898 and 1899 as well. She remembered gardening and other summer activities inconsistent with the cold months her journal covers. Perhaps she spent more than one stint working for the Moncurs at Pipe Springs. See Margaret (Maggie) Heaton, interview by Richard Wilt, Moccasin, AZ, August 27, 1974, 1, 6–7, and 9, Oral History Collection, PSLA.

⁵ Margaret Heaton, interview by Richard Wilt, August 27, 1974, 1–2.

everybody and they worked it and someone had to be there [to] watch the cattle, o[f] course, in the watering because [cattle] would get stuck in the mud and I'd have to go help pull them out. And then we kept the travel that went by too. . . . I was there as a hired girl and helped keep the place, and do wha[t]ever was need to be done, and milked the cow, and tend the chickens, and ride the horses around. And then I'd have to go see to the cows. I was out in the desert so I had all that to help do. Then we had a garden there too, you know, and there's some of the old fruit trees still left there, I understand.⁶

Maggie wrote that she was familiar with the area before she ever arrived at Pipe Springs because her father and one of his plural wives had “undergrounded” in nearby Moccasin during the Raid.⁷ She took the job at Pipe to be closer to her suitor, Charles Heaton, a member of the Orderville Heaton family who had obtained possession of Moccasin Ranch when the Order disbanded in 1885.⁸ By accepting the post at Pipe, Maggie hoped to further develop her relationship with Charles who had been her sweetheart since childhood.⁹ She came to the Springs in January 1900 and married Charles Heaton on November 28, 1900. After her marriage, Maggie spent the rest of her life living in Moccasin, and nearby Pipe Springs figured prominently in her long life. In 1907 her husband's family purchased the Pipe Springs Ranch.¹⁰ As the oldest of Jonathan Heaton's sons, Maggie's husband Charles became the treasurer and

⁶ Margaret (Maggie) Heaton, interview by Park Historian Richard Wilt, Mrs. Heaton's residence, Moccasin, AZ, July 23, 1973, 1, PSLA, VF, Fam Hist/Heaton.

⁷ Margaret Heaton, “Journal,” January 9, 1900.

⁸ Margaret Heaton, “Journal,” January 1, 1900; and Margaret Heaton, interview, July 23, 1973, 23-13.

⁹ Maggie wrote that even though she was currently being pursued by others, including a Brother Cutler who wanted to take her as a plural wife, she “had always loved [Charles Heaton] above all others.” Maggie's mother encouraged her because “she knew Charl [*sic*] had it in mind for me to be his wife, . . . [and] time proved she was right.” Margaret Heaton, “Journal,” January 1, 1890.

¹⁰ *Inter-Mountain Republican* (Salt Lake City), July 1, 1907, 3, UDN.

financial manager of the Pipe Springs Land and Cattle Company and between 1907 and 1923 he managed Pipe Springs.¹¹ Their oldest son, Charles Leonard Heaton, became the first caretaker of Pipe Springs National Monument and actually lived at the Monument. Leonard was superintendent of the monument for the first thirty years of its existence.¹² Inheriting a special love for Winsor Castle from both of his parents, Leonard Heaton painstakingly gathered a huge amount of Pipe Springs history for which we are greatly indebted.

The diary of Maggie's nine-week stay at Winsor Castle from January 3 to March 4, 1900, is the most complete record of everyday life at pre-monument Pipe Springs that has yet been discovered. It is particularly significant for the light and vivacious color it sheds on domestic life at the Pipe Springs hostel and the buzzing little hub of outpost Mormon society that existed there near the turn of the twentieth century.¹³ Just before Maggie arrived at Pipe, she spent five months working as a chore girl on Dan and Emma Seegmiller's ranch at Upper Kanab and had been employed there when Dan Seegmiller was murdered by a disgruntled neighbor, upset over longstanding disputes over water rights, bulldogs, and horse racing.¹⁴ Maggie wrote in

¹¹ *Salt Lake Herald*, May 1, 1907, 5, NPC; and Flora Woolley, "History of the Pipe Springs Monument," 2, WSC, b3, f9.

¹² Margaret Cox Heaton, Moccasin, AZ, interview by Kay S. Fowler, July 14, 1987, Doris Duke American Indian History Project, item 102, 25, UUSC.

¹³ Unless otherwise noted, all references in this section are from Margaret Heaton, "Journal," January 1 to March 5, 1900.

¹⁴ Maggie wrote that while she was working for the Seegmillers, "Will Roundy a neighbor. . . shot Bro Seegmiller & then him self." Margaret Heaton, "Journal," January 1, 1900. Seegmiller and William H. Roundy lived about a mile from each other in Upper Kanab. Contemporary newspapers reported that the tragedy was the result of "an old feud and recent trouble over a water right." Dee Woolley's son Royal said "the trouble" between Seegmiller and Roundy started over "bull dogs" and "race horses." When the Seegmillers lived at the Upper Kanab Ranch they had to cross Roundy's property to go to the local sawmill, which doubled as a post office and Latter-day Saint meeting house. Roundy's dogs "invariably" attacked the Seegmillers' dogs when they followed their owners passing through to attend church or to get their mail. On a trip to get the mail, one of Dan's bulldogs killed a dog owned by Roundy on the latter's property. Roundy and Seegmiller were competitive owners of expensive racehorses, and the fact that Seegmiller's prized thoroughbred stallion "German Boy" could not outrun Roundy's "Jimmy Burns" added to their strife as Roundy gloated in his success. Royal Woolley reported that there was "only one thing more sure. . . for making trouble" than barking dogs and horse racing, and that was "irrigating water." According to him, those "three elements caused the feud."

her journal that Charles Heaton drove her from Orderville to Mt. Carmel in the middle of the night after a New Years Ball on January 1, 1900, after bidding her “mama, brothers & sisters good bye.” Early the next morning she joined the Moncurs on a long wagon ride to Pipe Springs. The Moncurs brought a gramophone which the trio listened to as they camped en route. Arriving on January 3, Maggie and Louise immediately went to work “getting settled” at the ranch. That evening they cooked a meal for Heber and five other men, presumably cowboys, shepherders, hired hands or travelers. Maggie described that after supper all eight inmates of the hostel adjourned to the parlor where they listened to the Moncurs’ gramophone until 1:30 a.m.¹⁵ Late nights were the norm. Winsor Castle’s parlor was mentioned often in Maggie’s journal, as she recounted the card games, evenings of dancing and singing, and the discussions of Mormon theology that occurred there as she and the Moncurs entertained the herdsman and the traveling public. Maggie sometimes used the telephone to transmit music from the Moncurs’ gramophone to cowboys listening in at Canaan Ranch.¹⁶ Maggie wrote that she and the Moncurs occupied the north building and slept upstairs. Maggie’s room contained the telephone, which sometimes

According to newspaper accounts, Seegmiller had allowed Roundy to build a reservoir on land he owned. As per verbal agreement Roundy was only to use the water at certain times and for specific purposes, but after a dispute over a horserace scheduled between their sons, the two men remembered the agreement differently. Since he felt Roundy did not comply with the agreement, Seegmiller repeatedly breached the reservoir. Roundy would simply build it back up. At last Roundy threatened Seegmiller that if he broke it again he would kill him. An ecclesiastical element heightened Roundy’s feelings against Seegmiller, for the latter was in the stake presidency and was supposed to be an example of Mormon sharing. From Seegmiller’s point of view, Roundy was a questionable Latter-day Saint, for a true Mormon would submit to the will of his priesthood leader. Seegmiller broke the dam once too often, and on the Sabbath morning of July 23, 1899, Roundy knocked on Seegmiller’s door, coaxed him into his dooryard and “shot him three times in the back” with “a 44 caliber Colts revolver,” then shot himself. See Presidents Edwin D. Woolley Jr. and Thomas Chamberlain, Kanab, Kane Co., UT, to Apostle Francis M. Lyman, Salt Lake City, July 29, 1899, Dilworth Woolley Collection, SUUU, b6, f4; “Roy’s Story of the Killing of Uncle Dan,” in WSC, b4, f1; Robert Seegmiller, *Legacy of Eternal Worth*, 50–56; *Salt Lake Tribune*, July 25, 1899, 1, and July 26, 1899, 1, UDN; *Coconino Sun*, September 9, 1899, 10, CALOC; *Deseret News*, August 30, 1899, 5, DNHA; and Velma Heaton Stewart, *Daniel Hoyt Heaton and Lydia Eva Wilson Heaton; Their Life Story* (Bountiful, UT: Family History Publishers, 1991), 43. Dan Seegmiller’s wife Emma, who was at home the day her husband was murdered, also wrote an account of her husband’s death. See Robert Seegmiller, *Legacy of Eternal Worth*, 50–56; 52–56.

¹⁵ Margaret Heaton, “Journal,” January 3, 1900.

¹⁶ Margaret Heaton, “Journal,” especially February 21, 1900.

disturbed her sleep. Ezra Stevens, a young buckaroo who worked at Canaan Ranch, sometimes telephoned in the evenings to sweet talk Maggie. Several other cowboys from cattle camps closer to Pipe also pursued her. The Moncurs soon found themselves acting as chaperones and in the awkward position of being asked by Maggie for permission “to go out” with various cowboys after dark.¹⁷

A large part of the crowd that assembled in Winsor Castle’s parlor and dining room, were cowboys and shearers from nearby winter camps who came to momentarily enjoy a roof, “a bright warm fire,” a good meal, a bath, and some female companionship. Churchmen, drummers, and folks traveling to and from the St. George Temple over the “Honeymoon Trail” also passed through. In the nine weeks Maggie was at Pipe Springs, she listed the names of scores of individuals who stopped. A number of these visitors were women traveling with their fathers, brothers, or husbands. Maggie’s first few entries after arriving at Pipe are representative of her experience there. On January 6, she wrote that she “got dinner for a traveling man,” and had a “pleasant talk” with “Charl Robertson who had just come from [the] herd . . . Then came Bell & Lucy McDonald, Dr. Lions, Mr. Roundy and Isabell. Did night chores & spent a pleasant evening with the crowd[,] Graphone, & talk. Have not felt the least lonesome or homesick.”¹⁸ But sometimes the place was quiet. On January 7, a Sunday, Maggie found herself “alone in the great big house,” but later she took “a nice ramble” on the hillside with the Moncurs. In the evening, herdsman Charles Robertson came again and spent the evening in chatting and listening to the gramophone while Maggie knitted. On January 8, she wrote: “Saw & talked with Fred Carroll who had his sheep here to water.” On the 9th, Charles Robertson asked her out to ride

¹⁷ Margaret Heaton, “Journal.”

¹⁸ Margaret Heaton, “Journal,” January 6, 1900.

with him on the range, and for propriety she asked “permission from Bro. & Sister Moncure.” But Maggie’s heart was already given to Charles Heaton. With the ramparts of the fort looking over the downward-sloping range for miles and miles, she could sit on the porch on the second floor and watch Charles Heaton and a host of other herders throughout the day. In her free time she sometimes secretly spied on her Moccasin cowboy whom she lovingly called “He” and “Him” in her diary. Otherwise, there were floors to sweep and mop, sheets to wash and hang, meals to fix, and tremendous numbers of pies to bake, which seemed to have been standard fare at Rawhide and Baling Wire’s makeshift desert hotel and restaurant.

Maggie records doing a great deal of housework but she also wrote about activities she engaged in outside of work, including quilting, sewing, making yarn, and completing her trousseau. She made drawers, dresses, capes, aprons, and stockings. She also darned socks and mended shirts for passing salesmen. She recorded taking nice rambles on the hill behind the castle or on the range, both alone, with the Moncurs, and more often, with “Him” in the light of the moon. She frequently took long walks enjoying nature and found joy in simple things like cane blossoms, “pretty rocks of different kinds,” and gathering “horns from dead cattle” which she used “to make pretty things such as pin cussions.”¹⁹ Following the guidelines of the Young Women’s Mutual Improvement Association, she spent much time reading the Bible and on her “Mutual lessons,” especially on Sundays. Maggie was preparing for marriage and a useful life of service to her church. Like a good Mormon, she fasted and prayed and berated herself in her record when she missed a prayer, scripture study, or neglected to fast. She made special efforts to attend Sunday meetings in Moccasin along with the Moncurs, but made clear that part of her motivation in attending the services in Moccasin was that Charles would be in attendance, since

¹⁹ Margaret Heaton, “Journal,” January 21, 1900.

the meetings were held in his parents' home. It irked the Moncurs, who often provided Maggie's transportation to the meetings, that she dallied to spend time with Charles, making them wait. One Sunday they angrily left her to find her own way home and even locked the fort so she had to holler at the door in the darkness "like a drummer," asking "if they would keep a tramp."²⁰

On one occasion she wrote of eating breakfast with Kaibab women hired to do the washing. The Kaibabit women also helped her wind yarn and provided pine nuts and jerky for her enjoyment. Four years older than Maggie, Louise took the younger girl under her wing, and Maggie wrote of several quiet conversations with her where she "learned many things about women that was new to me."²¹ The cowboys and the travelers kept them both busy, though, and her diary is full of notes like "got dinner for a man traveler," "made pies," "some one came from Can[aa]n," "Knit till 9 [and] got supper for a drummer," etc. Sometimes gentiles passed through; once she described "A dark prospector with 5 Buerro[s]," passing Pipe at "about noon." A surprising number of travelers actually overnighted at Pipe, sometimes so many that Maggie had to give up her own bed and slept on the floor. When Heber was away with his work, Maggie and Louise slept together: "She & I went up to bed, as I jumped in the slats fell out, [but we] couldn't fix them for laughing." Despite occasional frictions between the hostesses of Pipe Springs, the two women were very close. After one particularly disagreeable morning, the two reconciled by domesticity: Louise "made a pudding" while Maggie "made a cake, combed her hair & she combed mine." In times of shared sweetness, Maggie often referred to Louise in her diary as "Weasy."²²

²⁰ Margaret Heaton, "Journal," January 20, 1900.

²¹ Margaret Heaton, "Journal," January 17, 1900.

²² Margaret Heaton, "Journal," January 27, 1900.

Maggie also killed and dressed chickens, “greased harnesses,” and even helped Heber brand cattle. Sometimes she helped him extricate mired livestock from the mud near the troughs. On one occasion she drove 24 head of cattle to Moccasin. On another, when a hired hand inexplicably disappeared, she proudly wrote that dressed in her “bloomer suit” she “got stradle of the horse in bloomers & went & rounded up some [thirsty] cattle & horses [and drove them] to watter.”²³ When she returned she went directly back to the kitchen and “parched corn & made molasses candy,” after which she read two chapters in her Bible, listened to the gramophone and then went to bed. One Saturday in February, she wrote “Work done, up stairs listened to Graph —Enjoyed it more than ever & am very happy, the reason I guess is because I think ‘*he*’ will be here tomorrow.” Despite the workload, her relationship with “Hebe” and “Weasy” usually brought her joy.

A doctor from St. George called on “Weasy” and felt that she was working too hard for her own good. A dejected Maggie wrote that Louise’s physician gave her coworker medicine and ordered her not “to wash[,] sweep[,] make beds, or sew on the machine, which will leave all for me to do.” Naturally, the same day “about sundown 2 drummers came” and then “a man & 3 women.” Now totally on her own, Maggie fixed supper and beds for all of them. Up at 4:30 the next morning, she fixed the visitors’ breakfast and packed a lunch for them and saw them off at daylight. She did the dishes and “straightened [the] front room,” but was so worn out that she lay down for a “catnap” at 10:30 a.m.. and slept until 3 p.m. While she was asleep one of Maggie’s many cowboy suitors called at Winsor Castle and asked Louise “where that lady friend of hers was.” She told the caller that Maggie was asleep, saying: “She still sits up with that Heaton nights & sleeps days.” Louise later teased Maggie that she had told the visitor that “that Heaton

²³ Margaret Heaton, “Journal,” February 25, February 28, March 1–2, 1900.

is quite a young looking [fellow, only] around 20” and that “he’d better wait till he’s 25 before he undertakes [to marry Maggie, as] that girl. . . could pick him up & mall the ground with him.” Even though the teasing was meant in good fun, Maggie complained that “that is the way I catch it all the time.”²⁴

But strong-minded Maggie could give as good as she got. One Sabbath day she wrote the following description of the three-way teasing that went on between herself, Weasy and Hebe:

I went to bed full of nonsense, & got up that way first it was she & I, then he & I, then all 3 of us, then she & him, t[i]ll he got pretty hot, then we sulked & wouldnt speak. We certainly [*sic*] had a little of the Devel [*sic*] in us, for I first tip[p]ed the dripper of bisquits up side down, then knocked the toothpick dish down, drop[p]ed the meat, spilt water, & at the table put one glass in the other, gave it a [k]nock & broke one, not long before brock [*sic*] another & so on all day, till I really felt ashamed & more so because it was on the Sabath.²⁵

One time when Heber was bored he tied a can of rocks to the tail of a house cat he had named “Miss Clayton.” The cat wildly raced around the old fort filling the place with hilarity and providing the threesome with “lots of fun.”²⁶ On another occasion, Louise overheard two drummers wondering aloud if Heber Moncur was a polygamist as he lived with “these 2 young women.” Weasy decided to have some fun at the drummers’ expense. When they came in for supper they asked which of their hostesses was “Mrs. Moncur.” Louise pointed to Maggie and

²⁴ Margaret Heaton, “Journal,” February 12–13, 1900.

²⁵ Margaret Heaton, “Journal,” February 11, 1900.

²⁶ Margaret Heaton, “Journal,” February 12, 1900.

said “that is Mrs Moncur ove[r] there,” at which Maggie “whirled around and said, ‘I am not[!] . . . [S]he is,’ and the rest of the evening was spen[t] in den[y]ing just who was Mrs Moncur.”²⁷ For several days near the end of February, one of the owners, in this case “Baling Wire” Jones himself, appeared at Pipe to check on things and stayed for a few days, which apparently put a temporary stop to their high-jinx.

Once she complained when the wind blew so bad she “couldn’t see 1/2 mile for dust.” On another occasion she described a winter trip to the store in Kanab in a wagon she and the Moncurs borrowed from the Heaton’s. They heated up rocks to put in their quilts to help keep their feet warm. It was so cold that they had to stop along the way to build a fire to warm up and reheat their rocks. At Wolf Springs they were surprised to meet “an Indian carr[y]ing his saddle hunting his horse” in the cold and lonely desert. A glimpse into the grim realities of Native American life in the Moccasin-Kanab region, this horseless saddle-bearer told the whites that “William Indian was very sick,” and that he was “sad” because “Sampson’s squaw had just died.” They found most of the Kaibabites encamped west of Kanab and on their return trip from Kanab they kindly gave three cold women a ride back to their camp.

By March 4, Maggie’s time at Pipe was over. That day she wrote: “Left Old Pipe[,] a happy leaving at 10:30.” She and the Moncurs carried on their usual antics “singing & talking” as their wagon headed toward their Long Valley homes. Maggie got off the wagon and hiked for a while, and “then came limping up to the wagon” pretending to be “a stranger from Africa hunting a lost camel.” Then she came again impersonating “a high born lady from Pipe Springs Arizona.” At a spot along the road they cleaned themselves up to make themselves presentable to

²⁷ Mr. & Mrs. Heber Moncur of Burley, Idaho, statement, August 19, 1946, in “Handwritten Field Notes of C. Leonard Heaton, 1941,” PISP Transcriptions, PSLA.

their families. “Weasy” put on one of Maggie’s dresses and Heber made the remark. “Well[,] we[‘]ve been at Pipe 4 mo[nths] & come home having to wear Maggies things, Poor w[a]ges to be sure.” Despite all the fun, Maggie arrived in Orderville on March 5, “Glad to be home.”²⁸

A.D. Findlay Purchases Pipe Springs: the War on Sheep and Mustangs

According to Lehi W. Jones’ son York, “Rawhide and Bailing Wire” and their Salt Lake partners Aquilla Nebeker and Joseph Heywood put together “the largest cattle company this section has ever known. Their headquarters were [at] the old Pipe Spring,” but the cattle spread out over a huge distance, for as York put it, “as the saying goes, their cattle ‘ran on a thousand hills.’” When asked how many cattle the Pipe Springs Cattle Company ran on the Arizona Strip, Lehi’s response was “we never did know for sure the exact number.” York explained that “it was such a vast range that it was impossible to make a complete round-up and [determine] an exact count.” Like Anson Winsor, Charles Pulsipher, and Woolley and Seegmiller before them, the PSCC partners found that their cattle drifted over the entire Hurricane Plateau and that they must cooperate with other cattlemen to round them up. York and Evelyn Jones remembered that Pipe was still the round-up center for a large chunk of the Arizona Strip and “was the meeting place for many cowboys and horses when it was round-up time. Lehi’s boys recalled being there during these round-ups and sitting around the fire in the evening swapping stories. Sometimes there were 100 cowboys, and their horses numbered over 300.”²⁹

²⁸ Margaret Heaton, “Journal,” March 4–5, 1900.

²⁹ York and Evelyn Jones, *Lehi Willard Jones*, 119–120, 240.

According to York and Evelyn Jones, it was “one of the worst droughts this country has ever known” that “forced” Bulloch and Jones to sell out completely and beat a hasty retreat back to Cedar City. The drought “wiped out their complete herd, with the exception of the steers,” which “they were forced to sell, together with the ranches, to take care of their obligations.”³⁰ On January 19, 1901 the Board of Directors of the PSCC met in Salt Lake City to consider an offer from Kanab cattleman Alexander Duncan Findlay, Sr., to buy them out. All four owners of the PSCC were present (Dave Bulloch, Lehi Jones, Aquilla Nebeker and Joseph Heywood). The Pipe Springs Ranch was still mortgaged to the Deseret National Bank of Salt Lake City for \$19,000. Nebeker and Heywood had many business interests and felt that their substantial debt with the Deseret National Bank tarnished their credit and they “just about forced a settlement with Bulloch and Jones,” though the minutes of the company’s meeting wherein they decided to sell show that Lehi Jones brought up the actual resolution. The property under consideration included the Pipe Springs Ranch, the adjacent Bull Rush Ranch, some grazing country on Cedar Mountain, and approximately 1200 head of cattle scattered on the Pipe Springs range carrying the brands “known as the frying pan and quarter circle two.” The Pipe Springs Ranch was to be sold for \$4,000, and included the “stove and furniture now used in said Pipe Springs Ranch House.” Pipe’s adult cattle were to go for \$22.50 each with the calves thrown in. Since it was unknown how many cattle the company owned, the total purchase price was determined by the number of “frying pan and quarter circle two” head gathered up at the annual roundups. As rounding up a herd spread over such distances took time, it was nearly two years before the paperwork finalizing the sale was signed.

³⁰ York and Evelyn Jones, *Lehi Willard Jones*, 240.

Over the years, several important water holes, seeps, reservoirs, and even a small stone ranch house had been developed in the Bull Rush Wash just south of Pipe Springs, which now constituted an independent ranch also owned by the PSCC. Like much of the private property on the Arizona Strip, its patent was questionable and was apparently to be thrown in with the price of the PSCC cattle. Findlay was to take possession of both ranches upon signing a contract. He offered to pay a downpayment of \$10,000 in cash, with another payment of \$10,000 in cash due upon receipt of the cattle. Any amount over \$20,000 cash (based on the tally count of the cattle) would be paid by Findlay in the form of up to 3,000 head of sheep from one of his herds. At their January 19 meeting, the PSCC directors voted to accept Findlay's offer. As stipulated in the contract, Findlay took immediate possession of the Pipe Springs and Bullrush Ranches.³¹ Findlay reportedly paid his \$20,000 in gold. In addition to the gold, the PSCC partners eventually received "about 1,800 head of sheep that had been run in the Kanab area." The exact number of cattle Findlay took possession of between 1901 and 1902 is not known, though York and Evelyn Jones wrote that "there were 1600 calves born" the spring the deal was made.³² Bulloch and Lehi Jones and their wives formalized their sale of Pipe Springs Ranch for \$4,000 to A.D. Findlay by deeding "the tract of land known as the Pipe Springs Survey" to the Kanab cattleman on October 8, 1901. On August 15, 1901, the *Salt Lake Herald* reported that "Alexander Findlay of Kanab has purchased a big tract of grazing country in the Pipe Spring valley from Aquilia Nebeker and others and has put in about 2,000 head of cattle."³³ The paper reported that conditions were

³¹ See Minutes of the Meeting of the Board of Directors of the Pipe Springs Cattle Company, Salt Lake City, January 19, 1901; Contract "made and entered into this 23rd day of January, 1901, by and between the Pipe Springs Cattle Company, a corporation, of Utah, . . . and A. D. Findlay, of Kanab, Kane County, Utah," and related documentation, all in PSLA, PISP 1643.

³² York and Evelyn Jones, *Lehi Willard Jones*, 120. York and Evelyn Jones explained that "after the completion of the sale of Pipe Spring, the cattle that were still on the range went with the property."

³³ Deed, David and Alice B. Bulloch, and Lehi W. and Henrietta L. Jones, conveying Pipe Springs to A. D. Findlay, October 8, 1901, PSLA, PISP 1782; and Deed, David and Alice B. Bulloch, and Lehi W. and Henrietta L. Jones,

auspicious for Findlay for two reasons. First, there had been “considerable rain there this summer and winter grass is growing splendidly.” Second, sheep were “no longer being profitably run in that country,” so the paper projected Findlay would have both “excellent summer and winter ranges.”³⁴ The last deed related to the PSCC sale to A.D. Findlay was apparently recorded on December 201902.³⁵

Called Alec by his friends, but usually A.D. Findlay in newspapers and legal documents, Alexander Duncan Findlay, Sr., owned Pipe Springs for about five years, selling it to Jonathan Heaton and Sons Company for a huge profit in 1906. Findlay was an up and coming cattleman who was already one of the wealthiest men in the region. Indeed, when he died in 1935 various obituaries stated that he had “amassed a fortune” in the livestock business and that “for years Mr. Findlay was considered the wealthiest man in Kane county and was much admired for his thrift and industry and his competent business abilit[y].” Despite his wealth he was a private man who left few records and his descendants and relatives are protective of his privacy. As a result we know relatively little about his tenure at Pipe Springs. He was born in Mill Creek, Salt Lake County, in 1853 and came with his missionary parents to Dixie in the early 1860s. Alec was reared in Santa Clara where he reportedly attended “the first school ever held in Utah’s Dixie.” Moving to Kanab “about 1880,” he married Sythia Experience Fuller in the St. George Temple.³⁶

Alec Findlay was a competent stockbreeder who paid great attention to developing the bloodlines of his cattle and horses. By 1886 his thoroughbreds rivaled those of Seegmiller on

conveying Pipe Springs to A. D. Findlay, November 3, 1902, PSLA, PISP 2126; and *Salt Lake Herald*, August 15, 1901, 5, UDN.

³⁴ *Salt Lake Herald*, August 15, 1901, 5, UDN.

³⁵ York and Evelyn Jones, *Lehi Willard Jones*, 120.

³⁶ A.D. Findlay obituary, *Kane County Standard*, May 24, 1935, 1, UDN; Daughters of Utah Pioneers Obituary Scrapbook, 278–279, Ancestry.com; and new.familysearch.org.

Kane County's racetracks, where Dan and Alec's horses were "the chief attractions."³⁷ He was keenly interested in reclaiming the worn-out Pipe Valley range and fought both mustangs and sheepherders with brutal tenacity. He knew that to thrive he had to make better use of every asset available to him, especially water. He sought to increase the amount of the water at Pipe Spring by examining and clearing all of its sources. He ran "a 100 ft pipe farther up on the hillside above the spring," hoping to find new outlets, but ultimately "with no success." He was, however, able to discover and "develop a small spring on the west of the old rock home" located on "the promontory" a few hundred yards west of Winsor Castle and located an earthen reservoir there the cowboys called "the Pipe Springs Tank" on the flats below it. To squeeze every possible ounce out of the main water supply at Pipe, he did away with most of Woolley's old "troughs and tanks" (and the many mudholes they produced) and built a single and more efficient large tank in their place.³⁸ Findlay was especially interested in establishing substantial waterholes far out on the range to give his cattle access to more grass. He developed seeps and springs and built expensive earthen reservoirs to capture the drainage of rain and snow melt. Most notable among them was a gigantic tank that still exists in some form at the head of Hack Canyon, some twenty miles south of Pipe Springs. Called "Findlay's Tank," Leonard Heaton first visited the place when he was ten years old and described that when full, Findlay's huge desert reservoir "covered an area over a mile across and about 12 or 15 feet deep at the dam." After expending a huge amount of effort and money in constructing the mammoth man-made lake, however, Findlay discovered that the flockmasters of some "eight or ten herds of sheep" watered their sheep at the reservoir he engineered and built and ravaged the distant rangelands.

³⁷ Adonis Robinson, *History of Kane County*, 243.

³⁸ WSC no number #3.

All over the Arizona Strip during the period, similar scenarios took place, enraging the cattlemen, who felt they had come into the country long before the sheep men. The frustrated cattlemen had claimed most of the best waterholes and developed them, only to have them expropriated by the flockmasters.³⁹

Findlay was particularly hostile to the sheepherders and believed that “choking” the sheepherders out by controlling water was key to rehabilitating the land. In 1902, Findlay sued William F. Hamblin in “a test suit between cattle and sheep men over springs on the desert.” Thirty-eight year old William was the nephew of both Jacob and Gunlock Hamblin and the son of Francis Marion Hamblin, who had worked for the Powell Survey. Representative of a second generation of Mormons struggling to make a living on the Kanab-Pipe Springs desert, William and his wife Celia had three children under seven years old they were struggling to support. Raising sheep was one of the few options open to them but since the Arizona Strip’s few waterholes and seeps were already claimed by cattlemen, William, like so many other herders, simply watered his sheep wherever he could. The year before Findlay’s “test suit” against Hamblin, the federal government had “made a forest reserve covering a big portion of the Buckskin mountains, and sheep [were] prohibited from grazing thereon” leaving Hamblin with few alternatives than to run his sheep on the Pipe Springs range. It seems Findlay’s suit to curtail Hamblin’s access to water, compounded by a downturn of the sheep market, proved too much for the poverty-stricken sheepherder, who died by suicide on June 6, 1902. Tragically, this left

³⁹ *Moccasin and Her People*, 2:86, 116; *Salt Lake Herald*, September 25, 1902, 5, and May 11, 1903, 3, UDN; and *Deseret News*, January 5, 1903, 7, UDN.

Celia and her three children without a provider and Findlay shifted his suit to them “as heirs of the defendant.”⁴⁰

Before Findlay disposed of his sheep in the purchase of Pipe Springs, he had either been elected or appointed Sheep Inspector for Mohave County, Arizona. In 1902 he used this position to refuse “a great many flockmasters the privilege of moving their sheep into [the] Mohave deserts for the winter.” As the owner of Pipe Springs Range, he held primary control over these deserts. The *Deseret News* described how “the action of Mr. Alex. Findlay” embroiled the “stock and sheepmen” in a serious feud. “The plaint of the sheepmen,” the newspaper reported,

is that Mr. Findlay, a stockman, is making use of a law established for the protection of the sheep industry, to work them injury. Mr. Findlay asserts he is only performing his bounden duty, as prescribed by law, while the sheepmen express themselves as convinced that his present rigor is the result of the efforts and influence of leading stockmen. Heretofore sheepmen have grazed over these deserts pretty much at will, as they afford the best winter range in this section, and it is rumored that threats of some sort of retaliation will be carried out unless compromises can be effected in the near future.

Findlay’s efforts to wrest the precious resources of the Pipe Range from the sheepherders provoked action and on January 5, 1903, the sheepherders of Kane County incorporated “the Kane County Sheepmen’s Union.” Its purpose was to protect sheepherders from the “attacks”

⁴⁰ See William F. Hamblin and Sina Cecilia Averett in new.familysearch.org. For the closure of the Buckskin Mountains for grazing in 1901, see *Salt Lake Herald*, August 15, 1901, 5, UDN. Newspapers reported that Hamblin’s “incessant drinking [was] thought to have been the cause” of his suicide. See *Davis County Clipper*, June 13, 1902, 2, UDN; *Kane County Standard*, September 15, 1939, 1, UDN; and *Salt Lake Herald*, September 25, 1902, 5, UDN.

Findlay and the cattlemen he represented were leveling against them. The sheepherders “filed articles of incorporation with \$25,000 capital stock, divided into 5,000 shares of the par value of \$5 per share.” These funds were designed to “develop and protect the sheep industry in Kane Co, [and to] secure necessary concessions, legislation, etc.,” from cattlemen. Jonathan Heaton was elected president of the new Sheepmen’s Union, and Dee Woolley’s counsellor in the stake presidency, Thomas Chamberlain, was elected vice president. Woolley sided with the cattlemen, which split not only sheepherders and the cattlemen, but families, ecclesiastical presidencies, and bishoprics, and polarized the entire Kane County community. It was a microcosm of what was happening all over Utah.⁴¹ Many Kane County and Arizona families of necessity trafficked in both cattle and sheep. When one market went bust, the other often boomed. Even cattlemen like Dee Woolley found that owning sheep kept them from going broke when cattle markets were down. The Heatons of Moccasin had successfully used the strategy of running both cattle and sheep.

In addition to sheep, Alec Findlay also had to contend with the more troublesome mustangs. Findlay loved “blooded” horses but the “scrubs” and mongrels of the desert destroyed the range his wealth depended on. Pipe Springs cowboys had waged war on the feral range horses at least since the 1870s but the very apex of “Man’s War against the Horse” on the Arizona Strip occurred during the five years Findlay owned Pipe Springs. Between 1901 and 1906, Findlay repeatedly sponsored huge range-wide roundups of the feral pests, which were hosted by him at his fort. At least one battle in the stockmen’s war of extermination against the desert horses attracted national attention and was reported in newspapers from coast to coast. Findlay and other stockmen had enlisted the Kiababit in their war against the mustangs, and the

⁴¹ *Deseret News*, January 5, 1903, 7, UDN.

October 19, 1901, issue of the *Intermountain Catholic* ran the line “Ranchmen and Indians began annual mustang hunt in northwestern Arizona and southwestern Utah, starting from Pipe Spring, Ariz.”⁴² On the very day Bulloch and Jones and their wives signed the deed conveying Pipe Springs to Alec Findlay (October 8, 1901) the *Salt Lake Herald* ran an article that was quickly picked up in papers around the nation with headlines like “Hunting Horses,” “War Declared On Mustangs,” and “Wild Horse Hunt.” The article announced that a “sport rivaling in excitement that of a buffalo hunt” was scheduled “to take place in Washington and Iron counties and across the Utah line in to Northern Arizona” beginning on October 10. The articles stated in simple terms that “the people of the Canaan district expect to set forth and exterminate as many desert horses as can be rounded up.” The *Salt Lake Herald* described that “desert horses, are so thick in the district lying between Hurricane Ridge and Kanab wash and over the old Canaan range to Mt. [Trumbull] that . . . The range is being eaten up, gentle horses are being run off and many valuable animals are being shot by mistake by careless sportsmen drawing a bead on supposed desert horses. So the populace has decided that the mustang must go.”⁴³

The article explained that the “Mustang Hunt” was centered at Pipe because “The best way to get them,” quoting Thomas Judd “is to wait until they have gone to the springs to drink. They drink so heavily they cannot run far without becoming exhausted and falling.” The strategy of involving large squads of cowboys and fresh horses, the article explained, was essential because it was “almost impossible to get near the wily animals. A crowd will start the drive.

⁴² *Intermountain Catholic*, October 19, 1901, 4, UDN.

⁴³ *Salt Lake Herald*, October 8, 1901, 8, CALOC. “Two years ago a similar decision was reached. During the progress of the hunt 300 were shot and left on the plain and 1,500 were run down and dispatched with the exception of 300 considered worth keeping.” For variations of the article as it appeared in the national press, see the *San Francisco Call*, October 9, 1901, 1; the *Earlington, Kentucky Bee*, October 10, 1901, 3; the *Iola [KS] Register*, October 11, 1901, 5, the *Prescott, Arizona Weekly Journal-Miner*, October 16, 1901, 2, the *New York Tribune*, October 20, 1901, 6, and the *San Angelo [TX] Press*, October 25, 1901, 6, all CALOC.

Relays of horses and men are in waiting, and one relay after another takes up the chase until the wild horses are exhausted. As fast as the boys get within reach they pick off all the good shots that present [themselves]. The desert horses are wellnight [*sic*] tireless, but finally they give out and are corraled. Those of any value are saved and the rest are shot.” Because “a thousand or more are killed off in a bunch” the “hides bring quite a revenue.”⁴⁴

The national press eagerly awaited the reports of Pipe Springs’ “wild horse hunt.” A Kanab special correspondent to the *Chicago Tribune* reported “Hundreds of wild horses stampeded in terror over hill and plains,” he wrote, “pursued by a band of mounted ranchmen, urging their mounts to the utmost, and now and then taking a shot at one of the fleeing animals.” “The mustang hunt was on,” he continued, explaining that “Ranchmen from all over northwestern Arizona and southwestern Utah, with some from Nevada, gathered at Pipe Spring, Ariz.” To provide readers with familiar context, he shared that “The animals are believed to have sprung from the horses owned by the victims of the Mountain Meadows massacre in 1857. When the party was attacked a large number of the horses escaped. For nearly half a century they have been breeding on the ranges of this region, mingling with the stray Indian ponies and escaped horses formerly belonging to cowmen, and multiplying at a prodigious rate.”⁴⁵ A writer for the *Coconino Sun* reported the mustang hunt differently. He reported that the Pipe Springs’ band consisted of about “300 horses” lead “by a magnificent bay stallion, which though often chased, has never been caught.” According to him, “the chase of the herd of 300 horses lasted several hours and covered many miles.” During the primary chase, “about seventy-five horses” were shot, and “the remainder were driven toward a deep canyon and over the edge. Forty were

⁴⁴ *Salt Lake Herald*, October 8, 1901, 8, CALOC.

⁴⁵ *Minneapolis Journal*, October 11, 1901, 3, CALOC; *Rogue River Courier* (Grant’s Pass, OR), February 13, 1902, 1, CALOC; and *Elyria Reporter* (Elyria, OH), December 2, 1901, 1, Newspaper Archive, FHL.

instantly killed and twenty eight were afterwards put to death by shooting.” The bay stallion “led the remainder off into the hills at such a pace that they could not be over-taken or shot.”⁴⁶

In December 1902 an even more devastating Mustang Hunt occurred at Pipe Springs when 200 cowboys from Utah, Arizona, and Nevada assembled at Kanab. The *San Francisco Call* reported that the stockmen organized under a “boss” for the day “assisted by a half dozen expert cowboys as sub-captains” and swept the entire range. “While the number of wild equines is less than ever before in nearly half a century, there is the same keen interest in the exciting sport and, more than ever before, the ranchmen feel the need of exterminating the bands of free horses that roam this part of the country.”⁴⁷ Similar raids occurred all over southern Utah, and in their wake the *Deseret News* told how Utah’s legislators congratulated themselves that “the desert ranges of the South have been rid of the pest[y]” horses, and that their flesh was freely “used as steaks by Indian tribes.”⁴⁸ Before its ending, the sport inspired a generation of young writers, including western fiction writer Zane Grey who spent time on the Arizona Strip area.⁴⁹ Jonathan Heaton’s son Daniel Hoyt Heaton, and Daniel Seegmiller’s grandson, Daniel Seegmiller McQuarrie also wrote of capturing a mythical palomino stallion “with a flaxen mane” the cowboys called Palmetto. Though this magnificent horse eluded capture year after year, both Dan Heaton and Dan McQuarrie wrote accounts claiming to be “the boy cowboy” who captured the famous animal when the great adult cowboys of the day could not. Dan Heaton told of participating in mustang “round-ups” about 1903 when he was but nine years old. After relays of

⁴⁶ The *Coconino Sun*, October 12, 1901, 6, CALOC; and the *Tombstone Epitaph*, October 27, 1901, CALOC.

⁴⁷ *San Francisco Call*, December 27, 1903, CDNC.

⁴⁸ *Deseret News*, January 31, 1903, 1, UDN.

⁴⁹ York and Evelyn Jones, *Lehi Willard Jones*, 176–177. Bulloch and Jones had a new operation at Short Creek where they met Zane Grey who was “collecting information for his books.” Dilworth Woolley was convinced that the Mormon cowboys that Grey met “trapping wild horses” on the Buckskin Mountain inspired his novel *Wildfire*. “Notes from Dilworth on Pipe Springs,” WSC, b3, f9.

cowboys had chased the grand palomino and worn him down, Young Heaton wrote: “I was on my little mustang horse, Jim—tough as they ever made them. He could run all day. . . . Well, I was just a little kid, and the stallion was getting winded. So all I had to do was just slowly run up beside him on my little horse; I reached over, put the loop over his head and snubbed it to the horn, and I had him.” Incensed at the youngster’s “luck,” the older cowboys forced him to ride the worn out stallion, but “of course, he was give out then; I didn’t weigh much on his back, and he was too tired to buck.” Dan wrote that he gave the stallion to his nephew Leonard, future custodian of Pipe Spring National Monument, but that “no one could ever break that horse; they never ever tamed him. He’d buck and fight, and he finally just killed himself trying to regain his freedom.”⁵⁰

McQuarrie wrote a much more sophisticated and detailed account of the capture of the great palomino stallion of Pipe Springs, though he was only seventeen at the time it was published. It appeared in July 1906 in the LDS church’s magazine *The Improvement Era* and was simply entitled “Palmetto.” McQuarrie too claimed to have captured Palmetto in 1903, when he was just fourteen years old. “Just across the boundary line of Utah,” he began his narrative, “in the center of a level, wind-swept plateau, which is skirted by blue mountains and crossed by only a low ridge, covered with cedars, lies Pipe Springs, like an oasis in a desert.”

From a strategic location near Cedar Ridge, “seven miles west of Pipe Springs,” McQuarrie tells of his first sight of Palmetto. Hiding from view, McQuarrie and a friend watched while other cowboys gave the horses chase, driving them toward McQuarrie’s hiding place. One by one horses burdened with “the load of water they had drunk” dropped out of the wild remuda. On fresh animals the boys evened their pace with Palmetto. Palmetto’s “square shoulders still

⁵⁰ Velma Heaton Stewart, *Daniel Hoyt Heaton and Lydia Eva Wilson Heaton: Their Life Story*, 64–65.

worked without a sign of tiring.” In his story, McQuarrie “looked upon the foaming Palmetto, who had so gallantly shown his worthiness to be free. I thought of his seven-mile run before he [reached] the ridge. I admired his finely shaped body, even more because it was covered with dust and sweat; and his large nostrils more, because they were full of blood; and him more, for his mettle and endurance.” McQuarrie’s partner roped the magnificent stallion who had put every ounce of his life-force into his final race for freedom. “O! hard, cruel sight!” writes McQuarrie, “Palmetto has felt his first rope,” but “still he bounds straight forward, straining his very life” against the rope. McQuarrie cried to his older companion to give the tired horse some slack. “But before the sentence was finished, Palmetto lay on the plan.” The older cowboy “leaped from his horse to hobble him, but there was no need. Palmetto was dead, just a few rods from his home in the mountains!”

“In Partnership With God”—“Jonathan Heaton and Sons”

For unknown reasons, sometime in 1906 Alec Findlay made arrangements to sell “about 3,000 head” of cattle “together with the old Pipe Springs and other ranches in the Pipe valley, to Jonathan Heaton and company of Orderville.” The “other ranches” included Bull Rush Ranch and a number of other small ranches like it such as one at Cane Beds which had evolved as Findlay developed and claimed additional springs and reservoirs in the desert. “Heaton and Sons” was a family corporation modeled after the United Order and operated chiefly out of Moccasin and the old Seegmiller-Woolley ranch at Upper Kanab, which the Heaton had purchased from the Seegmiller estate in 1900. Findlay had already sold a giant ranch adjoining the Heaton’s Upper Kanab Ranch to Heaton and Sons and both parties were pleased with the

transaction. The sale of Pipe Springs and its cattle followed naturally. Findlay's sale of "the old Pipe Springs and other ranches in the Pipe valley" to Heaton and Sons took about two years to complete. The first part of the purchase took place in connection with the spring roundup of 1907 when "about \$60,000 changed hands." This first installment was nearly three times the amount he paid for it five years earlier.

The sale of the ranches themselves was easy, but cattle owned by Findlay's "Pipe Valley ranches" were scattered from the Hurricane Fault as far east as the Buckskin Mountain and House Rock Valley, and from the Colorado River to a point north of Upper Kanab. Even with the cooperation of all the cowboys operating in the area it would take some time to "tally" all the animals of the pertinent brands. According to the Heaton's, Findlay originally offered to sell the Pipe Valley Ranches for \$30,000, with all the cattle and horses thrown in "without counting, take them just as they were running on the range." The truth is, considering the enormous size of the territory his animals ranged on, Findlay had no idea how many Pipe Valley cattle he owned and knew it would be nearly impossible to find out. The Board of Directors of Heaton and Sons met to consider the offer. Jonathan Heaton had a hunch \$30,000 was a good deal, but the majority of his shareholding sons wanted to be sure. They suggested that they offer one price for the ranches and then pay a certain price for each branded animal counted on the range. ("\$30.00 for a cow and calf.") A small bar was branded on each animal below the "Frying Pan or Pipe brand" or other brands they were buying from Findlay to indicate it had been counted so it would not be counted twice. This involved an enormous amount of work and took over a year to complete. Once branded with a "talley bar" or slash beneath Pipe's frying pan brand, the seared mark became known as the "Talley Pipe," indicated the animal had been counted. The talley pipe eventually became Heaton and Sons brand for its Pipe Springs cattle. Heaton family records

make it clear that they were still counting and therefore still “settling” with Findlay in 1908 and that they continued finding animals that had escaped being counted as late as 1912. According to Charles Heaton and his son Leonard, Heaton and Sons ended up paying “almost \$100,000” for what they could have had for less than a third of that amount because they were determined to count the animals to be sure they got a good deal. The whole experience highlighted the continuing problem “that the cattle men did not know how many cattle they really owned on the [vast] Arizona Strip country.”⁵¹

Upon taking possession of the property, Heaton and Sons (a group made up primarily of Jonathan Heaton’s fifteen sons and additional sons-in-law⁵²) officially reincorporated itself as The Pipe Springs Land & Livestock Company (PSLLC), filing its articles of incorporation with the Secretary of the State of Utah on April 30, 1907. The new company’s directors were Jonathan Heaton, Charles C. Heaton, Alvin Heaton, Junius Heaton and George F. Carroll. Though the company had a new name, the PSLLC was still simply referred to as “Heaton and Sons.”⁵³ Heaton and Sons owned Pipe Springs from 1907 to 1923—a period of sixteen years. Though Jonathan Heaton allowed significant autonomy in decision-making to his sons and sons-in-law, allowing various ones to take their turn as business manager of the PSLLC, he presided over Pipe Springs longer than any other man. At the time of the sale, the Pipe Springs range was

⁵¹ *Inter-Mountain Republican* (Salt Lake City), July 1, 1907, 3, UDN; Charles and Leonard’s account is in “Purchase of Pipe Springs,” in *Moccasin and Her People*, 2:109. Ira Heaton remembered it slightly differently than his brother and nephew. “When Heaton’s bought Pipe Springs in 1907 from Alex Findley, he thought he would let them have it for \$30,000. He changed his mind and the ranch cost \$40,000 and the stock \$30.00 for a cow and calf. When they rounded them in, [the animals] cost them \$44,000,” apparently making a total of \$84,000.00. See “Notes from recollections of Ira Heaton,” in Charles Leonard Heaton Collection, 1879–1990, CHL, r6, item 38. Also see “Heaton and Sons Buy Pipe Spring Ranch From Findlay. . . Kanab, Utah, January 2, 1909,” PSLA; Margaret Heaton, interview July 23, 1973, 23–24, PSLA; and C. Leonard Heaton and Joe Bolander, interview by Glen Clark, January 17, 1976, 3–5, PSLA.

⁵² Heaton family records indicate that there were “other men” besides family members involved in their purchase of Pipe Springs. See *Moccasin and Her People*, 2:109.

⁵³ *Salt Lake Herald*, May 1, 1907, 5, UDN.

fully dilapidated, and even to the Heaton's the old fort was a sideline in a family business whose primary summer ranges were to the north on Cedar Mountain and in the area of the town of Alton. The Heaton's and scores of other stockmen continued to use the Pipe Range, especially in winter, because Pipe Springs continued to be the most important waterhole in the region. Winsor Castle continued as the center of the semi-annual roundups and cattle sales, but by the time Jonathan Heaton took possession of Pipe its best days were in the past.

Jonathan Heaton was born in Payson, Utah in 1857, a year after his parents hiked across the continent on foot pulling a handcart. Born and bred in the fervid spirit of the 1856–1857 Mormon Reformation, Heaton came of age as the fire of Young's United Order ignited southern Utah. Possessing a passionate commingling of his culture and a raw native faith, Jonathan Heaton can be characterized as a white-hot Latter-day Saint who doggedly put his religion first. His parents responded to Brigham's call to the Muddy Mission when he was just eleven.⁵⁴ Over a century later, the *Church News* of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints reported that Young himself had promised the youthful Jonathan that if he would go "to southern Utah and settle that country" and his "posterity would become as numerous as the sands of the sea." In 1979 the *Church News* reported that eight of the nine bishops in the Kanab Utah Stake were his descendants.⁵⁵ In the constant struggle to survive on the Muddy, young Jonathan developed a

⁵⁴ For biographical information regarding Jonathan Heaton, see Robert B. Heaton, *The Book of Heaton: The Story of the Life of Junius Floyd Heaton, Including Stories of the Atherton, Beilby, Bennett, Cook, Fuller, Glover, Heaton and Hoyt Ancestors* (Chico, CA: Robert B. Heaton, 2006), 161–243, PSLA (Special thanks to Robert B. Heaton who provided copies of this substantial work); Jennie Brown and Nora Heaton, *Moccasin and Her People*; Elsie C. Carroll, "The Family of Jonathan Heaton," *Improvement Era* 32 (April 1929): 484–489; Gwen Heaton Sherrat and Hannah Heaton Roundy, comp., *Ester's Children: Her Story and a Collection of Faith Inspiring Experiences* ([Salt Lake City?]: William Heaton Family Organization, [1971?]), CHL; various short biographies of Jonathan Heaton, familysearch.org; and "Sturdy Kane County Pioneer Laid to Rest," *Kane County Standard*, August 15, 1930, 1, UDN.

⁵⁵ *Church News*, September 22, 1979, 13.

work ethic that was unsurpassed even among the most ardent of his coreligionists.⁵⁶ When the Muddy Mission was disbanded, Jonathan and his parents and brothers followed President Young's directions to settle in Long Valley and found themselves in Orderville.⁵⁷ "From the time he was seventeen years of age," family records indicate, "Brother Heaton was given much responsibility. At that age he was appointed by the Board to act as foreman over a company of men, many of them old enough to be his grandfather."⁵⁸ He married sixteen-year-old Clarissa Amy Hoyt on his eighteenth birthday. The very first members of the OUO to marry, the dedicated couple "lived in the Order as long as it lasted." Since the St. George Temple was still under construction at the time of their marriage in September 1875, Jonathan and Amy showed their devotion to their religion by traveling by wagon over 600 miles round trip to be married "for Time and All Eternity" in the Salt Lake Endowment House. Otherwise the couple would have had to marry civilly and wait for the temple to be finished to have their marriage sealed. Once back in Orderville, they set up housekeeping in a wagon box and dedicated themselves to the Order.⁵⁹

As a very young man Heaton was put in charge of the OUO sawmill, and then the Order's Washington cotton farm, where he served for four years in what was said to be the toughest job in the whole order. When asked about "the success with which he carried on such responsibilities at so early an age," Heaton said, "I always thought if the [OUO Board of Directors] had confidence enough in me to put me in such places, I would do the best I could; and as sixty days was all the schooling I ever had, I had to shoot or give up the gun." His wife

⁵⁶ Robert Heaton, *Book of Heaton*, 165.

⁵⁷ Robert Heaton, *Book of Heaton*, 166.

⁵⁸ Elsie Carroll, "Family of Jonathan Heaton," 486.

⁵⁹ Robert Heaton, *Book of Heaton*, 167-168, 208; and Elsie Carroll, "Family of Jonathan Heaton," 486.

Amy wrote: “My husband worked hard. He never would spare himself.... He worked without stint, and fatigue sometimes made him sometimes lack understanding [for] us.... His physical strength [and work ethic] soon made him an admired adult member of the Order and his accomplishments are a worthy record of his faith and determination.” Under his leadership, the cotton farm operated “as a ‘miniature’ United Order,”⁶⁰ and he was later put in charge of the OUO’s sheep herd. It was said that until his death in 1930, “Good season or bad, he stuck it out and the fortunes of his family built up with the development of that industry in Utah.”⁶¹ When he took charge of OUO sheep herd, it numbered 3,000 head, and when he turned it back just a short time later, the number had skyrocketed to 15,000.⁶² The OUO was respected for its animal husbandry, especially sheep, which was largely owing to Jonathan’s industry, making him an obvious choice for the first president of the Kane County Sheepmen’s Union when it organized to protect the shepherders from Findlay and other hostile cattlemen. Heaton’s lifetime success allowed him to buy the Pipe Springs Ranch at a very high price—twenty times what Alec Findlay had given the PSCC for it.⁶³

While the OUO collapsed in 1885, the principles upon which it was based were embedded in Jonathan Heaton’s heart. To Heaton, the people of Orderville’s Order, with their shared past in the Muddy Mission, were simply the finest Christian folk the Good Lord had ever raised up. He served them as a member of their bishopric from 1884 to 1897.⁶⁴ When the Order disbanded in 1885, President Woolley and the Orderville Bishopric arbitrated the separation of

⁶⁰ Robert Heaton, *Book of Heaton*, 168, 170–171, 208–209, 211; and Elsie Carroll, “Family of Jonathan Heaton,” 486–487. Jonathan’s son Charles, who married Maggie Cox and sold Pipe Springs on behalf of “Heaton and Sons” to the federal government, was born while Jonathan was director of the Order’s Cotton Farm near St. George.

⁶¹ Robert Heaton, *Book of Heaton*, 216.

⁶² Robert Heaton, *Book of Heaton*, 172–173.

⁶³ Heaton and Sons Company’s \$100,000.00 investment for Pipe Springs Rancho and its cattle paid off. In 1910 alone, in a single deal, they sold \$80,000.00 worth of cattle. *Salt Lake Herald*, February 28, 1910, 3, CALOC.

⁶⁴ Robert Heaton, *Book of Heaton*, 172.

its vast holdings, reportedly redistributing it without hardly a word of complaint. Townsite plots were drawn for “by lot,” and “the farm lands were divided into pieces and priced and divided according to sealed bids.” These properties were doled back out to Order members based on credits for services rendered. The record of credits showed that Heaton and his brothers were hard workers and “received the house in town and Jonathan and his brothers got the Moccasin Ranch on the Arizona Strip as their share.”⁶⁵ After the Order had collapsed, the Heaton Family agreed to continue living the sacred communal pattern among themselves. Most if not all the brothers had worked and lived on the Moccasin Farm at one time or another, and the oldest brother, Christopher (Chris), had been called as a missionary to teach the Native Americans at the Indian Farm how to cultivate the ten acres the church had provided for them.⁶⁶ The Heaton took possession of the farm at the start of the Raid, and according to Jonathan’s first wife Amy, “During the days of the raids the second wives of all the boys moved [to Moccasin] with a number of others of their associates in polygamy.”⁶⁷

Jonathan was a polygamist who married his second wife, fifteen-year-old Lucy Elizabeth Carroll, when he was twenty. Heaton understood that as a Mormon High Priest it was his duty to “raise a quiver full” of children.⁶⁸ Heaton was even more serious about this than he was about his church, the Order, or even his livestock. The latter were all means to an end, and that end was “raising up a family unto the Lord.” The sobriquet “Heaton and Sons and Company” stood for

⁶⁵ Robert Heaton, *Book of Heaton*, 215.

⁶⁶ Robert Heaton, *Book of Heaton*, 216. For years before the breakup of the Order, Chris “sort of had charge of running the place” and he excelled in making “fine molasses from the cane that was grown in [Moccasin’s] rich, sandy soil.”

⁶⁷ Robert Heaton, *Book of Heaton*, 216.

⁶⁸ Robert Heaton, *Book of Heaton*, 170–171; and Elsie Carroll, “Family of Jonathan Heaton,” 485. Before he married he had once made “some sort of a bargain between [himself] and his Father in Heaven.” He said, “Before I was married I used to tell the Lord that if he gave me a family I wanted him to give me strength, wisdom and understanding enough to return them all back to him clean and pure—and that is still my prayer.”

much more than a financial undertaking. For him his family and his business was a “partnership with God.” Nearly all his children remembered their family prayer sessions “with fondness”. Daughter Elsie wrote, “I see our big family and the hired help sitting around our supper table in front of the fireplace. Everything was at peace, with Father reading a scripture. We would all sing a hymn before kneeling in prayer. Father always wanted the family together at [prayer] both morning and night.”⁶⁹ An unnamed son of Jonathan echoed his sister’s sentiments, honoring his parents for quality of the family they raised.

I believe the reason father and our mothers have succeeded so well in this is because they have always prayed *with* us every night and morning, and have taught us to pray from our infancy. Father eliminated the devil’s work-shop, idleness, by always having something for us all to do. We [Heaton children] have all been . . . taught [to] believe that to marry well and to rear clean, noble families is the greatest calling of Latter-day Saints.⁷⁰

In 1929, six years after the Heatons sold Winsor Castle to the National Park Service, the *Improvement Era* (a magazine for adult Mormons) held “Jonathan Heaton and Sons” (and corresponding mothers and daughters) up as the model Latter-day Saint family. By then there were “one hundred eighty-seven living members of Jonathan Heaton’s family” and according to the *Era* every single one of them kept “the Word of Wisdom,” the Mormon health code.⁷¹ Before 1890, polygamy had been called “The Principle,” and was used, along with colonization missions, as a “test of faith” whereby Mormons showed their religious commitment. But after the

⁶⁹ Robert Heaton, *Book of Heaton*, 173.

⁷⁰ Elsie Carroll, “Family of Jonathan Heaton,” 488–489.

⁷¹ Elsie Carroll, “Family of Jonathan Heaton,” 484–489; and McClintock, 98.

Raid essentially shut down both Mormon polygamy and church-sponsored immigration, new tests of faith were needed. The Word of Wisdom gradually became “a commandment” and replaced polygamy and the act of responding to colonization missions as the prime test of Mormon faithfulness. It was also closely linked with the law of tithing, which increasingly became a test of faith during this period. Church leaders argued that money saved by not engaging in “debauching habits” like smoking and chewing tobacco and drinking alcohol and “hot drink stimulants” could be paid to the church as tithing and donations. The Word of Wisdom was coming into its own at the very time the Jonathan Heaton Family was touted in the *Improvement Era*.⁷² “In this day of comparatively loose living,” the *Era* article read, it is a fact “most interesting,” that “a family numbering one hundred eighty-seven members of whom it can be said that none of them use tea, coffee, tobacco or liquor; that none of their names are listed among the lawbreakers of any court; that they are all living clean, active, successful lives.” As far as the *Era* was concerned, “Heaton and Sons” was performing splendidly in obtaining the real purposes for which it was founded.⁷³

One of the main reasons the OUO had collapsed was its failure to provide economic opportunities for the huge number of maturing young people Orderville’s polygamous marriages produced. Not long after Christopher, Jonathan, Alvin, Wilford and Fred Heaton collectively obtained the OUO’s Moccasin holdings, they realized that the tiny farm and its water supply were not sufficient to provide long term for the futures of the large polygamous families they

⁷² Paul H. Peterson, “*An Historical Analysis of the Word of Wisdom*” (master’s thesis, BYU, 1972; reprint [Salt Lake City]: Benchmark Books, 2005); Thomas G. Alexander, “The Adoption of a New Interpretation of the Word of Wisdom,” in *Mormonism in Transition: A History of the Latter-day Saints, 1890–1930* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1986), 272–306; and Anthony W. Ivins, “Notes from the Diary of Anthony W. Ivins,” 1–3, CHL. Joseph Smith had revealed the Word of Wisdom in Kirtland, OH in 1833, “warning” against the use of tobacco, alcohol, coffee, and tea. Since it was not originally given “by commandment or constraint,” the settlers of the Dixie-Pipe Springs-Kanab corridor, freely used these substances, particularly enjoying their “Dixie Wine.”

⁷³ Elsie Carroll, “Family of Jonathan Heaton,” especially 484.

were raising. One by one Jonathan's brothers and their families left Moccasin for "greener pastures." By the early 1890s only the families of Jonathan and Alvin Heaton remained. Jonathan and his two wives were blessed with fifteen sons and nine daughters. According to family records, in 1896 Alvin and Jonathan decided the "land was too straight" for both of their families. After counseling amicably together they decided that Jonathan's large clan would leave Moccasin and take full possession of their Fiddler's Green farm, located halfway between Orderville and Mt. Carmel in Long Valley. Jonathan loaded up his goods and children into wagons and pulled away. When just a few miles out of Moccasin, they beheld a single Native American running after them. Captain Frank-Chuarumpeak, who was in his last year in 1893, traveled some distance to hug Brother Jonathan and send him on his way. After travelling even further toward their new home, Alvin approached on horseback and called Jonathan from his wagon. The two brothers stepped out of earshot of the children, and renegotiated the move. The youngsters never heard a word of the conversation, but the plans were reversed. It seems Alvin, who had mostly daughters, had come to the conclusion that his brother's family, with its abundance of sons, would be better suited to work the Moccasin Farm. Alvin suggested that he take Fiddler's Green after all. In a decision that would change both Moccasin and Pipe Springs history, Jonathan turned his wagons around and took possession of Moccasin. The Heaton portion of Moccasin would solely be the inheritance of Jonathan Heaton and his posterity. Indeed, they still possess most of "Mormon Moccasin" to this day.⁷⁴

⁷⁴ Robert Heaton, *Book of Heaton*, especially 173, 178, 213–220, 441–458; C. Leonard Heaton, "Talking Things Over," in *Heaton Family History*, JAP; *Moccasin and Her People*, especially 2:104; Annie Porter Seaman, "Biography of Alvin Franklin Heaton (1860–1910)," especially 13, CHL; and Margaret Cox Heaton, interview by Kay S. Fowler, July 14, 1967, 17–19, Doris Duke American Indian History Project, Western History Center, UU.

Applying UO principles to his farm and family, Jonathan Heaton organized Jonathan Heaton and Sons as a joint stock company. The idea was to work “unitedly” to provide the wherewithal to set each family member up at marriage with “a stewardship” that would be their own.⁷⁵ Considering the fact that there were 24 children to thus provide for, and that much smaller families were leaving the area in droves because they could not even feed themselves, this was an ambitious goal. Making it work certainly showed the faith Jonathan Heaton and his brood had in the revealed principles of the UO. As in the Order, they would “share and share alike.” Mimicking the OUO, Jonathan lead his family in weekly company meetings where individuals could bring up concerns and problems and where they would be settled in a spirit of love, fairness, and cooperation. The same economic principles that had made Orderville the economic powerhouse of southern Utah, particularly as it effected cattle and sheep, turned Heaton and Sons into a force to be reckoned with. And like the original OUO upon which it was modeled, Heaton and Sons began to dramatically expand its holdings both in terms of real property and livestock. After Daniel Seegmiller was killed by William Roundy, for example, Heaton and Sons purchased the Upper Kanab Ranch from the Seegmiller Estate in 1900. Heaton divided his two families between Moccasin Ranch and the Upper Kanab Ranch Seegmiller and Woolley had once purchased from Canaan Ranch. But now it went by the name of Heaton Ranch or Wild Rose Ranch, so named for the beautiful wild roses that graced this virtual garden of Eden in the desert. Their financial success and expansive abilities enabled Heaton and Sons to

⁷⁵ Under the Law of Consecration and Stewardship revealed by Joseph Smith, a “stewardship” was property given to an individual to manage as his own. During its last years, the Orderville United Order initiated “the stewardship plan” based on Smith’s revelations. The idea was that an individual actually owned his stewardship, but the “increase,” or amount of profit over and above that which was needed for a particular owner, would be freely given to the church, or, as the principle was applied by the OUO or Heaton and Sons, to the main company.

purchase Pipe Springs from A. D. Findlay between 1906 and 1909 for the whopping price of “almost \$100,000.”⁷⁶

⁷⁶ Robert Heaton, *Book of Heaton*, especially 173–178, 220–221, 467; Velma Heaton Stewart, *Daniel Hoyt Heaton and Lydia Eva Wilson Heaton: Their Life Story*, 45, 48; Margaret Cox Heaton, Charlotte Cox Heaton, and Abigail Cox Heaton, “Life History of Margaret Cox Heaton,” 2, Charles Leonard Heaton Papers, r6, CHL; Mary Chamberlain, *Handmaiden of the Lord*, 56; *Moccasin and Her People*, 2:109; and *Inter-Mountain Republican* (Salt Lake City), July 1, 1907, 3, UDN.

Chapter 16

A Home for Kaibabit and Fundamentalists, and Grand Visions of Reclamation and Economic Exploitation

“Locking Arms with the Indians”—Moccasin, the Heaton and the Kaibabit

Latter-day Saint historian Andrew Jenson first visited Pipe Springs and Moccasin on a history-gathering tour in 1892. In an official report of his fact finding journey published in the *Deseret News*, Jenson inadvertently demonstrated that Utahans generally viewed the Arizona Strip to be a part of Utah. He wrote: “Three miles north of P[i]pe Springs ranch, in a romantic little cove, are the Moccasin springs, from which about one hundred acres of some of the best and most productive farming land in Southern Utah are irrigated.” Jenson wrote that there were then “only two families” residing in Moccasin—the families of Jonathan and Alvin Heaton “who belong to the Orderville ward.”¹ There are various explanations for how the name “Moccasin” came to be applied to the “romantic little cove” and system of springs and seeps that exist approximately three miles north of Winsor Castle. Jonathan Heaton’s grandson Leonard, who was born in Moccasin to Charles and Maggie Cox Heaton in 1901, and who was raised among the Kaibabit, wrote that “the first people to live here were the Pie-eeds Indians. The Pie-eeds came from Pangwitch and made their home [at Moccasin]. The Pie-eeds named it Moccasin, for

¹ Andrew Jenson, Fredonia, Arizona, to Editor *Deseret News*, March 10, 1892, in *Deseret News* March 29, 1892, 11, DNA.

when they came here they found a meadow that was the shape of a moccasin.” Heaton learned from the Indians that the “Pie-eeds” were the original Kaibabit.² Another source, however, indicates that the Kaibabit knew the place by the name of *Pa-it-spick-ine* which meant “big, bubbling springs.”³ The Kaibabit told Leonard that Moccasin was used “as a winter camping place [long] before the white men came in.” By observation Leonard learned that during the winter the Kaibabits located their wickiups against the cove’s south facing cliffs, which absorbed the sun’s rays and otherwise protected them from the desert’s cold winds.⁴

In contrast to Leonard Heaton’s report that the Kaibabit themselves named Moccasin, traditions among the Mormons assert other origins for the name. One narrative is that William B. Maxwell, who may well have been the first Mormon to visit the little cove nestled between various spurs of the Vermilion Cliffs, found a discarded Navajo deerskin sandal at the edge of the largest of the area’s springs, which he then named “Moccasin Spring.” Another version of the story is that Maxwell, or sometimes another unnamed discoverer of the springs, simply found moccasin tracks in the sand around the springs. Either way, the name memorializes the fact that the Native Americans were there first and that the cove and its springs were an important resource to them. Leonard Heaton took an early interest in Moccasin-Pipe Springs History and in 1915, at only fourteen years of age, the future custodian of the National Monument attempted to gather the Kaibabit’s knowledge of the area’s prehistory. All he could coax from them was the ancient belief that their people had originally come “from Panguitch,” that they named the place Moccasin as described above, and that Navajo began to come into their country sometime before the Whites invaded. To discourage their more formidable neighbors from taking over their land,

² Leonard Heaton, “The History of Moccasin by Leonard Heaton, Feb. 2, 1915,” in LH, r6, item 36.

³ Herbert E. Gregory, “Population of Southern Utah,” in *Economic Geography* 21 (January 1945): 57.

⁴ Leonard Heaton, “Notes on the History of Moccasin[,] Arizona,” PSLA, PISP 2035.

the Kaibabit had “stopped all the springs but one.” They buried every spring in their entire country, presumably except the largest one at Moccasin, which could easily be defended. “When the Navajo came they could not get a drink,” and returned to their own land. Moccasin’s strategic location had protected Kaibabit land from their enemies and became the tribe’s agricultural and ceremonial center.⁵

Since the Heatons now possessed land that had been especially important to the Kaibabit, and because the Kaibabit still owned ten adjacent acres and shared a third of Moccasin’s water, the Heaton’s relationship with the Kaibabit was complicated. Mormon records attest that the Heatons did a great deal for their Kaibabit neighbors but also that cultural differences and competition for resources severely strained the relationship. The Kaibabit deserted their sick and aged by placing them in caves “on the hill above the spring to the north of the [Heaton’s] ranch houses” “to get better or to die” on their own. Hearing the weeping and wailing of the deserted, the Heatons did what they could for the unfortunates. To end such action, Fred Heaton concocted the story that a deceased Kaibabit named Old Mose returned from the dead to tell the Kaibabit that they “were neglectful of their sick and dead” and that “they should overcome their superstition and give their sick and dead better care.” Alvin Heaton’s wife Jane remembered witnessing a traditional Kaibab marriage battle at Pipe Springs Point when an girl of the Moccasin tribe married a man from St. George, but her Moccasin suitor brought her back. Her new husband followed and to “decide the matter she was forced to run the gauntlet. She was handled roughly but not seriously hurt. As soon as she broke through the line, she ran to her St. George lover.”⁶

⁵ Will C. Barnes, *Arizona Place Names* (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1988), 281; McClintock, 97; Robert Heaton, *Book of Heaton*, 481; Leonard Heaton, “The History of Moccasin by Leonard Heaton, Feb. 2, 1915.”

⁶ Emma Carroll Seegmiller, “Personal Memories of the United Order,” *UHQ*, 8 (October 1939): 195–196.

Paiute from various bands throughout Utah, Arizona and Nevada gathered at Moccasin for a pow-wow with their Kaibab friends and relatives in 1891. They came from as far away as “Santa Clara, the Muddy, Johns Valley and other places,” swelling the native population to as high as 400. The visiting Native Americans brought their ponies with them and turned a large number of them into a fenced area the Heatons owned called Moccasin Pasture. Remembering the events many years later, Charles Heaton stated that “as usual when the white man settled this country, they . . . crowded the Indians out and there was no agreement or definite understanding made with the Indians about [staying off] the land.” Captain Frank directed his guests to turn their horses into the Heaton’s pasture even though the Heatons had fenced an “Indian Pasture” just east of Moccasin Pasture for their use. Charles Heaton, about 10 years old at the time, remembered that his Uncle Alvin respectfully asked the Native Americans “to move their horses into the other pasture,” but they “disregarded the request.” After giving them several days to comply, Charles said that “early one morning Uncle Alvin and a few of us boys rode out and rounded up all the Indian horses and started to drive them out of the Moccasin Pasture into the Indian Pasture.” Alvin and his group of white youngsters were immediately “surrounded” by natives. With visitors from various Paiute bands lined up behind him, Captain Frank harangued Alvin Heaton, and the two argued “for some time over the pasture rights, but there was no agreement.” At last Alvin “slid off his horse, rolled up his sleeves and said, ‘I will fight every man here, one at a time, beginning with Captain Frank.’ After a long pause of silence, Captain Frank gave a sharp command and the horses were driven off by the Indians to their pasture.” But tensions remained high. Jonathan Heaton had been away on business, but when he returned he sent Charles and the other boys “up in the canyon to get two large fat steers.” Captain Frank was invited over for a talk with Jonathan and Alvin, and both sides respectfully aired their grievances

and suggested amicable solutions to their problems of land use. Charles remembered that they “talked for quite a long time, partly in Indian as Father and Uncle Alvin could talk some Indian.” The Heatons allowed Chuarumpeak to choose two steers he would like to take back to his camp to share with his guests.⁷

Notwithstanding cultural differences and the natural competition for resources that strained their relationships, there were many positive interactions between the Heatons and the Kaibab, including pan-Moccasin interethnic feasts, dances, and celebrations. When all the Heatons were present, there were nearly as many of them as the whole Kaibab band, which during the 1890s numbered somewhere between 70 and 90 individuals. Sometime during the early 1890s the Heatons hosted a watermelon bust for their Indian neighbors. Alvin Heaton requested Captain Frank-Chuarumpeak to select a suitable location for the party and gather his people. Dan Seegmiller’s widow Emma, whose sister was one of Alvin Heaton’s wives, recorded:

the Indians were prepared for us. They had selected an almost perfect amphitheatre among the trees near their camp for the affair. Poles were placed on the outer edge next to the trees for seats and the Captain was seated with his subjects, waiting for us. The wagonload of melons were soon unloaded by the white and Indian boys in a huge pile at the south end of the clearing. Our lighting was the campfire.”

⁷ See Charles Carroll Heaton, “Need of a Good Understanding,” in Charles Leonard Heaton Collection, r6, item 36, CHL; and Annie Porter Seaman, “Alvin Franklin Heaton,” 9–10.

Emma noted one of “the most impressive feature of the evening occurred when Captain Frank stepped into the center of the large circle, surrounded by his tribe and his friendly white neighbors, and gave thanks to God for the occasion.” She described him as “a majestic figure as he stood in the center of the circle, tall and straight, with finely shaped body, almost physically perfect in form, and with bowed head, as he asked god’s blessings on those assembled, on himself and his people, and especially on Alvin Heaton who had brought the melons to them.” “After the feast,” the Native Americans entertained the group “with dances; then all joined in games, and red men competed with white men in races. The dance that seemed a favorite in which the white[s] joined, was very pretty as they moved in a circle, the whites locking arms with the Indians and keeping time with the beat of the tom-tom. The step, the rhythm of the body and the chant of many voices were pleasing to watchers.”⁸

In the years before the government provided the Native Americans with medical services, the Heaton women became unofficial midwives, and attended those who were dying and tried to make their final hours as comfortable as possible. The Heatons doled out large amounts of foodstuffs to their neighbors and provided jobs. They hired native women to do their wash. The Heaton brothers hired native cowboys and day laborers whenever possible, and continued to help the Native Americans plow and sow and irrigate their ten-acre farm. Alvin was known far and wide as one of the country’s most meticulous farmers, one who demanded that his fences and furrows were straight, and that his fields and ditches were free of weeds, and sought to teach the Native American farmers at Moccasin to do likewise. Captain Frank was painstakingly taught to

⁸ Emma Carroll Seegmiller, “Personal Memories of the United Order,” 196–197.

build a perfectly straight fence, and when complimented for his work, simply said, “That’s the way Alvin likum.”⁹

In 1903, James A. Brown, “a special disbursing agent” for the Indian Office visited the Kaibabit and made his first report on August 15. His visit appears to have been called forth by the fact that these Kaibabit, who traditionally made most of their living hunting deer on the Kaibab Plateau, had recently been completely shut off from their most important source of food. Other than Miss Laura B. Work, superintendent of the Indian School at Shem, west of St. George, Brown was virtually the only employee of the Indian Office that had paid the Kaibabit any attention since the days of John Wesley Powell. A passionate Presbyterian missionary, Laura Work had been hired about 1900 to run a school for the Shivwits and Kaibait near St. George. Brown and Work noted in their reports that Captain George’s Kaibab, like their Shivwits relatives, were no longer considered “blanket Indians” by the Indian Office, for they had long since given up traditional rabbit skin robes and blankets as their primary garments. Brown was proud to report in 1903 that “all the Indians of this agency wear citizens’ dress and all [the males] wear short hair,” a sure sign that they were “gradually adopting the ways of the white people.” Despite these “signs of progress,” he lamented that “all” the Kaibabit still lived “in tepees, never remaining in one place long at a time.” Brown reported that there were 110 Kaibabit, but vital statistics printed with his report indicated that their death rate was over twice the birth rate—therefore their total population was decreasing. A major factor in this demographic downtrend was malnutrition. According to Brown, in 1903 the Kaibabit only cultivated “about 7 acres” on their “small farm” near Moccasin Spring, on which they raised corn and alfalfa. The Kaibabit did not “realize much money from their farm” for as soon as their corn

⁹ Annie Porter Seaman, “Alvin Franklin Heaton,” especially 16.

was ripe, the various Kaibab families would descend upon Moccasin “and eat up” what the farmers had raised. Like the Shivwits, the Kaibabit still used natural grass seed for, and relied heavily on, the annual harvest of pine nuts. But these natural resources were not enough to sustain them.

Brown and Work reported that both the Shivwits and the Kiababit obtained “considerable work at fairly good wages in the surrounding neighborhood—riding after cattle and working on farms being the principle occupations of the younger men.” Indeed, Superintendent Work wrote that “all the younger men are good vaqueros and skilled in the cattle business.” The Heatons, Dee Woolley, Bullock and Jones, A.D. Findlay, B.F. Saunders, Preston Nutter, and most other cattlemen on the Strip hired native cowboys. Brown reported that male Kaibab were also hired to herd sheep, and that “the haying season is when they are most employed” around the farms near the Mormon villages. Brown wrote that native women had “steady employment the year round washing for the white people,” for which they were paid “from 25 cents to 60 cents per day putting out a washing (or a batch of clothes).” Maggie Heaton reported that washing was heavy work that very few Mormon women did when an Indian woman could be found. Laura Work reported that the Shivwits women showed great interest in basket weaving, and she helped them establish a market for their baskets at the faraway Hampton Institute, a boarding school in Hampton, Virginia for acculturating Native Americans and formerly enslaved people; this Shivwits interest in selling baskets soon spread to Kaibab women. Despite these odd jobs, Agent Brown lamented that “they never get anything ahead, but spend their money as fast as they make it [simply] to support themselves.” Hunger was thus a very real problem, and Brown explained that while the “young” Kaibabit “do a great deal of hunting,” they now obtained but little, for game “is very scarce, rabbits being about all they get.” In 1905 Buckskin Mountain had been

declared a national forest preserve by President Theodore Roosevelt and officially closed off to their use. The Kaibab's disbursing agent noted that deer were still "very plentiful on the Buckskin Mountain, and before it was made a reserve these Indians obtained most of their living from that source." The Kaibabites were not allowed "the same privilege as white men have during the open game season" which was an injustice Brown recommended should stop.

Both Brown and Work noted the "progress" the Kaibabites and Shivwits were making in "adopting the ways of the white people." One of the "signs of progress" that Laura Work noticed was the substitution of traditional Native American religious practices with those of her own Presbyterianism. "I note progress also in other particulars," she wrote, for they now "have but one [aboriginal] dance, the 'cry' or mourning dance, a modification of the ghost dance." She boasted that she had single-handedly taught the Shivwits "to live in houses instead of caves" and was delighted with the quick development in the "moral sense" she was seeing in her wards, and noticed it even in the Native American "marriage relations." Previously, she wrote in one of her reports, marriage "was lightly taken up and as lightly 'thrown away.'" She punished native polygamy by the "severe treatment" of the "withholding of supplies" in hopes of creating "a wholesome sentiment against such looseness." She used a similar "severe treatment" to inculcate "a new self-respect" for the Indian "which will not allow stealing or begging, but insists on each one earning what he gets and paying up his debts, and despises those who fail in these particulars." She took this new "moral growth" as a "demand and hunger for [more] religious teaching" which seemed to her to be "the most promising signs of progress in these Indians, and I sincerely trust that the missionary promised them by the Women's Board of Missions of the Presbyterian Church may be on the ground soon, and be wise to plant the ground already broken up with the seeds of a better life." Miss Work was attempting to establish a viable Indian School

on a Shivwits Indian Farm the Mormons had provided in the desert on the Santa Clara River Reservation west of St. George, to which both Shivwits and Kaibab children were invited. The place was called Shem after a Shivwits headman of that name. Work had got several of her wards, including Kaibab Tony Tillohash, placed in distant government boarding schools like the Carlisle Indian School in Pennsylvania, but having their children so far away caused parents' extreme emotional distress. Work reported that Chief Shem was greatly opposed to the boarding schools, and told Miss Work, "you no more send 'em school; you make 'em school here, no more send 'em; [let] die [first], papa, mamma, brother, cousin, then send 'em [to the faraway boarding schools]." On her recommendation a purchase of land for an Indian School for the Paiute was made in Panguitch in 1903.¹⁰

Sister Rebecca Mace's journal preserves a picture of Kanab Mormon-Kaibab interactions and relationships as they existed on the eve of the establishment of the Kaibab reservation in 1907. She wrote:

March 25, 1905, "Indian Sampson commenced to clean out the ditches on my lot—& promised to come on Monday again."

May 13, 1905, "Squaw Maggie washed for me to day."

¹⁰ Report of James A. Brown, Special Agent for Kaibab Indians, Kanab, Utah, to the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, August 15, 1903, and Report of Laura B. Work, School Superintendent Among Shivwits Indians, to the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, June 30, 1903, both in *Annual Reports of the Department of the Interior for the Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 1903: Indian Affairs, Part I. Report of the Commissioner and Appendixes* (Washington: Government Printing Office, 1904): 329–331; Laura B. Work, Report of School at St. George, Utah, to the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, June 30, 1902, in *Annual Reports of the Department of the Interior for the Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 1902: Indian Affairs, Part I. Report of the Commissioner, and Appendixes* (Washington: Government Printing Office, 1903), 472–474; *Deseret News*, September 13, 1901, 2, UDN; *Salt Lake Tribune*, October 17, 1903, 8, UDN; and *Ogden Standard Examiner*, October 10, 1905, 8, UDN and Interview of Margaret Cox Heaton by Kay S. Fowler, July 14, 1967, 1–10, and 15–16, Doris Duke American Indian History Project, Western History Center, UU.

May 25, 1905, "Didn't go to R[elief] S[ociety] Meeting busy weeding [strawberries]—
one bed weeded by an Indian Woman."

May 29, 1905, "Joe and Son came and cleaned the door yard of weeds."

November 26, 1905, "Rec'd 2 welcome letters to day . . . [one] from Tony Tellohash one
of our Kanab Indians [at] Carlisle Pa Indian School."

December 11, 1905, "I also wrote a letter for Buckskin Joe Indian to his son at Panquitch
Indian School."

March 5, 1906, "An Indian called Mose is chop[p]ing tree trim[m]ings into stove wood
for me to day."

March 26, 1906, "Indian Mary washed."

July 27, 1906, "A little Indian girl helped me weed out some of the Strawberry beds."

August 1, 1906, "Yesterday I got an Indian to clean out my ditches and mend the brake."

August 4, 1906, "Old Charlie came this morning to mend the ditch, I hardly liked him to
do the work for in times before when I have employed him He was not trusty, I have not

hired him for a long time. He has wanted to work for me & to day I told him I wanted the work well done or not at all. However Charlie done his work well to day and was quite satisfied with the money I paid him. So I hope in the future if I hire him he will do well.”

August 22, 1906, “I again had to have my ditch repaired this is the 4th time this month. Sampson fixed the brake twice[,] Old Charlie once[,] and Adam cleaned the ditch & strengthened the weak places to day.”

September 6, 1906, “To day Jake & his squaw—wife—came in from Buckskin Mt. intending to go north as far as Hatchtown. The Indians all left Kanab on the 31 Aug, to go for Pine Nuts some to Buckskin some to Canonville others to Panuitch. Jake asked me to let him camp on my lot etc.”

September 7, 1906, “I was thinking about Conference how I could manage to leave home, & I felt that the Lord had opened the way by sending this Indian & wife to me. So I spoke to them asking them if they would watch my place while I went to meetings. They said they would.”

September 9, 1906, “Jake & wife was gone before I reached home[,] they made up their mind to go to Panguitch and see their little girl at school[.] I gave them Grapes & Peaches—Lucerne etc for their team and a treat for their little girl, it is her first school experience It seems very hard for the Indian Mothers to part from their children when they go to school. The Indians are very fond of their children.”

October 31, 1906, “Wrote to Tony Tillohash for his Uncle Young William—Indians Carlisle Pa.”

November 17, 1906, “My Son & Frank Rider & Grandson laid a foundation wall around the cellar preparatory to putting up the front of my house. Buckskin Joe Indian, helper.”

February 13, 1907, “To day Indians Buckskin Joe & Long Valley Jim Made dyke by the Creek charged one dollar.”¹¹

The contrast between Miss Laura Work’s joy for the “moral development” of the native Americans and daily routine of Sister Rebecca Mace’s journal is stark indeed. Mace’s diary indicates that something in Mormonism’s proselytizing spirit had grown cold—at least as far as it concerned Kanab’s Lamanites. Mace’s diaries frequently exhibit a white hot missionary zeal toward white gentiles which is noticeably lacking when it comes to local native peoples. To Rebecca Mace, President Woolley, the Heaton family, and many other local Mormons, the Kaibab Lamanites were sources of cheap labor and objects of charity—in that order. Often their exploitation of native peoples was buried in their conviction that they were “doing them good.” One of the earliest letters written by a Kaibab that has been preserved was apparently a protest over low wages paid by Mormons and referenced the fact that the Kaibab felt they were exploited as slaves. In 1909 some Kaibab would not work because Mormons only offered them \$1.50 a day when they paid whites \$2.00 for comparable labor. Robert Pikyavit, whose father

¹¹ See Rebecca Elizabeth Howell Mace Journal, Rebecca Elizabeth Howell Mace Papers, CHL, f6.

had once reportedly sold the whole Buckskin Mountain to the Mormons for an old saddle, wrote to the Commissioner of Indian Affairs on December 6, 1909, and asked, “Is there any more Slaves should be held in the states any more?” He complained that his aged father was “working like a slaves of states Utah, only for eat. I could not heardly stand that workes. their he not got any money from. . . . Because my Father dosn’t know any things about the Money, and getting old now. He has worked about 7 years, only Just for eat and many other Indians do that at Mormon towns . . . That slavery working.” The first gentile agent at the reservation criticized the Kaibabit for feeling “they do not have to do a day’s work unless they can get *their* price for it, instead of being willing to work for what they can get.” The agent wrote that “on the average I think the Indians are well compensated for their labor.”¹² As late as 1903, then, the two cultures still lived side by side, sometimes exploiting and bewildering each other, but each simultaneously attempting to understand and help the another.

Tramway to the Old West, National Park, and Indian Reservation—

Pipe Springs and its Role in Uncle Dee’s Master Plan

A year or two before the Heatons bought the Pipe Springs Ranch, Dee Woolley initiated a plan that would forever change the future of the Kaibab Band of Southern Paiute. The plan drastically altered their relationship with the Heaton family, and with the Latter-day Saints generally, for it would change them from being “Mormon Indians” to being “Government Indians.” By 1905 there were reportedly only 73 members of the Kaibab band of Southern

¹² Martha C. Knack, *Boundaries Between: The Southern Paiutes, 1775-1995* (University of Nebraska Press: Lincoln, 2004), 173.

Paiute, and because of disease and extreme poverty this tiny population was still waning at an alarming rate.¹³ By Heaton's death in 1930 his family's population was more than double that of the whole Kaibab people.¹⁴ As Dee Woolley pursued his dream of opening up the north rim of the Grand Canyon for tourism, he realized having panhandling natives on the streets of Kanab or on the Kaibab Plateau was not in the best interest of his economic plan to bring tourists to area.

By August 1905, Woolley and a group of investors had incorporated a company whose purpose was to build "an aerial tramway" to span the Grand Canyon "at its wildest point" with "a steel cable 500 feet long and a cage to carry 10 passengers" across the Colorado River "50 feet above the water." Woolley was convinced that once tourists spread the word that "the scenery from Kaibab plateau's southern edge is far beyond anything they get from points now reached" they would demand a rail road be brought in from the north, which would revolutionize the entire Kane County economy.¹⁵ In August 1905 Woolley and his allies launched a newspaper campaign to promote their plan. His immediate tasks included bringing in materials for the tramway, lobbying President Roosevelt to set the Buckskin Mountain aside as a national park for sight seeing, hunting and other recreation, and, establishing a "real" reservation for the Kaibab. Then there was the task of annexing the entire Arizona Strip to Utah so Woolley's home state could control the projected North Rim tourist trade. Longer term plans included building highways and rail roads to bring tourists into the country via Kanab. As a precursor to accomplishing this, Woolley's new company offered to host both Utah and Arizona's

¹³ Utah's Senator Reed Smoot reported to Commissioner of Indian Affairs Francis E. Leupp on November 29, 1905 that the Kaibab only numbered 73. *Deseret News*, November 29, 1905, 1, UDN. A special correspondent to the *Deseret News* earlier that same year estimated that there were 90. *Deseret News*, September 30, 1905, UDN.

¹⁴ In 1929, just a year before Heaton's death, the *Improvement Era* reported that Heaton's family, counting spouses of his children and grandchildren, numbered 187 individuals.

¹⁵ *Salt Lake Herald*, August 7, 1905, 1, and August 13, 1905, 23, UDN; and *Deseret News*, September 4, 1906, 3, UDN.

congressional delegations on a horse and mule trip to examine the Grand Canyon and consider its economic possibilities for their constituents. Woolley needed the congressmembers' political clout to finesse the annexation of the Arizona Strip to Utah, support the creation of the proposed national park, and to establish a reservation. A week or two in the saddle and around campfires with these power brokers was fundamental to Woolley's plan.¹⁶

On August 13, 1905, over a month before the trip was to start, Woolley's publicist at the *Salt Lake Herald* revealed the Kanab booster's bold plan to anchor "a cable to the wall of rock on either side of the gorge, on which will be operated a cage or car . . . to transfer tourists"¹⁷ to the Kanab side of the Grand Canyon. The article argued that "to keep the Kaibab plateau what it now is—one of the few spots where the old west still exists—an effort [must] be made to have it set aside as a government park." It asserted that the plateau was "a virgin wilderness" still rich in big game, but prophesied that "unless some steps are taken to protect the country" its wild animals, cattle and sheep would "do their work and make a cactus-spiked waste" of Buckskin Mountain as they had of the Pipe Springs range. The paper appealed to an increasing American nostalgia for the evaporating past, repeatedly calling the Kaibab Plateau a "bit of the Old West." It argued that Utah and Arizona had "within their boundaries more of the old west—the land of the cattlemen [with their] long single action revolvers, [and] of unbroken solitude and terrific scenery, than any other states in the Union." It held the North Rim up as "one of those odd corners where barbed wire fences have never c[o]me." The *Herald* painted the Kaibab Plateau as a natural playground, where "great forests stretch over its level," where grand "mountain flowers bloom in its grassy pastures," and where "herds of wild horses gallop down its canyons." This

¹⁶ *Deseret News*, September 4, 1906, 3, UDN.

¹⁷ Quotations from here through block quote are from *Salt Lake Herald*, August 13, 1905, 23, UDN.

heaven-on-earth was a place where “the hand of man has done nothing to defile its wilderness. It remains as Nature first made it.”

The *Herald*’ used the Old Fort at Pipe Springs and its “historic associations” to “sell” the public on the idea of preserving the area in the spirit of reviving “the Old West.” The article describes Kanab’s first settlers as “fighting at times for their very existence” and continued:

By order of Brigham Young they built a fort—it was their last outpost. Its buildings still stand, weather beaten, picturesque, at Pipe Springs, in the midst of the wonderful silent desert.

It lay in the land of the savages, this fort. Its little garrison was surrounded by bands of hostile Indians. But the men stuck it out, in spite of more than one massacre and countless attacks. They had been told to stay. Their presence in this desolate spot was necessary. Before the building of the fort the Navajo had been accustomed to sweep across the alkali wastes, driving before them the cattle of the white men. By a series of raids they had impoverished settlers; had made the region dangerous. That was why they built the fort,... It stands, a monument to the days civilization has put far back of us. You can pass it as you leave the little town for the plateau.

The journey to this Kaibab Plateau brings one back to the days of which you may read in fiction—days you will never see save in a few of the corners which the barbed wire fences have missed.¹⁸

¹⁸ *Salt Lake Herald*, August 13, 1905, 23, UDN.

Woolley's pack-horse trip for Utah's congressional delegation took place in late September 1905. Woolley "arranged all the details and . . . directed operations with the skill of a veteran."¹⁹ Woolley had previously coordinated with another former owner of Pipe Springs, Aquila Nebeker, to use his influence to sell President Theodore Roosevelt and other Washington power brokers on the idea of setting aside a "about 2,500 square miles" of the Kaibab Plateau as "a national game preserve." Nebeker believed the Kaibab "could be made the greatest game preserve in the country." Having run cattle on the Plateau for years, he lauded its range, mountain lakes and springs, abundance of timber, and claimed that "it now contains more deer than any other section of the United States."²⁰ Woolley's original plan was for the congressional delegations of both Utah and Arizona to come in from the north and south respectively and meet on the banks of the wild Colorado at the site of the proposed tramway. A storm delayed the Arizona party and Woolley used the opportunity of having Utah's delegation in the south to get them to "officially investigate the conditions of the Kaibab Indian band, roaming in this vicinity" in hopes they would see the need to remove them to a reservation. On their way to Kanab, Senator Reed Smoot and Congressman Joseph Howell stopped at the government Indian School near Panguitch and inquired into the conditions of the Kaibab at Moccasin and Kanab. According to the office teacher there, the Kaibab felt that if there was to be a school at all, it should be in Moccasin or Kanab. Smoot and Howell did not actually visit Moccasin but newspaper reports of their "investigation" indicated that "the farm is not large enough. There are

¹⁹ *Deseret News*, September 30, 1905, 6, UDN; and *Deseret News*, October 2, 1905, 3, UDN. Howell reported that it was "President Woolley's dearest wish to some day conduct President Roosevelt" on a similar tour to see the glories of the North Rim for himself, and expressed "the hope that the [Kanab Stake president's] plan may succeed."

²⁰ *Salt Lake Herald*, August 14, 1905, 8, UDN.

some 90 in the Kaibab band, which is rather a large family to be supported on an eight or ten-acre farm.” The *Deseret News* reported that Utah legislation had “excluded [the Kaibab] from hunting in Utah for years, and that government regulations keep them off the Buckskin mountains.” The “settlers have had to supply their wants, which is often done from the ‘Mormon’ tithing office in bulk.” President Woolley and others suggested plans for their relief which included a more substantial farm “where the Indians may work for their living.” The Indians, it was said, were “good workers,” and that “a little intelligent direction of their efforts on a good farm would make them self-supporting.”²¹

On November 29, 1905, Smoot called on Commissioner of Indian Affairs Francis E. Leupp “in regard to a plan to alleviate the condition of the Kanab Indians.” Smoot told the Commissioner that condition of the 73 Kaibab still in existence was “deplorable, verging on starvation.” Smoot explained to the commissioner that “as the matter now stands these Indians are a burden upon a community *not over able to care for itself*.” After his meeting with Leupp, Smoot told the *Deseret News* that “if he should fail to gain assistance for the Kanabs through the Indian office,” he intended “to prepare and press a special bill [through Congress] to alleviate their condition.”²² On December 6, Utah’s Senators Reed Smoot and George Sutherland and Representative Joseph Howell visited President Theodore Roosevelt in the White House. Smoot laid a map out on the president’s desk and formally expressed Utah’s desire that a “sixty by eighty mile” portion of the Kaibab Plateau be “converted into a National game preserve.” They also used Smoot’s map to show the president the 7,000,000 acres that comprised the Arizona Strip and informed the president that Smoot planned on introducing “a bill in the Senate to annex

²¹ *Deseret News*, September 30, 1905, 6, UDN.

²² *Deseret News*, November 29, 1905, 1, UDN.

the strip to Utah.” They informed the president that they had a conference planned with Gifford Pinchot of the forestry bureau the next day.²³

On March 9, 1906, Smoot gave notice of an amendment he was adding to the annual Indian Appropriation Bill calling for “an appropriation of \$10,500 for the support of the Kaibab Indians in Utah and for the purchase of land and water together with necessary farming implements, machinery and live stock for their use.” At first Smoot was “arranging with the Indian office for the purchase of 200 acres of land near Kanab for use of the indigent Kaibab Indians.” Under his original plan, though, the Kaibab would also be provided with use of 2,500 acres of grazing land on the public domain.²⁴ Roosevelt declared the Kaibab Plateau a national game preserve in 1906 and in January 1907 Smoot obtained \$10,500 “for the support and civilization of the Kaibab [*sic*] Indians in Utah . . . for the fiscal year 1907.”²⁵ On June 24 United States Indian Inspector Frank C. Churchill and Walter Runke, superintendent of the Panguitch Indian School and Special Disbursing Agent, met in conference with the leaders of the Kaibab and a tentative agreement for a temporary reservation was reached. The Kaibab, represented by twelve signers headed by Captain George, agreed to permanently make their homes at Moccasin *if* the United States would pipe their “one-third of the full flow of the Big Spring on Moccasin Ranch . . . to the vacant land about one and one-half miles easterly from the Moccasin Ranch buildings . . . and secure to the indians water from the Point Spring so called.” The Kaibab also agreed to eight stipulations which included sending all their children to the government school, providing labor for building ditches and a reservoir, and fencing in a mammoth pasture “eight miles in length, and four miles in width” for cattle or other livestock the government promised to

²³ *Salt Lake Tribune*, December 7, 1905, 1, UDN.

²⁴ *Deseret News*, March 9, 1906, 1, UDN; and *Salt Lake Herald*, December 30, 1906, 10, UDN.

²⁵ *Deseret News*, January 15, 1907, 1, UDN.

provide for them. (This four by eight mile rectangle seems to have been the original size of the proposed reservation.) The Kaibabit also agreed not to sell or give away cattle or other property with which they might be provided “without the consent of the duly authorized agent of the United States,” and that they “be sober and industrious,” and “do all in their power to be self-supporting and law abiding citizens.” They also agreed that “the Cedar groupe, Rabbit valley and Grass valley groups and the Kanosh indians, and other indians of the same blood not already provided with land or homes, may live and share with us the land and water herein discribed [sic].” The agreement specified that “the title to all land and the improvements” mentioned in the agreement would be held by the United States and not the Kaibabit. The original agreement called for fencing which would have enclosed Pipe Springs and Winsor Castle within the reservation. Captain George, Charley Bullets, Young William, Charley, Bush Head, Frank Snow, Frank Mustach, Dave, Adam, Buckskin Joe, John Seaman, and Long Valley Jim signed by mark and left an ink fingerprint on a typed record of their agreement.²⁶

A week later Special Agent Runke produced a census of the band, listing eighty-three members and giving their Indian and English names and respective ages. The list grouped the Kaibabit into eighteen family units ranging in size from 2 to 11, leaving two elderly women as singles without family association. The oldest person on the census was an 84-year-old grandmother named Flat Nose *Mo-e-ats*, while the record for the oldest male was shared by three 66-year-old men. First there was Old Mike *Ta-nin-nie* (whose son Jon Seaman’s Indian name was the name of the people, *Ka-bits*). Second, there was Samson *Mo-ants* who had known John Wesley Powell and had a seven-year-old son named Major Powell Samson. Third, *Quag-gant*

²⁶ “Memorandum of a Conference between the Piute Indians living near Kanab, Utah, and known as the Kaibab groupe of Piutes, and Frank C. Churchill, United States Indian Inspector, held at Kanab, Utah this 24th day of June 1907,” b5.

who did not have an English name. *Qua-gant's* grandson was 28-year-old Monkey Frank *Tung-co-tap*. Perhaps showing family relationship with Captain Frank *Chuarumpeak*, ten individuals out of the 83 had “Frank” as part of their name including Monkey Frank *Tung-co-tap*, Frank Mustach *Kas-loh*, Mamie Frank *Woo-nee*, and Rebecca Mace’s 22-year-old friend Annie Frank *Wee-uts*. (At least one other named “Long Valley Frank” somehow missed the census.) Captain Frank’s successor, Captain George’s Indian name was *An-bat-o-ats*, and his wife Maggie George’s name was *Chan-go-up*. They were 49 and 46 years of age respectively, and had a seven-year-old son named George *Mun-o-pa-qeets*. Bushhead, the medicine man who had prescribed Captain Frank’s faulty sweat lodge “cure” appeared on the list as *Am-Kai-hats*, one of the oldest Indians at 51 years of age.

Without authorization from Congress or the president, on October 16, 1907 the Secretary of the Interior withdrew some 120,000 acres from the public domain for a reservation. The temporary new reservation for the Kiababit now formed a rectangle roughly twelve miles by eighteen miles, significantly larger than the four by eight mile piece Churchill and Runke had originally offered the Indians. It took two Executive Orders issued in June 1913 and in July 1917, to secure the enlarged reservation.. While it measured over 189 square miles, it contained some of the driest land within the borders of the United States. Even with a third part of Moccasin Springs, and the newly acquired Point Springs, the Kaibabit only had enough water to irrigate about “10 to 15” of their 120,000 acres and most of that was on lands the Mormon Church had already made available to them nearly twenty years before.²⁷

²⁷ See Findings and Recommendations with Reference to Reorganization Activities for the Paiute Jurisdiction, 30 September 1936, in Bureau of Indian Affairs Records, Accn 1125, b5, f3, UU.

The Secretary's original withdrawal included both Moccasin and Pipe Springs and for a while it looked like it would be the Heatons and the other cowboys who watered their cattle at Pipe Springs who would be removed to make place for Kaibabit. After an initial crisis, and presumably after some massaging of the Indian Office plan on the part of Senators Smoot and Sutherland, the Heaton's were allowed to keep their property at Moccasin, and their right to two-thirds of Moccasin's water. Similarly, the Heatons—who owned forty acres at Pipe Springs and two-thirds of its water—and an unnamed group of cowboys who owned the other third were allowed to continue to exercise their rights, though they would eventually pay fees to graze on reservation lands. This left the Indians with a lot of land but with very little water, creating an increasingly bitter contest for limited desert resources between the Heatons and Kaibabit. The Heatons continued to make available substantial supplies to hungry Indians, through a small store they established in Moccasin and generally tried hard to be kind “as the Gospel required.” Meanwhile the Kaibabit provided labor for the Heatons and allowed them use of reservation lands. Both the Heatons and Kaibabit generally allowed trespasses on each others property but tensions naturally arose at times and especially when the Heatons adjusted the government weir which divided the waters of Moccasin's springs in their own favor. The contest for water from Pipe and Moccasin Springs was caused by “interagency competition” driven by the Bureau of Indian Affairs on behalf of the Indians. Eventually the National Park Service entered the mix on the side of the Heatons and the Mormon Church, to mitigate the power of its sister bureau. In fact, the sale of Pipe to the National Park Service was in part a strategy on behalf of the church,

the Heaton family, and other cowboys to protect Pipe Valley and its limited water from the Indian Office and its Kaibab wards.”²⁸

Despite reoccurring droughts, cowboying in Pipe Valley has never really stopped since James Whitmore arrived there in 1863. The establishment of the reservation increased the cattle business in the region as the Indian Office sought to turn the Kaibab vaqueros into self-supporting cowboys. The initial government outlay included a cow or a bull for each Kaibab man, woman, and child and these were purchased from the Heaton’s herd. By 1910 huge stockade-type cedar corrals like those that had always existed at Pipe were built at “Kaibab,” the small village the Agency built for the Native Americans about a mile from the Mormon village of Moccasin.

***“It Does Not Concern Me Any”: Elizabeth Johnson Colvin,
Pipe Springs, Short Creek and The FLDS***

Winsor Castle was in a dilapidated state when the Heatons acquired it. At some point in the 1890s certain cattle outfits had collectively purchased one-third of Pipe’s water, and since then, transient cowboys and travelers abused the site. Blanche Hicks of Kanab remembered attending a dance for the cowboys in the castle’s courtyard about 1911. She remembered that the doors to the ground floor of the lower building were missing, and that the rooms where Anson and Zenetta Winsor had once made and stored cheese and butter, and where Dee Woolley’s

²⁸ See Martha C. Knack, “Interethnic Competition at Kaibab during the Early Twentieth Century,” *Ethnohistory*, 40: (Spring 1993): 212–245, especially 214; Martha C. Knack, “Church and State in the History of Southern Paiute in Cedar City, Utah,” *Journal of California and Great Basin Anthropology* 19: (1997) 159–178; and Martha C. Knack, *Boundaries Between*, especially 140.

cowboys had once stored their gear, had been turned into a barn where cowboys now kept their horses. Floorboards on the ground level had long since disappeared and rock, dirt, and manure now made up the floor. The three upstairs bedrooms had fared little better. The inner partition walls that had once divided the upper floor of the lower building had been knocked down, apparently to make an indoor dance hall for the cowboys—despite warped planks which made dancing a challenge. In short, the lower building was now totally uninhabitable. Even its veranda was sagging at a dangerous angle. As for the upper building, only the three upstairs bedrooms were fit for use, but transients and coyotes, skunks, rats, rattlesnakes, and other desert creatures had all contributed to making even this living space objectionable. The upper house's veranda was also unstable and tilted perilously toward the ground, and worse, constant leakage from the spring under the parlor floor had rotted and warped those portions of the floor that had not already been ripped out by careless campers and burned for firewood.²⁹ Andrew L. Siler, Jr., was at Winsor Castle in 1902 when Frederick Dellenbaugh visited and commented on the strange experience of observing Siler's family sitting around a gaping hole in the parlor floor as if there were no problem.³⁰

After a few years of neglect, the Heatons, like previous owners of Winsor Castle, found it necessary to make arrangements for caretakers to keep the place from being vandalized and further run-down. The Heatons rented Pipe to struggling families who tried to eke out a living by minimal farming, running a few head of stock, and operating a small hostel "for the traveling public."³¹ From August 1911 to some point in 1914, Orlin F. Colvin and his wife Elizabeth

²⁹ Notes on interview of Blanche Hicks Mace on Pipe Springs, July 1965.

³⁰ Lauritzen, 63–64. In John Peterson's original manuscript, the text indicates that Andrew L. Siler, Jr., and his wife had lived at Winsor Castle.

³¹ C. Leonard Heaton, "Families Who Have Lived at Pipe Springs," in Robert C. Heaton, et al, "Moccasin and Her People," 2:99.

rented Pipe Springs from the Heatons and “kept hotel” for gentile voyagers as well for the extensive Mormon traffic traveling between Utah and the church’s Arizona and Mexican settlements.³² The Colvins had both had hard lives. Elizabeth’s father, Warren M. Johnson, had run Lees Ferry for years, trying to raise a family in abject poverty at that bottleneck on the Utah Road. She had been a plural wife of Isaac V. Carling, Jr., whose sisters Ann Carling Chamberlain and Ellen Carling Chamberlain had spent time hiding at Pipe during the Raid. After Isaac died in 1895, her father cared for her for a short time, but he suffered an accidental fall from a load of hay while riding with Dee Woolley between Kanab and Fredonia and “broke his back, so he was paralyzed from his waisted down.” In desperation Elizabeth took in washing and otherwise scraped by until, in 1901, she drove a wagon a thousand miles from Mt. Carmel to the Big Horn Basin with two small children to attach herself to her brothers. Her wagon carried an old organ that her husband Isaac had rescued from destruction and repaired which would eventually make its way to Pipe Springs.³³

Twice Elizabeth’s age, Orlin Colvin was a former polygamist who was at the time both a divorcee and a widower. Orlin and Elizabeth Colvin apparently met at a dance in the Mormon community in the Big Horn Basin. At these dances Ben Colvin played the fiddle and Elizabeth Johnson Carling accompanied him on her organ. After their marriage, a dam broke above their ranch and an adjacent river “changed channels and flooded through our house.” In desperation, Orlin contracted with some of Elizabeth’s brothers “to build a canal, but the company went broke and they lost all their summers work.” They were so discouraged that they “sold out” and

³² For general information on the Colvins and their time at Pipe Springs, see Elizabeth Johnson Carling Colvin, *Story of My Life* (Salt Lake City: n.p., 1968), BYU, especially 143–147; and various family histories in PSLA, VF, FH, Colvin.

³³ Colvin, *Story of My Life*.

worked on a railroad near Shoshone, Wyoming. Financially destitute, the Colvin's headed back to Utah.³⁴ Elizabeth wrote that she and her new husband had "taken over" Jonathan Heaton's ranch "and run his farm" at Alton in 1910, and that in August 1911 "we went to Pipe Springs, Arizona, as Jonathan Heaton owned that place, too, and [he] wanted us to go and take care of it and make our home there." By 1911 they had five children of their own to complement Elizabeth's son and daughter by Isaac Carling.³⁵ The youngest child, Urban James, was just an infant when the family moved to Pipe Springs, and the "two big ponds in front of the [lower] building" were a constant threat to the toddler as they had been to others before him. One of his siblings remembered that the older children were instructed that if little Urban fell into the ponds that they were to "jump in [and] get him out, no matter what." A favorite family story is that when thus instructed, Urban's sister Vera asked, "But Mama, even if I'm in my Sunday best?"³⁶

Elizabeth wrote that while at Pipe Springs she "cooked meals night and day" noting that there were all "all kinds of people going through, as it was just before World War One." Her guests tended to arrive "early and late" and included "a great many tramps—some that had escaped from jail and some murderers came through. When the war started, they were drafted into the Army." The Colvins brought their organ and placed it in the upper building's newly repaired parlor and before they left they purchased a new piano. Daughter Charlotte remembered evenings "around the piano with mother playing the piano and our dad playing the violin and all of us singing." Charlotte's father often "played the violin for us to dance and we wore our front room floor out twice, dancing on it, each time he had to put in a new floor." (The moisture from the leaking spring below the parlor floor undoubtedly had more to do with the wearing out of the

³⁴ Colvin, *Story of My Life*, especially 129–142.

³⁵ Colvin, *Story of My Life*.

³⁶ Charlotte Olds, "History of Orlin Francis Colvin, Written by Daughter, Charlotte Olds," PSLA, VF, FH, Colvin.

floor than the dancing children). Orlin and Elizabeth's daughter Vera remembered the floors on the ground level of the upper house being damp and that her mother suspected that the water and mold under the floor gave one of her daughters typhoid. Fear of disease from the water seeping into the floorboards eventually caused the family to leave Pipe Springs prematurely. Charlotte Colvin also remembered that her older sister Mary, (called Mamie) played for traveling guests, especially the "general authorities" that passed through. One evening Mamie was "entertaining a room full of people" when young Urban came into the parlor parading with a chamber pot over his head. "Everyone laughed but mother, she was so embarrassed." A proud Mormon mother, Elizabeth wrote:

While we were living at Pipe Springs, Arizona, Susa Young Gates [a daughter of Brigham Young] came one time and stayed a couple of days with us, as she was going through the country visiting different Wards in the Church. She was so thrilled and surprised when she heard our daughter, Mamie, play the piano. She could hardly believe there was such a great and natural musician out in the desert like we were. She gave her a great send-off and thought she should be living in the city where she could be better known. After she got home in Salt Lake, she put an article in the paper praising Mamie in her music.³⁷

The Colvins were deeply committed Mormons, and took repeated trips to the St. George Temple to "work for their Kindred Dead." Their situation had improved and by 1914 they contemplated buying a place in Santa Clara to be closer to temple. On a trip to investigate some

³⁷ Colvin, *Story of My Life*.

property, they stopped at the St. George Temple where the president of the temple, David H. Cannon, recommended that they “go to Short Creek. That is where you belong.” Just then hundreds of gentiles acting on exaggerations of the area’s success with dry farming and promises of access to underground aquifers were rushing to homestead the Short Creek and Pipe Valley regions. By settling in Short Creek, the Colvin’s could help stave off this gentile invasion and preserve part of the heritage of the old Canaan Ranch for a new generation of Latter-day Saints. Viewing the temple president as an inspired priesthood leader, the Colvins immediately accepted the call and “obtained the land by homesteading.” After living at Pipe Springs for three years they “moved over to Short Creek in the year 1914.” Among the last Latter-day Saints to be called to permanently settle in the manner of their “old time religion,” the Colvin’s call had a lasting impact on Mormonism.³⁸ Elizabeth Carling Colvin, though not a polygamist herself, had multiple family members who were and had rebelled against the Woodruff 1890 Manifesto and against the Joseph F. Smith 1904 Manifesto, or “Second Manifesto.” Some of her brothers followed her to Short Creek and in their determination to continue polygamy, they made it a haven for post-manifesto polygamy.³⁹

Apparently on Elizabeth’s recommendation, her brother LeRoy Sunderland Johnson moved to Short Creek, and other ardent polygamists followed—including her brothers Elmer and Price, and a brother-in-law Carling Spencer. They were joined by John W. Woolley, Lorin C. Woolley, and Joseph W. Musser, who along with LeRoy Johnson launched the “Fundamentalist”

³⁸ Colvin, *Story of My Life*, 146–147.

³⁹ Colvin, *Story of My Life*, 86. When Elizabeth’s father Warren M. Johnson first read the Woodruff Manifesto in 1890, he could not understand why God would have him enter “a new and everlasting covenant,” and then terminate it. Elizabeth wrote that when he received word “that the people that were living the Law of Plural Marriage would have to put away their plural wives, and he prayed and studied about it a great deal. It was a sore trial to him.”

movement and often met in Elizabeth's Short Creek home.⁴⁰ LeRoy eventually became president of the Fundamentalist Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints (FLDS Church). A good number of Elizabeth and Orlin Colvin's descendants are today members of this church. Elizabeth and several of her brothers and sisters-in-law, a son-in-law and at least two of her daughters were excommunicated from the LDS Church in 1935, along with "twenty-five or thirty [other] families" for failing to sign a loyalty oath repudiating plural marriage. The twin polygamist citadels that grew out of the Short Creek settlement, the contiguous border communities of Hildale, Utah and Colorado City, Arizona, literally straddled the line, so that by taking a few steps a hunted polygamist could move from one state's jurisdiction to the other. Unless both states worked in tandem, arrest was impossible. (Both states did cooperate in mass arrests in the Short Creek Raid of 1953.) The Grand Canyon and the logistical problems of the Arizona Strip still presented formidable obstacles. In 1954 Elizabeth's daughter Vera Colvin Black and her family were targeted by the State of Utah as it continued its attempt to stomp out polygamy. In 1956, Vera's children were placed in foster homes because her husband, Leonard Black, had multiple wives. In 1957, Vera Colvin and her husband "signed a statement agreeing to no longer live polygamy, making it possible for their children to come home." The FLDS are keenly aware that Brigham Young established a "compound" at nearby Pipe Springs where he could escape

⁴⁰ In modern Mormonism, fundamentalism is a term used to refer to those who still practice polygamy. Since Joseph F. Smith issued the 1904 manifesto, those who entered new plural marriages have been liable to excommunication, and to this day when practicing Fundamentalists are found in the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints they are promptly excommunicated. Members of the mainstream church generally do not consider Fundamentalists to be Mormons, despite Fundamentalists' belief in the *Book of Mormon* and refer to themselves as Mormon. In general conference in November 1998, Gordon B. Hinckley, the Prophet-President of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints said: "I wish to state categorically that this Church has nothing whatever to do with those practicing polygamy. They are not members of this Church. . . . If any of our members are found to be practicing plural marriage, they are excommunicated, the most serious penalty the Church can impose. . . . There is no such thing as a 'Mormon Fundamentalist.' It is a contradiction to use the two words together." *Ensign*, November 1998, 71-72.

persecution from the north by strategically using the Utah-Arizona line as protection from jurisdictional persecution.⁴¹

Not long after the Colvins moved out of Winsor Castle to escape the disease-infested floorboards in Pipe's parlor to start a new life in Short Creek, Will and Sarah Rust rented Pipe Springs from the Heatons for \$10.00 a month and lived there from 1914 to 1917. Rust noted in his autobiography that "tourist travel" in the region was slowly picking up, and since he expected it to dramatically increase, he tried to purchase Pipe Springs and transform it into a full-fledged hotel, "but the Heatons refused to sell." Undaunted, he wrote that in an attempt to cash in on the rising "tourist travel" he and Sarah "went to Salt Lake and bought some second hand iron beds and [a] fancy red sofa and chairs from a hotel that was selling out." Despite the wet and moldy problems hiding under the parlor floor, Rust wrote that "in the big living room of the old Pipe Springs Fort the red sofa and chairs looked very elegant and refined. Tourists traveling through there on their way to Cedar City, St. George, and Hurricane would stop for meals or stay over night [as] there was no other road to those points." In addition to running Pipe's makeshift hotel, Rust ran a herd of goats at Short Creek and "south of Pipe Springs Valley."⁴²

Will Rust and his brother-in-law, Jacob M. Lauritzen, played an important role in attempting the "reclamation of the Land of Canaan."⁴³ Rust and Lauritzen were representative of

⁴¹ For general information on the settlement of Short Creek, the rise of Fundamentalism there, and the roles played by Elizabeth and her family in it, as well as those played by her friends John Woolley, Lorin C. Woolley, and Joseph W. Musser, see Elizabeth Colvin, *Story of My Life*, especially 143–164; J. Max Anderson, *The Polygamy Story: Fiction and Fact* (Salt Lake City, UT: Publishers Press, 1979); Benjamin G. Bristline, *The Polygamists: A History of Colorado City, Arizona* ([Scottsdale, AZ]: Agreka, LLC, 2004), especially 21, and 125; Benjamin G. Bistline, *Colorado City Polygamists: An Inside Look for the Outsider* ([Scottsdale, AZ]: Agreka, LLC, 2004), especially 33–35, 37, and 65; Brian C. Hales, *Modern Polygamy and Mormon Fundamentalism: The Generations after the Manifesto* (Salt Lake City: Greg Kofford Books, 2006); Martha Sonntag Bradley, *Kidnapped from That Land: The Government Raids on the Short Creek Polygamists* (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1998), especially 56–58, and 225; and *San Juan Record*, 12 September 1935, 3, UDN.

⁴² William Slauson Rust, "The Story of My Life," 9–10, CHL.

⁴³ Rust and Lauritzen had married two sisters, respectively Sarah and Annie Eliza Gardner. See new.familysearch.org.²⁰⁸

a cadre of schemers seeking to transform the economic base of Brigham Young's old "land of Canaan" from the double-pronged sheep and cattle industry, to something much more economically viable and diverse. By 1908 it seemed like little had changed on the Arizona Strip, for in September of that year James Andrus, who had directed the Mormon militia to Pipe in the wake of the killings of Whitmore and McIntyre in 1866, was still directing the biennial roundups at Winsor Castle some forty-two years later. But the worn out range and the old pioneer economy were both crying for new life. On September 24, 1908, the *Richfield Reaper* discussed the scarcity of money in Dixie and on the Arizona Strip and noted that a huge roundup "under the direction of James Andrews of St George" was virtually the only evidence of financial activity in the entire region.⁴⁴

John Wesley Powell was convinced that "reclaiming lands through irrigation" was the only way much of the west could sustain viable populations. The great droughts of the 1890s called much attention to Powell's ideas and on June 17, 1902, President Theodore Roosevelt signed the Reclamation Act into law, which led "to the eventual damming of nearly every major western river." The Reclamation Act set aside funds raised by the sale of public lands for the construction and maintenance of irrigation projects designed to make huge parcels of semi-arid lands productive in sixteen western states and mandated that public lands "reclaimed" would in turn be sold and the proceeds put back into a revolving fund that would pay for additional projects. To administer the program, the Secretary of the Interior created the United States Reclamation Service inside Powell's United States Geological Survey. By 1907 the Reclamation Service became a separate organization within the Department of the Interior.⁴⁵ The town of

⁴⁴ *Richfield Reaper*, September 24, 1908, 3, UDN.

⁴⁵ Miss Dewey Farnsworth, "Arid Regions," A Paper Read Before the Scientific Research Society, in *Beaver City Press*, June 5, 1908, 1, UDN;

Hurricane, Utah—itself a product of reclamation—had shown that such a project was possible, at least on a small scale. Between 1893 and 1905, a 7.5 mile canal was built (parts of which still cling to the face of the Hurricane Cliffs) bringing water from a dam on the Virgin River to the Hurricane Bench. The canal made the town of Hurricane possible, by irrigating some 2,000 acres of prime orchard and farm lands around it.⁴⁶

In 1909 Rust and Lauritzen proposed to build a 250-foot-high dam in the Virgin Narrows (now in Zion National Park) where sandstone cliffs tower hundreds of feet high and only 30 to 50 feet apart on either side of the Virgin River. They visualized that water from this dam would be brought into the vast deserts south of the Vermilion Cliffs by tunneling through six miles of solid rock and bringing it down Short Creek Canyon into a massive desert reservoir to be called Short Creek Lake. The reservoir was to cover “5358 acres, with a capacity of 90,757 acre feet of water.” This water, it was estimated, would bring over 100,000 acres from the Hurricane Cliffs to Kanab Gulch, including the Pipe Valley, into cultivation. They reasoned that it would turn the whole region into a virtual paradise, making many thousands of homes possible in the Canaan and Pipe Springs desert. Between 1909 and 1913, Lauritzen and Rust put together a company called the Short Creek Irrigation Project, backed by Chicago investors who investigated the feasibility of the plan that promised the “reclamation [of] the bench land between Caanan Ranch [sic] [a]nd Pipe Springs” and to transform the land which cattle had turned into giant beds of tumbleweed “into fruit land of the very best” quality. Over time the massive reclamation project was known by various names including the Virgin River Irrigation Project, the Short Creek

<http://www.wapa.gov/UGP/powermarketing/2021PMI/HistoricalDocs/ReclamationAct.1902.pdf>;
http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Newlands_Reclamation_Act; and <http://www.usbr.gov/history/borhist.html>.

⁴⁶ *Deseret News*, April 15, 1905, 17, UDN; and Leila Larson, “The Origin and Growth of Hurricane,” St. George, Utah, Works Project Administration, WCL.

Irrigation Project, and the Pipe Springs Valley Project and was characterized by Utah boosters as having the potential to become the largest reclamation project in the history of the United States.⁴⁷ Plans included a network of tunnels, cement canals, and giant power plants to generate electric power for new settlements expected to be established once the water arrived.

Key to the project was the development of railroad lines to bring in settlers and to ship produce to national markets. One evolving scenario called for a line extending from the “Salt Lake Route” terminus at Lund, reaching through Cedar City to Kingman, Arizona, with a side spur extending from St. George to Pipe Springs, Kanab, and the north rim of the Grand Canyon. If built, Pipe’s cattle could be shipped directly to eastern markets without the usual costly desert drives to the existing railheads at Modena, Lund, and Marysvale. The proposed line would bring tourists to the Grand Canyon while hauling away timber from the Kaibab National Forest which was touted as “the largest virgin forest in the United States, there being approximately 3,000,000,000 feet of merchantable standing timber.”⁴⁸ By 1910 the two partners signed Easton & Gearon, a Chicago company, “to finance the project for a one third interest” in its profits.⁴⁹ According to Lauritzen, the estimated cost of the project was \$5,000,000. Easton and Gearon were adamant that “the capital required . . . could not be secured . . . unless a railroad would penetrate the territory and assure rapid settlement and markets for produce raised” and proposed surveying two potential spurs extending to the North Rim. However, “neither the Union Pacific

⁴⁷ *Ogden Standard*, September 9, 1909, 4, UDN; *Washington County News*, September 16, 1909, 3, December 30, 1909, 1, February 10, 1910, 1, and December 14, 1911, 6, UDN; *Salt Lake Herald*, December 30, 1909, 3, UDN; and *Salt Lake Herald*, May 22, 1910, 14, CALOC; and *Richfield Reaper*, May 9, 1911, 1, UDN.

⁴⁸ *Washington County News*, February 10, 1910, 1, UDN; *Eastern Utah Advocate*, July 14, 1910, 3, UDN; and *Richfield Reaper*, May 9, 1911, 1, UDN; and *Ogden Standard*, June 2, 1915, 1, UDN.

⁴⁹ Lauritzen, 61. M. B. Gearon and Adolph H. Easter whose office was in “the Unity Building” in Chicago evidently represented “other Chicago capitalists who will finance the project.” *Washington County News*, May 26, 1910, UDN.

nor the Denver Rio Grand thought it profitable to run another track away from the mainline just to get to this little town [Kanab] on the edge of nowhere.”⁵⁰

Rust left for Chicago early in 1911, planning to spend much of the spring there, but Gearon became ill and died, which immediately “put a damper on the project.” Gearon’s Chicago partners demanded control of vast water claims Lauritzen had obtained from Utah, which Lauritzen refused to give up. On Lauritzen’s refusal to sell his water rights, the eastern investors withdrew their funds, and “the company went broke and that was the end of the project.”⁵¹ While the Pipe Springs Valley Project was never brought to fruition, half a century later a dam was indeed put in at Glen Canyon, but rather than piping its water into House Rock Valley, it created the mammoth man-made lake named for John Wesley Powell. In 1910 the *Tribune* acknowledged that these projects were “gigantic” but captured the “reclaiming” spirit of the times by postulating that “the increase of population” in America demanded “that not many years will elapse before the Colorado [and Virgin rivers] will be compelled to do something for humanity aside from [providing] unparalleled scenic attractions.”⁵²

Like other Latter-day Saint desert dwellers, Lauritzen and Rust were not easily discouraged and initially salvaged a sliver of their project by bringing in floodwaters from the top of Canaan Mountain to their vaunted Short Creek Lake, by way of Short Creek Canyon. They did this by enlisting adventurers from the Virgin River settlements to help them scrape out ditches and build flumes over washes and sand fields to irrigate 500 rather than 100,000 acres.

⁵⁰ Lauritzen, 64; *Washington County News*, May 26, 1910, and June 16, 1910, 1, UDN; George Otis Smith, Director United States Geological Survey, to the Honorable Secretary of Interior, April 28, 1910, in *United States Geological Survey, Bulletin 623: Petroleum Withdrawals and Restorations Affecting the Public Domain* (Washington: Government Printing Office, 1917), 176; and *Southern Utah News*, March 4, 2009, <http://www.sunews.net/article.cfm?articleID=52>.

⁵¹ Rust, *Story of My Life*, 8; and *Richfield Reaper*, May 9, 1911, 1, UDN.

⁵² *Salt Lake Tribune*, January 23, 1910, CALOC.

Flash floods after desert freshets washed away their flumes and filled their ditches with sand, but at first neither they nor the people of Utah gave up hope. As the *Richfield Reaper* tried to uphold the honor of the town's two former inhabitants and emphasized the hope that the profit realized from this "small part of the original scheme of reclaiming thousands of acres of land," would eventually "be used to develop the big part of the project." The St. George newspaper voiced this same optimism, promising that in the short run, Short Creek Lake would "hold enough water to irrigate 2500 acres of land." The *Washington County News* postulated that Lauritzen and Rust's tiny irrigation project was but "*the beginning of the reclamation of the land of Canaan* and that this small project will prove the opening wedge for the building of the larger project which would mean so much to this part of the state."⁵³ A visiting Salt Lake automobile tourist commented in an article published on November 16, 1911, that the impact of the reclamation project on Pipe Springs "will turn the famous cattle range, which has its center at Pipe springs, far-famed in the early history of Utah and northern Arizona, into a garden of fertility." At the same time he noted," but the cattle are not moving off yet—that tunnel has not been bored and the [i]ron rails of steam transportation have not been laid to its border." In summarizing the history of the site, he called it "famous" for its "connection with the years of struggle with marauding bands of bad Indians[.] It was there that Dr. Whitmore and his party were so foully murdered and where persecuted fugitives from the north found shelter within its fortress walls[.]

⁵³ *Richfield Reaper*, May 9, 1911, 1, and September 7, 1911, 1, both UDN; *Salt Lake Herald*, October 26, 1911, 6, UDN; and *Washington County News*, November 2, 1911, 2, and December 14, 1911, 6, both UDN, italics mine.

In strange contrast to its general appearance and surroundings a western telegraph sign protrudes boldly into the sunlight—but the telegraph keys have long since been silent.”⁵⁴

⁵⁴ *Washington County News*, November 16, 1911, UDN; and “Wesley Edward King,” in Press Club of Salt Lake City, *Men of Affairs in the State of Utah: A Newspaper Reference Work* (Salt Lake City: Western Printing Company, 1914), unpaginated. Wesley King, a prominent non-Mormon Salt Lake attorney, freemason, founding member of the Salt Lake Rotary Club, and influential member of the Salt Lake Commercial Club took an epic automobile trip from Salt Lake to Kanab, and across the Pipe Springs desert to St. George and then back to Salt Lake City. Sponsored by Dee Woolley, King’s trip was meant to draw other motorists into the area.

Chapter 17

Corridors to the Future: Pipe Spring, its Roads, and the Creation of a National Monument

“Automobiles Conquer [the] Wilds of Dixie Land”

To encourage tourists to see the Grand Canyon from its north rim, Woolley’s plan required roads, automobiles, railroads, trains, way stations (with drinking water, restrooms, hotels and restaurants), and eventually gasoline stations and mechanic shops for auto repairs. Dee and Flora’s time at Pipe Springs had given them practical knowledge of how to provide for the traveling public. Dee established his Grand Canyon Transportation Company, commenced his tramway, pioneered the Bright Angel Trail, turned his Kanab homes into hostels, and purchased other Kanab buildings to transform into hotels. He and his son-in-law Dave Rust established a string of pack horses and mules along with experienced cowboy guides that could be hired to take people to and from the Canyon. His slogan, “Get the World to come and see our Country!” was to inspire others to build and improve roads and otherwise participate in his plan for economic development in Kane County and the eastern half of the Arizona Strip.¹

Early on, the Kanab Stake president understood that the automobile was the wave of the future. His nephew, Edwin Gordon Woolley, Jr. (called Gordon), owned several and sometime

¹ See Swanson; *Los Angeles Herald*, September 7, 1905, 3, CDNC; [Elizabeth Jensen], “The Tourist Industry Continued,” WSC, b1, f8; and related material throughout WSC.

before 1909 President Woolley had taken his very first automobile ride in Gordon's brand new roadster. He proposed that the State of Utah construct a road from Preston, Idaho, to Fredonia, Arizona. He envisioned it as "the backbone highway of the state" designed to bring tourists into his southern "treasure house." He pushed his nephew Gordon to join the Salt Lake Automobile Club, an organization "composed of men who ha[d] pledged their support and effort to good roads." Meanwhile he pioneered a road from Marysvale, through Kanab, to the north rim of the Grand Canyon, which could bring Gordon's car to the very brink of the awesome crevasse. It took some convincing to get his nephew to hazard a vehicle on such a journey, for "until 1908, not a single mile of paved rural highway existed" in all of America and even "the rough pioneer wagon trails had fallen into extreme disrepair with the extension of railroad lines." Incredibly rough roads "and the fragile unreliability of those first automobiles made every trip a major undertaking." Around 1904, a salesman had driven a motorcar as far south as Panguitch. The vehicle was marooned, however, and its owner had to ship it back north by freight-wagon and train. Uncle Dee wanted his nephew to demonstrate that motorcars could make the journey from population centers in northern Utah to the very edge of the Grand Canyon. The younger Woolley apparently purchased a brand new Thomas Flyer especially for the trip. He took possession of it just two weeks before he ventured toward the Kanab wilderness on June 19, 1909. The Flyer reportedly cost him \$4,500 and was said to be the fastest car to ever terrorize the streets of Salt Lake City.

For safety and companionship, Gordon convinced his brother-in-law, David A. Affleck, to drive to the Grand Canyon in tandem with him, in Affleck's brand new Locomobile, which was the first motorcar equipped with a front-mounted, water-cooled engine. The 1909 models of both the Thomas Flyer and the Locomobile were chain-driven touring cars and had steering

wheels on the right side. Like most cars of the age they were started by hand cranks. Affleck's Locomobile touted forty horse power while Woolley's Flyer kicked up great clouds of dust with seventy. Both were equipped with state of the art Warner speedometers which doubled as odometers. Coming to view the experiment as a grand adventure, both automobile owners decided to make a vacation of it. Gordon Woolley took his wife and children and Affleck was accompanied by his chauffeur and a young adult sister-in-law.

The caravan of two left Salt Lake City on Saturday June 19, 1909, with a pile of hand-drawn maps sketched by Dee Woolley as their only guide. Since no gasoline was available south of Provo, Dee shipped fuel ahead by rail. "Two five-gallon cans" were cached every thirty miles along the route while President Woolley's friends, fellow boosters and ecclesiastical associates smoothed out rough spots to prepare the way for the expensive machines. Gordon wrote: "Our chief trouble all along was taking out high centers, obstructions in the middle of the road—sagebrush, stumps and rocks—which could be negotiated with a wagon all right, but which we had to remove. We dug out hundreds of stumps, going and coming." One of the greatest obstacles they encountered was an enormous sand dune north of Kanab "where even a horse and wagon could get stuck." When the autos with their skinny tires reached the sand, Uncle Dee himself came to the rescue by bringing out "a long, heavy tarpaulin which he stretched out in front of the cars." After the horseless carriages drove across it, "he dragged the canvas around in front of them again and again" until they made it through. Dave Rust wrote that the naysayers they encountered en route "were worse than the roads." "All along," he said, the company was "met with that old 'You'll never get there,' both from those who knew and those who didn't know the requirements of automobiles."

All through southern Utah, startled villagers, farmers, ranchers and Native Americans were drawn by the strange sounds of internal combustion engines and honking horns to see the phenomenon. Gordon reported to Dee's publicist at the *Salt Lake Herald* that on the fourth day out from Salt Lake they reached Kanab. He wrote: "Our entrance into Kanab was in the nature of a triumphal procession. The whole town turned out, and all night long scores of curious people visited the shed where we put up the cars. We made several drives out of Kanab with people of that place, and they were immensely tickled." One of Dee's daughters described that when "the long, loud honk was finally heard, as the party approached the outskirts of town . . . everyone rushed into the street to get a glimpse. . . . Father sat upon the engine, waving his hat and shouting, 'Hurrah! I told you so!' . . . There were not a dozen people in town who had ever seen an automobile before."

One of the smallest newspapers in America, the *Kanab Lone Cedar*, reported that "The impossible had happened" when "the visit of the 'First devil wagon to reach Kanab.'" After rest and repairs in Kanab, Gordon Woolley, Affleck, and their entourage—now joined by Uncle Dee—headed out to Bright Angel Point, where President Woolley had already dispatched a pair of wagons loaded with passengers, provisions, and camping equipment escorted by mounted riders. The Warner speedometers measured exactly "430 [and] 4-10ths miles" from Salt Lake City to "the very rim of the canyon" at Bright Angel Point, which they reached on the ninth day out. According to a precise log kept by the autoists, the trip from Salt Lake City to Bright Angel took exactly 39 hours and 20 minutes of actual motoring. In a report published by his uncle's publicist at the *Salt Lake Herald*, Gordon reported that Bright Angel Point was "directly across the Colorado River from the famous El T[ovar] hotel, the only resort of its kind in the world," which "practically overhangs the gorge" and was reached by a 40 mile extension of the Santa Fe

Rail Road. Gordon explained that Bright Angle Point was one of five “fingers” or promontories on the North Rim separated by “immense gorges” which provided “magnificent views” of the canyon. These also included Powell’s Plateau, Point Sublime, Basin Point, and Greenland Point. The *Herald* plugged Woolley and Rust’s “tramway across the river” where people could cross from the south rim to the north “in a wire basket swung on two steel cables and operated by a windlass or gasoline engine.”

On Gordon’s return trip he and his Salt Lake entourage backtracked the same 430 miles to the city, reaching home on July 6, eighteen days after their departure. Though the Salt Lake papers announced they had been forced to “overcome some gigantic difficulties” Gordon wrote that he returned “sunburned, hard as nails and feeling fit as a fiddle.” Each vehicle made the entire trip on only one set of tires, which were later exhibited by the US Rubber Company to demonstrate the durability of their product. Both motorcars experienced minor mechanical difficulties en route but “there were no breakdowns that were not easily repaired by the tools taken along.” After a barrage of newspaper articles in the Salt Lake papers congratulating Dee and his nephew on the success of their endeavor, the Woolleys were besieged by requests for information from automobile and tourism enthusiasts who wanted to duplicate the trip over what they were now calling “the Woolley route.” According to the *Salt Lake Herald*, the first to follow their tracks to Bright Angel left Salt Lake less than a week after Gordon returned to the city. Among these intrepid tourists were Apostle David O. McKay and future apostle Stephen L Richards of the church’s General Sunday School Presidency, who meant to combine church business with pleasure as they headed for the North Rim. A host of others soon followed. Whenever they did, President Woolley volunteered to guide the travelers from Kanab to the rim. Those who dared “get the crowning experience of their automobile careers” by “push[ing their]

front wheels to the very edge of the Grand canyon of Arizona from the north side” found that Wooley was determined to accompany them “for the sheer joy of realizing that at last the Automobile Pioneers [he dreamed of] had come.”²

While the 1909 Woolley route bypassed Pipe Springs, the automobile and the needs of the traveling public journeying to and from the North Rim would transform the future of Winsor Castle at Pipe Springs and save the old structure from dilapidation. The fort’s water, its road, its shade, and even its privy guaranteed that Brigham’s Bastion would be preserved and eventually turned into a national monument. Nine months after the Woolley-Affleck excursion to the North Rim, Dave Rust wrote a promotional article in the church’s *Improvement Era* called “From Salt Lake to the Grand Canyon.” He spoke of Uncle Dee’s prophecy that their trip was a “forerunner to a railroad” or highway that would be opened to the North Rim. Woolley’s publicist at the *Salt Lake Herald*, used the byline “AUTOMOBILES CONQUER WILDS OF DIXIE LAND,” emphasizing the dollar sign. The opening of roads for automobiles and tourism had the potential to bring money and economic development to the whole region. Dave Rust felt certain he and his father-in-law were pioneering a new age, and he ended his *Improvement Era* article by assuring his readers that “pioneers have always” intuitively known what kind of foundation to build for the future. Within days of triumphantly returning to Kanab with the automobiles from the North

² *Goodwin’s Weekly*, June 12, 1909, 12; UDN; *Salt Lake Telegram*, June 19, 1909, 8, UDN; *Salt Lake Herald*, July 8, 1909, 1 and 3, and July 11, 1909, 22, UDN; *Salt Lake Tribune*, July 8, 1909, 8, CALOC; *Salt Lake Tribune*, July 18, 1909, 19, and August 31, 1913, 12, UDN; *Ogden Standard*, July 9, 1909, 8; *Inter-Mountain Republican* (Salt Lake City), August 19, 1909, 4; David D. Rust, “From Salt Lake to the Grand Canyon,” *Improvement Era* 13 (1910): 408–412; William R. Palmer, “Pioneers of Southern Utah: Edwin D. Woolley, Jr.,” *Instructor*, 80 (March 1945): 111; *Southern Utah News*, March 4, 2009, <http://www.sunews.net/article.cfm?articleID=52>; Helen B. Gibbons, “The 3 m.p.h. Adventure,” in *Deseret News*, May 8, 1980, <http://news.google.com/newspapers?nid=336&dat=19800508&id=LjRTAAAIBAJ&sjid=GoMDAAAIBAJ&pg=5017,2454111>; Mary Woolley Chamberlain, “Sketch of the Life of Edwin Dilworth Woolley, Jr.,” 9–11; Elsie Carroll, *History of Kane County*, 95–98; Adonis Robinson, *History of Kane County*, 185–192; Swanson, 61–64; McKoy, *Administrative History of Pipe Spring*, 86; and Angus M. Woodbury, *A History of Southern Utah and Its National Parks UHQ* 12 (1944): 111–222, (revised and reprinted, 1950), 193–194.

Rim, Dee Woolley reported the trip's success to Arizona's delegate to congress, Ralph H. Cameron, and petitioned him "to secure government aid in the construction of a road from Kanab . . . to the northern rim of the Grand Canyon, near the head of Bright Angel Peak." Almost immediately, Cameron took the issue up with the US Forest Service, which now managed much of the Kaibab Plateau.³

Together the Woolley-Affleck automobile excursion to the North Rim and Lauritzen and Rust's near success in almost pulling off the Pipe Springs Valley Irrigation Project seem to have played a role in exciting southern Utah about the potential of bringing roads and railroads into the region. Between 1911 and 1913, convicts from Utah's state penitentiary and other men hired by the Utah State Road Commissioner had pounded out a serviceable road for automobiles through the Black Ridge Gorge between Cedar City and St. George. During the summer of 1913, southern Utah rejoiced that the newly opened road would facilitate the "freighting of fruit out of Dixie," and would bring tourists and cattle buyers into "that section without difficulty." In August 1913, Cedar City's *Iron County Record* observed that "a few months ago it was next to impossible for a farm wagon to pass" between that place and St. George, "but today the roads are in splendid condition for auto travel." A cordial invitation was extended to autoists to visit St. George's Fruit District and many came to St. George to enjoy a special Pioneer Day celebration on July 24, 1913 (Utah's Pioneer Day celebrated the arrival of the Mormons in "the Promised Land").⁴ Dee Woolley seized the moment and laid before the State Road Commission maps and plans to build "an auto road to the Grand Canyon." The road, he and other Grand Canyon zealots promised, would eventually induce both the Union Pacific and the Denver & Rio Grande

³ *Coconino Sun*, August 6, 1909, 2, CALOC.

⁴ *Iron County Record*, August 8, 1913, 2, UDN.

railroads to extend their respective lines from Lund and Marysvale. Woolley was just beginning to envision a road leading from Yellowstone to the Grand Canyon to draw that traffic to Utah and the Arizona Strip. Cities, towns, and villages all along the route would be built up by such a road, not to mention what it would do for Woolley's tramway, hotels, and guide service. Even as they sat, "the trail south" was "being put into good shape by the counties through which it runs, with the assistance from convicts."⁵

Woolley had his road-boosting counterparts up and down the corridor who similarly dreamed of the commerce tourists would bring to their communities. In October 1913 the *Ogden Standard* told of how capitalists from Utah, Idaho, and Arizona were "combining" to build "a magnificent automobile highway from the Grand Canyon of the Colorado to Salt Lake and thence to Yellowstone park" and that "some of the most influential financiers in the west [were] behind it." The *Standard* reported that the "plan" for the highway was "one of [great] magnitude and its fruition will give to the country the most wonderful highway in the world, embracing scenic attractions ranging from the almost diabolically rugged, through the picturesque and into the peacefully pastoral." One of the "great features" of the proposed road was "to bridge the Grand Canyon with steel—a thing never dreamed of until this project came into view." The paper explained how "eminent engineers" had "examined into the feasibility of stretching a steel structure across the mighty chasm," connecting the North Rim with points further south.⁶

A year later, in July 1914, Dee Woolley, Jonathan Heaton, and others met in Hurricane and organized a "Five-County Road Convention" to take in-hand the process of generating interest, funds, and plans for immediate action on Woolley's road. Hurricane appears to have

⁵ *Washington County News*, July 24, 1913, 1 and 4, UDN.

⁶ *Ogden Standard*, October 3, 1913, 10, UDN.

been selected because it was central to the road's intention of reaching the Grand Canyon, it lay at the foot of the road's biggest challenge—the Hurricane Fault—and Hurricane was symbolic of the spirit of the times, since it was built entirely upon principles of reclamation. In front of a crowded hall in Hurricane, Jonathan Heaton encouraged support for the Grand Canyon Highway and reclamation by drawing a verbal “picture of the ‘strip’ that made it a perfect paradise for the dry farmer and rancher.” A temporary organization “was effected to start the business” in which “E D Woolley of Kanab, E. H Snow of St George and Amos Workman of Hurricane were elected a committee to effect a permanent organization.”⁷

From the start, Pipe Springs and its water were central to the project, and in fact it appears that some of the very first work done between Hurricane and the North Rim on what Woolley's organization began calling “the Utah-Grand Canyon Highway” was commenced at Pipe Springs. Knowing what the project could mean to himself and his family, Jonathan Heaton took an early interest in the work. Hardly three weeks after the organization meeting at Hurricane, the *Mohave County Miner* reported that

Jonathan Heaton of Moccasin, the member of the standing committee for the Utah-Grand Canyon Highway, representing Mohave county, Ariz., will take men and teams and equipment, this week, sufficient to construct the road from Pipe Springs to the Utah Arizona line, which he expects to have completed in about ten days time. The Highway committee of Hurricane will send a sufficient number of men and equipment to make a good auto road from the top of the hill at Hurricane to the Utah-Arizona line, meeting Mr. Heaton.

⁷ *Washington County News*, July 23, 1914, 1, UDN.

Through Woolley, the Kaibab National Forest was on board and *The Miner* similarly announced that “the forest dept has a gang of men at the rim of the Canyon” preparing to work a road back toward Pipe Springs.⁸ Part of the hurry for getting the road in shape was that a promotional caravan of Grand Canyon auto tourists tried the route out in September. As the autoists and their strange machines passed through, mass meetings were held in towns like Beaver, Parowan, and Cedar City where large crowds turned out and each town’s commercial clubs pledged themselves “to urge good roads.”⁹ Despite the 1914 season’s work on the roads, the motorists found the “highway” treacherous and far from adequate. In January 1915 there was urging for “more work” on the Grand Canyon Highway. That month the *Iron County Record* argued that “in Kane, Washington and Iron counties the completion of the Grand Canyon highway is an industrial necessity to get products out of that country until such time as the railroad penetrates to the Kaibab forest.” The *Record* averred that the people had finally “awakened to the fact that a good [motor] road is a mighty fine substitute [for a railroad] and that big motor trucks . . . and good roads will solve Dixie transportation problems to a great extent.”¹⁰ In another article entitled “A Splendid Boost,” the Cedar City paper called on its sister newspapers to “consecrate themselves” to furthering the railroad spawning highway, “for only by a long pull together can it be accomplished.”¹¹

Excitement for Woolley’s Grand Canyon Highway began to take on a fervor that was almost religious in nature. Indeed, some of the propoganda made frequent reference to “the

⁸ *Washington County News*, August 6, 1914, 1, UDN.

⁹ *Washington County News*, August 6, 1914, 1, UDN; and *Washington County News*, September 17, 1914, 1, UDN.

¹⁰ *Iron County Record*, January 8, 1915, 1, UDN.

¹¹ *Iron County Record*, January 8, 1915, 1, UDN.

LORD,” “Father Abraham,” “Brother Brigham,” “the Land of Canaan,” and “Consecration” and packed a spiritual-economic flavor the area had not seen since Young preached Cooperation and the United Order. One newspaper man writing from Beaver illustrates the phenomenon in an article entitled “Great Awakening in Southern Utah.” Using words that fit a religious revival as well as an economic resurgence, he wrote, “It strikes me that there is a wave of awakening interest in industrial affairs sweeping over southern Utah that will make 1915 the biggest year in the history of the section.” The people, “are awake, they are watchful and they are affirmatively active[.] They seem to have shaken off indifference and not only are they using efforts to develop resources on their own account, but they are meeting the advances of outside capital with a spirit of intelligent cooperation that unquestionably marks a new era for the country.” He spoke of “revival” and wrote that he had long held “an abiding faith in this country[.] but on this trip I became decidedly enthusiastic.”¹² Max Weber, R. H. Tawny, and Richard L. Bushman have all written of the transformation of the spiritual-economic focus of the Puritans to one primarily economic in nature, while still maintaining the language and forms of the earlier era. It seems something similar was occurring here, as Brigham Young’s people, in a new time and with a transformed religion, adapted old principles, fervors, and language to their current economic situation.¹³ As part of this transformation, instead of preparing to fight the gentiles or trying to physically or economically secede from the larger American community, they now sought to entice non-Mormon capitalists into the very region they once built bastions to bar them from.

¹² *Washington County News*, January 14, 1915, 1, UDN.

¹³ Max Weber, *The Protestant Work Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism*, trans. Talcott Parsons, (London: G. Allen & Unwin, Ltd., [1930]); R. H. Tawney, *Religion and the Rise of Capitalism: A Historical Study* (New York: Harcourt, Brace and Co., 1926); and Richard L. Bushman, *From Puritan to Yankee: Character and the Social Order in Connecticut, 1690–1765* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1967).

Just as certain Mormon cities (and their bishops and stake presidents) had once competed in making donations to the temple, they now vied to outdo each other in financial contributions to the highway or in actual labor on the road. Committees of self-appointed missionaries struck out to raise funds for the Grand Canyon Highway. When Washington and Iron Counties chided Kane for not donating as much or as quickly as they did, Kane County rose up in righteous indignation. “‘Uncle D.’ Woolley headed the list with a donation of \$200,” and outdid himself by asking “the privilege of putting Cedar Ridge in shape for auto travel in addition to his [cash] subscription.” Other than the Hurricane Cliff itself, Cedar Ridge was the biggest obstacle to automobile travel on the Hurricane Plateau, and personally handling that part of the road was a major contribution. Gurnsey Brown donated 10,000 feet of lumber for bridge building, and widow [Rebecca] Mace of Kanab gave \$10. In fact, it seemed that everyone—rich or poor—was eager to contribute. Many offered to assist by getting out with their teams and helping to build the highway. Not to be outdone now by their civic rivals in Kanab, the people of Long Valley pled with the donation collectors “to go over and hold a [donation] meeting with them. Some people from over the line in Arizona [undoubtedly including the Heatons also] gave good liberal amounts.” The donation raisers reported that “on our way home we saw a force of men and teams from Hurricane building the highway out by Gould’s shearing corrall [and] in La Verkin the citizens were out working roads. In Toquerville nearly all the male population was out with their teams, making grade, and putting in culverts.” Young’s followers now complained that “at present all tourist travel misses this part of the state. We will, no doubt, get a great many [gentile travelers] when the State and Grand Canyon Highway is completed but not until we get a chance to draw directly on the Lincoln Highway and Millard Trail will we get anything like our full

share.”¹⁴ How different the spirit of the times now were from that of the early 1870s when genteel newspaperman J.H. Beadle felt obliged to disguise himself as a Navajo to travel these very roads.

A bill “asking for \$50,000 to complete the Grand Canyon Highway” was about to be introduced in the Utah House of Representatives early in 1915.¹⁵ By now the planned road was also sometimes called the Yellowstone-Grand Canyon highway, or the Utah-Grand Canyon Highway, or the State Grand Canyon Highway¹⁶ and boosters were pushing “a good road built in the form of a loop from Salt Lake to Kanab, the southgoing route being west of the mountain range by way of Toquerville, and the returning route being through Panguitch on the east side.” Having two spurs not only made it “an ideal route for tourists,” but opened up more of the state for economic development.¹⁷ Meanwhile Dee Woolley was diligent. He sent his son Bert, and son-in-law Dave Rust to Salt Lake to purchase automobiles on behalf of his Grand Canyon Transportation Company “for the establishment of a tourist line from Cedar City or perhaps Lund to the Grand Canyon and return.” While in the city they solicited the use of more “state convicts in the completion of the State and Grand Canyon highway to the Arizona line.”¹⁸ Woolley himself was “chairman of the Kane county committee for the Utah-Grand Canyon highway” and the *Salt Lake Telegram* noted that his “special hobby is to secure a system of highways to link the Grand canyon with Yellowstone national park.” Arizona was “slow to make an appropriation for the improvement of the short portion [of the highway] within that state,” but

¹⁴ *Iron County Record*, January 22, 1915, 1, UDN.

¹⁵ *Iron County Record*, January 22, 1915, 1, UDN.

¹⁶ For “Yellowstone-Grand Canyon Highway,” see *Salt Lake Telegram*, January 18, 1915, 14, UDN; For “Utah-Grand Canyon Highway,” see *Salt Lake Telegram*, August 12, 1915, 3, UDN; and for “State and Grand Canyon,” see *Iron County Record*, January 22, 1915, 1, UDN.

¹⁷ *Salt Lake Telegram*, January 18, 1915, 14, UDN.

¹⁸ *Iron County Record*, April 2, 1915, 1, UDN.

Mohave County stepped up, made an appropriation and appointed Jonathon Heaton “as supervisor for that road district” and placed “the appropriation at his disposal [for] the Grand canyon road.”¹⁹

By 1916 local boosters and national automobile enthusiasts considered the Yellowstone-Grand Canyon Highway usable. In southern Utah and northern Arizona’s flash flood country, however, an afternoon freshet could wipe out a bridge or create a new wash by evening. But Will Rose wrote in *The Arrowhead* that “there is today absolutely no reason why an automobile enthusiast who has negotiated the Lincoln highway to Salt Lake should fear the Grand Canyon highway[.] It is no longer new and untried[.] It is open to any man who knows how to get over average difficulties.” Rose described that on a road where several years ago farmers and ranchers “had never seen a car,” these very men were now “driving their own machines over the state highway every day.” There were now repair garages and hotels in most towns on the route as well as ample supplies of gasoline. Writing for a nationally acclaimed magazine, Rose described that “there are a thousand reasons for the trip,” noting that “it is enough to say that the North Rim is two thousand feet higher and two thousand feet more impressive than the South Rim.” He described its excellent views, its alpine forests and hundreds of streams which contrasted favorably to the flat and treeless deserts of the South Rim.²⁰

Stephen T. Mather:

The Director of the National Park Service and His Pet Project

¹⁹ *Salt Lake Telegram*, August 12, 1915, 3, UDN.

²⁰ Citation needed.

Though it is not certain they ever met, within months of Woolley's death in July 1920, Uncle Dee's pioneer highway across the Hurricane Plateau became the pet project of one of the greatest boosters of roadbuilding in American History—Director Stephen T. Mather of the newly created National Park Service (NPS). While it would take some time, Mather turned the Pipe Springs corridor into the booming tourist thoroughfare Woolley had hoped it would become by transforming the old tithing ranch Woolley had presided over into a national monument to for the benefit of autoists “traveling between the parks.” In 1914, Stephen Tyng Mather, a Chicago millionaire who had made his fortune selling borax, visited some of America's great western national parks as a private citizen. Dissatisfied with the manner in which the parks were being administered, he sent a letter of complaint to Franklin K. Lane, an “old college chum” who was serving as the Secretary of the Interior and had supervisory control of the parks. To his surprise, Secretary Lane responded “If you don't like the way the national parks are being run, come on down to Washington and run them yourself.” Mather accepted the invitation and on January 21, 1915, was sworn in as assistant secretary of the Interior with oversight of the national parks. Mather wanted to turn the national parks into “the Nation's playgrounds” by expanding them and making them more accessible. There were limited funds available for the NPS and Mather spent a significant fraction of his private fortune developing the national parks and monuments.²¹ As he himself said, preserving and developing Pipe Springs became a pet project of his.²² Pipe Springs and its road would be one of the most important links in a great Park-to-Park Highway. Mather's visionary highway was destined to become a massive network of roads and corridors

²¹ See Robert Shankland, *Steve Mather of the National Parks* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1951), especially v, and 7–11.

²² Stephen T. Mather, National Park Service, Washington, DC, to Heber J. Grant, President, Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints, Salt Lake City, Utah, May 21, 1923, NMPSF.

that connected each park or monument to all the rest in what Mather described as an “inter-park system” of “good roads” well-supplied with gasoline, food, water, restroom facilities, and camping places. “It ought to be made possible,” he dreamed, “for a family to start in their little automobile from the Atlantic coast and spend every night in the open on ground set aside for the purpose” while they visited all “these wonderful regions belonging to the people . . . without fear of finding impassable stretches which would break up their trip as they journey from park to park.”²³

The motley collection of thirteen national parks and eighteen national monuments Mather took charge of in 1915 were in a poor state of affairs, and the roads connecting them were almost non-existent. Yellowstone, established in 1872, was “the first national park in the history of the world” followed in 1875 by Mackinac National Park and by Sequoia and Yosemite in 1890.²⁴ From the beginning, national park status has been declared by act of Congress but the 1906 Act for the Preservation of American Antiquities gave presidents power to declare national monuments on their own initiative. As Robert Shankland explained in his biography of Steve Mather, “the difference between a national monument and a national park is shadowy—some sites, like the Grand Canyon, have been both—but, in a rough way, the monuments are less overpowering and much more miscellaneous, and they emphasize historical or scientific values rather than scenic.”²⁵ Mather’s primary reason for suggesting that Pipe be made a national monument was that its water made automobile travel possible between four stupendous scenic wonders. While he would justify its selection by emphasizing that the interesting old homestead preserved the history of life on a typical pioneer ranch, the quintessential road-builder saw that

²³ Essay on “the National Park-to-Park Highway” by Stephen T. Mather, in *Ephraim Enterprise*, 4, UDN.

²⁴ <http://www.pbs.org/nationalparks/parks/yellowstone/>

²⁵ Shankland, *Steve Mather of the National Parks*, 50.

Pipe's water was the kingpin in a scenic loop he envisioned that took in Zion Canyon, the north rim of the Grand Canyon as well as Cedar Breaks and Bryce Canyon.

Possessed of a work ethic that made him "a human whirlwind," once Mather took charge of the national parks he worked assiduously to get Congress to make vast increases in their appropriations to the parks and monuments. Simultaneously, he launched a campaign to widely promote national parks and monuments. His innovative and exhaustive plan to connect parks and monuments with a web of roads was timely, as motor tourism that was just then beginning to surge through the nation.²⁶ Among his successes, was the Park Service Act of 1916, which created the NPS as the ninth bureau inside the Department of the Interior. Passed in April 1916, the new law mandated that the bureau could not be organized until 1917, but by July 1916 Mather had control of an appropriation "of more than a half million dollars for the improvement of automobile roads in the national parks." In what would become one of the biggest bursts of road making in American history, the isolation of the Pipe Valley Desert and the Kaibab Plateau was eventually breached.²⁷ In the first of many such stunts staged to attract the nation's attention, Mather sent out a caravan of "twenty-five automobiles from half a dozen middle Western states" from St. Paul, Minnesota "on the first leg of a tour to Yellowstone park." The cortege increased in size dramatically as it proceeded westward, inviting the nation to hop in their cars and "see America First." Meanwhile "a hotel train de luxe" left St. Paul over the Northern Pacific railroad, scheduled to meet the automobile tourists "each noon and night" in the carefully choreographed publicity event. To facilitate the automobiles, the train had a special car "equipped with welding and repair outfits."²⁸

²⁶ Shankland, *Steve Mather of the National Parks*, 56.

²⁷ Shankland, *Steve Mather of the National Parks*, 106; and *Salt Lake Telegram*, July 20, 1916, 1, UDN.

²⁸ *Salt Lake Telegram*, July 20, 1916, 1, UDN.

In his 1916 annual report to the Secretary of the Interior, Mather commented on the “astonishing increase of Motor Travel” in the national parks noting that “12,563 cars registered at the portals of the various parks” in 1915, and that “19,848 cars, carrying 78,916 tourists, passed through them and made tours of the parks” in 1916. In his 1916 report to the Secretary, Mather reported that this “tremendous increase in automobile travel leads to one conclusion only, and that is that in the early future travel in private machines will overtake the increasing railroad travel and constitute the greater portion of all park travel. This makes it incumbent upon the federal government to prepare for the great influx of automobiles by constructing new roads and improving existing highways wherever improvement is necessary [*sic*].” His advocacy including mention “that American motorists are intensely interested in the national parks, are visiting them in ever increasing numbers, and are contributing, by way of automobile fees large sums of money toward park improvement and administration.”²⁹

At least by January 1917 the work of Dee Woolley and Stephen Mather began to coincide. That month Woolley sent Dave Rust (who he got elected as Kane County’s representative to the Utah State Legislature) to Salt Lake with a bill to push through for additional appropriations “to complete the Grand Canyon highway, which it is proposed shall run from Salt Lake south to the Grand Canyon of the Colorado by way of Cedar City[,] St George and the Arizona strip and return by way of Kane[,] Garfield, Paiute[,] Sevier and Sanpete counties,” the road forming a loop so that “the tourist could go to the Grand Canyon by one road and return [to Salt Lake City] by the other, [thus] seeing practically every section of the state.”³⁰ Meanwhile Director Mather, now touted as “one of the country’s foremost exponents of good

²⁹ As quoted in *Salt Lake Telegram*, January 7, 1917.

³⁰ *Washington County News*, January 11, 1917, 1, UDN.

roads,” crisscrossed the west delivering speeches, inviting representatives from each state to attend a “good roads conference” in Yellowstone later that fall where delegates would plot a mammoth road system connecting all the national parks and monuments.³¹ By 1917 the route from Hurricane to Kanab via Pipe Springs was known as “the worst” link in the whole route from Yellowstone to the North Rim. On July 9, the *Deseret News* issued a travel advisory to “Keep away from the Grand Canyon if you don’t want to be buried in 10 inches of sand.” In recent instances “occupants of cars had to shove [their vehicles] for 80 miles through the terrible sand, and other cases where cars got stuck so badly that they could not move either way.”³² As time went on, this impossible stretch of road between Hurricane and the North Rim became a symbolic hurdle Mather had to overcome in order for his massive “Park-to-Park Highway” to be complete. Thus Director Mather began to develop “a great personal interest” not only in the Pipe Springs corridor, but also in Brigham Young’s old fortress and its water. As Pipe’s water had once been key to Young’s strategy, it now became key to Mather’s whole “system of intercommunicating highways” designed to connect every park and monument in the west in a complex system of loops, straightaways and spurs.³³

In 1919 Director Mather sent out another staged publicity caravan, this one traversing a “5,800-mile circle tour of the national parks of the West,” over what he was now formally calling “the National Park-to-Park highway.” With thousands of miles of interconnecting roads to worry about, there were several factors that began to put the sixty-mile route between Hurricane and Fredonia near the very top of Mather’s priority list. For starters, the critical lack of water and

³¹ *Salt Lake Telegram*, July 30, 1916, 39, UDN.

³² *Deseret News*, July 9, 1917 as quoted in *Washington County News*, August 2, 1917, 1, UDN.

³³ *Iron County Record*, September 26, 1924, 6, UDN; and “Memo For Commissioner Spry,” by Arno B. Cammerer, Acting Director, National Park Service, Washington, DC, May 18, 1923, NMPSF.

settlement along the Pipe Springs corridor simply made it the most remote, challenging, and dangerous stretch of road anywhere in Mather's entire "inter-park system." There were no communities between Hurricane on the west and Fredonia on the east, and that the road went nowhere but to the Grand Canyon made it difficult to interest anyone in keeping the road up. Laborers had to be brought in, making the work doubly expensive. Meanwhile, the area's blowing sand and dust and occasional flash floods tended to obliterate roads as fast as they were laid out. Simultaneously, several additional parks and monuments in the region were brought to Mather's attention that, with the north rim of the Grand Canyon, created a singularly impressive scenic loop in southern Utah and northern Arizona. These included Zion Canyon, Bryce Canyon and Cedar Breaks and Mather could see that the old Mormon Corridor through Pipe Springs was fundamental in making them accessible to tourists. Zion Canyon had been made a National Monument under the name Mukuntuweap in 1909, but was "changed over to a national park" and got a new name (Zion National Park) in 1919. Though Bryce Canyon did not become a National Monument until 1923, and Cedar Breaks not until 1933, the four pronged attraction they made with Zion and the north rim of the Grand Canyon comprised "a short but truly marvelous scenic loop" recognized as early as 1920 as "destined to become one of America's greatest attractions." To that purpose, in June 1920 Mather orchestrated "the Zion Park-Grand Canyon Highway Convention" in Hurricane.³⁴

³⁴ *Iron County Record*, June 18, 1920, 4, and April 29, 1921, 4, UDN. Sadly, by now Dee Woolley (one of the most important characters in the entire Pipe Springs story) was near the end of a two year struggle with stomach cancer. He passed away in Flora's Kanab home on July 20, 1920. The Kaibabits held a "Cry" for their old friend, which one of Woolley's daughters described as "a sacred death ceremony which they perform when one of their chiefs passes away." *Standard Examiner*, July 23, 1920, 9, UDN; *Salt Lake Telegram*, July 21, 1920, 5, UDN; and Mary Elizabeth Woolley Chamberlain, *Mary E. Woolley Chamberlain— Handmaiden of the Lord*. (n.d, no place/pub), 231–232. [in L. Tom Perry Special Collections, Harold B. Lee Library, BYU]

On January 14, 1920, local papers throughout America published a press release by Mather giving an overall snapshot of the plan that was about to preserve and transform Brigham's old bastion at Pipe Springs:

The recent 5,800-mile circle tour of the national parks of the West by a large caravan, traveling on a predetermined schedule without regard to weather conditions, has a large significance. It has demonstrated that these wonderful regions belonging to the people may be visited by motorists from all parts of the country, particularly those carrying camping equipment and living out-of-doors, *without fear of finding impassable stretches which would break up their trip as they journey from park to park.*

I believe the opening of the National Park-to-Park highway will greatly stimulate automobile travel to the West. . . .In addition to demonstrating that good roads connect the parks—Rocky Mountain, Yellowstone, Glacier, Mount Rainier, Crater Lake, Yosemite, General Grant, Sequoia, Grand Canon and Mesa Verde—it has aroused western communities to the need of providing comfortable automobile camps for visitors, not only as a matter of hospitality, [*sic*] but as an investment, for such tourists necessarily spend much money in the towns they visit, and mean new population in that some of them decide to settle.

In certain states through which the highway runs most of the land belongs to the federal government. Such country is usually sparsely settled. In such cases, particularly where the road would be used principally by motorists en route to the national parks from all

parts of the United States, it would seem that the federal government would be under the obligation of repaying the cost of such sections of the inter-park [highway] system.

States must do their part in creating state parks to supplement the national park system. It ought to be made possible for a family to start in their little automobile from the Atlantic coast and spend every night in the open on ground set aside for the purpose.³⁵

Mather successfully mobilized the country, particularly in the west, to build a network of national playgrounds in the form of parks and monuments made accessible by thousands of miles of interconnected roads. His vision would not be accomplished, however, without the thousands of local boosters in communities across America, including Dee Woolley. And while Pipe Springs stands as a monument to the exploration and mapping work of John Wesley Powell and to the accomplishments of frontier Mormons like Jacob Hamblin, James Whitmore, James Andrus, Brigham Young, Joseph W. Young, Anson Winsor, and Dee Woolley, it also stands as a monument to the man who made it a national monument and who, in fact, created the National Park System. Indeed, it is a monument to America's best idea, or more correctly, Stephen Mather's best idea.

***“This Splendid Old Landmark Should be Saved [and]
Maintained as a National Monument.”***

³⁵ *Ephraim Enterprise*, January 14, 1920, 4, UDN.

Dee Woolley died of stomach cancer in Kanab on July 20, 1920, just as Director Mather formulated his strategy for fulfilling their joint dream of bringing hordes of tourists to the North Rim.³⁶ Mather traversed the Pipe Springs corridor in a motor car several times in 1920 and 1921 and as he did, he began to see that Brigham Young's old bastion and ranch at Pipe Springs should be preserved as a national monument. Granted, the place originally appealed to Mather primarily because of the utter necessity of its water, but he quickly saw that restoring the old fort could provide a point of interest for travelers while simultaneously securing its water and its shade trees for a roadside picnic area and campground. The springs' location, however, in the center of tribal lands and questionable ownership, created formidable entanglements that made obtaining for a national monument an exceedingly difficult endeavor.

Based on the old Mormon common stock principles of Brigham Young's United Order, the cooperatively owned Heaton and Sons Company (HSC) held questionable squatters rights to the forty acres upon which Winsor Castle stood and claimed two-thirds of Pipe's precious water. HSC's claims were based on Valentine Scrip filed on Pipe Springs by Daniel Seegmiller during the anti-polygamy raid. Seegmiller's claim had never been fully recognized by the US Land Office but to the Mormon settlers of the Arizona Strip it was etched in stone. Unfortunately for Mather, there were serious complications to this contested claim. For starters Jonathan Heaton and each of his sons and sons-in-law held an equal vote in HSC and though they reportedly got along famously, no one person controlled the property. A unanimous decision to sell was not likely. In a confusing web of "verbal deeding," a loose and anonymous association of local cowboys also held a questionable claim to a third of Pipe's water and the right to use Winsor Castle's troughs, reservoirs, and corrals. These questionable rights would also need to be

³⁶ Chamberlain, *Handmaiden of the Lord*, 231–232.

purchased, but from whom? Over the years the Native Americans and their agents objected to these Mormon claims on their reservation, and from time to time unsuccessfully contested them. The church, which was increasingly becoming interested in historical sites, also had a vested interest in the old fort. While the church had not owned Pipe Springs for years, it still had considerable influence over the devoutly religious Heaton family, who would not sell it if the church opposed the transaction. Meanwhile the Bureau of Indian Affairs, its various agents, the US Land Office, and other bureaus within the Department of Interior all had an interest in Pipe Springs. Unraveling this bureaucratic juggernaut and boondoggle of questionable ownership to secure clear title to Winsor Castle, its springs, and quarter section for the Park Service challenged Mather's political acumen and exhausted his energy.

There are several conflicting versions of how Mather's Pipe Springs strategy developed and the director himself apparently only told part of the story. It appears Director Mather first visited Pipe in the fall of 1920, directly after the dedication of Zion National Park on September 15, 1920. Open-minded and kind, Stephen Mather was already fond of the Mormon people and their unique culture and history. On numerous occasions, he interacted with President Heber J. Grant and found him to be of a similarly open disposition. A man from a deeply religious background himself, Mather, who loved church music, took great delight in joining with the Mormons in their rich congregational singing.³⁷ As he made his first trip from Zion to the North Rim that September, he found himself impressed with the civic organization of the Latter-day Saints. Learning of Mather's trip in advance, the Mormon communities from Cedar City to Kanab turned out to improve his road in hopes of inducing "the Director" to distribute some of the government road money he controlled. In a speech Mather gave in the Salt Lake Tabernacle

³⁷ McKoy, *Administrative History of Pipe Spring*, 115.

memorializing the death of President Warren G. Harding in 1923, he told of his first drive across the Hurricane Plateau toward the Grand Canyon. In a paraphrased report of his speech, Mather reported being impressed with the Mormon bishops he met en route. He remembered the trails were not chartered and highways were not then in present condition so he “was obliged to make inquiry of every one he met” for directions. He “encountered a man of wholesome countenance, riding a spirited horse, and wearing all the habiliments of a thorough ranchman.” It turned out he was the Bishop. Passing some miles further Mather came upon a group of men repairing a bridge. He stopped and checked up on his bearings and on receiving courteous and satisfying information said to the man who seemed to be the foreman, “Thank you very much, you certainly are well acquainted with the locality.” “I ought to be,” said the foreman, “I am the Bishop in these parts.” After another long stretch and with nightfall was approaching, Mather saw a man plowing in a field not far distant from an inviting home, and stopping the man at work, asked, “Pardon me stranger, but could you direct me to where I might find Bishop Harrison?” “That’s me,” said the bishop and Mather was safe and comfortable for the night.

Speaking in their Great Tabernacle from the very pulpit the prophets used in general conference, Mather thrilled his Latter-day Saint crowd by confessing that he “secretly entertained a wish that he might aspire to become a [Mormon] bishop himself.”³⁸ From other sources we know that upon reaching Pipe, Mather took some photographs of the fort. He reportedly visited with the Heaton family, discussing the idea of making the place a national monument with its owners. The Heatons were said to be “receptive to the idea,” and to have “promised to furnish labor” should the NPS decide to purchase and restore the fort.³⁹ In fact the

³⁸ *Iron County Record*, March 13, 1925, 1, UDN.

³⁹ McKoy, *Administrative History of Pipe Spring*, 90.

Heaton's claim the idea for a national park at Pipe originated with Charles Heaton, who reportedly suggested it to the Director the first time he visited the fort.⁴⁰ Either way, nine months after Mather's initial visit, on June 6, 1921, the Park Director delicately wrote to Commissioner of Indian Affairs Charles H. Burke informing him that he had found "a very interesting old homestead" on the Kaibab Indian Reservation that he wished to acquire for the park system. Mather wrote that Winsor Castle was deserted at the time of his first visit, though he found it "in an excellent state of preservation." He had learned that "it has now been abandoned about a year, and if left in this condition will soon rapidly deteriorate." Since the old fort technically was "within the boundary of the Kaibab Indian Reservation and it is a point at which tourists stop en route from Zion Park in Utah while visiting the North Rim of the Grand Canyon, or vice versa," Mather requested for the time being that the Indian Department see that a caretaker "from the reservation" be placed there to prevent vandalism or squatting. This seemed particularly necessary because 100 or so families of California homesteaders had just come in to take possession of Pipe Valley, south of the reservation, on the false hope that they could irrigate their crops with groundwater that could be pumped to the surface by windmills. Mather had learned from Jonathan Heaton that "both the Indian Office and the Land Office [were then] questioning Mr. Heaton's right to ownership of this tract." He wrote the Commissioner of Indian Affairs that "the house, and the area immediately around it, I believe should be preserved as a national monument from a historical point of view."⁴¹

The same day Mather wrote the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, he wrote former Utah governor William D. Spry, who was then serving as United States Land Commissioner, urging

⁴⁰ Citation needed.

⁴¹ Stephen T. Mather, Washington, DC to Charles H. Burke, Commissioner of Indian Affairs, Washington, DC, June 6, 1921, NMPSF; and *Cononino Sun*, July 29, 1921, 5, LOC.

that “this splendid old landmark should be saved, either by direct purchase if Jonathan Heaton’s title is confirmed, or, if it reverts to the United States, it should be maintained as a national monument.”⁴² Involving the commissioner of the General Land Office shows that Mather understood that the Heaton’s title to the land was in question. For years, the Indian Office had challenged the validity of the Heaton’s claim and had pressured the Land Office in the interest of the Kaibab against this single Mormon family at Moccasin and at Pipe. The Valentine Scrip questionably filed by Daniel Seegmiller in 1888 was supposed to have been placed on “unimproved government land,” and, of course, by 1888 Pipe had been “improved” for nearly two decades. Second, the Heaton’s had lost their copy of the original Valentine Scrip filing and had never received a quitclaim deed from A.D. Findlay. At the time the Heaton’s bought Findlay out, in the tight knit Mormon community of Kane County “a man’s word was as good as his bond,” and “paper” was not deemed necessary to prove ownership. Even as late as 1921 no one in the local community questioned the Heaton’s right to their property. But especially since the arrival of Superintendent Edgar A. Farrow at Kaibab in 1917, the Indian Office increasingly became convinced that the Kaibab Reservation was virtually worthless to the Indians if they only had access to a third of Moccasin’s water. According to Farrow, the Indians simply must have the full use of all the water the springs at Moccasin and Pipe could produce. Accusing the Heaton’s of dishonestly adjusting the separating weir at Moccasin Springs in their favor, Farrow and his superiors sought to find some legal technicality upon which they could dispossess the Heaton’s from Pipe Springs and Moccasin altogether. The Heaton’s had retained a legal firm with

⁴² McKoy, *Administrative History of Pipe Spring*, 90; Stephen T. Mather, Director, National Park Service, Department of the Interior, Washington, DC, to Hon. William D. Spry, Commissioner of the General Land Office, Washington, DC, June 6, 1921, in NA, Records of the National Park Service, National Monuments, Pipe Spring File, NA, RG 79, digital copy in PSLA, hereafter NMPSF. See also E. B. Meritt, Assistant Commissioner, Office of Indian Affairs, Washington, DC to Hon. Stephen T. Mather, June 17, 1921, NMPSF.

offices in Phoenix and Washington, DC, and enlisted Utah and Arizona politicians to help them hold the Indian and Land Offices at bay. Fearing they would eventually lose Pipe anyway, some of the Heatons were anxious to sell Winsor Castle and their questionable rights to its water to the park service before it was stripped from them in court by the Indian Office.

Mather knew that under the circumstances, the Land Office, headed by former Utah Governor William Spry (who was both a Utahan and a Mormon),⁴³ would be a key player in bringing a clear title to the NPS and in protecting NPS interests from the Indian Office. Mather understood from the start that he was entering a bombastic relationship which already existed between the Heatons and certain parties in the Indian Office, especially Kaibab Reservation agent and physician Edgar A. Farrow, who was determined that the Heatons' claims be handed over to the Kaibabit. The boondoggle over the Heatons' title and Pipe's water rights persisted for years after the NPS formally acquired possession of Pipe Springs.⁴⁴ Mather, in his effort to obtain Pipe Springs was entering into a long-term conflict between different agencies of the federal government.⁴⁵ Having been ordered by his superiors in the Indian Office to provide a caretaker for Pipe, Superintendent Farrow reported back that he had learned from the Heatons that a son-in-law of Jonathan Heaton had taken up occupancy of Pipe Springs around April 1, 1921, and that therefore "the appointment of a caretaker" representing the Indian Office seemed "unnecessary."⁴⁶ This son-in-law was probably Price W. Johnson, who married Jonathan Heaton's daughter Esther in 1914. Price and Esther lived at Pipe off and on during the late teens

⁴³ In addition to serving as the third governor of the State of Utah from 1909 to 1917, Spry had served his church as president of the Southern States Mission from 1888 to 1891. See http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_Governors_of_Utah; and Jenson, *Latter-day Saints Biographical Encyclopedia*, 4: 380.

⁴⁴ "Moccasin and her People," 2:108-109.

⁴⁵ McKoy, *Administrative History of Pipe Spring*.

⁴⁶ E. A. Farrow, Superintendent and Physician, Kaibab, Moccasin, Arizona, to the Honorable Commissioner of Indian Affairs, Washington, DC, July 6, 1921, NMPSF.

and twenties caring for the traveling public. Price and Esther later became involved in post-manifesto polygamy and, along with Elizabeth Colvin, were instrumental in the establishment of Short Creek as a haven for polygamists. Price also helped reinstitute a fundamentalist version of the United Order there. In the 1930s he spent nearly a year in jail for polygamy.⁴⁷

In the fall of 1921 Mather returned to Pipe Springs in the company of Carl R. Gray and Randal L. Jones. Gray was the president of the Union Pacific Railroad, which had recently obtained control of the line from Salt Lake City to Lund, Utah, a point some 35 miles northwest of Cedar City. The Union Pacific was exploring the possibility of making Cedar City the gateway to the southern parks, by extending its line from Lund to Cedar. It was also flirting with the idea of making a rail line from Cedar via Pipe Springs to the Grand Canyon. The Union Pacific was also developing a subsidiary called the Utah Parks Company, which would build hotels, lodges, and cabins at Mather's parks and monuments. Part of the Utah Parks Company plan was to rent automobiles to the traveling public and bring "auto buses" full of tourists from the Cedar City railhead to the Grand Canyon. Because Pipe Springs would provide a necessary rest stop in this scenario, support and capital from the Union Pacific significantly strengthened Mather's bid to obtain Winsor Castle and its water. Randall Jones was Cedar City's primary park and road booster, the secretary of the Cedar City Commercial Club, and the architect of a 200-room hotel Cedar City was then building to service visitors to the newly dedicated Zion National Park. He was also the son of Lehi Jones, who had been a part owner of Pipe Springs Ranch between 1895 and 1902. In his youth, Randall Jones had spent much time cowboying at Pipe. He thus knew the Heatons and was well informed as to Winsor Castle's resources and history.

⁴⁷ Marianne T. Watson, "Short Creek: 'A Refuge for the Saints,'" in *Dialogue* 36 (Spring 2003): 71–87, especially 78–79, 84, and 86.

Certainly he was interested in preserving “the splendid old homestead” that had once been his family’s property, and his background and interest in Pipe Springs, not to mention his boosterism and experience in building national park roads and hotels undoubtedly made him an ideal travel companion for Mather on this occasion.

Leaving Zion early one morning in the director’s Packard, Mather, Gray, and Jones became stuck in the notorious sands of Short Creek, not far from where the same dunes had allowed angry Native Americans to overtake and murder Joseph, Robert, and Isabella Berry half a century earlier. Charles and Maggie Heaton’s son Leonard, who would be appointed caretaker and restorer of Winsor Castle after it was finally designated as a national monument in 1923, gave the following details in a 1991 interview:

They were stuck there for about three or four hours in the sand, and when they come to Pipe Spring, along about one or two-o’clock, they were so famished and they didn’t have any water with them. And while they were resting there [Director Mather] began to look around the fort and my father was down there riding on the range. . . .

And then my father come up on horseback and Randall Jones was with him from Cedar City. He was promoter of tourism in southern Utah, and Dad knew Randall Jones, . . .

And after Mather walked through the fort, the old fort (a lot of it was torn out then, inside of it and things like that), he asked my dad what the history of the place was.⁴⁸

⁴⁸ *Iron County Record*, September 26, 1924, 6, UDN; *Garfield County News*, June 29, 1978, 2, UDN; Skankland, and McKoy, *Administrative History of Pipe Spring*, 90–91. In the interview, Leonard Heaton stated “Mather had thought that Pipe Spring would be a good place for tourists to stop on the road from Zion to the Grand Canyon or the Grand Canyon back to Zion. And that was it. From that time it was Randall Jones and these other fellows, they decided to make Pipe Spring a national monument.”

Gray expressed his enthusiasm for “the scenic advantages of the territory,” and his puzzlement over the roads needed to get travelers “between points of surpassing scenic interest. “The question of a branch line of the Union Pacific system from Lund to Cedar City is so closely interwoven with that of highway transportation and hotel accommodations for the traveling public at the various points of natural scenic wonders as to be inseparable from it. The one cannot be decided without the other.”⁴⁹

It is clear that some of the Heaton's were anxious to sell the fort to the NPS. In addition to fearing the Indian Office would confiscate it without payment, perhaps the Heaton's also felt the increased traffic a national monument on the road between two national parks would create would also create a market for their produce and increase the need for the accommodations they provided travelers in nearby Moccasin. Either way, Jonathan and Charles Heaton tentatively agreed to sell Winsor Castle to the Park Service for the sum of \$5,000 and to provide the labor for its restoration. Since “it would be a labor of love” with the Heaton's, Mather expected their work to be done “at a very small expense.”⁵⁰

By now Mather enlisted the support of church President Heber J. Grant, First Counselor in the First Presidency Anthony W. Ivins, and Apostle George Albert Smith, who became important allies. All three were park and road boosters in their own right; all three were extraordinarily historically conscious; and all three had important connections to the Arizona Strip and to the old fort at Pipe Springs. George Albert Smith was a grandson of Brigham Young's counselor of the same name who had played such an important role in establishing

⁴⁹ *Iron County Record*, July 14, 1922, 1, CALOC.

⁵⁰ Stephen T. Mather, Director, National Park Service, Washington, DC, to George A[lbert] Smith, Church of the Latter Day Saints, Salt Lake City, Utah, January 18, 1922, NMPSF.

southern Utah, the Pipe Springs corridor, the Arizona mission, and the Old Mormon Road to Mexico. Indeed, St. George itself was named after the elder George A. Smith. In tandem with his apostolic father, John Henry Smith, George Albert had been partners in the livestock trade with Dee Woolley and had run cattle at Pipe. George Albert Smith was as interested in preserving the history of Mormonism and later was a founder of the Utah Pioneer Trails and Landmarks Association. The very first historical marker put up by this organization honored of Pipe Springs, “the first fort in Southern Utah.”⁵¹

Tony Ivins was a son-in-law of Erastus Snow and had spent considerable time visiting family members at Pipe during its “old days.” A successful St. George cattleman, he and his cousin Heber J. Grant had owned a number of ranches on the Arizona Strip, and Ivins had participated at many a roundup at Pipe Springs. One of the original settlers of St. George, he was thirteen-years old when James Whitmore and Robert McIntyre were killed on the Pipe Springs range. Like Grant and Smith, he was exceptionally historically conscious, but also had the benefit of having lived most of his life in southern Utah. Additionally, he was an excellent writer. Anthony Ivins had written perhaps the best account ever written of the Whitmore-McIntyre murders and the subsequent Mormon retaliation aids against the Indians.⁵² Director Mather acknowledged that Ivins had more than a “half century [of] personal knowledge of this country” and was “probably better posted on that section of the country than any living man.”

Mather leaned heavily on Grant, Ivins, and Smith to pull off his pet Pipe Springs Project.⁵³ It was in the church’s interest to transform “peculiar Mormon Utah” into a respected

⁵¹ See *Salt Lake Telegram*, October 17, 1930, 2, November 7, 1930, 13, January 8, 1931, 13, January 27, 1931, 2, and May 21, 1945, 1, UDN.

⁵² Anthony W. Ivins, “Traveling Over Forgotten Trails,” *Improvement Era* 14 (February 1916): 350–56.

⁵³ Telegram of Stephen T. Mather, National Park Service, Washington, DC, to Frank Pinkley, Blackwater, Arizona, September 29, 1923; Telegram of Stephen T. Mather, National Park Service, Washington, DC, to Anthony W. Ivins,

player inside the American mainstream, and they seized upon Mather's open mindedness and brotherly good will and returned it in kind. Grant viewed Mather's parks and inter-park highways as major opportunities to integrate Utah into a new and more accepting American orthodoxy. Grant, Ivins, and Smith were representative of a new generation of Mormons who sought to interact positively with non-members—who under the new regime were no longer publicly called gentiles. All three joined broad interfaith associations and cultivated “friends of other faiths” everywhere they went.⁵⁴ Symbolic of the changes that were occurring in Mormonism and in America, it is significant that the very spot Brigham Young had once prepared to do battle with the United States Army now united church leaders with the President of the United States and leading government bureaucrats in the common purpose of preserving the emblematic bastion of their former stormy history.

On January 18, 1922, Mather wrote George Albert Smith “reminding” him “to follow up as promptly as possible with your friends in the Church [on] the question of the relinquishment by Jonathan Heaton of his claims on the Pipe Springs property.” Counting on the remarkable power Latter-day Saint church leaders still had over the Mormon rank and file, Mather asked Smith to “take up negotiations with [Jonathan Heaton] and find out the amount that he feels he should have for reimbursement and then secure this fund, with the understanding that the President would make this a national monument.” Mather assured the church that once purchased and delivered to the Park Service, “we could then spare from the national monument fund enough money to spend in the restoration of the old fort, providing it will be done on an

church headquarters, Salt Lake City, Utah, September 29, 1923; and Stephen T. Mather, Yellowstone Park, Wyoming, to Hon. George W. P. Hunt, Governor of Arizona, Phoenix, Arizona, October 28, 1923, all in NMPSE.

⁵⁴ For a discussion of this New Moderate Mormonism, see Thomas G. Alexander, *Mormonism in Transition: A History of the Latter-day Saints, 1890–1930* (Urbana, IL: University of Illinois Press, 1986).

economical basis by Mr. Heaton and his son.”⁵⁵ Stephen Mather himself was incredibly generous with his personal funds. When his estate was executed in 1930 Mather’s attorney declared that the Director had given over \$50,000 of his own money to the NPS. Part of Mather’s amazing success was that he expected others to be generous too, often making his own contributions as an inducement for others to make theirs. To Mather, the national parks and monuments were national treasures that all Americans should be involved in securing and preserving, and all over the country he solicited donations and appropriations from citizens, legislators, and congress members, and then used that money with the wisdom and tenacity of a miser.⁵⁶

Mather sought to interest donors to purchase Pipe Springs from the Heatons and “make a gift of it” to the NPS. Part of Mather’s reasoning was based on the residual antipathy some in the government and in the nation still held toward the Latter-day Saints. The fort itself was one of the last remaining physical witnesses of the Mormon rebellion against the United States and it was certainly a legitimate question whether such a place should be preserved, especially at the taxpayers’ expense. Its connection with the Mountain Meadows Massacre and its use as a refuge for those involved in the “illegal” and “disloyal” practice of polygamy still struck many as grossly un-American. A non-Mormon Salt Lake banker, for example, warned Mather that “the preservation of Pipe Springs wakens little or no enthusiasm among the Non-Mormons, who seem to regard the place strictly as an old out-post of the Mormon Church, and who frankly say it is up to the Mormons to take care of the matter if they wish anything done” to preserve it. In response to this general sentiment, Mather appealed to the church itself, and other interested parties, such

⁵⁵ Stephen T. Mather, Director, National Park Service, Washington, DC, to George A[lbert] Smith, Church of the Latter Day Saints, Salt Lake City, Utah, January 18, 1922. Charles Heaton and his son Leonard had tentatively agreed to be caretakers and restorers once the fort was turned over to the Park Service.

⁵⁶ Shankland, *Duchesne County Newspapers*, March 18, 1920, 7, UDN; and *Garfield County News*, February 28, 1930, 1, UDN.

as the Union Pacific and its subsidiary, the Utah Parks Company (who stood to profit from a road linking Zion, Cedar Breaks, and Bryce Canyon with the North Rim) to pay for the monument and present it as a gift to the Park Service.⁵⁷ At the same time, Mather sought to distance the fort's connection to the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints by emphasizing that it was a quintessential representative of the western cattle ranch, and for that reason ought to be preserved. An article in the *Deseret News* divulged that Smith had been working with Mather "in the interest of the southern Utah scenic route" and revealed some of the thinking behind Mather's plan. "While many national monuments have been founded all over the country," the article read, "there is as yet none in this part of the world [representative] of the nature of the ranch." Without overtly mentioning Pipe's connection to the church, the *News* explained that "in early days" Winsor Castle was "an oasis to thousands of settlers threading the western reaches[.] It is in northern Arizona and was the only water within sixty miles on the road between Dixie and Kanab in pioneer times. Persons going between these two points detoured to the old ranch or fort to get the waters from one of the purest springs to be found in the world." The article proceeded to describe the condition of the old fort and its potential as a memorial frontier Utah and Arizona:

At present there are two old stone buildings and in order to carry out the national monument idea Mr Mather suggests that the ranch would have to be rebuilt into the old fort as it was formerly with a wall connecting the two buildings[.] It is now under private ownership and property rights would also have to be secured by the government[.] Mr

⁵⁷ Lafayette Hanchett, Salt Lake City, to Hon. Stephen T. Mather, Director National Parks, Washington, DC, June 8, 1923, NMPSF.

Mather thinks the acquisition of the old ranch would add much interest to the Zion Canyon Bryce Canyon Cedar Breaks trip and *would serve as a memorial of western life.*

To assure its readers that the church approved of the Park Director's plan (and thereby encourage the financial participation of its members), the article concluded that Apostle Smith "stated this morning he considered the making of Pipe Springs Ranch into a national monument a commendable move and that in his opinion it ought to be done to save the old historic spot from eventually going to ruin."⁵⁸

Relying on the good-natured interaction between church and state he had engendered, Mather asked church leaders not only to encourage the Heaton's to sell Pipe Springs, but to help raise most of the funds necessary to purchase it from them. An elaborate plan was devised wherein a number of interested corporations and individuals were to put up portions of the \$5,000 the HSC/PSLLSC required to sign their claim to Winsor Castle and its water over to the Park Service. The exact make-up of the donors and their respective contributions shifted several times before the money was finally paid out some fifteen months after Pipe became a national monument. In the end, Mather himself contributed \$500 and President Grant personally contributed \$250, while subscribing an additional \$1,000 donation on behalf of the church. The Union Pacific also donated \$1,000 in consideration of what it stood to gain by the fort's transformation into a national monument. Heaton and Sons made a significant contribution itself by reducing \$1,000 of its \$5,000 asking price. Significantly, George M. Whitmore, a son of the murdered James M. Whitmore, donated \$150 and a brother of Robert McIntyre, who was killed with Whitmore, donated \$50. The remaining money was chiefly donated by other Salt Lake men

⁵⁸ The *Deseret News* as quoted in *Washington County News*, January 26, 1922, 1, UDN, italics mine.

of means, principally in \$100 chunks. But to Mather's consternation, this money was not paid out nor a quitclaim deed placed in the hands of the Secretary of the Interior until October 1924.⁵⁹

Mather was about to learn that the power Brigham Young had wielded in demanding money from his coreligionists was not exercised in the same degree by his successors. Smith told Mather that while he supported the notion of Pipe Springs becoming a monument, he was personally unacquainted with Jonathan Heaton and promised to find someone else in the hierarchy to negotiate with him. Smith reported that he had been appointed by Utah's governor to a committee "to look after our scenic attractions, and see that they are properly advertised." He concluded his letter to the Park Director by congratulating Mather on "the amount of interest you stirred up while here," and assured him "that much good" would be the result.⁶⁰ Mather waited for over a year for leaders of the church to work things out with the Heatons. Meanwhile the Heatons were stymied, as their attorneys tried to settle their claim to Pipe Springs. Letters were sent out through the family in an attempt to find a copy of Seegmiller's original Valentine Scrip document that was feared to have been burned in a house fire. The Heatons' attorneys urged them to have A.D. Findlay provide them with a quitclaim deed, even though his sale of the property had occurred some sixteen years before.⁶¹

⁵⁹ See McKoy, *Administrative History of Pipe Spring*, 139–140; and various pieces of correspondence in NMPSF, including Telegram of Heber J. Grant, Salt Lake City, Utah, to Stephen T. Mather, Director, National Park Service, Washington, DC, October 8, 1924, Heber J. Grant, Salt Lake City, to Stephen T. Mather, Director, National Park Service, Washington, DC, October 8, 1924, Heber J. Grant to Mr. Charles C. Heaton, Moccasin, Arizona, October 8, 1924, Stephen T. Mather, Director, National Park Service, Washington, DC, to Charles C. Heaton, Moccasin, Arizona, Hubert Work, Secretary of Interior, Washington, DC to Stephen T. Mather, Director, National Park Service, October 23, 1924, and Stephen T. Mather, Director, National Park Service, Washington, DC to Heber J. Grant, Salt Lake City, Utah, October 29, 1924.

⁶⁰ The Council of the Twelve, Salt Lake City, to Hon. Stephen T. Mather, Director of National Parks, Department of the Interior, Washington, DC, January 24, 1922, NMPSF.

⁶¹ "Moccasin and Her People," 2:108–109; and John H. Page, John H. Page & Company, Public Land Specialists, Phoenix, Arizona, to Charles C. Heaton, Moccasin, Arizona, October 330, 1920, and Charles C. Heaton, Moccasin, Arizona, to Israel Heaton, November 12, 1920, both in PSLA, #1606.

They were forced to wait while an application to refile their Valentine Scrip worked its way through the bureaucratic red-tape of the General Land Office. All the while the Heatons and their attorneys encountered stiff opposition from the Indian Office. Some family members felt that if they could secure firm title it would be best to hang on to Pipe Springs and the delay gave them time to think things through. In an attempt to force the issue, Mather and his underlings prepared a document for President Harding to sign proclaiming Pipe Springs a national monument. To “buy” the assent of Commissioner of Indian Affairs Charles H. Burke for the monument the NPS hoped to establish in the heart of an Indian Reservation, Mather inserted a sentence giving “the Indians of the Kaibab Reservation . . . the privilege of utilizing waters from Pipe Spring for irrigation, stock watering and other purposes, under regulations to be prescribed by the Secretary of the Interior.” As Mather would soon learn, this sentence set the stage for a long term fight over Pipe’s water between the NPS and the Indian Service.⁶²

Part of Mather’s haste to finalize the sale and transfer stemmed from “a colonization scheme . . . put over by Los Angeles men” launched in the summer of 1921 which brought large numbers of homesteaders into Pipe Valley. The company was called the Northern Arizona and Nevada Development Association. Hoping that something akin to Lauritzen and Rust’s Pipe Valley Irrigation Project would bring water into its deserts, the homesteaders planned on surviving in the meantime by sinking wells into the sand and pumping out groundwater.⁶³

⁶² McKoy, *Administrative History of Pipe Spring*, 653; William S. Spry, Commissioner of the General Land Office, Washington, DC, Memorandum for Mr. Cammerer, May 23, 1923, NMPSF; A. E. Demaray, National Park Service, Memorandum for Mr. Mather, May 23, 1923, NMPSF; Memorandum for the Secretary of the Interior from the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, May 28, 1923, NMPSF; Memorandum Regarding Use of Water from the Pipe Springs National Monument by Indians of Kaibab Reservation, undated, NMPSF.

⁶³ During the period, government geologists like Herbert E. Gregory and church leaders and scientists like Apostle John A. Widstoe were touting that there was enough water in underground aquifers to water much of the land east and south of Pipe Springs if the new settlers would just “go after it.” “Moccasin and her People, 2:104; and John A. Widstoe, *Dry-Farming: A System of Agriculture for Countries Under a Low Rainfall* (New York: Macmillan Company, 1920).

Newspapers in both Utah and Arizona reported that “at least 100 families [were then] camping in the valley, where they are to enter or have entered [filings for homesteads] on the public lands.” The project’s organizer, a Los Angeles businessman named R.E. Dodge, was establishing Dodge City, Arizona, to be located about “eight miles south of the picturesque and well-known ‘Pipe Springs.’” Dodge and a Utah/Arizona partner had advertised that Pipe Valley was “one of the best, so far as soil and water is concerned, in the [entire] state [of Arizona]” and they promised “that Pipe Spring valley [would soon] have a town of considerable importance and that the territory surrounding it will become one of the most important agricultural regions of the state.” By the first of June 1921 the settlers of “Dodge” numbered at 300, and were described as coming “mostly from California.” As Mather determined to make Pipe a national monument, he was aware the Dodge City settlers were feverishly “clearing land, sinking wells, building a large reservoir, planning a school house for next winter and preparing a petition for a post office.”⁶⁴ Fearing they would somehow upset his plans for Pipe, or worse, use the fort as a rock quarry, Mather asked locals from Kanab to monitor their activity. Mather felt that this town building scheme was “a very poor proposition” and since it was on public lands he called on Commissioner Spry to have it “thoroughly investigated.” Before the General Land Office could respond, however, the lack of water thoroughly disheartened the settlers and by December 1922, Park Service correspondence indicates that “the activities of these men have apparently ceased.” Dodge City never materialized.⁶⁵

⁶⁴ *Iron County Record*, June 3, 1921, LOC; *Mohave County Miner* (Kingman, AZ), July 22, 1921, 1, NPC; *Coconino Sun*, July 29, 1921, 5, LOC; and William S. Spry, Commissioner, General Land Office, Washington, DC, to Ralph S. Kelley, Chief of Field Division, Salt Lake City, Utah, December 7, 1922, and other correspondence in NMPSF. Dodge’s partner was named Cutler.

⁶⁵ “Moccasin and Her People,” 2:108–109; Stephen T. Mather, Washington, DC to Mr. Harold Bowman, Kanab, Utah, November 2, 1921, NMPSF; and Stephen T. Mather, Washington, DC, to Hon. William S. Spry, Commissioner, General Land Office, November 29, 1921, NMPSF; and Stephen T. Mather, Washington, DC, to Mr. F. A. Wadleigh, Passenger Traffic Manager, Denver & Rio Grande Railroad, Denver, Colorado, November 29,

A master at using deadlines and upcoming trips as leverage to provoke action, Mather tried to get President Grant to push the Heaton's to finalize the sale by telling him he wanted Pipe Springs purchased and the title in his hands before the June 1923 trip President Harding was taking to the Western states and to the territory of Alaska. Harding was planning to visit a number of national parks en route including Yellowstone, Yosemite, Zion, and the north rim of the Grand Canyon. Among other things, Harding was slated to play a round of golf with Heber J. Grant in Salt Lake City before heading to Cedar City to open the new Union Pacific railhead accessing Zion National Park. "I want you to realize how important it is that we get [the purchase of Pipe Springs] carried through in the next month or so," Mather wrote Grant. "Just as soon as Mr. Heaton's title is relinquished I will take the necessary steps to have a national monument created, but this should be all accomplished before President Harding starts for the west, as his signature is required on the proclamation." Mather invited the church president to join him on a quick tour of Pipe Springs, the Grand Canyon, and Mesa Verde immediately after Harding's visit to Utah. On this junket the director would also host Congressman Louis C. Crampton of Michigan, the chair of an important subcommittee which directed Interior Department appropriations. Grant had a prior commitment in California but suggested his counselor Anthony Ivins go in his place. Ivins would make a great traveling companion for the director and the congressman, Grant said, for he was "the best posted man on all matters connected with the settlement and development of southern Utah."⁶⁶

1921, NMPSF; William S. Spry, Commissioner, General Land Office, Washington, DC, to Ralph S. Kelley, Chief of Field Division, Salt Lake City, Utah, December 7, 1922; and Arno B. Cammerer, Acting Director, National Park Service, Washington, DC, to F. A. Wadleigh, Denver & Rio Grande Western Railway, Denver, Colorado, December 9, 1922, NMPSF.

⁶⁶ Heber J. Grant, Southern Pacific Train, to Stephen T. Mather, Director, National Park Service, Washington, DC, May 12, 1923, NMPSF; and Stephen T. Mather, National Park Service, Washington, DC, to Heber J. Grant, President, Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints, Salt Lake City, Utah, May 21, 1923, NMPSF.

Meanwhile, Mather dispatched Utah's Senator Reed Smoot (who was a personal friend and political ally of both Mather and President Harding) to make sure the country's chief executive's itinerary included a side-trip to Cedar City, Zion, Pipe Springs, and the north rim of the Grand Canyon. To strengthen Smoot's work, Mather saw that Utah Governor Charles R. Mabey and the state's junior senator, William H. King, both called at the White House to "informally invite" Harding to come to Utah. Since the projected auto caravan carrying some forty members of the president's entourage would have necessity have to stop at Pipe for drinking water, lunch, and toilet facilities, Mather wanted all property transactions completed before the trip so the place would be in firm possession of the government by the time the president arrived. Throughout April and May 1923 Smoot repeatedly met with the president in the White House and went over the route of the proposed excursion to Zion and the Grand Canyon via Pipe Springs "in detail." Smoot invited himself to dinner in the White House to show the Harding's transparencies of the potential sights they would see. Smoot urged the president and his wife to enjoy "a real vacation" in southern Utah as his "guests," and assured them that "the trip could be made with such comfort that Mrs. Harding would not be fatigued." (The First Lady had been critically ill in the fall of 1922) As "the only pure water along the road [for] a distance of sixty-two miles," and virtually the only shade in that same distance for the scorching mid-summer drive Smoot was planning for the Hardings, Pipe's tiny oasis loomed large in these discussions. In turn, these talks and the president's proposed trip led to Harding's decision to declare both Pipe Springs and Cedar Breaks as national monuments within the 21 days before his trip. The president planned to depart on June 20, 1923, and Pipe was proclaimed a monument May 31 and Cedar Breaks June 8. Harding was planning to visit both monuments but by May 10 and 11 Smoot told the Utah Press that the Hardings had decided to lop the Grand Canyon, and

therefore a stop at Pipe Spring, off their itinerary. Since they still planned to visit Bryce Canyon and Cedar Breaks along with Zion National Park, the senator boasted that “the president’s visit will be a wonderful advertisement for Utah” and that “it will be one of the biggest things that has happened to acquaint the country with the wonderful scenic attractions of the state.”⁶⁷

Meanwhile Mather used the Harding’s trip and his own upcoming junket with Congressman Crampton to pressure Heber J. Grant to persuade the Heatons to expedite the transfer of their claim to Pipe Springs. He explained “With this property actually a monument, I propose to have Congressman Crampton’s trip from Zion to the National Monuments and Mesa Verde made via Pipe Springs, so that he will see the place for himself and it will give me a chance to show him just what is needed in the way of improvements. After he comes across the desert from Hurricane [in the hot summer sun] I am sure he will be convinced of its importance as a stopping place, and would thus be able in any appropriation bills next winter to give proper attention to the requirements for [Winsor Castle’s] restoration.” Mather admonished Grant that “If I do not carry this through as proposed the whole thing goes over for another year and it will be two years before any funds would be available” for the purpose of restoring Winsor Castle. He pleaded with the President of the Mormon Church to “*do all in your power to put this pet project of mine through in the next thirty days.*”⁶⁸

At the time Mather wrote this letter, he was sick and had been confined to his bed for “a few days.” With the director thus incapacitated, Acting Director Arno B. Cammerer sent a memo

⁶⁷ Smoot, *Diary*, 531–533, and 536–537; Carl Sferrazza Anthony, *Florence Harding: The First Lady, The Jazz Age, and the Death of America’s Most Scandalous President* (New York: William Morrow and Company, 1998), 375–388; *CR*, October 1923: 102; *Garfield County News*, April 27, 1923, 1, UDN; *Salt Lake Tribune*, May 11, 1923, 22, CHL; *Springfield Republican* (Springfield, MA), May 17, 1923, 6, GB; *Idaho Statesman* (Boise, ID), May 24, 1923, 7, GB; *Ogden Standard Examiner*, June 4, 1923, 3, NPA; and *Washington County News*, June 7, 1923, 1, UDN.

⁶⁸ Stephen T. Mather, National Park Service, Washington, DC, to Heber J. Grant, President, Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints, Salt Lake City, Utah, May 21, 1923, NMPSF, italics mine.

to Commissioner Spry of the General Land Office seeking to expedite the process of the Heaton's obtaining a clear title to Pipe Springs. In an effort to use the personal religious affiliation of the commissioner of the Land Office, Cammerer begged Spry to reveal what he could regarding the machinations of the Indian Department to thwart the transfer and sent him a copy of a letter Heber J. Grant had written, clearly delineating that the church favored the establishment of Pipe Springs as a national monument. In writing for his boss, Cammerer's language was poignant and demonstrated the depth of Mather's feelings regarding Pipe Springs and his willingness to surreptitiously do battle with the commissioner of Indian Affairs: "Director Mather has taken a great personal interest in a proposal to establish this property as a National Monument. It is understood that Jonathan Heaton's ownership of this property has been disputed by the Indian Service and that there has been some action in this matter taken by the General Land Office. I would appreciate it if you would have the status of this matter looked up in order that Director Mather may have the facts."⁶⁹

On May 29, 1923, Mather transmitted his draft of a proclamation and an explanatory letter to President Harding by way of Secretary of the Interior Hubert Work. Mather wrote "I have personally visited Pipe Spring several times and realize the desirableness of having this area established as a National Monument *for the benefit of motorists traveling between Zion and Grand Canyon Parks.*" Mather's proclamation, though, as later signed by the President, indicated that "a large dwelling place, called 'Windsor Castle,' [*sic*] with portholes in its walls, which was used as a place of refuge from hostile Indians by the early settlers," was now to

⁶⁹ Arno B. Cammerer, Acting Director, National Park Service, "Memo for Commissioner Spry," May 18, 1923, NMPSF. Commissioner Spry was also the former governor of Utah and a Latter-day Saint.

“serve as a memorial of western pioneer life.” So as not to impact the Park Service’s budget by purchasing such a “way station,” Mather explained to President Harding:

I have interested a number of Utah’s representative citizens in this matter and have secured promise from the claimants of the property to sell it to myself and associates for \$5,000. It is my intention, when this purchase has been completed, to have the claimants [i.e. the Heatons] withdraw their application now pending on the appeal [of the Land Office’s rejection of their claim to ownership based on Daniel Seegmiller’s Valentine Scrip] in order that the National Monument proclamation may be made effective.

Almost as an afterthought, Mather ended his letter with this postscript: “At the suggestion of the Commissioner of Indian Affairs a clause has been inserted in the proclamation, giving the Indians of the Kaibab Reservation the privilege of utilizing the waters of Pipe Spring for irrigation, stock watering and other purposes under regulations to be prescribed by the Secretary of the Interior.”⁷⁰ Secretary Work passed the proclamation on for the president’s signature, emphasizing that “the spring affords the only water on the road between Hurricane, Utah, and Fredonia, Arizona, a distance of 62 miles, which is the direct route from the Zion National Park, Utah, to the north rim of the Grand Canyon National Park, Arizona. It is an oasis in the desert lands and with the increasing motor travel between the two National Parks, it is highly desirable that this area be established as a National Monument.”⁷¹

⁷⁰ McKoy, *Administrative History of Pipe Spring*, 106, and 653; and Stephen T. Mather, Memorandum for the Secretary, May 29, 1923, and related papers in NMPSF.

⁷¹ McKoy, *Administrative History of Pipe Spring*, 107; and Hubert Work, Secretary of the Interior, to My dear Mr. President, n.d., NMPSF, italics mine.

Even with Mather marshaling all the powers of heaven and earth, the Heatons' contested title could not be resolved before President Harding left for the west on June 20, 1923. But assured by the Secretary of the Interior, the Commissioner of the General Land Office, the Director of the NPS, and even the Commissioner of Indian Affairs that Mather would eventually get clear title, the President signed the proclamation anyway, declaring Pipe Spring a National Monument on May 31, 1923.⁷² To this point, the names "Pipe Spring" and "Pipe Springs" occur interchangeably in government documents. Even Mather himself used the terms interchangeably, but in his letter to the President and in the proclamation itself, the Director of the NPS used the name's singular form. When Harding signed the proclamation Mather had submitted, he inadvertently canonized the singular "Pipe Spring" at least as far as official government usage is concerned. Because of the language used in Presidential Proclamation No. 1663, this singular landmark would be known thereafter as "Pipe Spring National Monument." Still no one, not even the Commissioner of the General Land Office, actually knew who owned it. Cowboys, Indians, Mormons, and gentiles, the presidents of both church and state, and the leaders within the Interior Department (including the Secretary himself, the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, the Commissioner of the General Land Office, the Director of the NPS) all scrambled for control.⁷³ When the Heatons land claims were finally cleared up, it apparently took the entire sum they received for Pipe Spring (\$4,000) to pay their legal fees.⁷⁴

⁷² Warren G. Harding, "Proclamation 1663—Establishing the Pipe Spring National Monument, Arizona," May 31, 1923, in *The American Presidency Project*, <http://www.presidency.ucsb.edu/ws/?pid=76668>; Telegram of Stephen T. Mather, Department of the Interior, National Park Service, Washington, DC to Heber J. Grant, Salt Lake City, Utah, June 2, 1923, NMPSF; and McKoy, *Administrative History of Pipe Spring*, 653. The Proclamation was announced to the press on June 4. See *Morning Herald* (Hagerstown, Maryland), June 4, 1923, 1, NPA.

⁷³ A major contribution of Kathleen L. McKoy's *Cultures at a Crossroads: An Administrative History of Pipe Spring National Monument* is the insight she gives us into this "complicated" and tangled mass of bureaucratic and jurisdictional infighting centered around Pipe Spring and its water. See McKoy, *Administrative History of Pipe Spring*, especially 1–145.

⁷⁴ "Moccasin and Her People," 2:108–109.

No attempt was made to shield the purpose of the national monument and even the southern Utah papers announced that “the monument was created primarily for the benefit of motorists traveling between Zion National Park and the north rim of the Grand Canyon as it contains the only pure water along the road between Hurricane Utah, and Fredonia, Ariz, [sic] a distance of sixty-two miles.”⁷⁵ Neither Mather nor his Park Service associates “made a case for [the] national importance of the site during the process of its establishment.”⁷⁶ Outwardly Pipe was simply an old ranch made significant by the fact that its water made travel between important parks possible. Winsor Castle’s significance in Brigham Young’s contest with federal government had been so well by shielded by Utah’s founding prophet that his own people, some of whom had lived through the entire period, were oblivious to it. Anthony W. Ivins of the First Presidency was one of St. George’s original settlers, having come as a child with Erastus Snow’s original party late in 1861. He was thirteen years of age when Maxwell and McIntyre were murdered and had just turned twenty when Winsor Castle was finished in 1872. During his thirties he spent time there with his brothers-in-law Dee Woolley, Dan Seegmiller, Moses Thatcher, Marion Tanner, and other members of the Erastus Snow family. He often attended the semi-annual roundups at Pipe Springs. About seventy-years-old at the time Mather was gathering information regarding Pipe, Ivins boasted that he was better informed as to Pipe’s history than any man living. Yet, if we can judge by his correspondence preserved by the NPS and other historical writings, Ivins was unaware of the role Pipe Springs had played as an escape from persecution from the federal government. In June 1922 he wrote: “The report which is current that the fort was erected as a place of refuge for Utah people who were liable to prosecution

⁷⁵ See *San Diego Union*, June 4, 1923, 2, GB; and *Washington County News*, June 7, 1923, 1, USN.

⁷⁶ McKoy, *Administrative History of Pipe Spring*, 109.

under the anti poligamy [*sic*] laws which were later enacted is an error. It was built long before any trouble existed between the people of Utah and the Government on the question of polygamy.”⁷⁷

Trouble had in fact “existed between the people of Utah and the Government on the question of polygamy” at least since the early 1850s and the fort was finished a full decade after the passage of the Morrill Anti-Bigamy Act of 1862. The decision to build Winsor Castle was made as a wave of anti-polygamy furor swept over Washington at the time the Cullom Bill was debated in the halls of Congress early in 1870. One of the primary purposes for the existence of Brigham’s fortress in the desert was to secure an exit route for polygamists should an exodus from Utah be forced upon the Latter-day Saints by the federal government. President Ivins was well-posted on the history of polygamy, and may well have had a reasonably complete understanding of Pipe Springs’ role. But by the 1920s the New Moderate Mormonism that Grant, Ivins, and Smith were inventing was trying to fit in with the rest of the American nation, and its proponents had reason to minimize the church’s polygamous past. In fact, they felt that ignoring polygamy altogether was crucial for the new image of the church they were trying to create. A national monument to Mormon polygamy or the church’s “anti-American rebellion” was the last thing the hierarchy would have wanted. In 1923 it seems to have been in most everyone’s best interest to minimize the history of the deadly rancor that had existed between Ulysses S. Grant and Brigham Young and to conveniently forget how close it had come to breaking out in actual warfare between the United States and the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints. It must have seemed best to forget that the castle had been built with a specific anti-government strategy

⁷⁷ See NMPSF, especially Anthony W. Ivins, Office of the First Presidency, Salt Lake City, Utah, to Mr. D. S. Spencer, Salt Lake City, Utah, June 8, 1922; and AWI.

in mind, and that a large motivation for John Wesley Powell's mapping of the country around Pipe Springs was based on military exigency on the part of the US government during a critical period in its long struggle with the Mormon Church. For the purposes of both church and State in 1923, it was felt best to ignore the tense realities of the conflict and represent the fort as a simple ranch house whose ramparts and loopholes only existed to protect cowboys from "hostile Indians."

In the meantime, Mather put Senator Smoot to work making sure the dirt roads from Cedar City to Zion National Park were in shape for the President Harding's proposed visit late in June. On the eve of the president's departure from Washington, Smoot learned that the roads were still "in a horrible condition." In many places dust was "hub deep" and various obstacles dictated that travel time would only allow the president "one hour in the Park in the middle of the day." Exasperated, at first Smoot canceled the proposed southern jaunt altogether and proposed to substitute the trip to Zion with a visit to sites closer to Salt Lake. Mather had worked too hard to get the president to his Utah parks to let the opportunity altogether slip away and urged Smoot to immediately dispatch "about 200 men" to put the road in order between Cedar and Zion. The resources of the Mormon priesthood were immediately mobilized. Local bishops called out their quorums and the required number of men worked on the road "night and day" for about a week "removing rocks and smoothing the native roads" without compensation. The last of their great effort was to sprinkle bucket loads of water on the dustiest parts of the route so the presidential caravan would not be inconvenienced. When Smoot accompanied the president's motorcade over

the road to Zion he was proud to report that “there was very little dust”—but that was primarily because he was riding with the president in the lead car.⁷⁸

⁷⁸ Smoot, *Diaries*, 539–541; and *Washington County News*, July 5, 1923, 4, UDN; and W. Paul Reeve, “President Harding’s 1923 Visit to Utah,” *History Blazer*, July 1995, in “Utah History to Go,” http://historytogo.utah.gov/utah_chapters/from_war_to_war/presidenthardings1923visittoutah.html.

Conclusion

President Warren G. Harding's Voyage of Understanding

By 1923, a united, interfaith effort to turn southern Utah and northern Arizona's scenic beauties into great national playgrounds had replaced religious persecution, church vs. State acrimony, and actual preparations for war. Mormons and non-Mormons came together in a common effort to make these shared national treasures accessible to the traveling public. Kathleen McKoy has articulated that the establishment of Pipe Spring as a national monument was in part a token of thanks offered to the Mormons on behalf of a nation that was coming to appreciate the contribution they had made in settling a huge chunk of the American West.¹ In their quest to Americanize, the LDS hierarchy had aligned itself with the Republican Party, which by 1923 held the presidency and both houses of Congress. By making an enduring alliance with the party that had once oppressed it, Mormon Utah was increasing its political influence. Mormon votes were becoming necessary for Washington politicians to gain and keep their elected positions.²

By 1923, Apostle Reed Smoot had become one of the most powerful men in the US Senate. Long a senior member of the Senate Finance Committee, by August of 1922 the senior Republican senator from Utah was in line to become its chair. He was also the second most senior member of the Senate Appropriations Committee. According to President Warren G. Harding, as chair of the Finance Committee, Smoot presided over the handful of key senators whose "deliberations and decisions directly [impacted] every man and woman in America." Long before his election as President of the United States, Harding had developed a close relationship with the apostolic politician from Utah,

¹ McKoy, *Cultures at a Crossroads*, 118.

² See Jonathan H. Moyer, "Dancing with the Devil: The Making of the Mormon-Republican Pact" (PhD diss., University of Utah, 2009).

openly declaring that he was “the most valuable member of the United States Senate.” In addition to being political allies, Harding and Smoot had become personal friends. Harding was a religious man and his wife Florence dabbled in the occult. The Hardings politely accepted the copy of the *Book of Mormon* Smoot optimistically presented to them and on at least one occasion, when Mrs. Harding was deathly ill, the apostle was called to the White House to anoint her head with consecrated oil and bless her after the manner of Latter-day Saint healing. All this worked to convince Smoot that President Harding “was at least moderately impressed with Mormonism.” Through this friendship, Senator Smoot persuaded the Hardings to travel over seven-hundred miles out of their way to visit Zion National Park in an effort to draw tourism and railroad dollars to Smoot’s constituents. Long an ally of Smoot himself, Director Mather was delighted. To make sure that his state and his church and the national parks benefitted from the president’s visit, Smoot coached the president on what he should say in his speeches while he was in Utah.³

On June 27, 1923 (the 79th anniversary of the Martyrdom of Joseph Smith), President Harding gave two speeches in out-of-the-way Toquerville and Cedar City, Utah, in which he publicly offered thanks to the Latter-day Saint people for their role in settling and pioneering the interior west. The president’s visit and kind words represented a culmination in the transformation of the relationship between the Latter-day Saints and the federal government.⁴ Harding and his wife Florence called their planned two month hegira across America “a voyage of understanding.” Harding had been elected by calling on America to return to a “sane” post-war “normalcy . . . to be reached in deliberation and understanding.” In a notable campaign speech he declared that “For emergence from the wreckage of war. . . we must all give and take, we must [not only] sympathize . . . but [we] must learn [to

³ *Beaver County News*, August 18, 1922, 7, UDN; Milton R. Merrill, *Reed Smoot: Apostle in Politics* (Logan: Utah State University Press, 1990), especially 151, 155–156, and 229; *CR*, October 1922, 102; Harding, *Speeches*, 33; Flake, *The Seating of Senator Reed Smoot*; and Smoot, *Diaries*, 531. Smoot went so far as to announce to the general conference of his church that his prayer saved Mrs. Harding “from the brink of the grave.”

⁴ Warren G. Harding, *Speeches and Addresses of Warren G. Harding, President of the United States, Delivered During the Course of His Tour from Washington, D. C., to Alaska and Return to San Francisco, June 20 to August 2, 1923*, reported and compiled by James W. Murphy, Official Reporter, U. S. Senate, (N.p., 1923), 151–156; McKoy, 117–118; and Reeve, “President Harding’s Visit to Utah.”

understand each other's] griefs and aspirations [and] seek the common grounds of mutuality." As he accepted the Republican Party's nomination, Warren Harding declared that "More than all else the present-day world needs understanding. There can be no peace save through [the reconciliation of] differences, and the submission of the individual to the will and weal of the many."⁵ After his election, the new president had made "promoting understanding and peace" a major theme of his administration. One of President Harding's great goals for America was to help her squabbling sections, ethnic minorities, and diverse religious groups to understand that the "common welfare" of the entire Republic was the great "goal of our national endeavor." He proclaimed that the "great inspiration" of the American system rested on the coming together of disparate individuals and groups and he desired all his countrymen to share in "this American viewpoint."⁶

As he crossed the continent by rail between June 20 and his death on August 2, Warren Harding repeatedly told his countrymen that his purpose was to form "a more intimate acquaintance with the people of [the] United States" so as to better understand and serve them. He told them the trip was "the most extended tour for inspection of National concerns that it has ever been the privilege of an American President to make." It included a trans-continental rail road tour, a visit to Alaska, and had Harding not died before the trip was finished, it would have included a sea-voyage back to Washington via the Panama Canal and Puerto Rico. Part of the president's plan to "reconcile antagonisms" at home was to use his "voyage of understanding" to draw attention to Mather's parks to give a war-weary nation a source of pride. These "natural wonderlands" had the potential to deepen the people's

⁵ Frederick E. Schortemeier, *Rededicating America: Life and Recent Speeches of Warren G. Harding* (Indianapolis: The Bobbs-Merrill Company Publishers, 1920), 109, 225, 42.

⁶ Warren G. Harding, "Inaugural Address," March 4, 1921, The American Presidency Project. <http://www.presidency.ucsb.edu/ws/?pid=25833>, italics mine. Warren G. Harding, "Second Annual Message," December 8, 1922, The American Presidency Project. <http://www.presidency.ucsb.edu/ws/?pid=29563>. In his "second annual message" to the nation, delivered less than six months before he took his Voyage of Understanding through Utah, Harding identified the great danger to the republic which he saw in what he and other national leaders of the period called "hyphenated Americanism." To Harding hyphenated Americans were individuals and subgroups within the country who were more committed to individual, group, or sectional interests than to the common welfare of the republic as a whole. A reaction against the problems of immigration, sectionalism, and deep seated fears brought on by the Bolshevik revolution in Russia, the president's warfare against hyphenated Americanism was one of the hallmarks of his administration.

allegiance to their country and serve as places where Americans could intermingle and come know each other better. Harding's original itinerary included Zion, Cedar Breaks, Bryce Canyon, Pipe Spring, the Grand Canyon, Yellowstone, Yosemite and other national parks and monuments, but before he departed on his voyage the official itinerary had been pared down to include only major parks like Zion, Yellowstone and Yosemite. The Hardings and their entourage travelled in a ten-car train, called *The Superb*, which was accompanied across the country by a second locomotive pulling five cars. For various parts of the trip they were accompanied by the Secretary of the Interior Hubert Work, Secretary of Agriculture Henry C. Wallace, Secretary of Commerce Herbert Hoover, Speaker of the House Frederick H. Gillett, and a changing cadre of senators and congress members. The president's fifteen cars also carried ten secret service agents, twenty-two newspaper correspondents, five photographers, an unspecified number of newsreel cameramen and stenographers, and a number of electronic technicians to set up loudspeaker systems and radio broadcasting equipment.⁷

During his Voyage of Understanding, Harding also wanted to assess whether the state's predominantly Mormon population had become "100 percent Americans." "Hyphenated Americans" was a pejorative term much used in the early decades of the twentieth century to describe Americans with divided loyalties. Most often it was used to connote immigrants who, though naturalized American citizens, held greater allegiance to their countries of origin and used their influence to advance those nations at the expense of their new adopted home. With socialism and communism challenging American capitalism, and with socialist and Bolshevik "agitators" operating in the United States, immigrants who had not sufficiently Americanized were almost automatically suspected of sedition. Since many Mormons were convert immigrants, and their religious tenets differed somewhat from those of the standard "American sects," especially as it touched upon their loyalty to their prophets, Mormon-Americans were often grouped with other hyphenated Americans. Harding's predecessors were outspoken against the dangers posed to the Republic by Americans with divided loyalties. Teddy

⁷ Trani and Wilson, 172–174.

Roosevelt said that “a hyphenated American is not an American at all,” and flatly stated that they should find “no room in this country.” They must either fully Americanize or leave.⁸ Woodrow Wilson had gone so far as to say that “any man who carries a hyphen about with him carries a dagger that he is ready to plunge into the vitals of this Republic whenever he gets ready.”⁹

Though originating in many different countries, including the United States, Mormons were viewed by many as an alien group who gave allegiance to their church first and their country second. Considering the revolutionary history of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, which some Americans still considered to be a “state within a state” with imperial designs, many felt Mormon-Americans could not be trusted with political office. In 1920, for example, the Arizona Baptist Convention distributed a circular which declared that the Mormon Church was an institution “dangerous [to] America” and that “the Mormon faith and practice [was] in direct opposition to the spirit and letter of . . . the National Constitution.” Quoting from an early work written by Apostle Parley P. Pratt, the circular stated that “the Mormon Church claims that the Priesthood ‘holds’ the power and right to give laws and commandments to individuals, churches, rulers, nations and the whole world [as well as] to appoint, ordain and establish kings, presidents, governors, or judges.” The circular sought to bar Mormon-Americans from US politics altogether, arguing that “no Mormon ought to be honored by the people with any public trust because his system is politically under . . . the dominance of the higher priesthood.”¹⁰

For years, Latter-day Saint politicians like Reed Smoot and William Spry had been assuring their non-Mormon colleagues in Washington that their fellow church members no longer had “divided loyalties.” They promised that the Mormons had entered the American mainstream in good faith and commitment to the nation’s ideals. Former Utah congressman and senator George Sutherland, however,

⁸ *Lewiston Daily Sun*, October 14, 1915, 10, news.google.com.

⁹ See Vought, especially 147.

¹⁰ *Graham Guardian* (Safford, Arizona), October 29, 1920, 1, CALOC. See also Parley P. Pratt, *Key to the Science of Theology: Designed as an Introduction to the First Principles of Spiritual Philosophy; Religion; Law and Government; as Delivered by the Ancients, and as Restored in This Age, For the Final Development of Universal Peace, Truth and Knowledge* (Liverpool: F. D. Richards, 1855), 66.

“who was born a Mormon but call[ed] himself a gentile,” continued to raise the question whether any Latter-day Saint totally committed to his religion could possibly be fully loyal to his country.¹¹ Sutherland had been a trusted campaign advisor to Harding and was widely credited with the campaign’s success.¹² Just months before the president’s Voyage of Understanding, Harding had appointed Sutherland to the Supreme Court. While apparently never baptized himself, Sutherland was the son of Latter-day Saint converts who had brought him to Utah as an infant but then quickly left the church. Growing up among the Mormons, Sutherland was convinced by his father that Brigham Young had committed murder and treason to advance his Kingdom and that there was something fundamentally un-American about Mormonism. This notwithstanding, Sutherland was educated at Brigham Young Academy where he became a protégé and favorite of the premier Latter-day Saint educator Karl G. Maeser. While at BYA he came to understand and respect his believing teachers and classmates, who likewise came to trust him, and he soon became one of Utah’s greatest lawyers and statesmen. Although born in Great Britain, by 1920 he had become one of the foremost authorities in the country on the US Constitution, and since the deaths of Ulysses S. Grant and Utah Chief Justice James B. McKean, few non-Mormons understood the philosophical contradictions existing between that document and the principles of early Latter-day Saint theocracy as well as George Sutherland did. Though he thoroughly understood Mormonism and respected his neighbors, he was wary of the inconsistencies between what he saw as two competing and ultimately incompatible systems. Those closest to Sutherland knew he was “not at all sympathetic” with the church’s political plans, and ultimately saw something sinister in them.¹³ Sutherland was opposed to hyphenated Americanism in

¹¹ *Los Angeles Herald*, November 28, 1904, 1, CDNC. Sutherland once said “You can not reason with a false religious belief any more than you can argue with a case of typhoid fever. It simply runs its course and mental health returns. . . when the false belief no longer appeals to [the intellect].” Flake, *The Seating of Senator Reed Smoot*, 155.

¹² Joel Francis Paschal, *Mr. Justice Sutherland: A Man Against the State* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1951), especially 106–108.

¹³ Edward L. Carter and James C. Phillips, “The Mormon Education of a Gentile Justice: George Sutherland and Brigham Young Academy,” *Journal of Supreme Court History* 33 (November 2008): 322–340; and James Henry Moyle, *Mormon Democrat: The Religious and Political Memoirs of James Henry Moyle*, edited by Gene A. Sessions, (Salt Lake City: Historical Department of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 1975), 135–140.

any form. He repeatedly told Harding “that one of the gravest dangers the people as a whole are facing is that of being dominated and exploited by and for the benefit of organized minorities of various kinds who know exactly what they want.”¹⁴ Thus Smoot, Spry, and Sutherland gave Harding conflicting reports on Utah’s ultimate loyalty. As part of his Voyage of Understanding the President now had the chance to gauge Utah’s “Americanism” for himself.

Harding and most, if not all, of his cabinet members remembered the anti-polygamy crusade, when the press had acrimoniously explored, almost daily, some aspect of “Mormon disobedience and disloyalty.” During the 1880s, Harding’s own newspaper, *Marion Star*, had repeatedly called the Mormons “fiends,” “American blood-clots” and “polygamous lepers” motivated by a “pernicious creed.” Calling Mormonism an “alarming and increasing evil” that needed to be “throttled” immediately, the *Marion Star* facetiously suggested that all the Native Americans in America be sent to Utah to “mix” with the Mormons in the hopes that “one [group] or the other would commence extermination and thus relieve the government of a heavy charge.”¹⁵ These leaders also experienced first-hand the intense anti-Mormon climate between 1901 and 1907 as “a broad coalition of Protestant churches sought to expel . . . Reed Smoot from the Senate, arguing that as a Latter-day Saint apostle he was a lawbreaker and therefore unfit to be a lawmaker.” During that time the whole church and its difficult history were put on trial by the Senate Judiciary Committee in what became known as the Smoot Hearings.¹⁶ But like his New Testament namesake, Warren “Gamaliel” Harding, was willing to suspend judgement while he tried to “understand” these peculiar Christians.¹⁷

¹⁴ George Sutherland, Chicago, Illinois, to Honorable Warren G. Harding, U. S. Senate, Washington, D.C., June 26, 1920, http://3197d6d14b5f19f2f440-5e13d29c4c016cf96cbbfd197c579b45.r81.cfl.rackcdn.com/collection/papers/1920/1920_0626_SutherlandHardingT.pdf.

¹⁵ Hans P. Vought, *The Bully Pulpit and the Melting Pot: American Presidents and the Immigrant, 1987–1933* (Macon, GA: Mercer University Press, 2004), 156; and *Marion Star* (Marion, Ohio), 3 July 1885, 1, 8 July 1885, 1, 14 July 1885, 2, 21 July 1885, 1, 2 September 1885, 2, 21 October 1885, 1, 4 February 1886, 2, 7 May 1886, 1, 26 June 1886, 6, NC.

¹⁶ Flake, *The Seating of Senator Reed Smoot*, especially dust jacket; and U. S. Senate, Committee on Privileges and Elections, *Proceedings Before the Committee on Privileges and Elections of the United States Senate in the Matter of the Protests Against the Right of Hon. Reed Smoot, a Senator from the State of Utah, to Hold His Seat*, 4 vols., 59th Cong., 1st Sess. S. Doc. No. 486, (Washington: Government Printing Office, 1906).

¹⁷ See Acts 5:33–40.

In an attempt to comprehend the Utah situation, Warren Harding took leave of his train in Ogden on June 26 and traveled in a seventeen-car motorcade the forty miles to Salt Lake through towns and roads thronged with tens of thousands of Utahns enthusiastically smiling and waving friendly hands and American flags. The Hardings traveled with Governor Mabey in the governor's brand new Lincoln Touring Car and Senators Reed Smoot and William H. King rode in the motorcade. The Associated Press reported that the president received "an almost continuous ovation during the 40 mile ride" as "hundreds gathered" in "every little town and along the country side to cheer, wave flags and . . . to strew roses in the pathway of the presidential automobile." The *Salt Lake Telegram* reported that "tiny tots with stars and stripes of proportionate size, smiling girls with larger flags and Boy Scouts, erect and serious of countenance, flanked the route in every town." A correspondent for the *San Diego Evening Tribune* reported that "at every cross-road and hamlet people had gathered for miles to extend Utah's welcome to the president" and that flowers from the innumerable rose gardens that deck the great [Salt Lake] valley were strewn in the pathway of the president's car." The reception in Utah was "American," and "non-partisan." "At every stop during the motor trip" Mrs. Harding "was almost buried under flowers" presented to her by adoring children. Meanwhile, the surprised and overwhelmed president "rode mile after mile with his hat in hand acknowledging the greetings that were extended to him from every side."

Despite the fact that the police were out in force to control the masses, several times "the crowds that lined the roadside" swarmed the president's car "literally [forcing him] to stop and verbally express his appreciation [for] the warmth of [their] welcome." By the time he reached Bountiful, some ten miles north of the capital city, Harding was convinced that Mormons, especially the younger generations, posed no threat to America but were part of its promise for the future. Indeed, "the royal greeting" he was receiving in what was left of Brigham Young's kingdom convinced him that these patriotic Latter-day Saints were not hyphenated Americans at all. These Mormon Utahns whose ancestors had once dusted their feet off against the government of the United States and left America in disgust were now possessed of an Americanism that thoroughly surprised Harding. Even the discerning

newspapermen who accompanied the president reported Harding's reception in Utah far outshone any he had received and that the president "was made to feel that he had many friends among the people of Utah."

In front of the Bountiful Tabernacle, whose basement had once concealed stores of Mormon foodstuffs to be used fighting an invading American army during the Utah War, 1,500 Latter-day Saints, "fully two-thirds of them small children," blocked the progress of the presidential motorcade. In contrast to the little girls dressed in white who once carried sarcastic banners mocking Ulysses S. Grant in the demonstration of July 4, 1871, "a hundred tiny girls, bearing a huge banner which bore the inscription 'Utah's best crop'" forced the President out of his automobile. Harding climbed the steps of the tabernacle and addressed the crowd for three minutes. In his short and spontaneous remarks, he expressed his relief at seeing for himself the extent of Utah's patriotism and commitment to the ideals of America. "I have had my faith in America [and in Utah] renewed this morning," he told the enthusiastic assembly. "I want to tell you, my countrymen," he continued, "that nothing can ever go wrong with Utah, or with the republic, so long as it has [such] a sturdy crop of *American* childhood" with which to build its future. He ended his revealing impromptu speech in Bountiful by declaring "that he entertained no fears for the future of America when he looked upon the . . . young folks of Utah."

In Salt Lake, the president's presence brought out "the largest down town crowds on record," and his motorcade followed a predetermined parade route. Again, throngs of citizens waved and showered flowers on the motorcade as it rode on streets decorated with flags and red-white-and-blue bunting. This time, however, at the president's special request there were no marching bands because he did not appreciate "noise." The only sound was a deafening "salvo of applause . . . that found no cessation" during the entire parade. A "cavalry troop with drawn sabers preceded the presidential car" but as a sign of the new era, the president's car "was followed closely" by an open 1922 Lincoln Model L 7-passenger Touring Car carrying "a bodyguard of secret service agents." At a brief stop in Salt Lake's Liberty Park, where years before certain church leaders had secretly performed post-Manifesto plural marriages, Harding told these Utahns that they had won his heart. "I speak only the truth when I

say that I have always liked Utah,” he said, “but I like it better than ever at this moment because of the cordiality of your greeting and the magnificent [demonstration] of citizenship . . . which it has been our privilege today to enjoy.” The president continued, “This trip has given me a new conception of [your state] and words are unable to express my appreciation of the warm friendly spirit of this reception.” A little later the Hardings ate lunch in the church-owned Hotel Utah, which stood on the site of the tithing barns where George Q. Cannon and other polygamists had hid from US marshals during the Raid. At that point, the President of the United States was only a few yards from the mansions where Brigham Young had spent months under house arrest while the US Supreme Court considered the Engelbrecht case which inadvertently decided on the constitutionality of the prophet’s unlawful cohabitation case. En route to the Salt Lake Country Club for a round of golf with Heber J. Grant, the president’s motorcade drove to the parade ground at Fort Douglas, where United States cannons had once been sighted-in on Young’s mansions. Members of the Utah National Guard, whose fathers had served in the Nauvoo Legion, stood at attention and presented arms while a select few gave their Commander-in-Chief the Presidential Salute, firing twenty-one thunderous shots from several large howitzers. At 7:30 p.m. the president’s party was “entertained at a private organ recital in the Tabernacle, a feature added to the program at the express request of Mrs. Harding.” At 8:15 President Harding spoke from the same Tabernacle stand from which Mormon leaders had given hundreds of speeches against the United States and its presidents. On the eve of his father’s flight to his southern bastion in October 1871, for example, Apostle Brigham Young, Jr. had been “bitterly denunciatory of the Federal officials” announcing that “the Government officials now persecuting were tools of the devil.” But a half century later the head of that government complemented Utah on the remarkable reception extended to himself and his retinue as they prepared to enter the very heart of Zion. A descendant of the Deseret Telegraph Company, the church’s radio station KZN (K-Zion) made “radio history” by broadcasting the speech. The live broadcast went to multiple locations in Salt Lake City, and to “nearly every nook and corner of

the state as well as most of the other states in the union.” Outdoor amplifiers were set up on Temple Square and Liberty Park for those who could not squeeze into the Tabernacle and Assembly Hall.¹⁸

The Great War, Harding said as he concluded his remarks, had taught “us the lesson that we had not been so American in spirit as we had honestly pretended” and charged that “some of our . . . citizenship wore the habiliments of America, but were not consecrated in soul [to her ideals].” He spoke of the dangers this posed for the country. “Some to whom we have given all the advantages of American citizenship,” he said, “would destroy the very institutions under which they have accepted our hospitality.” Pointing out this danger he called for a revival in pushing the necessary process of Americanization at home “which we too long [have] neglected.” “I wish these United States to go on securely,” Harding stated, “I would like developing dangers noted and appraised and intelligently and patriotically guarded against.” In repeated “extemporaneous additions to his prepared address,” Harding described how fighting a common enemy had “revealed the soul of America and consecrated it to [a common] ideal.” He told listeners that since the war had brought America closer together, he thought it “a great mistake that we drift back into selfishness” and separatism. Harding pointed out that conflict and disunion was costly, both for the world and for the nation. “Just think of it!” he said, “eighty-five per cent of every tax dollar goes to war, preparation for war and payment of past wars. Don’t you think we ought to play our part in abolishing war?”

A close examination of Harding’s actions and speeches in Utah shows that the President was subtly encouraging Mormon Utah to finalize her Americanization.¹⁹ During his two days there, he repeatedly called upon Utah to be “one” with the rest of the nation and “strive for the common good” of

¹⁸ Reeve, “Harding’s Visit”; *Deseret News*, 26 June 1923, 1–2, and second section, 1, and 27 June 1923, 1–3, and 6, CHL; *Daily Register Gazette* (Rockford, IL), June 26, 1923, 1, GB; *San Diego Evening Tribune*, June 26, 1923, 10, GB; *Idaho Statesman* (Boise, ID), June 26, 1926, 2, GB; *Augusta Chronicle* (GA), June 27, 1923, 1, GB; *Boston Herald*, June 28, 1923, 3, GB; *Salt Lake Telegram*, June 26, 1923, 1, 3, 5, and 6, and June 27, 1923, 1, and 7, CHL; *Tampa Tribune* (Tampa, FL), June 28, 1923, 1, GB; Harding, *Speeches*, 130–151; George W. Givens, *500 More Little-Known Facts in Mormon History* (Springville, UT: Bonneville Books, 2004), 235–236; *Sacramento Daily Union*, October 6, 1871, 2, CDNC; Christopher H. Sterling, ed., *Encyclopedia of Radio*, 3 vols., (New York: Fitzroy Dearborn, 2004), 2: 1592–1593; and Gerry Avant, “Mormon Tabernacle Choir on Parade,” January 27, 2001, *Church News*, <http://www.ldschurchnews.com/articles/39254/Mormon-Tabernacle-Choir-on-parade.html>

¹⁹ Lawrence, 1; Harding, *Speeches*, 127–156; *Salt Lake Telegram*, 27 June 1923, 1 and 7, CHL.

all Americans. He openly told Utahns that the United States needed their “100 percent” allegiance. Most importantly, he assured these people, many of whom felt that in the not-too-distant past they had had been mistreated by the people of the United States, that “the Republic wants you to be a part of it.” On the evening he first crossed Utah’s border, the president had articulated his goal that there be no more hyphens—there must only be “*one* American people, with *one* aspiration, *one* love of country, *one* pride in the Republic’s accomplishments, and *one* love for dear ‘Old Glory.’” The development of great national playgrounds and inter-park highways to bring others into the heart of Mormondom and to more fully Americanize Utah contributed to this goal. The designation of Pipe Spring a National Monument was Harding’s way of proclaiming to Mormons and non-Mormon’s alike that the Latter-day Saints were part of America and that their history was an integral part of America’s history.²⁰

Newspapers all over the country reported that “the striking feature of the tabernacle meeting was the approval the president aroused” in his listeners with his comments about increasing understanding and ending conflict. “Last night’s meeting in the president’s honor in the great Mormon tabernacle in Salt Lake City,” a syndicated writer wired to the four corners of the nation, “was the most successful that Mr. Harding has addressed since he left Washington a week ago today, if success is to be measured by the enthusiasm which prevailed and the approval given the utterances of the president.”²¹

Not long after his speech in the Tabernacle, Harding and his entire entourage, now joined by a number of Utah dignitaries, including Governor Mabey, Senator Smoot, and Presidents Grant and Ivins, and the commander of the US troops at Fort Douglas, boarded *The Superb* and her sister train in Salt Lake City for an all night ride to Cedar City. Just before 8:00 a.m. on June 27, 1923, the two locomotives arrived in Cedar City on the barely completed Union Pacific spur which now connected Cedar with Lund, Salt Lake, Los Angeles, and the rest of the nation’s rail-network.²² In Utah the new rail line was called the National Park Line because it would now bring tourists to Cedar which was

²⁰ Harding, *Speeches*, 127–156, especially 127, and 153–154.

²¹ For examples, see *Plain Dealer* (Cleveland, OH), 28 June 1923, 17, GB.

²² *Plain Dealer* (Cleveland, OH), June 28, 1923, 17, GB; and *Richfield Reaper*, June 28, 1923, 1, and 4, UDN.

touted as the gateway to Zion, Pipe Spring, the North Rim, Cedar Breaks and Bryce Canyon. Senator Smoot and Parks Director Mather had used the occasion of Harding's trip to pressure the Union Pacific to expedite the construction of the forty mile spur, which took just 87 days and \$1,049,000 to complete. Newspapers had announced that the president would only visit Zion "providing the track was in shape for his big special train," and chronicled the "orgy of toil" it required. To show the connection between the line and the president's visit, a post marked the site for a new town to be called "Harding, Utah." Reportedly, every man in the Union Pacific system "from the highest executive to the lowest section hand plunged into the work with redoubled energy." Just forty-eight hours before the president's arrival in Cedar, the train stop was still strewn with debris from a swath of houses torn down to make room for the track and from a brand new depot that was still being finished. The *Garfield County News* reported that "twelve hours before the President's train was due the electricians were [still] erecting poles and stringing the lights along the railway track and the station yard."²³ Dave Bulloch as a boy of seven had ridden into Cedar Valley with the Mormon Pioneers in 1851 standing "on the running gear in front of the first wagon," and at seventy-eight years of age the former owner of the Pipe Springs Ranch was honored as a passenger in President Harding's private rail car.²⁴

In Cedar City, former Pipe Springs cowboy and road booster Randall Jones, now a state senator, headed "the citizen's committee in tendering the hospitality of southern Utah to the presidential party." Some 6,000 people from all over southern Utah crowded into Cedar City. To provide the president with an "authentic" western experience the committee had arranged for Captain Pete and his band of seventy-five Cedar City Paiutes to be on hand, some in native costume and painted faces. Although on a tight schedule, the president acknowledged "the original inhabitants of the land" by shaking every hand. In the process scores of cameras recorded staged photos of the president greeting a Paiute mother

²³ *Garfield County News*, August 24, 1923, 1, and 9, UDN; *Lexington Herald* (KY), July 28, 1923, 3, GBC; *San Diego Union*, August 23, 1923, 3, GBC.

²⁴ "Cedar City's First White Boy Rides Cedar City's First Train," *Iron County Record*, June 22, 1923, 1, UDN; *Iron County Record*, July 11, 1924, 1, UDN; and Hunter Stubbs, "David Dunn Bulloch September 1844," <http://www.sonsofutahpioneers.info/2013essays/daviddunbullochseptember1844.pdf>.

and two children. Presidents Grant and Ivins, Senator Smoot, Governor Mabey, and a host of other Utah dignitaries accompanied Harding the seventy miles to Zion National Park in a motorcade of “thirty-two highly polished cars furnished by Cedar City residents.” Reportedly “175 people” piled into the vehicles which were “gay with bunting” and driven by experienced locals who knew the roads. The children of Cedar City threw roses in front of President Harding’s vehicle, “making a literal driveway of roses.” President and Mrs. Harding shared an automobile with Senator Smoot and Governor and Mrs. Mabey. Deputy sheriffs “garbed as cowboys“ were stationed every few miles along the route to keep “the road clear of cows and tourists.”²⁵

At some point before the motorcade dropped over the rim of the basin “the story of the execution of [John D.] Lee for his participation in the Mountain Meadows massacre was recited as the trail which the emigrants [had been taking towards] California was pointed out.”²⁶ The motorcade drove down the precipitous Black Canyon that Brigham Young had once planned to use to keep the armies of Harding’s predecessors out of his southern bastion. Now, with polygamy’s total surrender nearly two decades in the past, Young’s successor welcomed Harding, several members of his cabinet, and the US Speaker of the House into Brigham’s bastion with open arms. At the deserted village of Harrisburg the motorcade passed the ruins of an old Mormon meeting house where Young in 1863 had resolutely stated “This is the place for our women and children [to hide, while we] meet the demon on . . . grounds [of our choosing].”²⁷ The fact that President and Mrs. Harding, the governor of Utah, and the apostolic chair of the Senate Finance Committee passed the ruined church in which these words were uttered while peacefully chatting in the same motor-car showed just how much had changed.

²⁵ *Deseret News*, June 27, 1923, 2, and June 28, 1923, 9, CHL; *Iron County Record*, June 29, 1923, 1, UDN; *Richfield Reaper*, June 28, 1923, 1, and 4, UDN; *Salt Lake Telegram*, June 28, 1923, 2, UDN; *Plain Dealer*, June 28, 1923, 17, GB; *Ogden Standard Examiner*, June 28, 1923, 1, UDN; and *Washington County News*, July 5, 1923, 4, UDN.

²⁶ *Salt Lake Telegram*, June 28, 1923, 2, UDN.

²⁷ Mosiah L. Hancock, “Autobiography of Mosiah Lyman Hancock,” NMS. Young’s quote continues “For so help us, our God, we will never give up that Holy Law [Polygamy] that the noble prophets [Joseph and Hyrum Smith] laid down their lives to maintain. . . . The powers of hell will do their utmost to get this people to give up that Holy Law which God designs to maintain. Give the devil an inch and he is sure to [take a mile]. Therefore, I do not intend to give one inch, but to maintain every foot of ground we have gained.”

At Toquerville, Harding made a short stop where a specially built platform draped in patriotic red, white, and blue bunting had been put up in the shade of the poplars on the tiny village's main street. Toquerville had been selected as the gathering place where all of Utah's Dixie would welcome the president and its residents crammed in with their wagons, carriages, and automobiles. Uniformed veterans of the Great War managed the crowd that had gathered from all over Kane and Washington Counties. A number of southern Utah's notable pioneers wearing special medals for the occasion sat on the colorful stand with local dignitaries.²⁸ Prominent among them was Elizabeth Steele Stapley, who had "the dis[t]inction of being the first white child born in Utah."²⁹ Her niece, Mary Janette Stapley Bringhurst, the wife of Toquerville's bishop, had hidden herself at Pipe Springs during the anti-polygamy raid and given birth to a daughter there, and presumably both were there in the crowd gathered in their home town to welcome the president. David H. Cannon was also honored on the stand. His life had spanned much of Mormon history. As a six-year old, he had watched his father make the death masks of Joseph and Hyrum Smith. One of the original pioneers Brigham Young had called to St. George in 1861, as a young man Cannon paradoxically had both served as a "missionary to the Lamanites" under Jacob Hamblin and assisted James Andrus in violently disciplining Navajo raiders. As manager of the Southern Mission's tithing office he had received Pipe Spring's beef, cheese, and butter for the use of construction workers building the St. George Temple. Later he had served as a counsellor in the presidency of the St. George Temple under Wilford Woodruff and then under J.D.T. McAllister, and eventually became president of the temple himself.³⁰

Stapley and Cannon were joined by a pair of petit white haired sisters named Mary Ann and Adelaide Cooper Savage, who had come to Utah in 1856 pulling their mother's handcart.

²⁸ *Salt Lake Telegram*, June 28, 1923, 2, UDN; and *Washington County News*, June 28, 1923, 1, UDN.

²⁹ *Washington County News*, June 28, 1923, 1, UDN. Elizabeth Steele Stapley was the daughter of one of the few married couples that traveled together with the Mormon Battalion. John and Catharine Steele reached the Salt Lake Valley about a week and a half after Brigham Young and his pioneers did in 1847. Catharine gave birth to Elizabeth on a buffalo robe in a tent on the site of what would become Salt Lake City on August 9, 1847. See also *Milford News*, July 30, 1931, 5, UDN; and *Washington County News*, April 7, 1938, 1, UDN.

³⁰ William R. Palmer, "Pioneers of Southern Utah: David H. Cannon," *Instructor*, 80 (October 1945): 455-458, 464.

Representative of early Utah's strange marital practices, once the Cooper sisters got to their Latter-day Zion, Levi Savage, Jr., one of the first settlers of both Pipe Springs and Kanab, had married them both along with their mother. (Savage was the first white man we have record of to graze herds in the Pipe Springs region, and was apparently chased out by James Whitmore with Erastus Snow and Brigham Young's consent.) Dan Seegmiller's brother Charles sat near the Savages on the presidential dais, as did Ed Lamb, who had cowboeyed at Pipe for Dee Woolley. Dan Seegmiller's grandson and namesake Daniel Seegmiller McQuarrie, who had early written of his experiences killing mustangs near Pipe Springs, was now a *Deseret News* staff writer on hand to cover the President's trip to Zion. Traveling with the church dignitaries from Salt Lake was Robert L. Judd, who as a toddler called "Bertie" had briefly been sheltered at Winsor Castle by his mother during the raid. By now Judd was a promising young Salt Lake attorney of thirty-eight years of age and a son-in-law of Heber J. Grant. President Anthony W. Ivins of the church's First Presidency, also sat near his cousin Heber Grant, both of whom had run stock on the Pipe Springs range. Noticeably absent from the celebration was Dee Woolley who had dreamed of such a day for four decades but had died the previous year.³¹

Harding personally greeted all the pioneers on the stand and admired their medals. Then, from atop his podium he gave "a neat little speech" in which he "extolled the pioneers who had . . . made what was once a wilderness to bloom as a rose." A religious man, Harding told the predominantly Mormon crowd that "surely God had a purpose when he prompted these pioneers [to come into the desert] and I have a reverent regard for them." Turning to the pioneers, he said "Great honor is due the rugged pioneers who came and settled this country, and proud should the decendents [*sic*] be to have for parents such noble and loyal [Americans]." Focusing again on the throng before him, Harding said something Heber J. Grant had been longing to hear for decades. "There is no place in America [that] can offer a finer company of Americans than I see before me now." Before leaving he commented on

³¹ *Washington County News*, June 28, 1923, 1, UDN; *Ogden Standard Examiner*, June 28, 1923, 1, UDN; and *Deseret News*, June 28, 1923, 1, CHL.

the roads, reporting that he had been told “that the roads down here were rough.” Seemingly unaware of the herculean effort that had just been made to smooth and straighten these dirt roads so they would be not only passible but comfortable for him, the president said that he was impressed with the quality of the roads and that he had “enjoyed every minute” he had spent on them.³² The only complaint Harding’s newspapermen made regarding the roads was that motorcade’s long line of vehicles kicked up such clouds of dust that the lesser V.I.P’s at the end of the cortège “were compelled to carry a little of Utah real estate” on their clothing, skin and hair.³³

After leaving Toquerville, the president’s convoy climbed the treacherous Hurricane Fault. Not far from the peculiar escarpment of the Vermilion Cliffs John Wesley Powell had named “Smithsonian Butte,” the motorcade descended again into the gorge of the Virgin. At the tiny village of Springdale Harding was hailed by John Dennet and A.D. Gifford, who were survivors of “the same fife and drum corps that used to greet Brigham Young” when he visited the river settlements on his annual tours.³⁴ In these very villages, Young had told Mormons of their generation “to adorn this place . . . for it is a good hiding place.” Referring to the entire system of labyrinthine megaliths and canyons that now compose and surround Zion National Park, he “rejoiced in the Lord to see what God had done [in] this mountain region.” In their presence he had thanked God “for these rugged mountains & barren Hills [that provided] a Defence [*sic*] for the Saints of God,” declaring that “if it was not for . . . these strong mountains the Gentiles would drive us out but they are so barren & rugged that the Gentiles find no place to stop to get a foothold for the Saints have taken up all places fit for Cultivation.” Speaking of Zion Canyon itself, President Young said “We will call it little Zion and it will be a sacred place of protection to the people in case we should need it.”³⁵ Nearly sixty years later and not far geographically from where Young made these remarks, President and Mrs. Harding entered Little Zion and had lunch

³² *Salt Lake Telegram*, June 28, 1923, 2, UDN; *Washington County News*, June 28, 1923, 1, UDN; *Iron County Record*, June 29, 1923, 1, UDN; and Harding, *Speeches*.

³³ *Salt Lake Telegram*, June 28, 1923, 2, UDN.

³⁴ *Ogden Standard Examiner*, June 28, 1923, 1, UDN; and *Deseret News*, June 28, 1923, 9, CHL.

³⁵ “Synopsis of President Young’s remarks at Grafton,” September 29, 1864, RTC; and *Iron County Record*, September 12, 1924, 5, UDN.

with about 800 of Young’s successors in Zion National Park before the park’s most famous landmark, a perpendicular and elephantine 2,400 foot tall sandstone megalith called the Great White Throne. Not having received the word about the president and “noise,” a brass band from Dixie College and a 100-voice Latter-day Saint choir from St. George regaled the presidential party with the national anthem, “America, the Beautiful,” and select Mormon hymns “with such gusto that the music . . . echoed back and forth from one great rock mountain to another.” Even the *Salt Lake Tribune* described this “ringing community singing” as such that “only the Mormon choirs can render.” As the president’s entourage ate lunch nestled between Zion Canyon’s towering sandstone monoliths, the St. George Choir sang “O Ye Mountains High.”³⁶ This beloved Latter-day Saint hymn—originally named “Zion”—“O Ye Mountains High” had been written during the turbulent 1850s to celebrate Brigham’s larger bastion of refuge in the mountains. Its chorus rang out, “O Zion! dear Zion! home of the free,” making it a natural choice for use in Zion Canyon in 1923. To Mormons the word Zion expressed all that Brigham’s great bastion in the west stood for. The hymn blatantly spoke of the mountain “chambers” the church had been driven into by persecution and forecasted the time when it would militarily destroy its oppressors and bring the entire gentile world under its heel. Had the visiting gentiles fully understood the lyrics of the song in their theological and historical context, some would certainly have found it an affront to the President of the United States and his retinue of gentiles. The lyrics committed the Saints to fight to defend Zion’s rights—which originally included the right to practice celestial plural marriage and the right to be independent from outside rule. Another holdover from Brigham Young’s kingdom theology, the hymn implied that the Saints would prevail militarily against all nations and promised that “the gentiles shall bow ‘neath [Zion’s] rod.”

Perhaps one of the reasons the song was selected for President Harding as he ate fresh Utah trout with the First Presidency, Apostle Smoot, and Governor Mabey in the shadow of “the Great White

³⁶ *Ogden Standard Examiner*, June 28, 1923, 1, UDN; *Salt Lake Telegram*, June 28, 1923, 2, UDN; *Washington County News*, June 28, 1923, 1, UDN; *Iron County Record*, June 29, 1923, 1, UDN; and *Deseret News*, June 27, 1923, 5, CHL. The *Salt Lake Tribune* was quoted in *Washington County News*, July 5, 1923, 4, UDN.

Throne,” was that from the Latter-day Saint point of view the occasion fulfilled at least part of a prophecy imbedded in the lyrics of the hymn. The third verse read:

In thy mountain retreat, God will strengthen thy feet;
On the necks of thy foes thou shalt tread;
And their silver and gold, as the Prophets have told,
Shall be brought to adorn thy fair head.
O Zion! dear Zion! home of the free;
Soon thy towers will shine with a splendor divine,
And eternal thy glory shall be.

Mather’s inter-park roads and highways, the Union Pacific’s new line into the heart of Zion, and Smoot’s success in drawing attention to Utah’s wonders by enticing the President of the United States to visit Zion National Park were all part of a calculated plan to bring outside “silver and gold” to “adorn [Zion’s] fair head.” This deep-seated Mormon goal subtly exists to this day, and motivated southern Utah boosters like Kanab Stake President Dee Woolley had worked toward this end from the start. While the great Utah boosters like Brigham Young’s son John W., Dee Woolley, Heber Grant, Anthony Ivins, George Albert Smith, and Senator Reed Smoot certainly fit in with the broader American boosterism of the era, there was something unique in their empire building. While Mather and Harding and much of the nation preached the gospel of “America first” and the subjugation of sectional interests for the common good, the Mormons’ primary focus still remained “adorning Zion’s fair head” and causing her towers to “shine with a splendo divine.”³⁷ To this day many rank and file

³⁷ For the standard lyrics of “O, ye mountains high” in use from 1856 to 1927, see *Latter-Day Saint Congregational Hymns* (Independence, MO: Zion’s Printing and Publishing Company, 1919), 1: no. 71. For a general history of the hymn, its use as a military anthem during the Utah War, and the changing of its text, see Juanita Brooks, *Mountain Meadows*, 29; George D. Pyper, *Stories of the Latter-day Saint Hymns* (N.p., 1939), 14–20; Fae Decker Dix, “Never Change a Song,” *UHQ* 44 (1976): 261–266; Karen Lynn Davidson, *Our Latter-day Hymns: The Stories and the Messages* (Salt Lake City: Bookcraft, 1988), 63–64; Keith E. Norman, A Kinder, “Gentler Mormonism: Moving Beyond the Violence of Our Past,” *Sunstone*,

Utah Mormons colloquially call the southern Utah park “Zion’s” or “Zion’s National Park.” While this colloquialism has virtually no meaning today, and is most often used subconsciously, it doubtless harkens back to the day when Zion felt that the park was exclusively Mormon. Representative of his apostolic peers, Smoot had been described by a Latter-day Saint political rival as having been raised “in a religious atmosphere,” and that although he certainly “imbibed” in religion, he was a “businessman first,” and only a statesman “and a churchman second.”³⁸ There were always prominent Latter-day Saints with an eye for business, and for protecting the interests of Zion. The church had been willing to pass the dilapidated old Pipe Springs tithing ranch and its precious water to the nation, only because it would ensure more travel between the parks, and therefore more commerce for the Saints which would produce more tithing. Besides, Director Mather and Land Commissioner Spry advised church leaders that the Kaibab would certainly get the place if the Heaton’s did not sell it to the Park Service. Significantly, even in the hands of the government the old fortress would do what she had always done, i.e., protect the interests of Zion and see that tithing and other church revenues kept pouring in. In any case, it seems President Harding grasped something of the meaning of “O, Ye Mountains High,” and in his remarks delivered to the crowd assembled in the shadow of the Great White Throne shortly after he heard it sung he deftly turned its lyrics on their head, appropriating the symbol of Brigham’s bastion for the entire United States of America. “If there are those in America who would destroy American institutions let them look to [these] mountains and know that our government is as impossible of destruction as the everlasting hills.” Harding symbolically claimed Zion’s labyrinthine rocks and canyons, as well as Brigham’s larger bastion, for the United States as he had Winsor Castle less than a month earlier.³⁹

August 1990: 10–14; Douglas Campbell, especially 68; and *Latter-day Saint Hymns: A Collection of Hymns and Spiritual Songs, Containing Words and Music, for Use of Choirs and Congregations of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints* (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book Company, 1927), no. 338.

³⁸ Moyle, 217.

³⁹ *Deseret News*, June 27, 1923, 2, CHL.

At this point Harding “threw off his collar and tie” and replaced them with a blue bandana. Donning leather chaps and “a 10-gallon sombrero” that proved to be too small, he mounted a black saddle horse “said to be one of the best in the state.” Surrounded by a cavalcade of about forty other riders the President proceeded up the scenic canyon on old trails until they could go no further. President Grant, Governor Mabey, Senator Smoot, Commissioner of the General Land Office William Spry, Secretary of the Interior, Hubert Work, Salt Lake City Mayor Clarence Neslen, and several members of the secret service (who were humbled by frisky horses) all joined in the ride. According to the papers, “Harding proved to be a good horseman.” Mrs. Harding opted out of the horseback ride, telling her husband, “I’ll stay in the car and you can tell me about it.” After spending just three hours in the park, the president’s caravan made its long seventy-mile journey back to Cedar.⁴⁰ At 8:30 p.m., the weary and dust-covered president addressed a group that included aged Latter-day Saint pioneers from the rear platform of his train. Perhaps giving evidence that Smoot and Harding may have talked about Brigham Young’s plan to use Utah’s mountains, cliffs, and canyons and limited water supply to isolate the Saints from the rest of the nation, Harding told his listeners: “Senator Smoot was telling me today that the resources of Utah are so great and her industries so varied that although a wall were built around the State, shutting it off from the world . . . her people could live within and for themselves alone.” He gently reminded them that they would “not want to do that” and assured them that they were “citizens of the greatest Republic in the world,” emphasizing that “the Republic wants you to be a part of it.” He congratulated the Mormons of southern Utah on having become a “distinctly American population” and told them they were “handsomely” doing their part “in the making of a greater America.” Turning his attention to the old timers in the crowd, Harding said: “To you men and women who came with your families in covered wagons into this country . . . the nation owes a debt of

⁴⁰ *Washington County News*, June 28, 1923, 1, UDN; *Salt Lake Telegram*, June 28, 1923, 2, UDN; *Ogden Standard Examiner*, June 28, 1923, 1–2, UDN; *Iron County Record*, June 29, 1923, 1, UDN; and *Deseret News*, June 28, 1923, 1, 9, CHL.

gratitude.”⁴¹ As the Hardings prepared to leave, the crowd spontaneously burst into the Latter-day Saint farewell anthem “God Be With You Till We Meet Again.” Moved by this extemporaneous expression of good will, the president and the First Lady “could scarcely restrain their tears.”⁴²

During and after his visit to President Harding repeatedly expressed that he was “profoundly impressed” by the “loyalty” of the people.⁴³ High ranking members of the president’s entourage commented on the remarkable change that had taken place relative to how LDS Utahns were responding to the federal government. Secretary of Agriculture Henry C. Wallace told Harding that what impressed him most about their visit to Cedar City was the loyalty to the United States he perceived in the faces of young Mormons. Nearly parroting Wallace, Speaker of the House Fred Gillet, a gruff anti-Mormon who once introduced a bill proposing an amendment to the US Constitution banning polygamy, told Harding: “Mr. President, what appealed to me most [about our visit to Utah]” was that the “countenances” of Latter-day Saint young people “depicted a truly 100 per cent Americanism.” Mrs. Harding affirmed that the enthusiasm of southern Utah for her husband was such that it was the one district where her husband did “not need a bodyguard.”⁴⁴ In the two decades since 1903 when Reed Smoot had nearly been denied his seat in the US Senate because he was a Mormon, something in the general attitude of Utahans toward the United States had changed. As Harding witnessed for himself, the majority of southern Utahans no longer wanted to build “a wall . . . around the State, shutting it off from the world [so that] her people could live within and for themselves.” Rather, they wanted to enjoy what Harding called “[their] share of the common good fortune of the

⁴¹ *Danville (Virginia) Bee*, June 28, 1923, 5, NPA; *Iron County Record*, June 29, 1923, 1, UDN; Russell, 577–578; *Goshen Daily Democrat* (Indiana), June 28, 1923, 4, NPA; Harding, *Addresses*, 153–156, and 159; *Deseret News*, June 27, 1923, 2, June 28, 1923, 1, 9, CHL; *Salt Lake Telegram*, June 28, 1923, 1, 8, UDN; *Iron County Record*, June 29, 1923, 1, UDN, italics mine. For a lengthy list of the pioneers then living in Cedar City, see *Iron County Record*, July 27, 1923, 1, UDN. After Harding’s remarks Randall Jones called the president’s attention to the fact that the pioneers who sat before him would like to personally greet him. Though worn out, the President and First Lady graciously shook the hand of every pioneer present.

⁴² *Standard Examiner*, June 28, 1923, 7, UDN; and Lafayette Hanchett, “Two Prayers,” *Juvenile Instructor* 58 (July 1923): 327.

⁴³ Harding, *Speeches*, 132–135.

⁴⁴ *Iron County Record*, September 14, 1923, 1, August 3, 1923, 6, May 15, 1925, 9, UDN; and Joan Smyth Iversen, *The Antipolygamy Controversy in U. S. Women’s Movements, 1880–1925* (New York: Garland Publishing, 1997), 244.

United States of America” by inviting the rest of the country to bring their tourist dollars and see southern Utah’s “national playgrounds.” Dee Woolley and John W. Young’s efforts to market had “Zion’s natural treasures” helped to foster this new attitude which resulted in breaking down Brigham’s wall.

Local newspapers made the most of the chief executive’s visit and some prognosticated its impact on the future. The *Beaver County News*, editorialized:

It is seldom that a President has ever found the time and the inclination to spend a day and two nights, travel 550 miles by rail, 140 miles by auto, and three hours on horseback in the effort to see a grand and beautiful piece of scenery so far from the great centers of population. For that reason, we of Southwestern Utah, feel complimented—feel that we really have scenery here which, as soon as the world finds it out, will draw thousands to our midst. The President has been one of the first to recognize our Scenic Wonderland as being worth while.⁴⁵

The *Salt Lake Tribune* noted that while the Harding’s visit to Zion “was brief and inadequate from the viewpoint of the tourist,” their journey was “significant in a very much larger sense” and would “prove of permanent and far reaching value to Utah.” “The eyes of the nation,” it said, “have been oriented toward the newest of the nation[‘s playgrounds” and have come to see Utah in a new light. The visit of the president, the *Tribune* said, “constituted the greatest honor that ever could come to that part of the state.” The *Tribune* further stated the way “the good people in all southern Utah flocked to the roadside by the thousands many of them coming long distances . . . gave the president such an assurance” of their loyalty and admiration “as the president never felt before.” “All this,” the

⁴⁵ *Beaver County News*, June 29, 1923, 1, UDN.

Salt Lake paper said, “will endure long after the warm day[,] the long road and the dust are forgotten[.] And all this will ripen into just such a fruitage as [Utah] well deserves.”⁴⁶

Meanwhile the herd of newspapermen Harding took with him gave the Mormons “good press” in hundreds of papers. Representative of the general spirit in which they reported the trip, an intimate friend and former newspaper business associate of President Harding, published the following in Harding’s hometown paper:

[In traveling with the president on his Voyage of Understanding] I came to know the Mormons and to take off my hat to them. They have the best, most effective church organization in America. They are the best community builders. Their people are thrifty, industrious, moral, law-abiding and every healthy activity of mind, and body is encouraged by them. The church controls the beet sugar industry of America, has its hands in many forms of business, sways the political destinies of several states and is wisely, sanely conservative *and sincerely patriotic*. I hold no bent for their theological cult, however, and they are welcome to it. In theory and results it seems to work good and not evil and that is the test so far as we non-Mormons are concerned.⁴⁷

Though this shift toward national toleration, understanding, and acceptance of Mormons had started years before Harding’s Voyage of Understanding, a significant transmutation in American journalism was taking place. This change both reflected and furthered a positive refashioning of the way Americans perceived Mormons. While Warren Harding did not accomplish all his goals for his Voyage of Understanding, his elevation of Pipe Spring to a National Monument, as well as his visit to Zion and the media coverage his tour and speeches generated, all played roles in helping Mormons and

⁴⁶ *Salt Lake Tribune* as quoted in *Washington County News*, July 5, 1923, 4, UDN.

⁴⁷ Malcolm Jennings, “Malcolm Jennings Tells About Tour of Late President Warren G. Harding,” in *Marion Daily Star* (Marion, Ohio), November 17, 1923, 15, NPA.

non-Mormons alike to positively progress in understanding and accepting one another. While traveling through Utah, the large-hearted president had lectured both the Saints and the nation on the dangers of hyphenated Americanism and had kindly invited the Mormons to more fully enter the American mainstream. No longer would the descendants of the pioneers who followed Brigham Young into his western stronghold consider themselves, or be considered by others, simply as Mormons or Mormon-Americans with an allegiance to something higher than that which they felt for their country. From now on they would be “100 percent Americans”—who also happened to be Mormons.

Just as the Vermilion Cliffs form the literal background to Winsor Castle when viewed from the desert, the long process of the transmutation of Mormon country from an independent theocratic kingdom seeking to separate itself from the United States into a fully committed and contributing part of the nation provides the symbolic backdrop to the whole history of Pipe Springs until 1923. For years the cliffs themselves formed the southern wall of Brigham’s larger bastion. Built in their shadow, Winsor Castle was constructed as a bottleneck fortress to protect this frontier from being skirted by hostile Native Americans or by invading gentiles. Located on top of the Sevier fault, symbolic seismic forces had created a chasm between the Mormon kingdom and the United States that seemed to be as deep and impassible as the Grand Canyon itself. Like its real world counterpart, it was a chasm that eventually was bridged. The significance of Pipe Spring is that it is a monument to this important part of the American experience. One of the last manmade reminders that such a conflict ever existed between the United States of America and the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, or that Brigham’s stronghold ever existed, Pipe Spring is the physical symbol of the whole era.

Epilogue—“The Golden Rail”

Warren Harding died five weeks after leaving Utah while still on his Western Tour.⁴⁸ The locomotive that had brought him deep into Brigham's bastion became his funeral train. *The Superb* was draped in black and mournfully carried his remains back to Washington, DC, while hundreds of thousands across the country turned out to stand by the transcontinental railway to honor the fallen president. Soon after his death, a congressional investigation dredged up enough evidence of corruption in his administration to permanently tarnish his image. This president, whose ambition was to be "the best-loved president," is now said to be the least favorably remembered president in American history. According to one biographer, among all the men to ever inhabit the White House, Harding's standing in the public memory is now dead last. Florence Harding's biographer calls him "America's most scandalous president."⁴⁹

In the first weeks after Harding's death, Utahans remembered Harding with affection. Senator Reed Smoot, on hearing of the President's death wrote in his diary that Harding was "one of my dearest friends," and that "a great, wise and good man [had been] called home."⁵⁰ To show their appreciation, the citizens of southern Utah held the "biggest celebration ever staged in Southern Utah" from September 12 to 14, 1923, with the dual purpose of memorializing Harding's death and celebrating the dedication of the new Union Pacific Lund-to-Cedar City line, which promised to bring "hordes of visitors" to "the gateway of Zion National Park." To combine both events, a golden rail was ceremonially laid on "the exact spot" where President Harding's private railcar had sat on June 27 when the President honored Cedar City, Southern Utah, and Zion National Park with his presence and

⁴⁸ Warren Harding died on August 2, 1923, in San Francisco.

⁴⁹ Interestingly, when the Harding Memorial Association tried to give the Hardings' Marion, Ohio home to the National Park Service in 1978, the gift was declined. See Dennis Roddy, "From Hero to Zero: The Lessons of President Warren G. Harding," *Pittsburgh Post-Gazette*, May 18, 2003, in <http://old.post-gazette.com/columnists/20030518edroddy18p1.asp>. See also Payne; Gaston B. Means, *The Strange Death of President Harding, From the Diaries of Gaston B. Means, as Told to May Dixon Thacker* (New York, Guild Publishing Corp., 1930); Carl S. Anthony, *Florence Harding: The First Lady, the Jazz Age, and the Death of America's Most Scandalous President*, Carl S. Anthony, "Poisoning the President? Florence Harding & Her Husband's 'Strange' Death, August 2, 1923," <http://carlanthonyonline.com/2011/08/02/poisoning-the-president-today-in-flotus-history-august-2-1923/>; Russell Aiuto, "The Strange Life and Death of President Harding," http://www.trutv.com/library/crime/terrorists_spies/assassins/warren_harding/6.html?sect=24.

⁵⁰ Smoot, *Diaries*, 554–555.

with his kind words. The President's train was the first passenger train to cross the new line and a nine-inch length of solid gold rail marked the spot he had addressed the people. It was engraved as follows:

HARDING MEMORIAL RAIL
LAID BY THE CITIZENS OF IRON COUNTY, UTAH
IN COMMEMORATION OF THE OPENING OF
THE UNION PACIFIC NATIONAL PARK LINE TO CEDAR CITY
ON JUNE 27, 1923 BY
PRESIDENT WARREN G. HARDING

Designed by a Salt Lake Firm, “the golden section of rail” was described as “beautiful in its rugged simplicity” and was said to be “one of the most striking things of its kind ever designed.” The *Tribune* described that was “but a [replica of a] short section of standard sized railroad ‘iron’—but [but was constructed] of dully gleaming gold.” “The marks of the forge,” the newspaper continued, “the irregularities of one of the steel bands which link the country together, are all there in the precious metal.” The *Salt Lake Tribune*, which had been founded as an anti-Mormon paper in in 1869, now wrote of the “widely popular and complimentary notice” that was “showering in on the southern Utah city from all parts of the nation.” The paper wisely held back the irony that this same village of Cedar City was the place murderous decisions had been made resulting in the Mountain Meadows Massacre—decisions that played a significant role in bringing the territory of Utah and the United States of America to the very brink of war.

For Utah, the laying of this “Bit of Golden Rail,” was the symbol of the “beginning of a new era, not only for . . . southern Utah, but for the state and nation.” The First Presidency and other church dignitaries from Salt Lake were in attendance, as were the Vice President of the Union Pacific and other prominent railroad officials. Utah's governor and other state dignitaries had traveled from Salt Lake, and newspapers reported that Cedar City was “flooded with visitors from every section of the

United States.” Director Mather was on hand to represent the Park Service while Forester R.H. Rutledge represented the Forest Service. The Cedar City-based former owners of Pipe Springs, Dave Bulloch and Lehi W. Jones and their families, played prominent roles in the celebration. Lehi’s son Randall, who had lived and cowboied at Pipe, was now the assistant park supervisor of the Union Pacific and served as the Master of Ceremonies for the three day celebration. Lehi’s brother, Uriah T. Jones, offered the invocation and original 1851 pioneer Dave Bulloch was chosen as one of four men to ceremonially drive four sixty-year-old pioneer-made iron spikes with which “the golden rail” was secured to its fancy railroad ties. Five thousand people reportedly watched the rail laying ceremony. Heber J. Grant and Senator Smoot made the keynote addresses and Anthony W. Ivins offered a prayer. *Popular Mechanics* reported that this “solid-gold section of rail” was left in place only for a short period, “under guard,” but was soon removed and put on display “in the museum at the [Utah] state capitol.” The festivities continued with a rodeo where local cowboys celebrated their unique culture by riding captured desert broncos and wild steers.⁵¹ Bringing our story full circle, thirty-five mustangs were rounded up for this rodeo in the Escalante Valley north of Cedar, not far from the spot where the Escalante-Dominguez party had prayerfully cast the lots that turned their path toward what would become the Pipe Springs corridor. Among others, the grandsons of men who had participated in the Mountain Meadows Massacre rounded up the wild horses and bulls which they believed were descended from animals which had escaped from Hispanic traders coursing the Old Spanish Trail and later from the victims of the massacre itself. The Ogden *Standard Examiner* reported that “the wild horses captured are for use in the rodeo to follow the laying of the Harding memorial rail as part of the celebration.”⁵²

⁵¹ *Iron County Record*, September 7, 1923, 1, and September 14, 1923, 1, UDN; *Standard Examiner*, August 22, 1923, 3, September 10, 1923, 3, September 11, 1923, 7, September 13, 1923, 2, September 14, 1923, 9, and September 15, 1923, 2, UDN; *Washington County News*, September 13, 1923, 1, UDN; *Beaver County News*, September 21, 1923, 2, UDN; *Salt Lake Tribune*, September 3, 1923, 14, NPA; and *Popular Mechanics*, 40 (December 1923): 841.

⁵² *Standard Examiner*, August 22, 1923, 3, UDN. Mormons persistently believed that the “western wild horses” that ran on their deserts were “the descendants of the first Arabian horses brought to this country by Cor[o]nado and other Spanish explorers of Mexico and our own southwest.” They were sure that “Padre Escalante brought the first Arabian horses north of

The arrival of the Union Pacific line into Cedar City's southern Utah hub represented the great distance American civilization had come in penetrating Brigham's bastion, driven by the Mormons themselves. Bulloch's reverent action in honoring the dead president by laying the golden rail also represented the great distance the Mormon people had come in their process of Americanization. Like thousands of like-minded Mormons, Bulloch and his family had walked across the unsettled Great Plains into the rough rock country of southern Utah to escape from Babylon, its presidents, and their perceived persecution. From 1868, when Young accepted a contract on behalf of his people to help build the track, to the laying of Harding's memorial in 1923, the rails of the Union Pacific had played a tremendous role in this transformation. So too had Mather's national parks and monuments and the roads that Mather and Woolley and other boosters designed to connect them. Between 1870, when Brigham laid out the lines for Winsor Castle, and the early 1920s, when Heber J. Grant played a leading role in purchasing Pipe Spring and presenting it as a gift to the federal government, the place the United States of America occupied in the Mormon mind had undergone a terrific transformation. Where it had once been known by the epithets Babylon, Whore of all the Earth, Killer of the Prophets, Persecutor of God's People, and the Nation which has driven you out, to the vast majority of Mormon people in 1923, the United States was now known by the simpler and more welcoming sobriquet "home." In some ways, Heber J. Grant's role in the passing of a fort originally designed to protect a Mormon prophet from an American president to the custody of the National Park Service represented a kind of surrender—or at least an acknowledgement of a new arrangement. Heaton and Sons Company was a philosophical descendant of Brigham Young's United Order, wherein Mormons cooperated to keep gentiles out. Certainly the acceptance of the old fort as a national monument in May 1923, combined with President Harding's visit to southern Utah and his expression of thanks to the Mormon Pioneers in June, and the subsequent celebration of the completion of the rail line to Zion and the

the Grand Canyon in 1776" and that "some of these noble animals were lost, and others were driven off by unfriendly Indians." See *Washington Country News*, August 17, 1939, 5, UDN; and *Kane County Standard*, June 23, 1933, 1, UDN.

memorializing of the dead president in September represented the crossing of a significant milestone in what has been called the Americanization of Mormonism.

In 1969, nearly a century after Winsor Castle was built, historian and preservationist Charles Hosmer, Jr., captured something of the interfaith good will of these men when he conducted an oral interview with Mather's protégé and successor in the directorship of the National Park Service, Horace Albright:

Hosmer: There's one historical area in the far West that struck me as kind of out of the ordinary for those days. And that was Pipe Spring, I think it was called, that little Mormon. . . .

Albright: Oh, the Mormon fort, Pipe Springs.

Hosmer: Yes, how in the world did *that* get into the Park System? It's not an Indian ruin; it's. . . .

Albright: No, it's a Mormon fort built against the Indians.

Hosmer: Yes, but I mean they weren't accepting forts in those days into the Park System.

Albright: It was bought and given to the Park Service.

Hosmer: It was given to the Parks?

Albright: Director Mather, the president of the Mormon Church, Mr. Heber Grant, and Mr. Carl Gray, president of the Union Pacific Railroad and there's one other man, I think, bought the fort

and gave it to the Park Service under the Lacy Act [the 1906 Act for Preservation of Antiquities]. . . .

Hosmer: They all bought it?

Albright: Bought it.

Hosmer: Why did Mather want that?

Albright: It was historic and also, of course, it was part of his program of cooperating with the Mormons. They didn't want it destroyed; they wanted it kept. Mather was very strong with the Mormons. He used to go down and sing with them; he had a beautiful baritone voice. He and I for several years there were all but Mormons, we spent so much time down there with them in southern Utah.⁵³

In *Cultures at a Crossroads*, Kathleen McKoy refers to Mather's singing with the Mormons and writes that "one cannot sing among a people and not feel a special bond with them." She points to a connection of the heart that developed between the first director of the National Park Service and the descendants of Utah's early settlers. She perceptively writes that "Mather not only appreciated Utah's spectacular scenic resources, [but he also developed a] sincere admiration for its people and their history." She notes that during Mather's "important meetings and conferences in Salt Lake City," his "personal visits with local bishops in their small rural towns, and the overnight visits and home-cooked meals" with people like the Heaton's, the first director of the NPS "came to know and appreciate the Latter-day Saints as a people." Originally built as a bastion of war, where red rock and heavy batten

⁵³ McKoy, *Cultures at a Crossroads*, 114–115.

gates were used to separate Mormons, Native Americans, and gentiles, on the one hand Winsor Castle stands as a monument to humanity's intolerance and lack of understanding for one another in the fight for religious freedom and in the struggle for limited natural resources. But on the other hand, as the pet project of kind-hearted and open-minded men like Mather, Albright, Grant, Ivins, and Smith, and President Warren Harding, in an interesting way Pipe Spring has become a monument to human understanding and tolerance and humanity's ability to set aside past grievances. Located on a park-to-park highway, it also stands as a monument to our appreciation of the best of nature's scenic wonders. It has become a place where Mormons, non-Mormons, and Kaibab Paiute, as part of the general American traveling public, can get a cool drink of water, enjoy some shade, and reflect on the importance of human diversity, tolerance, and understanding as we head back and forth to the heavy red rocks that now bring people together from all parts of the globe.

Index:

BY stands for Brigham Young and LDS for Latter-Day Saints

- Abiquiú settlement, [3](#)
- Act for the Preservation of American Antiquities (1906), [697](#)
- Adams, John (handyman), at Pipe Springs, [515](#)–17
- Address From the Citizens of Great Salt Lake City to His Excellency James Buchanan, President of the United States, An*, [59](#)
- Affleck, David A., automobile trip Salt Lake to Bright Angel Point, [682](#)–86
- Agua de la Vieja* (Pipe Springs), [13](#), [33](#)
- Akerman, Amos T., on McKean's abuse of law, [176](#)
- Albright, Horace, interview with Hosmer, [760](#)
- Americanization of Mormonism, [176](#)
- Andrus, James (Captain)
 - Battle of Pipe Springs (or of Bull Rush Wash), [99](#)
 - bishop of the cowboys, [430](#)–35
 - CCCC, control of, [585](#)
 - drought, reports of effect on cattle, [429](#)
 - hostile Indians, search at Ute trail for, [86](#)
 - killing of Kaibabits, explanation, [79](#)
 - on livestock breeding by Woolley and Seegmiller, [472](#)
 - Mormon herd raids by Navajos and Piedes, [87](#)
 - panic of 1893, impact on, [587](#)
 - replacing Pulsipher at Pipe Springs, [428](#)
 - role in Grama Canyon campaign, [73](#), [74](#), [78](#)
 - Woolley, Lund, and Judd Mercantile Company, purchase, [434](#)
- Anointed Lodge, [218](#)
- Anointed Quorum, [218](#)
- Antelope Valley, [8](#)
- “anti-Mormon Ring”, [155](#), *See* “Utah Ring”; Utah Ring
- anti-Mormon climate (1901-1907), [737](#)
- anti-polygamy crusade, [737](#)
 - “cohabs”, hiding from prosecution, [500](#)
 - “Mormon criminals,” list of, [503](#)
 - Arizona, refuge from, [498](#)
 - church property protection from, [500](#)
 - killing of Mormons, [493](#)
 - Mormon leaders, effect on, [495](#)
 - newspaper editorials, [493](#)
 - prosecution of LDS leaders, [497](#)
 - Utah economy, paralyzed by, [546](#)
 - Woolley, special target for capture, [504](#)
- Arapeen (brother of Walkara), and slave trade, [19](#)
- Arizona
 - Mormon cattle move to, [436](#)
 - Mormon emigration to (1876-1878), [435](#)
 - territory transfer to Nevada, consequences of partial, [193](#)–96
- Arizona mission, [313](#)

BY response to collapse, [352](#)
 collapse, [348](#)–50
 expedition report, [338](#)
 Pipe Springs, BY on significance of, [345](#)–46
 purpose, [337](#)

Arizona Strip
 annexation to Utah, [660](#)
 BY isolation on, [281](#)
 Dominguez-Escalante expedition, [10](#)
 national panic (1893), consequences, [584](#)
 Navajo bands, cattle thefts, [66](#)
 Powell, description of, [116](#)
 protection, from Arizona officials, [144](#)
 Spanish meeting Indian bands, [4](#)
 Utah, transfer to, [602](#)

Armijo, Antonio Mariá, [4](#)
 diary, [13](#)
 expedition New Mexico to California, [12](#)

Armstrong, John (Deputy Marshal), conduct, [505](#)

Arsenal Hill, [396](#)–97

Ash Creek, [6](#)

automobiles, economic impact on Dixie lands, [687](#)

Averett, Elijah and Elisha (twins)
 accomplishments, [203](#)–5
 Mormon exodus from Utah, roles in, [204](#)
 sibling rivalry, [206](#)
 at Winsor Castle, [204](#), [205](#)

baptism, Native Americans
 military threat, [392](#)
 newspapers on, [391](#)–93
 plot to drive out gentiles, [391](#)–93

Barboncito (Navajo Nation leader), [88](#)
 Colorado River crossings, guarding, [131](#)
 expression of love, [126](#)
 Mormon-Navajo peace treaty, reply, [126](#)–28

Bates, George C. (prosecuting attorney)
 BY court proceedings, delaying, [278](#)
 on McKean's objective, [157](#), [176](#)

Battle of Bull Rush Wash, [86](#), [99](#)–100
 accounts, [99](#), [100](#)
 Navajo raids after, [100](#)

Battle of Pipe Springs. *See* Battle of Bull Rush Wash, 99

Beadle, John H. (a.k.a. Mr. Hanson)
 Beaver, returning to, [316](#)
 fact-finding tour, Southern Utah bastion, [307](#)–17
 on Kanab as a refuge, [147](#)
 on Lee's excommunication, [309](#)
 Mountain Meadow Massacre, gathering information about, [308](#)
 at Pipe Springs, [313](#)
 on Winsor Castle as a choke point; Winsor, [315](#)

Belknap, William W. (Secretary of War), purpose of Beaver City military post, [237](#)–38

Bennett, Frank T. (Captain), Powell/Hamblin welcome at Ft. Pierce, [123](#)

Berry family, Paiute retribution for killings by, [89–92](#)

Berry, John and William, discovering bodies of family, [92](#)

Bishop, Francis M., on Mormons at Kanab, [250–52](#)

Black Hawk (Ute War Chief), [64](#)
intertribal coalition of raiders, [71](#)
with Navajos, [67](#)

Black Hawk War, [70](#)
livestock raids, [71](#), [105](#)

Black, George A., proclamation against militia parade, [151](#)

Black, Vera Colvin (daughter of Elizabeth Colvin), and husband foregoing polygamy in 1957, [674](#)

Bleak, James G., [14](#)
on killing of Whitmore and McIntyre, [77](#)
on Whitmore and McIntyre burials, [85](#)
on Whitmore's work at Pipe Springs, [61–62](#)

Book of Acts, [144](#)

Book of Mormon
BY modeling himself after heroes in, [25](#)
BY's communal economic manner of living, [144](#)
church's mission, [18](#)
Hopi, descendance, [33](#)
Lamanites, [388](#), [394](#)
Mormon understanding of Native Americans, [458](#)
presented to Harding by Smoot, [732](#)
Prince Madoc's Welsh Colony (Nephites), [33](#)
protection of family and property, [79](#)

Bosque Redondo Reservation, genocidal treatment of Navajos, [72](#)

Bowles, Samuel
northern Arizona and southern Utah, mapping of, [240](#)

Bowman, Wallace Alonzo Clark
death, [21](#)
threats to BY, [19–21](#)

Brethren at Kanab, [137](#), [138](#)

Brigham Young University, [570](#)

Brower, Emeline Zenetta (Winsor's first wife), [180](#)

Brown, Harriet (wife of Gurnsey), maintaining hostel at Pipe Springs, [453](#)

Brown, James A. (Indian Office), report on Kaibab (1903), [651–54](#)

Brown, Joseph Gurnsey, leasing Winsor Castle, [453](#)

Bryce Canyon National Monument, [701](#)

Buchanan's War (or Blunder), [26](#)

Buchanan, James
confrontation with Mormon Rebellion in Utah, [25–26](#)
Lynch's testimony, publication of, [46](#)

Buckskin Mountain, [36](#)
Gentleman's Hunting Park, transformation into, [571](#), [573](#)
national forest preserve, [652](#)

Buckskin Mountain Indians. *See* Kaibab band (Paiute), 8

Buffalo Bill, [573](#)
at Pipe Springs, [581–83](#)
European tour, [575](#)
Grand Canyon exploratory expedition, [576–82](#)

Grand Canyon tourism, facilitating, [583](#)
 Bull Rush Ranch, sale (1906), [633–35](#)
 Bull Rush Wash, [3](#), [8](#)
 sale to Findlay, [623](#)
 Bulloch, David Dunn, [743](#)
 Pipe Springs takeover, [593](#)
 Bulloch-Jones partnership, [594](#)
 business, post-rainstorms, [601](#)
 Pipe Springs Ranch, sale (1902), [595](#)
 Pipe Springs title transfer to PSCC, [599](#)
 PSCC, incorporation, [597](#)
 “Rawhide and Baling Wire,” nickname, [595](#)
 Bunting, James L., racing, letter to Cannon on complaints, [474](#)
 Bureau of Indian Affairs, water contest on Kaibab reservation, [667](#)
 Burke, Charles H. (Commissioner of Indian Affairs), [707](#)
 Bushman, Richard L., on spiritual-economic to economic transformation, [692](#)
 California Road. *See* Old Spanish Trail, 14
 Cal-o-e-chipe (Southern Paiute chief), [90](#)
 Camp Crittenden, abandonment of, [47](#)
 Canaan Cattle Company, takeover, [382](#)
 Canaan Cooperative Stock Company. *See* CCSC (Canaan Cooperative Stock Company), 378
 Canaan Ranch. *See* CCCC (Canaan Cooperative Cattle Company)
 Canaan-Short Creek-Pipe Springs-Kanab range, destruction of grassland, [403](#)
 Cannon, David H., [341](#), [375](#), [673](#), [745](#)
 Cannon, Frank J.
 on BY, [330](#), [331](#), [367](#)
 BY kingdom, a church sanctuary, [352](#)
 Cannon, George Q. (Apostle)
 arrest, [161](#)
 capture, [502](#)
 Clawson trial, refusing to testify, [496](#)
 and Edmunds Act, [491](#)
 fiscal and political policy, disagreements with, [547](#)
 flight to California, [166](#)
 on General Authorities meeting, protection of Taylor, [499](#)
 horse racing complaints, [475](#)
 LDS defense strategy, against Morrill Act, [543](#)
 on McKean, [157](#)
 Mormons, creating sympathy for, [166](#)
 on tithe payments, [590](#)
Canyon Voyage, A (Dellenbaugh), on Winsor Castle (1872), [261](#)
 Captain Frank (chief of Kaibab)
 baptized, [389](#)
 meeting with Taylor, payment for Moccasin, [461](#)
 at Paiute and Kaibab meeting, Moccasin (1891), [648](#)
 and Powell, relationship, [117](#)
 services to Hamblin, [117](#)
 testimony on Navajo raid, [68](#)
 Captain John. *See* Coal Creek John, 90
 Carson, Christopher “Kit” (colonel), [64](#)
 cash & stock tithing, [188](#)

CCCC (Canaan Cooperative Cattle Company)
natural resources diminishing, due to growth of, [304](#)
new cattle brand, [448](#)
ownership, [182](#)
purchase by Bulloch, [594](#)

CCSC (Canaan Cooperative Stock Company)
cattle for St. Johns purchase, refusing, [441](#)
church and private livestock, separation, [449](#)–51
drought, consequences for, [404](#)
grassland, destruction of, [403](#)
investments in, [378](#)
livestock withdrawal, [426](#)
Moccasin Farm, transfer to Kanab war, [462](#)
ownership, back to Mormons, [592](#)
Parashont Range, relocating to, [419](#)
purchase by Saunders, [588](#)
stock mixing, [415](#)
Upper Kanab dairy and ranch, leasing, [465](#)
and WCSGC, [414](#), [418](#), [427](#)

Cedar Breaks, National Monument, [701](#)

Cedar City
gateway to southern parks, [710](#)
to Zion road, preparation for Harding visit, [729](#)

Cedar City Indians (Wahnquint), retaliation participants, [90](#)

Chase, Salmon P. (Chief Justice), McKean legal system illegal, [292](#)

Chávez, José Antonio, on new route New Mexico to California, [12](#)

Chuarumpeak, Frank. *See* Captain Frank (chief of Kaibabit), 68

Chug (Kaibab headman), warning on trouble, [132](#)

“Church Association of the Kanab Stake of Zion, The,” church property transfer into, [544](#), [547](#)

Church Association of the Kanab Stake, [544](#), [551](#), [552](#), [557](#)

church leaders, tax collection from, [214](#)

Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints (LDS). *See* Mormons, 2

church property
escheatment, cessation, [559](#)
federal confiscation, [493](#), [495](#), [542](#)–48
legislation threat to escheat, [462](#), [491](#)
Pipe Springs Ranch, return, [585](#)
protection from escheat, [499](#), [500](#)
recovery from property confiscations, [589](#)
shelter for personal property, [550](#), [554](#)
vs. personal property, blurry lines, [135](#)

church stock, inventory and value, [424](#)

Civil War, [47](#)

Clawson, Rodger, polygamy trial
on resisting anti-polygamy laws, [496](#)
US government position, [496](#)

Cleveland, Grover (President), Utah statehood bill, [584](#)

Clinton vs. Engelbrecht
news reports on decision, [293](#)
test case for McKean challenge, [290](#)–93

Clorinda Schlappi, at St. George House, [371](#)

Coal Creek John
 Mormon, becoming a, [103](#)
 retaliation, primary attack leader, [92](#)
 “terror” of southern Utah, [91](#)

Codman, John, on tithing system, [210](#)

Cody, William F.. *See* Buffalo Bill

Colfax, Shuyler (Vice President), [240](#)

Colorado City, AZ, polygamist citadel, [674](#)

Colorado Meadows, [439](#)

Colvin, Orlin F.
 move to Short Creek, [672](#)
 Pipe Springs, renting from Heatons, [669](#)–72

Conference of the Southern Mission, Joseph Young announcing Winsor Castle, [187](#)–88

Confessions (Hickman), [147](#), [308](#)

Connor, Patrick (Utah Territorial Militia, Major-General), [149](#)
 “cooperative institutions” incorporation, purpose, [215](#)

Cooperative Cattle Companies (CCC), small vs. rich investors, [380](#)–82
 cooperative herd exchange, [437](#)

Cotton and Woolen Mill purchase by Dixie Saints, [209](#)

Council of the Twelve, and Pipe Springs Ranch, [557](#), [592](#)

Cove Creek Fort, template for Winsor Castle, [187](#)

Covenants of the Latter-Day Saint endowment, [330](#)

Cox, Margaret (Maggie)
 activities outside work, [616](#)–21
 life at pre-monument Pipe Springs, diary of, [613](#)–16
 and Louise Moncur (“Weasy”), [617](#)
 and Moncus, teasing relationship, [619](#)
 at Pipe Springs, account (1974), [610](#)–21
 return to Orderville, [620](#)

Cradlebaugh, John (Federal Judge), [44](#)

Crittenden, John (Kentucky Senator), [47](#)

Croix, Teodoro de (*Provincias Internas*, commandant general), [11](#)

Crosby, George (son of Jesse), testimony on round-ups, [555](#)

Crosby, Jesse W., Jr. (Panguitch Stake president)
 embezzlement, accusations of, [589](#)
 testimony on round-ups, [555](#)

Crossing of the Fathers, [3](#), [7](#), [38](#)

CSGC and CCSC relationship. *See* Pulsipher, Charles

Cultures at a Crossroads (McKoy), [761](#)

Cumming, Alfred, [29](#)
 governor, replacing Young, [26](#)

currency, during emigration to Arizona, [437](#)

Danites
 murders, blame for, [466](#)
 refuge at Kanab, [147](#)

Decker, Charles (son-in-law of Brigham Young), [17](#)

Declaration of Independence, and Young's "kingdom", 24

Deer Mountain, [36](#)

Dellenbaugh, Frederick
 on Averett brothers' work, [205](#)
 on first visit to Winsor Castle, [146](#)–47

Kanab country, return to, [398](#)
letter to Buffalo *Courier* on purpose of Winsor Castle, [398](#)–402
on meeting Hamblin, [246](#)
Pipe Springs and Winsor Castle, description (1872), [257](#)
Pipe Springs, description (1876), [261](#)–63

Deseret News
on Mather-Smith cooperation, [716](#)
on UO local branches, [368](#)

Deseret Telegraph Company
line extension, [172](#), [225](#)

Deseret Telegraph Company, line extension, [164](#)

Deseret, State of, [23](#)

Diné raiders, [65](#)

Dixie
automobiles, economic impact, [687](#)
ranch establishments near, [56](#)

doctrinal alienation, [329](#)

“Doctrine of Gathering,” building of fortification, [328](#)

Dodge City, AZ, establishment and failure, [720](#)

Domínguez, Francisco Atanasio, [2](#)

Domínguez-Escalante Expedition, [3](#)–10
Colorado River crossing at Lees Ferry, [9](#)
Kaibab Band, first encounter, [8](#)
Kaibab, evangelization, [9](#)
Padre Creek, stone cliff steps, [9](#)–10
Paiute guides, [6](#)–7
Pipe Springs desert, first encounter, [8](#)
return to Villa Santa Fe, [10](#)

drought (1875-1876), consequences, [403](#)

drought (1896), cattle deaths, [596](#)

drought (1899), consequences, [603](#)

Dutton, Clarence, environmental impact of cattle herding, [379](#)

Dyer, Frank H.
appointed receiver of church property, [545](#)
confiscations, ending, [557](#)

Edmunds Act (1882), [462](#), [464](#)
constitutionality, US Supreme Court upholding, [497](#)
suppression of polygamy, [491](#)
“unlawful cohabitation” and polygamy, distinction, [492](#)

Edmunds-Tucker Act (1887), [493](#)
confiscation of religious property, enabling, [495](#)
LDS, disincorporation, [493](#)
settlement of confiscation cases, [551](#)

El Arroyo de Santa Gerturdis, [8](#)

El Vado de los Padres. *See* Crossing of the Fathers, 7

Eldredge, Horace S.
commercial founder of Mormon commonwealth, [53](#)
St. George, location selection, [54](#)

Emery, George W. (Utah Territorial Governor), threat to baptism of Native Americans, [392](#)

Emma Mine, selling of, [275](#)

Emporia News (Kansas), on BY founding colony in Arizona, [146](#)

ending plural marriage, [560](#)
endowment fraternity, [218](#)
Englebrecht Decision, [175](#)
environmental impact, of herding cattle, [379](#)
Escalante, Silvestre Vélez de, [2](#)
 diary, [10](#)
“escape colonization,” Taylor fulfilling BY plan, [498](#)
escheatment, federal
 cessation, [559](#)
 church property, strategies to protect, [500](#)
 Pipe Springs Ranch, protection from, [542](#)
 and stopping to pay tithing, [590](#)
Evans, Isaac (Captain), BY's jailer, [295](#)
Farnsworth, Moses F., on Native American demands at Kanab, [230](#), [233](#)
Farrow, Edgar A. (Superintendent), attempt to dispossess Heatons, [708](#)–10
“Federal Authority vs. Polygamic Theocracy”, [161](#)
Findlay, Alexander Duncan, Jr., [591](#)
 hostile to shepherders, [626](#)–28
 mustangs, extermination, [628](#)–33
 Pipe Springs ranches, sale, [633](#)–35
 Pipe Springs sale (1906), [624](#)
 PSCC, purchase, [621](#)–24
 water sources, development, [624](#)
“Findlay’s Tank”, [625](#)
First Presidency
 BY control of, [164](#)
 Muddy settlers, to locate at Long Valley, [195](#)
 tithes, suspension of payments, [216](#)
First Quorum of Seventy, [56](#)
 on list of “Mormon criminals”, [503](#)
Fitch, Thomas (BY attorney)
 bail amount, objection to, [287](#)
 on civil war with Mormons, at Congress, [288](#)
“Five-County Road Convention” at Hurricane, [689](#)
FLDS Church (Fundamentalist Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints), [674](#)
“Flora’s Prison”, [515](#)
Forney, Jacob (Utah Superintendent of Indian Affairs)
 letter to Johnston about murders, [44](#)
 “Mormon-lover”, appearance as, [42](#)
 Mormons, protection from, [41](#)
 recovery of children, [28](#)–31
 report to commissioner of Indian Affairs, [44](#)
 travel to take possession of children, [40](#)–42
 victim properties, distribution among church dignitaries, [43](#)
Fort Kanab
 fire at, [192](#)
 purpose and design, [191](#)
 and Winsor castle, southeastern bastions, [192](#)
Fort Pierce Wash, [7](#)
Fort Pierce, Navajo skirmish at, [98](#)
Franciscans, exploration of Salt Lake City region, [2](#)

Fredonia, refuge for women, [511](#)
 “From Salt Lake to the Grand Canyon” (Rust in *Improvement Era*), [687](#)
 Ft. Defiance
 annuity distribution to Navajos at, [245](#)
 Hamblin at, [113](#)
 Hamblin invitation of Navajos to, [227](#)
 Mormon-Navajo Peace Treaty at, [121–32](#), [192](#), [224](#), [229](#)
 “Fundamentalist” movement, [673](#)
 fundraising for Mormon cities, Grand Canyon Highway, [693](#)
 Garland, Augustus H. (US Attorney General), suit to recover funds from PE Fund, [544](#)
 General Tithing Office, Salt Lake City, [437](#)
 Gentile League of Utah, [288](#)
 “Gentile Ring”. *See* “Utah Ring”; Utah Ring
 gentiles, [239–40](#)
 Gibson, Manomus (plural wife of Andrus), [428](#), [433](#)
 Gillet, Fred (Speaker of the House), on LDS Americanism, [752](#)
Girl Rough Riders, The (Ingraham), [579](#)
 Golden Rail, symbolism of, [756–58](#)
 “good roads conference,” Yellowstone, [700](#)
 Gospel of Jesus Christ, [3](#)
 “Gould’s Ranch”, establishment, [56](#)
 Gould, Samuel, [56](#)
 Grama Canyon Killings. *See* Nauvoo Legion campaign, Grama Canyon
 Grand Canyon. *See also* National Monuments
 automobile roads to, [682](#)
 automobile trip Salt Lake to Bright Angel Point, [682–86](#)
 Buffalo Bill, exploratory expedition, [576–82](#)
 highway loop, [699](#)
 naming of, [272](#)
 national monument, [569](#)
 national park, [583](#)
 plan for aerial tramway across, [659](#), [660](#)
 to Yellowstone park, automobile highway, [689](#)
 Grant, Heber J., [713](#)
 Grant, Julia Dent (First Lady)
 polygamy, discussion with BY, [395](#)
 Salt Lake Tabernacle, visit to, [398](#)
 Grant, Ulysses S. (President), [191](#)
 abuse of power, [277](#)
 and BY, minimizing history between, [728](#)
 animus against BY, [299](#)
 Arsenal Hill, visit to, [396–97](#)
 and BY meeting, [395](#)
 Ft. Cameron, establishment of, [237](#)
 Territory of Utah, message on, [301](#)
 tithing system, attack on, [212](#)
 Grant-McKean judicial system, test case against, [290](#)
 Grass Valley, murders at, [390](#)
 grasslands, on Shoal Creek, [56](#)
 “Great Map” (Powell)
 map creation, [267](#)

survey process, [241](#)
 Great Basin kingdom, primary reason for, [142](#)
 Greeley, Horace (Presidential candidate, 1872), BY support, [317](#)
 Grey, Zane, [631](#)
 Gunlock Bill. *See* Hamblin, William F.
 Gunlock Hamblin. *See* Hamblin, William F.
 Hamblin expedition
 Agua de la Vieja springs, reaching, [33](#)
 crossing Colorado River (Crossing of the Fathers), [37](#)
 Pipe Springs to Buckskin Mountain travel, [36–37](#)
 Pipe Springs, earliest maps of, [239](#)
 to Moqui, reports to Forney and BY, [40](#)
 Hamblin, Jacob
 Apostle to Lamanites, [36](#), [73](#)
 Arizona expedition report, [338](#)
 Captain Frank, initiated into church, [117](#)
 Captain Frank, securing services of, [116](#)
 collusion with BY, [31](#)
 deception on captive children recovery, [29–31](#)
 escape route to Arizona and Mexico, discovery expedition, [30–31](#)
 Ft. Defiance treaty, [224](#)
 Indian Farms, establishing, [455](#)
 letter from BY, instructions for Paria Indian Farm and Indian involvement, [136](#)
 letter on second Navajo treaty talks, [128](#)
 letter to Taylor and Powell, on help to Kaibabits, [456–58](#)
 at Oraibi, [38](#)
 Oraibi, start for, [32](#)
 outpost safety, consultation with Joseph Young, [131](#)
 peace with Kaibabs, seeking, [97](#)
 Pipe Springs corridor, exploration, [39](#)
 Powell expedition, services to, [105](#)
 proselytizing Southern Paiute, [26](#)
 return to Kanab, [129](#)
 on Tontaquint Paiute's fears, [16](#)
 trip to recover child survivors, [30–31](#)
 visiting Hopi villages, lost children, [38](#)
 Hamblin, William F.
 naming of Pipe Springs, [34–36](#)
 test suit against shepherd, [626](#)
 Hancock, Mosiah, on enrichment of church's leaders, [381](#)
 Harding, Warren G. (President)
 Cedar City and Zion National Park visit, [729](#)
 death and remembrance, [756](#)
 death, Mather memorializing, [706](#)
 Mather letter promoting Pipe Spring National Monument, [724–25](#)
 on Mormons as Americans, [751](#)
 Pipe Spring National Monument, signing, [36](#)
 proclamation of Pipe Spring National Monument, signed, [726](#)
 promoting National Parks, [733](#)
 Salt Lake City visit and unifying speeches, [737–42](#)
 and Smoot, relationship, [732](#)

speeches in Toquerville and Cedar City, [732](#)
Utahans' remembrance, [756](#)
visit to national parks and Pipe Springs, [721](#)
visits
 Cedar City, [742](#)–44
 effect on Mormonism, [754](#)
 press on, [753](#)–54
 Toquerville, [744](#)–47
 Zion National Park, [744](#), [747](#)–52
voyage of understanding, [732](#)–35
Hardscrabble saints, [580](#)
Haun's Mill, killings at, [408](#)
“headwaters of the Severe” rise, [19](#)
Heaton and Sons Company (HSC)
 joint stock company, organized as, [643](#)
 model LDS family, [640](#)
 OUO, mimicking, [643](#)
 Pipe Springs, purchase, [624](#), [633](#)–35
 reincorporation as PSLLC, [635](#)
 squatter rights at Pipe Springs, [704](#)
 Upper Kanab Ranch, purchase, [643](#)
Heaton family
 caretaker for Winsor Castle, arrangement for, [669](#)
 Pipe Springs land claim, clearance, [726](#)
 Winsor Castle, sale to NPS, [712](#)
Heaton family, at Moccasin Springs
 and Kaibab, relationship, [647](#)–51
 rights on Kaibab reservation, [667](#)
 watermelon bust, [649](#)
Heaton, Alvin, possession of Fiddler's Green, [642](#)
Heaton, Charles, [612](#)
 Paiute-Kaibab meeting at Moccasin, [648](#)
 Winsor Castle, sale of, [712](#)
Heaton, Charles Leonard (son of Charles)
 caretaker of Pipe Spring National Monument, [609](#), [613](#)
 Moccasin-Pipe Springs history, interest in, [646](#)
Heaton, Jonathan, [636](#)–41
 Pipe Springs title problem, [708](#)
 possession of Moccasin, [642](#)
 Utah-Grand Canyon Highway support, [690](#)
 Winsor Castle, sale of, [712](#)
Heaton, William, Muddy settlement, [195](#)
“Hebron”, stock-raising village on Shoal Creek, [56](#)
Hempstead, Charles H. (prosecuting attorney, Utah), attorney for BY, [278](#)
Henry, Joseph (Smithsonian Institution, secretary), supervision of Powell's expedition, [243](#)
Heywood, Joseph L., Jr., [597](#), [598](#)
Hickman, Bill, “Danite murderer”, [158](#), [308](#)
 BY arrest warrant, on testimony of, [286](#)
Hickman, Bill, evidence against BY, [158](#)
Higbee, Richard, on raids after Battle of Bull Rush Wash, [100](#)
Hildale, Utah, polygamist citadel, [674](#)

Hill, George Washington, baptizing Native Americans, [386](#)
Hoar bill (1884), [492](#)
Hollister, Oliver J. (tax collector)
 BY's finance base, attacking, [212](#)
 Mormon tithing, non-voluntary, [213](#)
Holy Order of the Gospel, [368](#)
Holy Order of the Temple Endowment, [218](#), [329](#)
“Honeymoon Trail”, [341](#), [512](#)
Hooper, William H., polygamy in exchange for statehood, [274](#)
Hopi
 baptism of, [389](#)
 descendants of Welsh Prince Madoc, believe, [33](#)
horses, slaughter for sport, [571](#)
Hosmer, Charles, Jr., interview with Albright, [760](#)
“hotel train de luxe”, [698](#)
Howd, Charlie
 retaliation, primary attack leader, [92](#)
 vengeance on Mormons, chief lieutenant on, [91](#)
Hunter, Edward (Bishop), [141](#)
Huntington, Dimmick, baptizing Native Americans, [389](#)
Hurricane Cliffs, [3](#), [7](#)
Hurricane Plateau, [7](#)
 livestock removal, [94](#)
Hurricane to Kanab route, sand problems, [700](#)
Hurricane–Pipe Springs–Lees Ferry road, work on, [340](#)
Hurt, Garland, [28](#)
Hyde, Orson, [53](#)
 on BY's tyrannical administration, [421](#)
 escape to southern Utah, [165](#)
“Hyphenated Americans” and Mormon-Americans, [734](#)
immigrant company, attack of, [27](#)
“Independence Day Sermon” (Rigdon), [204](#)
“Indian Trail,” passing through Vermilion Cliffs, [61](#)
Indian Appropriation Bill, [664](#)
Indian Farms, [393](#), [456](#)
 as buffer zones, [110](#), [130](#)
 of Kaibab, [113](#)
 Moccasin and Two Mile, [470](#)
 of Mormons, move from Kanab to Moccasin, [117](#)
 of Shivwits, Indian School on, [654](#)
 Paria, [110](#), [131](#), [136](#), [459](#)
 Pipe Springs and Kanab, [456](#)
 Santa Clara, [29](#)
Ingalls, George W.
 reservations for Native Americans, [456](#)
Ingleheart, William (*Salt Lake Tribune*)
 Arizona Strip, account of travel, [604](#)–6
 on post-polygamy and statehood, concerns, [606](#)
Ingraham, Prentiss, [573](#), [576](#)
 on Grand Canyon expedition, [579](#)
Ivins, Anthony W., [713](#)

KCC, transfer to Salt Lake bank, [554](#)
 KLCC, appointment as manager, [567](#)
 life at Pipe Springs, [727](#)
 on wealth flow from poor to rich, [382](#)–83
 supervisory actions on Woolley and Seegmiller, [566](#)
 on Whitmore and McIntyre deaths, [72](#)
 “Jack-Mormons”, [288](#)
 Jackson, James Webb
 letter to BY, [318](#)–21
 letter to Greeley, [321](#)–24
 on elections at Pipe Springs, [318](#)
 “Jacob’s Twist”, 50
 Jacob’s Crossing, [96](#)
 Jenson, Andrew, on Moccasin Springs, [645](#)
 Joaquín the Laguna, [8](#)
 Johnson Colvin, Elizabeth (wife of Orlin). *See* Colvin, Orlin F., 669
 Johnson, Charles Ellis, on Whitmore and McIntyre burials, [85](#)
 Johnson, LeRoy (brother of Elizabeth Colvin), president of FLDS church, [674](#)
 Johnson, William Darby (Bishop), letter to *Deseret News* about Pipe Springs survey, [254](#)
 Johnston, Albert Sidney (Commanding General of the Army in Utah), [29](#), [44](#)
 Jones, Daniel W., [19](#)
 Jones, Lehi Willard, partner of Bulloch, [594](#)
 Jones, Randall, promoter of Utah tourism, [710](#)
 Jones, Sondra, [21](#)
 Jubilee of 1880, [422](#)–29
 Judd, Thomas, [517](#)
 capture, [518](#)
 Hurricane Canal, builder of, [517](#)
 undergrounding wife and son in Salt Lake City, [518](#)
 July 4th, 1871 stand-off Trobriand and BY, [151](#)–55
 “Jumpers’ Club”, [156](#)
 Kaibab band (Paiute), [8](#)
 and Paiute, meeting at Moccasin (1891), [648](#)
 baptism of, [388](#)–89
 Captain Frank, father of reservation, [117](#)
 captures, Whitmore and McIntyre killing witnesses, [74](#)
 farms, help to establish, [455](#)
 Indian farms of, [113](#)
 intermarriage and anti-Mormon activities, [98](#)
 on low wages and exploitation, [657](#)
 Moccasin, defense against Navajos, [647](#)
 moral development, [653](#)
 “Mormon Indians” to “Government Indians,” changing, [658](#)
 and Mormons, joint forces, [103](#)
 at Pipe Springs, [519](#)
 reservation agreement, Moccasin, [664](#)–66
 resettlement to “Indian Farm”, [568](#)
 Kaibab Plateau, [36](#)
 Gentleman's Hunting Park, failure to secure investors, [583](#)
 national game preserve, campaign for, [662](#)–64
 preservation, [660](#)

recreation and adventure park, [571](#)
wild life, chase and slaughter, [571](#)
Kaibab. *See* Kaibab band (Paiute)
Kanab
abandonment, [95](#)
descriptions of (1871), [247](#)
fort at, [71](#)
Indian Farm at, [456](#)
Mormon refuge, [168](#)
Mormon troops, permission to protect, [231](#)
Nauvoo Legion, request for assistance, [231](#)
Navajo visit, peace talks, [227–29](#)
Navajos, defense against hostile, [229–34](#)
polygamists, preparation for immigration of, [435](#)
religious and cultural toleration at, [252](#)
resettlement, [190](#)
UO, living the, [388](#)
Kanab Cooperative Cattle Company (KCCC). *See* KCCC (Kanab Cooperative Cattle Company)
Kanab Cooperative Cattle Company (KCCC). *See*, [443](#)
Kanab Desert stock drive, [378](#)
Kanab Guard, [508](#)
Kanab Gulch-Grand Canyon Gold Rush (1872), [263–66](#)
Kanab Stake, [411](#)
guards corps, [509](#)
Pipe, [556](#)
property and water rights at Moccasin, [462](#)
Relief Society Sisters of the, [475](#)
Kanab Stake Association, [544](#), [546](#)
Kanab Stock Herd Company, [446](#)
“Kane County Sheepmen’s Union”, [627](#)
Kane County, people in economic distress, [567](#)
Kane, Thomas L., [276](#), [282](#)
on polygamy abandonment, [284–85](#)
and southern escape route, [285](#)
Kanosh (Pahvant Chief), about lack of government support, [384](#)
KCC (Kaibab Cattle Company), [553](#)
KCCC (Kanab Cooperative Cattle Company)
CCSC property, proposition to obtain, [443](#)
Pipe Springs, push to take over, [444](#)
Taylor proposal, [443](#)
WCSGC, placing cattle in, [427](#)
Keys of the Priesthood, passing on, [360](#)
Kingdom and the Republic, potential conflict, [288](#)
Kingdom of God, building of, [302](#)
Kirtland Temple, [408](#)
KLCC (Kaibab Land and Cattle Company), [565](#)
revival by Ivins, [567](#)
Woolley and Seegmiller, dismissed as managers, [567](#)
KZN (K-Zion) radio station, broadcasting Harding speech, [740](#)
labor tithing, at St. George construction, [208](#)
Lake Powell, [679](#)

Lamanites

BY letter to furnish land and implements, [387](#)

BY support, [388](#)

BY suspending endowments to, [387](#)

conversion of, [18](#), [350](#)

Hamblin, Apostle to, [36](#), [73](#)

New Mexican Mission, [440](#)

Taylor position on, [458](#)

“Land of Standing Rocks,” Powell description, [269](#)

“Last Wild Horse of the Kanab Desert, The” (article in *Outing*), [573](#)

Latter-Day Saints (LDS). *See also* Mormons

hierarchy and Republican Party (1923), [731](#)

Lauritzen and Rust

irrigation project, effect on road and railroad construction, [688](#)

water from Canaan Mountain to Short Creek Lake, [679](#)

Lauritzen, Jacob M. (brother-in-law of Rust), [675](#)

Law of Consecration and Stewardship, [135](#), [144](#), [335](#), [344](#)

Lee, John D.

enrichment from victim's properties, [43](#)

excommunication of, [309](#)

instigation of Southern Paiute to attack emigrants, [28](#)

lumber for Winsor Castle construction, [197](#)

proselytizing Southern Paiute, [26](#)

Lee's Ferry, [109](#), [171](#)

Lehi Cattle Feeding Company, [600](#)

Lehi Feed Yard

PSCC cattle, primary source, [598](#)

pulp feed, [598](#)

Lincoln, Abraham

election, [47](#)

on Utah and its minerals, [24](#)

Lion House, [286](#)

Logan Temple, financing of, [142](#)

“Long Walk”, [64](#)

Long Valley

abandonment, [95](#)

Muddy settlers arriving, [222](#)–[23](#)

Muddy settlers, relocating to, [195](#)

resettlement, [190](#)

Losee, Isaac, in charge of Pipe Springs Ranch, [445](#)

Lund, Robert (Bertie), [517](#)

Arizona Strip to Utah, formal request, [602](#)

Lynch, James

Fourney a “Mormon-lover”, labeling, [43](#)

Fourney's protection army, leader, [41](#)

Latter-Day Saints, incrimination by children, [43](#)

on Mormon avarice, [41](#), [43](#)

on Hamblin's false reports, [42](#)

testimony on false Hamblin reports, [45](#)–[46](#)

MacDonald, Alexander F., head of SUTO, [362](#)

Mace, Rebecca

on horse racing at Kanab, [474](#)
 on Kanab Mormon-Kaibab interactions, [654–57](#)
 Maggie. *See* Cox, Margaret (Maggie)
 “Manifesto” of 1890, ending Mormon plural marriage, [527](#)
 “Man’s War against the Horse”, [628–33](#)
 Manti Temple
 dedication, [559](#)
 financing of, [142](#)
Marion Star, on Mormons, [737](#)
 Mather, Stephen T. (Director of NPS), [750](#)
 death of Harding, memorializing, [705](#)
 and Dee, promoting park highways, [699](#)
 document for Harding’s signature, Pipe Spring as National Monument, [719](#), [724–25](#)
 donors for Pipe Springs, seeking, [715](#)
 on “increase of Motor Travel” in national parks, [699](#)
 letter to Burke, on Winsor Castle preservation, [707](#)
 letter to G.A. Smith on Pipe Spring property, [714](#)
 letter to Spry, on Winsor Castle preservation, [707](#)
 meeting Charles Heaton, [711](#)
 national parks and monuments, promotional campaign, [697](#)
 National Park-to-Park Highway, creation, [695–703](#)
 on Pipe Springs preservation and transformation, [702](#)
 Pipe Spring National Monument, promoting, [704](#)
 Pipe Springs strategy, [705–7](#)
 Pipe Springs, attempt to obtain, [709](#)
 pressing for sale of Pipe Springs before Harding visit, [721–23](#)
 publicity caravan over Park-to-Park highway, [700](#)
 Winsor Castle, seeking financial support for purchase, [717](#)
 “Matung springs”, [33](#)
 Maxwell, William B., [56](#)
 McArthur, Daniel D. (Colonel)
 on punishing Navajos for Grama Canyon, [80](#)
 role in Grama Canyon campaign, [73](#), [74](#), [78](#)
 McConnel, Jehile, Arizona expedition report, [338](#)
 McGeary, James (Deputy Marshal), conduct, [505](#)
 McIntyre, Robert. *See also* Nauvoo Legion campaign, Grama Canyon
 burial, [85](#)
 killed, at Red Clay Flat, [68](#)
 killing, Latter-day Saints and Paiute mutual vengefulness, [85](#)
 primary stock herder at Whitmore ranch, [63](#), [66](#)
 McKean, James B. (Chief Justice)
 abuse of the law, [176](#)
 BY and Mountain Meadows Massacre, attempt to tie, [158](#)
 Grant’s judicial policy, implementation of, [277](#)
 law against adultery, [158](#)
 legal system illegal, Chief Justice Chase, [292](#)
 legal system unconstitutional, Supreme Court, [175](#)
 Mormon theocratic system, intent to topple, [161–63](#)
 political winds shifting, letter to Grant, [279](#)
 removed from office, [394](#)
 “Utah Ring,” leader of, [155](#)

“McKeanites”. *See* “Utah Ring”; Utah Ring
 McKoy, Kathleen
 on Mather's singing with Mormons, [761](#)
 on Pipe Spring National Monument establishment, [731](#)
 McQuarrie, Dan, on capture of Palmetto, [632–33](#)
 "Mericans", 27
 Merriam, Florence A., on state of polygamy (1890), [564](#)
 Mesa Arizona Temple, [441](#)
Message of the President, Communicating . . . Information in Relation to the Massacre at Mountain Meadows, and other Massacres in Utah Territory (Buchanan), [47](#)
 military forces, native religious gatherings, mobilization to break up, [392](#)
 “Missionaries for Arizona,” meeting on Arizona colonization, [339](#)
 Mix, Charles E. (Utah Superintendent of Indian Affairs), [28](#)
 Moccasin Farm, purchase on behalf of Kanab Indians, [443](#), [459–62](#)
 Moccasin Springs
 history and naming, [645–47](#)
 livestock removal, [94](#)
 Paiute and Kaibab meeting (1891), [648](#)
Mohave County Miner, on Utah-Grand Canyon Highway support, [690](#)
 Moncur, Heber
 Pipe Springs National Monument, visit to, [609–10](#)
 Winsor Castle, caretaker, [609](#)
 Moncur, Louise (“Weasy”), [609](#)
 and Maggie, [617](#)
 Moody, John M., [63](#)
 Moqui Villages, missionary expeditions to, [97](#)
 “Mormon Indians,” change to “Government Indians”, [658](#)
 Mormon avarice, [41](#)
 Mormon canon, added to Woodruff Manifesto, [563](#)
 Mormon Church, effects of federal government stopping polygamy, [493](#)
 Mormon Corridor. *See* Old Spanish Trail
 Mormon press on John Newman, [157](#)
 Mormon Primary Association, women leaders' trip account of Pipe Springs corridor, [607](#)
 Mormon Probate Court, [294](#)
 “Mormon Problem”
 and the Civil War, [47](#)
 Engelbrecht decision's failure to settle, [294](#)
 government maps, key to solving, [241](#)
 Grant interest in solving, [339](#)
 nation's and LDS reaction, [495](#)
 and plural marriage, [326](#)
 Mormon settlements, destruction of Native Americans' grasslands, [385–87](#)
 Mormon territory, maps and descriptions, [239–40](#)
 Mormon-Americans, [734–37](#)
 Mormonism, theocratic monarchy, [366](#)
 Mormon-Navajo peace treaty, [121–32](#), [123–28](#), [192](#), [224](#), [229](#)
 Chief Barbencito, expression of love, [126](#)
 Mormons
 “Danites,” vigilantes called, [21](#)
 “Dixie,” definition and importance of, [48–49](#)
 Americanization, contributing people, [758–60](#)

anti-polygamy crusade, [493](#), [494](#)
 Arizona, locating settlement sites in, [339](#)
 BY's management of church funds, concerns and exodus, [420–22](#)
 children adoption, post 1857 massacre, [28](#)
 climate against (1901-1907), [737](#)
 cooperation to self-interest, shift, [416](#)
 declaration of independence by BY, [331](#)
 drought, God's wrath, [596](#)
 enticing gentile capitalists, [692](#)
 exodus from Missouri (1838-1839), [408](#)
 from theocratic kingdom to part of a nation, transmutation, [755](#)
 Grand Canyon Highway donations, [693](#)
 Indian Slavery substitution, [21–22](#)
 and Kaibabits, joint forces, [103](#)
 meeting to secure church property, [545](#)
 and Mountain Meadows Massacre connection, [31](#)
 naming “Pipe Spring”, [34–36](#)
 Native American Missions, establishment, [2](#)
 and non-members, positive interactions, [714](#)
 personal vs. church property, blurry lines, [135](#)
 response to livestock raids, [71](#)
 slave trade, awareness of, [16](#)
 social barriers, [328–30](#)
 Southern Utah, attack of immigrant company, [27](#)
 theology, principle with promise, [143](#)
 US Supreme Court, faith in, [289](#)
 Ute children, "rescue" of slaves, [17–19](#)
 vigilante groups, [466](#)
 Morrill Anti-Bigamy Act (1862), [491](#), [728](#)
 church assets, protection from, [543–44](#)
 constitutional, US Supreme Court, [290](#), [491](#)
 prohibition of church property, [493](#)
 Morton, Oliver P. (Senator), opponent of McKean, [162](#)
 “Mountain Meadows Massacre. Surviving Children of the Murdered Fix the Crime upon the Mormons, The” (Lynch), [43](#)
 Mountain Meadows Massacre, [25](#)
 Mormons and Paiute attack, [27](#)
 site descriptions, post-massacre, [41–42](#)
 Mountain Meadows Massacre, children recovery
 adoption by Mormons, [28](#)
 deception by Hamblin, [29–31](#)
 Hamblin trip, [30–31](#)
 by US government, [28–31](#)
 Mr. Hanson. *See* Beadle, John H. (a.k.a. Mr. Hanson)
 “Mu-tum-wa-va (Dripping Rock)” (or Matung springs), [33](#)
 “Muddy Mission”, [180](#), [193](#)
 Muddy River settlers
 exodus, [180](#)
 relocation to Long Valley, [195](#), [222–23](#)
 Muddy settlements, transfer to Nevada
 relocation committee of seven, [195](#)

tax impact and resettlement, [193](#)–96

Musser, A. Milton (Bishop)

- on insufficient stock tithing, [210](#)
- Pipe Springs telegraph office opening, [249](#)

“Mustang Hunt”

- national press on, [630](#)–33
- Pipe Springs, centered at, [629](#)

mustangs

- drives at Pipe Springs (1877), [573](#)
- killing for sport, [572](#)
- war against, [628](#)–33

My Summer in a Mormon Village (Merriam), [564](#)

Naraguts, chief of Kaibab Indians, [37](#)

National Monuments. *See also* Pipe Spring National Monument

- Bryce Canyon, [701](#)
- Cedar Breaks, [701](#), [722](#)
- Grand Canyon North Rim, [569](#)
- Winsor Castle, [36](#), [201](#), [711](#)
- Zion Canyon, [701](#)

national panic of 1893, [584](#)

National Park Service (NPS), [696](#)

- sale of Pipe Springs to, [667](#), [750](#)

National Park Service (NPS), sale of Pipe Springs to, [712](#)

National Park-to-Park Highway, [700](#)

- creation, [695](#)–703

National Transcontinental Telegraph Line, [54](#)

Native Americans

- baptisms, [385](#)–87
- diseases from European contacts, [102](#)
- government assistance (Powell), [304](#)
- lack of food and stealing, [385](#)
- national press on baptism of, [387](#)
- reservation for (Powell), [456](#)
- slave trade, [15](#)–22
- support to newly baptized, [393](#)
- uprisings, [70](#)

Native peoples of Utah, adoption of Hispanic culture, [16](#)–17

Nauvoo Legion

- block houses, building of, [96](#)
- and Navajos, battles (1866-1870), [125](#)
- proclamation to abolish, [146](#), [148](#)

Nauvoo Legion campaign, Grama Canyon, [73](#)–78

- Kaibabit Indians, killing of, [75](#), [76](#), [78](#)
- killings, justification, [79](#)
- Moccasin Ranch detachment, [74](#)
 - Kaibabit encampment, finding clothes, [75](#)–76
 - Whitmore and McIntyre killing, Kaibabit witnesses, [74](#)
- Navajos, killers of Whitmore and McIntyre, [81](#)–85
- orders, [73](#)
- Pierce, role in, [73](#), [74](#)
- Red Clay Flats patrol, discovery of bodies, [76](#)–78

“Navajo round-up”, by federal campaigns, [64](#)
Navajo War, [101](#), [107](#)
 end of, [234](#)
 livestock raids, [71](#), [105](#), [130](#)
 on Latter-Day Saint stock, [70](#)
 Pipe Springs, strategic role, [125](#)
Navajos
 baptism, resisting, [390](#)
 Black Hawk, vulnerability to, [71](#)
 killers of Whitmore and McIntyre, accounts, [81](#)–[85](#)
 livestock raid at Pine Valley, [98](#)
 Mormon livestock, raids on, [95](#)
 raids, [64](#)
Nebeker, Aquilla, [597](#)
“Nephites”, [33](#)
“New Canaan”, [111](#)
New Canaan cooperative cattle plan, [302](#)
New Mexican Lamanite Mission, [440](#)
New Mexican slave market, [5](#)
New Moderate Mormonism, [728](#)
New York Times, on BY's post-release Tabernacle Speech, [300](#)
Newman, John Philip, against Latter-day Saint theocracy, [156](#)–[58](#)
Newman, Parson (Grant's minister), against Mormons, [299](#)
Northern Arizona and Nevada Development Association, [719](#)
Northern Utes
 "Lordship" over Southern Paiute, [15](#)–[16](#)
 and slave trade, [16](#)
Northwest Ordinance of 1787, BY judicial system using, [25](#)
Northwest Ordinance of 1798
 dismantling of, [154](#)
NPS (National Park Service), [696](#), *See* National Park Service (NPS)
Nuttall, L. John
 CCSC property, care of, [442](#)–[45](#)
 Kanab UO, head of, [389](#)
 letter to Bishop Johnson, providing for Kaibabits, [458](#)
 Moccasin Farm, Indian use, [461](#), [463](#)
 Pipe Springs Ranch, difficulties to lease, [451](#)–[53](#)
 secretary to Taylor, [470](#)
Nutter, Preston
 Mormon market, [586](#)
 and Mormons, relationship, [476](#)
Ojo Caliente, settlement, [3](#)
“Old Tappie”, [83](#)
 Kaibab revenge for Shirts curse, [86](#)
Old Spanish Trail, [3](#), [12](#), [26](#)
 expedition by Pratt, [14](#)
 increasing traffic, due to polygamy practice, [435](#)
Order of Enoch. *See* United Order (UO), [215](#)
Order to the Second Coming, [369](#)
OUO (Orderville UO)
 collapse, property distribution, [638](#)

collapse, reason, [641](#)
Moccasin property, sale to Church, [462–65](#)
Pipe oversight, end of, [446](#)
Pipe Springs Ranch, taking care of, [444](#)
Pagampachi, [8](#)
“Pageant in the Wilderness”, [8](#)
Paiute. *See also* Kaibab band (Paiute)
and Kaibab, meeting at Moccasin (1891), [648](#)
attack of emigrants, instigation by Lee, [28](#)
children adopted by Mormons, [22](#)
famine, [304](#)
fear of Europeans and slave trade, [5](#)
government support, lack of, [383–85](#)
immigrant company, attack of, [27](#)
Kaibab Band, [8](#)
and Latter-day Saints, mutual vengefulness, [85](#)
mythology, [118](#)
Navajo raids, assisting, [113](#)
proselytization by Mormons, [26](#)
proving Navajos as killers of Whitmore and McIntyre, [81](#), [82](#)
retaliation, [89–94](#)
Palmer, William R., [83–84](#)
Palmetto, capture, [631](#)
Panguitch (village), [482](#)
cattle drive to, [556](#)
Indian School, [654](#), [662](#)
Panguitch John. *See* Coal Creek John
Panguitch Lake, [474](#)
Panic of 1873
precursors to, [350](#)
and scarcity of money, [352](#)
pan-Indian rebellion, [11](#)
“paper stock” for live stock, [378](#)
Paria ferry, construction, [171](#)
Park Service Act (1916), [698](#)
Parker, John (Bishop, Virgin City), [135](#)
Parrish-Potter Killings (1857), [362](#)
Parussi country, [10](#)
Parussis, [7](#)
Pass of Pipe Springs, [96](#)
Patnish (Northern Ute), [71](#)
at Kanab, [227](#)
demands, [230](#)
killing Whitmore and McIntyre, [68](#), [98](#)
raid at Pipe Springs, [66–68](#), [86](#)
stirring up trouble, [129–32](#)
Perpetual Emigration Fund (PE Fund), [544](#)
“Pie-eeds” Indians, [646](#)
Pierce, John D. L. (Captain)
Battle of Pipe Springs (or of Bull Rush Wash), [99](#)
role in Grama Canyon campaign, [73](#), [74](#)

Pintura, modern village, [6](#)
 Pipe Spring National Monument, [108](#), [583](#), [609](#)
 antipathy, [715](#)
 benefit to motorists, [727](#)
 Deseret News on Mather-Smith cooperation, [716](#)
 Heaton land claim clearance, [726](#)
 Mather document for Harding's signature, [719](#), [724](#)–25
 Mather strategy and trip to North Rim, [705](#)–7
 McKoy on establishment of, [731](#)
 ownership problems, [704](#)
 proclamation of, [722](#)
 proclamation signed, [726](#)
 reasons for becoming, [570](#)
 Pipe Springs
 base of operations, [113](#)
 bastion at, [223](#)
 births at, [522](#)–24
 cattle, water for, [534](#)–36
 children at, [522](#)
 construction at, [302](#)–3
 cowboys at, [476](#)–78, [533](#)
 economic forces at, [366](#)
 Edmunds Act, impact, [491](#)
 fortification of, [72](#)
 and Grand Canyon Highway, [690](#)
 Heaton claim to, settlement, [718](#)
 herd, “culled”, [554](#)
 husband visits, during polygamist crusade, [521](#)
 importance, [604](#)
 Indian Farm at, [456](#)
 life in 1872 at, [324](#)–25
 livestock removal, [94](#)
 monument, meaning of, [762](#)
 Mormons and Mountain Meadows Massacre connection, [31](#)
 Mormons' need for bastion at, [489](#)
 naming of, [34](#)–36
 national park, [583](#)
 Native Americans, feeding, [385](#)
 ownership, [215](#)
 ownership during confiscation period, [546](#)
 Paiute Indians at, [539](#)
 plural wives at, [520](#)
 polygamist shelter, life during, [519](#)
 post-Civil War politics, role in, [302](#)
 Powell's base of operations, [121](#)
 protection of Apostles, during Raid period, [562](#)
 raid detection system, [509](#)
 rainstorms, consequences, [601](#)
 round ups, biannual, [477](#), [621](#)
 sale to Heaton and Sons Company, [624](#)
 telegraph line, benefits, [524](#)

telegraphers at, [405–7](#)
telephone line, augmenting telegraph, [525](#)
title transfer to PSCC, [599](#)
tourist waystation, [570](#)
water source, [3](#), [7](#)
Whitmore, master of, [57](#)
Woolley and Seegmiller, “owners”, [542](#)

Pipe Springs corridor, [12](#)
 food shortage, consequences, [224](#)
 Hamblin exploration, [39](#)
 inter-park system, challenge to, [701](#)
 traders and trappers, [12](#)
 traffic during abandonment, [95](#)

Pipe Springs fort, [27](#), *See* Winsor Castle

Pipe Springs Land and Cattle Company, [613](#)

Pipe Springs Plateau, after temporary abandonment, [95](#)

Pipe Springs Ranch
 church cattle, hiding from federal government, [219](#)
 church property, return, [585](#)
 Hamblin's mission enabling, [114](#)
 Nuttall to Bishop Johnson on care of, [446](#)
 ownership, back to Mormons, [592](#)
 purchase by Heaton family, [612](#)
 purchase by Saunders, [588](#)
 refuge, plural wives and children, [504](#)
 refuge, polygamists and witnesses, [508](#)
 sale to Findlay, [622](#)
 sale to NPS, [750](#)
 sale, up for, [557](#)
 Upper Kanab holdings, added, [470](#)

Pipe Springs region
 and wild horses, [571](#)
 cattle industry at, [477](#)
 demise, [584](#)
 investment withdrawals, [426](#)
 Navajo and Nauvoo Legion, battles, [98](#)
 as a way station, [479](#)

Pipe Springs telegraph office, opening of, [249](#)

Pipe Springs-Kanab exploration, [133–45](#)

Poland Act (1874), constitutional, [491](#)

political demonstration (1885), mourning religious freedom, [501](#)

polygamy
 coming to end, press on, [274](#)
 in exchange for statehood, [274](#), [284–85](#), [289](#)
 minimizing past, [728](#)
 Short Creek, haven for post-Manifesto, [673](#)
 voices on, [176](#)

Powell survey expedition, [241–53](#)
 cairn at Vermilion Cliffs, [271](#)
 economic impact, [272](#)
 “Great Map”, [241](#), [267](#)

meeting with BY at Kanab, [248](#)
 Mormons and Navajos, building friendships, [246](#)
 Mt. Trumbull, triangulation at, [256–57](#)
 Pipe Springs, focus of mapping process, [270](#)
 report to Secretary of the Smithsonian Institution, [267](#)
 self-advancement, [243](#)
Shinumo cliff dwellings, discovery of, [244](#)
 significance, [241](#)
 Southern Utah, mapping of, [238](#)
 survey at Pipe Springs, [254–56](#)
 topographical features, importance of, [268–70](#)

Powell, Clem (*Chicago Tribune*)
 on Kaibab Indians' need for food, [305–7](#)
 on Kanab Gulch gold rush, [264](#), [265](#)
 Pipe Springs, description (1872), [258–60](#)

Powell, John Wesley
 and BY, cooperation, [106–8](#)
 and Captain Frank, relationship, [117](#)
 explorations, government-sponsored, [105](#)
 interest in Native Americans, reasons, [114](#)
 irrigation projects, [676](#)
 Native Americans, government assistance to, [304](#)
 Native Americans, reservations for, [456](#)
 Pipe Springs, base of operations, [121](#)

Powell-Hamblin Uinkaret expedition, [34](#), [115–21](#)
 BY with, [108–13](#)
 and Captain Frank, relationship, [117](#)
 Ft. Pierce, welcome at, [123](#)
 on Hamblin's influence over Indians, [119](#)
 Powell meeting Uinkaret band, [118–21](#)
 trip to Navajo Agency headquarters, Ft. Defiance, [121](#)

Pratt, Orson
 Indian baptisms, [387](#)
 postmaster of St. George, [55](#)
 St. George, location selection, [54](#)

Pratt, Parley P., expedition along Old Spanish Trail, [14–15](#)
 “Prince Madoc’s Welsh Colony” (Nephites), [33](#)

Provo, riots at, [150](#)

PSCC (Pipe Springs Cattle Company)
 cattle, source for Lehi Feed Yard and Utah Slaughter Company, [598](#)
 incorporation, [597](#), [599](#)
 sale to Findlay, [621–24](#)

PSLLC (Pipe Springs Land & Livestock Company), [635](#)

Pulsipher family
 founding “Hebron”, stock-raising village, [56](#)
 Traveling Agent, appointed, [359](#)

Pulsipher, Alydia Terry (daughter of Charles), telegrapher at Pipe Springs, [405–7](#)

Pulsipher, Charles
 early life, [408–11](#)
 food for “Temple hands”, [357–60](#)
 on WCSGC and CCSC, relationship, [414](#)

Pipe Springs Ranch and WCSGC, appointments, [402](#), [404](#)
 Pipe Springs Ranch, move to, [411](#)
 Ranch responsibilities, BY instructions, [407](#)
 temple donations, preaching for, [302](#)
 WCSGC and CCSC, suggestion to unite, [415](#)
 Quire, Francis, [199](#), [201](#)
 Quorum of the Twelve Apostles
 Hyde, President, [421](#)
 on list of “Mormon criminals”, [503](#)
 Pipe Springs, reaction to sale of, [591](#)
 Taylor, President, [422](#)
 Woodruff, President, [559](#)
 Woolley and Seegmiller, scrutinizing actions by, [548](#)
 “Rawhide and Bailing Wire”, [595](#)
 drought effect on, [622](#)
 Rebecca Mace
 on horse racing at Kanab, [474](#)
 Reclamation Act, [676](#)
 Red Rock Springs, [33](#)
 Reilly, P.T., on Woolley-Seegmiller actions, Edmunds-Tucker Act settlement, [553](#)
 Relief Society Sisters of the Kanab Stake, [475](#)
 “Renegade Pies”, [98](#)
Reynolds vs. the United States, decision on prosecution for plural marriage, [435](#)
 Reynolds, George, sentenced for polygamy, [435](#)
 Rigdon, Sidney (First Presidency, member), “Independence Day Sermon”, [204](#)
 Riggs, Brigham A., on mixing church and private cattle interests, [416](#)
 Rio Virgen Manufacturing Company, [356](#)
 Robinson, J. King, murdered by Mormon vigilante group, [467](#)
 Robinson, Joseph E., for Arizona Strip annexation by Utah, [602](#)
 Rock Canyon, [7](#)
 Roosevelt, Theodore (President)
 Buckskin Mountain, national forest preserve, [653](#)
 Kaibab Plateau a national game preserve, [664](#)
 Kaibab Plateau, national game preserve, [662](#)
 on hyphenated Americans, [735](#)
 Reclamation Act, signing of, [676](#)
 Roundy, Lorenzo W. (Captain), [66](#)
 fort at Kanab, building, [71](#)
 Rust and Lauritzen
 attempt to reclaim Land of Canaan, [675](#)
 Virgin Narrows dam, proposal for, [677](#)–79
 Rust, Will and Sarah, renting Pipe Springs from Heatons, [675](#)
Salt Lake Herald, preservation of Kaibab Plateau, [660](#)–61
 Salt Lake Ring, [396](#)
 Salt Lake Temple, financing completion, [142](#)
 San Francisco Mountain Exploring Company, [340](#)
 Sánchez, Joseph P., [11](#)
 Santa Clara, [51](#)
 Saunders, Benjamin Franklin
 buying spree, [587](#)–89, [590](#)
 cattle shipping, [477](#)

cattle syndicate, chief representative, [585](#)
 CCSC purchase, [588](#)
 Mormon market, [585](#)
 Pipe Springs Ranch purchase, [588](#), [590](#)
 Pipe Springs, ownership transfer to LDS stockmen, [593](#)
 and Utah-Arizona beef market, [475](#)
 Savage, Levi, Jr., [56](#), [66](#)
 Sawyer, Joseph
 cattle theft, by employees, [449](#)
 at Winsor Castle, [444](#), [445](#)
 Schools of the Prophets
 as Boards of trade, [140](#)
 scrip notes, [363](#)
 during emigration to Arizona, [437](#)
 uses, [376](#)
 Utah economy, importance to, [414](#)
 Second Manifesto, [563](#), [673](#)
 “secret police,” alternative names, [466](#)
 Secret Mormon Cypher, [280](#)
 “see America First”, [698](#)
 Seegmiller, Daniel
 activities, [565](#)
 CCSC Upper Kanab dairy and ranch, renting, [465](#)
 embezzlement, accusations of, [589](#)
 killing Colonel Pike accusation, [467](#)
 Mormon vigilante group, member, [466](#)
 southern Utah, moving to, [468](#)
 Valentine Scrip filed on Pipe Springs, [704](#)
 Shaffer, J. Wilson (Utah's war governor)
 confiscation of church property, [219](#)
 control of territorial militia, [148](#)–50
 death, [150](#)
 enforcement of proclamations and BY's response, [151](#)–55
 First Presidency and Federal government, [149](#)
 proclamations, abolishing Nauvoo Legion, [146](#)
 Shankland, Robert, national monument vs. national park, [697](#)
 Sheridan, Philip H. (General), [149](#)
 Sherman, William T., collection of church taxes by military forces, [214](#)
Shinumos, cliff dwellings discovery, [244](#)
 Shirts family, siege of, [86](#)
 Shirts, Peter
 livestock removal from ranch, [94](#)
 rock fort, [110](#)
 Shivwits (Paiute)
 baptism of, [388](#), [391](#)
 farm, Indian School on, [654](#)
 on killing white men, [119](#)–20
 moral development, [653](#)
 Navajo raids, assisting, [113](#)
 and Uinkarets, conciliation, [118](#)–20
 Short Creek Irrigation Project, [677](#)

Short Creek Raid (1953), [674](#)
Short Creek, haven for post-Manifesto polygamists, [673](#)
Shoshones, baptized, [386](#)
“singing wires”, [225](#)
Smith, George A. (First Presidency, member)
 on killing Navajo sheep, consequences, [65](#)
 Mormonism, preserving history, [712](#)
 St. George, list of settlers for, [53](#)
 St. George, location selection, [54](#)
 tax rate, Utah vs. Nevada, [194](#)
 Whitmore murder, discussion with Paiute, [82](#)
Smith, John Henry
 morality of church property protection, [546](#)
 on Cannon taking responsibility, [547](#)
 at Winsor Castle, [512](#)
Smith, Joseph F. (1st LDS President), [18](#), [25](#)
 democratic checks and balances, [365](#)
 Law of Consecration and Stewardship, [135](#), [335](#), [344](#)
 lobbying against “Church Steal Bill”, [547](#)
 on Mormon power, [365](#)
 murder, [279](#)
 revelations, [18](#), [79](#), [135](#), [143](#), [215](#), [365](#)
 Second Manifesto, [563](#), [673](#)
Smoot Hearings, [737](#)
Smoot, Reed (Senator)
 and Harding, relationship, [732](#)
 Harding visit to Pipe Springs, ensuring, [722](#), [729](#)
 at Indian School, Panguitch, [662](#)
 Indian Appropriation Bill amendment, [664](#)
 meeting Roosevelt on Kaibab Plateau, [663](#)
 on Harding's death, [756](#)
 on Mormons as Americans, [735](#)
 Senate power, [731](#)
 Senate seating, questioned, [563](#)
Snow Thatcher, Georgiana
 undergrounding at Pipe Springs, [514](#), [520](#), [528–30](#)
Snow, Eliza R. (plural wife of Joseph Smith and BY), [460](#)
Snow, Erastus
 “underground” church business, [502](#)
 CCSC Upper Kanab dairy and ranch, renting, [465](#)
 consolidated settlements, consequences of, [94](#)
 guarding against Navajos, plan for, [97](#)
 laborers, housing visiting, [362](#)
 Mormon troops, permission to protect Kanab, [231](#)
 order to prepare defenses, [70](#)
 Pipe Springs, presidency over, [520](#)
 president, Canaan Ranch, [182](#)
 St. George, call for cattle, [209](#)
 St. George, location selection, [54](#)
 and US Marshal, relationship, [506](#)
Snow, Josephine (wife of Tanner), undergrounding in Salt Lake City, [518](#)

Southern Paiute. *See* Paiute

Southern States, secession from the Union, [47](#)

Southern Utah Co-operative Stock Herd Company. *See* CCCC (Canaan Cooperative Cattle Company)

Southern Utah Tithing Office (SUTO). *See* SUTO (Southern Utah Tithing Office)

Spaneshanks (Kaibabit leader)

- killing of, [93](#)
- Mormon interaction, [88](#)
- retaliation, primary attack leader, [92](#)

"Spanish crosses," in Pipe Springs region, [3](#)

Spanish exploration, early, [3](#)

Spencer, Howard

- Kaibabits, proposal to support, [458](#)
- Mormon vigilante group member, [466](#)
- southern Utah, moving to, [468](#)

Spry, William D. (US Land Commissioner), [707](#), [750](#)

- on Mormons as Americans, [735](#)

St. George

- call for cattle, [209](#)
- establishment of, [52](#)–[55](#)
- labor tithing at construction of, [208](#)
- list of settlers, [53](#)
- location selection, [54](#)
- Mormondom's southern capital, [367](#)
- railroad to, proposal, [604](#)
- ranch establishments near, [56](#)
- stock-raising industry, establishment of, [53](#)

St. George co-operative herd. *See* CCCC (Canaan Cooperative Cattle Company)

St. George House Hotel

- Schlappi, about living at, [371](#)
- and temple construction, [362](#)

St. George Stake

- church assets and liabilities in, [424](#)
- feeding laborers, [207](#)
- Joseph W. Young, president, [342](#)
- UO, BY organizing, [368](#)

St. George Stake Conference, [169](#)

St. George Stake School of the Prophets, announcement of St. George Temple, [223](#)

St. George Tabernacle, providing beef for workers at, [208](#)–[10](#)

St. George Temple

- announcement of, [223](#)
- beef, providing for workers, [208](#)–[10](#)
- building of, [302](#), [352](#)
- casualties of construction, [380](#)
- completion, consequences of accelerated, [330](#)
- completion, effect on WCSGC, [413](#)
- financing by Pipe Springs tithing ranch, [144](#)
- foundation, preparation of, [353](#)–[55](#)
- labor, free, [355](#)
- northern workers at, [360](#)–[62](#)
- and Pipe Springs fort, BY's last goals, [144](#)
- scrips at, [363](#)

volunteer laborer, sustenance for, [356–60](#)
 work force, determination of size, [372–74](#)
 Stakes of Zion, [414](#), [544](#)
 Stapley Bringham, Mary Janette, [745](#)
 Steel Stapley, Elizabeth, [745](#)
 Steele, John, report to First Presidency on Navajo War impact, [101](#)
 Stewart, Levi (Bishop)
 Fort Kanab, expansion, [191](#)
 letter from BY, colonizing instructions, [137–39](#)
 meeting BY, [111–13](#)
 Sutherland, George, and Mormonism, [735–37](#)
 SUTO (Southern Utah Tithing Office), [362](#)
 cattle from Pipe Springs, [370](#)
 use of scrip, [376](#)
 WCSGC account, [375](#)
 WCSGC paying taxes to, [377](#)
 Taggart, John B. (assessor for Utah)
 BY's financing base, attacking, [212](#)
 Mormon tithing, non-voluntary, [213](#)
 tithe assessment, [214](#)
 “Talley Pipe”, [634](#)
 Talmage, James E., [570](#)
 Tanner, Joseph Marion
 Brigham Young Academy in Provo, [520](#)
 at Winsor Castle, [512](#)
 Tawny, R. H., on spiritual-economic to economic transformation, [692](#)
 Taylor, John (President, LDS Church)
 “double martyr”, [493](#)
 CCSC cattle, demand for, [442](#)
 church property
 inventory, [423](#)
 move into underground, [543–44](#)
 and private property, distinction, [420](#)
 Clawson trial, refusing to testify, [496](#)
 colonization of Sonora and Chihuahua, [498](#)
 death, [499](#)
 free-will donations, [422](#)
 Lamanites, position on support, [458](#)
 leadership and economic policies, [419–22](#)
 meeting with Captain Frank on payment for Moccasin, [461](#)
 prosecution, fleeing, [498](#)
 Salt Lake Tabernacle, speech against anti-polygamy laws, [499](#)
 touring Moccasin Farm area, [460](#)
 Trustee in Trust, [417](#)
 Taylor, Zachary (US President), [23](#)
 telegraph lines, establishment by BY, [54](#)
 telephone lines, [525](#)
 Temple Building Missions, [330](#)
 Temple ordinances, [142](#)
 Tenney, Ammon M., [32](#)
 as translator, [121](#)

land purchase, St. Johns, [439](#)
on naming Pipe Springs, [34](#)
on obtaining Mormon-Navajo peace, [128](#)
on Battle of Bull Rush Wash, [99](#)
on Crossing of the Fathers, Crossing, [38](#)
“Tenney’s Sheep Troughs”, [61](#)

Thatcher, Moses
land in Mexico, acquisition for polygamist exiles, [528](#)
at Winsor Castle, [512](#)

The Superb
Harding's funeral train, [756](#)
Harding's train, [734](#)

Thomas Fitch, on Grant's anti-Mormon crusade, impact, [167](#)

Timpanogos Ute, [10](#)

Tissandier, Albert
at Kanab, [480–82](#)
at Grand Canyon, [488](#)
in Kaibab forest, [487](#)
Kaibabits, meeting, [486](#)
on Mormon hospitality, [488](#)
on Mormon ladies and young men, [483](#)
on Mormons' fear of police patrols, [489](#)
at Pipe Springs, [482–85](#)
polygamists, raising international awareness, [490](#)
Southern Utah and Arizona Strip, articles and sketches, [479–90](#)
water in the desert, finding, [485](#)

tithing
cash & Stock, [188](#)
decrease, [217](#)
non-taxable, Internal Revenue determination, [216](#), [220](#)
Saints leaving church due to, [217](#)
stopping to pay, [590](#)

tithing funds
control by BY, [142](#)
distrust in handling of, [589](#)

tithing offices, [139–40](#)
cattle transfers through, [437–39](#)
reserves, depletion of, [211](#)

Tomore’routikai, chief of Uinkaret band, [118](#)

Tontaquint Paiute, fear of newcomers, cause, [16](#)

Toquerville, Willis of (Bishop), [135](#)

Townsend, George Alfred (Cincinnati Commercial), account of meeting on BY's impending arrest, [160](#)

Trade and Intercourse Act, [18](#)

traders and trappers, Pipe Springs corridor, [12](#)

Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo, [22](#)

Trial of Don Pedro León Luján: The Attack Against Indian Slavery and Mexican Traders in Utah, The
(Jones), [21](#)

Trobriand, Regis De (General), [152](#)

Trumbull, Lyman (Senator)
Grant's judicial policy, attack on, [277](#)
opponent of McKean, [162](#), [173–75](#)

“Trustee in Trust”
 BY resignation, [220](#)
 confidence in, [212](#)
 Pipe Springs management, [442](#), [470](#)
 Pipe Springs Ranch sale, [557](#)
 Taylor as, [417](#)
 WCSGC ownership, [135](#)

Two Mile Ranch
 sale to KCCC, [447](#)
 Webber return to, [451](#)

Udall, David K.
 Mesa Arizona Temple, first president of, [441](#)
 St. Johns, paying debt for, [440](#)

“Uinkarets” mountain range, naming, [120](#)

Uinkarets (Paiute)
 and Shivwits, conciliation, [118](#)–20
 Navajo raids, assisting, [113](#)

Union Pacific Railroad
 role in Mormon Americanization, [759](#)
 to Cedar City, [742](#)
 tourists to Grand Canyon, [710](#)

United Order (UO), [215](#), [329](#), [344](#)
 apathy and collapse, [421](#)
 approaches to living the, [388](#)
 commencement in St. George, [367](#)
 factions at Kanab, [389](#)
 failure, [367](#)
 fathers advancing sons a threat to BY's purpose for, [417](#)–19
 purpose and establishment, [352](#)
 Utah settlements transformation into, [361](#)

United States Reclamation Service, [676](#)

“unlawful cohabitation” and polygamy, Edmunds Act distinction, [492](#)

UO (United Order). *See* United Order, 144

Upper Kanab Ranch
 Nonathan Heaton and Sons purchase, [643](#)
 underground station for male polygamists, [504](#)

US government
 cold war with BY's kingdom, [104](#)

Utah, [47](#), [155](#), [162](#)
 Arizona Strip, annexation, [602](#)
 mining and wealth in, [275](#)–77
 road and railroad construction, [688](#)
 settlements, transformation into UO working companies, [361](#)
 statehood in exchange for polygamy, [274](#), [284](#)–85, [289](#)
 territory transfer to Nevada, consequences of partial, [193](#)–96
 vs. government, on polygamy, [728](#)
 war on polygamy, [156](#)

Utah Parks Company, [710](#)

“Utah Ring”, [155](#), [162](#), [288](#)
 purpose, [155](#)

Utah Slaughtering Company, [598](#)

BY's "Home Industry," incarnation, [600](#)
 Utah Sugar Company, [598](#)
 Utah Territorial Legislature, assistance to build forts, [103](#)
 Utah-Arizona scenic loop, [701](#)
 Utah-Grand Canyon Highway, [690](#)–95
 "Ute Royal family", [90](#)
 Ute Ford, [9](#)
 Ute Trail, [86](#)
 Valentine Scrip, [704](#), [708](#), [718](#)
 Vélez de Escalante, Silvestre. *See* Escalante, Silvestre Vélez de, 2
 Vermilion Cliffs, cairn at, [271](#)
 Virgin Narrows, [115](#)
 Virgin Narrows dam, proposal for, [677](#)–79
 Virgin River, [3](#)
 Voyage of Understanding, [732](#)–35
 Walkara (a.k.a. Walker, Northern Ute war chief), and slave trade, [19](#)
 Walker War, [21](#)
 Walker, Charles L.
 on Battle of Bull Rush Wash, [100](#)
 on Shaffer's proclamation, [146](#)
 on St. George Temple design, [223](#)
 on Whitmore and McIntyre burials, [85](#)
 Wallace, Henry C., on Mormon loyalty to US, [752](#)
 "War on the Mormons", [224](#)
 War of the Rebellion, [47](#)
 Warner, Ted J., [8](#)
 Washington Cotton and Woolen Factory, [332](#)
 sale, [383](#)
 watering place of the Old Woman, [33](#)
 WCSGC (Winsor Castle Stock Growing Company), [111](#), [135](#)
 and CCSC, purpose and relation, [414](#)
 Article of Agreement, [333](#)–35
 and CCSC merger, [427](#)
 church and private ownership, [335](#)
 church and private stock ownership, shelter for, [220](#)
 drought, consequences for, [404](#)
 grassland, destruction of, [403](#)
 incorporation, [332](#)
 investments in, performance, [378](#)
 product distribution, [376](#)
 property transfer to CCSC, [427](#)
 small vs. rich investors, [380](#)–82
 St. George Temple, contribution to building, [375](#)
 stock mixing, [415](#)
 SUTO account, [375](#)
 taxes, payment, [377](#)
 use of scrip, [376](#)
 valuation and inventory, [412](#)–14
 Webber, Frank
 "jumping" Pipe Springs and Two Mile ranches, [447](#)
 cattle thefts, by employees, [447](#), [448](#), [449](#)

Two Mile Ranch, return to, [451](#)
 vacating Pipe Springs property, [448](#)
 at Winsor Castle, [444](#), [445](#)

Weber, Max, on spiritual-economic to economic transformation, [692](#)

Wells, Daniel H. (First Presidency, counselor)
 arrest, [161](#)
 murder charge, [165](#)
 territory defense properties, addressing Saints on, [51](#)–52

“Welsh Indians”, [33](#)

Whitmore, Elizabeth Carter Flahrity (wife of James), [57](#)–60

Whitmore, George (son of James)
 survival and rescue from Navajo raid, [69](#)

Whitmore, James M.. *See also* Nauvoo Legion campaign, Grama Canyon activities, [63](#)
 background, [57](#)–60
 burial, [85](#)
 establishment of stock-raising industry at St. George, [53](#)
 killed, at Red Clay Flat, [68](#)
 killing, Latter-day Saints and Paiute mutual vengefulness, [85](#)
 letter to President Buchanan, drafting, [59](#)
 master of Pipe Springs, becoming, [57](#)
 Pipe Springs Ranch, work at, [61](#)–62
 St. George, location selection, [54](#)

Wilson, Woodrow, on hyphenated Americans, [735](#)

Winsor Castle. *See also* Pipe Spring National Monument
 “War on the Mormons”, threats of, [224](#)
 and Fort Kanab, southeastern bastions, [192](#)
 automobile travel to North Rim transforming, [687](#)
 BY's last bastion, [175](#)
 BY's plans for, [110](#)
 BY's purpose, [224](#), [436](#), [728](#)
 cattle roundups at, [377](#)
 class distinction at, [533](#)
 considerations for building, [133](#)–34
 construction, [27](#)
 factors for slow, [221](#)
 reasons for slow, [226](#)

Dellenbaugh letter to Buffalo *Courier* on purpose of, [398](#)–402
 dilapidated state (1911), [668](#)
 famine and tithing, [226](#)
 first description (Dellenbaugh), [146](#)
 Joseph W. Young, charged to build, [183](#)–86
 Kanab and Long Valley resettlement, connection, [190](#)
 lay out, [113](#)
 lease of, [451](#)
 location selection, primary reason, [281](#)
 look-out for deputies, [530](#)–32
 lumber for, [197](#)
 migration through, [436](#)
 monument, meaning, [762](#)
 National Monument, designation, [36](#)

- objectives for, [297](#)
- obsolete, becoming, [584](#)
- ownership, [424](#)
- ownership return to church, [558](#)
- plan for, [187](#)
- political banner, significance, [325](#)
- post-Civil War politics, role in, [302](#)
- preservation, [661](#)
- as refuge from federal government, [147](#)
- resettlement program, part of, [105](#)
- safety zone during polygamy raids, [513](#)–15
- saved by Woolley, [570](#)
- spring, rerouting of, [201](#)
- and St. George Temple, BY's last goals, [145](#)
- trade during gold rush of 1872, [264](#)–66
- Upper Kanab holdings, added, [470](#)
- Winsor family involvement in construction, [199](#)–203
- Winsor Castle Stock Growing Company. *See* WCSGC, 111
- Winsor, Andrew N.
 - Winsor Castle, description of construction, [202](#)–3
- Winsor, Anson Perry (Bishop), [26](#)
 - church tithing cattle, gathering at Pipe Springs, [302](#)
 - on killing of Baibabits, [76](#), [78](#)
 - memorandum of agreement, responsibilities at WCSGC, [336](#)
 - Pipe Springs Ranch and WCSGC, replaced as superintendent, [402](#)
 - Pipe Springs, responsibilities at, [196](#), [374](#)
 - St. George Temple officer, [402](#)
 - tithing and temple donation stock, gathering, [356](#)–60
 - tithing herd supervisor, Pipe Springs, [141](#), [178](#)
- Winsor, Anson Perry, III
 - at Pipe Springs, [178](#)–80
- Winsor, Emeline
 - pioneer cheese and butter plant, [370](#)
- Winsor, Frank
 - dairy products for St. George, [370](#)–72
- “Wooden Gun Rebellion”, [150](#)
- Woodruff Manifesto (1890)
 - ending Mormon plural marriage, [527](#)
 - added to Mormon canon, [563](#)
 - Mormon canonization of, [565](#)
 - proclamation of, [584](#)
- Woodruff, Wilford (4th LDS President)
 - on Arsenal Hill explosion, [397](#)
 - compromise with government on confiscations, [548](#)
 - land purchase, St. Johns, [439](#)
 - on Mountain Meadows, [50](#)
 - Pipe Springs sale, [592](#)
 - St. George Temple, President, [402](#)
- Woods, George L. (Utah Territory, Governor)
 - Mormons, control of, [235](#)
- “Woolley route”, [686](#)

Woolley and Seegmiller, [468–70](#)
 “blooded” breeding stock, investing in, [473](#), [475](#)
 exoneration from blame in cattle sales, [557](#)
 federal investigation, [555](#)
 horse racing, [473](#)
 John W. Young herds, managing, [565](#)
 KLCC calves, branding as private, [566](#)
 KLCC, dismissed as managers, [567](#)
 partnership, dissolution, [558](#)
 at Pipe Springs Ranch, [541](#), [543](#)
 primary animal substitution by “scrubs”, [552–55](#)
 questioned by federal examiners, [548](#)

Woolley and Young (John W.)
 turning Buckskin Mountain into Gentleman's Hunting Park, [571](#)

Woolley, Edwin D., Jr. (Dee), [68](#)
 activities, [527](#)
 Arizona Strip to Utah, formal request, [602](#)
 arrest and release, [560](#)
 boarding houses and restaurants, [569](#)
 capture, special target for, [504](#)
 CCSC Upper Kanab dairy and ranch, renting, [465](#)
 changing Kaibab future, [658](#)
 cohabitating law, disregarding, [565](#)
 death, [704](#)
 embezzlement, accusations of, [589](#)
 Flora move to Pipe Springs, [507](#), [510](#)
 Grand Canyon Epiphany of tourism, [568–70](#)
 Grand Canyon tourism, plan to develop, [659](#)
 Grand Canyon, automobile roads to, [682](#)
 Kaibab Plateau, exploiting resources of, [568](#)
 Kanab-Northern Rim road, lobbying for, [688](#)
 killing Colonel Pike, accused of, [467](#)
 Mormon vigilante group, member, [466](#)
 on Andrus, Canaan boss, [430](#)
 on killing of Kaibabits at Grama Canyon, [78](#), [80](#)
 raids on “underground station at Upper Kanab Ranch”, [507](#)
 stake presidency, responsibilities, [470](#)
 “tallying” system, [542](#)
 telegram to Woodruff on sale of Pipe Springs, [591](#)
 testimony before Examiner, [556](#)
 and US Marshal, relationship, [506](#)
 Utah congressional delegation to Kaibab Plateau, [662](#)
 Winsor Castle, saved by tourism, [570](#)
 wives at Upper Kanab Ranch, [504](#)

Woolley, Edwin Gordon, Jr. (nephew of Dee), trip to Bright Angel Point, [682–86](#)

Woolley, Elizabeth (daughter of Dee), on Dee's cattle operation at Winsor Castle range, [471](#)

Woolley, Flora (second wife of Dee)
 at Upper Kanab Ranch, [504](#)
 and children at Pipe Springs, [521](#)
 Kanab, return to, [565](#)
 Pipe Springs

isolation at, [527](#)
 on life at, [532–39](#)
 move to, [507](#), [510](#)
 as principle witness, search for, [560](#)
 at Winsor Castle, [503](#), [511–13](#)
 Woolley, Herbert (son of Flora), tribute to mother and underground women, [540](#)
 Woolley, Lund, and Judd Mercantile Company, [434](#), [517](#), [585](#)
 Woolley-Affleck automobile excursion
 to North Rim, [682–86](#)
 Utah road and railroad construction, effect on, [688](#)
 Work, Laura B. (superintendent, Indian School)
 “moral development” and Mace's journal, contrast, [657](#)
 report on Kaibab (1903), [651–54](#)
 Yampahute. *See* Patnish (Northern Ute)
 “Yellow Rock Springs”, [33](#)
 Yellowstone-Grand Canyon highway. *See* Utah-Grand Canyon Highway
 Young, Brigham (2nd President, LDS Church)
 “free will,” purpose to systematize chaos of, [367](#)
 anti-polygamy law, unconstitutional, [289](#)
 Arizona mission, reaction to collapse of, [352](#)
 Arizona Strip, isolation on, [281](#)
 Arizona, preparing for invasion of, [331](#)
 arrest
 and bail, [286–88](#)
 polygamy charges, [161](#)
 support against, [278](#)
 bail, decisions after skipping, [163–65](#)
 blessing from heaven, securing, [143](#)
 Bowman threat, [19–21](#)
 Brigham’s Bastion, [57](#)
 church property, in “secret trust”, [543](#)
 church-controlled territorial legislature, [25](#)
 Cotton and Woolen Mill, selling, [208](#)
 dependence on Whitmore, [59](#)
 donation to Chicago, post-Great Fire, [169](#)
 economy and wealth, attitude towards, [209](#)
 establishment of St. George, [52–55](#)
 estate holdings in WCSGC, [424](#)
 evacuation order of settlements, consequences, [94](#)
 evil, life and death struggle, [24–25](#)
 exodus from Nauvoo, Ill., [18](#)
 exodus from St. George, preparing potential, [171](#)
 exploration to strengthen southern bastion, [49–52](#)
 exploration trip, relocation of escape route from St. George, [173](#)
 First Presidency, insufficient tithing funds, [141](#)
 flight
 purpose, discussions of, [170](#)
 to south, [168–70](#)
 fort at Pipe Springs, construction, [27](#)
 grand bastion, weakening, [583](#)
 and Grant, minimizing history between, [395](#), [728](#)

Grant-McKean judicial system, test case against, [290](#)
"Great Game," against US, [23](#)
Hamblin meeting on Southern Indian Mission, [101](#)
house arrest at Lion House, [287](#)
house arrest, freedom to leave, [298](#)
imprisonment release, [294](#)
Indian Affairs, replacement as governor and superintendent, [31](#)
indigenous converts, support of, [393](#)
infrastructure, planning of, [105](#)
isolation of Mormons from newcomers, [217](#)
July 4th provocation of Shaffer proclamations, [151](#)
kingdom vs. individual agency, [365](#)–70
kingdom, cold war with US government, [24](#), [104](#)
Latter-Day Saint doctrines, preaching of, [330](#)
Law of Consecration and Stewardship, commitment to, [144](#)
letter
 to Eldredge, considerations for building Windsor Castle, [133](#)–34
 to furnish new converts, [387](#)
 to Hamblin, on Paria Indian Farm and Indian involvement, [136](#)
 on Muddy Saints freedom to resettle, [195](#)
 to Stewart & Brethren at Kanab, colonizing instructions, [137](#)–39
 on tithing cattle at Pipe Springs, [139](#)–40
 to Toquerville and Parker, on transporting saw mill, [135](#)
livestock transfer to personal account, [211](#)
martial law, declaration of, [26](#)
in McKean's court, [175](#)
meeting
 on impending arrest, [160](#)
 in St. George, [145](#)
 Stewart in Kanab, [111](#)–13
message to First Presidency, after skipping bail, [164](#)
on mining, wealth, and infrastructure, [276](#)
Moquis, provision of arms, [65](#)
Mormon independence from gentile world, at St. George Tabernacle, [331](#)
Mormon power, strengthening in southern Utah, [47](#)
Moroni and Smith, modeling himself after, [25](#)
Mountain Meadows Massacre involvement, [27](#)–28, [30](#), [31](#)
New Canaan, [111](#)
 policy, [144](#)
 program, letter to inaugurate, [179](#)
officials seceding, [49](#)
on Kaibab punishment for Grama Canyon killings, [84](#)
peace of the Territory, proclamation, [20](#)–21
persecution through taxation, defenses, [219](#)–21
Pipe Springs, purchase of, [108](#)
Pipe Springs-Kanab exploration, [133](#)–45
and Powell, cooperation, [106](#)–8
power, loss of, [328](#), [351](#)
preaching tours (1873-1874), [367](#)
preparing for war with US, [27](#)
privacy, [295](#)–98

prosecutions dismissed, [292](#)
 public opinion, favorable change, [166–67](#)
 raising rescued slave children, [17–19](#)
 on Red Clay Flat killings, [79](#)
 red rocks of Dixie, strategic importance of, [48](#)
 return to court, conditions and motivation, [279–80](#), [282–84](#)
 return to Salt Lake City, [174](#)
 Revelations, call to conform, [367](#)
 Saints, herded together, [328](#)
 Shaffer proclamations, testing, [150](#)
 slave trade, curtailing of, [18](#)
 St. George Temple
 establishment, [51](#), [170](#)
 importance of, [144](#)
 St. George, naming, [53](#)
 State of Deseret, vision of, [23](#)
 submitting to McKean and Bates, [292](#)
 summons, obeying, [161](#)
 Tabernacle speech, post-release, [300](#)
 tax assessment, improper, [214](#)
 telegram to Wells, on omitting paying tithes, [216](#)
 telegraph lines, establishment, [54](#)
 “temple stock” enterprise, development in Canaan, [219](#)
 tithing
 herds, management of, [209](#)
 income from, [212](#)
 income, tax assessment, [212–13](#)
 system, Mormons becoming restive, [210](#)
 United Order
 sole agent of, [367](#)
 speeches on benefits of, [368–70](#)
 unrighteous dominion, accusation of, [364](#)
 Utah courts, stripped of, [158](#)
 view of temples, [142](#)
 wealth, international stories about, [213](#)
 Winsor Castle
 construction, [133](#)
 purpose, [197](#)
 Young, John R. (nephew of BY), [17](#)
 head of Kanab UO, replaced as, [389](#)
 Muddy settlers relocation, support, [222](#)
 on Berry family killing, [92](#)
 at Pipe Springs Ranch, activities, [197–99](#)
 Young, John W. (son of BY)
 and Buffalo Bill, seeking investors for Hunting Park, [573](#), [575](#)
 cattle, surreptitious church ownership, [565](#)
 church and private business, consequences of mixing, [575](#)
 church cattle, re-branding, [565](#)
 Kaibab Cattle Company, hiding cattle in, [553](#)
 OUO, purchase of holdings from, [574](#)
 WCSGC and private cattle, confusing, [417](#)

Young, Joseph W. (BY nephew)
Arizona immigrant party, organizing, [345](#)
assignments and responsibilities, [180](#), [341](#)–44
illness and death, [346](#)–48
letter to Eldredge on assignment to build Winsor Castle, [186](#)
passing oversight to Anson Winsor, [189](#)
Pipe Springs, on being at, [181](#)–82
request for sawmill, [189](#)–91
St. George, call for cattle, [209](#)
Winsor Castle, charged to build, [183](#)–86
workers at St. George and Pipe Springs, feeding, [206](#)–9
Yuta lands, traffic and trade prohibition in, [10](#)–11
Zane, Charles S. (Territorial Chief Justice)
on confiscation compromise, [549](#)
on Clawson trial, [496](#)
Zion National Park, [51](#)
“silver and gold,” to adorn Zion's fair head, [749](#)
dedication, [705](#), [710](#)
Harding visit, [744](#), [747](#)
naming, [701](#)
National Monument, [701](#)
tourism to, [732](#), [756](#)
Union Pacific railhead, [721](#)
Zion Park-Grand Canyon Highway Convention (1920), [701](#)